

CARAVAGGIO

SECOND REVISED EDITION



John T. Spike



CARAVAGGIO

SECOND REVISED EDITION

John T. Spike

with the assistance of Michèle K. Spike

CD-ROM CATALOGUE

Note to the Reader	2
Abbreviations	3
How to Use this CD-ROM	3
Autograph Works	6
Other Works Attributed	412
Lost Works	452
Bibliography	510
Exhibition Catalogues	607
Copyright Notice	624

Note to the Reader

This CD-ROM contains searchable catalogues of all of the known paintings of Caravaggio, including attributed and lost works. In the autograph works are included all paintings which on documentary or stylistic evidence appear to be by, or partly by, the hand of Caravaggio. The attributed works include all paintings that have been associated with Caravaggio's name in critical writings but which, in the opinion of the present writer, cannot be fully accepted as his, and those of uncertain attribution which he has not been able to examine personally. Some works listed here as copies are regarded as autograph by other authorities.

Lost works, whose catalogue numbers are preceded by "L," are paintings whose current whereabouts are unknown which are ascribed to Caravaggio in seventeenth-century documents, inventories, and in other sources. The catalogue of lost works describes a wide variety of material, including paintings considered copies of lost originals. Entries for untraced paintings include the city where they were identified in either a seventeenth-century source or inventory ("Inv."). Most of the inventories have been published in the Getty Provenance Index, Los Angeles.

Provenance, documents and sources, inventories and selective bibliographies are provided for the paintings by, after, and attributed to Caravaggio. Only seventeenth-century copies executed on canvas are listed. Author-date citations can be found in the Bibliography arranged chronologically through autumn 2009. Exhibition citations are found in a separate section of the Bibliography, arranged alphabetically by city, i.e., Cleveland, Rome, Valletta. Many of the citations are accompanied by a parenthetical synopsis of the author's views on attribution or date; the absence of a summary usually indicates that the author sustains the attribution. Most of the entries contain a brief description of physical condition; a full account of the technical examinations and ongoing restorations of Caravaggio's paintings is beyond the scope of this book.

Abbreviations

ASAP	Archivio dell’Arciconfraternità di Sant’Anna dei Palafrenieri
ASF	Archivio di Stato, Florence
ASM	Archivio di Stato, Milan
ASN	Archivio di Stato, Naples
ASR	Archivio di Stato, Rome
ASV	Archivio Segreto Vaticano
NLM	National Library of Malta

How to Use This CD-ROM

To Find a Word or Name

On a Mac:

Open the Edit menu and choose Find, or type a combination of the command (apple) and F keys. A dialog box will appear highlighted; enter a term to be located and click on “Find” or press the Return key. The search function will locate the first occurrence of the term, on or after the page that is open.

To locate the next occurrence of the same term, click on the left or right arrow to scroll through the pages of the document to continue your search.

When the end of the search is reached, a dialog box will appear to inform you that Acrobat has finished searching the document and that no more matches were found. If you click “OK,” the search will end.

On a PC:

On the toolbar, type term in the Find box, or type a combination of the control (Ctrl) and F keys. Press the Return key. The search function will locate the first occurrence of the term, on or after the page that is open.

To locate the next occurrence of the same term, press Enter again, or type a combination of the control (Ctrl) and G keys.

When the end of the search is reached, a dialog box will appear indicating no more matches have been found.

How to Use the Bookmarks

On a Mac:

This document is set to launch with the Navigation Panel open, to the left of the document, with the Bookmarks visible. If only the document is visible, go to the View menu, then select Navigation Panels/select Bookmarks. The bookmark panel will open on the left.

To make more room on the desktop for the document, click on the X at the top right of the Bookmarks window to hide the Bookmarks; the Navigation Panel can also be made narrower by dragging the frame bar between the text and the bookmarks to the left.

The Bookmarks constitute a directory of the catalogue. Document icons with arrows to the left of them function like folders in a desktop file directory: clicking on the arrow displays the contents of the folder. Clicking on a document icon or the heading text to the right of the icon opens the document at the page where the corresponding term is found (the term will be in large type).

On a PC:

This document is set to launch with the Navigation Panel open, to the left of the document, with the Bookmarks visible. If only the document is visible, click on the Bookmarks icon to the left of the page or go to the View menu and select Navigation Panels and then Bookmarks.

To make more room on the desktop for the document, click on the X at the top right of the Bookmarks window to hide the Bookmarks; the Navigation Panel can also be made narrower by dragging the frame bar between the text and the bookmarks to the left.

The Bookmarks constitute a directory of the catalogue. Document icons with a plus to the left of them function like folders in a desktop file directory: clicking on the arrow displays the contents of the folder. Clicking on a document icon or the heading text to the right of the icon opens the document at the page where the corresponding term is found (the term will be in large type in the document).

Changing the Display Size

On a Mac:

The document is set to open with a full document page visible. If the text is too small to read easily on a particular monitor, magnify the display by clicking the magnifying glass icon in the Acrobat menu bar or choose a sizing option from the View menu.

On a PC:

The document is set to open with a full document page visible. If the text is too small to read easily on a particular monitor, magnify the display by clicking the magnifying glass icon or plus and minus keys in the Acrobat menu bar or choose a sizing option from the View menu.

For Further Assistance

Under the Help menu, click Reader Guide.

Autograph Works

I. *Boy Peeling Fruit*, c. 1592

Oil on canvas, 25¼ x 20¼ in. (64.2 x 51.4 cm)

The Dickinson Group, London

Provenance:

Possibly the work painted by Caravaggio for Pandolfo Pucci da Recanati soon after the artist's arrival in Rome, around 1592 (Mancini). Another painting of this subject attributed to Caravaggio was in the collection of Cesare Crispolti, a poet who died in Perugia in 1608; sale Phillips, London, December 10, 1996, lot 67 (as attributed).

Document:

1. August 16, 1608: Letter sent by Lorenzo Sarego, Perugia, to Cardinal Scipione Borghese, Rome, regarding the paintings in the estate of Cesare Crispolti (ASV, Carte Borghese 54/5; Fumagalli 1994, pp. 101–17; Macioce 1996, pp. 123–24, 132 n. 12 (perhaps a copy), Fumagalli 1994, p. 149: “And further a painting by Michelangelo Caravaggio, living, that is a figure of a youth seen from the belt up who is peeling a peach in oil.” [“E più un quadretto di Michel Ang(el)o Caravaggio vivo, cioè una figura d’un giovane dalla cintura in sù che monda un persico a olio.”].

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–25 (1956, I, p. 224), Caravaggio “passed to Rome when he was about 20 years old where, having little funds, he stayed with Pandolfo Pucci da Recanati, recipient of a stipend from Saint Peter’s . . . whom he left after some months of meager satisfaction. . . . In this period he made for him some copies of pious paintings that are in Recanati and, to sell, a boy who cries at being bitten by a lizard that he holds in his hand, and afterwards a boy who peels a pear with a knife” (codice Marciano; codice Palatino, “who peels an apple with

a knife”). [“Se ne passò a Roma d’età incirca 20 anni dove, essendo poco provisto di denari, stette con Pandolfo Pucci da Recanati, beneficiato di S. Pietro . . . Donde dopo alcuni mesi [si parti] con poca soddisfazione . . . In questo tempo fece per esso alcune copie di devotione che sono in Recanati e, per vendere, un putto che piange per essere stato morso da un racano che tiene in mano [London, National Gallery], e dopo pur un putto che mondava una pera con il cortello” (codice Marciano; codice Palatino, “che mondava con un cultello una mela”).]

Exhibitions:

Sydney-Melbourne 2003–4, cat. no. 2; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 27.

Bibliography:

Spike in Phillips 1996, pp. 106–9 (c. 1592); Langdon 1998, pp. 57–58, 421; Puglisi 1998, no. 1B (c. 1593–94); Gash 2001, p. 429 (possibly first version); Marini 2001, pp. 134–35; Spike 2001, cat. no. 1 (c. 1592); Capon 2003, pp. 82–83, 227, cat. no. 2 (c. 1593–94); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, ill. p. 96, p. 236, cat. no. 27 (1593); Varriano 2006, pp. 105, 116, fig. 94; Whitaker–Clayton 2007, p. 262.

Numerous copies attest to the popularity of this deceptively simple image, whose possible emblematic significance is discussed in the text, pp. 28–30. The connection between these compositions and Mancini’s reference is secured by the identification of the Hampton Court version as by “Michael Angelo” dating back to 1688.

The work demonstrates its autograph status in every passage. The boy’s head is modeled with a strong relief that underscores the flatness of the known copies. The boy’s shirt is rendered with a marvelous translucence as though its folds were overlapping veils of white light. A very significant distinction between this original and the copies can be observed in the shadows beneath the boy’s hands. This area represents the opening of the woven sack used to carry the fruit and a few interwoven fibers of the same golden color can be glimpsed. The copies only show a scattering of meaningless flecks in this area.

See pp. 28–29.

Condition:

Good condition. Various examinations were carried on October 9–11, 1996 by Maurizio Seracini of Editech Laboratory on the premises of Phillips, London: radiography; infrared reflectography; photography of ultraviolet fluorescence; chemical analysis of pigments and cross sections. Various pentimenti were revealed by radiography and infrared reflectography. The boy's proper right eye was lowered approximately $\frac{5}{16}$ inches (0.8 cm) below its original position. Additional touches by the artist served to lengthen the knuckles of the boy's right hand and to elevate the position of the thumb. Examination demonstrated that the margins of the canvas are essentially intact with possible reduction along the sides not exceeding $\frac{3}{8}$ inches (1 cm).

Copies:

Bibliography for the copies: Before 1996 this composition was discussed on the basis of copies after a lost original. Kallab 1906–7, p. 277 (lost work); de Rinaldis 1936, p. 115 n. 11 (identifies lost work with no. 89 in the inventory of the items seized from the Cavaliere d'Arpino on May 4, 1607 and presented to Cardinal Scipione Borghese: "A boy at table with an apple in his hand" ("Un putto in *tavola* con un pomo in mano"); Friedlaender 1955, p. 145 (all copies, probably of lost original); Wagner 1958, pp. 19–21; Arslan 1959, p. 198; Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa, 1967, no. 2 (lost original 1591, known in four versions; Kitson 1969, p. 85); Calvesi 1971, pp. 95–96 (allegory of Christian redemption); Cinotti 1971, pp. 88–89, no. 1 (original painted on panel probably in d'Arpino's studio, 1592); Posner 1971, pp. 305–6 (not erotic); Frommel 1972, pp. 23, 39; Salerno 1974, p. 587 (lost work, 1593–95); Röttgen 1974, p. 251, n. 126 (based on proverb); Wind 1975, p. 72 n. 4 (related to a series on the seasons); Moir 1976, pp. 103–4 nos. 50a–50i; Costello 1981, pp. 375–85; Cinotti 1983, p. 443 (summary of previous literature); Spike 1983, p. 40 (painted while in employ of Pandolfi Pucci; composition known through several copies); Salerno 1984, p. 439 (d'Arpino provenance dubious unless the word *tavola* refers to the table); Gregori 1985, no. 61 (perhaps no significance beyond genre subject; cites Salerno's views on d'Arpino provenance); Salerno 1989, p. 35 (the bitter fruit is a symbol of youth's disillusionment, another vanitas); Bauer 1991, pp. 391–98 n. 46; Bologna 1992, p. 298 (second half 1592); Fumagalli 1994, pp. 101–17 (dismisses d'Arpino provenance, noting that the painting cited in 1607 reappears in the 1693 Borghese inventory as executed on panel by Sodoma); Macioce 1996, pp. 123–35 (original dates to 1592–94, earlier than known versions); Fumigalli in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 143–45.

C.1

Berlin, private collection

Oil on canvas, 26³/₈ x 20 in. (67 x 51 cm)

Bibliography:

Baumgart 1952, p. 87 (original); Jullian 1961, pp. 47, 53, 255 (original, 1591); Moir 1976, p. 104 copy no. 50d.

C.2

Florence, Roberto Longhi Foundation

Oil on canvas, 26³/₄ x 24⁵/₈ in. (68 x 62.5 cm)

Provenance:

Private collection, London; Aldo Briganti, Rome; Roberto Longhi, Florence

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 52 (copy); Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 15.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1943, p. 10 (copy); Berenson 1951, p. 56 (copy); Mahon 1951, p. 233 (1592–94, copy); Venturi 1951, no. 50 (copy of lost prototype, dated c. 1593–97); Baumgart 1952, pp. 88–89, 95–98 (copy); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1591–92, copy); Boschetto 1971, no. 54; Frommel 1972, pp. 23, 39 (best version of lost original); Marini 1974, p. 62 n.24, 84 n.2, 332–34 (copy); Moir 1976, p. 104, no. 50b (copy); Acidini Luchinat in Gregori 1980, no. 79 (copy); Gregori in Barcelona 2005, pp. 104–7, cat. no. 15 (copy, 1593–94).

C.3

Hampton Court Palace, Her Majesty the Queen; inv. 437; 24 x 19 in. (61 x 48.3 cm)

Provenance:

Possibly acquired by Charles II; first recorded in the 1688 inventory of James II's pictures at Whitehall, Windsor, Hampton Court and in the custody of the Queen Dowager, Catherine of Braganza, at Somerset House, as "by Michel Angelo" (M.S. 15752 printed by W. Bathoe, 1758); later at Windsor Castle.

Exhibition:

London 2008.

Bibliography:

Law 1881, no. 398; Law 1898, no. 398; Isarlov 1935, p. 116–17 (copy of an unknown original); Longhi 1943, p. 10; Hinks 1953, p. 93; Friedlaender 1955, p. 145 (copy); Jullian 1961, pp. 47, 53, 61, 225; Levey 1964 (ed. 1991), p. 60, no. 423; Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa, 1967, no. 2 (copy); Kitson 1969, no. 1 (copy); Cinotti 1973, no. 1; Marini 1974, cat. no. 2 (copy?); Nicolson 1974, p. 560 (as copy); Moir 1976, pp. 103–4 no. 50a, 136 n. 228 (closest copy to early paintings); Cinotti 1983, p. 442 (copy); Hibbard 1983, no. 3, p. 269 (copy?); Marini 1989, p. 359 (as Minniti?); Levey 1991, no. 423, p. 52 (copy, not of highest quality, of an original dated 1592–93); Macioce 1996, pp. 127–28 (Minniti); Whitaker–Clayton 2007, p. 262 (1592–93, autograph); Papi in Milan 2009, pp. 21–27 (original).

C.4

Rome, private collection

Oil on canvas, 29½ x 25⅝ in. (75.5 x 64.4 cm)

On reverse is the eighteenth-century wax seal of Cardinal Tiberio Borghese, illustrated in Caravaggio 2003, p. 29.

Exhibitions:

Bergamo 2000, no. 9; Rome 2001, cat. no. 11; Caravaggio 2003; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 28; Frankfurt am Main 2009, cat. no. 27.

Bibliography:

Marini 1982, pp. 75, 83; Cinotti 1983, p. 442 (copy); Hibbard 1983, pp. 16, 265, fig. 3 (copy); Marini 1983, p. 127; Gregori 1985, p. 203 (copy and not the prototype for the other known copies); Marini 1989, pp. 358–62, no. 4 (after June 3, 1593); Salerno 1989, p. 31 (variant of original); Cottino 1989, pp. 659–76 fig. 777 (Caravaggio); Calvesi 1990, p. 421 (best copy of original of c. 1593–94); Levey 1991, p. 52 (best version); Bologna 1992, p. 298 (copy); Gregori 1994, p. 145, no. 1 (copy of lost original, c. 1593); Macioce 1996, pp. 127–28 (bottega of Cesari, earliest known version); Puglisi 1998, no. 1A (c. 1593–94); Robb 1998, pp. 36, 498 (perhaps the original of 1593); Marini in Bergamo 2000, pp. 185–86 (wax seals; as original); Marini in Rome 2001, pp. 26–27, no. 11; Marini in Caravaggio 2003; Marini 2005, pp. 138, 374–76, no. 5; Gasparri in Düsseldorf 2006, ill. p. 97, pp. 236–37, cat. no. 28 (1593); Eclercy in Frankfurt 2009, pp. 156–57, cat. no. 27.

C.5

Tokyo, Ishizuka Collection

Oil on canvas, 25⁵/₈ x 20¹/₂ in. (65 x 52 cm)

Provenance:

Sir Joshua Reynolds, London, by 1791 (Murillo); Reynolds estate sale, 1795 (Murillo); Earl of Inchiquin, 1805; Marquise De Plessis-Bellières, 1897; Hart collection, London; sale Christie's London November 28, 1927, lot 125 (attributed to Le Nain); Sale F.T. Sabin, London, 1952; private collection, England; Dr. Pio Quadrini, Rome; Silvano Lodi, Campione d'Italia.

Exhibitions:

Park House, London, 1952, pp. 6–7, pl. 5 (attributed); New York–Naples 1985, n. 61 (attributed); Bergamo 2000, no. 8; London–Rome 2001, cat. no. 1.

Bibliography:

Mahon 1952, p. 23 (model same as for youths in Metropolitan Museum of Art's *Musicians*); Hinks 1953, pp. 42, 93 (possibly original); Friedlaender 1955, p. 145 (copy); Wagner 1958, p. 20 (from Spain?); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 360 (dubious); Czobor 1960 (copy); Jullian 1961, pp. 47, 53

(copy); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa, 1967, no. 2 (copy); Kitson 1969, no. 1 (1591); Moir 1976, p. 104 no. 50c; Nicolson 1979, p. 34, pl.1 (original); Spear 1979, p. 318(?); Gash 1980, pp. 17, 23 n.4; Cinotti 1983, no. 20 (best copy of lost original); Hibbard 1983, p. 269 (copy); Marini 1983, pp. 132–34, fig. 30, 150–51, n. 55 (Spadarino); Salerno 1984, p. 438; Salerno 1989, p. 31; Gregori 1985, no. 61, pp 200–203 (possibly original); Macioce 1996, p. 127, ill. p. 135; Puglisi 1998, no. 1 (reference); Rossi in Bergamo 2000, pp. 183–84 (as original); Brown in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 1, p. 21 (generally considered the best copy); Tresoldi 2006, p. 66 (1592).

For Cinotti (1983) the Sabin picture was the best copy of a lost original. After many years this painting has returned to view and is considered an autograph original by Nicolson, Gash, Salerno, and Mahon (cited in Bergamo 2000, pp. 183–84); Gregori 1994 omits it.

2. *Boy with a Basket of Fruit*, c. 1593

Oil on canvas, 27½ x 26⅜ in. (70 x 67 cm)

Galleria Borghese, Rome, inv. 136

The canvas bears two unidentified inventory numbers. At lower right, in white, 606. On the youth's white sleeve, faintly, in ink, 475.

Provenance:

Giuseppe Cesari, Cavaliere d'Arpino, Rome, until 1607, when confiscated by the papal treasury and transferred by Paul V to Cardinal Scipione Borghese on July 30, 1607; Palazzo Borghese, Campo Marzio, Rome, by 1693; transferred in 1891 to the Villa Borghese, Rome.

Inventories:

1. May 4, 1607, *Inventario del sequestro del bene di Cavaliere d'Arpino*, no. 56, without indication of author (De Rinaldis 1936, p. 114 n. 8; Della Pergola 1959, p. 75), “a painting of a young boy holding a basket of fruits in his hands, without frame” [“Un quadro di un Giovane che tiene un canestro di frutti in mano senza cornice”].

2. April 7, 1693, Inventory of the Palazzo Borghese, Campo Marzio, Rome, no. 65 (Della Pergola 1959, p. 75), “a painting of three palmi with a young boy who holds a basket of fruits with two numbers, one 606, and the other 475, with a gold frame by Michelan Garavagna” [“un quadro di tre palmi con un Giovane che tiene la canestra di frutti con due numeri, uno 606 e l’altro 475 con cornice dorata di Michelan Garavagna”].

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 2; Utrecht-Anvers 1952; New York-Naples 1985; Rome 1987; Cremona 1996, v.3; Bergamo 2000, no. 15; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 17; Munich 2002; Florence 2003; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 27; Milan 2009, cat. no 1.

Bibliography:

Catalogue 1790 (n. 61: “a young boy with a basket of fruits, Caravaggio” [“Un giovane con canestra di frutti, Caravaggio”]); Barbier de Montault 1870, p. 358; Piancastelli 1891, p. 891; Venturi 1893, p. 98 (attributed); Venturi 1909, p. 39; Witting 1916, p. 75; Marangoni 1917–18, p. 13 (only the still life by Caravaggio); Marangoni 1922 [1953 ed.], pp. 143–44 (old copy after lost original); Voss 1924, p. 446; Longhi 1927, p. 28; Longhi 1928/29, p. 31; de Rinaldis 1936, pp. 110–18; de Rinaldis 1937, pp. 224 n. 34; Schudt 1942, no. 5 (doubtful); de Rinaldis 1948, p. 62; Arslan 1951, p. 448; Baroni 1951 (Caravaggio 1589–91, among the early works *per vendere* cited by Mancini); Berenson 1951, p. 10; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 2 (1589); Mahon 1951, p. 233 (1592–94); Venturi 1951, no. 5 (1593); Longhi 1952, no. I (1589–90); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1592–93); Grassi 1953, pp. 47–49; Hinks 1953, no. 3 (1592); Baumgart 1955, no. 7 (c. 1591–93); Czobor 1955, pp. 206–10 (self-portrait); Friedlaender 1955, p. 145, no. 3 (painted in d’Arpino’s studio, still life by Caravaggio, face possibly by another artist in the studio); Wagner 1958, pp. 18–20, 41, 46, 176 n. 46–49 (1589–91); Arslan 1959, pp. 194–95, 199–201, 211–12 n. 11; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 151–52, 164, 252–53; Della Pergola 1959, p. 75, no. 111; Jullian 1961, pp. 48, 53, 56, 73, 165 (1592); Della Pergola 1964², p. 253–55 (results of cleaning); Brandi 1966, p. 167 (copy) Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa, 1967, no. 11 (1593–94); Kitson 1969, no. 3 (1593–94); Longhi 1968, p. 131 (c. 1590); Röttgen 1969, pp. 155, 167 n. 43; Calvesi 1971,

pp. 93–98, 102–3; Cinotti 1971, pp. 89–92, 161, 163; Brandi 1972–73, pp. 10–14 (copy with some *miserie di esecuzione*); Frommel 1972, pp. 39–43 (1593–94); Gregori 1972, p. 17; Marini 1974, n. 3 (1593); Salerno 1974, p. 587 (1593–95); Wind 1975, p. 71; Moir 1976, p. 83 no. 2; Nicolson 1979, p. 34; Magnuson 1982, p. 82, fig. p. 83; Moir 1982, 83 (1593–94); Cinotti 1983, no. 49 (1593–94); Freedberg 1983, p. 55; Hibbard 1983, pp. 17–19 (c. 1594); Spike 1983, p. 44 (c. 1594); Gregori 1985, no. 66 (earliest Roman period, not self-portrait, p. 211, suggests connection with a “vilico” mentioned by Mancini 1619–21, [ed. 1956, I, p. 224]); Cottino 1989, pp. 659–76 fig. 780 (1593–94); Posèq 1990², pp. 149–51, pl. 1; Posèq 1990³, pp. 113–21 pl. 4 (1593); Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 36–37; Marini 1989, pp. 362–64, no. 6 (after June 3, 1593); Calvesi 1990, p. 422 (1594–95); Bologna 1992, pp. 291–92, 298 (1592–93); Gregori 1994, p. 27, 145, no. 3 (1593–94); Cottino in *La natura morta* 1995, n. 11; Frommel in Macioce 1996, pp. 20, 29 (1593–94); Gilbert 1995, pp. 216, 250–51, 282 n. 10; Milicua in Cremona 1996, p. 136; Langdon 1998, pp. 68–72; Puglisi 1998, no. 4 (c. 1593–94); Robb 1998, p. 45, 49, 499 (portrait of Minniti, 1593); Coliva in Bergamo 2000, pp. 191–92; Laureati in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 17 (c. 1593–94); Spike 2001, pp. 30–34, cat. no. 2 (c. 1593); Papi in Munich 2002, p. 131; Giusti, Spinosa, and Utili 2003, p. 10; Papi in Florence, 2003, p. 132 (1593–94); Sgarbi 2005, no. 2; Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 25; Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 27, pp. 121–23 (c. 1593); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 6; Tresoldi 2006, p. 67 (1593); Papa 2008, pp. 44–45 (1593–94); Papi in Milan 2009, pp. 21–27, 46.

Despite doubts expressed as recently as 1972, the *Boy with a Basket of Fruit* is generally recognized as an autograph composition that entered the collection of Cardinal Scipione Borghese in 1607 together with the *Self-Portrait as Bacchus* and other works confiscated from the Roman workshop of Cavaliere d’Arpino. If painted during Caravaggio’s activity in d’Arpino’s workshop, as seems probable, the picture would date from Caravaggio’s first year or two in Rome, around 1593.

The artist’s early biographers do not mention this *Boy with a Basket of Fruit*; the picture is first specifically ascribed to Caravaggio in a 1693 inventory of the Palazzo Borghese.

The dazzling variety of purple and green figs, black and green grapes, striated Roman apples, peaches, autumnal medlars, pears, and so forth, are a pastoral poem in praise of nature for nature's sake. By describing them so particularly, as though making portraits of the very items he found in the market, wormholes and all, Caravaggio endows the fruit with an equal standing with the model.

See pp. 30–34.

Condition:

Good condition. In the course of cleaning and examination in 1964 the painting was discovered to have been enlarged along its left and right edges. Small losses of pigment on the figures, cheek, and shoulder were inpainted; these inpaintings have subsequently faded and are clearly visible in photographs. The picture was radiographed in 1953 by the Istituto Centrale del Restauro in Rome.

Copies:

None recorded.

3. *Self-Portrait as Bacchus*, c. 1593 (*Il Bacchino malato*)

Oil on canvas, 26³/₈ x 20³/₄ in. (67 x 53 cm)

Galleria Borghese, Rome, inv. 534

Provenance:

Giuseppe Cesare, Il Cavaliere d'Arpino, Rome, by 1607; from whom confiscated by the papal treasury and transferred by Paul V to Cardinal Scipione Borghese on July 30, 1607; Palazzo Borghese, Campo Marzio, Rome, by 1693; transferred in 1891 to the Villa Borghese, Rome.

Inventories:

1. May 4, 1607, *Inventario del sequestro del bene di Cavaliere d'Arpino*, no. 54, without indication of author (De Rinaldis 1936, p. 114 n. 7; Della Pergola 1959, pp. 76), “another small painting of a youth with a wreath of ivy around his head and a bunch of grapes in his hand, without frame” [“Un altro quadretto con un giovanotto con la Ghirlanda d'hellera intorno, et rampaccio d'uva in mano senza cornice”].

2. April 7, 1693, Inventory of the Palazzo Borghese, Campo Marzio, Rome, no. 54, (Della Pergola 1959, II, p. 76), “A painting of three palmi on canvas by Caravaggio of a Bacchus with a crown of laurel on its head and a bunch of grapes in his hand, at bottom another bunch of black grapes with two peaches in a gold frame” [“Un quadro di tre palmi in tela del Caravaggi con un Baccho con la corona di Laoro in testa et un rampazzo d'uva in mano et un altro rampazzo d'uva negra da piedi con due persiche al n. 475 con cornice dorata”].

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–21 (ed. 1956, I, p. 226): “Among many he made a most beautiful Bacchus who was unbearded, now in the possession of the Borghese” [“Fra tanto fa un Bacco bellissimo, et era sbarbato lo tiene Borghese”].

2. Baglione 1642, p. 136: “After spending some months in the house of Giuseppe d'Arpino, Caravaggio tried to get along on his own and made some other small pictures which were drawn from his own reflection in a mirror. The first was a Bacchus, with bunches of various kinds of grapes executed with great care, but a bit dry of manner.” [“Indi [dopo un soggiorno di alcuni mesi presso il Cavalier d'Arpino] provò a stare da se stesso, e fece alcuni quadretti da lui nello specchio ritratti. Et il primo fu un Bacco con alcuni grappoli d'uve diverse, con gran diligenza fatte, ma di maniera un po secca.”]

Some commentators, among them Friedlaender (1955, p. 146), believe that this statement by Baglione refers rather to the *Bacchus* (Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence, cat. no. 14).

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 3; New York-Naples 1985; Rome 1986; Rome 1987; Rome 1995³, cat. no. 10; Bergamo 2000, cat. no. IX.2; Milan 2001, pp. 474–76; Naples 2003, cat. no. 1; Cremona-New York 2004; Rome 2007, cat. no. VIII.4; Rome 2009, cat. no. 1.

Bibliography:

Catalogue 1790 (“A Satyr [Un Satiro], Caravaggio”); *Fidecommesso* 1833, p. 13 (“A Bacchus by Ludovico Carracci, 2 palmi, 4 once wide, 2 palmi, 3 once high”); Piancastelli 1891, no. 60 (“A Bacchus attributed to Ludovico Carracci”); Venturi 1893, p. 64 (school of Carracci); Cantalamessa 1912, I, n. 535 (caravaggesco, self-portrait?); Marangoni 1922, pp. 783–94 (not Caravaggio); Longhi 1927, pp. 28–31, *Opere complete*, 1967, II, pp. 300–306 (self-portrait by Caravaggio at time of his illness at the Hospital of the Consolation, c. 1589, to judge from his age of about twenty; probably not the Bacchus cited by Baglione; comparable to Doria *Saint John the Baptist* [cat. no. 29.c.4] and the Berlin *Victorious Cupid* [cat. no. 26]; de Rinaldis 1936, pp. 110–18; Schudt 1942, no. 73 (doubtful); Longhi 1943, p. 8; de Rinaldis 1948, p. 62; Arslan 1951, p. 445 (eighteenth-century copy); Arslan 1951, p. 2; Berenson 1951, p. 12; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 3; Mahon 1951, p. 233 (1592–94); Venturi 1951, no. 6 (1593–97); Longhi 1952, no. II (1589–90); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1591–92); Grassi 1953, pp. 45, 47; Hinks 1953, no. 2 (1592); Mahon 1953, pp. 214–15; Baumgart 1955, no. 2 (1589–90); Calvesi 1954, pp. 129–30 (influenced by his master, Peterzano) Czobor 1955, pp. 202 (self-portrait); Friedlaender 1955, no. 4a (extremely early, 1589, style difficult to reconcile with the Uffizi *Bacchus* [cat. no. 14]); Bauch 1956, p. 254, 260 (copy); Wagner 1958, pp. 13–15 (1589–91); Arslan 1959, pp. 193, 195–8, 211–3 (seventeenth-century copy of original of 1593–94); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 204–8, 252–54; Della Pergola 1959, II, p. 77, no. 112 (clarifies a confusion by some authors who relate this painting to the *Fidecommesso* 1833, p. 25, “A satyr, unknown author, 1 palmo, 4 once wide, 2 palmi high” also described by Piancastelli (1891, at no. 160), “Satyr, author unknown,” both of which instead refer to the painter P. P. Bonzi, Della Pergola 1959, I, p. 48); Jullian 1961, p. 48, 71–74, 163 (c. 1592); Argan 1962, p. 24 (compares to Alciati emblem of elegaic poet); Sedlmayr 1962, p. 25 (identifies as the Saturnine temperament); Della Pergola 1964, p. 229; Della Pergola 1964², p. 253; Salerno 1966, p. 110; Enggass 1967, p. 20 note 20; Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 1 (1591); Longhi 1968, pp. 11–14; Kitson 1969, no. 2

(1591); Moir 1969, 95; Röttgen 1969, pp. 154–55, 165–67; Slatkes 1969, p. 24; Salerno 1970, pp. 239, 243; Calvesi 1971, pp. 98–100, 102, 104, 112, 126, 131 (1585; symbolizes Christ); Cinotti 1971, pp. 64, 89–99, 160, 163; Frommel 1972, pp. 23–26, 33–37 (1593); Posner 1971, pp. 314–16 (imitation); Gregori 1973, p. 17; Fiorio 1974, p. 96 (influenced by a Persian Sibyl by Peterzano in the Certosa di Garegnano, Milan); Röttgen 1974, pp. 43, 111, 117, 183–93, 201, 207, 211–13, 262 (self-portrait as melancholic Bacchus with imagery of pleasures and deception; refutes Calvesi 1971); Marini 1974, n. 2 (1593); Moir 1976, p. 83 no. 1, 121 n. 179 (possibly self-portrait); Nicolson 1979, p. 34; Magnuson 1982, p. 82, fig. p. 83; Moir 1982, p. 66; Cinotti 1983, no. 52 (c. 1593–94; with precedent bibliography); Hibbard 1983 no. 9 (c. 1593); Spike 1983, pp. 40, 44 (c. 1594); Bertelli in *New York-Naples* 1985, pp. 60–62; Hermann-Fiore in *Rome* 1986, pp. 24–25; Cottino 1989, pp. 659–76 fig. 779 (1593–94); Marini 1989, pp. 361–62, no. 5 (after June 3, 1593); Herrmann Fiore in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni*, 1989 pp. 95–134 (influenced by Dürer); Posèq 1990², pp. 151–52, pl. 4 (1593–94); Calvesi 1990, p. 212–13 (the boy symbolizes the Spouse in the Song of Songs); Christiansen 1990, pp. 36–37; Heimbürger 1990, pp. 5–7; Posèq 1990³, pp. 113–21 pl. 1 (1593?); Cinnotti 1991, pp. 21–25; Bologna 1992, p. 299 (1592–93, when in studio of Cavaliere d’Arpino); Herrmann Fiore 1993, pp. 24–27; Gregori 1994, pp. 30, 143, no. 2 (c. 1593); Lapucci 1994², p. 161, pl. 82a; Cottino in *Rome* 1995³, pp. 102–3; Frommel in *Macioce* 1996, pp. 20, 29 (1593); Gilbert 1995, pp. 207, 215, 250; von Lates 1995, pp. 55–60; Berra 1996, p. 117 (1593); Christiansen in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 20–27 (influenced by Peterzano and by prints); Heimbürger 1998, p. 21 (influenced by Dürer, Goltzius, and Peterzano); Langdon 1998, pl. 1; Marini 1998, pp. 36–37; Puglisi 1998, no. 2 (c. 1593–94); Robb 1998, pp. 39–40 (1593); Calvesi in *Madrid-Bilbao* 1999, p. 13; Herrmann Fiore in *Bergamo* 2000, p. 67; Herrmann Fiore in *Milan* 2001, cat. no. IX.2, pp. 474–76 (classical prototypes); Spike 2001, pp. 30–36, cat. no. 3 (c. 1593); Ebert-Schifferer 2002, pp. 7–10; Röttgen 2002, p. 129; Giusti in *Naples* 2003, cat. no. 1 (c. 1592–93); Christiansen in *Cremona-New York* 2004, pp. 169–70; Lucantoni in *Herrmann Fiore* 2007, p. 330 (n. VII.4); Lapucci 2005, p. 16, fig. 1; Marini 2005, no. 7; Sgarbi 2005, no. 1; Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 6, fig. 2; Varriano 2006, pp. 11–12, 13, 23, 37, 58, 62, 69, 80, 105, fig. 6; Tresoldi 2006, p. 69 (1594); Debono 2007, p. 9 ill.; Lucatoni in *Rome* 2007, p. 330 (n. VII.4); Papa 2008, p. 47 (1593–94); Papi in *Milan* 2009, pp. 21–27; Coliva in *Rome* 2009, pp. 110–15, cat. no. 1 (late 1593); Giantomassi, “Note di tecnica pittorica su alcuni dipinti di Caravaggio,” in *Spezzaferro* 2009, pp. 21–22.

Baglione's description of a self-portrait in the guise of Bacchus seems to apply to this picture, which Caravaggio probably painted in the workshop of Cavaliere d'Arpino around 1593. The *Self-Portrait as Bacchus* entered the Borghese collection together with the *Boy with a Basket of Fruit* and other paintings sequestered from d'Arpino in 1607. In the eighteenth century, the painting was mistaken for another of the same subject and attributed to Saraceni. This error was rectified by Roberto Longhi who recognized the work as by the young Caravaggio (cf. Coliva 2009).

Herrmann Fiore (1989) has suggested that Caravaggio portrayed himself in a lunar light with reference to the "furor di luna" of the Bacchic revels and with the pallid complexion considered characteristic of the melancholic (creative) personality. On the other hand, the pallid skin tones inspired Longhi (1927) to dub this picture the *Bacchino malato* (or sick little Bacchus), suggesting that Caravaggio has portrayed himself shortly after suffering a severe illness. Coliva (2009) supports Longhi's hypothesis that the painting was executed soon after Caravaggio's hospitalization at the Hospital of the Consolation at the end of 1593 or the beginning of 1594.

See pp. 30–36.

Condition:

Good, cleaned in 1965. In 1980 the stretcher was considered in need of replacement. Marini (1998, pp. 36–37) published the improbable assertion that the yellowish skin tint is the result of excessive cleaning. For Coliva (2009, p. 114), this claim was disproven by Carlo Giantomassi and Donatella Zari who found during the restoration of the painting in 2000 that the "chromatic tone is perfectly preserved. . . ." Prior to 2000, the preparation of the canvas was variously observed as either gray (Christiansen 1986; 1988, p. 27, n. 4; 1990, p. 56 and Mahon 1988) or red (Lapucci in Florence 1991).

Giantomassi and Zari found that the figure was painted on a thin velatura of gray priming on top of Caravaggio's characteristic red preparation (Coliva 2009).

Copies:

None recorded.

4. *The Cardsharps, (I bari)*, c. 1594

Oil on canvas, 37 x 51³/₄ in. (94.2 x 131.2 cm)

Kimbell Art Museum, Fort Worth

Provenance:

Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, Rome, by 1615; by descent to Ugucione Del Monte and then to Alessandro Del Monte, Rome, 1626; from whom acquired by Cardinal Antonio Barberini, Rome, 1628; Prince Maffeo Barberini, Rome, 1686; Palazzo Colonna di Sciarra, Rome, 1812; Barberini Colonna di Sciarra collection, Paris, 1891–92; sale by Prince Maffeo Barberini Colonna di Sciarra, Paris, 1899; private collection, Caen, France; private collection, Zurich; acquired by the museum, July 1987.

Inventories:

1. February 21, 1627: Inventory of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “a game by the hand of Caravaggio with a black frame of 5 palmi.” [“Un gioco di mano del Caravaggio con Cornice negra di palmi cinque”] (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol. 580r, Frommel 1972, p. 31).

2. May 7, 1628: Listed among items sold to pay debts of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “On May 7th, for a Saint Catherine and a game of cards by Caravaggio” [“A di 7 di maggio . . . Per una S. Caterina, et un gioco di carte del Caravaggio . . .”] (Nota del denaro retratto dalla vendita de Mobili del Giardino di Ripetta dopo otto scuti il Breve posto del Banco di S. Spirito, Kirwin 1972, p. 55).

3. April 1644: Inventory of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, “In the room of Parnassus/262 a painting of three half figures who are playing, by the hand of the same [Caravaggio], in an entirely gilt

frame” [“Nella Stanza di Parnasso / 262 Un quadro di 3 mezze figure che giuocano, *di mano del detto* [Caravaggio, at no. 260 *supra*], con cornice tutta dor.ta”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 167).

4. August 4, 1671: Inventory after the death of Cardinal Antonio Barberini of the contents of the Palazzo ai Giubbonari, “no. 113—400—a painting with three figures playing cards by Caravaggio of 4 palmi in height, with a gilded frame no. 1—400 [scudi]—” [“ Un Quadro con tre figure che giocono a Carte mano del Caravaggio di p.mo 4 di Altezza inc.a con Cornice d’orata no. 1”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 297).

5. 1672: Inventory at the division between the two heirs of Cardinal Antonio Barberini’s estate, “253) a painting of 4 palmi in height with three figures playing cards, by Michel’Angolo da Caravaggio in a gold frame 400 [scudi]” [“Un quadro di p.mi 4 – di Altezza con tre figure che giocono a Carte, mano di *Michel’Angolo da Caravaggio* con Cornice d’orata 400”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 346).

6. August 16–17, 1672: Inventory of the Palazzo Barberini, the residence of Prince Don Maffeo, the heir of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, “17) an oblong painting of three figures playing cards 5½ palmi in length, circa 4 high, with a plain gilt frame, by Caravaggio” [“Un Quadro oblongo con tre figure che giocano a Carte lungo p.mi 5½ e alto 4 Incirca con Cornice liscia tutta dorata *mano del Caravaggio*”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 363).

7. 1686: Inventory of the estate of Prince Maffeo Barberini, “72) an oblong painting with three cardplayers, about 5 palmi long, 4 palmi high, with a plain gilt frame hand of Caravaggi” [“Un quadro p lungo, con tre Giocatori di carte lungo p. 5 alto p. 4 incirca, con cornice liscia dorata mano del Caravaggi”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 397; Macioce 2003, p. 367).

8. 1730: Inventory of Francesco Barberini, Prince of Palestrina, as by Caravaggio, “A painting with three players of cards” [“Un Quadro con tre Giocatori di carte”] (Getty Provenance Index 19).

9. 1812: Inventory of the Palazzo Colonna di Sciarra, Rome, taken by V. Camuccini and G. Landi (Mahon 1951, p. 229 n. 67; Mahon 1990, p. 10, n. 45).

10. 1818: Inventory of the Fidecommissario taken of the pictures of Prince Maffeo Barberini Colonna di Sciarra with a provenance from the Barberini, “no. 15 a Card players by Caravaggio” [“Giucatori del Caravaggio”](Mahon 1990, p. 10).

Documents:

1. 1615: In two letters from Rome, dated February 20 and July 10, 1615, to his brother Deifebo, Giulio Mancini wrote that he intended to hire a good painter to make a copy of the *Musica* belonging to Cardinal Del Monte (without obtaining permission) and asked whether copies of the *Bari* and the *Buona ventura* would be of possible interest to the client, Agostino Chigi (Maccherini 1997, docs. 28, 34).

2. May 8, 1628: Recorded in the account book of Antonio Barberini who paid 550 scudi to Alessandro Del Monte for a large group of paintings and books, that included “a large painting of Saint Catherine by Caravaggio, one of a player by the same” [“. . .un quadro grande d’una santa Catherina del Caravaggio, uno d’un giocatore del medesimo . . .”] (Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana Archivio Barberini, Computisteria 223, fol. 22 recto MDXXVIII di 15 giugno; Wolfe 1985, p. 452).

3. June 20, 1642: Carlo Magnone (Rome, 1620–55) pupil of Andrea Sacchi, commissioned to paint a copy of the *Cardsharps* and *Lute Player*, both by Caravaggio, in the Barberini collection, “22 scudi paid to Carlo Magnone painter for having copied two paintings by Caravaggio one of three people playing a game and the other one of a lute player” [“. . .sc. ventedue m.ta buoni a Siri pagati a *Carlo Magnone* pittore p haver copiato due quadri del *Caravaggio* uno con tre persone che giocano e l’altro con uno che sona il leuto - 22”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 9, no. 78).

Sources:

1. Scannelli 1642 (1657, p. 197): “And in the palace of His Eminence Antonio Barberini one sees a painting of half length figures, that shows them marvelously playing cards, a subject conducive to his genius, and as a result of rare beauty.” [“Et appresso l’Eminentissimo Antonio Barberini si vede un Quadro di mezze figure al naturale, che dimostrano giocare mirabilmente alle carte, inventione molto al di lui genio confacevole, e per conseguenza in tal particolare di rara bellezza. . . .”]

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 216): “Another painting worthy of the same praise is in the apartment of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, and it represents three half-figures playing cards. Here Michele represented a simple youth holding cards and dressed in a dark suit, his head well drawn from life. Opposite him in profile, a fraudulent youth who leans one hand on the gaming table and with the other, held behind him, takes a false card from his belt. A third figure near the boy looks at the marks on cards and with three fingers reveals them to his companion. The companion leans on the table exposing his shoulder to the light; he wears a yellow jacket striped with black bands. There is nothing false in the coloring of this work. These are the first strokes from Michele’s brush in the clear manner of Giorgione, with tempered shadows. By acclaiming Michele’s new style, Prospero augmented the renown of his works among the leading persons of the court—to his own advantage as well as to that of Caravaggio. The *Card Game* was bought by Cardinal Del Monte, who was such an enthusiastic lover of paintings that he helped Caravaggio out of his difficulties by giving him an honored place in his house among his gentlemen” [“. . . ed un altro degno dell’istessa lode nelle camere del Cardinale Antonio Barberini, disposto in tre mezze figure ad un giuoco di carte. Finsevi un giovinetto semplice con le carte in mano, ed è una testa ben ritratta dal vivo in abito oscuro, e di rincontro a lui si volge in profilo un giovane fraudolente, appoggiato con una mano su la tavola del giuoco, e con l’altra dietro, si cava una carta falsa dalla cinta, mentre il terzo vicino al giovinetto guarda li punti delle carte, e con tre dita della mano li palesa al compagno, il quale nel piegarsi su ’l tavolino espone la spalla al lume in giubbone giallo listato di fascie nere, né finto è il colore nell’imitazione. Sono questi li primi tratti del pennello di Michele in quella schietta maniera di Giorgione, con oscuri temperati; e Prospero acclamando il nuovo stile di Michele accresceva la stima delle sue opere con util proprio fra le prime persone della corte. Il gioco fu comprato dal Cardinale Del Monte, che per dilettersi molto della pittura ridusse in buono stato Michele e lo sollevò, dandogli luogo onorato in casa fra suoi gentiluomini.”(Friedlaender 1955, p. 247).

3. Baldinucci 1681, III, p. 682: Barberini collection (paraphrases Bellori 1672).

4. Rossini 1693, p. 56: Barberini collection.

5. Dézaillier d’Argenville 1745 (1762, I, p. 89): Barberini collection.

6. Engraved by G. Volpato, 1772: Palazzo Barberini.

7. von Ramdohr 1787, II, p. 285: Barberini collection.

8. Vasi 1763 (ed. 1794, p. 450; ed. 1807, p. 285): Palazzo Barberini.

Exhibitions:

New York 1987; New York 1989–90; Florence 1991; Washington 1996; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 11 (London only); Cremona-New York 2004.

Bibliography:

Burckhardt 1855, p. 1048; Vicchi 1889, pp. 43–44, pl. IV; Venturi 1896, p. 98; Kallab 1906–7, p. 281 (traced provenance to Sciarra collection from whence sold in 1812 to a “Mr. Rothschild”); Marangoni 1922–23, p. 51 (not Caravaggio); Pevsner 1927/28, p. 390; Longhi 1928/29 (on basis of photograph taken at Sciarra sale, Caravaggio, c. 1593); Mahon 1951, pp. 229 n.67, 234 (1597–98, lost original); Mahon 1951², pp. 286–92 (publishes photograph); Longhi 1952, pp. 15, 19, 20–21 (1591–92); Mahon 1952 pp. 4, 9 n. 40, 19 (1593–94, lost original); Hinks 1953, no. 7 (1594–95); Mahon 1953, pp. 213 n.7, 216 n.27; Baumgart 1955, no. 13; Czobor 1955, pp. 208–9; Friedlaender 1955, no. 9; Arslan 1959, p. 202; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 25, 168, 266, 277–79; Longhi 1960 (1592–93); Jullian 1961, pp. 49, 53, 71, 226 (c. 1596); Salerno 1966, p. 110; Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1971, no. 30 (uncertain); Marini 1974, no. 11 (lost original); Röttgen 1974, p. 198; Wind 1974, pp. 31–34; Aronberg Lavin 1975, pp. 167, 297, 346, 397; Moir 1976, pp. 104–7, no. 52 (original lost); Meloni Trkulja 1977, pp. 47, 50 n. 4; Nicolson 1979, p. 34; Moir 1982, pp. 15, 25 fig. 29 (1594); Cinotti 1983, no. 70; Hibbard 1983, no. 10; Spike 1983, p. 40; Wolfe 1985, p. 452 n. 16; Mahon 1988, pp. 19–21 (rediscovered lost original); Christiansen 1988, pp. 26–27; Gregori 1987; Marini 1987; Marini 1989, pp. 386–89, no. 16 (as *Il baro*, Rome 1594); Calvesi 1990, pp. 228–29; Mahon 1990, p. 5; Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono. . .* 1991, no. 2; Cinotti 1991 p. (1594–95); Bologna 1992, p. 303 (1594); Gregori 1994, p. 36, 145, no. 6 (c. 1594); Waźbiński 1994, pp. 605–6; Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1594); Gilbert 1995, pp. 123–24, 125, 127, 159, 203–7; Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, p. 3 (1594–95); Feigenbaum in Washington 1996, pp. 153–54; Langdon 1998, pp. 89–93; Macioce 1998, p. 337 (1594–98, Minniti is model); Puglisi 1998, no. 7 (c. 1594–95); Robb 1998, p. 499 (1594); Langdon in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 11 (c. 1595); Spike 2001, pp. 37–46, cat. no. 4

(c. 1594); Macioce 2003, p. 367; Christiansen in Bayer 2004, pp. 170–71 (c. 1595); Sgarbi 2005, no. 9 (c. 1595); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 25 (c. 1595); Tresoldi 2006, p. 74 (1594–95); Varriano 2006, pp. 1–2, 40, 105, 117, 122–24, 131, fig. 12; Debono 2007, p. 13; Gregori in Forli 2008, pp. 20–49 (publishes a version in the Mahon collection; for additional bibliography see Other Works Attributed, no. 102 *infra*); Papa 2008, pp. 21–22 (1595–96); Franits in Frankfurt 2009, pp. 37–53; Grundy in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, p. 32.

The Cardsharps, known also by its Italian title, *I bari*, represents the young Caravaggio's revival of the secular genre subjects that were popularized by Giorgione and other Venetian painters in the first half of the century. Such mischievous subjects were deliberately discouraged in papal Rome following the Council of Trent, which accounts perhaps for the enormous success of this oft-copied composition. The work cemented Caravaggio's reputation as a radical realist. Though Mancini does not mention it in his *Trattato*, no doubt because of its forbidden subject, he desired to have a copy made of it.

Bellori cited *The Cardsharps* as an early work that attracted the attention of Cardinal Del Monte around 1594. Baglione (1642, p. 136) wrote that Del Monte first acquired some pictures by Caravaggio from the shop of a picture dealer named Valentino located near the church of San Luigi dei Francesi. On February 20, 1615, Giulio Mancini wrote to Deifebo Mancini, Siena, that he intended to hire a good painter to make a copy of the *Musica* (cat. no. 6) belonging to Cardinal Del Monte (without obtaining permission) and asked whether copies of the *Bari* and the *Buona ventura* (cat. no. 5) would be of possible interest to the client, Agostino Chigi (Maccherini 1997, doc. 28).

See pp. 37–46.

Condition:

The painting was cleaned and relined in 1987. This restoration revealed that the canvas had been enlarged at an unknown date by approximately 5½ inches (14 cm) along its upper margin. A collection stamp identifiable as that of Cardinal Francesco Del Monte was found on the back of the original canvas. See *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, pp. 102–9, for a

detailed report of the technical analyses conducted at the Kimbell Art Museum in 1987 in consultation with Keith Christiansen.

Copies and Versions:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C.1

Rome, 1615: In two letters from Rome, dated February 20 and July 10, 1615, to his brother Deifebo, Giulio Mancini wrote that he intended to hire a good painter to make a copy of the *Musica* belonging to Cardinal Del Monte (without obtaining permission) and asked whether copies of the *Bari* and the *Buona ventura* would be of possible interest to the client, Agostino Chigi (Maccherini 1997, docs. 28, 34).

C.2

Rome, Collection of Ottavio Costa

Inventories:

1. 1633: Inventory of the Palazzo di Albenga, a painting of three rogues who are playing dice with a gilt frame 7 palmi long and high likewise [“un quadro di tre furbi che giocano a dadi con cornici tutte indorate di larghezza palmi 7 e di altezza altrettanto] (Costa Restagno 2004 p. 138).

2. January 18–23, 1639: Inventory of the objects in the house of Ottavio Costa, Rome, at his death: “94. And another painting of three cardplayers/friends of one who made the Caravaggio with its frame” [“94. E più un altro quadro delli tre giocatori / compagno d’uno che fece il Caravaggio con la sua cornice”] (Spezzaferro 1974, p. 584; Costa Restagno 2004, no. 74, p. 100).

3. 1640: a painting of three youths, of whom two are playing cards [“un quadro di tre doi de quali giocano a carte”] (Costa Restagno 2004, pp. 100–101).

Bibliography:

Spezzaferro 1974, p. 584; Cinotti 1983, p. 554; Marini 1989, p. 388; Spike 2001, cat. no. 4.c.2; Costa Restagno 2004, pp. 100–101, 138; Terzaghi 2007, pp. 305–6, it seems to be another copy of the *Bari*, the owner of which was a friend of the banker, Ottavio Costa.

C.3

Rome, Barberini Collection, June 20, 1642: Carlo Magnone (Rome, 1620–55) pupil of Andrea Sacchi, commissioned to paint a copy of the *Cardsharps* and *Lute Player*; both by Caravaggio, in the Barberini collection, “22 scudi of paid to Carlo Magnone painter for having copied two paintings by Caravaggio one of three people playing a game and the other one of a lute player” [“. . .sc. ventedue m.ta buoni a Siri pagati a *Carlo Magnone* pittore p haver copiato due quadri del *Caravaggio* uno con tre persone che giocano e l’altro con uno che sona il leuto - 22”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 9, no. 78; Macioce 2003, II. doc. 482, p. 295).

C.4

Bologna, March 29, 1665: A copy was offered for sale to Pietro Aimondi as the agent of the Duke of Mantua, Carlo II di Nevers, for 400 *scudi*, who called it “exquisite.” Probably the same painting was offered again in Bologna on June 13, 1665, to Cardinal Leopold de’ Medici of Florence for 200 *doppie* by his Bolognese agent, Annibale Ranuzzi, comparable to a *Concert* by Giorgione then in the Medici collection, today at the Palazzo Pitti, Florence. No record of a sale to either party is recorded. (Luzio 1913, p. 10; Cinotti 1971, p. 93; Meloni Trkulja 1977, pp. 46–50, Cinotti 1983, pp. 554–55; Spike 2001, cat. no. 4.c.4).

C.5

Rome, 1621: Marchese Sannesio: A painting of “three playing persons” was stolen when the Marchese lent it to Antonio Orsini to be copied. The original was valued at 200 scudi (Bertolotti 1881, II, p. 76; Friedlaender 1955, p. 154; Moir 1976, p. 106 no. 52r; Cinotti 1971, p. 162 F 98, Cinotti 1983, pp. 554–55; Spike 2001, cat. no. 4.c.5).

c.6

Bologna, December 9, 1680: The posthumous inventory of Giuseppe Prandi cites “three players of half figures with a gilt frame said to be by the hand of sig.r Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio” (Morselli 1997, inv. 310; Spike 2001 cat. no 4.c.6).

II. Selected copies are listed by Kitson 1969, p. 88; Moir 1976, pp. 105–7, no. 52; Marini 1974, pp. 348–49; Marini 1979, p. 77; Cinotti 1983, pp. 554–55; Marini 1989, p. 381.

c.7

New York, Knoedler & Co. (formerly)

Oil on canvas, 39 x 54 in. (99 x 137 cm)

Provenance:

Sold Sotheby’s London July 16, 1969, lot 36; Rome art market; collection Baron Antoine de Rothschild, Paris.

Bibliography:

Venturi 1950, pp. 41–42 (found in storehouse in New York, Antoine de Rothschild, repainted, poor condition); Berenson 1951, pp. 18–19, 46; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1593–94); Baumgart 1955 (copy); Friedlaender 1955, p. 154 (not entirely good condition, left half much restored, right is very well executed and corresponds to photograph of Sciarra picture); Longhi 1960, pp. 32–33 (notes difference with Sciarra, copy); de Logu 1962 (as Caravaggio); Bottari 1966 (copy); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 30 (1596); Kitson 1969, no. 15 (called by Bellori Caravaggio’s first work, best version, same dimensions as Louvre *Fortune-Teller*); Cinotti 1971 (best version, Sciarra lost original); Moir 1976, p. 105 no. 52g, 137 n. 232 (high quality); Cinotti 1983, p. 555 (copy); Marini 1989, p. 388 (perhaps by Carlo Magnone for Cardinal Antonio Barberini in 1642); Spike 2001, cat. no. 4.c.7 (copy).

5. *Fortune-Teller (Buona ventura)*, c. 1594

Oil on canvas, 45¼ x 59 in. (115 x 150 cm)

Pinacoteca Capitolina, Rome, inv. 227

Provenance:

Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, Rome, by 1615; by descent to Ugucione Del Monte and then to Alessandro Del Monte, Rome, 1626; sold as Caravaggio by heirs on February 21, 1628; from whence probably purchased by Cardinal Pio di Carpi di Savoia, Rome; in 1749 sold by his great nephew Prince Gilberto Pio di Savoia (in a collection of 126 paintings) to Benedict XIV (Pope 1740–58); the Pio collection together with the Sacchetti collection became the founding collections of the Pinacoteca Capitolina.

Inventories:

1. February 21, 1627: Inventory of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “A Gypsy by Caravaggio, five palmi large, with a black frame” [“Una Zingara del Caravaggio grande Palmi cinque con cornice negra”] (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol. 575v; Frommel 1972, p. 31).
2. May 5, 1628: Listed among items sold to pay debts of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “On 5 May for a Shepherd and a Gypsy by Caravaggio . . .” [“A 5 d Per il Coridone e Zingara del Caravaggio . . .”] (Nota del denaro retratto dalla vendita de Mobili del Giardino di Ripetta doppo otto scuti il Breve posto del Banco di S. Spirito, Kirwin 1972, p. 54–55; Macioce 2003 p. 290, II, doc 468).
3. 1641: Inventory of the estate of Cardinal Carlo Emanuele Pio di Savoia: “A painting with a gypsy who holds the hand of a youth while reading his fortune on canvas 5½ palmi high 6¾ palmi wide with a black frame” [“Un quadro con una Zingara, che tiene la mano d’un giovane in atto di dirgli la ventura in tela alto p.mi 5 1/6 largo p.mi 6¾ con cornice nera”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990, p. 90; Macioce 2003, pp. 355–56, no. 35).

4. December 9–11, 1697: Listed among the 138 paintings lent by Francesco Pio di Savoia, to an annual exhibition of paintings shown in the church of San Salvatore in Lauro. The exhibition showed a notable selection of the collection of Pio di Savoia, which had been acquired from the Del Monte collection in 1628, including the *Fortune-Teller (Buona ventura)* and the *Saint John the Baptist (San Giovanni Battista)* (cat. no. 29) by Caravaggio (Guarini 1994, p. 102).

5. March 3–April 4, 1724: Inventory of the estate of Francesco Pio di Savoia (d. 15 September 1723), “n. 74. A painting of a Gypsy, who holds the hand of a young man in the act of telling his fortune, the youth has a yellow shirt trimmed in black, with a gray lining, and a black hat with a white feather, on canvas, 5½ palmi high, 6¾ palmi long, with a gilt frame by Caravaggio” [“n. 74. Un quadro con una Zingara, che tiene la mano d’un giovane in atto di dirli la ventura, il giovane hà un zaio giallo guernito di nero foderato di bigio con cappello nero, e penna bianca in tela, alto palmi 5½ largo palmi 6¾ con cornice dorato del Caravaggio”] (Guarini 1994, p. 121).

6. 1740 (1742): Inventory of the collection of Cardinal Pio di Savoia prepared by Francesco Trevisani, as “hand of Annibale Caracci” (Battisti 1955, 182; Cinotti 1983, p. 519; Guarini 1994, p. 103)

7. November 18, 1749: Inventory of Prince Gilberto Pio di Savoia prepared by Pannini on the occasion of the sale to Benedict XIV Lambertini, “A painting measuring 5 palmi, by 7 long, with an antique gilt frame, representing a Gypsy, who tells the fortune of a Soldier, original by Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio, valued at 300 scudi” [“Un quadro di misura di palmi 5, e 7 per traverso, con cornice antica tutta dorata, rappresentante una Zingara, che dice la ventura ad un Soldato, originale di Michel’ Angelo da Caravaggio, di valore scudi 300”] (Battisti 1955, 182; Cinotti 1983, p. 519; Guarini 1994, p. 103).

Document:

1. 1615: In two letters from Rome, dated February 20 and July 10, 1615 to his brother Deifebo, Giulio Mancini wrote that he intended to hire a good painter to make a copy of the *Musica* belonging to Cardinal Del Monte (without obtaining permission) and asked whether copies of the *Bari* and the *Buona ventura* would be of possible interest to the client, Agostino Chigi (Maccherini 1997, docs. 28, 34).

Sources:

1. Possibly referred to by Mancini 1619–21 (1956, I, p. 224): “I am told that he stayed in the house of Cavaliere Giuseppe and Monsignore Fantin Petrignani who gave him the use of a room. During this time he painted many pictures and in particular of a gypsy telling a young man’s fortune . . . (p. 140) . . . Caravaggio sold the Gypsy for eight scudi.” [“Doppo mi vien detto che stesse in casa del Cav.^r Giuseppe e di Mons.^r Fantin Petrignani, che li dava commodità d’una stanza nel qual tempo fece molti quadri, et in particolare una Zingara, che dà la Bonaventura ad un giovanetto.[145r] . . . come si vedde nel Caravaggio che vendè . . . la Zingara per otto scudi”].

2. Baglione 1642, p. 136: Caravaggio painted for Cardinal Del Monte, “He made a beautifully colored painting of a gypsy telling the fortune of a young man.” [“Effigiò una Zinghera, che dava la ventura ad un giovane con bel colorito.”]

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 9; Paris 1977; New York-Naples 1985, no. 67; Rome 1987; Florence 1991 no. 1; Milan 1999, cat. no. 4; Rome 2000, pp. 275–76; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 10 (London only); Milan 2005, cat. no. 4; Siena-Rome 2005, cat. no. 6.4.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1913, pp. 26 n. 1 (as Saraceni, “Saraceni never errs, even when he copies Caravaggio as he did in the Barberini *Lute Player* and in the *Fortune-Teller* in the Capitoline” [“Saraceni per questo lato non si smentisce mai, né pure quando copi Caravaggio, come appare nella *Suonatrice* Barberini e nella *Buona Ventura* della Capitolina”]); Voss 1924, p. 74, pl. 6 (autograph); Bocconi 1926, no. 131, p. 284 (Saraceni, “For a considerable period the canvas was attributed to Caravaggio upon the testimony of Bellori. . . . However the Capitolina picture lacks the subtle elegance found in the works of Caravaggio’s first manner, as is also absent the vigorous modeling of the master’s mature style. Hence the picture should probably be attributed to his follower and imitator, Carlo Saraceni.”); Pevsner 1927–28, p. 390; Benkard 1928, pp. 98–107 (Saraceni); Bocconi 1930, p. 379 (Saraceni); Schudt 1942, no. 12; Longhi 1943, p. 9 (variant of Louvre, but original); Arslan 1951, p. 445 (“we find ourselves before a late copy”); Longhi in

Milan 1951, no. 9; Mahon 1951, p. 234 n. 112 (“The Capitolina version of this subject is . . . obscured by quantities of discoloured varnish. But the composition is in every detail more flaccid than the Louvre version; ‘Caravaggio made easy’, without particular accent, without the spice. . . . it must be by a superficially clever and relatively early imitator”); Baumgart 1955, p. 182 (rejects); Grassi 1955; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 152–53, no. 8B (not painting mentioned by Bellori, possibly one in Mancini, “not necessarily an original”); Wagner 1958, p. 227; Arslan 1959, p. 214 n. 36 (rejects); Berne Joffroy 1959; Jullian 1961, p. 49 (rejects); De Logu 1962 (rejects); Salerno 1966, p. 110 (rejects); Moir 1967, p. 20 (old copy); Guttoso–Ottino Della Chiesa 1967, no. 15 (variant of Louvre, formerly attributed to Saraceni); Kitson 1969, no. 9 (variant, figure style slack); Cinotti 1971, pp. 102–3, 183 n. 167–69 (old copy optimum quality); Spezzaferro 1971, p. 84 (rejects, Frommel documents refer to Louvre picture); Frommel 1972, pp. 39–40 (connects to Del Monte with early chronology 1595–96, earlier than Louvre); Kirwin 1972, pp. 53, 55; Salerno 1972, pp. 234, 236; Gregori 1974, p. 38; Marini 1974, no. 12, pp. 102–3, 350–51 (Caravaggio, 1594; observes silicon grains in paints’ surface); Röttgen 1974, pp. 189, 198; Wind 1974, p. 31 (rapport with *Commedia dell’Arte*); Moir 1976, pp. 84 no.4e, 122–23 n.181 (variant copy of painting in Louvre, with numerous changes in details); Caruso 1978, pp. 27–30; Nicolson 1979, p. 34 (copy); Spear 1979, p. 318 (copy); Moir 1982, p. 68 (copy); Cordaro 1980, pp. 103–6 (Caravaggio c. 1593); Cinotti 1983, no. 58 (remains unsure, Capitolina later); Hibbard 1983, p. 273 (copy); Gregori 1985, no. 67 (rejects possibility that this was pair with *Cardsharps*, p. 218; Capitolina version predates Louvre, p. 219–20, as proof 1977 x-ray shows painting in style of d’Arpino beneath present image); Wolfe 1985, p. 452 n. 25 (generally regarded as copy of Louvre); Mahon 1988, pp. 23–24; Christiansen 1988, pp. 26–27; Marini 1989, pp. 389–91, no. 17 (Rome 1594); Tittoni Monti in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 179–84; E. Zivieri–C. Caneva in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 184–97; Christiansen in New York 1990, pp. 54–55; Mahon 1990, pp. 5, 16 n. 89 (very early work, earlier than Louvre based on x-rays underpainting is d’Arpinesque); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono. . .* 1991, no. 1; Bologna 1992, p. 303–4 (disagrees with Mahon, later, 1594); Spike 1992², pp. 275–77; Caruso 1993, pp. 27–30; Gregori 1994, p. 33, 145, no. 5 (1593–94); Guarino 1994, p. 102, 121; Gilbert 1995, pp. 42, 112–14, 124, 127, 152, 203, 215, 282 n.4 (stylistic analysis not credible; “The biographical information points to the Louvre version as earlier than Del Monte’s. Longhi reasonably called it unlikely that Caravaggio would have agreed to the sale at a distress price if he had a secure lodging, so it must have taken place before he

moved into Del Monte's house, thus no later than 1595"); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1594); Langdon 1998, pp. 84–88; Macioce 1998, p. 337 (in Paris version of *Buona ventura* c. 1596, 19-year-old Minniti substituted for anonymous gentleman); Porzio in Bergamo 1998, pp. 25–28; Puglisi 1998, no. 8 (c. 1594–95); Robb 1998, p. 499 (1594); Vodret 1998, pp. 39–40; Guarino in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 90–91 (not exhibited); Guarino in Milan 1999, cat. no. 4; Langdon in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 10 (1593–94); Marini 2001, no. 20, pp. 404–6; Spike 2001, pp. 37–41, ill. p. 72, cat. no. 5 (c. 1593); Moffit 2002, pp. 129–56; Guarino and Maccherini in *Siena e Roma* 2005, cat. no. 6.4, pp. 408–11 (1594–95); Sgarbi 2005, no. 4 (c. 1594–95); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 25 (c. 1595); Varriano 2006, p. 117; Papa 2008, pp. 19–22 (1595); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, p. 51.

This *Fortune-Teller* is generally recognized today as Caravaggio's first treatment of a provocative theme which he subsequently repeated and perfected in the painting in the Louvre in Paris (cat. no. 15). There is some confusion in the sources but it seems most likely that the present picture is the Gypsy painted in a room provided him by Monsignor Petriagnani after leaving d'Arpino's workshop. The reappearance of the *Cardsharps*, (cat. no. 4) which also belonged to Cardinal Del Monte, helped to bring into focus Caravaggio's style around 1594. The fact that Caravaggio painted this *Fortune-Teller* on top of a canvas he had already used for a praying Madonna would appear to reflect his unsettled financial circumstances in this period.

Although no direct copies of this *Fortune-Teller* are known, the composition inspired imitations by the artist's many followers, including Simon Vouet and Valentin du Boulogne.

In the *Fortune-Teller*, the *Cardsharps*, and the *Boy with a Basket of Fruit*, Caravaggio carried Leonardo's advice to paint the poses of people in their most natural attitudes to an extreme. That Caravaggio did not pose his card players or fortune teller in classical stances, as Mannerists would have, proves that he had deliberate uses for such motifs when he did employ them, for example in his *Self-Portrait as Bacchus*.

See pp. 37–41, illustrated at p. 72.

Condition:

Good. The painting was restored in 1984–86 by Elena Zivieri under the direction of Maria Elisa Tittoni Monti (1989). Radiographs executed in 1977 and 1986 revealed that the *Fortune-Teller* was painted on top of an image of the Madonna with praying hands with the canvas oriented vertically. See Cordaro 1980, Zivieri-Caneva 1989, and Caruso 1993.

See *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, pp. 91–95, for a detailed technical report.

Copies:

None recorded. See cat. no. 15.

6. *Musicians*, c. 1595

Oil on canvas, 34⁵/₈ x 45¹/₄ in. (87.9 x 115.9 cm)

Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, Rogers Fund, inv. 52.81

Inscribed (lower left) in a later hand c. 1700:

MI]CHELANG[ELO].DA CARAVA / [G]IO

Provenance:

Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, Rome, by 1615; by descent to Ugucione Del Monte and then to Alessandro Del Monte, Rome, 1626; sold by heirs on February 21, 1628; probably the painting given by Cardinal Antonio Barberini to the Duc de Créquy (ambassador in Rome 1633–34, died 1638); probably purchased from his estate by Cardinal Richelieu (d. 1643); sold at his estate sale January 7–February 8, 1650, no. 996, for 1,030 livres tournois to Marie Wignerod de Pontcourlay, duchesse d'Aiguillon, Richelieu's niece (d. 1675); sale of the collection of Earl of Lonsdale, Whitehaven Castle, England 1920; David Burns, Fernacre, Whitehaven, Cumberland, England (inv. 1933, no. 846); Mrs. David Burns, Fernacre (d. 1947); sold shortly before her death to Joe Cookson, Kendal; sold to Surgeon Captain W. G. Thwaytes, Maulds Meaburn, Penrith, England for £100; sale Christie's February 9, 1951; purchased by The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Rogers Fund, 1952.

Inventories:

1. February 21, 1627: Inventory of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “a Concert by Michelangelo da Caravaggio with a black frame, about 5 palmi” [“Una Musica di mano di Michelangelo da Caravaggio con cornice negra di palmi cinque in circa”] (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol. 581v; Frommel 1972, p. 35).

2. May 7, 1628: Listed among items sold to pay debts of Cardinal Francesco Maria del Monte, “On May 8th, for a painting of youths singing, a carafe of flowers, by Caravag . . .” [“A di 8 d. Per un quadro di Giovani che ca[n]tano, una caraffa di fiori del Caravag . . .”] (Nota del denaro retratto dalla vendita de Mobili del Giardino di Ripetta doppo otto scuti il Breve posto del Banco di S. Spirito, Kirwin 1972, p. 55).

3. May 10–July 12, 1638: Inventory of the paintings in the collection of Maréchal Charles I de Créquy taken some months after his death “a concert painted by Caravage in a gold frame” [“CXIX Item une musique du Caravage peincte sur bois et garnie de sa bordure dorée prisee”] (Boyer–Volf 1988, pp. 23, 31; Mahon 1990, p. 21, n. 61).

4. 1643: Inventory of the paintings of Cardinal de Richelieu: “996. another painting of a musical concert, a first class work by Caravage in a gilt frame, estimate 1 000 lt” [“996. Item, un autre tableau d’un Concert de musique le premier oeuvre de Caravage garny de sa bordure de bois dorè, prisè et estimé la somme de 1 000 lt”] (Boyer–Volf 1988, pp. 23, 31; Mahon 1990, p. 21, n. 61).

Sources:

1. Baglione 1642, p. 136: [Caravaggio] painted for the Cardinal [Del Monte] “a *Concert of Youths* which was drawn quite well from nature” [“Dipinse per il cardinale [Del Monte] una Musica di alcuni giovani ritratti dal naturale assai bene”].

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 216): “Caravaggio painted for the Cardinal [Del Monte] a concert of youths in half figure” [“Dipinse per questo signore [Card. del Monte] una musica di giovini ritratti dal naturale in mezze figure”].

Exhibitions:

Fort Worth 1954; Boston 1970; Cleveland 1971–72, no. 15; New York-Naples 1985, no. 69; New York 1990, cat. no. 3; Florence 1991, no. 3; Athens 1992, cat. no. 6; Rome 1992, cat. no. 3; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 84–89; Bergamo 2000, no. 23; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 28; Siena-Rome 2005, no. 6.3; Naples 2007, cat. no. 11; Milan 2009, cat. no. 2.

Bibliography:

Burns–Carritt 1952, pp. 119–20; Longhi 1952, p. 19 (1590, doubts Del Monte provenance); Mahon 1952 pp. 3–23 (p. 3 n. 9 “It bears in the left bottom corner an inscription of considerable age [at least eighteenth century] reading: ‘CHELANG.DA CARAVA/GIO.’”), p. 19 (1594–95); Mahon 1952², pp. 20–31 (1594–95, publishes Del Monte reference); Baumgart 1952, p. 98 (1589); Berenson 1953, p. 7, pl. 9; Hinks 1953, no. 6 (1593–94); Mahon 1953², pp. 33ff; Baumgart 1955, no. 5 (1590–92, doubts Del Monte reference); Czobor 1955, pp. 206–10 (both the figures of the youth in the background and the principal figure are self-portraits); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 148–49, no. 5 (youthful work; notes overpainted wings on the youth at left); Samek Ludovici 1956, p. 121; Wagner 1958, pp. 21–23, 45, 226 (1590–92); Arslan 1959, p. 198 (1585–90); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 328–31; Jullian 1961, pp. 49–43, 58–59 (c. 1595, doubts Del Monte reference); de Logu 1962, no. 5, pl. IV; Waterhouse 1962, pp. 22–23; Venturi 1963 (c. 1593); Causa 1966, I, fig. 2; Salerno–Kinkead 1966, pp. 108–12; Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 3 (1591–92); Dell’Arco 1968, p. 50; Longhi 1968, p. 14 (copy of lost original); Kitson 1969, no. 12 (1596, based on Baglione and Bellori, first picture commissioned by Cardinal Del Monte); Salerno 1970, p. 242; Calvesi 1971, pp. 110–11; Cinotti 1971, pp. 99–101 (bad condition, 1595–96); Posner 1971, pp. 303–13; Spear 1971, n. 15 (1595); Spezzaferro 1971, pp. 60–87; Fredericksen and Zeri 1972, pp. 44, 501, 608; Nicolson 1972, p. 113 (poor condition, but autograph); Frommel 1972, pp. 32–39; Kirwin 1972, pp. 53, 55; Volpe 1972, pp. 60–61; Röttgen 1974, p. 173, 183, 189, 190, 198; Marini 1974, pp. 20–21 (1594); Moir 1976, pp. 84–85 no. 7, 123 n.183 (allegory of love); Nicolson 1979, p. 34; Gash 1980, p. 35; Magnuson 1982, p. 83 (commissioned by Cardinal Del Monte); Moir 1982, p. 70 (1595–96); Cinotti 1983, no. 38 (1595–96); Hibbard 1983, no. 15; Spike 1983, p. 40; Freedberg 1983, p. 56; Marini 1983, p. 127–31; Trinchieri and Ziino 1983, pp. 68–72; Spear 1984, p. 162; Colin Slim 1985, pp. 241–42; Gregori 1985, no. 69, pp. 228–35 (1595–96); Wolfe 1985, p. 451; Christiansen 1986, p. 441

(badly damaged); Boyer-Volf 1988, pp. 23, 31; Marini 1989, pp. 374–77, no. 12 (Rome 1594); Milesi 1989, pp. 23–24, 52, 54, 58–60; Trinchieri Camiz 1989, pp. 198, 200, 203; Calvesi 1990 (1595–97); Mahon 1990, pp. 12, n. 61; Posèq 1990³, pp. 113–21 pl. 3 (1594); Christiansen 1990; Posèq 1990; Bonsanti 1991, pp. 8–9, 11, pl. 7; Camiz 1991, pp. 213–36; Cinotti 1991, pp. 31, 36, 198, fig. 9 (1595–96); Cropper 1991 p. 194, fig.1; Gregori in Florence 1991, pp. 110–23; Lapucci in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991; Papi in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991; Trinchieri Camiz 1991, pp. 213, 218, 220–22; Bologna 1992, pp. 300–301 (1593); Krohn 1992, cat. no. 6; Röttgen 1992, p. 62; Gregori 1994, p. 38, 145, no. 7 (c. 1594–95); Ważbiński 1994, p. 605 (the composition is inspired by antique sculpture in the Del Monte collection, e.g. the Portland vase); Frommel in Macioce 1996, pp. 19–29 (1595); Gilbert 1995, pp. 114–16, 118–24, 127–28, 133, 139, 159, 216, 253; Langdon 1998, pp. 109–11, 113, 144–45; Macioce 1998, p. 337 (1594–98, Minnitti is model); Puglisi 1998, no. 9 (c. 1595); Robb 1998, p. 57–60, 500 (1595); Benedetti in Mormandi 1999, pp. 209; Macioce in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 84–89; Macioce in Bergamo 2000, pp. 198–200; Spike 2001, pp. 52–55, cat. no. 6 (c. 1595); Strinati and Vodret in London-Rome 2001, p. 91; Vodret in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 28 (c. 1595); Christiansen in Cremona-New York 2004, p. 249; Christiansen 2005, pp. 9–26; Maccherini in Siena-Rome 2005, pp. 406–7, cat. no. 6.3 (c. 1595); Marini 2005, no. 16, p. 398; Marini in St. Petersburg 2005, p. 29 (identifies the music as *O felici occhi miei*, a madrigal by Arcadelt 1546, on the basis of a copy in a private collection); Lapucci 2005, pp. 19–20, fig. 5, 44 fig. 23; Sgarbi 2005, no. 7 (intorno 1595); Marini in Athens 2006; Rosenberg 2006, p. 76; Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 6; Varriano 2006, pp. 14, 63, 105, 116, 120–21, 155 n 81, fig 11; Tresoldi 2006, p. 72; Scarpa in Naples 2007, pp. 38–41; Papa 2008, pp. 15–17, 55 (1594–95); Whitfield 2008, pp. 3–38 (as “La Musica” fig. 15); Christiansen 2009, pp. 36–37; Eclercy in Frankfurt 2009, p. 31; Papi in Milan 2009, pp. 21–27, 50.

Baglione describes this *Musicians* as Caravaggio’s first composition painted specifically for Cardinal Del Monte, who took the painter into his household in around 1595. Along with the two representations of *Lute Players*, the *Musicians* would thus exemplify the cardinal’s well-known interests in music and classical culture.

Longhi suggested that the painting represents a concert being performed in Del Monte’s palace by boys in antique dress. This reading seems insufficient given the presence of a

winged cupid at left. The *Musicians* revolves around a theatrical innovation: “the play within a play.” The boy with wings is merely pretending to be a cupid without the slightest hint of being mythological. An early owner of the *Musicians* thought these wings so inapt, he had them painted out. The rarified character of the *Musicians* did not strike a chord among the artist’s followers, who preferred Caravaggio’s depictions of ordinary daily life.

The *Musicians* was presented to the Maréchal de Créquy in 1634 by Cardinal Antonio Barberini, into whose possession it had passed following Del Monte’s death in 1628. Some years later, Bellori repeated Baglione’s description almost word for word because he was not acquainted with the original. The painting disappeared into private collections in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. The doubts expressed by Longhi and others at the time of the painting’s rediscovery by David Carritt and publication by Denis Mahon in 1951, are perhaps explainable by the picture’s precarious condition.

See pp. 52–55.

Condition:

Damaged. The painting has been many times restored in an effort to compensate for numerous losses believed to have been caused at an early date when the canvas was apparently removed from a wooden panel to which it had been glued. The written music is entirely restored and no longer legible. Traces of the artist’s name written in capital letters with gold leaf probably date from the ownership of Maréchal de Créquy.

See *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, pp. 114–22, for a detailed technical report by Roberta Lapucci.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

Rome, Giulio Mancini.

Documents:

1. February 20, 1615: Giulio Mancini wrote to Deifebo Mancini, Siena, that he would hire a good painter to make a copy of the *Musica* belonging to Cardinal Del Monte (without obtaining permission) for a client, Agostino Chigi (Maccherini 1997, doc. 28).

2. March 13, 1615: Giulio Mancini in a letter to Deifebo Mancini, Siena, described the painting as finished (Maccherini 1997, doc. 31).

3. July 3, 1615: Giulio Mancini wrote that the painting is sent (Maccherini 1997, doc. 33).

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 85 nos. 7a, 7b, fig. 17; Bologna 1992, p. 301; Marini 2005, no. 16, p. 398.

7. *Boy Bitten by a Lizard*

7.1 *Boy Bitten by a Lizard*, c. 1595

Oil on canvas, 25 x 19½ in. (66 x 49.5 cm)

The National Gallery, London, inv. NG6504

Provenance:

Sir Paul Methuen (as attributed to Murillo); acquired by Dr. Jones, bishop of Kildare; donated to Viscount Harcourt, Nuneham Park, Oxford in 1857; sold Christie's London, June 11, 1948, to Vincent Korda; London, Korda Collection; acquired 1986.

Exhibitions:

London 1948; New York-Naples, 1985; London 1986–87; Florence 1991, no. 4; Sydney-Melbourne 2003, no. 4; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.1.

7.2 *Boy Bitten by a Lizard*, c. 1600

Oil on canvas, 25³/₄ x 20⁵/₈ in. (65.8 x 52.3 cm)

Roberto Longhi Foundation, Florence

Provenance:

Collection P. d'Atri, Paris (nineteenth century); Rome, art market, 1925.

Exhibitions:

San Francisco 1938; Milan 1951, no. 4 (as original); Florence 1991, no. 4a; Rome 1995, no. 12; Cremona 1996, v. 4; Bergamo 2000, no. 10; Munich 2002; Florence 2003; Naples 2003; Sydney-Melbourne 2003, no. 5; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 1; Turin 2005; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 25.

Inventory:

Spezzaferro (in Calvesi and Volpi 2002, p.28); Macioce (2003, p. 345) refer to a painting of this subject identified as a self-portrait in two posthumous inventories of the collection left by Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps.

1. October 15, 1620: Inventory of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps. Archivio Altemps, Castello di Gallese, Viterbo: “122. a portrait by Caravaggio bit by a lizard 3½ palmi with a black frame decorated in gold, 18 scudi” [“122. un retratto di Caravaggia dove gli morsica una lucerta di p[almi] 3½ con cornice nero rabescato d’oro 18 scudi”].

2. c. 1620: Inventory of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps. Newberry Library, Chicago: “A painting of a portrait of Caravaggio bit by a lizard with a gilt frame by Caravaggio” [“Un quadro di un retratto del Caravaggio che li morde una lucertola con cornice dorata del Caravaggio”].

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–21, 59, 59v (1956, I, pp. 140, 224), “Afterwards, at about the age of 20, being poor, he stayed with Pandolfo Pucci from Recanati. . . . At this time he painted some copies of

devotional pictures, which are now in Recanati, and for the market, a boy who cries at being bitten by a lizard which he holds in his hand . . .” [added in Palatino manuscript: “. . . which is why, having sold it, he was encouraged that he would be able to support himself, and he left that ungenerous master and patron.”] [“Dopo se ne passo a Roma d’eta incirca 20 anni dove, essendo poco provviso di denari, stette con Pandolfo Pucci da Recanati . . . In questo tempo fece per esso alcune copie di devotione che sono in Recanati e, per vendere, un putto che piange per essere stato morso da un racano che tiene in mano e dopo pur un putto che mondava una pera con il cortello.” [nel manoscritto Palatino: “che fu causa che, vendutolo e preso animo da poter vivere da se, si parti da quel suo cosi scarso mastro e padrone . . .”]]

Caravaggio sold a *Boy Bitten by a Lizard* for 15 *giulii* (Friedlaender 1955, p. 154; Cinotti 1983, p. 435); in Palatino manuscript for 25 *giulii* (Gregori 1985, p. 237).

2. von Sandrart 1635 (1675, p. 189) “In the beginning he painted many faces and half-length figures in a sharp, dry manner. One of these is that of a child with a basket of flowers and fruit, from which a lizard emerges, biting the hand of the child who begins to cry bitterly, so that it is marvellous to look at and it caused his reputation to increase notably throughout Rome.” [“Ed egli produceva molte teste e mezze figure, tra le quali quella di un fanciulletto con un cesto pieno di fiori e di frutti, dal quale un ramarro lo mordeva a una mano, ed egli amaramente ne piangeva; opera di grande effetto, che aumentò notevolmente la sua fama in Roma.”]

3. Baglione 1642, p. 136: Next he stayed for some months in the house of Cavaliere Giuseppe d’Arpino. . . . He also painted a *Boy Bitten by a Lizard* which emerges from among the flowers and fruits. The boy seems truly to cry out and the whole is carefully executed.” [“Poi andò a stare in casa del Cavalier Gioseppe Cesari d’Arpino per alcuni mesi. . . . Fece anche un fanciullo che da una lucerta, la quale usciva da fiori, e da frutti, era morso; e pareva quella testa veramente stridere ed il tutto con diligenza era lavorato.”]

4. Some authorities propose a connection with a painting listed in the Borghese collection by Manilli (1650, p. 71) and de Sebastiani (1683, p. 24) in the Villa Borghese, Rome, ascribed to Caravaggio but representing a “Boy bitten by a crab” (*Fanciullo morso da un granchio*), a different subject.

Bibliography:

Kallab 1906–7 (cites sources without knowing picture); Boerenius 1925, pp. 23–26, ill. p. 24 (first published London/Korda version, as in collection of Viscount Harcourt, Nuneham Park, previously ascribed to Murillo, as by Caravaggio); Pevsner 1927–28, p. 390 (accepts London/Korda as original); Longhi 1928, pp. 21, 275 (first published Longhi picture as original by Caravaggio, London/Korda version as a “*copia antica*”); Schudt 1942, nos. 6–7 (both); Arslan 1951, p. 446 (“Both paintings display seventeenth-century execution, and based on strong testimony are believed to be by Caravaggio . . . the copy, exhibited here [Longhi version] does not seem to possess, the lucid and strong execution typical of those years; instead it appears weighed down by a muddy and smudged touch [“*dipinti di sicura fatture seicentesca, che, per testimonianze di notevole peso, si sono creduti del Caravaggio . . . la cui copia, qui esposta [Longhi version], non sembra possedere la lucida, potente, affilata fattura tipica di quegli anni; ma appare invece appesantita da un tocco torbido e sbavato*”]); Baroni 1951, p. 17 (Longhi version is original); Berenson 1951, p. 13 (Longhi version is original); Clark 1951, p. 49; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 4 (Longhi version is original, dates to Del Monte period); Mahon 1951, p. 233 (publishes only Longhi version as original, 1594–95); Venturi 1951, p. 13–14, no. 51 (accepts London/Korda as original); Voss 1951, p. 167 (accepts London/Korda as original); Longhi 1952, no. VIII (accepts Longhi as original); Mahon 1952, pp. 8, 19 (Longhi version as original, 1592–93); Hinks 1953, no. 4 (Longhi version as original, 1592–93); Mahon 1953, pp. 214–15 (rejects London/Korda version as a copy c. 1620); Calvesi 1954, p. 129; Hess 1954, p. 282 (accepts London/Korda as original); Baumgart 1955, no. 96 (1594–95); Czobor 1955, pp. 206–7, 210–11 (Longhi version, self-portrait); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 154–55, nos. 10 A and B (reserves judgement because has not seen London/Korda version, cannot be dated just after Caravaggio’s arrival in Rome as Mancini implies); Bauch 1956, p. 206; Samek Ludovisi 1956, p. 85 (both copies of lost original); Wagner 1958, pp. 23–24 (both versions of lost original, 1590–92); Joffroy 1959, pp. 246–47 (accepts Longhi as original, Korda as copy); Jullian 1961, p. 46, 53 (accepts London/Korda as original, doubts Longhi picture, raises possibly that this is the *Carafa di fiore* mentioned by Bellori, c. 1596); de Logu 1962; Bottari 1966; Salerno 1966, p. 108; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 6 (both versions excellent—either two originals or two copies of lost original); Hess 1967, pp. 283 n. 2, 285; Moir 1967, I p. 3, II p. 55; Kitson 1969, no 4 (1593, both high quality); Röttgen 1969, pp. 167 n. 43, 170 n. 94; Slatkes 1969 [1972, p. 24]; Salerno 1970, pp. 234–35 (both originals); Cinotti 1971, pp. 88–91, 179–81

(preferred London/Korda as original, certainly not earliest period, painted shortly after time in studio of Cavaliere d'Arpino); Posner 1971, pp. 304–5, 308–23 (accepts Longhi as original, after 1597); Spear 1971 pp. 470–73 (accepts Longhi as original); Spezzaferro 1971, pp. 86–89 (after 1597) Frommel 1972, pp. 18–27 (accepts Longhi as original, after 1597); Gregori 1972, pp. 40–44; Nicolson 1974, p. 560 (as attributes with question Coll. Vincent Korda, London); Röttgen 1974, pp. 190–95, 198, 240 (after 1597, both originals); Salerno 1974, p. 587 (1593–95, without discussion of either version); Slatkes 1976, pp. 148–53 (Longhi version as original); Moir 1976, p. 104 nos. 51a, 51b (both copies of lost original; Longhi version perhaps by Saraceni); Parronchi 1976, p. 38 (after 1600); Slatkes 1976, pp. 148–53; Nicolson 1979, p. 34, pl. 2 (accepts London/Korda as original); Spear 1979, pp. 318–19 (accepts London/Korda as original); Acidini Luchinat in Gregori 1980, no. 78; Costello 1981, p. 377 (painting represents sense of touch as companion to *Boy Peeling a Fruit*, sense of taste); Posner 1981, pp. 387–91; Cinotti 1983, no. 16 (lists London/Korda as version—air of repetition—of Longhi original which is executed with more vigor, c. 1594); Magnuson 1982, p. 82, fig. p. 83 (Longhi version as original); Moir 1982, p. 82 (London/Korda with doubts, 1596–97); Hibbard 1983, pp. 43–46, 283–84 (c. 1597, London/Korda); Spike 1983, p. 40; Marini 1983, p. 126–27 (London/Korda by Caravaggio; Longhi version probably in part by Manfredi); Gregori 1985, no. 70, p. 237 (Longhi picture no pentimenti, better condition, more incisive execution; London/Korda could be early seicento copy); Calvesi 1988³, pp. 114–15; Cottino 1989, pp. 659–76 fig. 778 (London/Korda version as original, “to be considered the first work attempted by Merisi when he was still an apprentice with d'Arpino” [“considerata la prima opera pervenutaci del Merisi ancora apprendista nella bottega d'Arpino”]); Marini 1989, pp. 372–74, no. 11 (London/Korda as original, 1594; Longhi version is a copy by Mario Minniti); Heimburger 1990, pp. 8–9; Mahon 1990, p. 5 (both originals, Longhi version 1593/4; London version, 1597–98); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 4; Lapucci 1991, pp. 130–37; Bologna 1992, p. 300 (records Longhi as first version, 1593–94; London/Korda as autograph replica); Spike 1992² pp. 275–77 (London/Korda version has pentimenti and more details in the still life); Calvesi 1994, pp. 148–57 (workshop assistance); Gregori 1994, pp. 40, 146, nos. 10/11 (1594–95 two replica versions by master); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1597, London/Korda is original); Gilbert 1995, p. 152, 216, 251, 153; Gregori in Rome 1995, p. 106; Berra 1996, p. 118; Sciuti et al. in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 69–85; Keith 1998, pp. 37–51 (Condition report, London/Korda version); Langdon 1998, pp. 116, 201, 204; Puglisi 1998, nos. 3A and 3B (c. 1593–94),

p. 69 (London/Korda original; Longhi workshop replica); Robb 1998, pp. 75–76, 500 (Longhi, 1596), 501 (London/Korda, 1596); Vodret 1998, pp. 39–40; Bauer–Colton 2000, p. 434 (cite use of tracings); Gregori 2000, p. 187 (1595–96, Longhi version); Spike 2001, pp. 40–45, nos. 7.1 (London c. 1595) and 7.2 (Longhi c. 1600); Gregori in Munich 2002, pp. 131–33; Moffit 2002², pp. 1–18; Capon 2003, pp. 86–89, cat. no. 4 (London c. 1595) and no. 5 (Longhi 1600); Giusti in Naples 2003 cat. no. 3 (Longhi, c. 1594); Gregori in Florence 2003, pp. 134–35 (Longhi); Berra in Milan 2004, pp. 55–83; Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 146–47, cat. no. I.1 (c. 1596–97); Gregori in Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 1, pp. 40–45 (Longhi version, 1594); Lapucci 2005, pp. 27–28, fig. 4, 36 fig. 6, 39, 41 fig. 13 (Longhi); Sacchi Ladispoto in Turin 2005, p. 319 no. 32; Sgarbi 2005, nos. 12, 13 (c. 1596–97); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 25; pp. 111–13 (1600); Marini in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 6 (both date to 1594); Tresoldi 2006, p. 70 (Longhi, 1594); Varriano 2006, pp. 9, 13, 37, 58, 62, 105, fig. 83 (Longhi); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82; Papi in Milan 2009, pp. 21–27.

The painful disappointments of amorous love are the theme of the *Boy Bitten by a Lizard*, the first version of which, today in London, was painted around 1595. The lizard that bites his middle finger, then as now associated with carnality, underscores the nasty surprises that lie in wait for the unsuspecting. The representation of a *ramarro*, a variety of lizard that does not bite, is an ingenious literary joke. Few poets since Petrarch had been able to resist the delicious paradox that the Italian words for *love* and *bitter* are nearly the same. Caravaggio's picture expands the play on words from two to three: *amore|amaro|ramarro*. The joke also trades upon the poetic trope that love is a rose with thorns.

The early biographies are unanimous in their praise of this innovative subject, which was instrumental in establishing the artist's reputation. It is odd, therefore, that no indications of the original provenance have yet come to light for either of the two autograph examples listed here.

The London/Korda picture is comparable in its delicate application of pigment to the *Musicians* (cat. no. 6); it clearly predates the Longhi version, executed with the deeper *chiaroscuro* of four to five years later. Comparison between the two versions is complicated by the unsatisfactory state of the London work.

A version of this subject was described as a self-portrait, one of four paintings “by Caravaggio,” listed in the inventory of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps datable to around 1620. An account book preserved in the Archivio Altemps in Castello di Gallese documents the purchase from Prospero Orsi of several paintings by Caravaggio between 1611 and 1613 (Spezzaferro in Calvesi and Volpi 2002, pp. 28–29).

See pp. 43–45.

Condition:

The London/Korda picture is in fair condition, having suffered over cleaning in the boy’s hair and in the shadows generally. The Longhi picture is in very good condition. The x-ray of the London/Korda picture reveals that the white drapery folds overlap and cross in a characteristic way, while the Longhi drapery is clearly based on this example. For a report on a recent examination of this picture see Keith 1998, pp. 37–51.

See *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, pp. 130–37, for detailed technical reports on both paintings by Roberta Lapucci.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 104, nos. 51a–d, fig. 3; Cinotti 1983, p. 435; and Gregori 1985, p. 237.

8. *Saint Francis in Ecstasy*, c. 1595

Oil on canvas, 37 x 51 in. (93.9 x 129.5 cm)

Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford, Connecticut, The Ella Gallup Sumner and Mary Caitlin Sumner Collection Fund, inv. no. 1943.222

Provenance:

Dr. Guido Grioni, Trieste, by 1929; Arnold Seligmann, Rey & Co., New York, 1939; from whom purchased by the Atheneum in 1943.

Inventories/Documents:

I. Recent research by Costa Restagno (2004) and Terzaghi (2007) has established that this painting was executed for Ottavio Costa, who first mentions it in his will dated 1606; the painting appears in his posthumous inventory prepared in 1639; it remained in the family by descent and is documented in inventories of 1732, 1792, and 1834; after the death of Giuseppe Origo, it was donated to the Congregazione degli Operai della Divina Pietà, which sold the painting in 1857 to an unknown acquirer; the painting's whereabouts were untraced until its reappearance in the collection of Dr. Guido Grioni, Trieste:

1. August 6, 1606: Testament of Ottavio Costa, in which he states that in the event of his death the Abbot Ruggero Tritonio, secretary to Cardinal Montalto, should have his choice of two paintings, without identification of artist: a *Saint Francis* and a *Saints Martha and Mary Magdalen*; the picture he did not select was to be left to Giovanni Enriquez de Herrera. ["Item legavit Multo Ill.ri D. Rogerio Abbati Tritonio a secretis ill.mi et R.mi D. Car[dina]llis Montisalti unum ex duobus quadris ipsius D. Testatoris i[des]t quadrum S[anc]ti Francisci seu S. Ta[rum] Martha et Magdalenae ada eletione[m] ipsius D. Abbatis, aalterum vero legavit M.to Ill. D. Iofannji Enriquez de Herrera"] (ASR, notaro A.C. Persico, vol. 5710, c. 374v, Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 579–86).

2. January 18–23, 1639: Inventory of the objects in the house of Ottavio Costa, Rome, at his death: "74. And another painting of Saint Francis made by the same Caravaggio with its frame" ["74. E più un altro quadro di San Francesco fatto dall'istesso Caravaggio tutti con la sua cornice"] (Spezzaferro 1974, p.584; Costa Restagno 2004, no. 74, p. 100).

3. February 7, 1688: Inventory of the Goods of Maria Cattaneo Costa, Rome, at her death: "26. A horizontal painting with Saint Francis walnut frame with gold" ["26. Un qua / dro per traverso con San Francesco cornice tinta di noce profilata d'oro"].

4. May 30, 1732, Rome: Posthumous inventory of Mons. Guido Del Pelagio, who acquired the painting by descent, "Another painting representing Saint Francis in Ecstasy and another the Magdalen 180, scudi 4" ["67. Altro rappresentante San Francesco in estasi e l'altro la Madalena 180 sc. 4"] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 26, p. 107).

5. Undated valuation (“stima a prezzi”) compiled by painters, Tommaso Minardi and Giovanni Silvagni, between 1834 and 1846, compiled after the donation by the marchesa Origo to the Congregazione degli Operai della Divina Pietà, commissioned by Sig. Poncini: “No. 7, painting identified no. 7, showing Saint Francis sustained by an angel original by Caravaggio, half life size, stripped, and retouched sc. 100” [“No. 7, Quadro segnato n. 7, rappresentante San Francesco sostenuto da un angelo mezzo al vero originale del Caravaggio spelato e ritoccato sc. 100] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 8, p. 121).

6. March 26, 1846, Catalogue paintings and coppers by various authors, not guaranteed, of objects received from marchese Giuseppe Origo, offered for sale by the Congregazione degli Operai della Divina Pietà, “6. Saint Francis sustained by an angel, half life size 40” [“Catalogo di quadri e Rami antichi di varj autori, che però non si garantiscono, . . . 6. San Francesco sostenuto da un angelo, mezzo al vero sc. 40”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 6, p. 123).

7. 1857 Catalogue of paintings for sale by the Galleria Sacro Monte di Pietà, Rome, from when sold (Costa Rastagno 2004, p. 68).

II. According to an alternative hypothesis first advanced by Frommel (1972) and Luigi Spezzaferro (1974), this picture is cited in the 1628 inventory of Cardinal Del Monte who either acquired it directly from the artist or from the heir of Ruggero Tritonio in about 1612. This hypothesis is implicitly supported by the appearance in 1894 of an old copy in Udine, now in the Museo Civico (see below c.1). Tritonio’s testament states that he received the painting, an original Caravaggio, as a gift from his friend Ottavio Costa. In the opinions of Gregori (1985), Costa Restagno, and Terzaghi, however, Ottavio Costa retained the original and gave a copy of it to Tritonio. The recent discovery (Lorizzo 2001, pp. 408–9) that the Del Monte painting was acquired in 1628 by Cardinal Ascanio Filomarino makes unlikely the identification with the Hartford picture, because subsequent Filomarino inventories refer consistently to a “companion,” perhaps another friar, instead of an angel, assisting Saint Francis. For the Filomarino references see Spike 2001, Catalogue of Lost Works, L.41; Spike 2010, Catalogue of Lost Works cat. no. L.54, Saint Francis with Brother Leo, Naples, Ascanio Filomarino, Inv. April 8, 1685 (Labrot 1992, p. 161).

A. August 6, 1606: Testament of Ottavio Costa, in which he states that in the event of his death the Abbot Ruggero Tritonio, secretary to Cardinal Montalto, should have his choice of two paintings, without identification of artist: a *Saint Francis* and a *Saints Martha and Mary Magdalen*; the picture he did not select was to be left to Giovanni Enriquez de Herrera. [“Item legavit Multo Ill.ri D. Rogerio Abbati Tritonio a secretis ill.mi et R.mi D. Car[dina]lis Montisalti unum ex duobus quadris ipsius D. Testatoris i[des]t quadrum S[anc]ti Francisci seu S. Ta[rum] Martha et Magdalena[e] ada eletione[m] ipsius D. Abbatis, aalterum vero legavit M.to Ill. D. Iofannji Enriquez de Herrara”] (ASR, notaro A.C. Persico, vol. 5710, c. 374v, Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 579–86).

B. A painting of Saint Francis by Caravaggio appears in Ruggero’s testament dated October 25, 1607, and published after his death on July 17, 1612, “a painting of Saint Francis painted with great diligence by the famous painter Caravaggio which had been given to him by the noble Octavius Costa of Genoa as a token of mutual friendship. The painting is to stay in the family and not be alienated” [“. . .divi Francisci signum a Caravaggio celeberrimo pictori summa cum diligentia affabre pictum, quod mihi do. Octavius Costa civis Januensis nobilissimus, mutui amoris incomparabilisque amicitia ergo donavit, perpetuo osservari nec ulli unquam concedi aut alienari iubeo”] (Udine Archivio Notarile antico, notaio Giulio Vecchi, Joppi 1894, IV, p. 41; Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 579–86).

C. Deed dated October 26, 1607, made public and transcribed on the death of Abbot Tritonio (July 7, 1612) left to his nephew, Ruggero Tritonio the younger, his furnishings in Rome, including the *Saint Francis*, “skillfully painted with the greatest care by the most celebrated painter Caravaggio” and which had been given to him by his friend, Ottavio Costa (Spezzaferro 1974, p. 580).

D. February 21, 1627: Inventory of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “A Saint Francis in Ecstasy by Michel Agnolo da Caravaggio with an adorned gold frame of four palmi” [“Un S. Francesco in Estasi di Michel Agnolo da Caravaggio con Cornici d’oro rabescate di Palmi quattro”] (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol. 580r, Frommel 1972, p. 34).

E. May 25, 1628: Listed among items sold by Alessandro Del Monte to pay debts of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, to an unidentified purchaser for 70 scudi [“Per un S. franc° del Caravaggio 70”] (Nota del denaro retratto dalla vendita de Mobili del Giardino di Ripetta doppo otto scuti il Breve posto del Banco di S. Spirito, Kirwin 1972, p. 55).

Exhibitions:

Naples, 1938, no. 4; Hartford 1940, no. 5; Hartford 1943, no cat.; New York 1946, no. 1; Hartford 1949, no. 3; Milan 1951, no. 17; Seattle 1954, no cat.; New York 1958, no. 60 bis; Sarasota 1958, no. 15; Poughkeepsie 1959, no cat.; Richmond 1961, repr. 59; Baltimore 1964; Detroit 1965, no. 2; Cleveland 1971–72, no. 14; New York-Naples 1985, no. 68; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 121.

Bibliography:

Borenus 1925, p. 26 n. (“... *The Death of Saint Francis* which is mentioned in a will as early as 1597, and which as lately as 1894 was in the Church of San Giacomo di Fagagna, in Friuli [see V. Joppin in *Miscellanea di Storia Veneta*, vol. xii, app. p. 41]. One wonders whether this painting . . . is still in existence, more especially as it used to be in a region since swept by the war.”); Longhi 1928–29, p. 30 n. 2 (both Trieste and Udine versions are copies after lost original); Marangoni 1929, p. 34 (first published as Caravaggio in private collection, Dr. Guido Grioni, Trieste, said to have come from Malta); Oertel in Naples 1938, pp. 228–30 (earliest work); Schudt 1942 (questions); Longhi 1943, pp. 9, 39, 106 (Hartford is original); Arslan 1951, 446 (“in any case not a high-quality work,” doubts both versions, lost original c. 1585); Berenson 1951, p. 36, fig. 55 (akin to Doria *Rest on the Flight*); Mahon 1951, p. 233 (1594–95); Voss 1951, pp. 410–12 (doubts); Venturi 1951; Longhi 1952, p. 24 (several years before 1597); Mahon 1952, p. 4, 7–10, 19 (1592–93); Mahon 1952², p. 24 (appreciably earlier than Metropolitan *Musicians*, cat. no. 6, c. 1594–95); Grassi 1953, pp. 63–64; Hinks 1953, p. 21, 44, 95, no. 5 (1593–95); Mahon 1953, pp. 213 no. 5, 219, no. 35; Calvesi 1954, p. 133 (Peterzano angel); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 148–49 (unsure whether one is original or if both are copies of a lost original, 1597 is *terminus post quem* but could be earlier); Baumgart 1955, p. 94, no. 3; Bialostocki 1955, pl. 9; Arcangeli 1956, p. 35; Wagner 1958, pp. 226–27 (copy from the circle of Saraceni); Arslan 1959 (earliest work?); Joffroy 1959, p. 248, 333, 337–38; Jullian 1961, pp. 51, 53, 60, 72–75, 225 (c. 1593);

Baroni 1962, fig. 14 (c. 1594); de Logu 1964, pp. 46, 148, no. 14 (c. 1594–95); Hibbard and Levine 1965, p. 371 (crude and early if by master at all); Causa 1966, no. 154 (before 1597); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa, 1967, no. 4 (1591–92); Moir 1967, I, pp. 1 n. 1, 15 n. 18, 197 n. 7, 256 n. 9; II p. 37 (very early); Kitson 1969, no. 7 (1591–92); Askew 1969, pp. 284–94 (c. 1592); Cinotti–Dell’Acqua 1971, p. 149 (c. 1594–95); Gregori 1971, p. 9; Spear 1971, n. 14 (1594); Frederickson–Zeri 1972, p. 44, 582; Frommel 1972, p. 15 (Saint has features of Cardinal Del Monte whose name was Francesco); Nicolson 1972, p. 113 (close to contemporary works by Cavaliere d’Arpino); Wittkower 1972, p. 38; Mariani 1973, p. 41 (1594–95); Cummings 1974, p. 3, 7, 11–12, 15; Marini 1974, pp. 65 n. 123, 98–99 n. 9, 348, 373, 461, 468 (1594); Röttgen 1974, pp. 43, 198–99, 254 n. 168 (1594); Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 579–86; Gregori 1975, p. 28; Spezzaferro 1975, pp. 103–18; Rizzatti 1975, p. 86 (1595–96); Moir 1976, p. 83 no. 3, 121–22 n. 180; Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Bissell 1981, pp. 16, 85 n. 37; Moir 1982, p. 76 (probably painted for Cardinal Del Monte c. late 1596); Cinotti 1983, pp. 440–42 (?1595); Gilbert 1983, p. 55 (c. 1595); Hibbard 1983, No. 30 pp. 286–87 (dates to when Caravaggio joined Del Monte); Marini 1983, p. 132; Bonsanti 1984, 11–14, fig. 9 (c. 1595); Gregori 1985, no. 68 (Frommel’s theory that saint has cardinal’s features less than convincing; painted about time Caravaggio joined Del Monte); Spike 1985, p. 416; Chorpenning 1987, pp. 49–58; Marini 1987, pp. 369–72, n. 10 (Rome 1594); Treffers 1988, pp. 145–72; Marini 1989, pp. 36–72, no. 10 (1594); Mahoney in Cadogan–Mahoney 1991, p. 84–91 (painting owned by Costa and bequeathed to Tritonio; Gironi family acquired from Maltese private collection); Bologna 1992, pp. 239–62, 301 (1593–94); Azzopardi in Macioce 1994, pp. 200–201; Gregori 1994, p. 146, no. 9 (1594–95); Wązbiński 1994, pp. 607 (unknown whether the painting was commissioned by Del Monte or acquired in 1612 from Abbot Tritonio); Gilbert 1995, pp. 107–9 (1595 too early), 125 (doubts association with Del Monte 1626 inventory, regards that picture as lost), 153–54 (case for early dating is based on a misreading of a date, 1597, versus 1607, Longhi dated after Matthew scenes—which he supposed were 1590), 249, 257; Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1595); Langdon 1998, pp. 126–27, 145; Puglisi 1998, no. 13 (c. 1596); Robb 1998, pp. 77–82, 500 (Rome, 1595); Jones in Mormondo 1999, pp. 32–35, fig. 2 (c. 1595); Varriano in Mormondo 1999, p. 198; Benedetti in Mormondo 1999, pp. 222; Bauer–Colton 2000, p. 434; Lorizzo 2001, pp. 408–9; Slatkes in London–Rome 2001, cat. no. 121 (c. 1594–95); Spike 2001, pp. 55–57, ill. pp. 10, 56, no. 8 (c. 1595); Costa Restagno 2004, pp. 47–48, 67 n. 221, ill. 74, 180; Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 25 (c. 1595); Sgarbi 2005, no. 3 (it is the first painting of an openly religious

scene by Merisi); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 25; Varriano 2006, pp. 116, fig. 95; Terzaghi 2007, pp. 273–82, 300–301 (1594–95, when Ottavio recovered from illness after 1606, he gave his friend Tritonio a copy of this painting, today in Udine); Ziane in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 161–79 (for the madrigal); Papa 2008, pp. 124–25 (1594–95); Terzaghi 2009.

No sources comment on this picture which is an extraordinarily refined statement of the Renaissance tendency to express spiritual love in physical terms. The picture offers an especially intimate perspective on the Neoplatonic humanism to which the young Caravaggio was exposed in his new residence, the palace of Cardinal Del Monte.

At first glance Saint Francis appears to be receiving the stigmata, but this reading is disallowed by the absence of the celestial vision of the crucified Christ and by the absence of marks on Francis' hands. It is only the Franciscan habit that prevents us from reading Caravaggio's picture as a straightforward allegory of Divine Love, symbolized by the angel. The unifying theme is the ardent love of God that has transported Francis into an ecstatic trance.

Both figures in the painting have been considered to be portraits. Mario Minniti is most often suggested as the model for the angel; Frommel (1972) and Robb (1998) believe that Saint Francis bears the features of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte.

In the light of recent research it now appears that the *Saint Francis in Ecstasy* was the earliest picture acquired by Ottavio Costa, who would become one of the artist's most devoted collectors.

See pp. 55–57, illustrated at pp. 10, 56.

Condition:

Good. There was a loss on the angel's cheek in shadow. The painting was most recently restored in 1983 by Gisella Helmkampf under the direction of John Brealey at the Metropolitan Museum of Art. The results of this restoration, with notes on pentimenti, are published by Michael Mahoney in Cadogan–Mahoney 1991, pp. 84–86.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976 (p. 83, no. 3) and Cinotti 1983 (p. 435). Among these is:

C. I

Udine, Italy, Museo Civico e le Gallerie d'Arte Antica e Moderna; inv. no. 45

Oil on canvas, 36⁵/₈ x 50³/₄ in. (93 x 129 cm)

Provenance:

Probably given in Rome by Ottavio Costa to Abbot Ruggero Tritonio of Udine c. 1606; mentioned in the July 7, 1612 testament, written in Udine on October 25, 1607, by Abbot Ruggero Tritonio, who left it to his nephew also named Ruggero; by descent to Conde Francesco Fistalario; in 1852 the count gave it to the church of Fagagna; it entered the civic museum of Udine in 1894.

Exhibitions:

Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 1.

Bibliography:

Joppi 1894, p. 41 (identified with picture described in Abbot Ruggero's 1597 [1607] will); Borenius 1925, pp. 23–26; Venturi 1928, pp. 58–59; Longhi 1928, p. 30 n. 2 (both versions after lost original); Marangoni 1929, p. 34 (copy had been substituted between 1622, Tritonio's death date, and date picture donated to church); Mahon 1951, p. 227, no. 49 and p. 233 no. 105 (Udine is copy); Friedlaender 1955, p. 149 (unsure whether one is original or if both are copies of a lost original); Someda de Marco 1956, p. 170 (autograph replica); Rizzi 1969, no. 6 (autograph replica of Hartford picture); Cinotti–Dell'Acqua 1971, p. 638 (anonymous copy); Spear 1971, p. 68; Frommel 1972, pp. 15–16 (Minniti?); Volpe 1972, pp. 57–60 (picture in Udine is an old copy and the one referred to in testament of 1607); Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 580–81; Moir 1976, p. 83 n. 3a (copy); Cinotti 1983, p. 440 ("early 1600s"); Marini 1987, p. 369 (a good copy); Mahoney in Cadogan–Mahoney 1991, p. 84–91 (copy); Gilbert 1995, p. 108; Macioce 1996, p. 21 (The picture described by Costa and Tritonio [see above] is the copy, now in Udine.); Bauer and Colton 2000, p. 434 (copy made from a tracing); Treffers 2000, pp. 112–20; Spike 2001, cat. no. 8.c.1 (copy); Costa Restagno 2004, pp. 47–48, 67 n. 221; Marini and Gasparrini

in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 1 (1594); Terzaghi 2007, pp. 295–306 (copy, created and ordered by Ottavio Costa; unlikely painted by Mario Minniti because he is documented in Sicily by May 1606); Marini and Gasparri in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, pp. 196–201, cat. no. 1 (c. 1594, replica of the Del Monte painting in the Wadsworth Atheneum).

9. *Saint Francis in Meditation*

9.1 *Saint Francis in Meditation*, c. 1595

(Chiesa di San Pietro, Carpineto Romano)

Oil on canvas, 48³/₈ x 36³/₈ in. (123 x 92.5 cm)

Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica, Palazzo Barberini, Rome (in deposit); D130

Provenance:

Chiesa di San Pietro, Carpineto Romano.

Exhibitions:

Rome 1970, no. 30 (attributed to anonymous artist of the early seventeenth century); Rome 1982–83 (attributed to Caravaggio); New York-Naples 1985, no. 83 (attributed to Caravaggio); Rome 1983; Rome 1987 (attributed to Caravaggio); Rome 1999, no. 3; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 118–20; Bergamo 2000, no. 45; Palermo 2001, cat. no. 5; London-Rome 2001, no. 18 (Rome only); Tokyo-Okazaki 2001–2; Canberra-Melbourne 2002, cat. no. 50; Turin 2002, cat. no. 35; Sydney-Melbourne 2003, cat. no. 1; Treffers in Morello 2003, pp. 193–94; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 20; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 9; Athens 2006; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 8; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 14; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8 cat. no. 14.

Document:

Spezzaferro (1974, p. 586) relates an untraced painting of Saint Francis in the January 18, 1639, inventory of Ottavio Costa to this painting in Carpineto Romano or to the *Saint Francis* in Cremona (cat. no. 61).

9.2 *Saint Francis in Meditation*, c. 1603

Oil on canvas, 50 $\frac{5}{8}$ x 38 $\frac{3}{8}$ in. (128.5 x 97.4 cm)

Santa Maria della Concezione (Church of the Cappuccini), Rome

Provenance:

Francesco de Rustici, by whom bequeathed to a Capuchin friary in 1617, perhaps San Bonaventura, Rome; transferred to Santa Maria della Concezione, Rome, probably in the seventeenth century.

Document:

An undated label, thought to be lost, was recently recovered on the reverse of the original canvas hidden by a relining. It states in a seventeenth-century hand that the picture had been donated by Francesco de Rustici to the Capuchins: “Signor Francesco de Rustici gives this to the Capuchin fathers with the condition that it cannot be given to anyone else.” [“Il S.re Francesco de Rustici da sto quadro a I padri Cappuccini con talè . . . nd . . . chè no . . . n si possi darè a niscu. . . .”]

Inventory:

1. 1790 inventory of the Chiesa dei Cappuccini, “The most precious painting in the sacristy, a *Saint Francis* by Caravaggio” [“Li quadri più Preziosi della sagrestia . . . un San Francesco, opera del Caravaggio”] (Marini 1989, p. 551).

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 28; Rome 1983; New York-Naples 1985, no. 82, Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 118–20; Bergamo 2000, pp. 118–20; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 100; Palermo 2001; Düsseldorf 2006, no. 10 (as copy); Trapani 2007, cat. no. 15; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 15.

Bibliography:

Until 1968, all authors discuss only 9.2, the painting in Santa Maria della Concezione. Cantalmessa 1908, pp. 401–2 (as Caravaggio, influence on Velázquez: recorded seventeenth-century inscription on a piece of paper pasted on back); Longhi 1918, p. 239; Marangoni 1922, p. 50; Pevsner 1927/28, p. 132 (c. 1603; associates with Gentileschi's loan of a Capuchin habit); Arslan 1951, p. 446 (“a painting of the 1600s . . . but there are points [the eyes the hands] which are not found in the personal language of this artist”); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 28 (1603; associates with Gentileschi's loan of a Capuchin habit); Venturi 1951, p. 41 (rejects); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (“good copy after an original . . . of about 1603–5.”); Longhi 1952 (ed. 1982), p. 188 (c. 1603); Hinks 1953, no. 38; Friedlaender 1954, p. 150 (rejects); Baumgart 1955, no. 16 (school); Wagner 1958, pp. 110–11; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 66–67 (school); Jullian 1961, pp. 143, 155 (doubts); Guttoso–Ottino Della Chiesa 1967, no. 57 (Capuchin, 1603); Moir 1967, p. 19 (follower); Brugnoli 1968, pp. 11–15 (publishes version in Carpineto Romano which in 1930 Santangelo had catalogued for Rome Soprintendenza as copy of Capuchin version); Longhi 1968, p. 37 (1604–5, Santa Maria della Concezione version); Kitson 1969, no. 55 (1603? school); Brugnoli in Rome 1970, no. 30 (attributes Carpineto version to Caravaggio, c. 1606); Salerno 1970, pp. 236–37 (both originals); Fagiolo dell'Arco–Marini 1970, p. 122; Calvesi 1971, p. 121; Cinotti 1971, pp. 128, 145 (period of *Supper at Emmaus* at Brera); Rossi 1973, no. 42; Marini 1974, pp. 56–57, 276–77, 454–56 n.89 (1609, “The cross leaning on a rock appears to evoke the concept of sacrifice and the whole image is constructed in a spirit of *ars moriendi* [the art of dying] in the typical posture of *Melanconia*”); Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 116–18, 584–86 (publishes possible provenance); Spezzaferro 1975, pp. 112–13, 116–17 (questions); Moir 1976, pp. 66, 120 no. 122 (“Anonymous Caravaggesche painter”), 161, n. 288 (better quality than Capuchin copy); Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Spear 1979, p. 318 (uncertain); Marini 1982, p. 82 (accepts Carpineto, datable after August 1609); Strinati 1982, pp. 91–92, nn. 82–83 (both possibly autograph); Cinotti 1983, no. 6 (Carpineto Romano adheres to the model of the Franciscan friar that the Sicilian Geronimo Errante, the general of the Capuchins described in his book *Expositio*, a book that ended up on the Index, because they courted poverty; Capuchin version is copy); Freedberg 1983, p. 70 (accepts Capuchin as after flight from Rome, 1606); Spear 1984, p. 165 (Carpineto original); Hibbard 1983, pp. 338–40 (Capuchin is superior, doubts both); Gregori 1985, no. 82 (1603, Capuchin version is Caravaggio's original); Spike 1985, p. 417 (Capuchin is original); Christiansen 1986, p. 442 (Carpineto is a feeble copy)

of Capuchin); Tempesta in Rome 1986, pp. 42–43 (Carpineto original); Alloisio in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni*, 1989 pp. 26–27; Marini 1989, pp. 549–51, no. 97 (Carpineto is datable to 1609); Calvesi 1990, pp. 39, 332, 335, 425; Bologna 1992, p. 331 (neither); Gregori 1994, p. 151, no. 49 (c. 1603, Capuchin); Azzopardi in Macioce 1996, p. 200; Berra 1995, pp. 101–18 (Capuchin is the prototype; refutes connection with Silos poem; publishes numerous copies; possibly self-portrait); Pupillo 1997, pp. 152–68 (Carpineto; de Rustici research); Langdon 1998, pp. 292, 294 (Carpineto); Puglisi 1998, no. 51 (Capuchin, c. 1603–6); Vannugli 1998, pp. 6–7 (relates a reference to a copy of a *Saint Francis* by Caravaggio in Juan Lescano’s 1631 inventory to this painting [see Catalogue Catalogue of Lost Works L.55]); Vodret in Rome 1999, no. 3 (leaves question open); Vodret in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 118–20 (perhaps both authentic, illustrates the Capuchin version twice); Bauer and Colton 2000, p. 434–36 (cite use of tracings); Vodret in Bergamo 2000, pp. 216–18 (Carpineto executed shortly before foundation of church, 1609; Capuchin version is probably Bartolomeo Manfredi); Brown in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 100 (Capuchin, c. 1603); Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 16–17, fig. no. 17 (Carpineto, 1609; Capuchin as Bartolomeo Manfredi?); Spike 2001, pp. 44–46, no. 9.1 (Carpineto c. 1595); Spike 2001 no. 9.2 (Capuchin, 1603); Vodret in Palermo 2001, pp. 118–19, cat. no. 5 (Carpineto); Sickel 2002 pp. 117–22 (Capuchin version commissioned by Rustici c. 1604 with a personal iconography); Vodret in Canberra-Melbourne 2002, pp. 151–52, cat. no. 50; Vodret in Turin 2002, pp. 114–15 (Carpineto is the original of which the Capuchin is a copy, perhaps by Bartolomeo Manfredi); Treffers in Morello 2003, pp. 193–94; Vodret in Capon 2003, pp. 80–81, cat. no. 1 (only Carpineto exhibited); Macioce 2003, fig. 1, with accompanying bibliography in side notes on pp. 5–8 (1609?); Vodret in Vatican 2003, pp. 194–94; Cardinali, De Ruggieri, and Falucci in *Technologische Studien Kunsthistorisches Museum, Wien*, 2004 pp. 60–67; Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 172, 179 nos. 1a and 1b (both, 1606–7); Vodret in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 151–52, cat. no. 20 (“new proposals”, Carpineto, original 1606; Capuchin faithful reproduction); Vodret 2004; Marini 2005, no. 105 (Capuchin is a copy); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 28 (Capuchin, 1604); Sgarbi 2005, no. 50 (c. 1606, Carpineto); Vodret in Barcelona 2005, pp. 76–79, cat. no. 9 (Carpineto, summer 1606, while Caravaggio was in the territory of the Colonna); Christiansen in Naples-London 2005, p. 104; Marini in Athens 2006, pp. 62–64 (1609, Carpineto, erroneously illustrates Capuchin version); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 214 (Carpineto, as original, 1606; Capuchin as copy, 1610–17); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 124; Pupillo in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 99–109 (Carpineto); Sciberras in Valletta

2007, cat. no. 24 (publishes a previously unknown copy in Malta [see c.3, below] and notes his acceptance of both the Capuchin and Carpineto versions); Vodret in Trapani 2007, cat. nos. 14 and 15, pp. 280–87, 306–26 (Capuchin version [9.2] by Bartolomeo Manfredi who may also have modified the cowl in the Carpineto version [9.1]); Vodret in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8 cat. nos. 14, 15, pp. 294–301, 312–33 (Capuchin version [9.2] by Bartolomeo Manfredi who may also have modified the cowl in the Carpineto version [9.1]); Mochi Onori–Vodret 2008, p. 284; Papa 2008, pp. 124–27 (Carpineto, 1605; Capuchin is replica).

The early biographers are silent on this *Saint Francis in Meditation* even though the better-known version seems to have hung in the Capuchin church of Santa Maria della Concezione, Rome, since the seventeenth century, to judge from its numerous copies. This last picture was already the object of scholarly dispute when another, excellent *Saint Francis in Meditation* was discovered in Carpineto Romano in 1968. The two versions are nearly identical, especially after the recovery of the bottom edge of the Carpineto canvas, which had been folded back. The technique employed in the Santa Maria della Concezione version (9.2) is demonstrably more mature leading Pevsner, Gregori, and other scholars to associate it with the loan of a Capuchin habit from Gentileschi to Caravaggio in 1603.

Brugnoli (1968, 1970) observed a major pentimento in the Carpineto Romano painting (9.1) whereby the artist had lengthened the friar's hood with a single brushstroke. It is arguable that Caravaggio quickly retouched the prototype to make it conform to the replica (9.2) he was painting several years later, presumably on commission from Francesco de Rustici in Rome. Although the enlargement of the hood is described by Vodret and Pupillo as the alteration of Capuchin hood into the form used by the Reformed Franciscan Minors, Rustici's specification of a Capuchin monastery makes this explanation unlikely. Capuchin hoods were larger, not smaller, than the Reformed Minors'.

Both of the churches in question were constructed by patrons close to Caravaggio, although the dates do not coincide with the execution of the paintings. The church and convent of San Pietro in Carpineto Romano was founded by Cardinal Pietro Aldobrandini in 1609. Francesco de Rustici, who died in 1617, specified that his painting was to be left to a Capuchin church. Santa Maria della Concezione in Rome was founded in 1626 by Pope Urban VIII Barberini. Like

most of Caravaggio's Roman patrons, Francesco de Rustici was a member of the Confraternity of the Holy Trinity of the Pilgrims (Arciconfraternita della SS. Trinità dei Pellegrini).

Technical analyses of the Carpineto version (9.1) in 2000 revealed that the figure of Saint Francis was painted on top of a smaller figure of the saint. A few areas of this underpainting were incorporated in the definitive image, proving the chronological primacy of that version. The restorers, Carlo Giantomassi and Donatella Zari, determined that the outlines of the two versions do not coincide exactly, which means that the Capuchin version was not copied using tracings, but rather through direct observation by the artist. The execution of the two versions is thus analogous to the London and Longhi versions of the *Boy Bitten by a Lizard* (cat. nos. 7.1 and 7.2), in which Caravaggio updated an invention of his early Roman years in his mature technique after 1600.

See pp. 44–46.

Condition:

Both paintings are in good condition. Brugnoli (1970) published the results of radiography and particle analysis carried out on both canvases. Christiansen (1986) detected some incisions in the Capuchin (9.2); additional incisions on both versions came to light during the restoration of 2000.

The Carpineto canvas had been folded along its bottom edge. After restoration in 2000 the paintings were shown to have identical dimensions. A significant loss in the saint's hand in the Carpineto version was restored. The extension of the friar's hood had been inaccurately described as a "pentimento" at the time of its restoration in 1969. As noted in the first edition of this book, the hood was already finished when it was retouched.

Vodret (in Bergamo 2000) published further results from conservation conducted on the two canvases in 2000.

Copies:

Moir 1976, p. 120 (in “Works not considered,” no copies listed); six copies are listed by Berra 1995, pp. 101–15 nos. 32–37. Additional versions, sometimes proposed as autograph by Caravaggio, have entered the literature since 2001.

C. I

Cesare Lampronti, Rome

50 x 37³/₄ in. (127 x 95.7 cm)

Provenance:

Christie’s Rome June 5, 2000, lot 682.

Exhibitions:

Palermo 2001, cat no. 11; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 9.

Bibliography:

Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 17–18, fig. 18; 130–31, cat no. 11 (Mario Minnitti, attr.); Marini 2005, pp. 562–65, Düsseldorf 2006, p. 194, cat no. 9.

C. 2

Private collection, formerly Cecconi collection, Florence

Oil on canvas, 53¹/₂ x 35³/₄ in. (136 x 91 cm)

Exhibitions:

Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 11.

Bibliography:

Marini 2005, p. 564; Whitfield in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 215, cat. no. 11 (autograph by Caravaggio, possibly the earliest version); Clark 2007, cat. no. 4, pp. 64–67; Gregori in Clark 2007, pp. 7–8.

C.3

Private collection, Malta

51³/₄ x 38¹/₄ in. (131.5 x 97 cm)

Exhibition:

Valletta 2007, cat no. 24.

Bibliography:

Sciberras in Valletta 2007, p. 41, cat. no. 24 (recently identified copy after Capuchin version; Sciberras states that this may be the painting referred to in a 1757 inventory of the Bishop Paolo Alpheron de Bussan, cf. cat no. 61. *Saint Francis in Prayer*, Cremona).

10. *Lute Player*

10.1 *Lute Player*, c. 1596

Oil on canvas, 37 x 46³/₄ in (94 x 119 cm)

Hermitage, Saint Petersburg, inv. 45

Provenance:

Vincenzo Giustiniani, Rome, by 1638; acquired in Paris by Baron Dominique–Vivant Denon in 1808 for the Hermitage (Delaroche 1812, no. 89).

Inventories:

I. Generally identified with a painting of this description by Caravaggio in the 1638 inventory of Vincenzo Giustiniani, who some scholars believe acquired it directly from the artist.

1. February 9, 1638: Inventory of paintings in the collection of Vincenzo Giustiniani, “In the large room of old paintings . . . 8. A painting above the door with a half-length figure of a youth playing a lute with various fruits and flowers and music books, painted on canvas, 4 palmi

high, and 5 palmi long—with a carved gilt frame by the hand of Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“Nella Stanza Grande de Quadri Antichi . . . 8. Un quadro sopraportato con una mezza figura di un giovane che suona il Leuto con diversi frutti e fiori e libri di musica dipinto in tela alto pal. 4, larg. pal. 5 - con sua cornice negra profilata e rabescata d’oro di mano di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”].

2. Inv. 1793, I, no. 250: “An over door painting of palmi 4 by 5 about, representing a Figure playing the guitar, called the ‘Fornarini’ by Michel’Angelo di Caravaggio, with an antique frame gilt with good gold.” [“Un quadro sopra Porta di palmi 4. e 5 per traverso rappresentante una Figura che suona la Chitarra, per nome detta la Fornarina, di Michel’Angelo di Caravaggio, con Cornice all’Antica dorata ad Oro buono”] (Salerno 1960, p. 135 n. 8; Cinotti 1983, p. 447; Marini 1989, p. 399; Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, 1638, part II, no. 8, pp. 394–95; Macioce 2003, inventari 28, p. 353).

Sources:

1. Baglione 1642, p. 136: “[Caravaggio] painted for Cardinal [Del Monte] . . . a painting of a youth playing a lute which is lively and realistic; in it is a carafe of flowers filled with water in which one can easily distinguish the reflections of a window and other objects in the room. On the flowers is a fresh dew which is rendered with exquisite accuracy. And this, he said, was the most beautiful painting he ever made.” [“. . . ed anche un Giovane, che sonava il leuto, che vivo, e vero il tutto pareva con una caraffa di fiori piena d’acqua, che dentro il riflesso d’una finestra eccellentemente si scorgeva con altri ripercotimenti di quella camera dentro l’acqua, e sopra quei fiori eravi una viva rugiada con ogni esquisita diligenza finta. E questo disse che fu il più bel pezzo che facesse mai.”].

2. Silos 1673, p. 90–91, Epigram CLXIII (1979, I, p. 89; II, p. 343): “Excellent portrait of Lute Player by the same Caravaggio, at the same Prince [Giustiniani].” [“Excellentis citharistae effigies. Eiusdem Caravaagij apud eundem” (“Principem Iustinianum”)].

3. von Ramdohr 1787 (III, p. 41) records a “Saint Cecilia playing a zither(?) the original of which by Caravaggio, is in the Giustiniani Palace, a copy of which is in the Barberini Palace.” (II, p. 285) “A Lute Player of which the original is in the Giustiniani Palace” [von Ramdohr

1787, III, p. 41: “Die heil. Cäcilia von Caravaggio. Ein Gemälde voller Wahrheit. Aber der Charakter der Heiligen erhebt sich nicht über den einer gemeinen Zitherspielerin. Die Copie ist im Pallast Barberini.”; van Ramdohr, II, p. 285: “Eine Lautenspielerin nach dem Originalgemälde des Carravaggio im Pallast Giustiniani.”] (Mahon 1990, p. 15, n. 79, 80).

4. Vasi 1763, [ed. 1794, p. 450; ed. 1807, p. 285]: In Palazzo Giustiniani, “a young lady playing a guitar, by Caravaggio” [“suonatrice di una chitarra a mano di Caravaggio”] (Mahon 1990, p. 15, n. 81).

Exhibitions:

Leningrad 1973, no. 18; Washington (Detroit, Houston, Los Angeles, New York) 1975, no. 3; Vienna 1981; Rome 1989; Rome-Berlin 2001, no. D1; St. Petersburg 2005.

Bibliography:

Kallab 1906–7, p. 208; Venturi 1910, pp. 197–98, ill. (“Fortunately there exists another picture also executed for Del Monte, perhaps not at a different time, which Bellori cited as ‘a woman in a shirt who plays the lute with the music in front.’ This passed from the Del Monte collection to that of Giustiniani . . . and then to the Hermitage.” [“Ma esiste fortunamente un altro quadro, pure eseguito per il cardinale Del Monte, e forse in tempo non diverso, . . . ricordato dal Bellori come “Donna in camicia che suona” il liuto con le note avanti; e passò poi dalla collezione del Monte a quella di Giustiniani . . . per l’Ermitaggio . . .”]); Longhi 1913 p. 161 n. 1 (Hermitage is original, Barberini picture is a copy by Saraceni); Marangoni 1922 [1953 ed, p. 139]; Voss 1923, p. 79–80; Voss 1924, p. 74, pl. 5 (only Hermitage is original; Barberini picture is not autograph); Borenius 1925, pp. 23–26; Benkard 1928, pp. 113–24 (Saraceni, from photograph); Schudt 1942, no. 9; Berenson 1951, pp. 8, 61; Mahon 1951, p. 233 (1594–95); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1594–95); Hinks 1953, no. 11 (1595–96); Baumgart 1955, no. 10 (1591); Czobor 1955, pp. 204–10 (self-portrait); Friedlaender 1955, p. 156, no. 11 (Hermitage is the “only example of this subject which fully agrees with Baglione’s description . . . undoubtedly the same picture which belonged to Cardinal Del Monte, and can thus be considered one of his juvenile half-figure works”); Wagner 1958, pp. 20–21, 176–77 (1590–92); Arslan 1959, pp. 199–200 (1590); Jullian 1961, pp. 46–47, 53, 55–56 n. 38, 71, 74, 165 n. 18, 226 (c. 1595); Borla

1962, pp. 3–16 (inscription on book, “Gallus,” could refer to Milanese musician, Giuseppe Galli who published *Treatise on Music* in 1598); de Logu 1962, pp. 30–31, 140; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 13 (1594); Kitson 1969, no. 13 (1594); Vsevolozhskaya 1970, pp. 9–18; Calvesi 1971, pp. 110–11, 135–36; Cinotti 1971, pp. 93–95; Posner 1971, pp. 301–4; Spezzaferro 1971, pp. 84–89; Frommel 1972, pp. 17–18, 21, 25–26, 36, 50–51 (1597); Kirwin 1972, p. 55; Scherliess 1973, pp. 147; Vsevolozhskaya in Leningrad 1973, no. 18; Marini 1974, p. 112, 358–60 (1595, Baglione refers to two pictures, the *Carafe of Flowers* being a separate independent work, as Bellori so states in 1672; see Catalogue of Lost Works L.108); Nicolson 1974, p. 560; Röttgen 1974, pp. 173, 189–90 (1596); Aronberg Lavin 1975, pp. 167, 346, 369, 397; Vsevolozhskaya 1975, no. 1 (one of the music books contains the first notes of a madrigal by Jacques Arcadelt: *Voi sapete ch’è io v’amo . . .*); Zafran in Washington 1975, pp. 24–29, n. 3 (c. 1596); Moir 1976, p. 85 no. 8; Parronchi 1976, pp. 16, 73; Nicolson 1979, pp. 34, 68; Vsevolozhskaya 1981, no. 115–16 (recites both Del Monte and Giustiniani as provenance: “The picture was painted for Cardinal Francesco Maria del Monte. . . . It is mentioned by Baglione and Bellori. However the earliest sources which mention this picture, the inventory lists of the Giustiniani gallery (1638) and Baglione 1642, refer to the lute player as a young man.”); Moir 1982, pp. 72–75 (1595–96); Cinotti 1983, no. 24 (Del Monte and Giustiniani references certainly to same picture, c. 1596); Freedberg 1983, p. 57 (1595–96); Hibbard 1983, pp. 279 (c. 1596); Spike 1983, p. 39; Wolfe 1985, pp. 451–52 (Hermitage is not the same as Cardinal Del Monte picture); Cottino 1989, pp. 659–76 (relates still-life elements to group of Master of Hartford *Still Lifes*); Marini 1989, pp. 399–402, no. 22 (Rome 1595); Salerno 1989, p. 34; Cropper 1990, p. 196; Christiansen 1990; Christiansen 1990², pp. 21–26 (densely painted surface, almost no pentimenti); Mahon 1990, pp. 5–20 (Hermitage, 1595–96); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono. . .* 1991, pp. 138–50; Bologna 1992, p. 304 (1595, earlier than New York version, Baglione refers to Hermitage version); Spike 1992², pp. 275–77; Gregori 1994, p. 146, no. 13 (c. 1595–56); Waźbiński 1994, p. 606 (painted for Del Monte by whom it was given to Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani); Gilbert 1995, pp. 105, 112–13, 124, 249, 253; Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1597, Hermitage); Langdon 1998, pp. 111–12, 115–16; Macioce 1998, p. 337 (1594–98, Minniti is model); Puglisi 1998, no. 11 (c. 1595–96); Robb 1998, p. 501 (I, 1596); Bauer and Colton 2000, p. 434 (cites use of tracings); Baldriga in Berlin–Rome 2001, pp. 274–75, no. D1 (c. 1595–96); Calvesi and Volpi 2001, pp. 176–77; Spike 2001, pp. 57–61, no. 10.1 (1596); Danesi Squarzina 2003, Inventari 1, pp. 394–95; Lapucci 2005,

pp. 20, 28 fig. 7; Marini in St. Petersburg 2005; Sgarbi 2005, no. 8 (c. 1595); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 25 (c. 1596, only autograph version); Vsevolozhskaya et al. 2005; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 6, 126; Varriano 2006, pp. 11, 37, 58–63, 116, 121–23, 159 n. 39 fig. 51; Debono 2007, p. 12 ill.; Ziane in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 170–71; Papa 2008, pp. 55–62 (1595–96); Eclercy in Frankfurt 2009, pp. 19–35.

Baglione's description of a *Lute Player* that Caravaggio considered the most beautiful work he had ever done is most reasonably applied to the present picture, which is universally acknowledged as the artist's finest rendition of this theme. It may well be, as Wa bi ski (1994) states that Vincenzo Giustiniani received this *Lute Player* as a gift from Caravaggio's protector Cardinal Del Monte. The marvelous reflections in the vase described by Baglione seem to be that author's recollection of a different canvas, perhaps the old copy formerly in the Duke of Beaufort collection, Badminton, and recently exhibited as autograph citing the opinions of Denis Mahon, Mina Gregori, Claudio Strinati, and Martin Kemp (Whitfield in Düsseldorf 2006). Bellori thought the lute player was female, and he appears to be referring to the second version, then in the Barberini collection (10.2 below).

All five senses are symbolically represented in the painting, itself an evocation of sight. The four madrigals in the open music book are love songs, painstakingly transcribed by the painter from four different pages of Jacques Arcadelt's *Libro Primo a quattro voci* published in Venice in 1539. The opening lines of the madrigal that begins with the ornamental majuscule V in the part book are

You know that I love you, nay, I adore you.
But you do not know that I die for you.

The lover's willingness to die for his beloved is intended to be read in the Neoplatonic key of courtly love. In a celebrated passage in the *Courtier* by Baldassare Castiglione, the poet Pietro Bembo described the way that earthly love becomes elevated to heavenly love through a platonic process of intellectual stages, beginning with the sensuous love for an unattainable, virtuous woman and culminating in the soul's love of God.

See pp. 57–61.

Condition:

Very good. The condition and technique of the painting was examined by Christiansen in his two publications of 1990.

Copy:

C. I

Private collection

Oil on canvas, 37³/₈ x 46³/₄ in. (95 x 118.5 cm)

Provenance:

Possibly purchased in Rome by Henry, third Duke of Beaufort at time of dispersal of Colonna Sciarra collection, c. 1728; Duke of Beaufort collection, Badminton, England; London, Sotheby's, June 11, 1969, lot 161, purchased by Mrs. McVail (£750); New York, Sotheby's, January 25, 2001, lot 179 (Düsseldorf 2006, p. 242).

Exhibitions:

Munich 2002; Florence 2003; Naples 2003; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 33 (dimensions 96 x 121 cm); Frankfurt am Main 2009, cat. no. 4.

Bibliography:

Nicolson 1974, p. 560 (copy); Moir 1976, p. 85 no. 8g, ill. 20 (copy of Hermitage); Cinotti 1983, p. 447 (copy of Hermitage); Wolfe 1985, pp. 451–52 (copy of painting mentioned by Baglione which includes a vase of flowers that reflects the light of a window); Christiansen 1990; Christiansen 1990², pp. 21–26; Mahon 1990, pp. 7–8, fig. 6 (closely based on St. Petersburg composition insofar as the figure and musical still life are concerned, but with a different carafe of flowers including reflections of a window); Calvesi 1995, pp. 27–47; Bauer–Colton 2000, p. 434 (copy made from a tracing); Spike 2001, cat. no. 10.1.c.1 (as copy, Hermitage); Gregori in Munich 2002 pp. 133–35; Kemp 2002, p. 364; Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, pp. 394–95 (copy with variations, citing re-examination by Whitfield); Gregori in Florence 2003, pp. 138–39 (1595); Whitfield in Düsseldorf 2006, ill. p. 102, detail 100, pp. 242–44, cat.

no. 33 (1595/96); Clark 2007, cat. no. 1, pp. 48–58 (as “Apollo the Luteplayer”); Gregori in Clark 2007, pp. 7–8; Whitfield 2008, pp. 3–38 (as “Apollo the Luteplayer” figs. 2, 16); Hartje-Grave in Frankfurt 2009, pp. 112–15, cat. no. 4.

10.2 *Lute Player*, c. 1600

Oil on canvas, 39³/₈ x 49³/₄ in. (100 x 126.5 cm)

Private collection, New York

Provenance:

Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, Rome, by 1627; by descent to Ugucione Del Monte and then to Alessandro Del Monte, Rome, 1626; from whom acquired by Cardinal Antonio Barberini; Prince Maffeo Barberini, Rome 1672; Prince Francesco Barberini, Rome, 1730; purchased from Prince Don Urbano Barberini, Palazzo Barberini, by Georges Wildenstein, restraints of entail having been dissolved by royal decree in 1934 (see: Mahon 1990, pp. 6, 10); by 1960, London, Wildenstein & Co.; by 1976, New York, Wildenstein & Co.

Inventories:

1. April 1627: Inventory of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, (section dated April 14, 1627) “In the third room [of the Palace at Ripetta] . . . a painting of a man who plays the lute by Michel Angelo da Caravaggio with a black frame measuring six palmi.” [“. . . Un Quadro con un’huomo, che suona il leuto di Michel Angelo da Caravaggio con Cornice negra di palmi sei.”] (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol. 583r; Frommel 1972, p. 36).

2. May 7, 1628: Listed among items sold to pay debts of Cardinal Francesco Maria del Monte, “On the seventh for a Saint Catherine, and a player of cards by Caravaggio, a Saint Jerome by Guercino da Cento, a Youth who plays a ‘keyboard’ . . . 550.” [“A di 7 d. Per una S. Caterina, et un gioco di carte del Caravaggio, un S. Gerolamo del Guercino da Cento, un Giovane che sona di clevo . . . 550”] (Nota del denaro retratto dalla vendita de Mobili del Giardino di Ripetta doppo otto scuti il Breve posto del Banco di S. Spirito, Kirwin 1972, p. 55).

3. April 1644: Inventory of the collection of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, “In the room of Parnassus/260) a painting with a young man in a shirt who plays the lute, with other instruments, by the hand of Caravaggio, with a gold frame, presumably modern” [“Nella Stanza di parnasso/260) Un quadro con un giovane in camiscia, che suona il leuto, con altri istrumenti, di mano del Caravaggio, con cornice tutta dorata, presumibilmente di tipo più moderno”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 167).

4. August 4, 1671: Posthumous inventory of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, Palazzo ai Giubbonari, Rome, “111) - 250 [scudi] - a painting 5½ palmi high, with a figure playing a Lute, with other musical instruments by the hand of MichielAngiolo de Caravaggio with a gold frame n.1 - 250 [scudi]” [“111) - 250 [scudi] - Un Quadro di p.mi 5½ di Altezza con Una figura che Suona un Liuto, con altri Stromenti Musicali mano di MichielAngiolo de Caravaggio con Cornice d’orata n.1 - 250 [scudi]”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 296–97).

5. 1672: Inventory taken at the division between the two heirs of Cardinal Antonio Barberini’s estate “252) A painting 5½ palmi high with a figure playing a Lute, with other musical instruments, by the hand of Michel’angiolo da Caravaggio with a gold frame 250 [scudi]” [“252) Un quadro di p.mi 5½ di Altezza con Una figura che suona un Liuto, con altri Istromenti Musicali, mano di Michel’angiolo da Caravaggio con Cornice d’orata 250 [scudi]”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 346).

6. August 16–17, 1672: Inventory of the Palazzo Barberini, the residence of Prince Don Maffeo, the heir of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, “149) An oblong painting of a woman who plays an *arciliuto* with various insturments, 5½ palmi long and 4 high, with a smooth gold frame, by Caravaggi” [“149) Un Quadro p. Longo di una Donna che Sona l’arciliuto con diversi Instr.te lungo p.mi 5½ alto p. 4 con Cornice liscia dorata mano del Caravaggi”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 369).

7. 1686: Inventory of the estate of Prince Maffeo Barberini, “66) A. an oblong portrait of a Woman, who plays an *arcileuto*, about 5½ palmi wide, 4½ palmi high, in a smooth gilt frame, hand of Caravaggi” [“66) A. Un Ritratto p. Longo d’una Donna, che sona l’Arcileuto lungo p. 5½ alto p.i 4½ in circa con cornice liscia tutta dorata, mano del Caravaggi -”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 397; Macioce 2003, p. 367).

8. 1730: Inventory of Francesco Barberini, Prince of Palestrina, by Caravaggio, Michelangelo Merisi da, “Music, playing a lute with a musical book and diverse instruments” [“La Musica, che suona un Leuto con un libro di sonate, e diversi Istrumenti”] (Getty Provenance Index 19).

Documents:

1. May 8, 1628: Recorded in the account book of Antonio Barberini who paid 550 scudi to Alessandro Del Monte for a large group of paintings and books, that included “a painting of a youth playing an instrument by Caravaggio” [“uno di un giovane sonatore del Caravaggio”] (Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Archivio Barberini, Computisteria 223, fol. 22 recto MDXXVIII di 15 giugno; Wolfe 1985, p. 452).

2. June 20, 1642: Carlo Magnone (Rome, 1620–55) pupil of Andrea Sacchi, commissioned to paint a copy of the *Cardsharps (I Bari)* and a *Lute Player (Sonatore di liuto)* both by Caravaggio, in the Barberini collection, “22 scudi paid to Siri paid to Carlo Magnone painter for having copied two paintings by Caravaggio one of three people playing a game and the other one of a lute player” [“sc. ventedue m.ta buoni a Siri pagati a *Carlo Magnone* pittore p haver copiato due quadri del *Caravaggio* uno con tre persone che giocano e l’altro con uno che sona il leuto - 22.”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 9, no. 78; Macioce 2003, II doc. 482, p. 295).

Sources:

1. Bellori 1672, (ed. 1976, pp. 216–17): “For this prelate [Cardinal Del Monte] Michele painted a *Concert of Youths* [cat. no. 6] in half figures drawn from life; a woman in a blouse playing a lute with the music before her and a Saint Catherine on her knees leaning against her wheel [cat. no. 20]. The last two paintings, which are still in the same room, show a more saturated coloring, since Michele was already beginning to strengthen his shadows.” [“Dipinse per questo signore [Cardinal Del Monte] una musica di giovani ritratti dal naturale in mezze figure [see cat. no. 6], *una donna in camicia che suona il liuto con le note avanti*, e Santa Caterina ginocchione appoggiata alla rota; *li due ultimi sono ancora nelle medesime camere, ma riescono d’un colorito più tinto*, cominciando già Michele ad igagliardire gli oscuri.”]

2. Rossini 1693, p. 56: listed in the Barberini Palazzo alle Quattro Fontane, after the *Cardsharps* by Caravaggio, “a woman who plays the lute, by the same hand” [“una donna che sona il leuto del medesimo”] (Mahon 1990, p. 14, n. 74).

3. Rossi 1697, p. 351: Listed in the Barberini Palazzo alle Quattro Fontane, “a female lute player” [“Suonatrice di leuto”] (Mahon 1990, p. 14, n. 75).

4. Vasi 1763 [ed. 1794, p. 450; ed. 1807, p. 285]: in Palazzo Barberini, “a female player of music by Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“suonatrice di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”] (Mahon 1990, p. 15, n. 82).

5. von Ramdohr 1787, III, p. 41: records the canvas in the Barberini Palace as a copy of a Saint Cecilia playing a zither in the Palazzo Giustiniani (See full text quoted at catalogue no. 10.1 above; Mahon 1990, p. 15, n. 79, 80).

Exhibitions:

Florence 1991, no. 5; Bergamo 2000, no. 25; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 29; Cremona-New York 2004.

Bibliography:

Mariotti 1892 pp. 127 (publishes Barberini inventory made by Camuccini 1817, listing painting as no. 13 “Woman playing a guitar by Caravaggio” [“Suonatrice di chitarra, del Caravaggio”]); Venturi 1910, pp. 197–98; Longhi 1913, p. 161 n. 1 (by Saraceni, “Saraceni is unmistakable even when he copies Caravaggio as he did in the Barberini *Lute Player* and in the *Fortune-Teller* in the Capitolina” [“Saraceni per questo lato non si smentisce mai, né pure quando copi Caravaggio, come appare nella *Suonatrice Barberini* e nella *Buona Ventura* della Capitolina.”]); Voss 1924, p. 74 (not autograph); Muñoz 1928, p. 298 (Saraceni); Benkard 1928, pp. 113–24 (Saraceni); Royal Decree of April 16, 1934 ending Barberini entail, no. 12, annex B (“N.12. *Carlo Saraceni [attribuito nei cataloghi al Caravaggio] Suonatore [male] di chitarra*”); Hinks 1953 (a free copy of the Hermitage picture, with musical instruments and a birdcage instead of flowers, ascribed to Saraceni); Wagner 1958, p. 177 n. 53 (refers to Anderson photo no. 3979 as recorded by

Caravaggio in Barberini collection in 1697); Longhi 1961, p. 26 (anonymous Caravaggesque copy of the Hermitage picture); Marini 1974, pp. 112, 359 (copy); Aronberg Lavin 1975 (as Carlo Magnone, copyist active for Barberini, June 20, 1642); Zafran in Washington 1975, pp. 24–29, n. 3 (copy with variations, which carried an attribution to Saraceni); Moir 1976, p. 85 no. 8f, 123 n. 184, ill. 19 (as Wildenstein, New York, 1960, the copy by Carlo Magnone [1620–53] painted for Barberini in 1642, with variations); Nicolson 1979, p. 68 (copy); Cinotti 1983, p. 447–48 (Barberini only ever owned a copy of the Hermitage picture painted by Magnone, as noted in 1642, and later promoted this copy to autograph status in later inventories; after discussing all documents and sources concludes that “Bellori has confused the Del Monte [original] and the Barberini [copy]; confusions of this type are common”); Hibbard 1983, pp. 272–73 n. 10, 279–81 n. 18 (copy); Colin Slim 1985, pp. 246–47 (musical notations differ from Giustiniani picture); Boyer–Volf 1988, pp. 23, 31 n. CXIX (identify this picture as the painting of a *musique* given by Cardinal Antonio Barberini to Duc du Créquy during his visit to Rome May–June 1638, Mahon (1990, pp. 5–20; connects the Créquy reference to the *Musicians*, New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art); Camiz Trinchieri in Marini 1989, p. 381 (copy, singer is castrato which explains ambiguity of sex); Salerno 1989, pp. 30–34 (attributed to Carlo Saraceni); Mahon 1990, pp. 5–20 (Barberini/New York later version of Giustiniani picture, 1596–97); Christiansen 1990, pp. 28–49, 59–60, no. 5; Christiansen 1990², pp. 21–26; Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 5; Cropper 1991, pp. 193–212; Bologna 1992, pp. 304–5 (believes that Baglione reference is to painting in the Hermitage, 1595); Spike 1992², pp. 275–77 (studio collaboration); Christiansen 1992, pp. 503–4; Mahon 1992, pp. 502–3; Varriano 1992, p. 505; Calvesi 1994, pp. 148–57 (workshop assistance); Gregori 1994, p. 44, 146, no. 14 (c. 1596–97); Waźbiński 1994, pp. 606–7 (probably executed in the workshop of Caravaggio perhaps under his supervision and during his residence in the Palazzo Madama); Bauer 1995, p. 38 (notes that d’Arpino used tracings to make replicas); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1598); Gilbert 1995, pp. 112–14, 124, 127, 131, 216; Langdon 1998, p. 112 (not entirely from Caravaggio’s hand); Puglisi 1998, no. 12 (as attributed, musical instruments by another painter, c. 1596); Robb 1998, p. 501 (II, 1596); Bauer and Colton 2000, p. 434 (cite use of tracings); Christiansen in Bergamo 2000, no. 25 (1597–98); Calvesi and Volpi 2001, pp. 176–77; Gash 2001, p. 439 (questions studio collaboration); Marini in Milan 2001, pp. 479 (Caravaggio and assistant, Mario Minniti?); Spike 2001, p. 60, no. 10.2 (c. 1600, with studio collaboration); Vodret in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 29 (c. 1597–98); Danesi Squarzina 2003,

vol. 1, pp. 394–95 (another version citing Christiansen 1990² and Gregori 1991); Macioce 2003, p. 367 (identifies this with the painting of this subject referenced in the 1672 and 1686 Barberini inventories); Christiansen in Bayer 2004, pp. 172–73 (1597–98); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 25 (c. 1596, picture referred to in 1627 Del Monte inventory, autograph despite ruined condition); Varriano 2006, pp. 1, 2, 95, 116, 121–23, 159, no. 39, 40, fig. 77.; Tresoldi 2006, p. 73 (1596–97); Ziane in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 170–72 (symbolism of caged bird); Eclercy in Frankfurt 2009, pp. 19–35.

Bellori cites this second *Lute Player* in the Palazzo Barberini adjacent to the *Saint Catherine*. Like many observers through the years, he mistook the singer for a woman. After 1787 the Barberini *Lute Player* was generally considered a copy of the superior Giustiniani version (cat. no. 10.1). The painting has recently been restored to Caravaggio by Mahon, who reconstructed its provenance from Cardinal Del Monte, and by Christiansen, who published x-rays demonstrating its technical dependence on the Giustiniani prototype. Christiansen showed that the outlines of the composition were transferred using tracings.

The painting appears to have been planned by Caravaggio in response to Del Monte's interest in music and poetry. Variations were introduced so that the composition would allude to the competition between a sublimely gifted singer and a nightingale described by Giambattista Marino in his poem, *L'Adone*. The solo instruments placed on the table refer to their marathon contest which finally ended with the bird's death. The lute player is noticeably less handsome, no doubt to distinguish him from the spiritualized portrayal in the Giustiniani *Lute Player*. For the Marino poem, see Cropper 1990, p. 193. Most recent writers have observed a measure of workshop assistance.

See p. 60, illustration.

Condition:

Good condition apart from some passages of overcleaning, especially in the drapery. The painting was somewhat flattened in the course of an old relining. Results of its technical examination in 1989 and 1990 were published by Christiansen (1990, 1990²).

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified copies:

C.1

June 20, 1642: Carlo Magnone (Rome, 1620–55), pupil of Andrea Sacchi, commissioned to paint a copy of the *Cardsharps (I Bari)* and a *Lute Player (Sonatore di liuto)* both by Caravaggio, in the Barberini collection, “22 scudi paid to Siri paid to Carlo Magnone painter for having copied two paintings by Caravaggio one of three people playing a game and the other one of a lute player” [“sc. ventedue m.ta buoni a Siri pagati a *Carlo Magnone* pittore p haver copiato due quadri del *Caravaggio* uno con tre persone che giocano e l’altro con uno che sona il leuto - 22.”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 9, no. 78; Ważbiński 1994, p. 606).

C.2

Rome, Collection of Ottavio Costa

Inventories:

1. 1633: Inventory of the Palazzo di Albenga, a painting of a young woman who plays the lute three and a half palmi high by 4 wide, with a partially gilt frame [“Giovane che sona di liuto d’altezza di palmi 3 e mezo in circa e di larghezza 4 in circa con cornici parte indorati con ramaggi à torno”] (Costa Restagno 2004 p. 138).

2. 1640: “a Luteplayer with a painting of three youths, of whom two are playing cards” [Costa Restagno 2004, pp. 100–101; Terzaghi 2007, p. 305, both copies].

II. Selected copies:

C.3

Paris, Salini Collection

Oil on canvas, 38½ x 47¾ in. (97.7 x 120.4 cm)

Provenance:

DiMarzo collection, Catania; private collection, Catania by January 1838; Christie's Rome, May 16, 1986, lot 221 (as Roman seventeenth century); private collection, Rome by 2000.

Exhibitions:

Milan 2001, cat. no. IX.3; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 32; Frankfurt am Main 2009, cat. no. 5.

Bibliography:

Amico 1855, I, p. 298 (as in Catania, “una cantante” by Caravaggio); Marini 1986, *Il giornale dell'arte*, pp. 1, 4 (as ex-Barberini); Marini 1989, pp. 377–84, no. 13 (Rome 1594); Mahon 1990, pp. 7–8 (not ex-Barbarini; manifest copy of relatively modest quality, by Magnone?); Marini in Milan 2000, pp. 477–79 (as autograph, 1594.); Marini 2001, pp. 146, 380–81 (1594); Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 3–7, fig. no. 1 (as Caravaggio?); Spike 2001, cat. no. 10.2.c.2 (as copy); Gasparri–Marini in Düsseldorf 2006, ill. p. 98, pp. 241–42, cat. no. 32 (1594); Hartje-Grave in Frankfurt 2009, pp. 112–15, cat. no. 5 (1603).

11. *Still Life of a Basket of Fruit*, c. 1596

Oil on canvas, 12¼ x 18½ in. (31 x 47 cm)

Pinacoteca Ambrosiana, Milan

Provenance:

Probably executed for Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, Rome, as a gift for Cardinal Federico Borromeo, Archbishop of Milan; by whom left to the Biblioteca Ambrosiana, Milan, in a testament codicil of 1607.

Inventories/Documents:

1. 1607: Codicil to the testament of Cardinal Federico Borromeo (Longhi 1928/29, pp. 30–31, 268, 271).

2. April 28, 1618: Inventory of the Ambrosiana, penultimate of the group: “a basket of fruits by Michel Angelo da Caravaggio, on canvas, one braccio wide, three quarters high, without frame.” [“una cesta di frutti di Michel Angelo da Caravaggio, sopra la tela, larga un braccio, et alta tre quarti, senza cornice.”] (ASM, Fondo Notarile, Archivio della Cancelleria Arcivescovile Civile, Filza n. 138, atto no. 39; published in Falchetti 1969, pp. 285, 295).

Sources:

1. Cardinal Federico Borromeo in *Musaeum*, part of the tract *De Pictura Sacra*, 1618, published 1625, pp. 32–33 (1754 ed. p. 132: Michaelis Angeli Fiscella. “Of not little value is a basket containing flowers in lively tints. It was made by Michelangelo da Caravaggio who acquired a great name in Rome. I would have liked to place another similar basket nearby, but no other having attained the beauty and incomparable excellence of this, it remained alone.” [“Nec abest gloria proxima huic fiscella, ex qua flores micant. Fecit eam Michael Angelus Caravaggensis Romae nactus auctoritatem, volueramque ego fiscellam huic aliam habere similem, sed cum huius pulchritudinem, incomparabilemque excellentiam assequeretur nemo, solitaria relictæ est.”]

2. Bosca 1672, p. 126: “A basket containing new fruit, grapes, apples and other natural kinds . . . tantalus . . . with such a strong painting he emulated Polyclorus his compatriot and obtained his first celebrity as an artist.” [“Continet cista recentes fructus, uvas, mala, aliaque id genus naturæ certantia, ac spectantium, nedum Tantalus, oculis futura ludibrio. . . . Fortasse pictori æmulari placuit Polydorum conterraneum suum primæ celebritatis artificem.”]

Exhibitions:

Lucerne 1946, no. 32; Milan 1951, no. 11; New York-Naples 1985, no. 75 (not exhibited).

Bibliography:

Ratti 1907, pp. 27, 58, no. 8, 136; Beltrami 1909; Venturi 1910, pp. 198–201 (Roman period); Marangoni 1917, pp. 13–14 (early study from youthful Roman period); Marangoni in Florence 1922, p. 19; Voss 1924, p. 446; Borenius 1925, p. 26; Bernkard 1928, pp. 140–41; Longhi

1928/29, pp. 30–31, 268, 274 (slightly later, painting was a gift from Del Monte to Borromeo based upon letter of February 29, 1596 in which picture may be mentioned); Schudt 1942, no. 39 (for its resemblance to the basket in the London *Supper at Emmaus*, dates to 1598); Borgese in *Corriere della Sera*, September 16, 1950 (as fragment study for London, *Supper at Emmaus*); Longhi 1950, pp. 34–39; Arslan 1951, p. 448 (c. 1596, fragment); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 11; Mahon 1951, p. 227 n. 49 (relates to 1596 letter from Cardinal del Monte to Cardinal Federico Borromeo), p. 233 (1596–97, n. 108 “. . . background, which breaks clumsily into Caravaggio’s sensitive contours, is certainly not by him.”); Venturi 1951, no. 14; Baumgart 1952, pp. 103, 106; Longhi 1952, p. 19, no. IV (no evidence painting is a fragment in x-rays, first preparatory sketch, painted over a decoration of grotesques); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1596–97); Sterling 1952, pp. 52–53 (“The first great master of modern painting to paint an autonomous still life” [a *xenion*]); Hinks 1953, no. 13; Baumgart 1955, no. 22 (c. 1595–96); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 142–43 (1596–97); Wagner 1958, pp. 35–36, 52, 185 n. 142–53, 227 (1596–97); Arslan 1959, pp. 192–201 (radiograph); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 76–78; Jullian 1961, pp. 48–49, 53, 67–70; Waterhouse 1962, p. 22; Venturi 1963, no. 17; Salerno 1966, p. 107; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 31 (1596, emblem of all modern painting); Kitson 1969, no. 19; Calvesi 1971, pp. 97–98, 128–29; Cinotti 1971, p. 162 (not fragment; after Uffizi *Bacchus* and before London *Emmaus*); Frommel 1972, pp. 13, 20, 51 (1599–1600); Causa 1972, pp. 997–99, 1030 n. 1; Gregori 1972, pp. 37–38; Calvesi 1974, pp. 80–82, 98, 100; Marini 1974, pp. 114, 360–62 (not fragment, rejects dating to letter of 1596); Moir 1976, p. 86 no. 11, 123–24 n. 185 (Hope Wernus identifies underlying painting as a copy of the base of a classical candelabrum in the Lateran Museum); Zeri 1976, p. 103; Wright 1978, p. 41; Nicolson 1979, p. 34; Moir 1982, p. 100 (1600–1601); Volpe in London 1982, pp. 57–59; Cinotti 1983, no. 32 (with previous bibliography); Hibbard 1983, no. 47, pp. 80, 294–95 (c. 1598); Spike 1983, p. 13–14, 39, pl. 1 (c. 1596); Gregori 1985, no. 75 (last years of 1500s); Paredi, Dell’Acqua, and Vitali in The Ambrosiana Gallery 1986, p. 32; Cottino 1989, pp. 659–76; Marini 1989, pp. 367–69, no. 9 (Rome, after January 24, 1594); Salerno 1989, pp. 30–31; Zeri 1989, p. 196, ill. 212; Calvesi 1990 (c.1599); Cinotti 1991 (1598–99); Bologna 1992, pp. 129–36, 306 (1595–96); Spike 1992, p. 20; Gregori 1994, p. 35, 147, no. 24 (c. 1597–98); Ważbiński 1994, II, pp. 455–56; Frommel in Macioce 1996, pp. 20–29 (1595); Gilbert 1995, pp. 111–12, 126; Spike in Macioce 1996, p. 212; Langdon 1998, pp. 116–19; Puglisi 1998, no. 35 (c. 1601); Robb 1998, pp. 103–5, 504 (1599); Battistini, Zuffi, Impelluso 1999; p. 48; Benedetti in Moromondo 1999, p. 218, fig. 37;

Spike 2001, pp. 61–64, no. 11 (c. 1596); Abbate 2002, p. 121; Annoni 2002, p. 235; Ebert-Schiffer 2002, pp. 1–23; Mozzarelli 2004, pp. 272, 284–85; Sgarbi 2005, no. 14 (1595–96); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 3; Varriano 2006, pp. 24–26; Debono 2007, pp. 8–9, ill.; Pichler in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 9–33; Papa 2008, p. 42 (1597–98).

Still Life of a Basket of Fruit, often known by its Latin title *Fiscella*, seems always to have been in the collection of Cardinal Federico Borromeo, founder of the Biblioteca Ambrosiana, where it is first cited in 1607. Scholarly opinion is divided as to whether the *Basket of Fruit*, one of the first independent still lifes painted in Italy, was commissioned directly by Federico Borromeo during one of his Roman residences (April 1597 to May 1601), or received as a gift from Cardinal Del Monte in whose palace Caravaggio lived from 1595 to 1600. Longhi called attention to a letter of February 29, 1596 to Borromeo in which Del Monte refers to forthcoming gifts of “paintings and clocks” (*pitture et horologi*). A subsequent letter of April 27, 1596 refers only to a *Madonna* being painted by Scipione Pulzone (see Calvesi 1990, pp. 258–59), which does not rule out, however, the connection proposed by Longhi with the Ambrosiana picture.

Longhi praised its “humble biological drama.” Nearly every writer on this fascinating still life has advanced a personal reading of its possible significance ranging from decorative *trompe-l’oeil* (Wright) to Christological (Calvesi). The representation of fruits and leaves in various states of decay inevitably evokes the *vanitas* imagery widely diffused in Netherlandish precedents. See pp. 61–64 for a reading of this picture as an evocation of a *xenion*, or gift, painting described in the *Imagines* of Philostratus.

Condition:

Good condition. The unmodulated cream-colored background and brown shelf on which the basket is placed are unusual in Caravaggio’s oeuvre. Technical and radiographic examination in 1951 rejected the hypothesis that the painting was a fragment of a larger composition. Radiography revealed an underlying painting representing a classical *grottesche* motif which Salerno (1966) ascribed to Prospero Orsi, Caravaggio’s friend and a specialist in the genre. On the basis of a cleaning and restoration carried out by the Istituto Centrale del Restauro in

Rome in 1966, Brandi (1972/73, pp. 37–42 cited in Cinotti 1983, pp. 464–65) laid to rest the suspicion that the light-colored background had been added by a later hand (Mahon 1951).

Copies:

None recorded.

12. *Medusa*, c. 1597

Oil on canvas stretched over shield of poplar wood,
diameter 21¾ in. (55 cm)

Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence: inv. 1351

Provenance:

Waźbiński (1994, p. 96, n. 100) proposed that Cardinal Del Monte brought the painting during his visit to Florence in July 1598 as a gift to the Grand Duke Ferdinando dei Medici; recorded in the Medici collections since at least 1620.

Inventories:

1. September 7, 1598, Inventory of the Guardaroba Medicea: without indication of author, “a little circle or round shield with a golden frieze at the edge, and painted in the middle is the head of Medusa on a green field” [“Una rotella o scudo tondo con fregio attorno arabescato d’oro e dipinto in mezzo la testa di Medusa in campo verde con la sua imbraccatura di velluto tané”] (ASF, Guardaroba Medicea 204, c. 18; Waźbiński 1994, p. 95; Barocchi and Gaeta Bertelà 2002, I, p. 102, n. 364).

This same reference is repeated in an inventory of 1609 (ASF, Guardaroba Medicea 289, fol. 154v).

2. 1631: Inventory of the Armeria Medicea “and in another hand a shield on which is painted a head of Medusa covered in snakes by Caravaggio” [“e nell’altra mano uno scudo entrovi

dento dipinto una testa di Medusa tutta serpegiata di mano del Caravaggio . . .”] and in subsequent inventories of 1639 through 1719.

3. In 1736, and subsequent inventories: “A shield of fig wood on which is painted the head of Medusa on a green field by Caravaggio or it might be by Leonardo da Vinci” [“uno scudo di fico dipintovi una testa di Medusa in campo verde di mano del Caravaggio oppure vogliono che sia di Leonardo da Vinci”] (Heikamp 1966, p. 75; Varriano 1997, pp. 73–80).

Sources:

1. Gaspare Murtola 1603, in a madrigal entitled: “For the shield of Medusa. Painting by the same [Caravaggio]” [“Per lo scudo di Medusa. Pittura del medesimo [Caravaggio]”] (Macioce 2003 F.3, p. 310).

2. Giambattista Marino 1620: A poem entitled “*The Head of Medusa*, on a round shield by Michelangelo da Caravaggio in the Gallery of the Grand Duke of Tuscany.” [“La testa di Medusa in una rotella di Michelangelo di Caravaggio, nella galleria del granduca di Toscana”] (Fulco 1980, p. 65–89; Heikamp 1966, 70–76).

3. Baglione 1642, p. 136: “Among the works for Cardinal Del Monte, Caravaggio painted on a round shield, a frightful head of a Medusa with snakes for hair, which the Cardinal sent as a gift to Ferdinand, Grand Duke of Tuscany.” [“E parimente [Caravaggio fece] una testa di Medusa con capelli di vipere, assai spaventosa sopra una rotella rapportata, che dal Cardinale fu mandata in dono a Ferdinando Gran Duca di Toscana.”]

4. Bellori 1672, p. 205: “The head of the Medusa, given by Cardinal Del Monte to the Grand Duke of Tuscany, was especially praised by Cavaliere Marino, first in glory among men of letters whose portrait Caravaggio had painted.” [“[S]i come dal Marino stesso fu celebrata particolarmente la testa di Medusa di sua mano, che il Cardinale del Monte donò al Gran Duca di Toscana.”]

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 5; Florence 2002; Milan 2004, cat. no. 1.

Bibliography:

Galleria di Firenze Illustrata 1819, p. 652, no. 63 (reproduced in etching); Burkhardt 1855, p. 1032; Ricci 1908, pp. 1–10; Marangoni 1922, pp. 793–94; Voss 1924, p. 83 (youthful work); Schudt 1942, no. 14; Arslan 1951, p. 448; Berenson 1951, p. 55; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 5 (1591–92); Mahon 1951, p. 233 (1594–95); Venturi 1951, no. 13; Longhi 1952, no. XIX (1591–92); Mahon 1952, pp. 8, 19 (1595–96); Hinks 1953, no. 15 (1596–97); Baumgart 1955, no. 16 (1593–94); Czobor 1955, pp. 206, 210, 211 (self-portrait); Friedlaender 1955, p. 157, no. 13 (the *Medusa* was undoubtedly given in celebration of the wedding of Cosimo to which Cardinal Del Monte was invited in 1608; end of juvenile period); Wagner 1958, pp. 24–25 (self-portrait, 1590–92); Wittkower 1959, p. 23; Arslan 1959, p. 202 (1596–97); Jullian 1961, pp. 51, 53 (c. 1596); Heikamp 1966, pp. 70–76 (added by Ferdinand to collection of precious armour which was presented to him, c. 1601 by the Persian ruler Abbas the Great, date toward 1600); Salerno 1966, pp. 106–10; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 33 (1596–98); Kitson 1969, no. 28 (c. 1600); Salerno 1970, pp. 240–41 (1598–99); Calvesi 1971, pp. 106, 109 (1602); Cinotti 1971, pp. 68–69 (1598–99); Spezzaferro 1971, p. 86, 89; Frommel 1972, pp. 42–45 (c. 1597); Marini 1974, pp. 116–17, 363–64 n. 21 (1596); Röttgen 1974, p. 198; Moir 1976, p. 86 no. 14; Marini 1977, pp. 119–44; Nicolson 1979, p. 31; *Gli Uffizi* 1979, no. P360; Moir 1982, p. 98 (1600–1601); Cinotti 1983, no. 11 (c. 1598–99); Hibbard 1983, pp. 67–69 (c. 1597); Marini 1989, pp. 403–5, no. 24 (Rome, c. 1596); Posèq 1989, pp. 170–74; Posèq 1990², pp. 157–59, pl. 10 (1597); Cropper 1991; Bologna 1992, p. 306 (1595); Corradini-Marini 1993, pp. 167–69; Gregori 1994, p. 147, no. 17; Wazbiński 1994, I, pp. 95–97; II, p. 350; Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1597); Gilbert 1995, pp. 112, 125, 127, 168, 252; Varriano 1997, pp. 73–80 (compares to *Medusa* by Leonardo); Langdon 1998, pp. 119–22, 199, 200–201; Puglisi 1998, no. 19 (c. 1598); Robb 1998, p. 502 (1597); Spike 2001, pp. 64–66, no. 12 (c. 1597); Caneva 2002, pp. 19–25; Caneva in Florence 2002; *La Medusa del Caravaggio Restaurata*, 2002; Scarpelli in Caneva 2002 (restoration notes); Solinas 2002; Marini 2003; Berra in Milan 2004, pp. 55–83; Moreno in Milan 2004, pp. 35–45; Rossi in Milan 2004, pp. 47–53; Spezzaferro in Milan 2004, pp. 19–27; Sebregondi 2005, pp. XLI–XLII; Sgarbi 2005, no. 16; Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (intorno 1596, deformed self-portrait, painted for Del Monte); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 1, fig. 1; Tresoldi 2006, p. 65 (1597–98); Varriano 2006, pp. 9, 24–25, 55, 73, 80–81, 105–6, 130, fig. 21; Krüger in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 35–57; Pichler in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 9–33; Papa 2008, pp. 16–17, 25 (1596–97).

This gift from Cardinal Del Monte to his patron, the grand duke in Florence, was widely praised in poetry and prose. None of the sources mentions, however, that the subject was chosen as an homage to one of the greatest treasures of the Florentine collections, the *Medusa* painted by Leonardo da Vinci, now lost. Wa bi ski (1994) and Varriano (1997) establish this connection. Within a few decades, Medici inventories confused the names of the two artists. As Heikamp (1965, 1966) discusses, the installation of Caravaggio's painting in the Medici armory confirms that its circular shape and wooden support were intended to evoke a shield embossed with the fearsome head of Medusa.

See pp. 64–66.

Condition:

Very good. The painting was restored in 1951 by the museum. In 1966, the *Medusa* was x-rayed on the request of Detlef Heikamp in order to determine that it was painted on a canvas that was then applied to a circular convex panel of wood. Ricci (1908) had suggested that the painting was executed on an authentic shield. The painting was found to be in good condition during its restoration by Stefano Scarpelli in 2002 (see *La Medusa del Caravaggio Restaurata*, 2002).

Copy:

C. I

Private collection, London

Oil on canvas applied to fig wood, diameter 18 $\frac{7}{8}$ in. (48 cm)

Inscribed in reverse: Michel A. f.

Exhibitions:

Milan 2001, cat. no. IX.5; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 40.

Bibliography:

Marini in Milan 2001, pp. 482–85 (as attributed); Marini–Mahon 2004, pp. 175–84 (precedes Uffizi *Medusa*); Marini 2005, p. 176, 413–15, no. 24; Hartje, Gasparri, and Marini in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 256–57, cat. no. 40 (1596).

13. *Jove, Neptune, and Pluto*, 1597

Oil on plastered wall, shallow barrel vault in a small room,

approx. 118 x 70¾ in. (300 x 180 cm)

Villa Boncampagni-Ludovisi, Rome (formerly Casino del Cardinal Del Monte)

Provenance:

In situ.

Documents:

1. November 26, 1596: Cardinal Del Monte acquires a vineyard with house near Porta Pinciana from Francesco Neri (Zandri 1969, p. 338 n. 2; Bernardini 1991, p. 18).

2. September 1597: Cardinal Del Monte sells the property to Cardinal Pietro Aldobrandini (Trinchieri Camiz 1992, pp. 82 and 88; Ważbiński 1994, p. 117).

3. April 1599: Cardinal Del Monte reacquires the property. (Ważbiński 1994, p. 117).

4. June 3, 1621: Property sold to Cardinal Ludovico Boncompagni Ludovisi. (Felice 1952, p. 132; Zandri 1969, p. 338 n. 2; Bernardini 1991, p. 18; Ważbiński 1994, p. 117).

Source:

1. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 233): "It is said in Rome that by his hand is a *Jove, Neptune, and Pluto* in the Ludovisi garden at Porta Pinciana, in the Casino that had belonged to Cardinal Del Monte who, being a student of chemical medications, adorned the small chamber of his distillery, associating these gods to the elements with a globe of the world in the center. It is said that Caravaggio, having heard himself criticized for not understanding neither planes nor perspective, responded by placing the bodies so as to be seen from below with the most difficult foreshortenings. Nonetheless it is true that these gods do not retain their proper forms, and they are painted in oil on the vault since Michele had never touched his brush to fresco. Similarly his followers always resort to the convenience of oil colors when painting the

model.” [“Tiensi ancora in Roma essere di sua mano Giove, Netuno e Plutone nel Giardino Ludovisi a Porta Pinciana, nel casino che fu del Cardinale del Monte, il quale essendo studioso di medicamenti chimici, vi adornò il camerino della sua distilleria, appropriando questi dei gli’elementi col globo del mondo nel mezzo di loro. Dicesi che il Caravaggio sentendosi biasimare di non intendere né piani né prospettiva, tanto si aiutò collocando li corpi in veduta dal sotto in su che volle contrastare gli scorti più difficili. E ben vero che questi dei non ritengono le loro proprie forme, e sono coloriti ad olio nella volta, non avendo Michele mai toccato pennello a fresco, come li suoi seguaci insieme ricorrono sempre alla commodità del colore ad olio per ritrarre il modello.”]

Bibliography:

Samek Ludovici 1952, pp. 69–70 (lost); Friedlaender 1955, p. 226 (lost); Joffroy 1959, p. 24 (lost); Jullian 1961, p. 233 (1595–1600, lost); Longhi 1968, pp. 32–33 (lost); Zandri 1969, p. 338–43 (1597–1600, Neptune self-portrait); dell’Arco 1970, p. 132 (as by Pomarancio); dell’Arco-Marini 1970, p. 122 (Antonio Pomarancio in a “Gentilsechiano” moment); Salerno 1970, p. 237; Calvesi 1971, pp. 100, 120; Cinotti 1971, pp. 144, 203 n. 582 (rejects); Posner 1971, pp. 313, 323 n. 45; Spear 1971, p. 8 n. 27 (rejects); Spezzaferro 1971, p. 86; Frommel 1972, pp. 9, 14, 20–22, 28–29 (1596–97); Calvesi 1972, p. 100; Marini 1974, pp. 288–89 (probably autograph, 1597); Röttgen 1974, p. 198; Moir 1976, no. 49, p. 135–36, n. 227; Wallach 1974–75; Nicolson 1979, p. 31 (rejects); Spear 1979, p. 318 (rejects); Moir 1982, p. 86 (1597); Cinotti 1983, no. 84 (attributed, doubts Bellori reference); Hibbard 1983, pp. 334–37 (rejects); Calvesi 1985, pp. 227f.; Gregori 1985, p. 30 (c. 1597); Dante Bernini in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 70–74 (connects figure of Jove with the Goltzius engraving, *Ixion*, of 1588); Marini 1989, pp. 405–7, no. 25 (Rome 1597); *Il soffitto . . .* 1990; Bologna in *Il soffitto . . .* 1990 (Pomerancio); Bernardini–Gaggi–Marccone 1991, pp. 18–21 (1598–99, details of restoration just concluded); Calvesi 1991, pp. 22–26 (allegory of Alchemy, quotes Ripa 1603 “for the ancients, Jove represented air, Neptune water, and Pluto earth”); Bologna 1992, pp. 347–48 (rejects); Rossi 1994, pp. 181–84; Gregori 1994, p. 147, no. 19 (c. 1597); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1596–97); Gilbert 1995, pp. 111, 125, 127, 257; Basile in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 51–56; Bernardini in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 102–5 (“in small room of the metals”); Gregori in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 106–20; Langdon 1998, p. 128; Puglisi 1998, no. 30 (c. 1599–1600); Robb 1998, p. 503 (1597); Spike 2001, pp. 66–69, no. 13 (1597); Sgarbi 2005, no. 24 (c. 1598–99, after Detroit *Magdalen*); Sgarbi

in Milan 2005, p. 26 (c. 1597); Tresoldi 2006, p. 81 (1597); Varriano 2006, pp. 25–26, 37; Clark 2007, cat. no. 3, pp. 60–62; Strinati in Milan 2008 (after end of November 1596 and before September 1597); Whitfield 2008, pp. 3–38 (fig. 1); Grundy in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 21–35.

As Bellori clearly states, the painting decorates the private study in the small garden villa where Cardinal Del Monte kept his alchemical laboratory. Its occult imagery has yet to be thoroughly understood. As the Ludovisi casino passed briefly to Cardinal Aldobrandini in 1598, the painting must have been executed before or after that date.

Mural painting is a rarity in Caravaggio's oeuvre as Bellori points out, underscoring his use of oil pigments instead of fresco. After many decades of doubts among scholars, including Cinotti (1971) and Hibbard (1983), the *Jove, Neptune and Pluto* is now generally accepted as a fully autograph, if exceptional, work by Caravaggio.

See pp. 66–69.

Condition:

Good, despite many small losses due to water infiltration and along cracks in the ceiling. In 1989 the work was restored by the Soprintendenza of Rome with results presented in a symposium held at the Palazzo Barberini on December 7, 1990. A summary technical report was published by Bernardini, Gaggi, and Marcone in 1991.

Copies:

None recorded.

14. *Bacchus*, 1597–98

Oil on canvas, 37³/₈ x 33¹/₂ in. (95 x 85 cm)

Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 1890, no. 5512

Provenance:

Marangoni discovered this canvas in the storage of the Galleria degli Uffizi in via Lambertesca about 1913, and considered it a copy.

Inventories/Documents:

I. Corti (1989, pp. 108–46) and Ważbiński (1994, p. 99 no. 113) identify this picture with a *Bacchus* acquired for Grand Duke Cosimo II by Francesco Guicciardini, Medici ambassador in Rome, March 8, 1618 [“un altra cassetta d’un quadro d’un Bacco auto da Francesco Stati e mandato pure a Sua Altezza d’ordine di Giulio Parigi”].

II. E. Fumagalli (in Florence 1998, cat. 33, p. 88) has suggested that this painting can be identified with a *Bacchus*, without attribution, cited in inventories of the Medici Villa at Artimino beginning in 1609:

A. 1609: A large painting on canvas of a Bacchus with a black frame with gold threads [“Un quadro grande in tela dipintovi Bacho con adornamento nero filettato d’oro”] (ASF, Guardaroba Medicea 290, c. 29v).

B. 1620: A painting on canvas with a black frame with gold threads of a Bacchus [“Un quadro in tela con adornamento nero filetto d’oro alto braccia 2 e largo braccia $1\frac{3}{4}$ entrovi dipinto un bacco”] (ASF, Guardaroba Medicea 1463, c. 25c).

C. 1638: A painting on canvas 2 braccia tall, $1\frac{7}{8}$ braccia wide with a gold frame in which is a portrait of Bacchus with a cup of wine in his hands crowned with grape leaves and leaves [“un quadro in tela alto braccia 2 largo braccia $1\frac{7}{8}$ con cornice d’oro entrovi ritratto un Bacco con una tazza di vino in mano coronato di grappoli d’uva e pampani”] (in Granducal apartments, first floor, ASF, Guardaroba Medicea 532ter, c. 15v).

If the Bacchus were sent directly to the villa Artimino, (built on a plan by Bernardo Buontalenti between 1596 and 1601), its receipt may not have been officially registered by the Guardaroba of the grand duke. The *Bacchus* remains in inventories of the Villa Artimino through 1735 (ASF Guardaroba Medicea 1433, c.43v) and 1738 (ASF, Guardaroba Medicea appendice 13, c. 112).

Exhibitions:

Florence 1922 (*hors catalogue*); Paris 1935; Naples 1938; Milan 1951, no. 1; Rome 1956, no. 34; Florence 1980; New York-Naples 1985, no. 71; Florence 1998, cat. 33; Florence, 2003; Naples 2003.

Bibliography:

Marangoni 1917 [1953 ed, pp. 139–43] (old copy after lost original, not *self-portrait as Bacchus* referred to by Baglione; Longhi considers it original); Voss 1924, p. 78 (among earliest works, timid); Marangoni 1922, p. 794 n. 1 (Caravaggio); Borenius 1925, pp. 23–26; Longhi 1927² [*Opere complete*, 1967, II, p. 304 (earlier than Borghese *Bacchus*, probably the *Bacco* cited by Baglione, “slightly dry manner” [“maniera un poco secco”]); Longhi 1927³ [*Opere complete*, 1967, II, p. 165, “rediscovered by me in 1915 in the Uffizi storage vaults” [“da me riscoperto nel 1915 nei depositi degli Uffizi”]]; Benkard 1928, pp. 134–41 (“seventeenth-century Saraceni-esque pastiche”); Pevsner 1927–28, p. 390 (autograph); de Rinaldis 1936 (after Borghese *Bacco*); Schudt 1942, no. 2–4; Longhi 1943, p. 8 (1589); Arslan 1951, p. 448; Baroni 1951 (c. 1589); Berenson 1951, p. 11; Hess 1951, p. 212; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 1; Mahon 1951, pp. 228, 234 (1596–97) n. 110 (“opening the mature phase of the artist’s early style”); Venturi 1951 [ed. 1963], no. 4 [5] (after 1593); Mahon 1952, pp. 8, 19 (1595–96); Mahon 1952², p. 23 (1595–96); Hinks 1953, no. 12 (c. 1596); Mahon 1953, p. 215; Hess 1954, p. 281 (portrait of Lionello Spada); Baumgart 1955, no. 8 (1592–93); Czobor 1955, pp. 206–8 (self-portrait); Friedlaender 1955, no. 4b (this, not Borghese, is the *Bacchus* mentioned by Baglione, self-portrait, careful attention to detail); Chastel 1956, p. 957 (before 1597); Salerno in Rome 1956, n. 34; Wagner 1958, pp. 15–18, 175–76 (c. 1589–91); Wittkower 1958, pp. 22–23; Arslan 1959, pp. 191–94, 198–200; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 148–51; Jullian 1961, pp. 48, 53 (c. 1593–94); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 12 (1593–94); Longhi 1968, pp. 13, 15; Kitson 1969, no. 14 (1595–96); Röttgen 1969, pp. 165, 167 n. 43 (c. 1596); Calvesi 1971, pp. 96–97; Cinnotti 1971, pp. 90–91 (1594–95); Posner 1971, pp. 302–8; Spezzaferro 1971, p. 88; Frommel 1972, pp. 29–31 (1596, sitter not Lionello Spada, but Mario Minniti); Gregori 1972, pp. 44–47; Rossi in *Immagine del Caravaggio* 1973, no. 12; Röttgen 1974, pp. 111, 117, 189–90 (c. 1596); Marini 1974, pp. 110–11, 356–58 (1595); Moir 1976, p. 85 no. 9; Nicolson 1979, p. 34; *Gli Uffizi* 1979, no. P358; Conti in Florence 1980, p.250 (cites 1638 Artimino inventory); Magnuson 1982, p. 83 (when joined Cardinal Del Monte); Moir 1982, p. 84; Cinotti 1983, no. 13 (reference to Baglione is wrong,

not self-portrait, 1596–97); Freedberg 1983, p. 58; Hibbard 1983, no. 22 p. 40 (c. 1595–96); del Bravo 1985, pp. 162–64; Gregori 1985, no. 71 (from time lived with Del Monte); Christiansen 1986, pp. 437–38 (fine condition despite losses); Cottino 1989, pp. 659–76, figs. 781–82; Marini 1989, pp. 397–99, no. 21 (Rome, 1595); Calvesi 1990, pp. 221–24; Posèq 1990², pp. 151–52, pl. 5 (1595²); Poseq 1990³, pp. 113–21 (1594–95); Bauer 1991, pp. 391–98, pl. 5; Bologna 1992, pp. 299–300 (1593, identifies with Baglione quote); Gregori 1994, p. 146, no. 16 (c. 1596–97); Wązbiński 1994, p. 99; Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1596); Gilbert 1995, pp. 124, 207–8, 211, 216, 246; Berra 1996, pp. 117–18; Fumagalli in Florence 1998, p. 88; Langdon 1998, pp. 150–52; Puglisi 1998, no. 13 (c. 1597); Robb 1998, p. 501 (1596); Spike 2001, pp. 70–72, no. 14 (1597–98); Barocchi and Gaeta Bertelà 2002, I, p. 172, n. 639 (for the provenance); Solinas 2002, pp. 27–38, (1596, describes the glass); Giusti, Spinoza, Utili in Naples 2003; Macioce 2003, pp. 64, 113, 216–17, 278, 286, 367; Papi in Florence 2003 cat. no. 2 (c. 1593); Elkins 2004, pp. 48–49; Lapucci 2005, pp. 19–20, fig. 4, 28 fig. 5, 43 fig. 19; Sebregondi 2005, XLII–XLIII; Sgarbi 2005, no. 11 (c. 1595–96); Tresoldi 2006, p. 77 (1596–97); Varriano 2006, pp. 23–24, 56–63, 95–96, 105, 110, 120, 130, 140 n. 31, fig. 3; Langdon in Valletta 2007, pp. 56–57 (p. 215, note 19: “This head was said to have been revealed by cleaning in 1922. For this, and bibliography, see Gregori 1985, 241. Marini 2001, p. 176, publishes a detail which indicates a self-portrait of the young Caravaggio reflected in the caraffe of wine (‘indica l'autoritratto del giovane Caravaggio riflesso nella caraffa di vino’). It is not mentioned by Spike, no. 14, nor in the recent exh. cat. P. Giusti, N. Spinoza, M. Utili, 2003.”); Pichler, W. in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 9–33; von Rosen, V. in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 59–85; Papa 2008, p. 24 (1596–97); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82; “Caravaggio, spunta un autoritratto: È riflesso nella caraffa del «Bacco»” in *Corriere della Sera*, October 30, 2009, announcement for an exhibition in Rome in 2010.

The Uffizi *Bacchus* left no trace in the early sources and has recently been identified with an unattributed painting cited in inventories of the Medici villa at Artimino. Its rediscovery in the deposits of the Uffizi gallery in 1916 by Roberto Longhi was the cause of considerable discussion among experts who were initially disbelieving. The picture is now regarded as a fine and characteristic work during Caravaggio’s residence with Del Monte, prior to 1600, although widely divergent views have been expressed on its year of execution. A date of 1597–98 seems indicated by its similarities to the *Jove, Neptune, and Pluto* (cat. no. 13); the boldly foreshortened wineglass looks ahead to his mature style.

See pp. 70–72.

Condition:

Good, apart from an L-shaped area of loss on Bacchus's chest and along the bottom edge. Cinotti (1983) publishes a photograph of the painting as it was found in 1913. Restorations are recorded in 1922, 1947 and 1980–81. Painted on a support of Flemish linen with a lozenge pattern, similar to that of the *Rest on the Flight to Egypt* (cat. no. 17) (Cinotti 1983, p. 431). Christiansen (1986) noted its careful execution. The paint surface is slightly wrinkled as a result of shrinkage during relining.

Copies:

None recorded.

15. *Fortune-Teller (Buona ventura)*, 1597–98

Oil on canvas, 40 x 51 $\frac{5}{8}$ in. (99 x 131 cm)

Musée du Louvre, Paris, inv. 1122

Provenance:

By 1609, collection of Girolamo Vittrici; by descent to his son Alessandro Vittrici (c. 1595/6–1650); given by Principe Camillo Doria Pamphili to Louis XIV, King of France, in care of Gianlorenzo Bernini in 1665; in 1683 recorded at Versailles by LeBrun; Royal collection inventories of 1695, 1709, 1730, 1760, 1788; entered the collection of the Louvre in July 1797.

Inventories:

1. May 1609: Inventory of Girolamo Vittrici lists, without attribution, “a painting of a gypsy—” [“un quadro della zingara—”] (Corradini 1993, doc. 120 as 1607; republished with additions and a date of May 1609 by Sickel 2001, p. 429).

2. June 7, 1613: Giulio Mancini, Rome, writes to Deifebo Mancini in Siena, “a picture by Michelangelo Caravaggio of a gypsy has been sold for 300 scudi. It is similar to the one I sent you. I estimate that our Saint John is worth at least 150 scudi.” [“E stato venduto un quadro del Michelangel Caravaggio d’una zinghara come quella che vi mandai, 300 scudi. Che stimo che il nostro San Giovanni 150 almeno.”] (Maccherini 1997, doc. 25).

3. The painting may have entered the Pamphili collections either:

A. Following a suggestion by Hibbard (1983), Cappelletti (1996) and De Marchi (2009) have investigated the possibility that this *Fortune-Teller*, the *Magdalen* (cat. no. 16) and the *Rest on the Flight* (cat. no. 17) and share a common provenance from Cardinal Alessandro Vittrici, whose sister and heir, Caterina, sold “a number of Paintings” to Camillo Pamphili in October 1650 (Cavelletti in Milan 1996, p. 38).

B. De Marchi (2008 p. 40–44) suggests a possible identification with the “painting of a Gypsy” [“quadro di una Zingara”] bequeathed by Cardinal Mario Filonardi to Camillo Pamphili (Garms 1972, no. 224, pp. 61–62).

4. 1683: Inventory of the pictures of Louis XIV, King of France, compiled by Charles Le Brun: “A painting by Caravaggio representing a Bohemienne and a young man, in half length, to whom she tells his fortune” [“Un tableau de Carravage représentant un Boemienne et un jeune homme demycorps è qui elle dit le bonne aventure”] (Brejon de Lavergnée 1987, no. 189).

Sources:

1. Gaspare Murtola, *Rime, cioe Gli occhi d’Argo*, 1603:

“For the gypsy by [Caravaggio]/I do not know which is more magical/the woman, who pretends,/or you who paints her./That one is pretty so to steal/With her sweet enchantments/our heart and blood./You paint the appearance/You make her appear alive/and others believe her to be breathing.” [“Per una zingara del medesimo [Caravaggio]./Non so qual sia più maga/O la donna, che fingi,/O tu che la dipingi./Di rapir quella è vaga/Coi dolci incanti suoi/Il core e ‘l sangue a noi./Tu dipinta, che appare/Fai, che viva si veda/Fai, che viva, si veda./Fai, che viva, e spirante altri la creda.”] (Heikamp 1966, pp. 70–76).

2. Mancini 1619–21 [1956, I, pp. 109, 140, 224]: “I am told that he stayed in the house of Cavaliere Giuseppe and Monsignor Fantin Petrignani who gave him the use of a room. During this time he made many pictures and in particular, a gypsy telling a young man’s fortune. . . . one of the few works of this school in which one sees grace and expression is the *Fortune-Teller* by Caravaggio, representing a gypsy girl telling the fortune of a young man, which is in the possession of Signor Alessandro Vittrici, a gentleman of Rome.” A marginal note on the same page adds: “The gypsy demonstrates her roguishness by faking a smile as she removes a ring from the finger of the young man, while he in his simplicity and libidinousness looks at the pretty gypsy as she tells his fortune and lifts his ring. . . . Caravaggio sold the Gypsy for eight *scudi*.” [“Doppo mi vien detto che stesse in casa del Cav.^r Giuseppe e di Mons.^r Fantin Petrignani, che li dava commodità d’una stanza nel qual tempo fece molti quadri, et in particolare una Zingara, che dà la Bonaventura ad un giovanetto.[145r] . . . E di questa schuola . . . non credo forsi che se sia visto cosa con più gratia et affetto che quella zingara che dà la buona ventura a quel giovanetto, mano del Caravaggio, che possiede il signor Alessandro Vittrici, gentilhuomo qui di Roma, [nei margine: che ancorchè sia per questa strada, nondimeno la zingaretta mostra la sua furbaria con un riso finto nel levar l’anello al giovanetto, et questo la sua semplicità et affetto di libidine verso la vaghezza della zingaretta che dà la ventura et le leva l’anello [166r] . . . come si vedde nel Caravaggio che vendè . . . la Zingara per otto scudi”].

3. Scannelli 1657, p. 199: describes a *Fortune-Teller* in the Pamphili villa outside the Porta San Pancrazio, Rome.

4. Chantelou 1665 (ed. 1946, pp. 132–33): Records on September 27, 1665, Gianlorenzo Bernini brought “a gypsy by Caravaggio, half figure, telling the fortune of a young man” as a gift from Prince Camillo Doria Pamphili to King Louis XIV of France; records on September 29, 1665 “the Gypsy by Caravaggio is a poor picture, with neither spirit nor invention” [September 27: “La cingara de Michel-Ange e Caravage, á demi-corps, avec un jeune homme á qui elle dit la bonne aventure”; and September 29 “la Cingara du Caravage, un pauvre tableau, sans esprit ni invention”].

5. Bellori 1672, (ed. 1976 p. 214–15, 215–17): “To prove his words, [Caravaggio] called a gypsy who happened to be passing in the street and, taking her to his lodgings, he painted her in the act of foreseeing the future, as is the custom of those of the Egyptian race. He also had

a youth pose with her, his gloved hand on his sword and the other hand bare, extended to the woman who holds and examines it. With these two half-figures Michele captured reality so well that he indeed confirmed what he had said. . . . These paintings are in the palace of Prince Pamphili.” [“E per dare autorità alle sue parole, chiamò una zingara che passava a caso per istrada, e condottala all'albergo la ritrasse in atto di predire l'avventure, come soglion queste donne di razza egiziana: fecevi un giovine, il quale posa la mano col guanto su la spada, e porge l'altra scoperta a costei, che la tiene, e la riguarda; ed in queste due mezze figure tradusse Michele si puramente il vero che venne a confermare i suoi detti. [pp. 215–16]: Veggonsi questi quadri nel palazzo del Principe Pamphili . . .”]

6. Baldinucci 1681: Records a *Buona ventura* at the home of Prince Pamphili of which Caravaggio painted others in that style.

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 8; Paris 1965; Paris 1977.

Bibliography:

Kallab 1906/7, pp. 281–82; De Ricci *Catalogue* . . . 1913, no. 1122; Marangoni 1922, no. VIII (doubts Louvre picture, but says Capitolina version inferior); Voss 1924, p. 439 (both original, Capitolina earlier); Hautecoeur *Catalogue* . . . 1926, no. 1122; Pevsner 1927–28, p. 309 (both original, Capitolina earlier); Benkard 1928, p. 88–97 (both Saraceni); Schudt 1942, no. 11; Longhi 1943, p. 9 (1590–91); Longhi 1951, no. 8; Mahon 1951, pp. 228, 234 (1597–98); Venturi 1951, no. 15; Longhi 1952, no. V; Mahon 1952, pp. 4–5, 8–10, 19 (1593–94); Hinks 1953, no. 9 (c. 1595); Mahon 1953, p. 215 n. 21 (rejects Capitolina); Baumgart 1955, no. 9 (1592–94); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 152–53, no. 8A (characteristic early period); Wagner 1958, pp. 25–27, 37–46, 180 n. 83–94 (1593–94); Wittkower 1958, p. 32; Arslan 1959, pp. 199–200 (1596–97); Jullian 1961, pp. 33, 49, 53, 68–73 (c. 1595); Salerno 1966, pp. 109–10; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 14 (1594); Longhi 1968, p. 16; Kitson 1969, no. 8 (Louvre is the original of the “Gypsy” which in 1620 belonged to Alessandro Vittrici cited by Mancini; 1595–96); Salerno 1970, pp. 236, 240–41, 248; Cinotti 1971, pp. 94–95, 100–101 (1596–97); Spezzaferro 1971, pp. 84–88; Frommel 1972, p. 31 (1597–98); Gregori 1974, p. 599; Marini 1974, p. 20

(1595); Röttgen 1974, pp. 189, 198, 239; Moir 1976, p. 84 no. 4, 122–23 n. 181 (autograph original of which Capitolina version is a copy with variations); Cuzin in Paris 1977, pp. 3–52, 57–60 (c. 1594–95); Delburgo in Paris 1977, pp. 53–56; Nicolson 1979, p. 34; Moir 1982, p. 68 (c. 1594); Cinotti 1983, no. 42 (1596–97); Hibbard 1983, pp. 25 (c. 1594–95); Gregori 1985, p. 219 (references to d’Arpino’s studio clearly refer to Capitolina version which is earlier than Louvre; Louvre is late Del Monte period, no earlier than 1597); Caruso 1987, pp. 27–30; Mahon 1988, pp. 23–24; Christiansen 1988, pp. 26–27; Marini 1989, pp. 395–97, no. 20 (Rome, 1595); Barbiellini Amidei 1990, pp. 164, 174 (provenance); Cappelletti and Testa 1990³, pp. 80–84 (provenance); Mahon 1990, p. 5 (later than Capitolina); Bologna 1992, p. 303 (1593–94, earlier than Capitolina); Spike 1992², pp. 275–77; Gregori 1994, p. 146, no. 15 (c. 1596–97); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1596); Gilbert 1995, pp. 112, 256, 282 n. 4 (stylistic analysis not credible; “The biographical information points to the Louvre version as earlier than Del Monte’s. Longhi reasonably called it unlikely that Caravaggio would have agreed to the sale at a distress price if he had a secure lodging, so it must have taken place before he moved into Del Monte’s house, thus no later than 1595.”); Spezzaferro in *La natura morta* 1995, pp. 53–54; Langdon 1998, pp. 84–89; Macioce 1998, p. 337 (c. 1596, 19-year-old Minniti is model); Puglisi 1998, no. 23 (c. 1598–99); Robb 1998, p. 500 (1595); Vodret 1998, pp. 39–40; Marini 2001, no. 23; Sickel 2001, pp. 428–29, fn. 29 (perhaps Girolamo Vittrici obtained the painting directly from Caravaggio around 1595, by descent to his son, Alessandro, who perhaps gave it to Pope Innocent X Pamphili in gratitude for being appointed governor of Rome in 1647); Spike 2001, pp. 72–73, no. 15 (1597–98); Calvesi and Volpi 2002, *passim*; Moffit 2002, pp. 129–56; Benedetti in Capon 2003, pp. 29, 223; Hartje 2004, pp. 189–91, 510; Lapucci 2005, p. 20, fig. 8; Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 25 (c. 1595); Guarino and Maccherini in *Siena e Roma* 2005, p. 410 (Mancini considered it the artist’s most beautiful painting); Sgarbi 2005, no. 10 (“autograph version, slightly later than the painting of the same subject in the Pinacoteca Capitolina”); Loire 2006, pp. 64–70 (1594–98; perhaps given by Alessandro Vittrici to Camillo Pamphili); Tresoldi 2006, p. 75 (1599); Varriano 2006, pp. 62, 105, 117, 131, fig. 53; Debono 2007, p. 13 ill.; De Marchi 2008, pp. 40–44 (youthful masterpiece, not in inventory of Pamphili ancestors, acquired by Camillo Doria Pamphili on market and given to Louis XIV in 1665, now at the Louvre); Papa 2008, p. 19–22 (1595–96).

This is Caravaggio’s definitive treatment of a theme with which he had made a notable success in the Capitolina version (cat. no. 5) of a few years earlier. There is some confusion in

the sources between these two pictures but it seems certain that Cardinal Alessandro Vittrici was the owner of the present picture, a provenance corroborated by a document of 1607–9. The engaging poem (1603) by Gaspare Murtola could have been inspired by either version, but it is tempting to associate it with the Louvre picture, which is of superior quality. This picture must have been readily available for viewing by artists in Rome because it, more than the Capitolina *Fortune-Teller*, was the inspiration for numerous imitations by Bartolomeo Manfredi, Simone Vouet, and other Caravaggisti. The young gentleman being duped by the vivacious gypsy is thought to be a portrait of Mario Minniti, Caravaggio's friend.

See pp. 72–73.

Condition:

Good. The painting was restored and examined in detail by the museum in 1977 when those results and the painting's restoration history were published by Cuzin and Delbourgo. The earliest record of its restoration dates back to 1665 when it was necessary to repair water damage suffered during its transport from Rome to Paris. At this time, probably, a strip of canvas about 4 inches (10 cm) wide was added at top necessitating a repainting of the white feather in the boy's cap. The painting was executed with short precise brush strokes and contains no pentimenti.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

Rome: Giulio Mancini sent a "Gypsy" made by a "scolaro di Michelangelo" to his brother, Deifebo Mancini, Siena, on December 30, 1606. Maccherini (1997, p. 75; *Siena e Roma* 2005, p. 410) assumes it was a copy of this picture.

Documents:

1. December 30, 1606: "I consign on Wednesday morning to the courier the box with a Saint Jerome, a Madonna, a gypsy and a head" (Maccherini 1997, doc. 4).

2. January 6, 1607: “If you find a way to give away that gypsy by the pupil of Michelangelo give it for 10–12 scudi and I understand that Savini wants to have copied a picture of Saint Thomas touching the rib of Christ by the hand of Caravaggio and maybe he would take this one” (Maccherini 1997, doc. 5; Maccherini 1997, docs. 7, 12, 25, also refer to this painting).

C.2

Rome: Giulio Mancini informs his brother, Deifebo, in a letter of December 27, 1614 of his intention to have a copy made of the *Zingara* (gypsy) by Caravaggio. Maccherini (in *Siena e Roma* 2005, p. 410) doubts that the copy was made.

Documents:

December 27, 1614: “I believe I will have an opportunity to have a copy made of the most beautiful thing made by Michelangelo da Caravaggio, which is a gypsy of the invention of that which I sent. If I can have it done by a good painter I will do it and send it to you.”

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 84, nos. 4e–h; Cinotti 1983, p. 485; Loire 2006, pp. 66–67.

16. *Penitent Magdalen*, c. 1598

Oil on canvas, 48³/₈ x 38³/₄ in. (123 x 98.5 cm)

Galleria Doria Pamphili, Rome, inv. 380

Provenance:

Possibly listed in the *Inventario delle Robe di Girolamo Vittrici*, May 1609, without attribution; possibly recorded in the collection of Prince Camillo Pamphili, Palazzo Doria Pamphili al Corso, Rome, 1652; cited by Scannelli together with the *Fortune-Teller* today in the Louvre (cat. no. 15) in the Villa Pamphili del Belrespiro, in 1657; in the Palazzo Doria Pamphili al Corso in Rome by 1713.

Inventories:

I. Many scholars have identified this with a painting of this subject, not identified by artist, in the collection of Olimpia Aldobrandini, Rome, although Testa 2002, p. 135, rules out the connection:

1. 1626: Inventory of Olimpia Aldobrandini, Rome, without indication of author: “n. 197 a large painting of the Magdalen in a gold frame, n. 361” [“Quadro in forma grande con una Madalena con cornice tutta dorata n. 361”] (Della Pergola 1960, p. 435).

II. Following a suggestion by Hibbard (1983), Cappelletti (1996), Sickel (2001), and De Marchi (2009) have investigated the possibility that this *Rest on the Flight*, the *Magdalen* (cat. no. 16) and the Louvre *Fortune-Teller* (cat. no. 15) share a common provenance from Girolamo Vittrici, and by descent to Cardinal Alessandro Vittrici.

1. May 1609: Inventory of the paintings listed in the household of Girolamo Vittrici, without attribution: A Magdalen [“Un della Madalena”] (Sickel 2001, p. 429; Cappelletti 2009).

2. October 1650: Caterina, the Cardinal’s sister and heir, sold “a number of Paintings,” without further identification, to Camillo Pamphili.

III. Doria Pamphili inventories

1. 1652: Inventory of the Guardaroba of Prince Camillo Pamphili, Rome, without attribution and unconfirmed, f. 211: “A painting on canvas with the image of Saint Mary Magdalen with her hands clasped and disheveled hair, with the measurement of a head, with a black gilt frame, no. 115” [“Un quadro in tela con l’effigie di S. Maria Madalena, con le mani giunte scapigliata, misura da testa con sua cornice nera con due fili d’oro mano incerta segnato col N. 115”] (Milan 1996, p. 74).

2. 1706: Inventory of the Pamphili collection, Rome, without indication of author of this subject in a frame that bore the arms of Pietro Aldobrandini (Marini 1989, p. 391, no. 18a).

3. Inventories of the Palazzo Doria Pamphili, Rome, beginning in 1747, 1764 to date (A. De Marchi in Calderola 2009, cat. no. 8, p. 90).

4. 1713: Record of a payment to the restorer Michelini for having “Relined, and cleaned, and filled with plaster many holes in a painting by Caravaggio 4 x 5½ palmi representing a Magdalen” in the Archivio of the Palazzo Doria Pamphili al Corso, Rome [“Foderato, e ripolito, e stuccati molti buchi ad un quadro di mano del Caravaggio di palmi 4 e 5½ rappresentante una Maddalena”] (A. De Marchi in Calderola 2009, cat. no. 8, p. 90).

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–21 (ed. 1956, p. 224): “I am told that he later stayed in the house of Cavaliere Giuseppe and Monsignor Fantin Petrignani who gave him the use of a room during which time he made many pictures, and in particular a gypsy who told the fortune of a youth. The Madonna who went to Egypt, a penitent Magdalen . . .” [“Doppo mi vien detto che stesse in casa del Cav.e Giuseppe e di Mons.r Fantin Petrignani che li dava commodita d’una stanza nel qual tempo fece molti quadri, et in particolare una Zingara, che dà la Bonaventura ad un giovanetto. La Madonna che v`a in Egitto, la Maddelena convertita . . . [ed altri]”].

2. Scannelli 1657, p. 199, 227: “In the Pamphili vineyard outside the Porta San Pancratio, a full sized Magdalen painted from life” [“. . .nella Vigna Pamfili fuori della Porta S. Pancratio . . . una Maddalena figura intera al naturale . . .”].

3. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 215): “He painted a young girl seated on a chair with her hands in her lap in the act of drying her hair; he portrayed her in a room with a small ointment vessel, jewels and gems placed on the floor; thus he would have us to believe that she is the Magdalene. She holds her face a little to one side, and her cheek, neck, and breast are rendered in pure, unadulterated and true tones, which are enhanced by the simplicity of the figural composition, with her arms covered in a blouse, her yellow dress drawn up to her knees, showing the white underskirt of flowered damask. We have described this figure in detail to demonstrate his naturalistic method and the way in which he imitates true colors using few tints.” [“Dipinse una fanciulla a sedere sopra una seggiola con le mani in seno in atto di asciugarsi li capelli, la ritrasse in una camera, ed aggiungendovi in terra un vasello

d'unguenti, con monili e gemme, la finse per Madalena. Posa alquanto da un lato la faccia e s'imprime la guancia, il collo e 'l petto, in una tinta pura, facile, e vera, accompagnata dalla semplicità di tutta la figura, con le braccia in camicia e la veste gialla ritirata alle ginocchia dalla sottana bianca di damasco fiorato. Questa figura abbiamo descritto particolarmente per indicare li suoi modi naturali, e l'imitazione in poche tinte sino alla verità del colore.”]

Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 215–16): “These paintings are in the palace of the Pamphili prince. . . .”
[“Veggonsi questi quadri nel palazzo del principe Pamphilio, . . .”].

4. von Rahmdohr 1787, II, p. 123: Pamphili Palace, as Caravaggio.

5. Tonci 1794, pp. 186–87: Pamphili Palace, as Caravaggio.

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 7; Rome 2000; Amsterdam 2006 cat. no. 13; Forlì 2008; Caldarola 2009, cat. no. 8; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

Burckhardt 1869 (as Saraceni); Kallab 1906/7, p. 278; Venturi 1910, pp. 269, 276 (among earliest works); Voss 1923; Pevsner 1928/29, pp. 279–80; Marangoni 1922, cat. III; Benkard 1928, pp. 142–51 (Saraceni); Longhi 1928–29, p. 294; Schudt 1942, no. 8; Arslan 1951, pp. 444–45, 448 (“eighteenth-century copy and I would say from the second half of the Settecento”); Berenson 1951, pp. 14–15; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 7 (1590); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1596–97); Venturi 1951, no. 3; Longhi 1952, no. VII (executed while Caravaggio living with Mons. Petriagnani); Mahon 1952, pp. 8–9, 19 (1593–94); Hinks 1953, no. 9 (1595); Baumgart 1955, no. 12 (1592–94); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 156–57, no. 12 (not well preserved, early period); Bauch 1956, p. 159; Chastel 1956, p. 957 (before 1597); Wagner 1958, pp. 28–29, 42–46; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 25, 36, 338; Jullian 1961, pp. 32, 50, 64, 68, 71–74; Salerno 1966, pp. 108–9; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 26 (1594–96); Moir 1967; Longhi 1968, pp. 9, 17; Kitson 1969, no. 11 (1595–96); Argan in Florence 1970, pp. 19–28; Calvesi 1971, p. 115; Spezzaferro 1971, (made for Cardinal Del Monte); Frommel 1972, pp. 18–20 (1597–98; made for Cardinal

Del Monte); Spezzaferro 1971, p. 88; Marini 1974, pp. 104–5, 351–53 (c. 1595, commissioned by Donna Olimpia Aldobrandini); Röttgen 1974, p. 173, 189, 198; Moir 1976, pp. 84 no. 6, 123 n. 182 (c. 1596); Salerno 1974, p. 589 (same model as in *Rest on the Flight into Egypt*, cat. no. 17); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Marini 1982, p. 75 (1594–95); Cinotti 1983, no. 53; Hibbard 1983, pp. 50–53 n. 28 (1594–95; painted for Cardinal Alessandro Vittrici); Calvesi 1986, pp. 156–61; Marini 1989, pp. 390–93, no. 18 (Rome c. 1595); Russo in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 159–61; Calvesi 1990, p. (1596–97); Cinotti 1991, p. (1596–97); Bologna 1992, p. 302 (1593–94); Gregori 1994, p. 145, no. 8 (1594–95); Bassani-Bellini 1994, pp. 50–56, 182–84; Gilbert 1995, pp. 124, 127, 153, 260, 274 n. 37 (notes possible influence on Caravaggio of poem about Magdalen by Aurelio [d. 1591]), p. 311 n. 108 (rejects Aldobrandini inventory references); Askew in Macioce 1996, p. 249; Cappelletti 1996, no. 4, p. 39 (possibly acquired by the Pamphili together with the *Rest on the Flight* and the *Fortune-Teller* today at the Louvre); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 20–29 (1597–98); Wind 1997, pp. 7–11 (aristocratic gesture); Langdon 1998, pp. 146–50; Puglisi 1998, no. 6 (c. 1593–94); Robb 1998, p. 502 (1597); Varriano in Mormando 1999, p. 192–203, fig. 22 (c. 1594–95?); Spezzaferro in Rome 2000, pp. 276–77; Brown in London-Rome 2001, pp. 290–92; Spike 2001, pp. 74–75, no. 16 (c. 1598); Sgarbi 2005, no. 6 (datable to the “critical year” of 1595); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 25 (c. 1596); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 13, pp. 75–76 (c. 1598); Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 35; Tresoldi 2006, p. 78 (1595); Varriano 2006, pp. 9, 62, 94–95, 105, 117–18, 125, fig. 2; De Marchi 2008, pp. 40–44, ill p. 39 (masterpiece of Caravaggio’s youth, traces Vittrici provenance, probably acquired by Camillo Doria Pamphili on open market in 1650); Papa 2008, pp. 22, 26–28 (1594–95); De Marchi in Caldarola 2009, pp. 90–91, cat. no. 8 (traces the Vittrici provenance; diagnostic techniques reveal that the pose was initially more frontal and showed the other side of the chair); Pellini in Rome 2009, pp. 122–25 (c. 1595–97; Vittrici provenance).

Roberto Longhi observed that the tilted perspective of the pavement and the elevated viewpoint of the curiously diminutive figure are probably the results of Caravaggio’s use of an optical device, perhaps an inclined mirror. Specifically, it is most unusual that both the bottom of the chair leg and the nearby carafe incline towards the left, away from the vertical. Chair leg and carafe lie on parallel axes that would converge at a point outside the picture plane at the center of the bottom of the painting.

Mancini placed this *Penitent Magdalen* and the *Rest on the Flight* (cat. no. 17) among early works that he had heard were painted for sale by Caravaggio while working independently in the house of Monsignor Petrucci, which would have been around 1594. Although this date seems precocious for these accomplished pictures, it is significant that Mancini considered them similar in style. The two pictures were already together in the Pamphili collection when first cited in a 1652 inventory. Their earlier provenance remains to be clarified. It was long assumed that both paintings originally belonged to Donna Olimpia Aldobrandini, whose collection passed to the Pamphili when her ultimate heir, also named Olimpia, married Prince Camillo Pamphili in 1647. Caravaggio could have been introduced to Donna Olimpia Aldobrandini, the sister of Cardinal Pietro Aldobrandini, by Cardinal Del Monte.

See pp. 74–75.

Condition:

Good. Radiography executed at the Istituto Centrale del Restauro in Rome in 1953 revealed that jewels on the floor were added later. Mahon (1951 and 1952) noted an interesting pentimento between the carafe and the dress, where the pavement was extended to cover the bottom edge of the skirt, which had originally touched the carafe. According to the most recent conservation report published in Rome 2009 (pp. 122–25), the condition is “fair, although some loss is visible on the surface; the black lace around the Magdalen’s neckline is probably not authentic.”

Copies:

C. I

Milan, Boscarelli collection

Oil on canvas, 53½ x 47⅝ in. (136 x 121 cm)

Bibliography:

Bossaglia 1961, pp. 195–202; Kitson 1969, p. 87 (good version); Moir 1976, p. 84 no. 6a.

I 7. *Rest on the Flight into Egypt*, c. 1598

Oil on canvas, 53 x 65½ in. (135 x 166.5 cm)

Galleria Doria Pamphili, Rome, inv. 384

Provenance:

First recorded in the collection of Prince Camillo Pamphili, Palazzo Doria Pamphili al Corso, Rome, 1652.

Inventories:

I. Testa 2002, p. 135, identifies this with a painting in three inventories of Olimpia Aldobrandini, Rome.

1. 1606: Inventory of Olimpia Aldobrandini, Rome, a painting, without indication of author, of “Joseph on the flight” [“Un quadro di Giuseppe che fugge”] (Macioce 2003, inventari 3, p. 341).

2. 1611: Inventory of Olimpia Aldobrandini, Rome, without indication of author, “A large painting of the Madonna’s Flight into Egypt in a frame with touches of gold and stars on the corners” [“Quadro grande uno quando la Mad[onn]a fugge in Egitto con cornici tocche d’oro e stelle alle cantonate”] (Della Pergola 1960, p. 427; Testa 2002, p. 135).

3. August 1622: Inventory of Olimpia Aldobrandini, a large painting of a Madonna with the child in her arms, and Saint Joseph without frame copy of Caravaggio [“quadro in forma grande in tela di una madona con il bambino in braccio, e san Giuseppe senza cornice, copia del Caravaggio”] (Testa 2002, p. 135, says attributions are often mistaken).

II. 1652: Inventory of the guardaroba of Principe Camillo Pamphili, f. 207: “A painting on canvas with the flight of the Madonna and Saint Joseph in Egypt with a child in arms, with an Angel from the back, who sings and plays the violin, figures life-size by Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio with a beautiful landscape, 6 palmi high by 7 long, in a gold frame decorated

with the pater nostri motif, number 63” [“Un quadro in tela con fuga della Madonna, e San Giuseppe in Egitto con puttino in braccio, con un Angelo in schina, che canta e suona il violino figure dal naturale mano di Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio con paese belliss[i]mo di misura palmi sei alto, e largo sette, e mezzo, con suo cornicione dorato tutto a’ mordente con pater nostri nel battente seg[na]to del n[umer]o 63.”] (Milan 1996 p. 73).

III. Following a suggestion by Hibbard (1983), Cappelletti (1996), Sickel (2001), and De Marchi (2009) have investigated the possibility that this *Rest on the Flight*, the *Magdalen* (cat. no. 16), and the Louvre *Fortune-Teller* (cat. no. 15) share a common provenance from Cardinal Alessandro Vittrici, whose sister and heir, Caterina, sold “a number of Paintings” to Camillo Pamphili in October 1650.

1. May 1609: Inventory of the paintings listed in the household of Girolamo Vittrici, without attribution: A Madonna when she went to Egypt [“Una Madonna quando andò in Egitto”] (Sickel 2001, p. 429).

2. Girolamo Vittrici’s sister and heir, Caterina, sold “a number of paintings” to Camillo Pamphili in October 1650.

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–21 (ed. 1956, p. 224): “I am told that he later stayed in the house of Cavaliere Giuseppe and Monsignor Fantin Petrignani who gave him the use of a room during which time he made many pictures, and in particular a gypsy who told the fortune of a youth. The Madonna who went to Egypt, a penitent Magdalen . . .” [“Doppo, mi vien detto che stesse in casa del Cav^{te} Giuseppe, e di Mons^r Fantin Petrignani, che li dava commodità d’una stanza nel qual tempo fece molti quadri, et in particolare una Zingara, che dà la Bonaventura ad un giovanetto. La Madonna che va in Egitto . . .”].

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, pp. 215–16): “On a large canvas he painted the *Rest on the Flight into Egypt*: a standing angel plays a violin, while a seated Saint Joseph holds the music book for him; the angel is very beautiful; his head is turned sweetly in profile, displaying his winged shoulders and his nude body except for that part covered by a cloth. On the other side sits

the Madonna and, bowing her head, she seems to sleep with the baby at her breast. These paintings are in the palace of the Prince Pamphili.” [“Dipinse in un maggior quadro la Madonna che si riposa dalla fuga in Egitto: evvi un angelo in piedi, che suona il violino, San Giuseppe sedente gli tiene avanti il libro delle note, e l’angelo è bellissimo; poiché volgendo la testa dolcemente in profilo, va discoprendo le spalle alate, e ’l resto dell’ignudo interrotto da un pannolino. Dall’altro lato siede la Madonna, e piegando il capo, sembra dormire col bambino in seno. Veggonsi questi quadri nel palazzo del principe Pamphiljo”].

3. von Ramdohr 1787, II, p. 135.

4. Tonci 1794, p. 66: as Caravaggio.

Exhibitions:

London 1930, no. 467; Milan 1951, no. 6; Naples 1963; Paris 1965; Milan 1996.

Bibliography:

Burckhardt 1869, p. 1050 (Saraceni); Meyer 1872, pp. 620 (as Caravaggio); Kallab 1906/7, pp. 277–78; Venturi 1910, p. 269, 276 (among earliest works); Voss 1924, pp. 73, pl. 3; Benkard 1928, pp. 152–62 (Saraceni); Pevsner 1928/29, p. 125; Longhi 1928/29, pp. 274, 283, 293; Schudt 1942, no. 10; Berenson 1951, pp. 15–16, 46, 54; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 6 (c. 1590); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1596–97); Venturi 1951, no. 2; Longhi 1952, no. V; Mahon 1952, pp. 7–8, 19 (1595–96); Hinks 1953, no. 10 (1595–96); Baumgart 1955, no. 11 (1592–94); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 150–52, no. 7 (one of very few landscapes by Caravaggio, similar to Tintoretto, compares angel to Peterzano, Giorgionesque, very early work); Chastel 1956, p. 957 (before 1597); Wagner 1958, pp. 29, 36, 140–42 (1594–95); Arslan 1959, pp. 191, 194, 200–202 (1596–97); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 23, 36, 140–42; Jullian 1961, pp. 32, 34, 50, 53, 59; Waterhouse 1962, pp. 25–26; Scavizzi in Naples 1963, no. I; Röttgen 1964, pp. 216, 222 (recalls drawing by Cavaliere d’Arpino in British Museum); Röttgen 1965, p. 58; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 22 (1594–96); Longhi 1968, pp. 9, 17; Kitson 1969, no. 10 (1595–96); Calvesi 1971, pp. 132, 135–36, 140; Cinotti 1971, pp. 63, 92, 100–102, 111 (1596–97); Posner 1971, pp. 302, 323 n. 61; Spezzaferro 1971, p. 86; Frommel 1972, pp. 37–39 (1596); Marini 1974, pp. 106–7, 353–54 (1595); Salerno

1974, 589 (same model as the Doria *Magdalen*); Moir 1976, p. 84 no. 5; Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Marini 1982, p. 75 (1594–95); Moir 1982 (1596–97); Cinotti 1983, no. 54 (1597); Hibbard 1983, pp. 53–54, 285–86; Colin Slim 1983; Camiz Trinchieri in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 214–16; Cinnotti in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 81 (cites a 1622 Pietro Aldobrandini inventory, of a copy); Marini 1989, pp. 393–95, no. 19 (Rome 1595); Barolsky 1990, pp. 20–21 (dream of Joseph in Matt. 2:19–10); Calvesi 1990, pp. 201–7; Bologna 1992, pp. 301–2 (1593–94, cites as listed in a 1647 inventory of paintings brought by Olimpia Aldobrandini on the occasion of her marriage to Camillo Pamphili); Gregori 1994, pp. 46–49, 146, no. 12 (c. 1595–96); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1596); Gilbert 1995, pp. 124, 153, 249, 256–57, 310–11 n. 107 (1622 Aldobrandini inventory cited by Cinotti 1989, does not refer to this painting); Cappelletti 1996, no. 4, pp. 38–39 (the Pamphili possibly acquired this painting together with the *Magdalen* and the *Fortune-Teller* today at the Louvre); Christiansen in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 18–23 (composition related to Marcantonio Raimondi, *Judgment of Paris*); Heimbürger 1998, p. 36 (Dürer influence); Langdon 1998, pp. 123–26, 146, 271, 295; Puglisi 1998, no. 10 (c. 1595); Robb 1998, p. 502 (1597); Varriano in Mormando 1999, p. 203; Spike 2001, pp. 76–77, no. 17 (c. 1598); Testa 2002, pp. 129–54; Testa 2002, p. 137 (1600–1601); Sickel 2003, pp. 54–64, 79 n. 17 (Vittrici provenance, not Aldobrandini); Sgarbi 2005, no. 5 (The work was executed by Caravaggio during his first years in Rome, when he was living with Mons. Fantin Petri gnani, c. 1595); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 25 (c. 1596); Tresoldi 2006, p. 76 (1595); Debono 2007, p. 12 ill.; Ziane in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 174–76 (Aldobrandini provenance not certain); De Marchi 2008, pp. 40–44, ill p. 37 (masterpiece of Caravaggio’s youth, not in inventory of Pamphili ancestors, probably acquired by Camillo Doria Pamphili on Roman market), p. 58 fn 73; Papa 2008, pp. 48, 52 (1595–96); De Marchi in Caldarola 2009, pp. 90–91, cat. no. 8 (traces the Vittrici provenance); Pellini in Rome 2009, pp. 122–25 (c. 1595–97, Vittrici provenance).

This masterpiece of the artist’s “blond manner” of the 1590s was evidently hidden from public view during the first two decades of the seicento otherwise its lyricism would surely have left an impression on Caravaggio’s followers. The composition is deliberately divided in two by the graceful figure of an angel who separates the mortal world of Saint Joseph, strewn with stones, left, and the Edenic realm of the Madonna and Child. The unprecedented inclusion of an angel playing music in this *Rest on the Flight* has been elucidated by Calvesi and by the scholars

Trinchieri Camiz and Colin Slim, who identified the music the angel plays. Above Joseph's fingers a large gothic majuscule Q begins the superius part of a four-voice motet by Noel Bauldeweyne (c. 1480–1530), "Quam pulchra es et quam decora"; lower on the same page is its *secunda pars*, "Veni delecte mi" (Colin Slim 1985, p. 245; cf. Trinchieri Camiz in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 214). Bauldeweyne's motet was first printed in 1519 in Fossombrone near Urbino. Both texts are taken from the Song of Solomon (7:6 and 11), whose sensuous verses have always appealed to composers. Christian exegetes translated this Old Testament dialogue between lovers into the mystical union of Christ and the Church, personified by Mary. Joseph represents humanity to whom the angel reveals some strains of the supreme harmony of the heavenly abode of Christ and the Virgin. The Bible verses are clearly the source for this extraordinarily natural depiction of a mother and child asleep together. "I sleep, but my heart is vigilant" (5:2), to which the Son responds "Put me like a seal on your heart" (8:6).

Like the *Magdalen* (cat. no. 15), the *Rest on the Flight* was known to Mancini only by name. By 1650, when both pictures had been in the Palazzo Pamphili for some time, they were among the artist's most familiar images and were lengthily described by Bellori. Until recently, scholars have tended to assume that both paintings were painted for Olimpia Aldobrandini, the sister of Cardinal Pietro Aldobrandini. Her collection of paintings passed by descent to her son and, at his premature death, to his niece, also named Olimpia, who married Camillo Pamphili in 1647. This theory is supported by a reference in the 1622 inventory of paintings in the Aldobrandini Villa Frascati to a copy of a picture of this subject by Caravaggio.

See pp. 76–77.

Condition:

Painted on a support of Flemish linen with a lozenge pattern, similar to that of the *Bacchus*, Uffizi (Bologna 1992, p. 300).

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to an unidentified version or copy:

C. I

Villa Aldobrandini, Frascati (Rome): 1622 inventory of the collection of the villa: “A large painting on canvas of a Madonna embracing the child and a Saint Joseph without frame, copy of Caravaggio” (Cinotti in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 81).

18. *Portrait of Fillide*, c. 1598

Oil on canvas, 26 x 20¾ in. (66 x 53 cm)

Kaiser Friedrich Museum, Berlin (formerly; destroyed 1945) inv. 356.

Provenance:

Fillide Melandroni, Rome, by whom bequeathed to Giulio Strozzi (1583–1660); Vincenzo Giustiniani, Rome by 1638; Paris, 1812 Giustiniani Sale (Landon 1812, p. 135, pl. 45); Kaiser Friedrich Museum, 1815; destroyed by fire in Berlin, 1945.

Inventories:

1. February 9, 1638: Inventory of paintings in the collection of Vincenzo Giustiniani, “In the Gallery of Old paintings 12. another painting with a portrait of a courtesan called Phyllis on canvas with a black frame by Michelangelo da Caravaggio.” [“Nella Stanza Grande de Quadri Antichi . . . 12. Un altro quadro con un ritratto di una Cortigiana chiamata Fillide in tela da testa con sua cornice negra di mano di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”] (Salerno 1960, p. 136 n. 12; Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, 1638, part II, no. 11, p. 399).

2. 1793: Inventory part I, no. 318: “Another of 2½ by 3 palmi high representing a portrait of a woman in a shirt with sleeves and a flower at her breast, by Michelangelo di Caravaggio, with a frame as above” [“Un altro di palmi 2½ · 3 per alto rappresentante un Ritratto d’una donna di Maniche di Camicia con un Fiore in Petto, di Michelangelo di Caravaggio, con Cornice come sopra”].

Document:

1. October 8, 1614: Testament of Fillide Melandroni “a painting of herself portrayed by the hand of Michaelis Angeli de Caravaggio which belongs and pertains to the Illustrious Giulio Strozzi and which is to be restored to same” (Corradini 1993, no. 149).

Source:

1. Silos 1673 (ed. 1979, I, p. 92; II, pp. 91, 344): Anonymous madrigal of XVII Century (Biblioteca Universitaria di Bologna, Epgramma CLVI): “By what sun above the portrait of Fillide, done by Michel Angelo Caravaggio, an angel he is able to portray, beautiful Fillide, your beautiful face, you are an angel of Paradise. . . .” [“D’incerto sopra il ritratto di una Fillide, fatto da Michel Angelo Caravaggio:

Sol un Angel potea
ritrar, Fillide bella, il tuo bel viso,
poi ch’un Angel sei tu di Paradiso. . . .”]
(Fulco 1980, p. 80).

Bibliography:

Verzeichniss der ehemals zu der Giustinianischen jetzt zu den Königlichen Sammlungen gehörigen Gemälde 1826, no. 96; Rouchès 1920, p. 62; Marangoni 1922, p. 24; Voss 1923, p. 81 (c. 1590, identifies with portrait of Caterina Campani cited in Onofrio Longhi will); Voss 1924, p. 83 (contemporaneous with *Lute Player*, Hermitage, cat. no. 10.1); Weisbach 1924, pl. xi; Schudt 1942, p. 46, no. 16; Longhi 1951, p. 37 (1590–95); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1596–97); Venturi 1951, cat. 7; Baumgart 1952, p. 105; Longhi 1952; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1596–97); Hinks 1953, pp. 54–56; Baumgart 1955, no. 20; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 218–19, no. 44 (1590s, not Fillide but instead connects to reference [see Lost Works] to portrait of Caterina Campani); Wagner 1958, pp. 27–28, 228–29; Salerno 1960, p. 136; Jullian 1961, pp. 52, 54, 61 (1597); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 20 (no date); Kitson 1969, no. 17 (only known portrait by Caravaggio universally accepted, entered Giustiniani collection about 1600, Fillide (“phyllis”) is nom de guerre of a known courtesan); Longhi 1968, pp. 14, 157; Cinotti 1971, pp. 97, 102; Frommel 1972, pp. 19, 27, 51; Spear 1971, p. 7; Marini 1974, pp. 115, 362 n. 20 (1596); Röttgen 1974, p. 173; Salerno 1974, p. 587 (1593–96,

same model as Detroit *Magdalen*, see cat. no. 21); Moir 1976, p. 86 no. 10; Nicolson 1979, p. 34; Fulco 1980, p. 80; Marini 1982, p. 82 (1596); Moir 1982, p. 19 (c. 1598); Cinotti 1983, no. 2; Hibbard 1983, pp. 47, 284–85 (c. 1597); Marini 1989, pp. 402–3, no. 23 (1596); Bologna 1992, pp. 308–9 (1596–97); Corradini-Marini 1993, p. 174, no. 26; Gregori 1994, p. 147, no. 18 (c. 1596–97); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1598); Gilbert 1995, pp. 105, 127; Gregory 1998, p. 3; Langdon 1998, pp. 145–47; Puglisi 1998, no. 25 (c. 1598–99); Robb 1998, p. 502 (1597); Spike 2001, pp. 85–86, no. 18 (c. 1598); Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, p. 399); Sgarbi 2005, no. 20 (before *Judith and Holofernes*); Varriano 2006, pp. 88–90, 118, fig. 46; Debono 2007, p. 16 ill.; Clark 2007, p. 56; Sickel in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 111.

The young woman represented in this portrait is identified in the 1638 Giustiniani inventory as Fillide, a celebrated Roman courtesan. Friedlaender doubted this identification, noting that the orange blossoms held to her breast are an attribute of a bride.

As this is one of the few known examples of Caravaggio's extensive activity as a portraitist, the loss of this painting during World War II is especially regrettable. On the basis of this portrait, many scholars have identified Fillide as the model painted by Caravaggio in several pictures among them the *Judith Beheading Holofernes* (cat. no. 19).

See pp. 85–86.

Copies:

None recorded.

19. *Judith Beheading Holofernes*, c. 1598

Oil on canvas, 57 x 76³/₄ in. (145 x 195 cm)

Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica, Palazzo Barberini, Rome inv. 2533

The inscription on the back of the frame (“D’Orazio” and “36”) cited by Matini (1974) is no longer visible.

Provenance:

The painting is believed to have been painted for Ottavio Costa, a banker from Albenga with offices in Rome, and is listed in his posthumous inventory of 1639; its subsequent descent in the family has been traced by Costa Restagno 2004 in inventories of 1732, 1792, and 1834, when it was donated to the Congregazione degli Operai della Divina Pietà; from whom acquired by Marchese Antonio de Cinque on January 14, 1854; by descent to Marchese Ferdinando del Cinque Quintili (d. 1873), by descent to his daughter, Matilde del Cinque Quintili, wife of Giannuzzi Savelli, and his granddaughter, Paolina Gianuzzi Savelli in Coppi, mother of Vincenzo Coppi; Vincenzo Coppi, Rome; from whom acquired in 1971 (Vodret 1999, no. 1; Costa Restagno 2004).

Inventories:

Spezzaferro 1974 and Costa Restagno 2004 identify this picture with a *Judith* cited in the collection of Ottavio Costa, Rome.

1. February 7, 1632: Testament of Ottavio Costa, “all of the paintings by Caravaggio in particular the Judith” [“tutti li quadri del Caravaggio particolarmente la Giuditta . . .”] (Spezzaferro 1974², pp. 582–86).

2. January 18–23, 1639: Inventory of the objects in the palace of Ottavio Costa, Rome, at his death: “A large painting with the image of Judith made by Michelangelo Caravaggio with its frame” [Inventario degli arredi del palazzo di Ottavio Costa, Rome, January 18–23, 1639: “un quadro grande con l’immagine del Judit fatto da Michelangelo Caravaggio con la sua cornice”] (Spezzaferro 1974², p.585; Costa Restagno 2004, no. 72, p. 100).

3. February 7, 1688: Inventory of the Goods of Maria Cattaneo Costa, Rome, at her death: “33. A painting as above with Judith and the head of Holofernes similar frame” [“33. Un quadro come sopra con Giuditta, e la testa di Oloferne cornice simile”].

4. May 30, 1732, Rome: Posthumous inventory of Mons. Guido Del Pelagio, who acquired the painting by descent, “26. Another painting 7 by 5 with a gilt frame in an antique manner, representing Judith, original by Caravaggi 132, scudi 300” [“26. Altro quadro da 7, e 5 con

cornice dorata modello antico rappresentante la Giuditta originale del Caravaggi 132 sc. 300”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 26, p. 107).

5. March 26, 1792, Rome: Inventory of the legacy of Mons. Carlo Origo, who acquired the painting by descent, “74. Another measuring 6 palmi by 7 long, representing Judith who cuts the head of Holofernes with a smooth gold frame, antique sc. 400” [“74. altro detto, in misura di palmi 6, e sette per traverso, rappresentante Giuditta che taglia la testa ad Eloferne con cornice liscia dorata, all’antica sc. 400”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 9, p. 112).

6. January 15–17, 1834, Rome: Posthumous inventory of Marchese Giuseppe Origo, who acquired the painting by descent, “27. a large painting on canvas showing Judith who cuts off the head of Holofernes, said to be by Michel’Angelo da Caravagio, scudi 50” [“27. Un quadro grande per traverso dipinto di tela, rappresentante Giuditta, che rescinde il capo di Oloferne, di Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio, come credesi, scudi 50, 50”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 27, p. 114).

7. Undated valuation (“stima a prezzi”) compiled by painters, Tommaso Minardi and Giovanni Silvagni, between 1834 and 1846, compiled after the donation by the Marchese Giuseppe Origo to the Congregazione degli Operai della Divina Pietà, commissioned by Sig. Poncini: “no. 1, painting identified with n. 36, representing Judith who cuts off the head of Holofernes, replica original by Caravaggio” [“No. 1, Quadro segnato n. 36, rappresentante Giuditta che taglia la testa ad Oloferne replica originale del Caravaggio sc. 300”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 1, p. 121).

8. March 26, 1846: Catalogue paintings and coppers by various authors, not guaranteed, of objects received from marchese Giuseppe Origo, offered for sale by the Congregazione degli Operai della Divina Pietà, “Judith who cuts off the head of Holofernes, replica original by Caravaggio” [“Catalogo di quadri e Rami antichi di varj autori, che però non si garantiscono, . . . Giuditta che taglia la testa ad Oloferne replica originale del Caravaggio sc. 200”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 19, p. 124).

9. January 14, 1854, among paintings acquired by Marchese Cavaliere Antonio De Cinque (Costa Restagno 2004, docs. 13, 14, pp. 125, 126).

10. 1857 Catalogue of paintings for sale by the Galleria Sacro Monte di Pietà, Rome, painting remains unsold. (Costa Rastagno 2004, p. 68, in catalogue, but appears to have been held out of the sale; Terzaghi 2007, pp. 144–47).

Sources:

1. Baglione 1642, p. 138, “He painted a Judith cutting off the head of Holofernes for the Signori Costi” [“Colori una Giuditta, che taglia la testa ad Oloferne per li Signori Costi . . .”].

2. Malvasia 1678 (1841 ed. I, p. 344): “When (Annibale Carracci) was pressed to speak his opinion on a Judith by Caravaggio, he replied I don’t know what to say except that it is too natural.”

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, *hors du catalogue*; Rome 1972; New York-Naples 1985, no. 74; Florence 1991, no. 8; Rome 1999, no. 1; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 102–5; Bergamo 2000, no. 28; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 109; Tokyo-Okazaki 2001–2; Genoa 2004, no. 112; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.2; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 10; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

Kallab 1906/7 (lost work); Longhi 1951, pp. 10–18 (1592–94); Mahon 1951², p. 286; Longhi 1952, no. XII; Mahon 1952, pp. 7–10, 19 (1597–98); Hinks 1953, no. 26 (1599); Baumgart 1955, no. 17 (1594–95); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 158–59, no. 15 (c. 1595, reference of Baglione to early work not incompatible with Pourbus letter describing picture of same subject on art market in Naples in 1607; number of disturbing weaknesses; surfaces hard, and sweep of Judith’s drapery awkward and illogical, lack of force in Judith’s action); Wagner 1958, p. 228 (follower); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 318–20; Jullian 1961, pp. 51, 73, 227 (c. 1597); de Logu 1962, p. 157 (with reservations); Röttgen 1965, p. 64; Moir 1967, I, pp. 1–2, 3–5, II, p. 56; (1597–98); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 28 (as in Rome, Collection Coppi, 1595–96, with reservations because of the violence of the scene); Kitson 1969, no. 26 (as in Rome, Collection Coppi, original, 1595–96); Longhi 1968, p. 20; Bodart 1970, pp. 14–15;

Calvesi 1971, p. 111; Cinotti 1971, pp. 65, 80–81, 97–98, 103, 185 n. 222–29 (1599–1600); Frommel 1972, pp. 19, 26–27, 51 (1598–99); Moir 1972, pp. 124, 128; Safarik 1972, no. 5 (1599–1600); Della Pergola 1973, p. 52 (rejects); Marini 1974, pp. 142–45, 377–79, no. 32 (1599); Röttgen 1974, pp. 198–200 (1599); Spezzaferro 1974, p. 585 (identifies Costa inventory with Coppi picture, 1599); Salerno 1974, p. 587 (1598–99); Moir 1976, p. 86 no. 13, 124 n. 186; Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Marini 1982, p. 77 (1599, from the Costa collection); Moir 1982, pp. 124, 128 (cites print and its inscription, written in pencil, “Michel da Caravaggio dipinse. Conca disegnò” in the *Calcografia Nazionale di Roma*); Cinotti 1983, no. 55 (1598 or early 1599); Hibbard 1983, pp. 65–69 (1598–99); Gregori 1985, no. 74 (just before Contarelli chapel, first painting of a dramatic subject); Christiansen 1986, pp. 427–29 (incisions indicate a “tableau vivant”); Mochi Onori 1986, p. 33; Schneider in Calvesi 1987, pp. 118, 126 (technical analysis); Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 37; Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove Riflessioni* 1989, p. 50 (same model as in Thyssen Magdalen [sic] to be identified as Girolama Giustiniani); Marini 1989, pp. 418–20, no. 33 (Rome 1599); Mochi Onori 1989, p. 145; Calvesi 1990, p. 83; Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 8; Bologna 1992, p. 308 (1596); Lapucci 1992, p. 192 (technical analysis); Spike 1992² pp. 275–77 (remarkable legibility in x-ray associated with Caravaggio); Gregori 1994, p. 86, 148, no. 29 (c. 1599); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1599); Gilbert 1995, pp. 107–9, 127, 255–57, 260; Spike in Macioce 1996, p. 215; Ward in *Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96*, p. 3 (1598–99); Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, p. 192ss; Langdon 1998, pp. 166–68; Mochi Onori–Vodret 1998, no. 60, p. 88; Puglisi 1998, no. 27 (c. 1599); Robb 1998, p. 504 (1599); Benedetti in Mormando 1999, pp. 208–33, fig. 224–25 (1598–99); Giantomassi–Zari in *Madrid-Bilbao 1999*, pp. 78–82; Vodret in *Rome 1999*, no. 1 (1597–1600); Varriano 1999, pp. 323–24; Vodret in *Madrid-Bilbao 1999*, pp. 102–5; Vannugli 2000, pp. 55–83; Vodret in *Bergamo 2000*, pp. 205–6; Brown in *London-Rome 2001*, cat. no. 109 (c. 1599); Spike 2001, pp. 81–85, no. 19 (c. 1598); Berra in *Milan 2004*, pp. 55–83; Caretta–Sgarbi in *Milan 2005*, pp. 148–49, cat. no. I.2; Sgarbi 2005, no. 21 (1598–99); Sgarbi in *Milan 2005*, p. 26 (c. 1597–98); Bull in *Amsterdam 2006*, cat. no. 10, pp. 56–61 (c. 1599–1600); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 25; Tresoldi 2006, p. 82 (1599); Varriano 2006, pp. 14, 40, 56, 80–81, 90, 94, 109, 117, fig. 8.; Terzaghi 2007, pp. 144–47; Mochi Onori–Vodret 2008, pp. 283–84; Papa 2008, p. 22, 34–35 (1599); Giantomassi 2009, pp. 22–23; Grundy in *Painted Optics Symposium 2009*, pp. 21–35; Spike in *Painted Optics Symposium 2009*, pp. 15–20; Pellini in *Rome 2009*, pp. 126–29 (c. 1598).

Caravaggio's reputation for spectacularly violent images is due in great part to this *Judith Beheading Holofernes* which was rediscovered only in 1951 by Pico Cellini. The picture is a manifesto for Caravaggio's uncompromising realism.

The biblical Judith's story is rich with overtones of vendetta, feminine heroism, the victory of virtue over vice (specifically pride) and, in Donatello's famous precedent, justice suppressing tyranny. Yet none of these grandiloquencies seem immediately applicable. Caravaggio leaves nothing to belie the impression that this is a cold-blooded depiction of a murder in a boudoir, if not a bordello. See pp. 81–85.

Condition:

The painting is in very good condition. As of its exhibition in 1999, it still had its original stretcher and frame. The painting was restored in 1950 by Pico Cellini who found it with the Coppi family. In the course of examinations in 1985 and 1991, numerous incisions in the wet paint were observed as testimony to Caravaggio's practice of fixing on the canvas the position and foreshortenings of his models. Other technical examinations have revealed numerous pentimenti of which the most important is the head of Holofernes, originally painted in a higher position. (Christiansen 1986; Vodret in Rome 1999). In late 1999 the painting was cleaned by Carlo Giantomassi and Donatella Zari who discovered the inscription "C.O.C." on the reverse of the original canvas. According to Costa Restagno 2004, p. 52, this could possibly be read as "Comes Ottavio Costa." Additional incisions were noted but no *abozzi*.

Copies:

None recorded.

20. *Saint Catherine of Alexandria*, c. 1599

Oil on canvas, 68½ x 52⅔ in. (173 x 133 cm)

Thyssen-Bornemisza Collection, Villa Hermosa, Madrid

At lower right: F.12 (number placed by *Fidecommesso* 1817, Barberini inventory, Mahon 1990, p.6).

Provenance:

Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, Rome, by 1627; by descent to Uguccione Del Monte and then to Alessandro Del Monte, Rome, 1626; from whom acquired by Cardinal Antonio Barberini, Rome, 1628; Prince Maffeo Barberini, Rome, 1686; Prince Urbano Barberini, Palazzo Barberini, Rome; Collection Thyssen-Bornemisza, 1934 (1934.37).

Inventories:

1. February 21, 1627: Inventory of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “A Saint Catherine with her wheel, work by Michel Agnolo Caravaggio with a gilt frame seven Palmi” [“Una S. Caterina della Ruota opera di Michel Agnolo da Caravaggio con Cornici d’oro rabescate di Palmi sette”] (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol.580r; Frommel 1972, p. 34).

2. May 7, 1628: Listed among items sold to pay debts of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “On May seventh, for a Saint Catherine and a player at cards by Caravaggio” [“A di 7 di maggio . . . Per una S. Caterine, et un gioco di carte del Caravaggio . . .”] (Nota del denaro retratto dalla vendita de Mobili del Giardino di Ripetta doppo otto scuti il Breve posto del Banco di S. Spirito; Kirwin 1972, pp. 54–55).

3. April 1644: Catalogued in the collection of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, “261) A large painting of a kneeling Saint Catherine supported by her wheel by the same hand [Caravaggio]” [“261) Un quadro grande, con una S.ta Caterina inginocchione appoggiata alla ruota di mano del detto [Caravaggio] con cornice nera rabescata d’oro”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 167).

4. August 4, 1671: Posthumous inventory of Cardinal Antonio Barberini of the contents of the Palazzo ai Giubbonari, “109)—400—A Saint Catherine, full figure, painted from nature, by the hand of Michelangiolo da Caravaggio about 8 palmi high, with a gilt walnut

frame no. 1—400—” [“109)—400—Una Santa Caterina figura intera al naturale mano di Michelangiolo da Caravaggio d. p.mi 8 - inc.a Alto, Con Cornice color di Noce profilata e rabescata d’oro no. 1—400—”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 296).

5. 1672: Inventory taken at the division between the two heirs of Cardinal Antonio Barberini’s estate “46) a Saint Catherine, full figure, painted from nature, 8 palmi, with a walnut colored frame, carved and gilt, by Michel’Angolo da Caravaggio 400—” [“46) Una Santa Caterina figura intera al Naturale di p.mi 8 - Con Conice color di noce profilata e rabescata d’oro mano di Michel’Angolo da Caravaggio 400—”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 338; Macioce 2003, p. 363).

6. 1686: Inventory of the estate of Prince Maffeo Barberini, “191) A. a vertical painting of Saint Catherine and her wheel, about 8 palmi high, 6 palmi wide, with a black frame decorated with gold, hand of Caravaggio.” [“191) A. Un quadro alto d’una S. Caterina della Rota alto p.i 8 largo p.i 6, incirca, con cornice nera fiorata d’oro, mano del Caravaggi”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 402; Macioce 2003, p. 368).

Document:

1. May 8, 1628: Recorded in the account book of Antonio Barberini (not yet a cardinal) who paid 550 scudi to Alessandro Del Monte for a large group of paintings and books, that included “a large painting of Saint Catherine by Caravaggio, and one of a player by the same.” [“. . . un quadro grande d’una santa Catherina del Caravaggio, uno d’un giocatore del medesimo . . .”] (Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana Archivio Barberini, Computisteria 223, fol. 22 recto MDXXVIII di 15 giugno; Wolfe 1985, p. 452).

Sources:

1. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, pp. 216–17): “For this prelate [Cardinal Del Monte] Michele painted a *Concert of Youths* (cat. no. 6) in half figures drawn from life; a woman in a blouse playing a lute with the music before her (cat. no. 10.2), and a Saint Catherine on her knees leaning against her wheel. The last two paintings, which are still in the same room, show a more saturated coloring, since Michele was already beginning to strengthen his shadows . . .” [“Dipinse per

questo signore [Cardinal Del Monte] una musica di giovini ritratti dal naturale in mezze figure (cat. no. 6), una donna in camicia che suona il liuto con le note avanti (cat. no. 10.2) e Santa Caterina ginocchione appoggiata alla rota; li due ultimi sono ancora nelle medesime camere, ma riescono d'un colorito più tinto, cominciando già Michele ad igagliardire gli oscuri.”]

2. Vasi 1763 (ed. 1794, p. 450; ed. 1807, p. 285): As in Palazzo Barberini (Mahon 1990, p. 15, n. 82).

Exhibitions:

Florence 1922, pl. XLIV (School of Caravaggio); Milan 1951, no. 20; Essen 1960, no. 31; Rotterdam 1960, no. 31; London 1961, no. 20; Cleveland 1971, no. 16; New York 1981; Paris 1982, no. 6; Moscow-St. Petersburg 1983–84, no. 26; New York-Naples 1985, no. 72; Madrid 1987, no. 37; London 1988, no. 10; Stuttgart 1988–89, no. 10; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 98–101; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 2; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 15.

Bibliography:

Mariotti 1892, p. 127 (publishes Barberini inventory made by Camuccini 1817, listing painting as no. 16); Kallab 1906/7 (lost); Longhi 1916, p. 264–65 (by Orazio Gentileschi); Marangoni 1922² [1953, pp. 155–56] (probably Caravaggio); Voss 1923, pp. 80–81; Voss 1924, pp. 74–75, pl. 1; Longhi 1928/29, pp. 25, 302; Royal Decree of April 16, 1934, ending Barberini entail, no. 11; Schudt 1942, no. 74 (copy); Longhi 1943, p. 36 n. 15 (1592–93); Arslan 1951, p. 446; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 20 (1594–95); Mahon 1951, pp. 228, 234 (1598–99); Mahon 1952, pp. 8–9, 19 (1596–97); Hinks 1953 (c. 1597); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 157–58, no. 14 (c. 1595); Baumgart 1955, no. 18 (1594–95); Wagner 1958, pp. 227–28 (Gentileschi?); Arslan 1959, pp. 201–2 (copy); Jullian 1961, 50–54 (c. 1597); Macrae 1964, p. 416; Röttgen 1965, pp. 64, 68 (1599–1600); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 27 (1595–96); Kitson 1969, no. 25 (1595–96); *Catalogue, The Thyssen-Bornemisza Collection* 1969, no. 55; Pérez Sánchez 1970, no. 33; Cinotti 1971, pp. 97–98 (c. 1599); Spear in Cleveland 1971, no. 16; Frommel 1972, pp. 17, 27, 31 (1598); Kirwin 1972, p. 55; Rossi 1973, no. 17; X. de Salas in *Caravaggio . . .* 1974, pp. 32–33; Marini 1974, pp. 118–19, 364–65 n. 22 (1597); Röttgen 1974, pp. 64–68; Salerno 1974, pp. 587–89 (1593–96,

Catherine is the same model as the *Magdalen* in Detroit [cat. no. 21]); Aronberg Lavin 1975, pp. 167, 296, 715; Moir 1976, p. 86 no. 12; Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Moir 1982, p. 88 (1597–98); Cinotti 1983, no. 7; Hibbard 1983, pp. 63–65, 288–89 n. 34 (1598–99); Gregori 1985, no. 72 (1597–99); Borghero 1986, no. 55, p. 62; Christiansen 1986, pp. 439–40 (extremely good condition); Ekserdjian in London 1988, cat. no. 10; Marini 1989, pp. 407–8, n. 26 (Rome 1597); Gregori in Florence 1991, pp. 14–15; Lapucci in Florence 1991, pp. 32, 34; Bologna 1992, p. 309 (1596–97); Gregori 1994, pp. 43, 148, no. 26 (c. 1598–99); Waźbiński 1994, pp. 607; Gilbert 1995, pp. 125–28, 257, 260; Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1598); Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50; Bona Castelloti 1998, p. 59; Langdon 1998, pp. 145–46, 164–66, 170; Puglisi 1998, no. 26 (c. 1599); Robb 1998, p. 502 (1598); Rossi in Bergamo 2000, pp. 78–79; Danesi Squarzina in Bergamo 2000, p. 95; Spike 2001, pp. 86–88, ill. detail, 123, no. 20 (c. 1599); Contini 2002, pp. 4–13 (1599–1600, relates model to *Portrait of Fillide* and *Conversion of Mary Magdalen*, Detroit); Macioce 2003, p. 367 (identifies this painting with a painting of this subject referenced in the 1672 and 1686 Barberini inventories); Lapucci 2005, pp. 19–20, fig. 6; Milicua in Barcelona 2005, pp. 46–51, cat. no. 2 (c. 1598); Sgarbi 2005, no. 19 (c. 1597–99); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (c. 1597); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 15, pp. 75–76 (c. 1599); Tresoldi 2006, p. 79 (1598); Varriano 2006, pp. 56, 62, 90, 94, 109, 117–18, fig. 47; Debono 2007, p. 17 ill.; Pichler, in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 9–33; Papa 2008, pp. 197–98 (1598–99); Grundy in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 21–35.

As Bellori acutely observed, the *Saint Catherine* marks a transitional phase in Caravaggio's development. The painting shows the deeper shadows that would characterize his style after 1600. Yet the model is portrayed with a literalness that still savors of his residence in the Del Monte palace, 1595–1600. The *Saint Catherine* is among the rare pictures with an uninterrupted provenance.

Caravaggio's Catherine leans comfortably on a huge wheel which is superbly rendered in perspective. Her martyr's palm lies on the ground, a less than decorous solution that was justified, perhaps, by forming a cross with the blade of the sword. The painter's selective suppression of the saint's distinctive symbols was especially provocative at this time. Wearing neither crown nor classical regalia, an attractive young woman is shown seated with some

props in a spotlight corner of a darkened studio. She holds, or caresses, really, an elegant rapier that could not have been the instrument of her martyrdom unless she was killed in a duel.

The attractive young woman with a heart-shaped face and fine delineated features, her caramel-colored hair parted in the middle and braided back, was the most consistent model Caravaggio ever had, recognizable in both leading and supporting rôles from the *Judith* of 1598 until the *Death of the Virgin* of 1604 or 1605. Many have thought that this favorite model must have been Fillide, a socially prominent prostitute, whose name can be found in the criminal archives of Rome.

See pp. 86–88, illustrated detail p. 123.

Condition:

The painting is in good condition. Radiography reveals pentimenti in both hands, especially in the position of the fingers. Some incisions are visible on the nail of the wheel, in Saint Catherine's cloak and in the background over her head which were intentional and would have been made directly into the wet imprimatura. For further discussion of condition see Contini 2002, p. 6.

Copies:

C. I

Church of San Pietro, Castel San Pietro (Palestrina)

Bibliography:

Marini 1974, p. 365, no. E2; Moir 1976, p. 86, no. 12a; Gregori 1985, p. 250; Contini 2002, p. 13 (medium quality, badly preserved).

C.2

Church of San Jerònimo el Real, Madrid, since December 1881

Oil on canvas, 65³/₈ x 50³/₈ in. (166 x 128 cm)

Bibliography:

Inventory of the Prado Museum 1845, inv. no. 2.725; De Madrazo 1872, no. 2.725; Voss 1924 (as in Prado); Ainaud 1947, p. 387, ill. 372 (identifies with *Santa Catalina de Caravaggio*, from Escorial and returned to Palazzo Reale in 1810 on the orders of Joseph Bonaparte); Pérez Sánchez 1970, no. 33, p. 124; Contini 2002, p. 13 (doubts Ainaud's reference).

21. *Conversion of Mary Magdalen*, c. 1599

Oil on canvas, 38¹/₂ x 52¹/₄ in. (97.8 x 132.7 cm)

The Detroit Institute of Arts, Detroit

Provenance:

The painting is generally identified with a "Saints Martha and Magdalen when she converts," unidentified by author, in a 1611 inventory of Olimpia Aldobrandini, Rome; after her death in 1638, her collection passed to her son, who died shortly thereafter, and the collection passed to his niece, also named Olimpia, in whose collection it is documented in 1646; she married Camillo Pamphili in 1647 and it appears in an Inventory of the Palazzo Doria Pamphili in 1682; in the 1722 inventory of Principessa Olimpia Aldobrandini; painting remained in the Aldobrandini family until litigation with Borghese over rights of primogeniture in 1769; possibly Niccolò Panzani, Emilia Panzani, Anna E. Panzani, Rome; exported from Milan, January 21, 1897; acquired in Paris between 1904 and 1909 by Indalecio Gómez, Argentine minister to the Imperial Court at Berlin, by whom brought to Argentina around 1909; transferred after the death of Gómez in 1920 to the Gómez family estate in the Salta region, Argentina; Ambassador Carlos Gómez-Alzaga, Buenos Aires, Argentina, after 1967; Sale Christie's, London, June 25, 1971, lot 21 (unsold); acquired with funds provided by the Kresge Foundation and Mrs. Edsel B. Ford in February 1973.

Inventories:

I. Luigi Spezzaferro (1974) identified this picture with an untraced and unattributed painting of this subject cited in the Testament dated August 6, 1606 of Ottavio Costa, Rome. Costa stated that in the event of his death, his friend the Abbot Ruggero Tritonio, secretary to Cardinal Montalto, should have his choice of two paintings in his collection, a *Saint Francis* and a *Saints Martha and Mary Magdalen*; the picture not selected by Tritonio was to be left to Costa's business partner, Giovanni Enriquez de Herrera. Testa (2002) demonstrated that the Costa picture is not identifiable with the present picture.

II. Testa 2002, p. 135 identifies this picture with a painting listed in the following Inventories of Donna Olimpia Aldobrandini (1567–1637) and her niece, also called Olimpia Aldobrandini (1623–1681):

A. May 25, 1606: Inventory of Donna Olimpia Aldobrandini, as in a bedroom: “a painting of Saints Martha and the Magdalen when she converts her with a black and gold frame” [“un quadro di S.ta Marta e Madalena quando la convertisce con cornice negre e oro”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990, pp. 240, 241 n. 103; Testa 2002, p. 132).

B. January 28, 1611: Inventory of Donna Olimpia Aldobrandini: “a painting of Saints Martha and the Magdalen with a black frame with gold stars” [“. . . cominciato adi 28 di genn. 1611 . . . quadro di s.ta marta e maddalena con cornice negre con oro e stelle”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990, pp. 240, 244 n. 106; Testa 2002, pp. 132, 150, fn 35, to the same effect in inventories dated 1615 and 1626).

C. May 8, 1634. Inventory of Donna Olimpia Aldobrandini: “A painting of Saint Mary Magdalen and Saint Martha with a gilt frame” [“Un quadro di S.M. Mad.a et S. Martha con cornice rabescata doro”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990, pp. 240, 244 n. 106; Testa 2002, p. 150, fn 36).

D. July 1638: After the death of Donna Olimpia in 1638, the painting was inherited by her son, Cardinal Ippolito Aldobrandini, who transferred it from the Palazzo di Magnapoli to the Palazzo al Corso in July 1638: “A horizontal painting with the Magdalen and Martha with a flower in hand with a black frame gilt in gold by Caravaggio” [“Un quadro Bislongo con una Maddalena et Marta, con Fiore in mano con cornice negra rabescata d'oro del Caravaggio”]

(Rome, Archivio Doria Pamphili, Archivio Aldobrandini, b.30 F.40; Cappelletti–Testa 1990, p. 240; Testa 2002, p. 132).

E. Later in 1638, Cardinal Ippolito died, and the entire Aldobrandini estate passed to his niece, also named Olimpia.

F. 1646: Inventory of Olimpia Aldobrandini, Rome: “A painting of Saint Martha and the Magdalen with her left hand leaning on a mirror with another figure, a vase, and a comb, gilt frame, four and three fourths palmi high” [“Un quadro di Santa Marta madalena con la mano manca appoggiata sopra uno specchio con un'altra figura, un vasetto, et un Pettine, Cornice rabescata d'oro, alto palmi quattro e tre quarti”] (Cappelletti-Testa 1990, pp. 241, 244 n. 108 [AA tomo 3, 157–4, Inventario della Guardaroba 1646]; Testa 2002, p. 132).

III. 1682: Inventory of the Guardaroba of the Palazzo Doria Pamphili, Rome: “A painting of Saint Mary Magdalen with her left hand leaning on a mirror and with the right she holds a flower, and in front a comb, about four palmi high on canvas with a frame touched in gold, artist uncertain” [“Un quadro di S. Maria Maddalena con la mano manca sta appoggiata sopra uno specchio e con la dritta tiene un fiore, e davanti un pettine alto p.mi 4 in circa in tela con cornice tocca d'oro di incerta mano”] (Della Pergola 1963, p. 183 n. 601; Cappelletti–Testa 1990, pp. 240, 244 n. 110; Testa 2002, p. 132).

IV. January 9, 1722: Inventory of Principessa Olimpia Aldobrandini listed among various paintings in her legacy: “A painting of Saint Mary Magdalen and Saint Martha with a gilt frame” [“Pitture diverse ereditarie della ch.e della S.ra Prnpa Olimpia Aldobrandini Sen.e . . . un quadro di S. maria Madalena e S. marta con cornice rabescata d'oro”] (Cappelletti– Testa 1990, pp. 240, 244 n. 111 [AA tomo 3, 158–3]; Testa 2002, p. 133).

V. Remained in family until litigation with Borghese over rights of primogeniture in 1769, where recorded in an inventory compiled by Ludovico Stern: “Another painting on canvas with a gold frame six palmi long and four palmi high, representing two half figures of women in life-size, copy of a Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“Altro quadro in tela con cornice liscia dorata longo palmi sei e alto palmi quattro rappresentante due mezze figure di donne al naturale copia di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990, pp. 241, 244 n. 112

[AA tomo 6, 159-6, f. 85]; Cappelletti–Testa 1990², p. 7; Testa 2002, p. 133 [probably called a copy because of poor condition]).

Source:

I. von Ramdohr 1787, p. 259 (ed. Matthiae, p. 302): Rome, Palazzo Mattei: “in the second room a painting by Michelangelo da Caravaggio, representing Saint Martha and Saint Mary Magdalen.” [“nella seconda stanza . . . un quadro di Michelangelo da Caravaggio, rappresentante S. Marta, e S. Maria Maddalena”].

Exhibitions:

New York-Naples 1985, no. 73; Florence 1991, no. 7; Boston 1999; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 30; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 37 (1598).

Bibliography:

Fiocco 1917, p. 361 (by Gentileschi; Mary wears the same gown worn by Caravaggio’s Saint Catherine); Voss 1924, p. 64–67 (young Vouet); Longhi 1943, pp. 11, 56 n. 76 (recognizes the invention as by Caravaggio, publishes photograph as in the collection of Commodore Manzella, Rome); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (all known versions are copies of a lost original executed 1596–97); Carritt in Christie’s 1971 (Caravaggio); Cummings 1973; Cummings 1974, pp. 563–64, 572–78 (based on Luini); Greaves-Johnson 1974, pp. 564–72 (reddish-brown ground, no preparatory drawing, Naples yellow and azurite are findings for two colors which would be unlikely in a later painting, minor changes shown in x-rays evidence of originality, similar to *Judith Beheading Holofernes* [cat. no. 19]); Marini 1974, pp. 120–21, 365–66 n. 23 (copy); Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 579–86; Salerno 1974, pp. 586–93 (1593–96); Posner–Johnson–Cummings 1975, pp. 302–3 (debate over attribution); Moir 1976, pp. 107–9 nos. 56a, 56d, 139–42 n. 237 (copy, near Valentin); Nicolson 1979, pp. 33, 109; Marini 1982, p. 77 (1597); Cinotti 1983, no. 10; Hibbard 1983, pp. 61–62, 288–89 n. 33 (1597–98); Gregori 1985, no. 73 (“The ground seems at times to have been left exposed between zones of color. . . . In the present painting the reddish brown preparation was also occasionally used for the middle tones. This corresponds to what Bellori [1672, p. 209] reports.”); Calvesi 1986², pp. 147–50; Christiansen 1986, pp. 436–37 (autograph but overcleaned); Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989,

p. 23; Marini 1989, pp. 408–10, no. 27 (Rome, 1597); Cappelletti–Testa 1990², pp. 5–7; Papi in *Caravaggio. Come nascono*. . . 1991, no. 7; Bologna 1992, pp. 309–10 (1596–97); Gregori 1994, p. 147, no. 23 (c. 1597–98); Gilbert 1995, pp. 107–8, 127, 257; Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1599); Lapucci in *Come dipingeva* . . . 1996, pp. 31–50; Cappelletti 1998, p. 341 (collection of Olimpia Aldobrandini, acquired shortly before her move to Palazzo dal Corso, c. 1621); Langdon 1998, pp. 122–23, 146, 150; Puglisi 1998, no. 24 (c. 1598–99); Robb 1998, p. 504 (1598); Jones in Mormando 1999, pp. 36–41; Mormando 1999, pp. 109–11, pl. 4 (c. 1598); Vannugli 2000; Garrard 2001, p. 45; Spike 2001, pp. 88–91, no. 21 (c. 1599); Testa 2002, pp. 132–33 (confirms Aldobrandini provenance, rejects Costa provenance); Macioce 2003, pp. 380–81 (cites various inventories of the Aldobrandini family, 1769–83, which conform to the inventory compiled by Lodovico Stern in 1769 who called the painting “of two half figures a copy after a Caravaggio”); Bissell 2005, pp. 10, 38, 43; Lapucci 2005, pp. 19–20, fig. 7, 28–29, fig. 8, 36 fig. 4; Marini 2005, pp. 184, 419–21, no. 28; Sgarbi 2005, no. 23 (c. 1598–99, after Vienna *Crowning with Thorns*); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (c. 1597); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 30, pp. 129–32 (c. 1599); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 250, cat. no. 37 (1598); Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 39; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 25, 32; Varriano 2006, pp. 9, 12, 56, 90–95, 109, 117–18, fig. 1; Terzaghi 2007, p. 32, n. 105 (rules out reference to Ottavio Costa cited by Spezzaferro), p. 300 n. 110, Ottavio had a copy or another version of this canvas); Papa 2008, pp. 199–201 (1597–99).

The present work is one of Caravaggio’s most successful compositions, which inspired numerous contemporary copies, as well as variations on its unusual theme, by other painters such as Carlo Saraceni, Orazio Gentileschi, and Pietro Paolini. The prompt and wide dissemination of this image among Roman artists presupposes its location in an accessible collection. Curiously, none of the early sources make any mention of it. The painting did not enter Caravaggio scholarship until Longhi’s published its photograph in 1943.

In recent research, Cappelletti and Testa have established that a *Conversion of Mary Magdalen* by Caravaggio was already in the possession of Donna Olimpia Aldobrandini by 1606 and remained uninterruptedly in Rome until at least 1787, by which time it had passed into the Mattei collection; but shortly thereafter it went untraced. Ottavio Costa, an enthusiastic Caravaggio collector, apparently owned a version of this subject in 1606 (Spezzaferro 1974).

In early inventories the composition is usually described only as “Saints Martha and Mary Magdalen.” The Aldobrandini inventory of 1606 cites the composition as *Mary Magdalen converted by Martha*. This early reference confirms the picture’s derivation from a famous *Conversion of Mary Magdalen* by Bernardino Luini, at that time attributed to Leonardo da Vinci, in the Barberini collection in Rome (cf: Cummings 1974, p. 575 fig. 39). In the absence of the usual attributes of Saints Martha and Mary Magdalen or any signs of penitence, Longhi (1943, p. 11) suggested the title *Martha Reproving Mary Magdalen for Her Vanity*. On the other hand the portrayal of the saint renders her and her splendid mirror as the protagonists of the composition as Cummings (1974) rightly noted.

See pp. 88–91.

Condition:

The painting is generally intact, although its appearance is compromised by the effects of excessive cleaning of the paint surface. The fragile dark pigments have been particularly affected, depriving Martha’s face of its subtle shading and creating a mottled effect in the background.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

Rome, Collection of Ottavio Costa

January 18–23, 1639: Inventory of the objects in the house of Ottavio Costa, Rome, at his death: “n.2 S.tae Marthae et Magdalene” (Spezzaferro 1974, p. 579; Terzaghi 2007, p. 300, n. 110 [painting does not reappear in Costa inventories, nor in those of Juan Enríquez de Herrera, nor those of his son, Pietro]).

C.2

Naples, Roomer collection, 1630 inventory as copy by Carlo Saraceni (Moir 1967, I, p.156; Moir 1976, p. 108, no. 56f).

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, pp. 107–9, nos. 56a–56p, including:

C.3

Oxford, Christ Church Picture Gallery

Oil on canvas, 38½ x 53½ in. (97.7 x 135.8 cm)

Provenance:

Collection of General John Guise (1682/83–1756) who bequeathed his property to Christ Church, Oxford, in 1765; moved to Gallery Collection of Christ Church, 1968.

Exhibitions:

Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 38.

Bibliography:

Byam Shaw 1967, no. 137; Moir 1976, p. 108, no. 56b; Spike 2001, cat. no. 21.c (among copies listed by Moir); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 251, cat. no. 38 (copy, 1620–25).

22. Contarelli Chapel, San Luigi dei Francesi, Rome, 1599–1600

22.1 Martyrdom of Saint Matthew

Oil on canvas, 127 x 135 in. (323 x 343 cm)

22.2 *The Calling of Saint Matthew*

Oil on canvas, 127 x 133¾ in. (322 x 340 cm)

Provenance:

Commissioned from Caravaggio on July 23, 1599; by July 4, 1600, *Martyrdom* installed at right, *Calling* at left, of altar.

Documents:

1. May 27, 1591: Contract with Giuseppe Cesare d'Arpino, attachment to this contract dated by Röttgen (ed. 1974, p. 20) circa 1592 or 1593: "For the Saint Matthew chapel. . . . At the right side of the altar, that is, on the side of the gospel, there is to be a painting of 17 palmi high and 14 palmi long in which is painted the same Saint Matthew in a store or large room used for tax collection with various items pertaining to such an office, with a counter such as tax collectors use, with books, and monies that have been received, or as shall seem best. From this counter Saint Matthew, dressed as a practitioner of his trade would be, should rise in order to follow Our Lord who passes along the street with his disciples and calls him to the apostolate; and the attitude of Saint Matthew should show the painter's skill, as should also the rest. On the left side, that is, of the epistle, there should be another painting of the height and length as above in which is painted a long wide space in the form of a temple, with an altar raised up on the top of three, four, or five steps: where Saint Matthew dressed in vestments to celebrate the mass is killed by the hands of soldiers and it might be more artistic to show the moment of being killed, where he is wounded and already fallen, or falling but not yet dead, while in the temple there are many men, women, young and old people, and children, mostly in different attitudes of prayer, and dressed according to their station and nobility, and benches, carpets, and other furnishings, most of them terrified by the event, others appalled, and still others filled with compassion . . ." ["Per la cappella di San Matteo . . . Al lato destro dell'altare cioè alla banda del vangeliaco si faccia un quadro alto palmi dicesette et largo palmi quattordici di vano nel quale sia medesimamente dipinto San Matteo dentro un magazzino, o ver, salone ad uso di gabella con diverse robbe che convengono a tal officio con un banco come usano i gabellieri con libri, et danari in atto d'haver riscosso qualche somma

o, come meglio parera. Dal qual banco San Matteo vestito secondo che parera convenirsi a quell'arte si levi con desiderio per venire a N.S.re che passando lungo la strada con i suoi discepoli lo chiama all'apostolo; et nell'atto di San Matteo si ha da dimostrare l'artificio del pittore come anco nel resto. Al lato sinistro cioè dell'epistola sia un altro quadro alto et lungo come di sopra, nel quale sia depinto un luogo lungo et largo quasi in forma di tempio et nella parte di sopra un altare in isola elevato con tre quattro cinque più o meno gradi: ove San Matteo celebrando la messa vestito in quel modo che poi si darà da intendere sia ammazzato da una mano di soldati et si crede sarà più secondo l'arte farlo nell'atto dell'ammazzare però che habbi ricevuta qualche ferita et già sia cascato o in atto di cadere ma non ancor morto et nel detto tempio sia moltitudine d'huomini et donne giovani vecchi putti et d'ogni sorte in oratione per la maggior parte et seconda le qualità loro et nobilita vestiti et sopra banchi et tappeti et altri apparati et per il più spaventati dal caso mostrando in altri sdegno in altri compassione . . ."] (Röttgen 1974, pp. 20–21).

2. July 23, 1599: Rectors of the congregation authorize a contract with Caravaggio to execute the two lateral paintings in the Contarelli Chapel for a price of 400 scudi. [“. . . deputaverit nuper d[ominum] Michaelem Angelum de Caravaggio pictorem pro dipingendo d[ict]is duob[us] quadries lateralib[us] ut s[upr]a indepictis relictam cedulamque bancariam scut[orum] quatringtonor[um] monete ad hunc effectum . . ."]

3. August 1, 1599: Caravaggio signs an additional contract for the lateral paintings in the Contarelli Chapel in the church of San Luigi dei Francesi, which he agrees to complete within one year for a fee of 400 *scudi* [“. . . Rectores dominus Michael Ang[elus] . . ."].

4. July 4, 1600 Caravaggio receives a final payment of fifty *scudi* for *The Calling of Saint Matthew* and *The Martyrdom of Saint Matthew* [“Introscrittus dominus Michael Angelus Marisius ad presens . . . et in contanti habuit et recepit ab introscritta venerabili Congregatione licet absente et pro ea a reverendo domino Ludovico Cressio et domino Francisco Francisio Belgio modernis rectoribus dicte eccelsie . . . scuta quinquaginta monete comprehensis in eis scutis viginti nettum de mense junij proximi preteriti per acta domini Fausti Barerij Vicarij . . . Michaeli Angelo ad computum introscritte picture consignate que scuta quinquaginta dictus dominus Michael Angelus ad se in tot iulij et testonibus argenteis . . . esse asseruerunt proresiduo et finali pagamento introscrittorum scrutorum quadringentorum . . .”].

5. July 17, 1600: Two rectors of congregation sign a declaration of receipt of a portion of the payment left for two paintings by Caravaggio [“. . . Congregationis habuerunt et receperunt in cont[anti] abe ill[ustribus d[ominis] introscrittis fil[iis] et hered[ibus] q[uondam] Virgilij Crescentij . . . pro residuo introscritt[um] scutorum 400 que . . .”]. (Other documents related to the proceedings by the congregation of San Luigi dei Francesi were published by Mahon 1952, pp. 22–23; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 295–301; Röttgen 1965, pp. 50–51; Cinotti 1971, pp. 150–51; Marini 1989, pp. 428–37.)

Sources:

1. Milesi 1606 c. 75r, 75v, 76r (ed. 1980, p. 88 [8]): “Lyric poem about the stories of Saint Matthew painted by Michel Angiol da Caravaggio” [“Selva per le historie di S. Mattheo dipinte da Michel Angiol da Caravaggio”] (Fulco 1980, p. 88 [8]; Macioce 2003, I doc. 104, p. 101).

2. Mancini 1619–21 (ed. 1956, I, p. 82, marginal note, cancelled): “In the Contarelli Chapel of San Luigi, the vault by Giuseppe [Cesari d’Arpinno] before 1600; the walls by Michelangelo da Caravaggio after 1600” [“In San Luigi quella de Contarelli di Giuseppe avanti il 600, quelle da basso di Michelangelo Caravaggio doppo il 600”]; (p. 224): “I am told that he later stayed in the house of Cavaliere Giuseppe and Monsignore Fantin Petrignani who gave him use of a room. During this time he made many pictures, and in particular . . . the pictures of San Luigi” [“Doppo mi vien detto che stesse in casa del Cav.^r Giuseppe e di Mons.^r Fantin Petrignani, che li dava commodità d’una stanza nel qual tempo fece molti quadri, et in particolare . . . quelli di San Luigi”].

3. Celio 1620–24, p. 18 (ed. 1638, p. 12): “San Louis of the French nation . . . the chapel of Saint Matthew last in the row, from the Cornice up, by Gioseppe Cesare, from the cornice down, all in oil by Michelangelo da Carauggio” [“S. Aloigi della natione Francesa . . . La Cappella di S. Matteo vltima in essa fila, dalla Cornice in su à fresco di Gioseppe Cesare dell abito di S. Michele. Dalla Cornice a basso il tutto ad olio di Michelangelo da Carauggio”].

4. Baglione 1642, pp. 136–37: “With the help of his cardinal, he obtained the commission for the chapel of the Contarelli in San Luigi dei Francesi. Over the altar he made Saint Matthew with an Angel; at the right is the calling of the Apostle by the Savior; at the left the saint is

struck down on the altar by the executioner, with other figures. . . . The ceiling of the chapel however is well painted by Cavalier Giuseppe Cesari d'Arpino." ["Per opera del su Cardinale hebbe in S. Luigi de' Francesi la cappella de' Contarelli, ove sopra l'altare fece il s. Mattheo con un Angelo. A man diritta, quando l'Apostolo è chiamato dal Redentore, et a man manca, quando sú l'altare è ferito dal carnefice con altre figure. . . . La volta però della cappella è assai ben dipinta dal Cavalier Giuseppe Cesari d'Arpino."]

5. Ottonelli–da Cortona 1652, p. 25: "The first, that is Michel'Angelo, to observe nature in painting, arrived at such a sign of perfection, that his works are marvelous, like that seen in the Chapel of Saint Matthew in Rome, in the church of San Luigi dei Francesi." ["Il primo, cioè Michel'Angelo osservò il naturale nel dipingere, e giunse a tal segno di perfetione, che l'opere da lui apportano meraviglia, come si vede nella Cappella di s. Matteo in Roma, nella Chiesa di s. Luigi de' Francesi"].

6. Scannelli 1657, p. 197: ". . . by the same Michelangelo the premier naturalist, work is on public view in the city of Rome, and also the best work of his qualified brush, and the first, and easily the most excellent of all others is seen in the church of San Luigi of the French nation in the last chapel from the entrance at the left side of the altar, which shows Saint Matthew with an Angel above the altar, and on the right the story of his Calling of the richest, most plastic, and natural composition, which shows the high capacity of paintings for imitating true reality. The chapel is almost entirely lacking in light, to the disgrace of the virtuosi and of the artist himself, as the paintings can be seen only imperfectly." [". . . della stesso Michelangelo primo capo de' naturalisti stanno in publica vista della città di Roma la maggior parte, ed anco le migliori opere del suo qualificato pennello, e la prima, e facilmente piú eccellente d'ogni altra si vede nella Chiesa di S. Luigi della Nazione Francese l'ultima Capella nell'entrare a mano sinistra con la Tavola, che dimostra S. Matteo con un'Angelo dalla parte di sopra, e alla pare destra l'historya delle piú pastose, rilevate, e naturali operationi che venga a dimostrare l'artificio della Pittura per imitatione di mera veritá, essendo in tal luogo, quasi del tutto mancante il lume, in modo che opera tale per disgratia de'virtuosi, e dello stesso Autore non si può vedere, che imperfettamente."]

7. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, pp. 220–21): ". . . On the right side of the altar is a Christ calling Saint Matthew to the Apostolate. Here several heads are drawn from life, among which is the

saint, who interrupts his counting of money and, with one hand on his breast, turns toward the Lord. Close to the saint is an old man placing spectacles on his nose and looking at a young man seated at one corner of the table, drawing the coins to himself. On the other side is the martyrdom of Saint Matthew who, dressed in priestly robes, is stretched out on a bench. Above him is the nude figure of the executioner, brandishing his sword to strike him while other figures draw back in horror. The composition and the movements, however, are not adequate for the story, even though Caravaggio repeated it twice. The darkness of the chapel and of the color makes it difficult to see these two pictures.” [“Dal lato destro l’altare vi è Cristo che chiama San Matteo all’apostolato, ritrattevi alcune teste al naturale, tra le quali il Santo lasciando di contar le monete, con una mano al petto, si volge al Signore: ed appresso un vecchio si pone gli occhiali al naso, riguardando un giovine che tira a sé quelle monete assiso nell’angolo della tavola. Dall’altro lato vi è il martirio del Santo istesso in abito sacerdotale disteso sopra una banca; e ‘l manigoldo incontro brandisce la spada per ferirlo, figura ignuda, ed altre si ritirano con orrore. Il componimento, e li moti però non sono sufficienti all’istoria; ancorché egli la rifacesse due volte; e l’oscurità della cappella e del colore tolgono questi due quadri alla vista.”]

8. von Sandrart, before 1658 (ed. 1675, p. 189): “He painted two large canvases for San Luigi dei Francesi while in the palace of Prince Giustiniani: the first represents Christ Our Lord who throws the Jewish merchants, their wares, and their table out of the temple; but still more admirable is the other canvas, in which Christ is shown entering a dark room with two of his disciples, where he finds the tax collector Matthew drinking and playing cards and gaming with dice with a group of rogues. Matthew fearfully hides the cards in one hand and lays the other to his breast, showing in his face the fear and shame he feels because he was called unworthily by Christ to the apostolate. One of the rogues with one hand sweeps his money from the table into his other hand and slinks shamefully away, all of which is true to life and nature itself.” (Friedlaender 1955, p. 179) [“Ancora dipinse due grandi tavole per San Luigi dei Francesi presso il palazzo del principe Giustiniani: la prima rappresentava Cristo nostro salvatore che caccia i mercanti ebrei con le loro mercanzie e le loro tavole fuori dal tempio; ma ancora più mirabile è l’altra tavola, in cui è rappresentato Cristo che entra in una stanza oscura con due dei suoi e trova il pubblicano Matteo con una manica di bricconi che bevono e giocano a carte e ai dadi: Matteo, colto da timore, nasconde le carte in una mano e porta l’altra al petto, mostrando nel volto la paura e la vergogna che lo ha accolto perchè indegnamente è

stato chiamato da Cristo all'ufficio di apostolo; un altro con una mano fa scivolare dal tavolo di denaro nell'altra e si allontana tutto vegognoso: tuto ciò è perfettamente conforme alla natura e alla vita.”] (Macioce 2003, p. 321)

9. Silos 1673, p. 21, Epigram XXXI.

10. Malvasia 1678, II, pp. 105–6.

Bibliography:

Burckhardt 1855, p. 1016; Bertolotti 1880, p. 381; Kalleb 1906–7, pp. 273–74, 283–85, 291 (c. 1590); Voss 1920 (*Calling* precedes *Martyrdom*, which is the last of Contarelli paintings); Marangoni 1922, pp. 13–15, 29–30, 90–94 (1590; *Martyrdom* after *Calling*); Voss 1924, p. 77; Benkard 1928, pp. 11–33, 49–69; Pevsner 1928/29, pp. 388–89 (first altarpiece with *Angel*, *Calling*, *Martyrdom*, finally second altarpiece with *Angel*); Longhi 1928/29, pp. 17, 21–30, 271, 275, 308 (*Martyrdom* is last); Schudt 1942, no. 19–28 (self-portrait upper left corner, *Martyrdom*); Longhi 1943, pp. 9–12 (c. 1595); Ainaud 1947, p. 383 n. 62; Mahon 1947, p. 177; Arslan 1951, pp. 449–50 (painted after Cerasi chapel, 1602–3); Berenson 1951, pp. 19–21, 23, 52, 57 (classicism that prefigures Jacques-Louis David); Hess 1951, pp. 186–201; Longhi 1951, pp. 7–8, 3–13, 12–14; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 15; Mahon 1951, pp. 223–25, 234 (1603–4); Mahon 1951², pp. 286–92 (perhaps earlier); Venturi 1951, no. 19 (1604, reflects latent Mannerism, Mantegna); Longhi 1952, pp. 25–30, 35, 54; Mahon 1952, pp. 3–19, 22–23 (1598–1600, predates Cerasi Chapel; publishes documents); Hinks 1953, no. 29/30; Mahon 1953, pp. 219–20 (*Martyrdom* predates *Calling*); Baumgart 1955, no. 23, 28; Czobor 1955, pp. 201–2 (self-portrait, upper left corner, *Martyrdom*); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 178–80, no. 22B and C (figure clutching money taken from Holbein woodcut in series illustrating the *Dance of Death*); Chastel 1956, pp. 963–64 (before Cerasi); Wagner 1958, 53–55, 60–69, 71–79, 86–92; Wittkower 1958, pp. 24–25, 27–29; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 39–40, 173–74, 194–96, 224–29, 293–94 (*Calling* last); Jullian 1961, pp. 31–34, 66, 69, 85–92, 97–99, 103–4 (1598–1601 *Calling* precedes second *Matthew and the Angel*, and *Martyrdom*); Röttgen 1964 [ed. 1974, pp. 43–75] (establishes date of 1599–1600 with documents; Caravaggio followed iconographical program originally assigned to d'Arpino); Röttgen 1965 [ed. 1974, pp. 75, 102–27] (publishes contract of July 23, 1599); Urbani 1966, pp. 36–80 (notes water reflection in

the *Martyrdom*, radiograph); Salerno–Kinkead–Wilson 1966, p. 115 (iconographic source from drawing of *Ulysses before the Circe Magi* in the Royal Library, Windsor Castle, attributed to Annibale); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 43 (1599–1600); Moir 1967, I, pp. 5–8, II, p. 58; Longhi 1968, pp. 21–26, 30; Kitson 1969, no. 40 (turning point of Caravaggio’s career, first public commission, 1598–1600, x-rays show extensive repainting with at least two versions underneath *Martyrdom*, painted after *Calling*, composition originally planned without Saint Peter); Salerno 1970, p. 237; Calvesi 1971, pp. 116–21, 125, 132–36, 140; Dell’Acqua 1971 (reminiscent of Zuccari and Raphael); Cinotti 1971, pp. 184, 201–3; Röttgen 1973, no. 18; Lavin 1974, pp. 59–81; Röttgen 1974, pp. 11–44; Marini 1974, pp. 27–28, no. 35 (nude figures are baptisands); Guttoso in Gregori 1975, pp. 140–42; Spezzaferro 1975, pp. 56–58; Moir 1976, p. 91, no. 20; Wright 1978, pp. 39, 41; Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Strinati 1980, p. 40; DeMarco 1982, pp. 5–7; Magnuson 1982, pp. 83–87; Marini 1982, pp. 72–83 (contract for lateral paintings July 23, 1599); Moir 1982, p. 20; Cinotti 1983, no. 61B; Hibbard, 1983 pp. 104–6, 298 n. 59; Spike 1983, p. 40; Gregori 1985, p. 39; Prater 1985, pp. 70–74 (Matthew identification in *Calling*); Calvesi 1988, pp. 117–32, 238–39; Hass 1988, pp. 245–50; Kretschmer 1988, pp. 63–66; Marini 1989, pp. 426–42, nos. 38–40 (Rome, 1599–1600); Treffers 1989, pp. 241–55 (Franciscan); Aronberg Lavin 1990; Calvesi 1990, pp. 279–310 (*Calling* refers to conversion of Henry of Navarre); Röttgen 1991, pp. 97–99; Bologna 1992, pp. 39–42, 312–14 (1599–1600); Gregori 1994, pp. 65, 158, no. 30 (c. 1599–1600); Askew in Macioce 1996, pp. 248–50; Gilbert 1995, pp. 23, 102, 127–28, 158–71, 189, 255, 260; Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, pp. 3–4; Christiansen in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 18–23 (first composition related to Marcantonio Raimondi, *Judgment of Paris*); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1599); Pupillo in Macioce 1996, pp. 148–66; Prater 1995, pp. 53–61; Pupillo 1996, p. 8 (contract dated 1591 with Virgilio Crescenzi for the decoration of the ceiling of the chapel of San Luigi dei Francesi, with “Stefanus Zucchari trentinus stuccator in Urbe”); Zuccari in Macioce 1996, pp. 289–93; Rice 1997, p. 319; Wind 1997, pp. 7–11; Heimbürger 1998, pp. 22–24 (Dürer influence in *Calling*); Langdon 1998, pp. 170–79, 184, 234, 257, 262, 299; Puglisi 1998, nos. 28, 29 (1599–1600); Robb 1998, pp. 117–20, 505 (1599–1600); Zuccari 1998, pp. 292–302 (1599–1600, while Caravaggio was at work on painting, Giordano Bruno was executed in Piazza Navona, February 8, 1600); Benedetti in Mormando 1999, pp. 208–33; Worcester in Mormando 1999, pp. 91–96, fig. 6 (1599–1600); Varriano in Mormando 1999, p. 192; Brown in London-Rome 2001, pp. 24–26; Spike 2001, pp. 92–100, cat. no. 22 (1599–1600); Antinori 2002, pp. 97–104; Calvesi 2002,

pp. 13–22; Corradini 2002, pp. 51–62; Marini 2002², pp. 233–42; Olsen 2002, pp. 107–42 (original composition as revealed in x-rays related to the veneration of relics); Tempesta 2002, pp. 63–80; Volpi 2002; Zuccari 2002, pp. 81–96; Sgarbi 2005, no. 28 (*Calling*), 29 (*Martyrdom*); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (1599–1600); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 8–9, fig. 3; Tresoldi 2006, p. 83 *Calling*, p. 85 *Martyrdom* (1599–1600); Varriano 2006, pp. 14, 20–21, 28–30, 40–44, 58, 83, 93, 111–12, 115, 119, figs. 9, 15; Warwick 2006, pp. 95–96; Debono 2007, pp. 13–14 ill.; Pichler in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 9–33; Papa 2008, pp. 66–80 (1599–1600); Franits in Frankfurt 2009, pp. 37–53; Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82.

Cardinal Mathieu Cointrel, known as Matteo Contarelli in Italy, acquired the rights to this chapel in 1565. Nothing came of his commission for paintings by Gerolamo Muziano. At Contarelli's death, twenty years later, he left his executor Virgilio Crescenzi with funds and instructions for its decoration with scenes from the life and death of his name saint, the Apostle Matthew. On November 23, 1587, Crescenzi gave a commission to the Fleming Jacob Cobaert, for a statue of Saint Matthew to be placed above the high altar. The marble group was to be completed within four years, but Cobaert had made little progress by May 27, 1591 when Giuseppe Cesari d'Arpino was engaged to paint frescoes on the vault and side walls of the chapel. Cesari was paid for the vault frescoes in June of 1593. The chapel was left in an incomplete state and the dissatisfied congregation of San Luigi dei Francesi petitioned the pope in December 1594 to demand that the executor, Giacomo Crescenzi, who had succeeded his father, complete the work on the chapel so that it could be opened. In a second petition to Clement VIII two years later, the congregation complained that the chapel was still closed twenty-five years after the cardinal's acquisition. The pope transferred the Contarelli legacy from the Crescenzi to the Fabbrica di San Pietro in July 1597. Giuseppe Cesari d'Arpino received a bank draft for 400 *scudi* in November 1597 to induce him to complete the chapel decorations, but the artist travelled to Ferrara with the papal delegation in 1598 and nothing was done. The chapel was opened for the celebration of Mass in May 1599.

In July 1599 d'Arpino returned the bank draft of 400 *scudi* to the Crescenzi and the assignment to complete the two lateral paintings on canvas, no longer in fresco, was given to Caravaggio, who agreed to paint them within one year following the program established by Virgilio Crescenzi. Radiography of the two paintings revealed that the artist struggled with the composition of

the *Martyrdom of Saint Matthew*, revising it at least twice. Final payment was received on July 4, 1600, although the paintings were apparently not installed until December; they were first laid down on panels and framed.

The events surrounding Caravaggio's execution of the altarpiece in place of the Codaert statue are described in the entry for cat. nos. 27 and 28. For the Crescenzi contestations, see Robb (1998); for the documents see Cinotti (1983).

Caravaggio's paintings in the Contarelli Chapel constitute a pivotal moment in his stylistic evolution and in his emergence as a painter of sacred histories.

For full discussion, see pp. 92–100.

Copies:

Bibliography for copies: Moir 1976, p. 91, no. 20 (none recorded of the *Martyrdom*), pp. 91–92, nos. 21a–21k (lists numerous copies of the *Calling*).

23. *Conversion of Saint Paul*, 1600–1601

Oil on wood (cypress), 93¼ x 74⅜ in. (237 x 189 cm)

Private collection (heirs of Principe Guido Odescalchi), Rome

Provenance:

Acquired from the artist by Giacomo Sannesio, Rome, c. 1601; by descent to his nephew, Francesco Sannesio, Rome, by 1644; acquired in Rome by Juan Alonzo Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and ninth Almirante de Castilla, Madrid, who died in 1647; by descent to his son, Juan Gaspar; acquired by Agostino Ayrolo, Genoa, by 1659; acquired by Francesco Maria Balbi, Genoa, by December 20, 1701; the painting passed from the Balbi collection, Genoa, to the Odescalchi–Balbi collection, Rome, in the 1950s; Principessa Vittoria Odescalchi–Balbi di Piovera, by descent to the present owners.

Documents:

See Documents for the Cerasi Chapel, cat. no. 24, below.

Inventories:

1. February 19, 1644: Inventory of Francesco Sannesio (nephew and heir to Cardinal Giacomo): “Two large paintings that represent a Saint Peter crucified and the other the conversion of Saint Paul, gilt frames” [“Doi quadri grandi in tavola che rappresentano un San Pietro crocifisso e l’altro la conversione di San Paolo corniciati e filettati d’oro”] (Macioce 2003, no. 37, p. 356).

2. August 17, 1647: Posthumous inventory of Juan Alonzo Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and ninth Almirante de Castilla, Madrid: “A large painting of the *Martyrdom of Saint Peter* . . . and another of the *Conversion of Saint Paul* both by the hand of Caravaggio.” [“[86]Quadro grande del martirio de Sanct P.o, con marco inventariado a n° 327, [87]Otro de la conversion de Sanct Pablo, grande como el de arriba con marco dorado ambos de mano del Carabacho”] (Burke and Cherry 1997, I, 43 f.333, p. 412; Spike 2001, Catalogue of Lost Works L.15, L.16; Macioce 2003, no. 40, pp. 357–58).

3. December 20, 1701, testament of Francesco Maria Balbi of Genoa: “In the main salon . . . the conversion of Saint Paul by Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“Nel Salotto primo . . . la conversione di S. Paolo di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”].

Sources:

1. Baglione 1642, p. 137, “In the Madonna del Popolo at the right of the high altar, in the Cerasi chapel on the side walls are the *Crucifixion of Peter* and the *Conversion of Saint Paul*. These paintings had first been worked by him in a different manner, but because they did not please the patron, Cardinal Sannesio took them; and Caravaggio made these in oil which one sees now because he did not work in any other technique.” [“Nella Madonna del Popolo a man diritta dell’altar maggiore dentro la cappella de’Signori Cerasi sú i lati del muro sono di sua mano la Crocifissione di s. Pietro; e di rincontro la Conversione di s. Paolo. Questi quadri prima furono lavorati da lui in un’altra maniera, ma perchè non piacquero al padrone se li prese il Cardinale Sannesio; e lo stesso Caravaggio vi fece questi che hora si vedono, a olio dipinti, poichè egli non operava in altra maniera.”]

2. de Brosses 1739–40 (1745–55, ed. 1957, p. 50): “In the palace of Giacomo Balbi, in the third room, the *Conversion of Saint Paul* by Michelangelo da Caravaggio, most beautiful.”

3. Cochin 1763, II, p. 280: In Balbi Palace, Genoa.

4. Ratti 1766, p. 168: in Genoa.

5. Banchero 1846, II: in Genoa.

6. Alizeri 1847, p. 420: in Genoa.

7. Boda 1884, II, pp. 817–18.

Exhibitions:

Genoa 1947, no. 135; Milan 1951, no. 13; Rome 1984–85; Florence 1991, no. 9; Bergamo 2000, no. 35; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 15 (exhibited in Rome only); Rome 2003; Rome 2006; Milan 2008.

Bibliography:

Burckhardt 1884, pp. 817–18 (as Caravaggio); Suida 1906, p. 158; de Foville 1907; Witting 1916, p. 29 (copy); Longhi 1916 [1960, p. 275, n. 38] (Orazio Gentileschi); Argan 1943, p. 40 (1606); Longhi 1943, p. 101 (Flemish c. 1620); Morassi 1947, pp. 95–102 (in Genoa, lost first version for the Cerasi picture); Argan 1948, pp. 74–76 (c. 1588); Baroni 1951, no. 34; Berenson 1951, p. 24 n. 1 (somewhat later in date, nearly contemporary with the *Seven Acts of Mercy* [cat. no. 53]); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 13, p. 19 (c. 1588); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (marginalia, “the picture is quite out of the question as the work of Caravaggio”); Baumgart 1952, pp. 98, 100 (rejects); Longhi 1952, pl. 9; Morassi–Mahon 1952, pp. 118–19 (debate pro-con); Hinks 1953, p. 109 (rejects); Baumgart 1952, p. 109, no. 1 (rejects); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 184–15, no. 24A (difficult, Caravaggesque elements, but composition is crowded and composed in crossing diagonals, somewhat in the manner of Central Italian painters such as Federico Barocci); Mahon quoted in Mancini 1956, pp. 122 (accepts); Wagner 1958, p. 226; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 276–77, 315–18; Jullian 1961, pp. 36–37, 51, 60, 100, 232 (copy); de Logu 1962; Röttgen

1965, p. 66; Bottari 1966; Causa 1966; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 23 (1594–96; rejects as improbable the notice of Baglione that first versions were rejected and acquired by Cardinal Sannesio); Kitson 1969, no. 42 (wholly out of character); Fagiolo dell’Arco 1969, p. 57; Röttgen 1969, pp. 162–65, 167 n. 43; Salerno 1970, p. 235; Cinotti 1971, pp. 116, 189–90 n. 317–23; Pepper 1971, pp. 334, 342 n. 38; Spear 1971, p. 76; Marini 1974, pp. 156–57, 385–86 (first version, 1600); Röttgen 1974, pp. 71, 106–17, 127, 135–44; Salerno 1974, p. 587 (1600–1601); Moir 1976, pp. 111 no. 63, 119 no. 115, 160–61 n. 285 (lost, no copies known perhaps never executed); Parronchi 1976, pp. 34, 44; Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Cinotti 1983, no. 63 (ordered September 24, 1600); Hibbard 1983, pp. 118–37, 298–99, n. 74 (1600); Gregori 1985, pp. 39, 41, fig. 10 (1600); Calvesi 1986, pp. 42–44 (1600); Marini 1989, pp. 446–49, no. 43 (Rome 1600); Papi in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 9; Bologna 1992, p. 310 (1598); Calvesi 1994, pp. 148–57; Gregori 1994, p. 148, no. 32 (1600–1601); Gilbert 1995, pp. 150–51; Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 26; Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, p. 4 (1601); Papi in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 123–34 (model Cecco del Caravaggio in works between 1601–4); Puglisi 1998, no. 31 (1600–1601); Robb 1998, p. 506 (1601); Castellotti in Bergamo 2000, 210; Bernardini 2001, pp. 87–100; Spezzaferro 2001, pp. 9–57 (Caravaggio, not his patron, replaced his first paintings; the paintings *in situ* were completed shortly before the payment to the framer on May 1, 1605); Spezzaferro in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 15, pp. 34–35; Spike 2001, pp. 111–13, cat. no. 23 (1600–1601); Langdon 2002, p. 300; Vodret in Rome 2003; Boccardo and Magnani 2003; Sgarbi 2005, no. 18 (the faithful adherence to documents is easy . . . but perhaps not obligatory); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (c. 1597–98); Boccardi in Lepri 2006, pp. 87ff. (provenance); Tresoldi 2006, p. 86 (1600); Varriano 2006, pp. 29, 43, 112, fig. 38; Vodret 2006; Merlini and Storti 2008; Strinati in Milan 2008, pp. 31–37 (perhaps he redid the paintings after the death of Cerasi in early May 1601; the heirs of Cerasi were the Confratelli del’Ospedale della Consolazione, where Caravaggio once stayed); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82.

Scholars identify this painting as one of two paintings commissioned from Caravaggio by Monsignor Tiberio Cerasi on September 24, 1600, for his chapel in Santa Maria del Popolo, Rome. The other painting, the *Crucifixion of Saint Peter*, is untraced today. Cf. Catalogue of Lost Works, L.6.

Cerasi died on May 3, 1601, before the construction of his chapel was completed. On November 10, 1601, Caravaggio received a final payment from the Ospedale della Consolazione, Cerasi's beneficiary. It is not clear whether that payment refers to the present painting (and the lost Crucifixion of Saint Peter) or to the two paintings of the same subjects in the chapel today. According to Baglione (1642), Caravaggio's first pair of paintings were rejected by the patron, acquired by Giacomo Sannesio, and replaced by the paintings in situ in the Cerasi Chapel. See cat. no. 24, below.

This *Conversion of Saint Paul* passed through noble collections in Rome and Spain until entering the Balbi collection in Genoa. During the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, guidebooks and travelers to Genoa considered it one of the outstanding paintings in the Palazzo Balbi. The painting suffered a critical eclipse in 1916 when Longhi ascribed it to Orazio Gentileschi. By 1943, Longhi had demoted its author to an anonymous Fleming active around 1620. The process of rehabilitation was initiated in 1947 by Morassi who confirmed its attribution to Caravaggio and proposed it as the first version of the canvas painted for the Cerasi chapel but thereafter rejected, as reported by Baglione.

For most of the twentieth century, the painting was difficult to access and therefore little studied. Since 2001, a series of exhibitions have resolved almost all doubts that it is in fact Caravaggio's first painting for the Cerasi Chapel.

The association with the Cerasi chapel is primarily supported by the fact that the picture is painted on cyprus wood panel instead of canvas. Not only is this support unique in Caravaggio's oeuvre, but cyprus wood was stipulated in Caravaggio's contract of September 24, 1600 for the Cerasi Chapel paintings (see cat. no. 24, Documents). On the other hand, Mancini, another eyewitness, does not write of rejected pictures. The rediscovery of the first version of the *Crucifixion of Saint Peter* would no doubt resolve many of these questions.

See pp. 111–13.

Condition:

The painting was cleaned in November 2006. See conservation report in Merlini and Storti 2008.

Copies:

None recorded.

24. *Cerasi Chapel, Santa Maria del Popolo, Rome, 1600–1601*

24.1 *Conversion of Saint Paul*

Oil on canvas, 93¼ x 68⅞ in. (230 x 175 cm)

24.2 *Crucifixion of Saint Peter*

Oil on canvas, 93¼ x 68⅞ in. (230 x 175 cm)

Provenance:

Commissioned from Caravaggio on September 24, 1600 on the condition of its completion within eight months. The artist received final payment on November 10, 1601, whether for the present paintings or for two earlier versions (see cat. no. 23, and Catalogue of Lost Works, L.6) is as yet uncertain. The paintings are installed at right (*Conversion of Saint Paul*) and left (*Crucifixion of Saint Peter*) of the altar.

Documents:

1. July 8, 1600: Monsignor Tiberio Cerasi, treasurer general of Pope Clement VIII, acquired from the Augustinian fathers of the Congregazione di Lombardia, the chapel at the left of the high altar in Santa Maria del Popolo. ["Concedono detti Padri in nome del detto loro Mon.^{rio} ad sud.o Mon.r Te.Ro G[enerale] Tiberio Cerasi la suddetta Cappella con facoltà et autorità che sua bricarla, alzarla . . ."] (Mahon 1951, pp. 223–34; Macioce 2003, doc. 89, p. 87).

2. September 24, 1600: "Michael Angelo Merisi de Caravaggio . . . egregius in Urbe pictor" contracts with Tiberio Cerasio to paint two pictures on cypress wood, each with a height of

ten Roman palmi and a width of eight palmi, representing the *Conversion of Saint Paul* and the *Martyrdom of Saint Peter*; for delivery within eight months [May 24, 1601], with all figures, persons, and ornaments which seem fit to the painter, to the satisfaction of his Lordship [Cerasi]. The painter was also obliged to submit specimens and designs of the figures and other objects with which according to his invention and genius he intended to beautify the said mystery and martyrdom. This promise the said painter made for a honorarium and price of 400 scudi in cash, . . . [having received] 50 scudi in the form of a money order directed to Vincenzo Giustiniani, merchant operating in Rome, . . .” [“Oblig[ati]o pingendi duo quadra. Die vigesimaquarta men[si]s septembris 1600. D[ominus] Michael Angelus Merisius de Caravaggio Mediolanen[si]s dioc[esis] egregius in Urbe pictor . . . Tiberio Cerasio . . . pingere duo quadra cupressus longitudinis palmor[um] decem et latitudinis octo pro quo[ibet], in altero v[idelicet] misterium conversionis s[anc]torum Pauli, et in alterum martyrium Petri ap[osto]lorum ea[que] infra octo menses prox[im]e futuros ab hodie persolvere et absolutos redere et consignare in manibus ip[s]ius Illustrissimi Domini cum omnibus et quibuscumque figuris, imaginibus et ornamentis ipsi Domino Pictori bene uisis ad satisfactionem tamen D[omi]n[atu]on[is] Suae Illustrissimae cui ipse Pictor teneatur, prout promisit, ante dictarum picturarum confectionem exhibere specimina et design[at]ione[s] figurarum et aliorum, quibus ipse Pictor ex sui Inuent[ion]e et ingenio dicta misterium et martyrium decorare intendit . . . d[ictus] d[ominus] pictor fecit pro mercede et precio scutorum quadringentor[um] m[one]tum ad quor[um] bon[um] computu[m] . . . ab eod[em] ill[ustrissi]mo d[omino] scuta quinquaginta mon[e]te med[ian]te ordine ill[ustrissi]mo d[omino] Vinc[entio] Iust[inia]no merc[ator]i in Urbe negot[ian]ti directo . . .”] (Mahon 1951, pp. 223–34; Macioce 2003, doc. 94, p. 91).

3. May 5, 1601: Rome, “Monsignor Cerasi, having died Wednesday night [May 3] was buried in the very beautiful chapel which he has had made in the Madonna of the Consolation by the hand of the famous painter Michel Angelo da Caravaggio . . .” [“Mercordi notte Monsr. Ceraso, . . . passó all’altra vita, e datoli sepultura nella sua bellissima Capella, che faceva fare nella Madonna della Consolazione, per mano del famosissimo pittore Michel Angelo da Carravaggio . . .”] (Mahon 1951, pp. 223–34; Macioce 2003, doc. 112, p. 104).

4. An inscription on the left wall of the chapel states that Tiberio Cerasi is buried in the chapel that he had constructed and decorated [“In Hoc Sacello al Ipso Obitum Constructo Atque Exornato”].

5. June 2, 1601: Rome, a note in the archives that states, “awaiting the two paintings that Caravaggio is making for the Chapel of Monsignor Ceraseo, Treasurer, deceased. The principal painting in this chapel is by Carracci, all three being excellent and beautiful.” [“. . . attendendosi hora . . . li dua quadri che fà il Caravaggio per la Capella del già Mons.r Ceraseo, Tesauriero. Il quadro Principale in essa Capella di d.o Caraccio, essendo insomma quei tre quadri di tutta l’eccellenza, et bellezza.”] (Macioce 2003, doc. 113, p. 105)

6. November 10, 1601: “Caravaggio received from the Ospedale della Consolazione, Tiberio Cerasi’s beneficiary, fifty *scudi* [of three hundred *scudi*] as final payment for the Cerasi paintings” [“Michel Angelus Marese de Caravaggio, . . . conf[essus fu]it et recepisse, a venerabile hospitali Beate Marie Consolationis herede universale bone memorie reverendissimi domini Tiberii Cerasii . . . scuta quinquaginta monete pro residuo et finali pagamento [scrutorum trecentorum monete per ipsum in pluribus pagamentis receptorum ex pretio . . . Quietantia scutorum 50 per dominum Michelem Angelum de Caravaggio”](Mahon 1951, pp. 227, n. 42; Macioce 2003, doc. 116, p. 106).

7. May 1, 1605: record of payment to a carpenter named Bartolomeo for framing the paintings in the chapel of Monsignor Cerasi in the church of the Popolo [“deve dare adì primo di maggio 1605 quattro scudi e cinquanta baiocchi pagati a Mastro Bartolomeo falegname per aver accomodato gli quadri delle pitture nella Cappella di Monsignor Cerasio nella chiesa del Popolo . . .”] (Macioce 2003, doc. no. 189, p. 161).

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–21 (ed. 1956, I, p. 225): Marciana codex: “[Caravaggio made] . . . the Cerasi Chapel at the Popolo, many paintings in private houses . . . [of Cardinal] Sennesio.” Palatino codex adds: “in the house of Cardinal Sennesio are copies and retouches of those in the Madonna del Popolo, Chapel of Prato [*sic* for Cerasi].” [“. . . al Popolo la Cappella del Cerasi, molti quadri privati in casa . . . [del cardinal] Sennesio” Palatino codex: “che sono copiati e ritoccati da quelli che sono nella Madonna del Popolo nella cappella del Prato . . . (*sic* for Cerasi)”].

2. Celio 1620–24, pp. 46–47 (facsim. ed. 1638 Naples, p. 19): “Santa Maria del Popolo, near the Porta Flaminia . . . the paintings of the altar of the Chapel, the upper part, the first being in oil, the second in fresco, by Annibale Caracci. The two oil paintings on the lateral walls with the acts of Saint Paul are by Michelangelo da Caravaggio, the ceiling fresco is by Giovan Battista da Novara.” [“Santa Maria del Popolo vicino la Porta Flaminia . . . Le pitture dell’altare della Cappella, che segue, & la parte di sopra, la prima ad’olio, la seconda à fresco, di Annibale Caracci. Li due quadri ad olio collaterali, con le attioni di S. Paolo, di Michelangelo da Caravaggio, quelle della sua volta à fresco di Giouan Battista da Novara.”]

3. Baglione 1642, p. 137: “In the Madonna del Popolo at the right of the high altar, in the Cerasi Chapel on the side walls are the *Crucifixion of Peter* and the *Conversion of Saint Paul*. These paintings had first been worked by him in a different manner, but because they did not please the patron, Cardinal Sannesio took them; and Caravaggio made these in oil which one sees now, because he did not work in any other technique.” [“Nella Madonna del Popolo a man diritta dell’altar maggiore dentro la cappella de’Signori Cerasi sú i lati del muro sono di sua mano la Crocifissione di s. Pietro; e di rincontro la Conversione di s. Paolo. Questi quadri prima furono lavorati da lui in un’altra maniera, ma perchè non piacquero al padrone se li prese il Cardinale Sannesio; e lo stesso Caravaggio vi fece questi che hora si vedono, a olio dipinti, poichè egli non operava in altra maniera.”]

4. Pacheco 1638 (ed. 1933, p. 169).

5. Scannelli 1657, p. 197, “In the Church of the Madonna del Popolo, in the chapel to the right of the high altar, are two paintings, one of the *Crucifixion of Saint Peter* and the other the *Conversion of Saint Paul*; the painting in the middle is by Annibale Carracci.” [“Nella Chiesa della Madonna del Popolo, nella Cappella della parte destra della Maggiore vi sono due Quadri dalle bande, l’uno con l’historia della Crocifissione di S.Pietro, e l’altro della Conversione di S. Paolo, essendo la Tavola de mezo d’Annibale Caracci.”]

6. Bellori 1672, (ed. 1976, pp. 221–22): “In the Church of the Madonna del Popolo, in the Chapel of the Assumption painted by Annibale Caracci, the two lateral paintings are by Caravaggio, the *Crucifixion of Saint Peter*, and the *Conversion of Saint Paul*, which lacks any action.” [“Nella Chiesa della Madonna del Popolo, entro la Cappella dell’Assunta dipinta da

Annibale Carracci, sono di mano del Caravaggio li due quadri laterali, la Crocifissione di San Pietro, e la Conversione di San Paolo, la quale istoria è affatto senza azione.”]

7. von Sandrart 1675 p. 189: “He painted also for the church of the Madonna del Popolo, in a chapel, the crucifixion of Saint Peter and also the fall of Saint Paul from his horse in the act of being raised, the horse is spotted and seems alive” (Macioce 2003, p. 321).

8. Dézailler D’Argenville 1745 (ed. 1951, pp. 47).

Exhibitions:

Rome 2003; Rome 2006; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1913, p. 162 (datable 1600–1601 from the donor’s tomb inscription on the chapel floor); Marangoni 1922, nos. XXIV–XXV; Voss 1924, p. 79, pl. 20, 21 (executed after Contarelli Chapel); Longhi 1927, p. 10; Pevsner 1927–28, p. 329 (after Contarelli Chapel); Longhi 1928–29, pp. 17, 26, 31–32, 274 (1600); Schudt 1942, no. 29–30; Arslan 1951, p. 449 (1600–1601, before Contarelli Chapel); Berenson 1951, pp. 23–25, 37, 85 (“We are to interpret this charade as the conversion of Paul. Nothing more incongruous than the importance given to horse over rider, to dumb beast over saint. . . . But for the noble Titianesque head of [Saint Peter], the rest is a study in the raising of a heavy weight without the aid of machinery.”); Hess 1951, p. 201; Longhi in Milan 1951, nos. 26–27; Mahon 1951, pp. 226–27, 234 (publishes contract; Cerasi Chapel comprises “middle group” of paintings prior to Contarelli Chapel); Venturi 1951, no. 24–25; Longhi 1952, nos. XXVI–XXVII; Mahon 1952, pp. 7, 19 (1601); Hinks 1953, no. 33–34; Baumgart 1955, pp. 183–86, nos. 36–37 (more concentrated and simplified); Chastel 1956, pp. 964–65 (1600–1606); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 183–86, nos. 24C–24D; Wagner 1958, pp. 97, 102, 115, 131–34; Wittkower 1958, pp. 24–28; Arslan 1959, pp. 206, 209; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 94, 158, 164–65, 279, 294 (after Contarelli Chapel); Steinberg 1959, pp. 183–90; Jullian 1961, pp. 92–93, 99–100, 110–17, 119–24, 127–36 (1600–1601, *Crucifixion* executed first); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 46–47 (1600–1601); Kitson 1969, no. 44–45 (evidence in favor of rejection of two first versions is these are on canvas, while contract stipulates cyprus

wood); Moir 1969, pp. 355–56, 370–71; Röttgen 1969, pp. 164–65, 169–70; Fagiolo Dell’Arco 1969, p. 53; Müller Hofstede 1970, pp. 95–96; Salerno 1970, p. 237; Baccheschi 1971, no. 33A; Calvesi 1971, pp. 116–17, 121, 136–37, 140–41; Cinotti 1971, pp. 66, 115–17, 123–27, 151; Pepper 1971, pp. 325–44; Frommel 1972, pp. 26–30, 44; Marini 1974, pp. 31–32, 168–69, 390–91, n. 41 (1600–1601: same time as *Martyrdom of Saint Matthew* [cat. no. 22.1]); Röttgen 1974, pp. 63–68, 71, 116–17, 123; Bentivoglio–Valtieri 1976 (research on the church); Moir 1976, p. 91 no. 23; Nicolson 1979, pp. 33; Magnuson 1982, pp. 87; Moir 1982, p. 106 (1601–2, *Crucifixion* precedes *Conversion*); Marini 1978/79, p. 74, n. 1; Moir 1982, p. 108; Cinotti 1983, no. 62A–B; Hibbard 1983, pp. 126, 132, 137, 301–2 (1600–1601, *Crucifixion* after *Conversion*); Spike 1983, p. 40; Calvesi 1986, p. 44 (1601); Chorpenning 1987, pp. 49–58; Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 30–31 (still Renaissance spatial concept, not expansive Baroque); Marini 1989, pp. 449–51, nos. 44–45 (Rome 1600–1601); Bologna 1992, pp. 47–54, 317 (1600–1601); Gregori 1994, pp. 88, 96, 149, nos. 33, 34 (1600–1601, *Crucifixion* first); Askew in Macioce 1996, pp. 250–51; Gilbert 1995, pp. 70–71, 81, 87, 128, 150–51, 187–89; Langdon 1998, pp. 5, 187–88, 219, 222, 281; Puglisi 1998, nos. 32, 33 (1600–1601); Robb 1998, p. 506 (1601); Varriano in Mormando 1999, pp. 192–203, fig. 20 (1600–1601); Bernardini 2001, pp. 87–100; Brown in London-Rome 2001, pp. 250–54; Spezzaferro 2001, pp. 9–48; Spezzaferro in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 15, pp. 34–35; Spike 2001, pp. 100–101, 105–13, cat. nos. 24.1 and 24.2 (1600–1601); Tantillo 2001, pp. 56–57 (Caravaggio, not his patron, replaced his first paintings; the paintings in situ were completed shortly before the payment to the framer on May 1, 1605); Langdon 2002, p. 300; Perini 2002, pp. 303–12; Vodret 2003; Sgarbi 2005, nos. 32 (*Crucifixion of Peter*), 33 (*Conversion of Paul*) (consigned after November 10, 1601); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 27–28 (1600–1601); Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 186; Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 9, fig. 5; Tresoldi 2006, pp. 87, 88 (1600–1601); Varriano 2006, pp. 8, 43, 74, 112, fig. 37; Vodret 2006; Jones 2008; Merlini and Storti 2008; Papa 2008, pp. 106–11 (1600–1601); Strinati in Milan 2008 pp. 31–37 (perhaps he redid the paintings after the death of Cerasi in early May 1601; the heirs of Cerasi were the Confratelli del’Ospedale della Consolazione, where Caravaggio once stayed); Pellini in Rome 2009, pp. 130–33.

In September 1600, Tiberio Cerasi engaged Caravaggio to execute two paintings for the side walls of a chapel he had recently acquired on the left of the high altar of Santa Maria del Popolo, Rome. Annibale Carracci had been commissioned to paint the *Assumption of the*

Virgin for the chapel altar. Caravaggio had just completed the lateral paintings in San Luigi dei Francesi, and his contract recognized his new success, calling him *Egregius in Urbe Pictor* [“distinguished painter of Rome”].

Mancini, Baglione, and Bellori do not omit to mention these prominent works by Caravaggio, but they seem not to share the high esteem in which they are held today. Baglione relates that Caravaggio’s first renditions of the *Crucifixion of Saint Peter* and *Conversion of Saint Paul* did not please the patron and a scandal was only avoided because of their acquisition by Cardinal Sannesio. Baglione could only rue Caravaggio’s incredible luck. Even granting that the Balbi *Conversion of Saint Paul* (cat. no. 23) represents a trial run at the subject, an alternative construction of events could be that the cyprus panel support was deemed unfeasible and it was decided to modify the commission terms to allow for canvas. Carracci’s altarpiece is painted on canvas, which reflects light much differently than does a wooden support. Strinati (Milan 2008) points out that the death of Tiberio Cerasi in early May 1601 would have been a likely or possible juncture at which time Caravaggio could have painted two replacement canvases of the original cyprus panels.

Whatever the process of creative germination, the *Crucifixion of Saint Peter* and *Conversion of Saint Paul* as finally realized exemplify the artist’s achievement of a mature style based on nature and stripped of Mannerist artifice. The contrast could not be more marked between the physical work illustrated in the *Crucifixion of Saint Peter* and Annibale Carracci’s adjacent depiction of the angels’ effortless transport of the *Virgin* heavenward. How Nature works and how things can be set into motion were the issues which modern science was just then attempting to liberate from theology. Caravaggio was a member of a household where the laws of physical science had been continuously discussed for twenty years. For Galileo, another Del Monte protégé, any true explanation had to include a mechanical model or representation of the phenomenon. Caravaggio makes the crucifixion happen with theatrical vividness. Strenuously laboring men lift the cross with three different means of leverage. By drawing the viewer’s attention to the work of martyrdom in contradistinction to the weightless ascent of Carracci’s angels, Caravaggio is not proposing a criticism: he is underscoring the physicality of taking a life. On the opposite wall, he represents the very different spiritual conversion of Saint Paul. Caravaggio’s blinded soldier beholds an internal vision, his eyes closed, and

therefore taking place within his heart and mind. Like the innkeeper in the paintings of the Emmaus miracle, neither the attendant who leads away Paul's oblivious steed, nor we the viewers, see what the apostle sees: eternal life.

See pp. 100–101, 105–13.

Copies:

I. One copy is recorded of the *Conversion of Saint Paul* (24.1):

C.1

By Vincenzo Camuccini (now lost)

Bibliography:

Falconieri 1875, p. 31; Moir 1976, p. 92 no. 23b; Spike 2001, cat. no. 24.1.I.c (lost copy).

II. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies of the *Crucifixion of Saint Peter* (24.2):

C.2

Paris, Philippe de Béthune Inventory, November 19, 1608: “Item a large painting, original by Michel Lange de Caravage, representing the Crucifixion of Saint Peter, in a gilt frame, valued at 250 livres” (Babelon 1988, pp. 33–38; Spike 2001, Catalogue of Lost Works L.56).

C.3

Seville, church of San Pedro: Pacheco 1638 (ed. 1956, p. 13) refers to a copy in this church. Longhi 1927, p. 10 (*Opere complete* 1967 II, pp. 123–24) reports that this excellent copy had since been transferred to another church. Cf. Moir 1976, p. 93 no. 24r; Cinotti 1983, p. 537.

III. Selected copies of the *Crucifixion of Saint Peter* (24.2). Bibliography for the copies: Numerous copies are listed by Moir 1976, pp. 92–94 no. 24; Cinotti 1983, p. 560. Among these are:

C.4

Valencia, Spain, Real Colegio del Corpus Christi

Oil on canvas, 75⁵/₈ x 68¹/₂ in. (192 x 174 cm)

Provenance:

Ainaud 1947 identified this work, attributed to Ribalta, with a reference by Pacheco 1638, p. 89.

Exhibitions:

Bilbao-Seville 2005, cat. no. 23; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 31.

Bibliography:

Moir 1976, p. 93, no. 24k (as 170 x 235 cm, by Ribalta?); Spike 2001, cat. no. 24.2.c.4 (copy); Bilbao-Seville 2005, pp. 174–75; Hartje in Düsseldorf, 2006 pp. 240–41, cat. no. 31 (as copy 1600–1611).

C.5

Valencia, Spain, Diocesan Museum

Oil on canvas, 77¹/₄ x 74⁷/₈ in. (196 x 190 cm)

Transferred from the chapel of San Pedro in the cathedral, 1936.

Bibliography:

Ainaud 1947 identified this work with a reference by Pacheco 1638, p. 383. Cf. Moir 1976, p. 93 no. 24.l.; Spike 2001, cat. no. 24.c.4 (copy).

C.6

Drawings Cabinet, National Gallery, Oslo

Drawing, pen, brown ink, and wash, 15 x 10 ½ in. (38 x 26.5 cm)

Signed and dated 1616 Gerhard van Honthorst

Bibliography:

Friedlaender 1955, p. 186, fig. 101A; Moir 1976, p. 92 no. 24c; Nicolson 1979, p. 81 (Honthorst); Cinotti 1983, p. 537; Spike 2001, cat. no. 24.c.6 (copy); Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 186, fig. 82.

25. *Supper at Emmaus*, 1601

Oil on canvas, 55½ x 77⅞ in. (141 x 196.2 cm)

National Gallery, London, inv. 172

At lower right: NI

Provenance:

Painted for Ciriaco Mattei, Rome, 1601; Villa Borghese, Rome by 1650; Palazzo Borghese in Campo Marzio by 1693, where it remained at least until 1798; sold by Principe Camillo Borghese, husband of Paolina Bonaparte, to Mr. Durand, Parisian antiquary, in 1801; Lord George Vernon, London by 1831; sale Christie's London April 16, 1831, n. 35 (anonymous, unsold at 115 guineas); acquired by the National Gallery in 1839.

Inventories:

1. April 7, 1693: Inventory of Palazzo Borghese, in Campo Marzio, "Room v, n. 28: a large painting with the Supper at Emmaus in canvas n. 1, with a carved and gilt frame by Caravaggio" [" . . un quadro grande con la Cena di Emaus in tela del n. 1 con cornice intagliata e dorata del Caravaggio"] (Della Pergola, p. 453; according to Gregori 1985, p. 276, this number is still visible in lower right-hand corner of painting).

2. 1790: Inventory of palazzo Borghese (de Rinaldis 1937, with date of 1760 corrected in Della Pergola 1955, I, p. 157 n. 48).

Document:

1. Book of accounts of Ciriaco Mattei, Archivio Mattei, January 7, 1602: “One hundred fifty scudi . . . paid to Romolo Rizivene without receipt to give to Michel Angelo da Caravaggio for a painting of Our Lord in the Breaking of the Bread” [“sc. cento cinquantadi mo.ta di iulij . . . per tanti pagati a ms Romolo Rizivene senza ricevuta per darli a Michel Angelo da Caravaggio pittore per il quadro de N[ostro] S[ignore] in fractione panis”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990, p. 235 [erroneous transcription “i padrone” for “in fractione panis”]; Cappelletti–Testa 1994, p. 104 [corrected]; Testa in Rome 1995, p. 118).

Sources:

1. Celio 1620–24 (1638 ed., p. 134; 1967 ed. pp. 101–2): Among the paintings in the Mattei palace, “that of Emmaus, . . . an oil by Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“quella di Emaus . . . ad olio di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”] (Marini 1989, no. 32; Cappelletti–Testa 1990, p. 234).

2. Baglione 1642, p. 137: Ciriaco Mattei was likewise seduced by the clamor; for him Caravaggio had painted a *Saint John the Baptist* and *Our Lord when went He went to Emmaus*, and then a scene of Thomas touching with his finger the wound in the side of the Lord, thus did Caravaggio relieve this gentleman of many hundreds of scudi” [“anche il signor Signor Ciriaco Mattei, a cui il Caravaggio havea dipinto un s. Gio Battista e quando N. Signore andò in Emmaus e all’ora che s. Thommaso toccò col dito il costato del Salvatore; e intaccò quel Signore di molte centinaia di scudi”].

3. Manilli 1650, p. 88: cites the painting in the Villa Borghese, Rome.

4. Possibly a *Supper at Emmaus* referred to by Jusepe Martinez c. 1650, although he could not remember where saw it, “Christ had common features of a workshop apprentice and the disciples were painted with such little decency that it may be said that they look like a couple of knaves” (Gregori 1985, no. 78).

5. Scannelli 1657, pp. 198–99: “One still sees in the galleries paintings of tremendous naturalness and in particular a rather large canvas, in the Palazzo Borghese, that shows Christ at the table with two Pilgrims” [“Si vedono ancora nelle Gallerie Quadri di tremenda naturalezza, ed in particolare nel Palazzo de’ Borghesi uno assai grande, che dimostra Christo a tavola con i due Pellegrini”].

6. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 223): “For the Massimi he painted an Ecce Homo that was carried to Spain and for the Marchese Patrizi a Supper at Emmaus in which there is a Christ in the center who blesses the bread, and one of the seated apostles recognizes him and opens his arms while the other apostle rests his hands on the table and stares at Him in wonderment. Behind stands the innkeeper with a cap on his head and an old woman carrying food. [Milan, Brera] For Cardinal Scipione Borghese, he painted a somewhat different version; the first one is in deeper tones, but both are praiseworthy for their imitation of natural color even though they lack decorum. For Michele’s work often degenerated into low and vulgar forms.” [“Alli Signori Massimi colorí un Ecce Homo che fu portato in Ispagna ed al marchese Patrizi la Cena in Emaus, nella quale vi è Cristo in mezzo che benedice il pane, ed uno de gli apostoli a sedere nel riconoscerlo apre le braccia e l’altro ferma le mani su la mensa e lo riguarda con meraviglia: evvi dietro l’oste con la cuffia in capo, ed una vecchia, che porta le vivande.” [Milan, Brera] Un’altra di queste invenzioni dipinse per lo cardinale Scipione Borghese, alquanto differente; la prima più tinta, e l’una e l’altra alla lode dell’imitazione del colore naturale; se bene mancano nella parte del decoro, degenerando spesso Michele nelle forme umili e vulgari.”]; (ed. 1976, p. 231): “In the Supper at Emmaus, besides the rustic characters of the two Apostles, the Lord appears young and beardless, the innkeeper who serves has a cap on his head and on the table there is a plate of grapes, figs, and pomegranates out of season.” [“Nella Cena in Emaus, oltre le forme rustiche delli due Apostoli e del Signore figurato giovine senza barba, vi assiste l’oste con la cuffia in capo, e nella mensa vi è un piatto d’uve, fichi, melagrane, fuori di stagione.”]

7. Montelatici 1700, p. 221, as in Villa Borghese.

8. von Ramdohr 1787, I, p. 299, as in Palazzo Borghese.

9. Lanzi 1795–96 ([1809] ed. 1968, I, p. 359).

Exhibitions:

New York-Naples 1985, no. 78; Rome 1995, no. 1; Cremona-New York 2004; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 2; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 38; Milan 2009, cat no. 3.

Bibliography:

Kallab 1906, p. 289; Venturi 1910, pp. 199–200 (not before 1605; compares as later development of Master different from earliest still-life studies, such as the Ambrosiana, cat. no. 11); Marangoni 1922 [1953 ed., p. 139]; Voss 1942, pp. 78–79, pl. 18; Longhi 1928/29, pp. 30–32; de Rinaldis 1937, p. 226; Schudt 1942, no. 41 (identifies painting with both Borghese and Mattei references); Longhi 1943, pp. 12, 15 (1594); Ainaud 1947, p. 371; Arslan 1951, p. 448; Berenson 1951, pp. 26, 56–58; Mahon 1951, pp. 228, 234 (1599–1600); Mahon 1951², pp. 286–92; Baroni 1951 (1594–95); Venturi 1951, no. 22 (Borghese and Mattei provenance, 1597–1600, based on Baglione); Baumgart 1952, p. 106; Longhi 1952, p. 24; Mahon 1952, pp. 8, 19 (1599–1600); Samek Ludovici 1952; Hinks 1953, no. 21 (Borghese and Mattei provenance, late 1590s, close to *Saint Thomas*); Friedlaender 1954, pp. 149–50; Baumgart 1955, no. 25; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 164–68, no. 18A (rejects Mattei provenance, late 1590s); Chastel 1956, p. 960 (responds to “grand manner of the Carracci”); Della Pergola 1957, p. 136; Salerno 1957 [ed. Mancini, II, pp. 122–23, n. 890] (identifies painting with both Borghese and Mattei references); Wagner 1958, pp. 86–87 (Borghese and Mattei provenance); Wittkower 1958, pp. 23–25; Arslan 1959, pp. 202, 204; Jullian 1961, pp. 95, 101 (1598–1600); Della Pergola 1964, p. 455 n. 261; Levey 1964 (1601–2); Röttgen 1965, pp. 62–64 (1601–2); Kinkead 1966, pp. 112–14; Moir 1967, I, pp. 20, 189–91, II, p. 57; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 37 (1596–98); Kitson 1969, no. 47 (cites Röttgen, dating to 1602); Salerno 1970, pp. 237, 241; Spear 1971, pp. 8, 10, 90–91; Frommel 1972, pp. 9 n. 31, 20 (rejects Mattei references as applicable to this picture); Levey 1971, pp. 49–53 (rejects Mattei references as applicable to this picture); Greaves–Johnson 1974, pp. 568–71; Marini 1974 pp. 136–40, 374–75 n. 30 (Baglione refers to different picture, *Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew* [cat. no. 78]); Nicolson 1974, p. 560; Potterton 1975, no. 3; Moir 1976, pp. 87–88, no. 17 (rejects Mattei references as applicable to this picture); Scribner 1977, pp. 375–82; Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Cinotti 1983, no. 25; Marini 1981, p. 366 (1599); Magnuson 1982, p. 88 (1602, same time as Cerasi pictures); Marini 1982, p. 77 (1599, from the Mattei collection); Moir 1982, p. 102 (1600–1601); Cinotti 1983, no. 25 (at p. 450: problem with Mattei and Borghese references: painting does not

appear in inventories of Antici–Mattei di Recanti; Celio 1638 refers to the painting as in the Mattei collection at that date, but Cardinal Borghese had to have acquired painting not long after its execution in 1602/3); Gregori 1985, no. 78 (1601–2, no pentimenti; use of tempera over still-wet oil on tablecloth as in Detroit); Christiansen 1986, p. 438 (a single incision); Cottino 1989, p. 671 (1601–2); Marini 1989, pp. 416–18, no. 32 (Rome, 1598–99); Cappelletti–Testa 1990, pp. 234–35 (Mattei payment, 1602); Cappelletti–Testa 1990², p. 5; Christiansen 1990², pp. 21–26 (densely painted surface, almost no pentimenti); Bologna 1992, pp. 42–43, 79, 181–83, 291–93, 306 (1595–96); Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 40–41, 104–5, 153 (1601, not mentioned in Mattei inventories of 1616 or subsequent); Gregori 1994, p. 149, no. 35 (1601); Askew in Macioce 1996, pp. 251–52; Gilbert 1995, pp. 37, 40, 42, 100, 107, 141–51, 153, 174; Spike in Macioce 1996, p. 215; Schröter 1995, pp. 62–87; Testa in Rome 1995, no. 1 (“datable with certainty to 1601”); Finaldi in London 1998 (1601, for Ciriaco Mattei); Langdon 1998, pp. 72–73, 230–34; Puglisi 1998, no. 34 (1601); Robb 1998, p. 506 (1601); Varriano in Mormando 1999, pp. 192–203, fig. 21 (1600–1601); Spike 2001, pp. 115–18, no. 25 (1601); Christiansen in Bayer 2004, pp. 171–72 (1601); Carr in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 100–103, cat. no. 2; Lapucci 2005, p. 36, fig. 5; Sgarbi 2005, no. 31 (after Contarelli Chapel, relying on document dated January 7, 1602); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (1598–99); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 38, pp. 160–62 (c. 1601); Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, pp. 187–88; Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 17; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 109–10; Tresoldi 2006, p. 89 (1601); Varriano 2006, pp. 1, 2, 13–14, 40, 106, 112, 119, 120, 124–25, fig. 7; Gash 2007, p. 107; Pichler in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 9–33; Papa 2008, pp. 139–45 (1601); Gregori in Milan 2009, pp. 29–37, 54; Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82.

Caravaggio’s *Supper at Emmaus* represents Christ’s first appearance after the Resurrection as a prefiguration of the Last Judgment. The three motifs singled out by Bellori as inappropriate to Emmaus are instead references to judgment and salvation. Christ is young and beardless as Michelangelo Buonarroti showed him in the Last Judgment in the Sistine Chapel. The innkeeper does not remove his hat because, unlike the astonished disciples, he does not yet recognize the Christ. The “grapes, figs, and pomegranates out of season” evoke the basket of summer fruits invoked by the prophet Amos (8:1–3) as a symbol of the coming Judgment. Caravaggio confirms the connection by copying Michelangelo’s mighty gestures: instead of breaking or blessing the bread as related in the Emmaus story, Christ raises his right hand in benediction. His left hand is over two symbols of the flesh and repeats the forbidding gesture of Michelangelo’s Christ the Judge.

This celebrated picture was executed for Ciriaco Mattei, whose payment of 150 scudi on January 7, 1602, was recently discovered by Cappelletti and Testa (1990). As the picture is not cited in any Mattei inventories, it must have been acquired relatively soon afterwards by Cardinal Scipione Borghese in whose collection it is recorded by 1650. Scholars had previously questioned the Mattei provenance while generally agreeing on a date in or around 1601, as has now been documented.

A number of good old copies of this painting are known, some of which are presumably identifiable with early inventories. Caravaggio's paintings for Ciriaco Mattei, which included the *Saint John the Baptist* (Capitolina, cat. no. 29), the *Taking of Christ* (cat. no. 30), and *Doubting Thomas* (cat. no. 33), are among the most copied in his career.

See pp. 115–18.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies, which may refer to either this version of the subject or the one now in Milan (cat. no. 50):

C.1

Rome, Doria Pamphili

1606–1638: Inventory Archivio Doria Pamphilj, Fondo Aldobrandini (Rome 30, 96): “1. The miracle that Our Lord made in Emmaus before two disciples by Michelagnolo da Caravagio” (Cappelletti 1998, pp. 341–42; Spike 2001, cat. no.25.c.1).

C.2

Paris, Philippe de Béthune, November 19, 1608: Inventory of the collection, “a large painting original by Michel Lange representing the pilgrimage of Our Lord to Emmaus found between two apostles, . . . price 250 livres.”

The painting remained in the collection of Béthune's heirs at least until 1680 (Babelon 1988, pp. 33–38; Spike 2001, cat. no.25.c.2; catalogue of Lost Works, cat. L.57; “Delight at Caravaggio discovery,” *BBC News, Europe*, January 25, 2006; *Les Caravagge de Philippe de Béthune . . .* 2009).

In January of 2006, it was announced by art historian José Frèches that a version of this composition bearing the coat of arms of Philippe de Béthune was hanging in the Church of Sant Antoine in the town of Loches-en-touraine, France. The face of Christ has different features and is bearded. The picture thus corresponds to the Sabin copy that appeared at auction at Sotheby's New York (see c.7, and the Fatoure engraving, c.5). To judge from the Sotheby's photograph, the work appears to be a copy by the same hand as the painter of the *Doubling Thomas* (cat. no. 33.c.3).

C.3

Rome, collection of Ottavio Costa (see cat. no. 50, below for inventory references to a copy assumed to be after the Brera *Emmaus*).

January 18–23, 1639: Inventory of the objects in the house of Ottavio Costa, Rome, at his death: an unattributed “large painting of when our Lord revealed himself to the two disciples” (Gregori 1985, pp. 308, 310; Spezzaferro 1975, p. 116 [as copy]; Spike 2001, cat. no. 25.c.3 [copy]; Costa Restagno 2004, no. 74, p. 100; Terzachi 2007, pp. 290–95).

C.4

Castello di Gallese, Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps

A. A copy is cited in inventory of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps Castello di Gallese:

October 15, 1620: “A Christ in Emmaus with two disciples and a Host 10 palmi long with a black gilt frame 60” [“Un Xpo in Emaus con doi discepoli et un Hoste di palmi 10 longo con cornice nera rabescata d'oro 60”].

The manuscript in the Newberry Library of this inventory states: “A painting of Our Lord who appears to the two disciples by Bartolomeo with a gilt frame” [“Un quadro di N.ro S.re che appare alli doi discepoli di Bartolomeo con cornice rabescata d'oro”] (Macioce 2003, p. 345).

C.5

Engraving, 12 x 8 in. (30.1 x 20 cm)

By Pierre Fatoure (1584–1629)

Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris, Bd. 8, no. 16; Albertina, Vienna, HB XIV 152/247

Bibliography:

Spike 2001, cat. no. 25.c.4; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 187, fig. 85; Gash 2007, p. 107.

In this engraving Christ is bearded, as Christ appears in the copy formerly belonging to Philippe de Béthune, Paris, see Spike comment at cat. no. 25.c.2 above.

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, pp. 87–88, nos. 17a–17n; Marini, 1974, p. 310; 1983, p. 145, figs. 62, 64; and Cinotti 1983, p. 450. Among these are:

C.6

Drawing, pen, ink, and wash (lost), 6¾ x 4⅝ in. (17.2 x 11.8 cm)

By Fragonard, who was in Rome 1756–61

Aquatint of 1771 in reverse, by abbot of Saint-Non

Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris, Bd. 8, no. 17

Bibliography:

Friedlaender 1955, p. 167 (of painting in Galleria Borghese); Moir 1976, p. 88 nos. 17c, 17e; Cinotti 1983, p. 450; Spike 2001, cat. no. 25.c.5.

C.7

Castel Gandolfo, Italy, Papal Palace

Dimensions unknown

Bibliography:

Moir 1976, no. 17h; Cinotti 1983, p. 450; Spike 2001, cat. no. 25.c.6.

C.8

Sotheby's New York

Sale January 28, 2005

Oil on canvas, 55 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 79 $\frac{1}{4}$ in. (140 x 178.4 cm)

Provenance:

Netherlands Gallery, London, by 1922; London, Frank T. Sabin Gallery [with dimensions 55 $\frac{1}{2}$ x 77 in. (141 x 196 cm)]; sold c. 1955 to Central Picture Galleries, New York (as Caravaggio); sold December 2, 1958 to Marc and Lillian Rojzman.

Bibliography:

Friedlaender 1955, p. 167 (as copy); Morassi 1958 (anonymous, Spanish, source for Fatoure's print I.c.5 above, bearded Christ); Moir 1976, p. 88 no. 17j (attributed to J. B. Del Maino, Spanish, present in Italy in 1611); Cinotti 1983, p. 450 (denies a claimed Borghese provenance, not in inventories); Spike 2001, cat. no. 25.c.7 (as copy).

The face of Christ has different features and is bearded. The picture thus corresponds to the version discovered by art historian José Frèches bearing the coat of arms of Philippe de Béthune and hanging in the Church of Sant Antoine in the town of Loches-en-touraine, France. See Spike comments above at cat. no. 25.c.2 and 25.c.5.

C.9

New York, private collection

Oil on canvas, 56 $\frac{1}{4}$ x 78 $\frac{5}{8}$ in. (143 x 199.4 cm)

Provenance:

By 1922, Ehrich Gallery, New York (with documentation by 1903 in J. Waldron Gillespie, Montecito, Santa Barbara); Christie's London, February 1, 1957, lot 29; W. P. Chrysler collection from whom acquired by the present owner in 1978 (from Düsseldorf 2006, p. 218).

Exhibition:

Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 12.

Bibliography:

Marini 1983, pp. 136–38; Marini 1987, p. 353; Babelon 1988, pp. 34–35, Spike 2001, cat. no. 25.c.8 (copy); Marini 2005, pp. 360, 577, Q-48; Marini in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 218–19, cat. no. 12 (1601).

This excellent early copy does not show traces of the master's own brush, but a contemporary execution cannot be excluded.

C. I O

Palermo, Galleria Regionale della Sicilia, inv. 5210

Oil on canvas, 52 $\frac{7}{8}$ x 80 in. (134 x 203 cm)

Exhibition:

Palermo 2001, cat. no. 7.

Bibliography:

Moir 1976, p. 88, no. 17g; Abbate in Palermo 2001, pp. 123–24, cat. no. 7 (as copy, 1640s).

C. I I

Christie's London (South Kensington)

Sale December 11, 2009, lot 115

Oil on canvas, 50 $\frac{1}{4}$ x 64 in. (127.7 x 162.5 cm)

Christ is beardless as in the painting in the National Gallery, London; no provenance indicated.

26. *Victorious Cupid (Amor Vincit Omnia)*, 1601–2

Oil on canvas, 61½ x 44½ in. (156 x 113 cm)

Gemäldegalerie, Staatliche Museen,
Preussischer Kulturbesitz, Berlin–Dahlem, inv. 369

On reverse a paraphe and the numbers 3, 36, 300, 369, L.378

Provenance:

Painted for Vincenzo Giustiniani, Rome, before 1603; sold with the Giustiniani collection in Paris in 1812 to D'Est and Bonnemaïson; acquired by Kaiser Friedrich Museum, Berlin, 1815.

Inventories:

1. February 9, 1638: Inventory of paintings in the collection of Vincenzo Giustiniani, “In the large gallery of old Paintings . . . n. 9 A painting of a smiling Cupid, in the act of disparaging the world, beneath him diverse instruments, crowns, scepters, and arms, it is famous as the Cupid by Caravaggio, on canvas, 7 palmi high, 5 wide, with a gilt walnut frame” [“Nella stanza grande de quadri antichi . . . n.9 [è riportato] Un quadro con un Amore ridente, in atto di dispregiar il mondo, che tiene sotto con diversi stromenti Corone, Scettri, et armature chiamato per fama il Cupido del Caravaggio dipinto in tela alta pal. 7, larg. 5, con cornice di noce profilata e rabescata d’oro”] (Rome, ASR, Archivio Giustiniani, Busta 10; Salerno 1960, pp. 135 n. 9; Danesi Squarzina 2003, part II, no. 9; Macioce 2003, inventari 28, p. 353).

2. 1793: Inventory of the paintings in the “Appartamento lungo/Quarta Camera”: “Another of 7.5 palmi high, representing Profane Love, with some musical instruments, by Michelangelo di Caravaggio, without frame” [“Altro di palmi 7.5 per alto rappresentante L’Amor profano, con alcuni stromenti musicali, di Michelangelo di Caravaggio, senza cornice”] (Danesi Squarzina in Berlin-Rome 2001, p. 286; Danesi Squarzina 2003, Inventari I, pp. 396–97).

Document:

1. “Baglione showed himself to be my rival and he exhibited another picture that was a Divine

Love that he had made in competition with an Earthly Love by Caravaggio. This Divine Love was dedicated to Cardinal Giustiniani and although the picture did not please as much as that by Michelangelo, the cardinal nevertheless gave Baglione a golden chain” [“Baglione si mostrò mio concorrente et ne mise uno altro all’incontro che era un Amor devino, che lui [Baglione] haveva fatto a concorrenza d’un Amor terreno de’ Michelangelo da Caravaggio quale amor devino lui l’haveva dedicato al Cardinale Giustiniano et se benedetto quadro non piacque quanto quello de Michelangelo non dimeno per quanto s’intese esso Cardinale gli donò una collana”] (Rome, ASR, Tribunale del Governatore, Processi, sec. XVII, col 28, bis, cc. 401v–406r).

Both paid for their works, although Caravaggio’s was preferred (Posse 1909, Cat. Kaiser Friedrich Museum, Berlin, n. 369; Voss 1922).

Sources:

1. Gaspare Mutola (*Rime*, Venice 1604) dedicates three madrigals, nos. 468–70, to “L’Amore. Pittura del Caravaggio.” The connection between these madrigals and this painting was rightly questioned by Enggass (1967) who noted that in the madrigals Cupid is described as blindfolded (“*cieco*”).
2. Milesi 1606 c. 15r (ed. 1980, p. 76) wrote an epigraph dedicated to this painting, as *Omnia vinci Amor* [“De Mich(aele) Ang(el)o de Caravagio, q(ui) / Amorem o(mn)ia subigentem pinxit. / Omnia vincit Amor, tu pictor, et omnia vincis / Silicet ille animos, corpora, tuque animos”] (Fulco 1980, p. 76; Macioce 2003, II doc. 403, p. 264, dates this document “before July 18, 1610” because it is published together with an epigraph of Caravaggio’s death).
3. Baglione 1642, p. 137: “Caravaggio made for the Marchese Giustiniani a seated Cupid, portrayed from life, so well colored that he became unreasonably enchanted by the works of Caravaggio.” [“Per il Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani fece un Cupido a sedere dal naturale ritratto ben colorito si, che egli dell’opera del Caravaggio fuor de’ termini invaghissi . . .”]
4. Scanelli 1657, p. 199: “It would not be possible to paint flesh more true to life than the little cupid owned by Prince Giustiniani, which among the private paintings by Michelangelo

is perhaps the most worthy.” [“. . . non potria dimostrare più vera carne quando fosse vivo, siccome l'Amoretto che si ritrova appresso al Prencipe Giustiniani, che frà i dipinti privati di Michelangelo da Caravaggio sará forsi il più degno. . . .”]

5. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 220): “Along with the half-figures belonging to the Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani . . . Caravaggio painted a *Victorious Love* with an arrow raised in his right hand, and arms, books, and other objects as trophies lying at his feet.” [“Appresso le quali mezze figure colorí un Amore vincitore, che con la destra solleva lo strale, ed a’ suoi piedi giacciono in terra armi, libri, ed altri stromenti per trofeo.”]

6. Silos 1673, p. 91 Epigramma CXLIV: Most celebrated Cupid/laughing with crowns/& arms below./By the same Caravaggio for Prince Giustiniani” [“Cupido Celebratissimus / ridet, & coronas calcat, / & arma. / Eiusdem Caravagij apud eundem Principem Iustinianum”].

7. von Sandrart 1675, p. 190 (Sandrart was a guest of Marchese Giustiniani 1629–35, as quoted in Enggass 1967, p. 13): “Caravaggio painted for the Marchese Giustiniani a life-size Cupid as a boy of about 12 years old, seated on a globe, and raising his bow in his right hand. On his left are various mathematical instruments and books on which is placed a laurel wreath : the Cupid has the wings of a large brown eagle. Everything is accurately and clearly designed with bright colors and a three-dimensionality that approximates reality. This painting was among 120 others by the most celebrated artists in a gallery that was open to the public. And, at my suggestion, was covered with a curtain of dark green silk, and was shown last, to avoid eclipsing the other works.” Sandrart added that Giustiniani refused an offer of a “a thousand pistoli” and “the fame of artistic perfection of this painting allowed Caravaggio to obtain his release and walk the streets freely.” [“Per il padre della nostra arte, il Marchese Giustiniani, dipinse anche un Cupido a grandezza naturale, in figura di un ragazzo di circa dodici anni, seduto sul globo terrestre, che tiene nella destra alzato l’arco, nella sinistra vari stumenti matematici e libri sui quali posa una coron d’alloro: Cupido ha come richiede la sua immagine, grandi ali brune d’aquila. Il tutto è dipinto con grande precisione con colori rivelati, nitidezza e rilievo tali da restare poco indietro rispetto alla vita. Questo lavoro, che era conservato assieme ad altri centoventi dei più eccellenti artisti in un unico locale ed era visibile al pubblico, venne dietro mio consiglio coperto con una cortina di seta verde scuro per essere mostrato da ultimo, perchè altrimenti toglieva pregio a tutte le altre rarità, tanto che lo si poteva definire

con buona ragione l'eclissi di tutti gli altri quadri. Esso era piaciuto tanto a un cavaliere di alto rango che questi, in presenza di molti di noi, offrì mille pistole per acquistarlo. . . . e quindi l'affare non fu concluso. E la fama di perfezione artistica di questo così celebre Cupido del marchese Giustiniani guadagnò al pittore anche il vantaggio che gli venne nuovamente permesso di andare in giro liberamente. . . .”] (Macioce 2003, pp. 321–22)

8. Félibien des Avaux 1688 (ed. *Paragone*, 1951, pp.62–63).

Exhibitions:

Florence 1922, cat. XI; U.S.A. 1948–51; Milan 1951, no. 21; Berlin 1980; New York-Naples 1985, no. 79; Rome-Berlin 2001, no. D3; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 33; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 1, fig. 115.

Bibliography:

Vasi 1763 [ed. 1804, p. 348]; Delaroche 1812, n. 97; Langdon 1812, p. 33, pl. 13; Bertolotti 1881, II, p. 62; Kallab 1906–7, p. 289; Voss 1922, pp. 60–64 (c. 1600); Voss 1923, pp. 95–96; Borenius 1925, p. 25; Longhi 1928, p. 32 [1968, p. 95] (1593–95); Schudt 1942, p. 50, no. 44; Arslan 1951, p. 448; Berenson 1951, pp. 31, 36; Mahon 1951, pp. 228, 234 (1599–1600); Venturi 1951, no. 21; Longhi 1952, p. 24 (after Contarelli Chapel); Mahon 1952, pp. 18, 19 (1598–99); Hinks 1953, no. 20 (c. 1598); Hess 1954 [ed. 1967, p. 289]; Baumgart 1955, no. 26; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 182–83, no. 23 (1603, connects to passage in Sandrart which says the painting “allowed Caravaggio to obtain his release” and connects to the legal proceedings of September 23, 1603); Chastel 1956, pp. 963–64 (1600–1606); Wagner 1958, pp. 79–82 (1598–1600); Arslan 1959, p. 202; Jullian 1961, pp. 94–95 (1598–1600); Röttgen 1966 [in 1974, pp. 145–204] (1602); Enggass 1967, pp. 13–20 (1598–99, poems by Murtola do not refer to this picture; calls theme *Omnia vincit Vincentius* and quotes Ficino, “Love is lord and master of all the arts”); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 41; Kitson 1969, no. 46 (cites madrigals of 1603 which suggest it was then a recent work); Longhi 1968, p. 19 (stylistically near *Supper at Emmaus* [cat. no. 25]); Röttgen 1969, pp. 167–68; Salerno 1970, pp. 237, 240–41; Cinotti 1971, p. 162 (1602); Levey 1971, pp. 50–51; Spear 1971, no. 4; Frommel 1972, pp. 47–51 (c. 1602–3); Scherliess 1973, pp. 141–48; Marini 1974, pp. 176–77, 395–96, n. 46 (1602); Bissell 1974, pp. 113–23 (1598–99,

Baglione's *Cupid*, signed & dated 1602, Roma, Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica, Palazzo Barberini, offers likely date for Caravaggio); Röttgen 1974, pp. 67–68, 190, 197, 202, 205; Moir 1976, p. 96 no. 26; Schleier 1978, p. 91 (x-rays reveal some pentimenti); Nicolson 1979, p. 31; Fulco 1980, p. 76; Moir 1982, p. 112 (1601–2); Cinotti 1983, pp. 409–11, no. 1; Cinotti 1983, no. 1; Freedberg 1983, p. 59 (Caravaggio's reaction against sublimated homosexuality of Michelangelo is to unveil the truth); Hibbard 1983, pp. 307–10 (c. 1601–2); Gregori 1985, no. 79 (1602–3), at p. 278: Earthly Love is not Sensual or Bestial Love: “According to Neoplatonic thought . . . the former was the source of inspiration for the arts & virtues, while the latter, as Marsilio Ficino maintained was a sort of madness.”); Calvesi 1986, p. 13 (1602); Christiansen 1986, p. 436; Cottino 1989, pp. 659–76, fig. 784 (c. 1602–3); Marini 1989, pp. 459–61, n. 50 (Rome, 1602); Strinati in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 175; Pacelli 1989–90, pp. 156–62; Posèq 1990², pp. 159–67 (“The title may have been inspired by Virgil's praise of love: ‘Amor defeats all, and we yield to Amor’ [Omnia vincit Amor, et nos cedamus Amori], but the topic of love's total victory also implies a merging of the biblical theme of the vanity of man's earthly endeavours [Vanitas vanitatum et omnia vanitas] in comparison with the ultimate triumph of virtue—with the humanistic concept of love, which, from the time of Dante, was conceived as a supreme agent, controlling man's destiny”; 1602–3); Bologna 1992, p. 315 (1599–1600); Röttgen 1992, p. 20; Posèq 1993, pp. 13–18; Röttgen 1993, p. 326 (dates the exhibition of Baglione's imitation at San Giovanni Decollato to August 29, 1602); Gregori 1994, p. 149, no. 37 (c. 1601–2); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 26 (shortly after 1600); Gilbert 1995, pp. 5, 33, 89–91, 234–35, 240, 253–55, 292–93 n. 41 (1602–3); Schroter 1995, p. 69; Christiansen in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 8–11 (modeled after Saint Bartholomew in Michelangelo's Last Judgment); Papi in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 123–34 (model is Cecco del Caravaggio in works between 1601–4); Rowlands 1996, no. 25 (c. 1601–2); Danesi Squarzina 1997, pp. 783–84; Langdon 1998, pp. 211, 213–20, 230, 258, 271; Puglisi 1998, no. 36 (c. 1601–2); Robb 1998, p. 507 (1602); Brown in London-Rome 2001, pp. 267–70; Danesi Squarzina 2001, pp. 282–86, no. D3 (1601–2); Spike 2001, pp. 102–4, cat. no. 26 (1601–2); Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, pp. 395–97; Preimesberger 2003, pp. 243–60; Marini 2005, cat. no. 54; Sgarbi 2005, no. 35 (c. 1602); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 26–28 (1601–2); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 33, pp. 142–45 (1602); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 1, fig. 115, p. 205 (1602); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 14, 82; Varriano 2006, pp. 21–25, 61–65, 95–97, 106, 122–23, 130, fig. 16; Debono 2007, p. 12 ill.; von Rosen in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente*

2007, pp. 59–85 (for *ignudi* of Michelangelo reference); Papa 2008, p. 36 (1601–2); Eclercy in Frankfurt 2009, pp.19–35.

The *Victorious Cupid* is an allegory of Earthly Love, which, according to the Neoplatonic system of Marsilio Ficino, is the inspiration of each of the laudable intellectual and aristocratic pursuits attributed to Giustiniani in the painting. Ficino's distinctions between earthly, divine, and human (carnal) love were commonplaces in Renaissance thought, repeated in innumerable handbooks and manuals. Gentileschi used the specific title of *Amor Terreno* (Earthly Love) for this painting, when called upon to testify at Caravaggio's libel trial a year later. Despite the resemblance to a *vanitas* composition, almost all of the standard *vanitas* symbols are absent, including the usual references to painting and sculpture, which Giustiniani appreciated but did not practice himself.

The seventeenth-century sources considered the *Victorious Cupid* Caravaggio's outstanding achievement in art. Baglione restricted his praise to its colors while the German Sandrart came straight to the point: the astonishing lifelikeness of the image.

The same writer tells us that the Marchese Giustiniani covered the painting with a green silk curtain so as to enhance the surprise and delight of his visitors. Various interpretations have been proposed for this image which takes its title from an adage famous in antiquity and revived in the Renaissance, *omnia vincit amor*. In consequence of its fame, this *Victorious Cupid* is one of the few in Caravaggio's oeuvre that can be traced to its origins. It is not entirely certain whether some of the poems dedicated to this painting by Milesi and Murtola might refer instead to Caravaggio's lost painting of *Cupid Bound* (see Catalogue of Lost Works L.129).

See text pp. 102–4.

Copies:

None recorded.

27. *Saint Matthew and the Angel*, 1602

Oil on canvas, 87¾ x 72 in. (223 x 183 cm)

Kaiser Friedrich Museum, Berlin (formerly, destroyed 1945) inv. 365

Provenance:

First version of the altarpiece for the Contarelli Chapel, San Luigi dei Francesi, Rome, presumably delivered before Pentecost (May 23, 1602), but rejected; purchased by Vincenzo Giustiniani, in whose inventory of 1638 it appears; sold with the Giustiniani collection in Paris, in 1812; acquired by Kaiser Friedrich Museum, 1815; destroyed by fire in Berlin, 1945.

Inventories:

1. February 9, 1638 (Part II, no. 1): Postmortem inventory of paintings in the collection of Vincenzo Giustiniani, “In the large room of old pictures . . . a large painting of Saint Matthew with an Angel who teaches, full figures, on canvas, about 10 palmi by 8, by Michel Angelo da Caravaggio in a black frame” [“Nella Stanza Grande de Quadri Antichi . . . 1. Un quadro grande di s. Matteo con l’Angelo che l’insegna figure intiere dipinto in tela alto palmi 10 largo plami 8 in circa di mano di Michelang.o da Caravaggio con sua cornice negra”] (Salerno 1960, pp. 102, 135).

2. 1793, I, no. 97: Inventory of the paintings in the Palazzo Giustiniani, Rome: “another of palmi 7.10 high representing S. Mattia di Caravaggio, con cornice come sopra” [“Altro di plami 7.10 per alto rappresentante S. Mattia di Caravaggio, con Cornice come sopra”] (Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, p. 388).

Documents:

1. May 27, 1591: Contract with Giuseppe Cesari d’Arpino, attachment to this contract dated by Röttgen [ed. 1974, p. 20] circa 1592 or 1593: “For the Saint Matthew chapel, on the altar will be a painting of 17 palmi high by 14 which will show the figure of Saint Matthew seated with a book or volume whichever appears best, where he is showing that he’s writing or wanting to write the Gospel, and next to him a standing angel larger than life size in the act

of reasoning or another attitude to this effect.” [“Per la cappella di San Matteo: All’altare sarà un quadro alto palmi dicesette et largo palmi quatordecì di vano nel quale sia depinta la figura di san matteo in sedia con un libro o volume come meglio parera, nel quale mostri o di scrivere o di voler scrivere il vangelio et a canto a lui l’angelo in piedi maggior del naturale in atto che acanto a lui l’angelo in piedi maggior del naturale in atto che paia di ragionare o in altra attitudine a proposito per q[ues]to effetto.”]

2. January 8 and 12, 1602: Payments for the transport of the statue of Saint Matthew from the house of the sculptor Cobaert to the Contarelli Chapel.

3. January 30, 1602: Cobaert is released from the responsibility to sculpt a figure of an angel for his statue of Saint Matthew.

4. February 7, 1602: Contract between Giacomo Crescenzi, executor of the will of Cardinal Contarelli, and Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio for the execution of an altarpiece of *Saint Matthew and the Angel*, with full-length figures, for 150 scudi of which 50 scudi are paid on account, balance on delivery which is to be no later than the following Pentecost [May 23, 1602]. Michelangelo is to furnish all materials, including paints and canvas for the work, except the blue ultramarine, for which the abbot will pay. Should the painting not satisfy the requirements of the Abbot, Michelangelo will bear the expense of replacing the painting with one that does. [“Die septima febr[uar]ii 1602. Ill[ustrissim]us et r[everendissim]us d[ominus] Iacobus abbas Crescentius ad faciend[um] re[m] grata[m] ill[ustri] d[omino] Francisco Contarello nobili gallo totique cong[regatio]ni eccl[esi]e S[anc]ti aloysii nationis Gallorum ex una et mag[nific]us d[ominus] Michael Angelus Marisi de Caravaggio pictor in Urbe partibus ex altera, . . . nella capella di San Mattheo erecta et institutta dalla fel[ice] mem[oria] dell’ill[ustrissim]o signor Car[dinale] Contarello zio del detto sig[no]r Francesco Contarello, un quadro per metterlo et collocarlo in faccia di detta cappella sopra l’altare di quella fra le due colonne in loco della statua di marmoro bianco novamente postavi come hoggi si vede il qual quadro contenga l’effigie et imagine di San Mattheo in actu scribentis Evangelii[um] con l’effigie et imagine ancor d’un angelo a man dritta in actu dictan[di] Evangeuliu[m] et l’un et l’altro con li corpi intieri. It[em] che questo quadro il detto Sig[no]r Michel Angelo lo debba havere finito con tutta perfettione et con quella eccellentia d’artificio che potrà maggiore et così finito et perfetto

consegnarlo et collocarlo nel loco sudetto per tutta Pasqua di pentecoste prossima a venire. Et all'incontro il d[ett]o ill[ustre] sig[no]r Michel Angelo p[raesent]i . . . la somma di scudi cento et cinquanta di m[one]ta a bon conto . . . s[ign]or Michel Angelo debba fornire tutti li colori necessarii, quali debbano essere finissimii et di quella qualità che conviene, et più la tela et telaro et ogn'altra materia che fusse bisogno, ad ogni sua spesa cioè di esso d[ett]o Si[gn]o[r] Michel Angelo, eccettuando però l'azzurro oltramarino il quale dovendosi adoprare et quando sia necessario per la pittura di questo quadro, il d[ett]o Sig[no]r abbate promette di fornirlo del suo proprio oltre li sudetti scudi centocinquanta. . . . It[em] che mancando esso eig[no]r Michel Angelo di rendere finito et perfetto detto quadro come et nel tempo che di sopra, d'adesso dà licentia ad esso sig[no]r abbate di far fare un altro quadro simile da qualsivoglia altro pittore ad ogni spesa maggiore di d[ett]o sig[no]r Michel Angelo, il quale pittore se lo possa eleggere da sé esso sig[no]r abbate senza farlo intendere alltramente ad esso sig[no]r Michel Angelo, il quale sig[no]r MicehlAngelo in tal caseo, cioè mancando come di s[opr]a sia tenuto et obligato, come promette et si obliga, di rendere qui in Roma ad esso sig[no]r abbate ne patisse mai . . .] (Marini 1989, p. 436).

5. September 22, 1602: Caravaggio receives a final payment of 65 *scudi* for the altarpiece of *Saint Matthew and the Angel* in the Contarelli Chapel in San Luigi dei Francesi (cat. no. 28). The payment is assumed to refer to the altarpiece still *in loco*, which replaced the first, rejected, version that was acquired by Vincenzo Giustiniani. ["Die 22 mensis septembris 1602. Sup[radic]tus Michael Angelus de Caravaggio . . . habuit et recepit manual[ite]r numeral[ite]r in co[n]tan]ti pro ultimo et finali complemento et satisfactione sup[radic]torum scutorum centurm quinquaginta p[rou]t sibi in precedenti instru[ment]o promissor[um] scuta sexaginta quinq[ue] m[one]te . . ."] (Marini 1989, p. 436).

Sources:

1. Baglione 1642, pp. 100–101, "A certain Saint Matthew, which was originally made for the altar of San Luigi dei Francesi, but which no one had liked, was taken by Giustiniani only because it was by Caravaggio." ["ed il quadro d'un certo S. Matteo, che prima havea fatto per quell'altare di s. Luigi, e non era a veruno piacciuto, egli per secer'opera di Michalagnolo, se'l prese"].

2. Sandrat before 1658 (ed. 1675, p. 189): Dating the picture after Michelangelo's flight from Rome for the murder of Ranuccio Tomassoni, and while taking refuge in the palace of the Marchese Giustiniani, "He painted the Evangelist Saint Matthew, before whom an angel in a white garment holds the book on which he writes." ["Dipinse poi anche l'evangelista Matteo con un angelo veste bianca che gli tiene davanti il libro su cui egli scrive . . ."] (Macioce 2003, p. 321).

3. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, pp. 218–20), "Then something happened which greatly disturbed Caravaggio and almost made him desperate. After the central picture of Saint Matthew had been finished and placed on the altar, it was taken away by the priests; who said that the figure with his legs crossed and his feet crudely exposed to the public had neither decorum nor the appearance of a saint. Caravaggio was in despair because of this affront to the first of his works in a church; the Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani acted in his favor and freed him from this grief. He intervened with the priests, took the painting for himself and had Caravaggio do another in a different way, which is the one now seen above the altar. To show how much he honored the first painting he took it in his house and later placed it beside paintings of the other three Evangelists done by Guido [Reni], Domenichino, and Albani, the three most celebrated painters of the time." ["Qui avvenne cosa che pose in grandissimo disturbo e quasi fece disperare egli terminato il quadro di mezzo di San Matteo e postolo su l'altare, fu tolto via da i preti con dire che quella figura non aveva decoro né aspetto di Santo, stando a sedere con le gambe incavalcate e co' piedi rozzamente esposti al popolo. Si disperava il Caravaggio per tale affronto nella prima opera da esso pubblicata in Chiesa, quando il Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani si mosse a favorirlo, e liberollo da questa pena; poiche interpostosi con quei sacerdoti, si prese per sé il quadro, e gliene fece fare un altro diverso, che è quello si vede hora su l'altare; e per onorare maggiormente il primo portatolo a casa, l'accompagnò poi con gli altri tre Vangelisti di mano di Guido [Reni], di Domenichino, e dell'Albano, tre li più celebre pittori, che in quel tempo avessero fama."]

4. Silos 1673, p. 87 Epigram CLVII: As in the Giustiniani collection.

5. Baldinucci 1681: "The painting of Saint Matthew the apostle . . . without any decorum . . . placed in a disconcerting pose . . . not like a saint but like any ordinary and plebian man . . . was removed from the church . . . and the marchese honored it by acquiring it" ["il quadro

del s. Matteo apostolo . . . senza alcun decoro . . . in sconcertata attitudine accomodato . . . come . . . non un santo ma un qualche uomo dozzinialissimo, e plebeo . . . di quella chiesa levato via . . .” e [il marchese Giustiniani acquisto per onorare il dipinto”].

Bibliography:

Landon 1812, pp. 29, 135; *Verzeichniss der ehemals zu der Giustinianischen jetzt zu den Königlichen Sammlungen gehörigen Gemälde* 1826, no. 94; Kallab 1906–7, pp. 283–84; Marangoni 1922, pp. 27–28; Voss 1923, pp. 90–91 (executed first, before the Contarelli and Cerasi Chapel lateral paintings); Voss 1924, p. 76, pl. 13; Longhi 1927, pp. 29 [*Opere complete*, 1967, II, pp. 302] (as inspired in part from the *Giove che bacia Amore* by Raphael in the Farnesina); Pevsner 1927/28, pp. 388–89 (executed first, 1597–98); Longhi 1928/29, pp. 23–24, 272, 284, 304 (executed first, c. 1592); von Schneider 1936, p. 349; Schudt 1942, p. 46; Arslan 1951, p. 449; Longhi 1951, 15, pp. 7–8; 17, pp. 4–6 (c. 1592); Mahon 1951, pp. 228, 234 (1599–1600, executed first); Venturi 1951, no. 17; Baumgart 1952, pp. 98, 105; Longhi 1952, pp. 22–23; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1597–98); Mahon 1952², pp. 17–18, 28–30 (1597–98); Hinks 1953, no. 19; Longhi 1954, pp. 37–38; Baumgart 1955, no. 21; Friedlaender 1955, p. 178, no. 22A (uncertain date); Wittkower 1958, p. 34; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 226–27, 312–14 (agrees with Voss); Jullian 1961, pp. 103–4 (1597–98?); Röttgen 1964, p. 220; Röttgen 1965 [ed. 1974] pp. 47–68, 75, 102–27 (publishes contract of February 7, 1602 and the payment of September 22, 1602); Rotondi 1966, pp. 11–34; Salerno et al. 1966, p. 113; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 44A (1602); Fagiolo dell’Arco 1968, p. 58 n. 32; Kitson 1969, no. 41A; Moir 1969, p. 365; Röttgen 1969, pp. 145–59, 165–68 (ed. 1974, pp. 89–92; establishes that original dimensions of the rejected canvas were 116¼ x 76⅞ in. [295 x 195 cm], similar to other altarpieces, and above all matching the *Saint John* by Naldini on opposite side of nave; Giustiniani cut picture down, especially at top and at right edge, trimming wing of Angel); Salerno 1970, pp. 240, 243; Calvesi 1971, pp. 118, 132; Cinotti–Dell’Acqua 1971, pp. 32–33, 112–13, 152–53; Spear 1971, p. 10; Bissel 1974, pp. 119–20; Marini 1974, n. 45; Lavin 1974, pp. 59–81 (Matthew resembles Socrates; identifies Hebrew text); Lavin 1974, pp. 590–91; Salerno 1974, pp. 586–87 (1602?); Moir 1976, p. 90 no. 19; Wright 1978, p. 35–42; Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Bologna 1980, pp. 43–44; Lavin 1980, pp. 113–14; Spezzaferro 1980, pp. 49 (May, 1599); Magnuson 1982, pp. 83–87; Moir 1982, pp. 26, 28, 50–54 (1601–2); Cinotti 1983, no. 3; Hibbard 1983, pp. 144, 183–91, 302–4 (after February 1602); Marini 1989, pp. 455–58, n. 48 (Rome after February 7, 1602, after Cerasi); Bologna

1992, pp. 306–8 (1595–96); Gregori 1994, p. 149, no. 39 (c. 1601–2); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 26; Gilbert 1995, pp. 45, 105, 128, 133, 172–89; Pupillo in Macioce 1996, pp. 148–66; Christiansen in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 7–9 (based upon Raphael’s composition *Jupiter and Cupid*, see engraving by Cherubino Alberti, Bartsch 100); Puglisi 1998, no. 38 (c. 1602); Robb 1998, p. 507 (1602); Spike 2001, pp. 118–23, cat. no. 27 (1602); Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, pp. 388–89; Spezzaferro 2003, pp. 23–50 (first altarpiece for Contarelli went on view in May 1599 so that Caravaggio could get commission for lateral pictures; it was then sold to Giustiniani in 1602 after Caravaggio completed final version); Saracino 2005, pp. 496–522; Sgarbi 2005, no. 27 (dates before lateral paintings in chapel); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 26–27 (c. 1600); Varriano 2006, pp. 28, 31, 37, 106, 130, fig. 26; Debono 2007, p. 17 ill.; Papa 2008, pp. 228–29 (1601).

See pp. 118–23.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies (which may refer to this first version or the second version, see cat. no. 28, below):

C. I

Rome, Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte

1627 inventory records that he possessed a copy of a painting of Saint Matthew [“Un quadro di S. Matteo di Palmi quattro copia del Caravaggio”] (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol. 574v; Frommel 1972, p. 30).

Bibliography:

Gilbert 1995, p. 112.

C. 2

Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani

Inventory 1638, part I, no. 171 cites a copy by Nicolas Regniér (Danesi Squarzina 2003, Inventari I, p. 389).

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 91, nos. 19a–19c.

28. *Saint Matthew and the Angel*, 1602

Oil on canvas, 116 x 76³/₄ in. (295 x 195 cm)

Contarelli Chapel, San Luigi dei Francesi, Rome

Provenance:

In situ.

Sources:

1. Baglione 1642, p. 100 (in the life of Jacob Cobaert): “He was retained by the Contarelli to sculpt in marble a statue of Saint Matthew Apostle and Evangelist for their chapel in San Luigi dei Francesi. [Cobaert] worked on this statue his entire life, never allowing anyone to see it nor, knowing how to choose and work marble, never asking anyone for advice. He worked until he was about 80; and was not able to finish it. He left it in the condition as it is today in the church of the Holy Trinity of the Pilgrims, on the right side of the altar. The angel, who leans towards Matthew, was added by Pompeo Ferrucci. The Contarelli when they saw it thought the work aimed too high and found it rather shallow and did not want it in their chapel. In exchange they had Michelangelo paint a Saint Matthew.”[“Vita di Cope Fiammingo, Scultore, Gli fu allogato da’ Signor Contarelli il far di marmo una statua di s. Mattheo Apostolo, & Evangelista, per metterlo nella loro cappella in s. Luigi de’ Francesi. Cope vi dimorò a far questa statua tutto il tempo di sua vita, non lasciandola mai vedere a persona veruna, nè sapendone cavar le mani, come quegli, che non havea pratica del marmo, e non volea pigliar consiglio, o aiuto da alcuno. Si condusse egli all’età di 80 anni in circa; & imbarbogitosi non potè terminarla, e lasciolla (come hora si vede) nella chiesa della santissima Trinità de’ Pellegrini a man diritta della Tribuna sopra d’un’altare; e l’Angelo, che porge il calamaro, v’è stato poi aggiunto da Pompeo Ferrucci. Li Contarelli, quando il videro,

pensando, che fusse opera divina, o miracolosa, e ritrovandola una feccaggine, no 'l vollero nella lor cappella di s. Luigi; ma in cambio di esso vi fecero da Michelagnolo da Caravaggio dipingere un s. Mattheo.”]

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 220): “Caravaggio exerted every effort to succeed in his second picture; he tried to give a natural pose to the saint writing the gospel by showing him with one knee bent on the stool and with his hands on the small table in the act of dipping his pen into the inkwell placed on the book. He turns his face to the left toward the winged angel who, suspended in air, speaks to him and makes a sign to him by touching the index finger of his left hand with that of his right hand. The color makes the angel seem far away as he floats suspended on his wings in the direction of the saint his arm and breast are nude and a fluttering white veil surrounds him in the darkness of the background.” [“Usò il Caravaggio ogni sforzo, per riuscire in questo secondo quadro: e nell’accommodare al naturale la figura del Santo, che scrive il Vangelo, egli la dispose con un ginocchio piegato sopra lo scabello, e con le mani al tavolino, intingendo la penna nel calamaio sopra il libro. In questo atto volge la faccia dal lato sinistro verso l’angelo, il quale sospeso su l’ali in aria gli parla, e gli accena, toccando con la destra l’indice dello mano sinistra. Sembra l’angelo lontana da color finto, e sta sospeso su l’ali verso il Santo, ignude le braccia, e ‘l petto, con lo svolazzo d’un velo bianco, che lo cinge nell’oscurità del campo.”]

Bibliography:

Marangoni 1922, no. XV; Voss 1923, p. 91 (executed after Berlin, before others in Contarelli and Cerasi Chapels); Voss 1924, p. 76, pl. 12; Pevsner 1927/28 (last among Contarelli pictures, before Cerasi Chapel); Benkard 1928, pp. 44–48; Longhi 1928/29, pp. 26, 31 (1598); Schudt 1942, no. 19; Arslan 1951 (after Cerasi Chapel); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 16; Mahon 1951, pp. 227, 229, 234 (1600–1601); Longhi 1952, no. XIV–XV; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1600–1601, follows lateral paintings, precedes Cerasi Chapel); Hinks 1953, no. 31; Baumgart 1955, no. 35; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 180–81, no. 22D (1602, more conventional); Wagner 1958, pp. 69–71, 86–92, 196–97 n. 305–12; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 157–58 (last of Contarelli paintings, precedes Cerasi Chapel); Jullian 1961, pp. 88, 91–92, 99; Rotondi 1966, pp. 11–34; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 44B (1602); Longhi 1968, pp. 18, 21, 34–35, 90–91, 95 (1602); Kitson 1969, no. 41B; Calvesi 1971, pp. 118–19, 131–35; Cinotti 1971, pp. 105,

113–14, 152–53; Frommel 1972, pp. 49, 52; Marini 1974, p. 31; Lavin 1974, pp. 59–61; Lavin 1974, pp. 590–91; Röttgen 1974, pp. 58–60, 69–71, 81–82, 139; Moir 1976, p. 92, no. 22; Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Magnuson 1982, pp. 83–87; Marini 1982, p. 78 (1602); Moir 1982, p. 96 (1602); Cinotti 1983, no. 61C; Calvesi 1986, p. 36 (after Cerasi); Calvesi 1988, pp. 117–32; Kretschmer 1988, pp. 63–66; Marini 1989, pp. 458–59, no. 49 (Rome before September 22, 1602); Treffers 1989, pp. 241–55; Calvesi 1990, pp. 279–310; Bologna 1992, p. 322 (1602); Gregori 1994, p. 82 (1602); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 26; Gilbert 1995, pp. 172, 184–85, 189; Pupillo in Macioce 1996, pp. 148–66; Langdon 1998, pp. 219, 237–40; Puglisi 1998, no. 40 (1602–3); Robb 1998, p. 507 (1602); Spike 2001, pp. 118–23, cat. no. 28 (1602); Antinori 2002, pp. 97–104; Calvesi 2002, pp. 13–22; Corradini 2002, pp. 51–62; Marini 2002², pp. 233–42; Olsen 2002, pp. 107–42 (original composition as revealed in x-rays related to the veneration of relics); Tempesta 2002, pp. 63–80; Volpi 2002; Zuccari 2002, pp. 81–96; Sgarbi 2005, no. 30; Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (c. 1601–2); Tresoldi 2006, p. 92 (1602–3); Varriano 2006, pp. 30, 40–41, fig. 32; Papa 2008, pp. 66–80 (1602).

Assuming that the first altarpiece of *Saint Matthew and the Angel* was completed by May 1602 in time to be unveiled at Pentecost as prescribed in the contract, Caravaggio must have painted its replacement in the intervening months before he finally received payment in September. He did not take any risks with the second version. Matthew now appears as portrayed in the lateral paintings. The angel duly ticks off the generations of Christ and we cannot see whether Matthew writes them down in Hebrew or Greek letters. The saint kneels on a short bench that teeters alarmingly over the edge of his platform. The motif reintroduces the mechanistic metaphor of balance and judgment, perhaps alluding as well to the paragone between painting and sculpture. The relative positions of the apostle and angel were clearly derived from Tintoretto's *The Virgin Appearing to Saint Jerome*. Caravaggio thus decided to make its composition conform to the Venetian qualities of the *Calling* and the *Martyrdom of Saint Matthew*.

The extraordinary circumstances surrounding Caravaggio's execution of two distinct altarpieces for the Contarelli Chapel made a deep impression on Baglione and Bellori. The marble statue of *Saint Matthew* by Jacob Cobaert was briefly installed in January 1602, still lacking an angel despite more than a decade of labor, but did not please the Rector Francesco Contarelli. Its late Mannerist conception no doubt contrasted with the new lateral paintings by Caravaggio.

A painted altarpiece was commissioned from Caravaggio on February 7, 1602 with delivery stipulated for Pentecost in the ensuing May. The contract contained the unusual stipulation that the artist would be required to replace the altarpiece at his own expense if his first submission was found unsatisfactory. Final payment was received on September 22, 1602.

It is now generally agreed that the commission of February 1602 resulted in the *Saint Matthew* (destroyed in 1945, see cat. no. 27) that was acquired by the Marchese Gisutini when it failed to please (presumably at its exhibition at Pentecost, although no document of its actual installation has come to light). Under this reconstruction of events, the payment of September 1602 would therefore follow the consignment of Caravaggio's second effort at the subject, the *Saint Matthew* that is still in situ above the altar in the Chapel.

See text pp. 118–23 for discussion of the remarkable differences between the two altarpieces.

Copies:

None recorded.

29. *Saint John the Baptist*, 1602

Oil on canvas, 50³/₄ x 37⁷/₈ in. (129 x 95 cm)

Pinacoteca Capitolina, Rome, inv. 239

Provenance:

Painted for Ciriaco Mattei, Rome, 1602; by bequest to his eldest son, Giovanni Battista Mattei, who bequeathed it to Cardinal Del Monte in 1624; sold as Caravaggio by Del Monte's heirs on February 21, 1628, probably to Cardinal Pio di Carpi di Savoia, Rome; Francesco Pio di Savoia, Rome, 1697; sold with 126 paintings by Prince Gilberto Pio to Benedict XIV (Pope 1740–58); the Pio collection, together with the Sacchetti collection, became the basis of the Pinacoteca Capitolina.

Inventories/Documents:

1. Book of accounts of Ciriaco Mattei, Archivio Mattei, records two unspecified payments to Caravaggio for 60 *scudi* on July 26, 1602 and for 25 *scudi* on December 5, 1602. [“(33) Adi 26 detto [giugno 1602] et pui deve havere sc. sesanta di mo.ta p.tanti p.me pagati a Mich’Angelo da Caravaggio pittore devo sc. 60”; “(49) Adi v di X.bre 1602 e pui devono havere li Ruspoli sc. venticinque p. tanti pagati p.me à Michel Angelo di Caravaggio p. tanti producili gratis et amore dice sc. 25”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990, p. 239 [as July 26]; Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 105–6, 139–40; Guarino in Rome 1995, p. 120 [as June]).
2. December 4, 1616: Inventory taken at the death of Ciriaco: “A painting of Saint John the Baptist with his lamb by Caravaggio in a gilt frame” [“Un quadro di San Gio: Battista col suo Agnello di mano del Caravaggio con cornice rabescata d’oro”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990, p. 239; Cappelletti–Testa 1994, p. 106; Guarino in Rome 1995, p. 120).
3. January 21, 1624: Testament of Giovanni Battista Mattei, eldest son of Ciriaco: “I leave to the most illustrious Cardinal Del Monte my lord and patron the painting of Saint John the Baptist by Caravaggio” [“Item lascio all’illustrissimo Signor Cardinale del Monte come unico mio signore et padrone il quadro di S. Giovanni Battista del Caravaggio”] (Frommel 1972, p. 31).
4. Codicil of June 5, 1624: Testament of Giovanni Battista Mattei: “A painting of Saint John the Baptist with his lamb by Caravaggio” [“Un quadro di S. Giovanni Battista con il suo agnello di mano del Caravaggio”] (Frommel 1972, p. 31; Macioce 2003, doc. 464, p. 289).
5. July 13, 1624: Payment to porters to carry the painting from the Palazzo Mattei to Cardinal Del Monte (Schröter 1995, p. 69).
6. February 21, 1627: Inventory of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “A Saint John the Baptist by Caravaggio with a black gilt frame 6¼ palmi” [“Un S. Giovanni Battista di mano del Caravaggio con cornice negra rabescata di Palmi sei et ¼”] (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol. 575v, Frommel 1972, p. 31; Macioce 2003, doc. inventari 23; p. 350).

7. May 5, 1628: Listed among items sold to pay debts of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “On the fifth, for a shepherd and a gypsy by Caravaggio” [“A 5 d Per il Coridone e Zingara del Caravaggio . . .”] (Nota del denaro retratto dalla vendita de Mobili del Giardino di Ripetta doppo otto scuti il Breve posto del Banco di S. Spirito, Kirwin 1972, pp. 54–55).

8. 1641: Inventory of the estate of Cardinal Carlo Emanuele Pio: “A painting with a seated nude youth who embraces a lamb in an outstretched arm, and holds him close to his face” [“Un quadro con un giovane nudo à sedere mezzo colco, quale tiene con braccio dritto abbracciato un’agnello, e se lo accosta al viso”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990, p. 240; Cappelletti–Testa 1994, p. 106).

9. December 9–11, 1697: Francesco Pio di Savoia lent 138 works to the annual exhibition of paintings in the Church of San Salvatore in Lauro. The exhibition showed a notable selection from the collection of Pio di Savoia, which had been acquired from the Del Monte collection in 1628, including the *Buona ventura* (cat. no. 5) and the “*Saint John the Baptist playing with a lamb* by Michel Angelo da Caravaggio.” [“S. Gio. Battista fanciullo, che scherza con l’Agnellino, di Michel’Angelo dá Caravaggio . . .”] (Guarino 1994, p. 102).

10. March 3–April 4, 1724: Inventory of the estate of Francesco Pio di Savoia (d. September 15, 1723): “N. 132. Another painting of a naked youth, who leans his left arm on a drapery and with his right embraces the head of a lamb, five palmi high and four long with gilt frame by Caravaggio” [“n. 132. Altro quadro di un Giovane nudo, quale appoggia il braccio sinistro sopra i suoi panni, e con il destro abbraccia la testa di un agnello, alto palmi cinque largo palmi quattro con cornice dorato del Caravaggio”] (Guarino 1994, p. 122).

11. 1740 (published 1742): Inventory of the collection of Cardinal Pio di Savoia prepared by Francesco Trevisani of the Pio collection: “No. 124 A painting on canvas representing a *Saint John the Baptist* 6 palmi high and 4 long by Caravaggio—valued at 150 *scudi*” [“no. 124 Un quadro depinto in tela representante un San Giovanni Battista alto palmi 6 largo palmi 4 del Caravaggio—valor 150 scudi”] (Battisti 1955, 182; Cinotti 1983, p. 519; Guarini 1994, p. 103).

12. November 18, 1749: Inventory of Prince Gilberto Pio di Savoy prepared by Pannini on the occasion of the sale to Benedetto XIV Lambertini, without reference to title: “A painting

measuring 5 palmi high, with a gilt frame, companion of the aforesaid Magdalene, original by Michel Angelo da Caravaggio, valued at 60 *scudi*” [“Un quadro di misura di palmi 5 per alto, con cornice dorata, compagno della suddetta Maria Egizziaca, originale di Michel Angelo da Caravaggio, di valore scudi 60”] (as cited by Spezzaferro 1990, it is uncertain if this is a reference to this painting; Cappelletti–Testa in Rome 1995, p. 122 state that the Caravaggio *Saint John the Baptist* was paired with a *Magdalen* by Domenico Tintoretto).

13. 1777: Initial inventory of the Pinacoteca Capitolina based upon Pio collection: “An oblong painting on canvas of ‘Imperial size’ with an old gilt frame with a figure from nature that represents a Saint John the Baptist with a Sheep, original by Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio, valued at 80 *scudi*” [“Un quadro p.lungo in tela quasi d’Imperatore con cornice antica tutta dorata con figura al naturale che rappresenta S. Gio. Battista con una Pecora originale di Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio, di valore s. 80”].

Sources:

1. Celio 1620–24, p. 134 (facsim. ed. 1638 Naples, p. 41): “Pictures in the old palace of Signor Marchese Mattei . . . That of a *Pastor friso*, in oil, by Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“Pitture nel Palazzo vecchio del Signor Marchese Matthei . . . Quella del Pastor friso, ad olio, di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”].

2. Baglione 1642, p. 137: “Ciriaco Mattei was likewise seduced by the clamour; for him Caravaggio painted a *Saint John the Baptist*, and *Our Lord on his Way to Emmaus*, and then a scene of Thomas touching with his finger the wound in the side of the Lord, thus did Caravaggio relieve this gentleman of many hundreds of *scudi*.” [“anche il signor Signor Ciriaco Mattei, a cui il Caravaggio havea dipinto un s. Gio Battista e quando N. Signore andò in Emaus [London, National Gallery] e all’ora che s. Thommaso toccò col dito il costato del Salvatore; e intaccò quel Signore di molte centinaia di scudi.”]

3. Scanelli 1657, p. 199: “. . . and in the Gallery of the most Eminent Pio some small pictures, and in particular, a figure of Saint John the Baptist nude, of which more life-like flesh could not be demonstrated unless it were living . . .” [“. . . e nella Galeria dell’Eminentissimo Pio alcuni quadretti, ed in particolare una figura di S. Gio. Battista ignudo, che non potria dimostrare più vera carne quando fosse vivo . . .”].

4. Bellori 1664, p. 45: “Cardinal Carlo Pio. In the Palace of His Eminence diverse rooms decorated with the rarest pictures . . . a Saint John playing with a lamb, by Michele da Caravaggio . . .” [“Cardinale Carlo Pio. Nel Palazzo di Sua Eminenza diverse camere ornate di pitture rarissime . . . San Giovanni scherza con l’Agnello di Michele da Caravaggio . . .”].

5. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 217): “He painted Saint John in the desert, as a seated youth, who thrusts his head forward and embraces a lamb; this is in the Palace of Signore Cardinal Pio” [“Dipinse San Giovanni nel deserto, che è un giovanetto ignudo a sedere, il quale sporgendo la testa avanti, abbraccia un agnello; e questo si vede nel Palazzo del signor cardinal Pio”].

6. Rossi 1697, p. 275: “Saint John the Baptist as a youth, who plays with a little lamb, by Michel’Angelo dá Caravaggio . . . [in the] Palazzo Orsino, Campo di Fiore . . . currently the home of Signor Pio” [“S. Gio. Battista fanciullo, che scherza con l’Agnellino, di Michel’Angelo dá Caravaggio . . . [nel] Palazzo Orsino in Campo di Fiore . . . presentemente abitato dá Signor Pij.”].

7. Milani 1742: “Another a shepherd seated with a sheep in a good Carraccesque style, value 50 scudi” [“Altro . . . un pastore a sedere con una pecora maniera buona carraccesca valore sc. 50”].

8. Roiseco 1745, I, p. 352: “In the Palazzo Pio, formerly of the Orsini . . . the young Saint John the Baptist by Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio” [“Palazzo Pii, anticamente degli Orsini . . . S.Gio: Battista fanciullo di Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio”].

9. Roiseco 1765, I, p. 360: The picture, as described in 1745 edition, now appears in a list of selected pictures in the recently opened Pinacoteca Capiolina.

10. Venuti 1767, p. 200: In the Palazzo Pio, describes Caravaggio’s *Baptist* as a “*fanciullo*” (boy), formerly there but now in Capitolina; at p. 337: mentions picture in Capitolina as a “Giovane nudo” (nude youth).

11. von Ramdohr 1787, I, p. 265: “Capitolina: a John the Baptist with a Sheep by Caravaggio. A repetition of the same picture that is in the Doria palace known under the name of Lust and

Innocence; it is beautiful.” [“Capitol: Johannes der Täufer mit einem Bock, von Caravaggio. Eine Wiederholung desjenigen Bildes welches im Pallast Doria unter dem Nahmen der Wollust und der Unschuld bekannt ist Schön.”]

12. Vasi 1794, [1970, p.93].

13. Tonci 1794, p. 147: cites both the Capitolina and the Doria Saint John the Baptists, one as a replica of the other [“cita due San Giovanni Battista, dicendo che l’uno era la replica dell’altro”] (Venturi 1910, p. 276).

Exhibitions:

London 1955, n. 17; Rome 1995, no. 2; Düsseldorf 2006, no. 20.

Bibliography:

Dalmazzoni 1804, p. 220; Tofanelli [1817, p. 26] 1819, p. 118 (“Nude youth with a goat by Caravaggio”); Fea 1819, p. 234; Righetti 1836, p. 92, pl. 287 (“A youth playing with a goat” [“Un giovane che scherza con un capra”]); Donovan 1843, III, p. 582, n. 179 (in the Pinacoteca Capitolina, “A young man, nude, with a buck goat, by Caravaggio”); Barbier de Montault 1870, p. 42, no. 179 (in the Pinacoteca Capitolina “Young shepherd stroking a ram. The same is twice repeated in the Doria gallery”); Venturi 1910, p. 276 (identifies the Doria canvas as a “very authentic work” and as the picture described by Bellori in the palace of Cardinal Pio); Bocconi in *Guida della Pinacoteca Capitolina* 1914, p. 202 (“A youth with a goat, probably the work of Michelangelo da Caravaggio”); Voss 1924, p. 75 (weaker version); Bocconi in *Guida della Pinacoteca Capitolina* 1926 (after Venturi described it as a “poor copy,” Bocconi removed the painting from view in the Capitolina and put it in storage, eliminating it entirely from this guide); Mahon 1953, p. 213 n. 7 (1598–99, recovered from the office of the mayor of Rome); Hinks 1953, no. 32, p. 123 (both, 1599–1600); Pietrangeli 1954 (as Caravaggio); Battista 1955 (not Pio picture, which is in England); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 169–72, no. 20B; Mahon in London 1955, pp. 20–24 (handling close to *Amore Vincitore*, 1598–99); Waterhouse 1955; Salerno 1956, no. 35, pp. 83–85 (both originals); Stechow 1956, p. 60 (subject identified as John the Baptist by 1613); Wagner 1958, pp. 82–84, 201–3 n. 353–72; Wittkower 1958, p. 27; Arslan 1959, p. 209 (1602–3); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 350–54; Della Pergola 1959, p. 79; Jullian

1961, pp. 50, 53, 59 n. 77–78, 66, 71, 107, 223 n. 12, 226, 231 (1597); Venturi 1963, no. 20; Bottari 1966, no. 25; Salerno 1966, p. 111; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 39 (1597–98); Moir 1967; Longhi 1968, p. 28; Kitson 1969, no. 37; Cinotti 1971 (shortly after Contarelli Chapel); Posner 1971, p. 314; Spezzaferro 1971, pp. 84, 88–89; Marini 1974, pp. 154–55, 382–85, n. 36 (1600); Frommel 1972, pp. 46, 49, 51 (1599); Kirwin 1972, p. 55; Slatkes 1972, pp. 17–24; Nicolson 1973, p. 560; Marini 1974, pp. 382–85; Moir 1976, pp. 87 no. 16, 125–26, n. 188 (adapted Sistine ceiling *ignudo* based on his friend Cherubino Alberti’s print, B.149 of 1585); Bruno *Guide . . .* 1978, p. 43, n. 92; Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Marini 1982, p. 77 (1600, Mattei provenance); Cinotti 1983, no. 59 (1599–1600); Freedberg 1983, pp. 52–55 (parodies Michelangelo, 1602); Hibbard 1983, pp. 154–59 (homoeerotic); Posèq 1990², pp. 153–57, pl. 8 (as *Saint John the Baptist with a Ram*, “Art historians have long been aware that both the nude figure and the ram have antecedents on the Sistine ceiling; the youth’s posture recalls the *Ignudi*, while the ram is like the sacrificial animal in *Noah’s Offering*. The adaptation however, explains neither Saint John’s sensual expression nor the transformation of his traditional lamb (*Agnus Dei*) into a horned ram, easily confused with a he-goat, the generic symbol of lust and lechery, and a canonic metaphor for the sinners who at the Last Judgment will be refused God’s mercy”; 1602–3); Marini 1989, pp. 444–46, n. 42 (Rome 1600); Cappelletti–Testa 1990, p. 237; Cappelletti–Testa 1990², p. 7 (“the *Saint John the Baptist* was given it is known, to Cardinal Del Monte in 1624); Correale 1990 (technical analysis); Bologna 1992, pp. 317–18 (c. 1601); Prosèq 1993; Calvesi 1994, pp. 148–57; Cappelletti–Testa 1994, no. 9, pp. 105–6; Gregori 1994, p. 149, no. 40 (1602); Gilbert 1995, pp. 2–34 (at p. 10 “Frisus or Phryxus is a legendary figure who, with his sister Helle, escapes a sacrificial death in Boeotia by flying to Colchis on the back of a miraculous ram with a golden fleece. Frisus is invariably mentioned as a prince not a shepherd.”); Guarino in Rome 1995, no. 2; Schröter 1995, pp. 68–69; Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, p. 10, fig. 7 (1601–2); Christiansen in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 11–16 (1602, modeled after Michelangelo *ignudi* in Sistine ceiling, cites engraving by Cherubino Alberti, Bartsch no. 149); Papi in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 123–34 (model is Cecco del Caravaggio in works between 1601 and 1604); Rowlands 1996, p. 222 (1601–2); Langdon 1998, pp. 213–14, 219, 225, 281–82, 292–93, 388–90; Puglisi 1998, no. 39 (original, c. 1602); Robb 1998, p. 507 (1602); Bauer and Colton 2000, p. 434 (cite P. Sannucci’s discussion of copy tracings in Correale 1990); Brown in London-Rome 2001, pp. 298–300 (c. 1602); Rudolph and Ostrow 2001, pp. 646–81; Spike 2001, pp. 126–31, cat. no. 29 (1602); von Rosen 2003², pp. 59–72; Sgarbi 2005, no. 37 (1602, places just after *Amor Vincit Omnia* [cat. no. 26] and just

before *Saint John the Baptist* in Kansas City [cat. no. 39]); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (1599); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 228–30 (1602); Kliemann in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 181–215; von Rosen in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 59–85; Papa 2008, pp. 94–103 (1602); Whitfield 2008, pp. 3–38 (as “The Shepard Coridone with a ram,” fig. 3); von Rosen 2009, forthcoming.

Baglione and Celio offer fundamentally divergent readings of the subject of this painting. In the view of Celio, an artist who once resided in the Palazzo Mattei, the painting represents the *Pastor Friso*, i.e. Phryxus, an obscure mythological hero. Baglione identified the picture as *Saint John the Baptist*, which became the traditional title, although the beardless young man lacks most of the saint’s attributes. The most convincing new hypothesis has identified the subject as Isaac following his rescue from sacrifice by his father, Abraham (Papa 1998). The boy’s jubilant expression, unusual for the Baptist, would be explained both by his deliverance and by his name, Isaac, which means “God has smiled, he has shown his favor.” On the other hand, the boy’s pose and beauty are unmistakably related to Michelangelo’s *ignudi* painted on the Sistine Chapel ceiling. This *Saint John the Baptist* offers striking analogies to the *Victorious Cupid* (cat. no. 26).

Evidently these differing readings from antiquity to Christianity were not intended to be mutually exclusive. It can hardly be coincidental that both are all concerned with love and sacrifice. The process is analogous to the distinction between poetry and prose. The allusions to Phryxus, Isaac, and the Sistine *ignudi* are superimposed on a template that recalls the iconography of the young John the Baptist.

The Capitoline Baptist and its faithful copy in the Doria Pamphili collection (see c.4 below) constitute one of the most striking episodes of “doubles” in Caravaggio’s oeuvre. The present painting was relegated to storage in the Capitoline museums after its demotion by Venturi (1910) as a poor copy of the Doria Pamphili version, which was duly studied by authorities in the ensuing decades. In 1953 Mahon traced the present picture to the office of the mayor of Rome. Its restored attribution has been supported by subsequent archival research. In particular, two unspecified payments of July and December 1602 to Caravaggio by Ciriaco Mattei are reasonably connected with this painting, which is documented in his collection.

See pp. 126–31.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C.1

Spain, Doctor Juan de Matute, 1628 inventory as by Caravaggio: “Nude Saint John embracing the lamb” (Getty Provenance Index, 0013 Matute, Juan de, Doctor 1628/12/22E–798; Spike 2001, cat. no. 29.c.1).

C.2

Madrid, Juan Gaspar Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and ninth Almirante de Castilla, 1691, posthumous inventory (as copy after): “Nude Saint John embracing the lamb” (Burke–Cherry 1997, pp. 892–93, 1095; Spike 2001, cat. no. 29.c.2).

C.3

Rotterdam, Collection of Jaques Meyers (c. 1660–1721), wine and art dealer

A. *Description du cabinet de Tableaux de Mr. Meyers*, Rotterdam (French & Bohm) 1714, p. 17: “Michelangelo da Caravaggio. A young man or shepherd with a ram, painted in the style of the Carracci and drawn in the manner of Giulio Romano. It comes from the cabinet of the Duc de Gramont [4 ft. x 3 ft.; 133.5 x 94 cm]” [“Michelangelo de Caravage. Un jeune Homme ou Berger, avec un Bélier, peint du Gout des Caraches, & dessiné de la maniere de Jule Romain. Il Vient du Cabinet du Duc de Gramont”].

B. September 9, 1722, sale, Rotterdam fl. 205.

Bibliography:

Hoet 1752, vol. I, p. 268; Van Gelder 1974, p. 172; Meijer 2000, pp. 377, 405 n. 20; Duvenger 2004, p. 241, no. 21; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 194, nos. Q and T.

II. Selected copies are listed by Moit 1976 (p. 87, nos. 16a–16k). Among these are:

C.4

Rome, Galleria Doria Pamphili, inv. FC 349

Oil on canvas, 52 x 38¾ in. (132 x 98.5 cm)

Provenance:

Possibly in the collection of Cardinal Mario Filonardi, at whose death in 1644 it passed by donation to Principe Camillo Doria Pamphili, Rome.

Inventories:

1. December 28, 1644: List of the possessions of Cardinal Mario Filonardi held at his death (Garms 1972, no. 224, pp. 61–62).
2. 1652: Inventory of the Guardaroba of the Palazzo Doria Pamphili.

Exhibitions:

London 1955, no. 17; Bergamo 2000, no. 38 (as copy); Athens 2006, cat. no. 3.

Bibliography:

Barbier de Montault 1870, p. 42, no. 179 (in the Pinacoteca Capitolina “Young shepherd stroking a goat. The same is twice repeated in the Doria gallery”); Venturi 1910, p. 276 (identified Doria canvas as the picture described by Bellori as in the palace of Cardinal Pio); Marangoni 1922, no. X; Benkard 1928, pp. 163–71; Voss 1924, p. 75, pl. 8 (as original); Schudt 1942, no. 15; Berenson 1951, pp. 32, 57; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1603–4); Venturi 1951, no. 20; Longhi 1952, p. 32; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1599–1600); Mahon 1953, p. 213 n. 7 (replica, slightly later); Mahon in London 1955, pp. 20–24 (dating perhaps from 1605–6, may have been a purchase by Cardinal Scipione Borghese); Hinks 1953, no. 32 (both autograph, 1600–1601); Baumgart 1955, no. 24 (1596–97); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 169–72, no. 20A (c. 1600); Salerno 1956, no. 35 (both); Wagner 1958, pp. 82–84, 201–3 n. 353–72; Arslan 1959, p. 209; Della Pergola 1959, p. 79 (may be a copy); Jullian 1961, pp. 50, 53, 59 n. 77–78, 66, 71, 107, 223 n. 12, 226, 231 (with doubts, 1598–1600); de Logu 1962;

Venturi 1963, pp. 17–24, no. 20(?); Bottari 1966 (late copy); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 40; Longhi 1968, p. 28; Kitson 1969, no. 37 (autograph replica); Slatkes 1969, pp. 17–24 (subject is shepherd Phryx, symbolic of month of March, sign of Aries, and the sanguine temperament); Salerno 1970, pp. 234, 236, 243 (copy); Cinotti 1971, pp. 68, 103–5, 166 (await cleaning); Marini 1974, pp. 154–55, 382–85, n. 36 (replica by Mario Minniti[?] with some intervention by Caravaggio); Moir 1976, pp. 87, nos. 16a–16k, 125–26, n. 188 (attributed to Angelo Caroselli, “superior contemporary copy, presumably by an artist who was very close to Caravaggio and very nearly his peer”); Nicolson 1979, p. 33 (with doubts); Cinotti 1983, p. 521 (copy or replica?); Marini 1983, pp. 132–35, fig. 29 (by collaborator, Mario Minniti?); Freedberg 1983, p. 59 (“sole instance that we know of an authentic replication by Caravaggio of one of his own works”); Marini 1989, pp. 445–46 (raises problem of the replicas from the Casa Mattei, these are either from the studio of Caravaggio or by a helper [Minniti?] in either case, with interventions by Caravaggio); Correale 1990; Barbiellini Amidei 1990, pp. 164, 174 (provenance); Cappelletti and Testa 1990³, pp. 80–84 (provenance); Bologna 1992, p. 318 (autograph replica, c. 1601); Calvesi 1994, pp. 148–57; Gilbert 1995, p. 4, fig. 2 (as copy); Barroero 1997, “L’Isacco di Caravaggio nella Pinacoteca Capitolina” in *Bollettino dei Musei Comunali di Roma*, XI, pp. 37–41; Puglisi 1998, at no. 39 (copy); Robb 1998, p. 508 (1602); Bauer and Colton 2000, p. 434 (cite P. Sannucci’s discussion of copy tracings in Correale 1990); Cappelletti in Bergamo 2000, p. 213; Spike 2001 cat. no. 29.c.3 (as copy); Estivili 2002, pp. 219–25; Marini 2005, pp. 362, 577–78, no. Q-58; DeMarchi in Athens 2006, cat. no. 3 (before 1625, “With regard to a well established critical tradition according to which Caravaggio never repeated a composition, in recent years a completely opposite view has been put forward by specialists also for commercial reasons.”); De Marchi in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 230–31, cat. no. 21 (as copy); Clark 2007, cat. no. 2, pp. 57–59 (as “The Shepherd Corydon with a Ram”); Gregori in Clark 2007, pp. 7–8; De Marchi 2008, pp. 40–44, ill. p. 41 (seventeenth-century copy, in galleries, probably acquired by Camillo Doria Pamphilj on Roman market).

For many years scholars labored under the a priori supposition that Caravaggio would not have executed replicas or availed himself of workshop assistance. Now that evidence to the contrary has come to light, many authorities believe that the quality of this version in the Doria Pamphili achieves the level of a workshop replica executed under Caravaggio’s supervision.

C.5

Herdringen (Schönborn Castle, Pommersfelden, Germany), Von Fürstenberg collection

Provenance:

Acquired in Rome by Wilhelm von Fürstenberg (1623–1699); described as original in 1666 when restored by Ferdinand Voet (1639–1700), a member of Maratta's studio when in the collection of Baron Wilhelm von Fürstenberg; by descent 1940 Count von Fürstenberg at Herdringen.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1922 (ed. 1961, I, p. 482); Baumgart 1939/40, pp. 488–89; Friedlaender 1955, p. 170 (copy); Moir 1976, p. 87 nos. 16d, 16e; Cinotti 1983, p. 521; Spike 2001, cat. no. 29.c.4 (copy); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, ill. p. 154, pp. 231–32, cat no 22 (copy).

30. *Taking of Christ*, late 1602

Oil on canvas, 52⁵/₈ x 66³/₄ in. (133.5 x 169.5 cm)

Society of Jesus of Saint Ignatius, Dublin, on loan to the National Gallery of Ireland, Dublin

Provenance:

Painted for Ciriaco Mattei, Rome, 1602; inherited at his death by his eldest son, Giovan Battista, in whose estate recorded 1616; by descent to his cousin, Paolo Mattei, son of Asdrubale, 1624; at his death to his brother, Duke Gerolamo, Palazzo Mattei, inventory 1753; Palazzo Mattei, inventory 1793, attributed to Gerard Honthorst; sold on February 1, 1802, to W. Hamilton Nisbet, of Scotland; Nisbet Hamilton Ogilvy, Biel, Scotland, until 1921 when sold at auction in Edinburgh at Dowells (*Catalogue of Valuable Pictures*, p. 108, 68 x 47 in., unsold); privately acquired c. 1930 by Maria Lea-Wilson who donated the painting to the Society of Jesuits of Saint Ignatius, Dublin.

Inventories/Documents:

1. Book of accounts of Ciriaco Mattei, Archivio Mattei, dated January 2, 1603: “125 scudi paid to Michelangelo da Caravaggio for a painting with its frame showing a Christ taken in the orchard” [“sc. cento vinticinque di mo.ta di iulj x . . . per tanti pagati à Michelangelo da Caravaggio per un quadro con la sua cornice depinto di un Cristo preso all’orto”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990², p. 6).
2. December 4, 1616 Inventory of Giovanni Battista Ciriaco: “A painting of the taking of Jesus Christ by Caravaggio in a black gilt frame with a red silk cordon” [“Un quadro della presa di Giesù Cristo del Caravaggio con la cornice nera rabescata d’oro col suo taffetà rosso e cordoni di seta rossa e fiocchi pendenti”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, p. 101; Macioce 2003, inventari 10, p. 344.)
3. January 21, 1623: Testament of Giovanni Batista Mattei, “a taking of Christ by Caravaggio” [“Una presa di Cristo del Caravaggio”] which he bequeathed to his cousin, Paolo Mattei, son of Asdrubale (Recanti, *Archivio Antici-Mattei*, Mazzo 52, *Testamento di G.B. Mattei del 1623*).
4. June 5, 1624: Inventory taken at death of Giovanni Batista Mattei (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 101, 103 n. 10).
5. June 24, 1624: Asdrubale Mattei received the Taking of Christ by Caravaggio from the estate of his nephew, Giovanni Batista Mattei, on behalf of his son, Paolo (Macioce 2003, II, doc. 465, p. 289).
6. November 29, 1638: Inventory of the estate of Abbot Paolo Mattei “a painting by Caravaggio of the Taking of Christ with a gold frame and green cord” [“quadro del Caravaggio della Presa di Christo con cornice dorata e sua cornice di taffetà verde”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 102, 103 n. 13).
7. 1676: Inventory of Duke Gerolamo Mattei: “The Taking of Christ in the Garden by Caravaggio with a gold frame, 6 x 8 palmi,” together with a copy [“La presa di Christo nell Orto del Caravaggio con cornice dorata di p. 6 e 8”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, p. 102; inventory dated 1666 in Cappelletti–Testa 1990², p. 71).

8. 1753: Inventory of Palazzo Mattei, painting described in the anticamera of the palazzo (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 102).

9. 1793: Inventory of Palazzo Mattei, Rome, in the fourth room of the “*appartamento nobile*” a *Taking of Christ* attributed to Gerard von Honthorst [“Gherardo della Notte, un Presa di Christo all’orto di p.mi 6-6”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 102).

10. Export license application dated February 10, 1802 to transfer the painting to Scotland on behalf of Hamilton Nisbet names a *Betrayal* with measurement 7 x 5 palmi (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 102, 104 n. 143).

11. 1838 Scottish Record Office, Gd 205/48/18/4: “Our Saviour betrayed by Judas by Gherardo della Notte” (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 102–3, 104 n. 27).

Sources:

1. Celio 1620–24 (1638 p. 134): Records in the old Palace of the Mattei, “that [painting] of the Taking of Christ with half figures” [“. . . quella [pittura] della presa di Christo mesa figure”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1990, p. 237; Cappelletti–Testa 1994, p. 101).

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, pp. 222–23): “Other Roman gentlemen vied with one another to obtain his paintings. Among them was the Marchese Asdrubale Mattei who had him paint the *Taking of Christ in the Garden*, which is also in half-figures. Judas lays his hand on the shoulder of the Lord after the kiss, and a soldier in full armor extends his arm and his ironclad hand to the chest of the Lord who stands patiently and humbly with his hands folded before him; behind, Saint John is seen fleeing with outstretched arms. Caravaggio imitated even the rust on the armor of the soldier whose head is covered by a helmet so that only his profile can be seen; behind him a lantern is raised and one can distinguish two more heads of armed men. . . .” [“Concorso al diletto del suo pennello altri signori romani, e tra questi il marchese Asdrubale Mattei gli fece dipingere la Presa di Christo all’orto, parimente in mezze figure. Tiene Giuda la mano alla spalla del Maestro, dopo il bacio; intanto un soldato tutto armato stende il braccio, e la mano di ferro al petto del Signore, il quale si arresta paziente ed umile con le mani incrocicchiate avanti, fuggendo dietro San Giovanni, con le braccia aperte. Imitò

l'armature rugginosa di quel soldato coperto il capo, e 'l volto dall'elemo, uscendo alquanto fuori il profilo; e dietro s'inalza una lanterna, seguitando due altre teste d'armati.”]

3. Panciroli–Posterla 1725, p. 494: Among the oil paintings in the Palazzo Mattei, “the *Taking of Christ in the Garden* by Michele da Caravaggio” [“la presa all’Orto di Michele da Caravaggio”] (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, p. 102).

4. de Brosses 1745–55 (ed. 1957, p. 464): In Palazzo Mattei, “Jesus Christ made prisoner in the olive orchard, by Caravaggio, beautiful” [“Gesù Cristo fatto prigioniero all’orto degli ulivi, del Caravaggio, bellissimo”].

5. Titi 1763, p. 88.

6. Venuti 1767, I, p. 852: “In palazzo Mattei, the Taking of the Lord in the Garden by Caravaggio” [“La presa del Salvatore nell’orto del Caravaggio”].

7. Lalande 1769, IV, p. 334: “In palazzo Mattei, Jesus Christ arrested in the Garden, by Caravaggio” [“Jesus Christ arreté dans le jardin, du Carravage”].

8. Rossini 1776, II, p. 233: As in Palazzo Mattei.

9. von Ramdohr 1787, pp. 259: “A Christ Betrayed by Judas’ Kiss, by Caravaggio. Others say Honthorst, which is less likely.” [“Im vierten Judas verrath den Christ mit einem Kuss, von Caravaggio. Andere sagen von Honthorst, welches weniger wahrscheinlich ist.”]

Exhibitions:

Edinburgh 1883, n. 376 (as Honthorst); Dublin 1993; Rome 1995, no. 3; Boston 1999; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 123 (London only); Amsterdam 2006, cat.no. 17.

Bibliography:

Brigstocke 1972, pp. 108–111; Cappelletti–Testa 1990², pp. 5–7; Cappelletti 1992, pp. 256–92; Lapucci in *Come nascono . . .* 1992, p. 31–51; Benedetti 1993, pp. 731–46; Benedetti 1993²;

Cappelletti 1993, pp. 742–46; Colasanti 1993, pp. 112–23; Schneider 1994, pp. 21–23; Gregori 1994, p. 150, no. 41 (1602); Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 101–4; Benedetti 1995, pp. 731–46; Benedetti 1995²; Benedetti in Rome 1995, no. 3; Gilbert 1995, pp. 135–41, 150–53; Hermann Fiore 1995, pp. 24–27; Tremblay in Macioce 1996, pp. 309–14; Schröter 1995, pp. 62–87; Treffers 1996, pp. 270–87; Gregori 1998, pp. 7–8; Heimbürger 1998, pp. 20–21; Langdon 1998, pp. 233–35, 388; Puglisi 1998, no. 41 (c. 1602–3); Robb 1998, p. 508 (1602); Benedetti in Mormando 1999, pp. 208–33; Mormando 1999, pp. 179–90, pl. 30 (1602); Varriano in Mormando 1999, pp. 192–203; Worcester in Mormando 1999, pp. 96; Slatkes in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 123 (1602); Spike 2001, pp. 128–31, cat. no. 30 (late 1602); Corrain in Calvesi and Volpi 2002, p. 225 (self-portrait as a painter because it shows his eye, face, and hand); Harr 2005; Sgarbi 2005, no. 36 (before the end of 1602); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 17, pp. 84–85 (1602); Tresoldi 2006, p. 91 (1602); Varriano 2006, pp. 8, 29, 48, 117, 122, fig. 96; Debono 2007, p. 16 ill.; Langdon in Valletta 2007, pp. 59–60 (“Caravaggio makes a deliberate reference to the painter’s tools, the hand, eye and chiaroscuro”); von Preimesberger in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 87–97; Papa 2008, pp. 22, 30 (1602); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82; Spike in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 15–20.

Caravaggio depicts the scene with the realism of a contemporary police documentary. He has injected a self-portrait of himself holding up a lantern. This is the sole example of artificial illumination in his paintings although his followers would be famous for the special effects of torches and lanterns. Caravaggio’s lantern does not cast much light; it serves instead as an evocation of the Greek philosopher Diogenes, who carried a lantern in the streets as he futilely sought to find an honest man. It is difficult to reconcile this metaphor with every Christian’s search for Christ, because Diogenes was a cynic who would not have believed in a Savior. By including himself in the company of Christ’s assailants, Caravaggio appears to question either his own faith or his worthiness. He had similarly represented himself among the fugitives from the martyrdom of Saint Matthew.

Of the several paintings acquired directly from the artist by Ciriaco Mattei, this *Taking of Christ* is the only one that remained in the family collection by mid-seventeenth century. The painting was cited and praised by sources and guidebook authors until the late eighteenth century, when confusion arose as to whether the author might not be Gerard Honthorst

instead. After its transport to Ireland, the painting disappeared from the literature until 1992, when it was referred by Sergio Benedetti, restorer at the National Gallery of Ireland, to the attention of Sir Denis Mahon. The recent rediscovery of the account book of Ciriaco Mattei has fixed its execution at the end of 1602, since the artist received payment of 125 scudi on January 2, 1603.

See pp. 128–31.

Condition:

Good. The painting was cleaned and restored by Sergio Benedetti of the National Gallery of Ireland in 1992. Various pentimenti were discovered on the sword of the soldier at center, the ear of Judas, and the figure of Christ, in particular his hands. See Benedetti (1993², pp. 34–37) for a complete technical report on the restoration of this painting.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C.1

Rome, Mattei collection

Inventories/Documents:

1. September 3, 1626: Asdrubale Mattei ordered and paid 12 scudi for a copy of the *Taking* by the painter Giovanni di Attilio (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 101, 103 n. 12).
2. This copy is recorded in the 1676 inventory taken at death of Duke Gerolamo Mattei, and even after the sale of the original painting in 1802, the copy continues to be mentioned in inventories of the Palazzo Mattei (Cappelletti–Testa 1994, pp. 102, 104 n. 26).

C.2

Rome, Collection of Ottavio Costa

January 18–23, 1639: Inventory of the objects in the house of Ottavio Costa, Rome, at his death: “Another large painting when Our Lord was taken in the orchard by the Jews” [“Un altro quadro grande quando Nostro Signore fu preso nell’orto da Giudei”].

Bibliography:

Costa Restagno 2004, pp. 106–8; Terzaghi 2007, p. 305 (both this painting, and the *Doubling Thomas* (cat. no. 33.c.6), are copies of originals by Merisi, being listed as originals by the Lombard in successive family inventories).

C.3

Prince Giuliano Colonna coll., Naples

Inventory/Document:

I. 1688 inventory of the di Stigliano collection: “Another, palmi 8 x 10, in a gilt frame, of the taking of Our Lord in the Garden, half-figure by Michel’Angelo Caravaggi. 400 ducats.”

Bibliography:

Moir 1967, I, p. 159; Moir 1976, p. 110 no. 60i; Marini 1989 p. 414 [connects to Odessa picture]); Spike 2001, cat. no. 30.c.2 (copy).

C.4

Naples, Giovanni Vandeneynnden

Inventory/Document:

I. 1688 inventory of the collection as a “Taking of Our Lord in the Garden by Caravaggio, Michelangelo Merisi Da” (Getty Provenance Index, 0080 Vandeneynnden, Giovanni 1688/12/02I–233; Spike 2001 Catalogue of Lost Paintings L.52).

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976 (pp. 109–10, nos. 60a–60i).

C.5

Odessa, Russia, State Museum of Eastern and Western Art; inv. 7

Oil on canvas, 52³/₄ x 68 in. (134 x 172.5 cm)

Provenance:

Collection of A. P. Basilevsky, Paris, who brought it to Russia and gave (sold?) it to Grand Prince Vladimir Alexandrovich in 1870, who thereafter donated it to the Fine Arts Academy of Saint Petersburg; 1899–1900 transferred to Odessa.

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 55 (copy); Milan 2005, no. I.15; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 14.

Bibliography:

Catalogo . . . 1878, no. 264, p. 8; *Catalogo . . .* 1924, n. 192, p. 21; Longhi 1943, pp. 13–14 (copy of unknown original); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (copy, 1603–4); Venturi 1951; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (copy, 1601–2); Znamerovskaja 1955 (copy); Malitzkaya 1956, no. 21 (original?); Bialostocki 1957 (original); Longhi 1960, pp. 23–36 (best of known copies); Jullian 1961 (1600–1601); Lazareff 1963, pp. 275–85 (1598–1601, composition is more compact than other known copies, characteristic of Caravaggio); Aliberti in Naples 1963, p. 785; Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 54 (copy); Kitson 1969, no. 52 (copy); Brigstocke 1972, pp. 108–11; Marini 1974, pp. 129–31, 370–72 n. 28 (original? 1598); Vsevolozhskaya 1975, no. 2 (1598–1601, possibly original); Moir 1976, p. 109 no. 60a, 143–44 n. 242 (copy); Nicolson 1979, p. 22 (original lost); Marini 1981, p. 366 (1598); Marini 1982, p. 77 (1598, belonged to the Mattei); Cinotti 1983, no. 39 (best of the copies); Hibbard 1983, no. 38 (copy); Marini 1983, p. 146, fig. 66 (as Mattei version); Gregori 1985, p. 352 (best of the versions); Marini 1989, pp. 413–14, no. 30 (Rome, 1598); Cappelletti–Testa 1990², pp. 5–7; Bologna 1992, pp. 322–23 (best copy known, 1602); Colasanti 1993, pp. 114–16; Benedetti in Rome 1995, p. 124 (faithful copy); Puglisi 1998, at no. 41 (copy); Spike 2001, cat. no. 30.c.3 (copy); Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 176–77, cat. no. I.15 (as attributed); Marini 2005, pp. 363, 578, Q-59; Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 221–24, cat. no. 14 (copy).

This excellent old copy was considered autograph by some prior to the rediscovery of the Mattei original.

C.6

Szépmuvészeti Museum, Budapest, inv. no. 76.4

Oil on canvas, 46 $\frac{7}{8}$ x 66 $\frac{1}{8}$ in. (119 x 168 cm)

Provenance:

Purchased from Erzsébet Etry and Mrs. Herendy (USA) 1976.

Exhibition:

Budapest 2006, cat. no. 22.

Bibliography:

Czobor, “L’arrestation du Christ” du Caravage” in *Bulletin du Musée Hongrois des Beaux Arts*, 10, 1957, pp. 87–90; Moir 1976, p. 109, no. 60d (follower of Honthorst?); Spike 2001, cat. no. 30.c.II (listed among copies cited by Moir); Tàtrai 2006, cat. no. 22 (as copy).

C.7

Private collection, Rome

Oil on canvas, 56 x 86 in. (142 x 218.5 cm)

Provenance:

Avv. von Ladis Sannini Collection, Florence, by 1943; from whom acquired by present owner.

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 55; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 13.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1943, pp. 13–14, fig. 16 (an old derivation, if not brilliant, at least faithful, also in its measurements 245 x 165 cm); Longhi in Milan 1951, p. 40, pl. 54 (as copy); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (copy); Mahon 1952 (copy); Hinks 1953, p. 111, cat. 41, pl. 63 (copy); Friedlander 1955, p. 173 (copy); Berne Joffroy 1959 (ed. 1999), p. 391 (copy); Longhi 1960, pp. 23–36 (copy); Lazzaref 1963, III, pp. 275–85 (copy); Moir 1976, p. 109, no. 6b (copy); Benedetti 1993, pp. 731–32,

n. 6–13 (copy; lists more copies unknown to Moir); Spike 2001, cat. no. 30.c.II (listed among copies cited by Moir); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 219–221, cat. no. 13 (1603, as autograph, with incomplete bibliography).

In 1943 Longhi identified this painting in the Sannini collection in Florence as a copy corresponding to Bellori's description of the lost picture in the Mattei collection (today in Dublin). In numerous subsequent publications, Longhi, Mahon, and other scholars who viewed the Sannini picture at the Caravaggio exhibition in Milan in 1951 referred to this painting as a copy in attempting to establish the date of the original composition. Moir publishes the painting as in the Sannini collection, Florence in 1976; after which it passed to a Roman private collection. The painting appeared on the Roman art market in 2003, was subsequently cleaned and restored, and exhibited in Düsseldorf (2006) as an original. The Düsseldorf catalogue entry cites Gregori, Mahon, Strinati, and Whitfield as in agreement with the autograph status.

31. Portrait of Cardinal Cesare Baronio (1538–1607), 1602–3

Oil on canvas, 23⁵/₈ x 18⁷/₈ in. (60 x 48 cm)

Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 3031

Inscribed at top: Caesar Cardinalis Baron

Inscribed on the reverse of the canvas: Emin.mo Cardinale Baronio

Exhibition:

Rome 1995².

Bibliography:

Pieraccini 1912, p. 218, n. 379; *Gli Uffizi* 1979, no. 1c55, p. 610 (unknown Florentine sixteenth century, before 1607); Calvesi 1990, p. 168 (perhaps entered the Uffizi collection in the 1590s; not unworthy of the intense realism of Caravaggio [“aggiunto forse proprio nell’ultimo

decennio del Cinquecento . . . non del tutto indegne dell'intenso realismo perseguito dal Caravaggio"]; "Il Ritratto del cardinale Cesare Baronio di Caravaggio," in *Il giornale dell'arte*, January 1995, p. 18); Spike in Rome 1995², pp. 588–90 (1602–4); Seracini–Schleicher in Rome 1995², pp. 591–93; Zuccari in Rome 1995², p. 481 (rejects Caravaggio); Danesi Squarzina 1995, p. 371; Shulman 1995, p. 72; Baldassare 1996, p. 103 (Orazio Riminaldi); Zuccari 1998, pp. 292–94 and 300, fig. 1 (perhaps one of the 170 portraits executed between 1599 and 1600 by Francesco Zucchi); Gash 2001, p. 429 (attribution not inappropriate); Spike 2001, p. 137, ill. p. 139, cat. no. 31 (1602–3); Varriano 2006, p. 91, fig. 70.

The painting belongs to the series of portraits of famous men that were collected by the Medici grand dukes in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. The majority of the portraits, nearly three hundred of them, were painted on panel by Cristofano dell'Altissimo between 1552 and 1589. During the seventeenth century two hundred more portraits were added, which are today mainly catalogued as anonymous.

In 1600 the Medici paid Francesco Zucchi, a minor painter in Rome, for 170 portraits, some of which presumably found their way into the Uffizi collection. Recent technical examination of this *Cardinal Baronio*, first attributed to Caravaggio in 1995, has established that the canvas was significantly trimmed on both sides and especially at bottom so as to reduce its dimensions to conform to the other portraits in the collection. The Baronio portrait was evidently not executed in the context of an extensive series. In addition, the characterization of this *Cardinal Baronio* is remarkably vigorous and intense, as Calvesi first observed, quite unlike Zucchi's known works.

Radiography revealed that the portrait was painted on top of a previous painting that was apparently also a portrait. The painter may have been asked to improve upon a preexisting portrait of the cardinal. Maurizio Seracini of Editech Laboratory observed several pentimenti in the rendition of the collar and jacket of the cardinal. Caravaggio frequently reused canvases during his Roman years both as an economy and as, one suspects, a implicit criticism of his late Mannerist contemporaries. The flesh tints and vigorous modeling of the face suggest a date to the time of the *Entombment* (cat. no. 32) in the Vatican, 1602–3, which was originally executed for the mother church of the Oratorian order to which Cardinal Baronio was the principal spokesman.

See text, p. 137, illustrated at p. 139.

Condition:

Very good. The painting was covered by an old varnish that had largely disintegrated when examined by the author in 1994. In the course of a conservation procedure carried out in the Uffizi gallery laboratory in 1995, the old varnish was replaced by a viscous and highly reflective varnish that did not improve the legibility of the work. The radiography, reflectography, and ultraviolet fluorescence carried out by Maurizio Seracini of Editech Laboratory, Florence, confirmed the chemical congruence of the work to the time and place of the artist.

Copies:

None recorded.

32. *Entombment*, 1602–3

Oil on canvas, 118 x 80 in. (300 x 203 cm)

Vatican City, Pinacoteca Vaticana, inv. 386

Provenance:

Painted between January 9, 1602 and September 1, 1604 for the Chapel of the Pietà, recently acquired by the Vittrici family in Santa Maria in Vallicella (Chiesa Nuova), Rome; taken to Paris by Napoleon in 1797; removed from the Louvre, October 20, 1815, and returned to the Vatican on January 4, 1816, and placed in the Pinacoteca Vaticana.

Documents:

1. September 28, 1596: Payment is made toward the expansion of the second chapel on the right of the Pietà beyond the outer wall of the old chapel in Santa Maria in Vallicella, Rome (Zuccari 1983, pp. 53–56).
2. January 9, 1602: The Oratorians of Santa Maria in Vallicella resolve to ask Cardinal Baronio

to request that the pope permit the celebration of this chapel's Masses at another altar until the new one is completed (Zuccari 1983, pp. 53–56; Macioce 2003, doc. 119, p. 107).

3. January 11, 1602: Payment for breaking through the outer wall to connect with the new chapel, constructed since 1596 (Zuccari 1983, pp. 53–56).

4. January 15, 1602: Clement VIII grants the request to transfer to the new altar the privilege “for the souls of the deceased” conceded to the old one in 1577 by Gregory XIII; while the new altar is being completed, this privilege is temporarily granted to “some other altar” (Zuccari 1983, pp. 53–56).

5. September 6, 1604: The Oratorians resolve to give the old painting of the *Pietà*, with its ornamented wooden frame, to Girolamo Vittrici, nephew and heir of Signor Pietro Vittrici, deceased in 1600, who had made the new painting by Caravaggio, which did not require the frame [“si dia al nepote del Signor Pietro Vittrici il quadro della Pietà con il suo ornamento di legno, che dimanda havendo di sua cortesia fatto fare il quadro nuovo del Caravaggio al quale non serve il sopradetto ornamento di legno”] (Lopresti 1922, p. 116; Sickel 2001, pp. 426–29).

6. October 1609: “I, Girolamo Vittrici, confirm the receipt from the Congregation of the Madonna in Vallicella of a picture that had been in my chapel, having had made another one.” [“Io Geronimo Vittrice confesso haver ricevuto dalla congregazione della Madonna in Vallicella un quadro per haverne fatto fare un altro che era nella mia cappella.”] (Zuccari 1983, p. 54, n. 9; Sickel 2001, p. 427, n. 114).

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–21 (ed. 1956, p. 80): “In the Chiesa Nuova . . . the deposition of Christ by Michelangelo da Caravaggio (after 1600)” [“nella Chiesa Nova . . . il Christo deposto di Michelangelo da Caravaggio doppo il 600”].

2. Celio 1620–24, p. 52 (facsim. ed. 1638 Naples, p. 20): “S. Maria in Vallicella near the Via dell’Orefeci, called the Pilgrim, . . . the altarpiece with Christ dead, in oil, by Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“S. Maria in Vallicella presso la via dell’orefeci, detto il Pellegrino, . . . La pittura di Altare con il Christo morto ad’olio, di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”].

3. Baglione 1642, p. 137: “In the Chiesa Nuova in the second chapel on the right is Christ dead, whom they desire to bury, with other figures, painted in oil; and this they say is his best work” [“Nella Chiesa nuova alla man diritta v’è del suo nella seconda cappella il Christo morto, che lo vogliono seppellire con alcune figure, a olio lavorato; e questa dicono, che sia la miglior opera di lui”].

4. Scannelli 1657, p. 199: “Of similar extraordinary excellence is the canvas in the Chiesa Nuova which shows when they carried the dead Christ to the tomb . . .” [“Di simile straordinaria eccellenza si ritrova egualmente la Tavola nella Chiesa Nuova, che dimostra quando portano Christo morto a seppellire . . .”].

5. von Sandrart before 1658 (ed. 1675, pp. 189–90): “More of his work can be seen in Rome at the Chiesa Nuova, the *Deposition of Christ*, of which I can show a good copy . . .” (Friedlaender 1955, p. 265).

6. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 220): “Among the best works painted by the brush of Michele, and justly held in the highest esteem, is the *Deposition of Christ* in the Chiesa Nuova of the Oratorian Fathers. The figures are assembled on a stone at the opening of the tomb. In the middle is the sacred body, at his feet is Nicodemus who embraces Christ’s legs under the knees; and in the lowering of the hips the legs from the knees down are extended. Saint John supports an arm and shoulder of the Redeemer whose head is thrown back, his breast deathly pale, his arm hanging down with the shroud. The nude is drawn with the force of the most exact imitation. Behind Nicodemus, are the three sorrowful Maries, one with her arms raised, the other with her veil to her eyes, and the third watching the Lord.” [“Ben tra le migliori opere, che uscissero dal pennello di Michele si tiene meritatamente in istima la Deposizione di Christo nella Chiesa Nuova de’ Padri dell’Oratorio; situate le figure sopra una pietra nell’apertura del sepolcro. Vedesi in mezzo il sacro corpo, lo regge Nicodemo da piedi, abbracciandolo sotto le ginocchia, e nell’abbassarsi le coscie, escono in fuori le gambe. Di là San Giovanni sottopone un braccio alla spalla del Redentore, e resta supina la faccia, e ‘l petto pallido a morte, pendendo il braccio col lenzuolo; e tutto l’ignudo è ritratto con forza della piú esatta imitazione. Dietro Nicodemo si veggono alquanto le Marie dolenti, l’una con le braccia sollevate, l’altra col velo a gli occhi, e la terza riguarda il Signore.”]

7. Silos 1673, p. 32, Epigram LII.

8. Baldinucci 1681, III, p. 685.

9. von Ramdohr 1787, III, p. 314.

10. Lanzi 1809 (ed. 1968, I, p. 359).

Exhibitions:

Lucerne 1948; New York 1983–84, no. 85; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 141 (London only).

Bibliography:

Craffonara in Craffonara–Guattani, 1820, pl. 29 (engraving); Kugler 1837, p. 352; Burckhardt 1855, p. 1025; Kallab 1906–7, pp. 285, 290 (1595); Saccá 1907, p. 43; Longhi 1913, p. 161 (datable near Cerasi Chapel); Witting 1916, pp. 22–23; Lopresti 1922, p. 116; Marangoni 1922, p. 792 (near the *Doubting Thomas* [cat. no. 33]); Voss 1923, p. 98 (after Cerasi Chapel); Voss 1924, p. 80, pl. 23; Pevsner 1927/28, p. 387 (1602–4); Longhi 1928/29, pp. 26, 291–92, 299, 312, 320; Stechow 1931–32, pp. 196; Schudt 1942, no. 31; Argan 1943, pp. 40–43 (the woman with raised arms, Maria di Cleofa, was later addition); Ainaud 1947, pp. 389–90; Arslan 1951, p. 449 (1602); Berenson 1951, pp. 29–31; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1601–2); Longhi 1952, cat. XXIX; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1601–3); Hinks 1953, no. 35; Baumgart 1955, no. 38; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 187–89, no. 25 (commissioned 1601, begun 1602, finished 1603); Graeve 1958, pp. 223–38 (iconography of stone slab as “stone of unction” makes the picture a Pietà); Wagner 1958, pp. 102–6, 131–35; Wittkower 1958, pp. 24–25; Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 317 (before Cerasi Chapel); Jullian 1961, pp. 141–42, 144–46 (1602–4); Röttgen 1965, pp. 64–66 (late 1602); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 53 (1602–4, recalls *Deposition* by Peterzano in San Fedele in Milan); Moir 1967, I, pp. 19–20; Kitson 1969, no. 51 (1602–4); Salerno 1970, pp. 237–38; Calvesi 1971, pp. 121–23, 135–36 (Christ is the cornerstone and foundation of the Church; commissioned by Oratorians); Cinotti 1971, pp. 67, 70–71, 117–20, 127–28 (dating not tied to restitution of frame); Spear 1971, p. 9; Marini 1974, pp. 32–33, 180–83, 398–99, no. 48 (1602–4); Moir 1976, p. 94 no. 25; Nicolson 1977, p. 862; Wright 1978, pp. 35–42 (questions cornerstone allusion); Nicolson 1979, p. 32 (1602–4); Zuccari 1981, pp. 92–105 (commissioned by the

Oratorians); Magnuson 1982, pp. 89 (1602–4); Cinotti 1983, no. 45 (end 1602–early 1603); Hibbard 1983, pp. 312–14; Spike 1983, p. 40; Mancinelli in New York 1983–84, pp. 160–63 (combines allusions to stone of unction, cornerstone, and the Pietà); Zuccari 1983, pp. 53–56; Calvesi 1986, pp. 35–36 (1602–4); Grossman 1984; Glen 1988, p. 21; Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 20 (cites sermon by Francesco Panigarola comparing the tomb of Christ to a cornerstone and to a balance); Calvesi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 8–9 (commission from Pietro Vittrici administered by Fabio Nuti between April and November, 1600); Marini 1989, pp. 461–64, cat. 51 (c. 1602–3, reviews documents); Calvesi 1990, pp. 315–18; Posèq 1990², p. 163 n. 8 (inspired by Roman sarcophagus reliefs of a drunken Pan being carried in the procession of Bacchus and Ariadne, or alternatively perhaps by a sarcophagus relief showing Meleager’s funeral); Bologna 1992, pp. 108–11, 323–24 (commissioned by Pietro Vittrici; January 1602–September 1604); Calvesi 1994, pp. 148–57 (reviews documentation identifies commission with unspecified contract received by Caravaggio from Fabio Nuti on April 5, 1600); Gregori 1994, pp. 106, 150, no. 42 (1602–4); Calvesi in *Caravaggio e la collezione Mattei* 1995, p. 20 (Oratorian influence); Gilbert 1995, p. 185; Calvesi 1995, p. 20; Macioce 1996, p. 360 (demonstrates Caravaggio’s ties to the Oratorians); Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, p. 4 (1603–4); Rowlands 1996, no. 25 (1603/4); Heimbürger 1998, pp. 25–29 (Dürer influence); Langdon 1998, pp. 241–45; Puglisi 1998, no. 43 (c. 1602–4); Robb 1998, p. 508 (1603); Benedetti in Mormando 1999, pp. 208–33, fig. 30; Varriano in Mormando 1999, pp. 192–203 (1602–4); Sickel 2001, pp. 426–29 (probably commissioned by Girolamo Vittrici directly from Caravaggio in January 1602; reviews the documentation); Spike 2001, pp. 131–36, cat. no. 32 (1602–3); Treffers in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 141 (1602–3); Sgarbi 2005, no. 39 (The commission for the altarpiece . . . occurred in February 1602, after Guerra completed his work in the chapel); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 27–28 (1602); Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 186 (illustrates van Baburen etching); Tresoldi 2006, p. 93 (1602–3); Varriano 2006, pp. 45–46, 106–8, 119, fig. 40; Terzaghi 2007, pp. 283–84 (already in situ on September 6, 1604); Ziane in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 161–79 (for Oratorian connection); Papa 2008, pp. 80–91 (1602–3); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82; Spike in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 15–20.

The *Entombment* was executed for the second chapel on the right side of Santa Maria in Vallicella, also known as the Chiesa Nuova, the mother church of the Oratorian order founded by Saint Philip Neri. The chapel was owned by Pietro Vittrici, who died on March 26, 1600.

Caravaggio responded to this important commission with the most monumental composition of his career and succeeded in attracting praise from all writers including Bellori, the arch-classicist. Copies soon found their way to distant cities and countries and even Peter Paul Rubens made one in homage. Duly cited in all the guidebooks, Napoleon requisitioned it for France in 1797. It was replaced in the Chiesa Nuova by a copy by Vincenzo Camuccini (subsequently replaced by one by Michel Köck, which remains today). The painting has been in the Vatican Pinacoteca since its return from France in 1816.

The available documentation establishes only the chronological brackets of January 9, 1602, when work was underway in chapel, and September 1, 1604, when its execution is recorded in a document referring to the transfer of the old altarpiece. Girolamo Vittrici is cited as having paid for the work. Marini (1989) deduced from this document that the painting was already in situ, as is possible but not certain. A dating to between 1602 and 1603 seems indicated on the basis of style.

See pp. 131–36.

Condition:

Good. The painting was restored in 1982.

Copies

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

von Sandart, before 1658 (ed. 1675, pp. 189–90): “More of his work can be seen in Rome at the Chiesa Nuova, the *Interment of Christ*, of which I can show a good copy” (Friedlaender 1955, p. 265; Spike 2001, cat. no. 32.c.1).

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, pp. 94–96, nos. 25a–2500. Among these is:

C.2

Deposition, 1614

By Peter Paul Rubens

National Gallery, Ottawa (formerly Liechtenstein Collection)

Bibliography:

Friedlaender 1955, p. 189; Cinotti 1983, at no. 45; Calvesi 1994, pp. 151–52 (proposes the theory that Rubens copied a lost model by Caravaggio for the altarpiece, thus explaining the differences between them); Spike 2001, cat. no. 32.c.2.

33. *Doubting Thomas, c. 1603*

Oil on canvas, 42 x 57½ in. (107 x 146 cm)

Stiftung Schlösser und Gärten, Sanssouci, Potsdam, Germany, inv. GKI 5438

Provenance:

Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani, Rome, by 1606; sold with the Giustiniani collection in Paris 1812; acquired by the Kaiser Friedrich Museum, Berlin, 1815; sometime before World War II placed on exhibition at Neues Palais, Potsdam.

Inventories:

1. February 9, 1638: Inventory of paintings in the collection of Vincenzo Giustiniani, “n. 10: In the large room of old paintings . . . a painting above the door of half-figures with the story of Saint Thomas who touches Christ’s ribs with his finger, painted on canvas, 5 palmi high, 6 palmi wide—by Michelangelo da Caravaggio with a black carved and gilt frame” [“Nella Stanza Grande de Quadri Antichi . . . Un quadro sopraporto di mezze figure con l’Historia di S. Tomasso che tocca il Costato di Christo col dito depinto in tela alto pal. 5 larg. Pal 6—di mano

Michelangelo da Caravaggio con cornice negra porfilata e rabescata d'oro"] (Danesi Squarzina 2003, part II, no. 10, pp. 397–99).

2. 1793 (I, n. 129): Inventory of paintings in the Palazzo Giustiniani: "Another 4.5 palmi wide representing Saint Thomas when he puts his finger into the wound on the rib of Our Lord, by Michel'Angelo Caravaggio, with a gilt frame of good gold. Model of Salvator Rosa" ["Altro di palmi 4.5 per traverso rappresentante S. Tomaso quando mette il dito nella Piaga del Costato di Nostro Signore, di Michel'Angelo Caravaggio, con Cornice dorata ad Oro buono. Modello di Salvator Rosa"] (Salerno 1960, pp. 135–36 n.10; Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, 1638, part II, no. 10, pp. 397–98).

Document:

1. August 4–6, 1606: Giustiniani in a letter compared his original to a copy in the house of Orazio Del Negro, Genoa. This is noted by his secretary, Bernardo Bizzoni, in his diary of this trip. (Cinotti 1983, p. 490)

Sources:

1. Baglione 1642, p. 137: "Caravaggio also painted for Ciriaco Mattei a *Saint John the Baptist* and *Our Lord on his Way to Emmaus*, and then a scene of Thomas touching with his finger the wound in the side of the Lord, thus did Caravaggio relieve this gentleman of many hundreds of scudi." ["Anche il signor Signor Ciriaco Mattei, a cui il Caravaggio havea dipinto un s. Gio Battista e quando N. Signore andò in Emaus [London, National Gallery] e all'ora che s. Thommaso toccò col dito il costato del Salvatore; e intaccò quel Signore di molte centinaia di scudi."]

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 222): "Caravaggio continued to be favored by Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani, who commissioned from him some pictures, the *Crowning with Thorns* [cat. no. 38] and *Saint Thomas* putting his finger in the wound in chest of the Lord, who draws his hand closer and pulls aside the shroud, revealing his breast." ["Seguitava egli nel favore del marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani, che l'impiegò in alcuni quadri, l'Incoronazione di spine [see cat. no. 38] e San Tomaso che pone il dito nella piaga del costato del Signore, il quale gli acosta la mano, e si svela il petto da un lenzuolo, discostandolo dalla poppa."]

3. Silos 1673, I, p. 92, Epigramma CLXV (II, pp. 342–44).

4. von Sandrart 1675 (1679, 1683) p. 189 after describing the death of Ranuccio Tomassoni: “During this time in which [Caravaggio] had to hide in this manner, he painted in the [Giustiniani] palace, Christ, in whose holy wounds Thomas, in the presence of the other apostles, is putting his finger. By means of good painting and modeling he was able to show on the faces of all those present such an expression of astonishment and naturalness of skin and flesh that in comparison all other pictures seemed to be miniatures on paper.” [“Nel periodo in cui dovette stare nascosto in quel modo, egli dipinse nel palazzo del marchese [Giustiniani] Cristo che fa porre a tommaso il dito nelle sue sante ferite, alla presenza degli altri apostoli: nei volti di tutti i presenti, grazie alla qualità della pittura e al rilievo, egli espresse una tale stupefazione e realizzò un tale naturalezza della pelle e delle carni che quasi tutti gli altri quadri, al confronto, sembrano miniature su carta.”] (Macioce 2003, Fonte 14, p. 321)

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 54 (copy); Rome 2001; Rome-Berlin 2001, cat. no. D2.

Bibliography:

Delaroche 1812, no. 95; London 1812, p. 95; *Verzeichniss der ehemals zu der Giustinianischen jetzt zu den Königlichen Sammlungen gehörigen Gemälde* 1826 (n. 100; L1819 n. 47, “without doubt one of the masterpieces of this artist”); Marangoni 1922, cat. XXX; Voss 1923, pp. 94–95 (at some point the museum returned the painting to the crown as not worthy of exhibition, and it was stored in the warehouses of the Castle of Charlottenburg; reattributed by Voss as original by Caravaggio, 1595); Voss 1924, pp. 78, pl. 17; Longhi 1928/29, pp. 27, 31; Poensgen 1935, no. 23; Schudt 1942, no. 38; Longhi 1943, pp. 12–14, 39 n. 25 (best extant copy of original c. 1595); Ainaud 1947, pp. 291–92; Baroni 1951 (1595); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 54 (copy); Mahon 1951, pp. 228, 234 (best extant copy of original, 1599–1600); Venturi 1951, no. 52; Longhi 1952, p. 32; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (copy of original datable 1599–1600); Hinks 1953, no. 22 (best extant copy of original 1598–99); Mahon 1953, p. 213 n. 7; Baumgart 1955, no. 31 (best extant copy of original 1598–1600); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 161–62, no. 17 (did not know if still extant after World War II; late 1590s); Chastel 1956, p. 960 (responds to “grand manner of the Carracci”); Wagner 1958, pp. 50–51, 86–92, 188–89 n. 202–7 (best extant copy of original 1597–99); Arslan

1959, pp. 202–4; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 152–53, 196–98 (copy); Salerno 1960, pp. 135–36; Ivanoff 1961, pp. 147–51; Jullian 1961, pp. 142, 154 n. 12–14, 228 (copy of original 1602–3); Moir 1967, I, pp. 19 n. 28, 53 n. 131, 54, n. 134, 97, n. 7, II, p. 57, n.5; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 50 (as destroyed); Kitson 1969, no. 49 (destroyed); Longhi 1968, pp. 28, 157 (among Caravaggios lost in Berlin); Calvesi 1971, pp. 121–22 (copy of lost original); Cinotti 1971, pp. 68, 74, 124, 163; Spear 1971, p. 109; Spear 1971, p. 109; Spezzaferro 1971, p. 84; Frommel 1972, pp. 9, 30–31 (Baglione mistook Mattei for Giustiniani, notes that painting not listed in 1613 Mattei inventory); Ivanoff 1972, pp. 71–73, 105–9; Pérez Sánchez in Seville 1973, no. 6; de Salas 1973, p. 33; Marini 1974, pp. 141, 375–77 n. 31 (1599); Nicolson 1974, p. 560; Moir 1976, pp. 88–90 no. 18; Nicolson 1979, p. 35; Marini 1981, p. 366 (1599); Marini 1982, p. 77 (1599, belonged to Giustiniani); Moir 1982, p. 110 (1601–2); Cinotti 1983, no. 44 (1602–3); Marini 1983, pp. 135–37 (1599); Hibbard 1983, pp. 167–68, 311 (1602–3); Marini 1989, pp. 423–24, no. 36 (Rome, 1599); Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 21; Cappelletti–Testa 1990², p. 7 (based upon Baglione, believe that this painting was originally in the collection of the Mattei who sold it to Giustiniani sometime before 1606); Bologna 1992, p. 320 (1601–2); Cappelletti in Rome 1995, p. 46 (probably painted for Giustiniani while Caravaggio was resident in the Palazzo Mattei, 1601); Gilbert 1995, pp. 152–53, 257, 269 n. 60 (“Cappelletti and Testa, for instance, believe that the Mattei owned four works by Caravaggio. The reason is that one source, Baglione, reports that Marquis Ciriaco also commissioned the *Doubting Thomas* but his statement finds no endorsement in any of the other reports on this famous work and is rejected in some”; rejects Frommel’s proposal that Mattei sold almost instantaneously to Giustiniani); Danesi Squarzina 1995, p. 370; Testa in Rome 1995, p. 118 (suggests Baglione erred in referring this painting to Ciriaco Mattei); Perini 1995, p. 200; Schröter 1995, pp. 62–87; Askew in Macioce 1996, p. 254 (1602–3); Sciuti et al. in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 69–85; Danesi Squarzina 1997, p. 773; Heimbürger 1998, p. 20 (quotes Friedlaender: “The realistic motif of Christ guiding the hand of Thomas as he feels the wound is based on a very old tradition. But we find parallels to Caravaggio’s emphasis on the finger thrust into the wound only in Northern representations, especially in Dürer”); Langdon 1998, pp. 235–37; Puglisi 1998, no. 42 (perhaps alludes to transubstantiation controversy, c. 1602–3); Robb 1998, p. 508 (1602); Varriano in Mormando 1999, pp. 192–203 (1602–3); Danesi Squarzina 2001, pp. 278–80, cat. no. D2 (c. 1600–1601); Dempsey in Calvesi and Volpi 2001, pp. 185–96; Spike 2001, pp. 123–25, cat. no. 33 (c. 1603); Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, pp. 397–98; Suthor in von Rosen 2003, n. 59, p. 276 (the tear in the sleeve of Thomas mirrors

Christ's wound); Sgarbi 2005, no. 26 (c. 1599, before Contarelli Chapel); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (1598–99); Tresoldi 2006, p. 90 (1600–1601); Varriano 2006, pp. 14, 29, 37, 60, 105, 107, 122, 130, fig. 11; Pichler in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 9–33 (compares the bilateral symmetry of the composition to the arched outline of the figures in the *Beheading of Saint John I*, Valletta [cat. no. 63]); Papa 2008, pp. 12, 30 (1599); Spike in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, p. 15–20.

Caravaggio's *Doubting Thomas* is the image of a rational man who will not be satisfied with secondhand information. The apostle Thomas said he would not believe that Jesus was risen and appeared to the disciples until he had seen and touched His wounds for himself (John 20:29). The biblical text had special relevance for influential thinkers like Caravaggio and Galileo who advocated personal experience as a source of knowledge. "In questions of science the authority of a thousand is not worth the humble reasoning of a single individual" was Galileo's shocking pronouncement. At the close of the sixteenth century, scientists, philosophers, and writers increasingly espoused empirical approaches to human affairs. The skeptical philosophy of Sextus Empiricus was widely known in Rome, where it was available in several editions after 1562. As one of the artist's most copied works, the *Doubting Thomas* was doubtless appreciated for its forceful depiction of a modern way of thinking.

Baglione states with seeming certainty that the *Doubting Thomas* belonged to the group of canvases for which Caravaggio was handsomely paid by the Mattei family. If not for this isolated reference, it would otherwise be assumed that the painting was executed for the Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani, in whose collection it is documented as early as 1606. The fact that Baglione forgets to mention the *Taking of Christ* (cat. no. 30), the only original that the Mattei retained, leads us to suspect a simple slip of the pen.

The present work was generally rejected by experts until 1960, when Luigi Salerno published the Giustiniani inventory of 1638. This uncertainty was due to confusion over the dating of the very similar *Sacrifice of Isaac* (cat. no. 34), whose date of 1603 was not then known.

Early inventories abound with references to copies and replicas ascribed to Caravaggio's own hand. The proliferation of copies testifies to the extraordinary popularity of this *Doubting Thomas*. Given the importance of some of these collectors of these copies—or example,

Philippe de Béthune, the ambassador of France who arranged the release of the artist from prison—the possibility that Caravaggio supervised the execution of workshop copies cannot be excluded.

See text, pp. 123–25.

Condition:

Good. The visibility of the painting would be notably improved by a cleaning and replacement of varnish.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C.1

Genoa, Casa Orazio dal Negro

August 4–6, 1606: Vincenzo Giustiniani in a letter compared his original to a copy in this house in Genoa (Friedlaender 1955, p. 162; Moir 1976, p. 90 no. 18x; Cinotti 1983, p. 245; Spike 2001, cat. no. 33.c.1; Danesi Squarzina 2003, pp. 397–98 (Giustiniani relative)).

C.2

Rome, Giulio Mancini

January 6, 1607: Giulio Mancini wrote to his brother Deifebo that Pandolfo Savini wished to have a copy made of a picture of Saint Thomas when he touches the flank of Christ, by Caravaggio (Maccherini 1997, p. 82; Spike 2001, cat. no. 33.c.2; Ciampolini in Pontedera 2005, p. CXLV [identifies as Pandolfo Savini whose collection was sold on July 3, 1615, which she connects to yet another copy of this painting listed in a 1729 collection of Adriano Sani “un quadro con Cristo che si fa mettere la mano nel costato da S. Tommaso del Caravaggio, con corn.e intagliata e dorata”]).

C.3

Paris, Philippe de Béthune

November 19, 1608: Inventory of the collection: “a large original painting by Michel Lange representing Saint Thomas putting his finger in the wound of Our Lord, in a gilt frame, 130 livres” (Babelon 1988, pp. 33–38). The painting remained in the collection of Béthune’s heirs at least until 1680 (Babelon 1988, pp. 33–38; Spike 2001, cat. no. 33.c.3; “Delight at Caravaggio discovery,” *BBC News*, Europe, January 25, 2006; *Les Caravagge de Philippe de Béthune . . .* 2009).

In January of 2006, it was announced by art historian José Frèches that a version of this composition bearing the coat of arms of Philippe de Béthune was hanging in the Church of Sant Antoine in the town of Loches-en-touraine, France. To judge from a photograph, the work appears to be a copy of the Potsdam picture by the same hand as the painter of the *Supper at Emmaus*, cat. no. 25.c.2.

C.4

Castello di Gallese, Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps

A. A copy is cited in the account book (*Libro Mastro*) of the Altemps, 1611–13:

i. February 15, 1613: “Payment by Giovan Angelo Altemps of 70 scudi to Prospero Orsi for two unidentified paintings of Saint Thomas and Our Lord and of David and Goliath” [“scudi settanta di moneta a Prospero Orsi pittore e sono per doi quadri di San Tomaso e N.S. e l’altro di Golia e David”].

ii. July 11, 1613: “Payment by Giovan Angelo Altemps for framing of a Doubting Thomas by Caravaggio above the bookcase with prohibited books” [“scudi 6 moneta pagati per una cornici di oro per mettere al quadro di N.S. e S.to Tomaso sopra la libreria de libri proibiti del Caravaggio”].

B. October 15, 1620: Inventory Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps Castello di Gallese, at c.38.r: “A Saint Thomas who puts his finger in the rib of Christ with other disciples, 6 palmi wide,

with an intarsia gild frame 15” [“Uno s. Tomaso che mette il detto nella costa di Xpo con altri discepoli larga palmi 6 con cornice intag[lia]to et indorato 15”].

Bibliography:

Spezzaferro in Calvesi and Volpi 2002, p. 29 (the paintings must be copies on the basis of the low price); Macioce 2003, docs. 12, 13, p. 345.

C.5

Rome, Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte

1627 inventory records that he owned a copy of the painting of Christ with Saint Thomas [“Un quadro di Nostro Signore con S. Tommaso copia del Caravaggio di Palmi sei con Cornici negre”] (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol. 575r; Frommel 1972, p. 30).

Bibliography:

Gilbert 1995, p. 112; Spike 2001, cat. no. 33.c.4.

C.6

Rome, Collection of Ottavio Costa

A. January 18–23, 1639: Inventory of the objects in the house of Ottavio Costa, Rome, at his death: “78. And another painting of Saint Thomas with Our Lord when he showed his rib” [“78. E più un altro quadro con l’immagine di San Tomaso e Nostro Signore quanto li mostrò il costato”] (Spezzaferro 1974, p.584; Costa Restagno 2004, no. 74, p. 100).

B. May 30, 1732, Rome: Posthumous inventory of Mons. Guido Del Pelagio, who acquired the painting by descent, from Ottavio Costa: “2. Another similar with similar frame imperial canvas representing Saint Thomas who touches the rib of Our Lord by Caravaggio 108 scudi 30” [“2. Altro simile con cornice simile tela imperatore rappresentante / San Tomasso che tocca il costato a Nostro Signore mano del Caravaggi 108 sc. 30”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 26, p. 106).

C. January 15–17 1834, Rome: Posthumous inventory of Marchese Giuseppe Origo, who acquired by descent, from Mons. Del Pelagio: “33. a large painting on canvas showing Saint Thomas who touches the rib of our Lord, believed to be by Caravaggio, with frame scudi 25” [“33. Un quadro della misura d’imperatore per traverso, dipinto in tela, rappresentante San Tommaso che tocca il costato di Nostro Signore che credesi del Caravaggio, con cornice intagliata, e dorata, scudi 25”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 27, p. 115).

D. Undated valuation (“stima a prezzi”) compiled by painters, Tommaso Minardi and Giovanni Silvagni, between 1834 and 1846, after the donation by the Marchese Giuseppe Origo to the Congregazione degli Operai della Divina Pietà, commissioned by Sig. Poncini: “no. 3, painting identified with n. 8, representing the Incredulity of Saint Thomas half figures life-size copy made in the school of Caravaggio” [“3, Quadro segnato n. 8, rappresentante l’incredulità di San Tommaso mezza figura di grandezza naturale copia fatta nella scuola di Caravaggio sc. 20”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 1, p. 121).

E. March 26, 1846, Catalogue paintings and coppers by various authors, not guaranteed, of objects received from Marchese Giuseppe Origo, offered for sale by the Congregazione degli Operai della Divina Pietà: “7. The incredulity of Saint Thomas, half figure, life size, copy made by the school of Caravaggio 8.” [“Catalogo di quadri e Rami antichi di varj autori, che però non si garantiscono, . . . 7. L’incredulità di S. Tommaso mezza figura di grandezza naturale copia fatta nella scuola di Caravaggio 8”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 6, p. 123).

F. January 16, 1864: Note of paintings sold by the Congregazione della Divina Pietà, Rome [“Nota di quadri appartenenti alla Congregazione della Divina Pietà di Roma venduti dal sottoscritto Deputato della medesima con autorizzazione, 16 January 1864; 7. l’incredulità di San Tomaso, mezza figura di grandezza naturale, copia fatta della scuola di Caravaggio, sc. 8.30”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 6, p. 123).

Bibliography:

Spezzaferro 1974, p. 584; Costa Restagno 2004; Terzaghi 2007, p. 305 (both this painting, and the *Taking of Christ* (cat. no. 30.c.2), are copies although they are both later listed as originals by Caravaggio in successive family inventories).

C.7

Spain, Don Martín de Saavedra Guzmán y Galindo, knight of the Order of Calatrava,

November 17, 1630: inventory of objects pledged against loan of 1,000 copper ducats and 4,551 silver reales from his father: “[20] another painting an original by Michaelangelo Carabucho of Saint Thomas” (Burke–Cherry 1997, pp. 15, 282; Spike 2001, cat. no. 33.c.5).

C.8

Duke of Savoy

1635 inventory of the collection

Bibliography:

Di Vesme 1897, no. 538; Spear 1971, p. 109, n. 1; Moir 1976, p. 90 no. 18z; Cinotti 1983, p. 490; Spike 2001, cat. no. 33.c.6.

C.9

Gian Vincenzo Imperiale

1648 inventory: “Saint Thomas touching the rib of Christ, by Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio” (Getty Provenance Index, 0175 Imperiale, GianVincenzo 1648/06/29I–825; Spike 2001, cat. no. 33.c.7).

C.10

Rome, Gallery of the Lodovisi

Scannelli 1657, p. 199: A painting of “Saint Thomas putting his finger in the side of Christ” (Spike 2001, cat. no. 33.c.8).

C. I I

Florence, Cardinal Carlo de Medici

1666 inventory: “A painting on canvas 1 and $\frac{1}{4}$ bracci high and 2 and $\frac{1}{2}$ wide with Our Lord in which he shows Saint Thomas who puts his finger in the wound with four figures said to be by the hand of Caravaggio . . .” [“Un quadro in tela alto bracci 1 e $\frac{1}{4}$ e largo 2 e $\frac{1}{2}$ entovi N. Signore quando si mostra a S. Tommaso che gli mette il dito nella ferita con quattro figure dicesi mano del Caravaggio . . .”] (Spike 2001, cat. no. 33.c.9; Hurrting in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 258).

C. I 2

Bologna, Signori Lambertini

Source:

Malvasia 1678, II, p. 217: A Saint Thomas touching the side of the Lord, an original by Caravaggio, in their possession.

Bibliography:

Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, pp. 398 (three copies are mentioned by Malvasia, being Lambertini, Legnani, and Garbieri, which Moir believes to have derived from a single Bolognese copy of the Giustiniani original).

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976 (pp. 88–90, nos. 18a–18ff); Marini (1974, no. 31); Cinotti (1983, pp. 554–55). Among these are:

C. I 3

Florence, Galleria degli Uffizi

Oil on canvas, $42\frac{1}{2}$ x $57\frac{1}{2}$ in. (108 x 146 cm)

Perhaps same painting as c.11 above

Exhibition:

Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 42.

Bibliography:

Marangoni 1922, pp. 792–93 (copy, superior to Potsdam version); Venturi 1951 (copy); Friedlaender 1955, p. 162 (copy); Berne Joffroy 1958 (copy); Moir 1976, pp. 89 no. 18g, 127 n. 192 (workshop of Mattia Preti); Cinotti 1983, pp. 489–90; Spike 2001, cat. nos. 33.c.9 and 33.c.11; Marini 2005, pp. 460–61; Hurttig in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 258–59, cat. no. 42.

C. 14

Paris, Prince G. Eristoff

Oil on canvas, 41 x 55 in. (104 x 139.5 cm)

Provenance:

Rome.

Bibliography:

Ivanoff 1972, pp. 71–72 (believes the Eristoff painting to be an original formerly in the Mattei collection); Pérez Sánchez 1973, no. 6; Moir 1976, p. 89 no. 18s; Cinotti 1983, p. 490 (very high quality, perhaps copy mentioned in 1627 inventory of Cardinal Del Monte); Marini 1983, pp. 135–37, fig. 30 (painting for Mattei); Spike 2001, cat. no. 33.c.12.

To judge from the photograph, this excellent old copy was possibly executed under Caravaggio's supervision.

C. 15

Rome, private collection

Oil on canvas, 41 x 55 in. (118 x 156.7 cm)

Exhibition:

Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 43.

Bibliography:

Marini 2005, p. 361, Q-51; Hurrting in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 259–60, cat. no. 43 (1601/02), who records that a 1997 restoration uncovered the following written on the back of the canvas in black capitals: “MICHAELE DA CARAVAGGIO / PITTORE.” Hurrting connects this to that recorded in the collection of Philippe de Béthune (cat. no. 33.c.3, above).

34. *Sacrifice of Isaac*, 1603

Oil on canvas, 41 x 53 in. (104 x 135 cm)

Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence, inv. 4659

Provenance:

Painted for Maffeo Barberini, Rome, probably in 1603; by descent in the Barberini collection; reportedly acquired from Barberini–Colonna di Sciarra collection, Rome, by John Fairfax Murray, who donated it in 1917 to the Galleria degli Uffizi, where it entered as by Caravaggio.

Inventories:

1. December 7, 1608: Inventory of the possessions of Cardinal Maffeo Barberini, in the house of Marchese Salviati, via dei Penetenzieri, Rome, without indication of author, “folio 1, 3) A painting of Abraham in a black frame” [“f.1, 3) Un Quadro dentro vi uno abram con Cornice nere”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 64; Macioce 2003, fonte 5, p. 342).

2. September 22, 1623: Inventory of Cardinal Maffeo Barberini, taken immediately after his election as Pope Urban VIII, of possessions donated to his brother, Carlo, without identification of author, “126) “The sacrifice of Isaac in a black frame” [“Il sacrificio d’Isach con cornice nere”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 69; Macioce 2003, fonte 17, p. 347).

3. August 16–17, 1672: Inventory of the Palazzo Barberini, the residence of Prince Don Maffeo, the heir of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, “587) an oblong painting of the Sacrifice of Abram and

Isaac, about 5½ palmi wide and 4½ palmi high, with a carved gilt frame by Caravaggio” [“587) Un Quadro p lungo con il Sagreficio di Abram et Isach longo p.mi 5½ e alto p.m 4½ Incirca con Cornice Itagliata tutta dorata mano del Caravaggio”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 368; Macioce 2003, fonte 53, p. 364).

4. 1686: Inventory of the estate of Prince Maffeo Barberini, “203) An oblong painting which represents the Sacrifice of Abraham, about 5½ palmi long and 4 high with a carved and gilt frame by Caravaggio” [“203) Un quadro p.longo che rapresenta il Sacrificio d’Abra lunga p. 5½ alto p. 4 in circa con cornice intagliata e dorata, mano del Caravaggi”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 403; Macioce 2003, fonte 62, p. 367).

5. 1730: Inventory of Francesco Barberini, Prince of Palestrina, as by Caravaggio, “a Sacrifice of Abram” [“Sacrificio d’Abram”] (Getty Provenance Index, 0085 Barberini, Francesco, Principe di Palestrina, 1730/08/04I-1).

Documents:

Aronberg Lavin 1967 connects to this Sacrifice of Isaac four payments recorded in the household accounts of Monsignor Maffeo Barberini, totaling 100 scudi, for an unspecified painting or paintings:

1. May 20, 1603: “Twenty-five scudi paid to Michelagnolo da Caravaggio on account for the purchase of a painting” [“123 / 131 A Spese di Masserite scudi Venticinque mta buoni a SSr Doni p. tanti che di mio ordne anno pagato a Michelagnolo da Caravaggio p a buon conto di un quadro Scudi 25”] (Aronberg Lavin 1967, p. 86; Macioce 2003, I doc. 135, p. 116).

2. June 6, 1603: “Ten scudi paid to Michelangelo da Caravaggio on account for the purchase of a painting” [“123 / 135 A spese di masserite scudi Dieci mta buoni a SSr Doni p tanti che di mio ordne àno pagato a Michelagelo da Caravaggio p a buon conto di un quadro Scudi 10”] (Aronberg Lavin 1967, p. 88; Macioce 2003, I doc. 135, p. 116).

3. July 12, 1603: “An additional 15 scudi to Michelagnolo da Caravaggio on account for the purchase of a painting” [“123 / 135 Doni S devon avere scudi quindici mta sono p al tanti

pagati de de mio ordne anno pagato a Michelagnolo da Caravaggio p a buon conto di un quadro. Dare spese di Masseritie Scudi 15”] (Aronberg Lavin 1967, p. 90; Macioce 2003, I doc. 135, p. 116).

4. January 8, 1604: “Fifty scudi paid to Michelagnolo da Caravaggio as the remaining payment for paintings had from him up to the present day” [“123 / 153 A Spese di Masserite scudi Cinquanta mta buoni a SSr Doni p tanti pagati di mio ordne sino sotto di 6 detto a Michelannolo da Caravaggio p[er] resto di pitture aute da Lui fino al p[rese]nte giorno Scudi 50”] (Aronberg Lavin 1967, p. 102; Macioce 2003, I doc. 135, p. 116).

Source:

1. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 224): “For Cardinal Maffeo Barberini, who later became Pope Urban VIII, Caravaggio painted, besides a portrait, the *Sacrifice of Abraham* representing Abraham who presses his knife to the throat of his fallen and screaming son.” [“Al Cardinale Maffeo Barberini, che fú poi Urbano VIII, sommo pontefice, oltre il ritratto, fece il Sacrificio di Abramo, il quale tiene i ferro presso la gola del figliuolo che grida e cade.”]

Exhibitions:

Florence 1922; Milan 1951, no. 12; Utrecht-Anvers 1952, no. 2; São Paulo 1954; Paris 1965; New York-Naples 1985, no. 80; Florence 1991, no. 11; Milan 1999, pp. 490–92; Milan 2001, cat.no. IX.7; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 21.

Bibliography:

Kallab 1906–7, p. 281 (as lost); Marangoni 1922 [1953 ed. p. 146] (old copy, Caravaggesque composition, last Roman period); Voss 1924, p. 74, pl. 4 (juvenile, 1590–91); Longhi 1928–29, p. 292 (1590–91); Schudt 1942, no. 76 (old copy); Berenson 1951, pp. 23, 85; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 12; Mahon 1951, pp. 228, 234 (1599–1600); Venturi 1951, no. 9; Longhi 1952, no. X (1592–93); Mahon 1952, pp. 8, 18, 19 (1597–98); Hinks 1953, no. 23 (c. 1599); Mahon 1953 (1597–99); Baumgart 1955, no. 15 (?c. 1593); Friedlaender 1955, p. 160, no. 16 (“incongruities seem to me to suggest the possibility that the Uffizi painting is not a copy but a pastiche”); Argan 1956, p. 37; Wagner 1958, pp. 86–91 (1596–98); Arslan 1959, pp. 202–4 (after 1597);

Berne Joffroy 1959; Jullian 1961, pp. 51, 63 (c. 1597); Longhi 1961, p. 498; Venturi 1963, no. 11; Bottari 1966 (c. 1594); Lavin 1967, pp. 470–73 (dates as 1603–4, connects to documentary payments); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 24 (1594–96); d’Onofrio 1967, pp. 60–61; Kitson 1968, no. 29 (1594–96); Longhi 1968, p. 19 (1590–93); Calvesi 1971, pp. 132, 151–53 (alludes to Christ’s grace); Cinotti 1971, pp. 153, 157; Frommel 1972, pp. 49–52; Spear 1971, p. 68; Rossi 1973, no. 35; Argan in *Caravaggio e i Caravaggisti* 1974, p. 22; Marini 1974, pp. 184–85, 399–401, n. 49 (1603); Aronberg Lavin 1975, pp. 64 n. 3, 69 n. 126, 386 n. 587, 403 n. 203, 474; Moir 1976, pp. 86 no. 15, 111 no. 64, 124–25, n. 187 (Lavin’s newly found Barberini documents upset dating perhaps Uffizi picture not from Barberini despite Sciarra provenance); Nicolson 1979, p. 31; *Gli Uffizi* 1979, no. P359; Cinotti 1983, no. 12 (a little before *Emmaus* in London [cat. no. 25]); Hibbard 1983, pp. 164–67, 310–11 (1603, based on documents); Marini 1983, p. 132; Gregori 1985, no. 80 (1603); Christiansen 1986, pp. 429–30 (same model posed for Isaac and for the angel); Marini 1989, pp. 465–66, no. 52 (Rome c. 1603); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 11; Bologna 1992, p. 311 (1598); Spike 1992, pp. 275–77 (1603–4); Gregori 1994, pp. 102, 150, no. 43 (1603); Gallo in Macioce 1996, pp. 331–60; Gilbert 1995, pp. 110, 255, 257; Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50; Papi in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 123–34 (model Cecco del Caravaggio in works between 1601 and 1604); Langdon 1998, pp. 219; Puglisi 1998, no. 44 (1603); Robb 1998, p. 509 (1603); Benedetti in Mormando 1999, pp. 208–33, fig. 28 (1603); Marini in Milan 2001, pp. 490–92 (1603); Spike 2001, pp. 136–37, cat. no. 34 (1603); Maciocce 2003, I, doc. 135, p. 116, I, doc. 158, p. 137 (payments are for unidentified painting by Caravaggio connected by Aronberg Lavin to the *Sacrifice of Isaac* in the Uffizi), p. 367; Sgarbi 2005, no. 15 (rejects association with Barberini payments discovered by Lavin on stylistic grounds. “It seems evident that the painting cannot be far from the *Rest on the Flight into Egypt*, cat. no. 17, and from the Odescalchi *Conversion of Paul*, cat. no. 23, which share a background of an open landscape . . . similar to northern Italian paintings . . . for which reasons a dating of 1595–96 seems reasonable”); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (c. 1597–98); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 21, pp. 101–3 (1603); Papa 2008, pp. 94–103 (1603); Spike in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 15–20.

Bellori’s identification of the patron for this *Sacrifice of Isaac* is confirmed by a series of three payments by Monsignor Maffeo Barberini to Caravaggio, followed by a final payment in January of 1604 mentioning paintings. The documents omit the title(s) of these paintings, which thus leaves a margin of doubt, however small, regarding this identification. The *Sacrifice of Isaac*

had generally been considered an earlier picture and was even doubted, often, because of its unusually bright tonality. The model for Abraham appears to be the same as that of the apostle in the second Saint Matthew and the Angel altarpiece (cat no. 28) of the previous year, 1602.

Isaac's active resistance to his cruel fate is unprecedented in images of this story. Caravaggio characteristically expresses as much sympathy for someone tormented by fear and uncertainty as for one blessed with perfect faith. The patriarch Abraham was a primary focus of learned debate between Catholic and Protestant theologians as his path to justification was especially well documented in the book of Genesis. Tested on several occasions by God, Abraham responded with both faith and good works. See James 2:21–23.

See text, pp. 136–37.

Condition:

Good. An especially interesting pattern of incisions is visible on this painting—for example, on Isaac's mouth and on his thigh—which reflectography shows was blocked in by the artist but then covered over by Abraham's drapery. For a diagram see Christiansen, 1986, figs. 15–17.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

Rome, Philippe de Béthune, ambassador to the King of France

August 3, 1610: Letter of Cardinal Maffeo Barberini from Spoleto to his brother, Carlo, in Rome, who wrote that before he left Rome, he had loaned his painting of Abram made by Caravaggio to the ambassador of the King of France, to enable him to copy it, and he asked his brother to remind him to obtain the return of his painting. [“Prima che io partissi da Roma mi ricordo haver detto a v.s., se non mi inganno, o sin°a ces°che l'ambasciator di Francia desiderava l'Abram mio, fatto dal Caravaggio, per poterlo copiare, et che me ne contentavo, però se li dessi ogni volta che lo domandava, mi dà avviso di ciò il Calcerello però v.s. non

manchi di farlo dare subito a quell'effetto; ch'è quanto mi occorre, et a v.s. mi raccomando et la prego, a far il simile per mia parte con la sig.ra cognata et saluti li suoi fig.li.”]

Bibliography:

D'Onofrio 1967, p. 61; Moir 1976, pp. 124–25; Nicolson 1979; Cinotti 1983, p. 248; Gregori 1985, p. 287; Corradini 1993, pp. 106–7; Spike 2001, cat. no. 34.c.1; Macioce 2003, p. 266; Terzaghi 2007, p. 306.

II. Selected copies are listed by Friedlaender 1955, p. 160; Moir 1976, pp. 86 no. 15, 124–25, n. 187 ill. 23; Cinotti 1983, p. 429.

35. *Still Life with Fruit on a Stone Ledge*, c. 1603

Oil on canvas, 34¼ x 53¼ in. (87.2 x 135.4 cm)

The Antonius Group, Zürich, Switzerland

Since 2007 on long-term loan to the Denver Art Museum, Denver

Provenance:

Probably Cardinal Antonio Barberini, Palazzo ai Giubbonari, Rome, by 1671; bequeathed to his brother, Cardinal Francesco Barberini, Rome, 1672; private collection, Madrid, Spain; sale Edmund Peel & Asociados, February 20, 1992, lot 5 (as follower).

Inventories:

I. August 4, 1671: Posthumous inventory of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, Palazzo ai Giubbonari, Rome, n. 354. “A painting of 4 palmi by 3 representing diverse fruits on a stone table in a basket by Michel Angelo da Caravaggio with a black gilt frame no. 1, 50 scudi” [“Un quadro di p.mo 4 e 3 - rappresentante Diversi frutti porti sop’a Un Tavolino di Pietra in Una Canestra mano di Michel Angelo da Caravaggio Con Cornice Nera filettata d’oro Rabescata no. 1-50 scudi.”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 309; Macioce 2003, fonte 51 p. 363, as August 9, 1671).

2. August 16–17, 1672: Inventory taken at the division between the two heirs of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, n. 141, “a painting of similar size representing a variety of fruits placed on a stone table in a basket by Michel’ Angelo da Caravaggio with a black frame 50–” [“Un quadro di Simil grandezza rappresentante diversi frutti porti sopra un Tavolino di Pietra in una Canestra mano di Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio, con Cornice Nera, et oro 50–”] (Lavin 1975, p. 342; Macioce 2003, fonte 52, pp. 363–64, as 1672).

Exhibitions:

Sydney-Melbourne 2003, no. 7; Williamsburg, Va. 2006–7; Fort Worth 2007.

Bibliography:

Moir 1976, p. 124 n. 185 (1671 inventory, *Basket of Fruit on a Stone Table*, lost work subject and size are appropriate to Caravaggio); Cinotti 1983, no. 125 (as lost); Gregori 1985, p. 208 (as lost); Colin Slim 1985, pp. 242–43 (identifies the music in the *Lute Player* [cat. no. 10.1] as madrigals from the *Primo Libro* of Arcadelt published by Gardano in Venice, 1539); Battisti in Zeri 1989, I, p. 28, pl. 12 (woodcut frontispiece to the *Mottetti del Frutto* published by Gardano in Venice, 1539); Trinchieri Camiz 1989, pp. 198–221 (Caravaggio painted madrigals from the *Primo Libro* of Arcadelt published by Gardano in Venice, 1539); Meijer in *La Pittura in Italia. Il Seicento*, II, pp. 593, 603, n. 67, fig. 889 (woodcut frontispiece to the *Mottetti del Frutto* published by Gardano in Venice, 1539); Christiansen 1990, pp. 42–43, 90–91 (identifies the music in the *Lute Player* [cat. no. 10.2] as a madrigal from the *Primo Libro* of Arcadelt published by Gardano in Venice, 1539); Gregori 1994, p. 16 (c. 1601); Trinchieri Camiz in Rome 1995, p. 75 (Caravaggio lute players have Renaissance precedents in the still-life frontispieces of motets published in Venice, 1539); Spike 1995, pp. 14–22 (c. 1605); von Lates 1995, pp. 55–60 (erotic fruit symbolism); Berra 1996, pp. 128–29, 154 n. 88 (quotes Baglione as confirmation of additional still lifes by Caravaggio; unaware of *Mottetti* woodcut precedent, from photo seems later in date); Spike in Macioce 1996, pp. 212–19 (c. 1605); Puglisi 1998, no. 45 (attributed, c. 1603); Robb 1998, p. 511 (1605); Varriano 1998², p. 39; Gash 2001, p. 429 (rejects); Spike 2001, pp. 143–46, cat. no. 35 (c. 1603); Talvecchia 2001, p. 262; Macioce 2003, pp. 363–67 (untraced); Janick 2003, pp. 4–7 (compares to Vasari description of Giovanni da Udine); Spike in Capon 2003, pp. 12–13, 92–93, 227, cat. no. 7 (c. 1603); Marini in St. Petersburg 2005, p. 29 (identifies the music in Caravaggio’s *Musicians* [cat. no. 6] as a madrigal by Arcadelt published

by Gardano in Venice, 1546); Paton 2005, pp. 9, 89, fig. 14; Varriano 2005, pp. 8–14 (dates from the time of the libel suit of Giovanni Baglione, 1603); De Groft 2006, *passim*; Janick in Williamsburg 2006/1010; Kaylor 2006, p. 358; Spike in Williamsburg 2006/2010; Varriano 2006, pp. 69–70, fig. 57 (1603); Varriano in Williamsburg 2006/2010; von Lates 2006/2010 (associates wit and allusions with the Umoristi academy, founded in Rome in 1603); Warner 2007 (“Perhaps the most compelling argument in favour of the Caravaggio attribution is the sheer power of the work, in which fruits and vegetables take on the monumentality and sensuousness of great paintings of the human figure”); Spike in Barbieri and Frascarelli 2009 (composition based on the frontispiece in Gardano’s *Mottetti del frutto*, 1538–39, with previous bibliography); Spike in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 15–20 (selective use of focus).

The painting takes its composition from the printed frontispiece of the *Mottetti del frutto*, a celebrated anthology of sacred motets by Jacques Arcadelt and other composers (Lewis 1988). Caravaggio painted Arcadelt partbooks in his *Lute Players*. The Venetian Renaissance woodcut is considered one of the earliest Italian still lifes (Meijer 1989), possibly designed by Dosso Dossi (Puppi 1968). The *Mottetti del frutto* were published by Antonio Gardano in Venice in 1538 and 1539, with a dedication to Marchese Francesco Pallavicino, the son-in-law of Giacomo Doria. The *Mottetti del frutto* contain an introduction in which the motets are wittily compared to fruit.

Caravaggio’s *Still Life with Fruit on a Stone Ledge* was the subject of papers delivered at a symposium organized at the College of William and Mary, Williamsburg, Virginia, in 2006. Scholars commented on the scientific exactness of the fruits and the visual humor of their suggestive shapes. The erotic juxtaposition of the split figs and squash stem has been identified as the artist’s rejoinder to the same motif by Giovanni da Udine in the loggia of Agostino Chigi, which earned the lavish praise of Vasari (1568). Spike (2001) has commented on Caravaggio’s provocative fusion of the sacred and profane symbolism of ripe fruits (cf. Calvesi 1990, pp. 7–8). Since the first edition (2001) of this catalogue, Sir Denis Mahon (orally, June 2008) accepts the attribution to Caravaggio.

The drama and scale of the *Still Life with Fruit on a Stone Ledge* invites comparison to the artist’s figure compositions, particularly, the *Sacrifice of Isaac*, executed on a canvas of the same width with a similar palette of deep green, orange, and red tones. The *Sacrifice of Isaac* was

one of several paintings acquired from Caravaggio in 1603 by Maffeo Barberini. Von Lates (2006/2010) connects the sophisticated wit of this painting with the literary milieu of Maffeo Barberini, a member of several Roman academies and especially the Umoristi, founded in Rome in 1603.

The painting corresponds to the description of a “Still Life with a Basket of Fruit on a Stone Table” by Caravaggio in the collection of Cardinal Antonio Barberini. At Cardinal Antonio’s death the still life passed to the collection of his brother, Cardinal Francesco Barberini, and then evidently passed out of the family collections. Caravaggio’s revival of the Venetian Renaissance compositional motif of fruits scattered on top of a plain stone ledge deeply impressed his followers like Bartolomeo Cavarozzi and Agostino Verrocchi, not to mention Michelangelo Cerquozzi in the next generation. Bellori’s statement (1672) that Caravaggio originated the Roman style of painting fruit pieces that “came to attain the beauty that delights us today,” implies his knowledge of the Barberini still life.

See text, pp. 143–46.

Condition:

Good. When discovered in Spain in 1992, the painting was obscured by surface dirt and discolored varnish. The painting was restored in 1993 by Mario Modestini in New York. Radiography and particle analysis are considered by Maurizio Seracini of Editech Laboratory to conform to the artist’s canvas preparation. Cleaning revealed that the wall in the background had been repainted with layers of black and gray paint completely masking the descending ray of light. A horizontal scratch in the leaves above the basket was inpainted. The ground of the painting is a reddish-brown color and of little density. An x-ray and a photograph of the painting during cleaning are published in Macioce 1996, pp. 218–19, figs. 86–87. It was observed that the dark background was painted successively to the fruits. In many places, for example, in the purple figs or along the contours of the green gourds, the artist has left a narrow thread of the reddish-brown ground to show through. This technique is recognized as distinctive to Caravaggio. See Lapucci in *Come nascono i capolavori* 1991, p. 42; Gregori in *Come nascono i capolavori* 1991, p. 24.

Copies:

None recorded.

36. *Portrait of Monsignor Maffeo Barberini, 1603*

Oil on canvas, 48 $\frac{7}{8}$ x 35 $\frac{1}{2}$ in. (124 x 90 cm)

Private collection, Florence

Provenance:

Reportedly in storage in the attic of the Palazzo Barberini, Rome, until its discovery c. 1960; by 1963 private collection, Florence.

Inventories:

1. Macioce 2003, p. 347, identifies this painting with a portrait without attribution in the following inventory:

2. September 22, 1623: Inventory of Cardinal Maffeo Barberini, taken immediately after his election as Pope Urban VIII, of possessions donated to his brother, Carlo, without identification of author, “111) A portrait of S.C. Barberini when he was a priest in chambers with a black frame” [“Un ritratto del S.C. Barber.o quando era chierico di Cam.a cò cornice nere”].

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–25 (1956, I, p. 227): “[Caravaggio] made portraits for the Barbarino” [“Fece ritratti per Barbarino”].

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 224): “For Cardinal Maffeo Barberini, who was later Pope Urban VIII, besides a portrait, he made the *Sacrifice of Isaac*” [“Al Cardinale Maffeo Barberini, che fù poi Urbano VIII, sommo pontefice, oltre il ritratto, fece il Sacrificio di Abramo”].

Bibliography:

Longhi 1963, pp. 3–11 (attributes to Caravaggio); Haskell 1966; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, notes to no. 10; Aronberg Lavin 1967, p. 470 n.8 (c. 1599, cites reference to doc. no. 113); d’Onofrio 1967, pp. 61–63, 428 n. 113; Moir 1967, I, pp. 25–26 n. 9, 14, 93, II, pp. 61–62 n. 9, 3, 80; Kitson 1969, no. 18; Salerno 1970, p. 236 (accepts both); Cinotti 1971, pp. 66, 97–98, 126–27, 144, 153, 157 (rejects); Frommel 1972, pp. 20, 51; Marini 1974, pp. 132–35, 372–74 (1598, identifies with 1623 reference, doc. 2 above); Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 65 n.33; Moir 1976, pp. 116, no. 98, 155 n. 269 (probable from photo, extensively repainted); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Spear 1979, p. 318 (controversial); Marini 1982, p. 77 (1598–99, belonged to the Barberini); Moir 1982, pp. 33–34 (illustrates Corsini version); Hibbard 1983, pp. 341–42 (both attributed, neither seen); Cinotti 1983, no. 17; Bonsanti 1984, p. 22; Marini 1989, pp. 414–16, no. 31 (Rome, 1598–99); Bologna 1992, p. 311 (1598–99, Maffeo Barberini elevated to Monsignor on March 1, 1598 and took possession on March 20, 1599); Gregori 1994, p. 148, no. 27 (c. 1598–99); Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1598); Gilbert 1995, p. 110; Gregory 1998, p. 9; Langdon 1998, p. 205; Puglisi 1998, no. 20 (c. 1598); Robb 1998, p.504 (1598); Sickel 2001, p. 429 (c. 1597); Spike 2001, cat. no. 36 (1603); Macioce 2003, p. 347; Sgarbi 2005, no. 17 (1598, the date when Maffeo Barberini was nominated “chierico della Camera Apostolica”); Tresoldi 2006, p. 81 (1598–99); Varriano 2006, p. 89, fig. 69.

Mancini’s information that Caravaggio painted more than one portrait of Maffeo Barberini prior to his election to the papacy as Urban VIII in 1623 is authoritative because Mancini was the Pope’s personal physician. Bellori was also aware of a portrait by Caravaggio, in which Barberini must have been shown in his dignity as monsignor because he was raised to the purple only on September 11, 1606, several months after the artist’s flight from Rome.

The subject of the present work can certainly be identified as Monsignor Maffeo Barberini. The folded letter in the prelate’s hand and the cylindrical document case attached to his seat may refer to his important assignment as special papal representative to France, a responsibility he undertook in 1601 and 1604. To judge from the photograph, the painting can be attributed to Caravaggio between the Vatican *Deposition*, 1602, and the *Madonna of Loreto*, 1604. The Florentine prelate was an active member of the Medici party, and the portrait may have been arranged by Cardinal Francesco Maria del Monte.

Sickel and other authors suggest an alternative dating to 1597 on the possibility that the portrait was commissioned at the time of Maffeo Barberini's appointment as cleric of the Apostolic Chamber in March 1597. The painting has not been available for examination by scholars for the past twenty years.

See illustration at p. 138.

Condition:

The painting appears from a photograph to be in good condition.

Copies:

None recorded.

37. *Madonna of Loreto*, 1604–5

Oil on canvas, 102³/₈ x 59 in. (260 x 150 cm)

Cavalletti Chapel, Sant'Agostino, Rome

Provenance:

Commissioned by Orinzia de Rossi, widow of Ermete Cavalletti, between 1603 and 1606.

Documents:

1. July 19, 1602: Ermete Cavalletti (d. July 21, 1602) leaves instructions and 500 scudi in his testament to provide for the acquisition and decoration of a chapel in Sant'Agostino, Rome (Corradini 1993, doc. 24).

2. September 4, 1603. The heirs of Ermete Cavalletti acquire the first chapel, hitherto dedicated to Saint Mary Magdalen, on the left-hand side of Sant'Agostino, which is to be dedicated to Our Lady of Loreto [“. . . quondam Ermete Cavalletti Bononiensis in suo ultimo quod condidit testamento . . . in fabricanda et ornanda quesdam (sic) cappella existente in

Ecclesia Sancti Augustini di Urbe . . . prope portam eiusdem exclesiae magnam intrando primam (sic) videlicet in ordine versus altare majus tendendo, ad praesens sub invocatione nuncupato B. Mariae Magdalene . . . voluit et mandavit fieri inscriptionem ipsius quondam domini Ermetis, uti fundatoris pro se suisque heredibus et successoribus, et in ea erigi altare cum pictura, et ad honorem Beat.^{mo} Marie de Laureto sub cuius invocatione nuncupari voluit . . .”](Rome, ASR, Archivio dei Notari dell’Ufficio della Curia del cardinale vicario, notaio Romaulus Franciscus, 1603, vol. 57, cc. 499r, 500v, . . .; Lopresti 1922, p. 176; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 304–5).

3. September 4, 1603: The *Libro delle Proposte 1587–1609* for Sant’Agostino records the cession of the chapel heretofore dedicated to Saint Mary Magdalen to the widow and sons of Ermete Cavalletti, who agree to spend more than 500 scudi on its embellishment (Hibbard 1983, p. 317, n. 120).

4. March 2, 1606: The painting of the Pietà that had formerly stood in the chapel was given by the Chapter of Sant’Agostino to Cardinal Scipione Borghese (Lopresti 1922, p. 176, n. 2).

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–21 (ed. 1956, I, p. 224): “. . . the Madonna of Loreto in Sant’Agostino . . .” [“. . . la Madonna di Loreto in S. Agostino . . .”].

2. Celio 1620–24, p. 15 (facs. ed. 1638 Naples, p. 11): “In Sant’Agostino . . . The Madonna of Loreta altarpiece by Michelangelo da Caravaggio, the collateral frescoes by Cristofaro Casolani”[“S. Agostino . . . La Madonna di Loreta pittura di altare ad olio di Michelangelo da Carauagio, li collatarali à fresco di Cristofaro Casolani”].

3. Baglione 1642, p. 137: “In the first chapel on the left of the church of Sant’Agostino he did a *Madonna of Loreto*, portrayed from life, with two pilgrims, the man with muddy feet and the woman wearing a soiled and torn cap; because of the lack of gravity with which he treated the subject, unexpected in a large painting, the populace made a great fuss over it.” [“Nella prima cappella della chiesa di S. Agostino alla man manca fece una Madonna di Loreto ritratta dal naturale con due pellegrini, uno co’piedi fangosi, e l’altra con una cuffia sdrucita, e sudicia; e

per queste leggierezze in riguardo delle parti, che una gran pittura haver de, da popolani ne fu fatto estremo schiamazzo . . .”].

4. Scannelli 1657, p. 198: “The Virgin standing with the Christ Child, and to the left a pilgrim and an old woman kneeling before her in devotion. Whoever looks at this painting must confess that the spirit of the pilgrims is well rendered, and shows their firm faith as they pray to the image in the pure simplicity of their hearts. On the other hand, it is evident that the painting lacks proper decorum, grace, and devotion; this in fact has already been observed by the best intellects and greatest masters.”

5. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 220): “Thereafter, in the Church of Sant’Agostino, Caravaggio painted another painting in the Chapel of the Cavalletti, the Madonna stands with the Child who opens his arms in the act of blessing: two pilgrims with their hands clasped kneel before her; the first is a poor man with bare feet and leather breeches, with his pilgrim’s staff leaning against his shoulder, beside him is an old woman with a hat on her head.” [“Seguitò a dipingere nella Chiesa di Santo Agostino l’altro quadro della Cappella de’Signori Cavalletti, la Madonna in piedi col fanciullo fra le braccia in atto di benedire: s’inginocchiano avanti due Pellegrini con le mani giunte; e ‘l primo di loro è un povero scalzo li piedi, e le gambe con la mozzetta di cuoio, e ‘l bordone appoggiato alla spalla ed è accompagnato da una vecchia con la cuffia in capo.”]; (p. 231): “In Sant’Agostino, the pilgrims show their dirty feet.” [“In Santo Agostino si offeriscono le sozzure de’ piedi del pellegrino; . . .”].

6. von Sandrart 1675 (1679, 1683) p. 190: “At Sant’Agostino, an image of the Madonna with the Baby Jesus adored by two kneeling pilgrims” [“a Sant’Agostino un’immagine della Madonna col Bambino Gesù adorato da due pellegrini inginocchiati”] (Macioce 2003, p. 321).

7. Passeri c. 1678 (ed. 1934, pp. 347–49): “In the first chapel to the left of the entrance in Sant’Agostino, Caravaggio painted the Holy Virgin with the Child in her arms and two pilgrims adoring her. At that time he lived in the House of the Eight Corners, in one of the little streets behind the Mausoleum of Augustus. Nearby lived a lady with her young daughter, who was not at all unattractive; they were poor but honest people. Michelangelo wished to have the young girl as a model for the Mother of God which he was to paint in this work, and he succeeded in this by offering them a sum of money which was large enough considering

their poverty to enable him to carry out his wish. This girl was being courted by a young man who was a notary by profession and who had asked the mother for her daughter's hand in marriage. However he had always received a negative answer because this simple and naive woman was unwilling to give her daughter to a notary since, as she said, all notaries are surely bound for damnation. . . ." Passeri continues with description of the notary's jealousy, and the altercation with Caravaggio that followed. ["Quando egli (Caravaggio) dipinse il Quadro che stà nella Chiesa di S. Agostino in Roma nella prima Cappella a sinistra dell'ingresso, nel quale è dipinta, al suo costume, Maria Vergine col Figlio in braccio, e due Perregrini che stanno in atto di adorarla, stave egli di Casa agl'otto Cantoni in quelli vicoli, che sono dietro al Mausoleo d'Augusto. Vicino a lui abitava una Donna con una sua figliola zitella, la quale non era discara nelle sembianze; gente povera; ma onorata, e Michel'Angelo procurò d'havere questa Giovinetta per esemplare della Madre di Dio, che doveva dipingere in quel suo Quadro, e gli riuscì l'haverla havendogli questo suo desiderio come l'eseguì. Questa Putta veniva amoreggiata da un giovane di professione Notaro, e l'haveva più volte fatta chiedere alla Madre per Moglie dalla quale sempre ne ottenne una continua negativa; havendo quella, come Donna semplice, et innocente, rimbrezzo di dare la sua figliola a Notari delli quali è sicura dannazione . . ."]

8. Titi 1674 (ed. 1763, p. 403).

9. Lanzi 1809 (ed. 1968, I, p. 359).

Exhibitions:

Florence 1922, no. XXII; Paris 1935; Milan 1951, no. 29; Rome 1956, no. 36; Paris 1965; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 134; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.4; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

Kallab 1906/7, p. 285; Venturi 1910, p. 269; Longhi 1913, p. 162 (c. 1597); Biancale 1920, pp. 14–16 (Carlo Saraceni); Lopresti 1922, p. 176 (documents); Marangoni 1922, no. XXII; Voss 1924, p. 79, pl. 19 (after Contarelli, before Cerasi); Pevsner 1927/28, p. 387 (1605); Longhi 1928/29, pp. 26, 32, 272, 294–95 (1597); Hess 1932, pp. 42–44 (documents); Longhi

1947 (adjusts dating to documentary evidence); Arslan 1951, pp. 448, 450 (1604); Berenson 1951, pp. 29, 57; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 29; Mahon 1951, pp. 228, 234 (1604–5); Venturi 1951, no. 28; Longhi 1952, no. XXXI; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1604–5); Hinks 1953, no. 42; Hess 1954, pp. 271–74 (documents); Baumgart 1955, no. 42; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 189–90, no. 26 (1604); Sterling 1955, no. 3; Chastel 1956, p. 964 (1600–1606); Salerno in Rome 1956, no. 36; Wagner 1958, pp. 111–15, 132–33, 209–10; Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 317 (after *Calling of Saint Matthew*, before second *Saint Matthew and the Angel* and the *Entombment*); Jullian 1961, pp. 147, 151–53, 155–56, 158 n. 88, 162, 173, 228 (1603–5); Bottari 1966 (1604); Causa 1966 (1604); Kinkead 1966, pp. 112–14; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 58 (1603–5); Kitson 1969, no. 58 (1604–5); Nicolson 1970, p. 641; Dell’Acqua 1971, pp. 38–39, 55 (autumn 1603–first half 1605); Cinotti 1971, pp. 76–77, 120–22, 128, 135, 154, 177–78, n. 97, 191 n. 357–68 (1604 into 1605); Spear 1971², p. 108; Marini 1974, pp. 34–35, 189–91, 403–5, n. 52 (1604–5); Röttgen 1974, pp. 173, 237; Salerno 1974, p. 589 (same model as the Louvre *Death of the Virgin*); Moir 1976, p. 97 no. 29; Nicolson 1977, p. 862; Nicolson 1979, pp. 32, 78; Magnuson 1982, pp. 89–90; Moir 1982, p. 120 (1603–4); Cinotti 1983, no. 60 (1604–5); Hibbard 1983, p. 184–91, 317–19 (1604–5); Spike 1983, p. 40; Calvesi 1986, pp. 46–47 (1604); Chorpenning 1987, pp. 49–58; Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 32 (as if the prayers of the pilgrims have caused a statue of the Madonna to come to life, which would be a response to the Protestant suppression of sacred images); Marini 1989, pp. 473–74, no. 57 (Rome, 1604–5); Posèq 1990², p. 163 n. 8 (“in a pose adapted from a statue in the Della Valle collection in Rome which has been identified as Thunselda, the wife of a German rebel against Roman rule”); Bologna 1992, pp. 230–34, 324 (1603–6); Bassani–Bellini 1994, pp. 212–14; Gregori 1994, pp. 108, 150, no. 47 (c. 1604–5); Nagel 1994; Marini 1995, pp. 134–37; Gilbert 1995, pp. 174, 177–78; Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, p. 4 (1604–5); Askew in Macioce 1996, p. 254 (1604–5); Macioce 1996, p. 360 (Augustinian influence, 1604–5); Spike in Macioce 1996, p. 216 (1604–5); Langdon 1998, pp. 287, 289, 298, 306; Puglisi 1998, no. 50 (c. 1603–6); Robb 1998, p. 509 (1604); Christiansen 1999, pp. 1–11; Jones in Mormando 1999, pp. 41–48, fig. 5 (c. 1604–5); Varriano in Mormando 1999, pp. 194–203, fig. 5 (1604–5); Zuccari in Madrid 1999, pp. 63–73 (1605, kneeling pilgrims may be portraits of Ermete Cavalletti and his mother); Cardinali 2000, Christiansen in Strinati–Vodret 2001, cat. no. 134; Pupillo 2001; Spike 2001, pp. 146–50, cat. no. 37 (1603–4); Treffers in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 134 (1604–5); Pupillo 2002, pp. 105–22 (iconography of Loreto); Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 152–53, cat.

no. I.4; Sgarbi 2005, no. 41 (1604–5); Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 15; Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 10; Tresoldi 2006, p. 94 (1604–5); Varriano 2006, p. 30, 45–46, 94, fig. 39; Debono 2007, p. 16 ill.; Steinbrück 2007, pp. 57–70; Jones 2008; Papa 2008, pp. 130–33 (1604–5); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82; Merlini and Storti Falcucci 2009, pp. 35–39; Pellini in Rome 2009, pp. 134–37.

Baglione and Bellori were scandalized by the graphic depiction of the humble pilgrims and their soiled feet in close proximity to a consecrated altar. On the other hand, Baglione's notice of the excited reaction among the populace implies that the altarpiece had its defenders as well. There is no evidence that the Augustinian fathers ever contemplated removing the painting, which Scannelli, a less biased observer, defended for its sincere piety. The *Madonna of the Pilgrims (Madonna dei Peregrini)*, as it is called in the earliest documents, can be dated between the acquisition in 1603 of the chapel and 1606, when the previous altarpiece was removed. Its style indicates an execution around 1603–4.

Caravaggio appears to have owed the commission for the Cavalletti Chapel in Sant'Agostino to his good relations with the gentlemen and clerics who were members of the Archconfraternity of Santissima Trinità dei Pellegrini. Only months before his death on July 21, 1602, Ermete Cavalletti had made the pilgrimage to Loreto in the company of his confrères. His widow, Orinzia dei Rubeis, executed Cavalletti's testamentary instructions to acquire a chapel to be dedicated to the Madonna of Loreto, signing the contract with the Augustinian fathers on September 4, 1603.

Over the turn of the year to 1604 Caravaggio himself made a brief trip to Tolentino in the same corner of the Marches province as Loreto. It is likely he went to see the Santa Casa di Loreto for himself. The doorway in which the Virgin stands alludes to the shrine at Loreto of the Holy Family's house miraculously transported by angels from Nazareth in the Middle Ages.

See text, pp. 146–50.

Condition:

Good. The painting was restored under the supervision of the Soprintendenti in Rome between 1999 and 2000. No significant pentimenti were discovered nor incisions, apart from some on the pilgrim's staff and the shoulder of the Virgin.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

Madrid, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and Admiral of Castille.

Inventories:

1. 1647: Inventory of Juan Alfonso Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and ninth Almirante de Castilla, by Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio: "Our Lady holding the Child with two pilgrims, male and female" (Getty Provenance Index, 0572 Castilla, 1647/06/25E-844).
2. 1663: Inventory of Juan Alfonso Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and ninth Almirante de Castilla, "Our Lady with her son in her arms and two pilgrims by Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio" (Getty Provenance Index, Rodillados 0001 Oviedo, Francisco de 1663/02/26E-856).
3. September 25–October 21, 1691: Inventory at the death of Juan Gaspar Enríquez de Cabrera, as *Caravaggio, Michelangelo Merisi da (copy after)*, "Our Lady with the Child two pilgrims, male and female" (Burke–Cherry 1997, pp. 892–93).

Bibliography:

Spike 2001, cat. no. 37.c.1 (copy).

C.2

Whitehall, England, Royal Collection of Charles I (1624–30)

1639/40 inventory compiled by Van der Doort in description of king's inventory, as “after . . . Caravagio.”

Bibliography:

Millar 1960, ap. 228; Moir 1976, p. 98, no. 29r, 130 n. 211 (copy possibly brought to England by Gentileschi); Spike 2001, cat. no. 37.c.2.

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976 (p. 98, no. 29a–29q); Cinotti 1983, p. 524.

38. *Crowning with Thorns*, c. 1604

Oil on canvas, 50 x 65 in. (127 x 165.5 cm)

Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna, inv. 307

At lower left: 302

Provenance:

Possibly painted for Vincenzo Giustiniani, Rome; Giustiniani inventory, 1638; acquired in Rome for the Imperial Gallery by Baron Ludwig von Lebzeltern around 1810, near in time to the dispersal of the Giustiniani collection; in the imperial gallery by April 1816 (Prohaska in Rome-Berlin 2001, cat. no. D4).

Inventories:

1. February 9, 1638: Inventory of paintings in the collection of Vincenzo Giustiniani, “An over-door painting of the Crowning with Thorns of Our Lord, four half figures painted on canvas 5 palmi high by 7 long—by Michelangelo da Caravaggio with a carved and gilt frame” [“Un altro quadro sopra Porta con l’Incoronazione di Spine de Christo nostro Signore, quattro

mezze figure dipinto in tela alto pal. 5½ - lar. pal. 7½ - di mano di Michelang.o da Caravaggio con sua cornice profilata, e rabescata di oro”].

2. 1793, I, n. 130: Inventory of paintings in the Palazzo Giustiniani: “Another of 6.7 palmi wide, representing Jesus Christ when the rabble mocked him, by Michel’Angelo Caravaggio with a frame, as above” [“Altro di palmi 6.7 per traverso rappresentante Gesù Cristo quando la Turbà lo schernisce, di Michel’Angelo Caravaggio, con Cornice come sopra”] (Salerno 1960, p.135; Marini 1974, p. 369; Danesi Squarzina 2003, Inventari I, 1638, parte II, no. 3, pp. 390–91; Macioce 2003, inventari 28, p. 353).

Sources:

1. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 222), follows Cerasi: “Caravaggio continued to be favored by Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani, who commissioned from him some pictures, *Crowning with Thorns* and a *Saint Thomas* [cat. no. 33] . . .” [“Seguitava egli nel favore del marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani, che l’impiegò in alcuni quadri, l’Incoronazione di spine”].

2. Silos 1673, p.88, Epigram CLVII: “Christ the Lord Crowned with Thorns, by the same [Caravaggio] at the Giustiniani. Behold here the Lord with his head crowned with thorns, and a stream of blood that flows over his cheeks” [“Christus Dominus spinis coronatur. Eiusdem [Caravaggio] apud eundem Iustinianum. Aspicias his Dominù redimitù tempora dumis, / Itque per irriguas sanguinis unda genas”].

Exhibitions:

Naples 1938 (Caracciolo); Zurich 1946–47 (Caracciolo); Milan 1951, no. 59 (copy after lost original, Neapolitan period); New York-Naples 1985, no. 90 (Neapolitan period); Florence 1991, no. 12 (Caravaggio); Bergamo 2000, no. 5 (Roman period); Rome-Berlin 2001, cat. no. D4; Sydney-Melbourne 2003, no. 6; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.3; Frankfurt am Main 2009, cat. no. I.

Bibliography:

von Engerth 1881, I, no. 8 (Caravaggio); Kallab 1906, p. 291 (copy); Voss 1912, p. 62 (Roman follower, derivation of Naples *Flagellation*); Longhi 1915, pp. 62–63 (Battistello Caracciolo); Longhi 1943, p. 18 (good copy after lost original, Naples period, by the young Caracciolo?); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (marginalia, “a good picture which seems to be by an independent artist who closely studied the works of the master from 1600 ff. and was also influenced by Gentileschi”); Samek Ludovici 1952 (copy of Giustiniani picture); Hinks 1953, no. 40 (Caracciolo? or Roman follower after 1600); Friedlaender 1954, pp. 150, 222 (old copy after lost original of 1606/7); Baumgart 1955, no. 22 (Neapolitan school); Friedlaender 1955, no. 46 (Neapolitan follower; not in Giustiniani collection when sent to Paris 1812 for sale, p. 222); Jullian 1955, pp. 83–84 (copy); Wagner 1958, p. 234 (Caracciolo); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 371; Salerno 1960, p. 135 n. 3 (probably not Giustiniani, but copy of lost original); *Catalogue . . .* 1960 (copy after lost original); Jullian 1961, pp. 175, 182 n. 40, 232 (Neapolitan copy); Longhi 1961, pp. 182–83; de Logu 1962; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 78 (rejects); Moir 1967, I, p. 158 (Manfredi); Longhi 1968, p. 42 (Caravaggio in Naples); Kitson 1969, no. 78 (Bellori’s testimony would place this in Rome c. 1600, some attraction to this view); Cinotti 1971, pp. 136, 199 n. 508 (not copy but original by good artist, like Caracciolo); Marini 1974, p. 369, no. 26 (1598); Moir 1976, p. 111, no. 65a, pp. 146–47, n. 245 (copy by Manfredi? or Biagio Manzoni?); Brejon 1979, p. 306; Nicolson 1979, p. 32 (Caracciolo?); Kugler 1981, p. 153; Marini 1981, p. 366 (1598); Cinotti 1983, no. 89 (attributed, measurements similar to Giustiniani source reads as 5.5 x 7.5 palmi or 48 x 66 in.); Hibbard 1983, pp. 72–73, 291 n. 41 (c. 1602–3); Gregori 1985, no. 89 (plausibly the Giustiniani picture, Naples period); Christiansen 1986, p. 445 (undecided); Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 58 (Giustiniani provenance possible); Marini 1989, pp. 422–23, no. 35 (Rome 1599); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 12; Prohaska 1991, p. 40 (1603–4?) Bologna 1992, p. 334 (1607); Gregori 1994, pp. 104, 150, no. 44 (c. 1603); Pacelli 1994, p. 54 (fall 1607–spring 1608, Naples); Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50; Puglisi 1998, no. 46 (attributed, c. 1603); Robb 1998, p. 514 (1607); Prohaska in Rome-Berlin 2001, pp. 288–93 (1602–4, documents the Giustiniani provenance); Spike 2001, cat. no. 38 (c. 1604); Wald in Rome-Berlin 2001, pp. 292–93 (technical report, publishes x-ray); Danesi Squarzina 2003, Inventari I, pp. 390–91; Prohaska in Capon 2003, pp. 90–91, cat. no. 6 (c. 1602–5); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 173, 179, no. 10 (first Neapolitan period); Lapucci 2005,

p. 38, fig. 10; Sgarbi 2005, no. 22 (1598–99, after *Judith and Holofernes*); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (1599); Wald in Milan 2005, cat. no. I.3; Varriano 2006, p. 37; Papa 2008, pp. 22, 26–28 (1599); Hartje–Grave in Frankfurt 2009, pp. 106–7, cat. no. 1 (1603); Spike in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 15–20.

The authorship of this arresting picture was frequently disputed prior to its inclusion in numerous exhibitions. The hands of Christ and the seated soldier seem below the master's standard, and the modeling is comparatively flat throughout the composition. Nevertheless, there is real beauty in the subtle play of light across Christ's face and breast. One suspects that Caravaggio did not apply the last perfections to a painting that was intended as an overdoor. It is cited as such in the Giustiniani inventory of 1638 and the figures are viewed from a perspective that is distinctly *in sotto in su*.

The identification of this picture with the reference in the Giustiniani inventory, Rome, 1638, although doubted by Salerno and other scholars, was finally confirmed by Prohaska (2001) from a document of 1810. A review of the divergent opinions as regards both the attribution and the Giustiniani provenance has been published by Danesi Squarzina (2003). It is now confirmed that this composition by Caravaggio was a major inspiration for the many variations painted on this theme by Manfredi, Gentileschi, and other Caravaggists.

See illustration at p. 163.

Condition:

Good. The painting was examined by Christiansen (1986, p. 445) on the occasion of its exhibition in New York in 1985. Here follow some excerpts from his discussion. "This well preserved picture is painted with remarkable directness and comparatively thinly. Perhaps because of this a number of incisions as well as extensive evidence of the *abbozzo* [sketchy underdrawing with the brush] are visible. . . . It is well to emphasize that this picture cannot be a copy. . . . Were it demonstrable that Caravaggio employed assistants in carrying out portions of his paintings this would offer a possible explanation for the somewhat schematic forms of the right-hand figure." See *Caravaggio. Come nascono* . . . (1991).

Copies:

None recorded.

39. *Saint John the Baptist*, c. 1604

Oil on canvas, 68 x 52 in. (172.7 x 132.1 cm)

Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art, Kansas City

Provenance:

The painting is generally identified with a Saint John the Baptist painted for Ottavio Costa and listed in his posthumous inventory of 1639; its subsequent movements are disputed by scholars prior to its acquisition by Thomas Agnew & Sons, Ltd. London, 1951, from which acquired 1952.

Inventories/Documents:

I. The painting was commissioned by Ottavio Costa in 1602:

A. May 21, 1602: entry in the archives of the Herrera Costa Bank: “Received by Caravaggio from Ottavio Costa 20 scudi on account for a painting that he will paint” [“. . . l’acconto di venti scudi sottoscritto da Caravaggio il 21 maggio 1602, dal Ill.re Sr Ottavio Costa a bon conto d’un quadro ch’io gli dipingo venti”] (Terzaghi 2009, p. 90; Terzaghi 2007, pp. 299–300, connects this payment to the Kansas City painting).

B. January 18–23, 1639: Inventory of the objects in the house of Ottavio Costa, Rome, at his death: “73. And another painting of Saint John the Baptist in the desert made by the same Caravaggio with its frame” [73. “È più un altro quadro di San Giovanni Battista nel deserto fatto dall’istesso Caravaggio con la sua cornice”] (Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 582 n. 22, 585; Spezzaferro 1975², p. 118; Rowlands 1996, p. 223; Costa Restagno 2004, no. 73, p. 100).

II. Rowlands 1996, identifies this painting with one which was the subject of a litigation between Costa’s estate and the Knights of Jerusalem, Malta, and which was subsequently

acquired by the fifth Baron Aston of Forfar on the island of Malta in the early eighteenth century:

Ottavio Costa, Rome by 1639; bequeathed to his grandson, Filippo di Benedetto Costa (d. 1683); by descent to his brother Pietro Francesco Costa (d. 1723); awarded (?) as part of Ottavio Costa's patrimony in 1705–10 to the Order of Saint John of Jerusalem, Malta; purchased in Malta by James, fifth Baron Aston of Forfar (d. 1751), conserved at Tixall, Straffordshire England; by descent to the second daughter, Barbara, who married the Hon. Henry Thomas Clifford; by descent to their eldest son, Sir Thomas Hugh Clifford; by descent to their son, Sir Thomas Hugh Clifford (1762–1829), who inherited Tixall and estates of Burton–Constable, Yorkshire; by inheritance to Sir Thomas Aston Clifford Constable; by inheritance to Mary Barbara Constable (d. 1876) who in 1826 had married Sir Charles Chicester; by descent to Brigadier Raleigh Charles Joseph Chichester Constable “Burton Constable”; bought by Agnew's and Edward Speelman & Sons London, January 15, 1951; from which acquired 1952.

III. Costa Restagno (2004) and Terzaghi (2007) instead identify this painting with a Saint John the Baptist, unidentified by artist, that appeared in various inventories of Costa descendants until its sale sometime after 1857.

A. Rome, July 17, 1687: Note of Maria Cattaneo, widow of Benedetto Costa, daughter-in-law and executrix of the Estate of Ottavio, added as a codicil to her will of the same date, listing the items she expected to receive from Ottavio's house in Rome, which would be brought to Albenga: “34. A Saint John the Baptist with a gold frame” [“34. Un San Giovanni Battista con cornice tutta dorata”].

B. February 7, 1688: Inventory of the Goods of Maria Cattaneo Costa, Rome, at her death: “14. A Saint John with a black frame with gold” [“14. Un San Giovanni con cornice nera ordinaria filettato d'oro”] (Costa Restagno 2004, p. 105).

C. May 30, 1732, Rome: Posthumous inventory of Mons. Guido Del Pelagio, who reputedly acquired the painting by descent, “32. A painting 7 by 5 with a gilt frame in an antique manner showing Saint John original by Caravaggi 138 scudi 25” [“32 Un quadro di 7, e 5 con

cornice liscia / dorata rappresentante San Giovanni originale del Caravaggi 138 sc. 25”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 32, p. 108).

D. January 15–17, 1834, Rome: Posthumous inventory of Marchese Giuseppe Origo, who reputedly acquired the painting by descent: “97. a large vertical painting, showing Saint John the Baptist, painted on canvas by Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio, with a gilt frame, scudi 20” [“97. Un quadro grande per alto, rappresentante San Giovanni Battista, dipinto in tela di Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio, con cornice dorato, scudi 20”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 97, p. 117).

E. Undated valuation (“stima a prezzi”) compiled by the painters, Tommaso Minardi and Giovanni Silvagni, between 1834 and 1846, after the donation by the Marchesa Origo to the Congregazione degli Operai della Divina Pietà, commissioned by Sig. Poncini: “2, identified as no. 43 a painting of a life-size figure of Saint John the Baptist original by Caravaggio, scudi 150.” [“2. Quadro segnato n. 43 rappresentante San Giovanni Battista figura grande al vero originale del Caravaggio sc. 150”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 2, p. 121).

F. March 26, 1846: “Catalogue of Paintings and Coppers by various authors, whose authorship is not however guaranteed, of objects received from the marchese Giuseppe Origo, offered for sale by the Congregazione degli Operai della Divina Pietà, . . . no. 23 a life-size figure of Saint John the Baptist, original by Caravaggio 80” [“Catalogo di quadri e Rami antichi di varj autori, che però non si garantiscono, . . . S. Gio. Battista figura grande al vero, originale del Caravaggio 80”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 23, p. 124).

G. January 9, 1854, Rome: Note of the paintings and marbles owned by the Venerable Congregation of the Divina Pietà and consigned to Antonio De’ Cinque: “11. San Giovanni Battista or 17. San Giovanni Battista nel deserto” [“11. San Giovanni Battista o 17. San Giovanni Battista nel deserto”] (Costa Restagno 2004, p. 125).

H. 1857 Inventory of paintings in the Galleria Sacro Monte di Pietà, Rome. Terzaghi 2007, pp. 144–47; p. 297, n. 94.

Exhibitions:

London 1950, p. 130, no. 323; Milan 1951, no. 23 (as Caravaggio); Seattle 1962, no. 62; Detroit 1965, no. 3; Cleveland 1971, no. 17; New York-Naples 1985, no. 85; Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–1996, no. 1; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 112; Sydney-Melbourne 2003, no. 8.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1943, p. 15, fig. 18 (published as original of which Naples was copy); Ainaud 1947, pp. 388–89; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 56 (1598–99); Arslan 1951, p. 446 (“old and quite beautiful copy”); Berenson 1951, pp. 33, 46; Longhi 1951, p. 30 (late 1590s); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (as no. 23, 1603–4) Venturi 1951, p. 41 (rejects); Baroni 1951; Longhi 1952, no. XXIII (c. 1600); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (as no. 23, 1602–4); Hinks 1953, pp. 71–72, no. 37 (c. 1603); Mahon 1953 p. 213 (c. 1602–4); Baumgart 1955, no. 29 (c. 1598–99); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 171–72, no. 20D (c. 1602, possibly even later, picture described as in Caravaggio’s possession confiscated at his death); Wagner 1958, pp. 106, 108–9 (1602–4); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 260, 333, 339, 374 (1602–4); Della Pergola 1959, p. 79; Jullian 1961, pp. 149, 151–53 (c. 1604); Moir in Detroit 1965, no. 3; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 55 (1603–4); Moir 1967, I, p. 256, II, pp. 57–58 (1604–5); Kitson 1969, no. 53; Matthiesen–Pepper 1970, p. 456; Cinotti 1971, pp. 128, 195 (1604–5); Spear 1971, no. 17 (c. 1604–5); Frederickson–Zeri 1972, pp. 44, 417, 589; Slatkes 1972, p. 67; Marini 1974, pp. 160–61, 386–87, n. 38 (1600); Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 584–85 (identifies with 1639 Costa inventory); Moir 1976, pp. 97 no. 27, 130 n. 27; Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Wright 1981, p. 2; Moir 1982, pp. 124, 134, pl. 31 (c. 1605); Cinotti 1983, no. 21; Freedberg 1983, p. 53; Hibbard 1983, pp. 191–93, 319–20 n. 126 (summer 1605); Marini 1983, p. 132; Gregori 1985, no. 85 (1604–5); Spike 1985, p. 417; van Tuyl 1985, p. 487; Calvini 1986, pp. 343–86; Christiansen 1986, p. 438 (many incisions, red mantle originally extended farther to the right); Tempesta in Rome 1986, p. 35; Bologna 1987, p. 162; Calvesi 1987, p. 108, 118–20; Christiansen 1988, p. 26 n. 2; Rotondo 1988, pp. 27, 108; Gregori 1989, pp. 116, 120; Marini 1989, pp. 468–69, no. 54 (Rome, 1603–4); Calvesi 1990, pp. 243, 424 (1604–6); Gilbert 1990, p. 59; Cinotti 1991, pp. 119–20; Ward 1991, p. 156 (1604); Bologna 1992, p. 318 (c. 1601); Gregori 1994, p. 150, no. 45 (1603–4); Gilbert 1995, pp. 2–34; Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, pp. 6–19, no. 1 (1604–5, probably retained by Costa in Rome and a copy sent to Conscente); Rowlands 1996, pp. 215–26, cat. no. 25 (most extensive discussion, c. 1605); Puglisi 1998, no. 49 (c. 1603–5); Robb 1998, p. 509 (1604); Brown in London-Rome

2001, cat. no. 112 (c. 1604–5); Spike 2001, p. 158, ill. 159, cat. no. 39 (c. 1604); Capon 2003, pp. 94–95, cat. no. 8 (c. 1604); Costa Restagno 2004, pp. 47–48, ill. 78, 180 (proposes new provenance); Sgarbi 2005, no. 38 (1602–3, just before *Entombment*, cat. no. 32); Varriano 2006, p. 15, fig. 13; Kliemann in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 181–215; Terzaghi 2007, p. 299 (1602; states that the painting “certainly was in Rome in 1846 and perhaps still in Rome as late as 1857, certainly only that it migrated to the United States from a London collection in 1951”); von Rosen in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 59–85; Spike in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 15–20.

This *Saint John the Baptist* failed to attract the notice of the Roman sources although it is a fine and characteristic work of around 1604. Its identification with a *Saint John the Baptist* cited in the 1639 inventory of Ottavio Costa seems assured by the existence of a faithful copy in Albenga (c.1), where the Costa family owned properties. The latter copy was originally in the Oratory of Saint John the Baptist in Conscente, a nearby fiefdom of the Costa family. Circumstantial evidence cited by Rowlands (1996, p. 219) tends to support the hypothesis that a new altarpiece of John the Baptist, probably a copy of this picture, was sent from Rome between 1603 and 1606.

The Costa *Baptist* closes an arc of work that initiated with the *Saint Catherine of Alexandria* in 1598. Both paintings are preeminently portraits of studio models illuminated by sharply contrasted and focused light. The symbolic ramifications of their draperies and saintly attributes are subordinated to the disarming illusion of their physical presence. This is perhaps the last picture executed by Caravaggio in which likeness to life is the predominant concern.

Not by coincidence, this canvas is also the latest datable work displaying extensive use of incisions to record the model’s position for subsequent studio sessions.

See text p. 158, illustrated at p. 159.

Condition:

Good apart from the regrettable loss of final glazes due to overcleaning in the past. The lack of transitions between the light and shade on the saint’s calf and ankle are symptoms of this

overcleaning. Radiography revealed a large pentimento in the red mantle which originally extended all the way to the right-hand margin of the painting. Numerous incisions around the model's head and legs were noted by Spear (1971) and Christiansen (1986). The ground is reddish-brown. See Rowlands 1996, p. 215 for a more detailed discussion.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Rowlands 1996, p. 223. Among these are:

C. I

Albenga, Italy, Museo Diocesano

Oil on canvas, 67³/₄ x 51⁵/₈ in. (172 x 131 cm)

Provenance:

Chapel of San Giovanni Battista, Conscente, built by Abott Alessandro Costa in 1588, rebuilt by the Costa brothers (one of whom, Ottavio, was a patron of Caravaggio) between 1596 and 1606; church of Sant'Alessandro, Conscente; by 1615 in Oratory.

Inventories:

Matthiesen and Pepper (1970) identify this copy with a painting of this subject in two inventories:

1. 1615–18 inventory of the paintings in the Oratory of the church of Sant'Alessandro, given by its patrons, the Costa family, unidentified by artist, “a large painting sent from Rome of Saint John the Baptist.”
2. In 1624 manuscript by Pierfrancesco Costa, son of Ottavio Costa and Bishop of Albenga, written as an artistic guide to his diocese in Liguria, he describes as in a “small holy oratory . . . formerly the parish church, restored in the modern style in honor of that mysterious nightingale who announces the coming of Christ, Saint John the Baptist. The image of him in the desert, mourning human miseries, was painted by the famous Michelangelo Caravaggio,

and it moves not only the brothers but also visitors to penitence.” (Sacro e vago Giardinello e succinto Repilogo delle Ragioni delle Chiese, e Diocesi d’Albenga: In Tre Tomi chiuso; cominciato da Pier Francesco Costa, Vescovo d’Albenga dell’anno 1624, I, pp. 367 f; Gregori 1985, p. 303; Costa Restagno 2005, pp. 127–33; Terzaghi 2007, p. 295).

Bibliography:

Matthiesen and Pepper 1970, p. 456; Spear 1971, p. 75 (discovery of copy suggested Kansas City picture probably commissioned by Ottavio Costa); Spezzaferro 1974, p. 585 (connects provenance to Kansas City picture); Moir 1976, p. 97 no. 27b (copy); Gregory 1985, p. 302 (copy made by Ottavio Costa); Gilbert 1995, p. 108; Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, pp. 6–19, fig. 5; Rowlands 1996, p. 223, fig. 25c (copy); Spike 2001, cat. no. 39.c.1; Costa Restagno 2004, pp. 127–33; Terzaghi 2007, pp. 296–304 (copy made c. 1605).

To judge from a photograph, the mediocre quality of this copy militates against a date as early as 1603. The possibility should not be excluded that this painting was made to replace the Caravaggio copy that was sent from Rome to Consente between 1603 and 1606. The excellent copy in Naples is an example of a version that could be contemporary to the original composition in Kansas City.

C.2

Naples, Museo Nazionale di Capodimonte; inv. 420 (Q.370)

Oil on canvas, 67³/₄ x 51⁵/₈ in. (172 x 131 cm)

Provenance:

Purchased in Rome, 1802, as work of Bartolomeo Manfredi; T. Conca collection, Naples.

Exhibition:

Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 24.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1927, p. 31 (previously described as Manfredi or Riminaldi, possibly copy of lost Caravaggio); Mariani 1930; Longhi 1943, p. 15 (copy); Berenson 1951 [1953 ed.], p. 32 (version);

Friedlaender 1955, pp. 171–72 (Manfredi); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, at no. 5 (copy); Moir 1976, p. 97 no. 27a (copy); Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, pp. 6–19, fig. 6 (copy); Rowlands 1996, p. 223, fig. 25b (copy); Spike 2001, cat. no. 39.c.2 (copy); Marini 2005, p. 483; Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, ill. p. 158, p. 233, cat. no. 24 (copy); Terzaghi 2007, pp. 144–47, 304 (Orazio Riminaldi), 296–306 (connects this copy to Ottavio Costa).

40. *Agony in the Garden*, c. 1604

Oil on canvas, 60⁵/₈ x 87⁵/₈ in. (154 x 222 cm)

Kaiser Friedrich Museum, Berlin (formerly, destroyed 1945) inv. 359

Provenance:

Possibly Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani, Rome, by 1621; Vincenzo Giustiniani Rome, by 1638; sold with the Giustiniani collection in Paris, 1812; acquired Kaiser Friedrich Museum 1815; destroyed in 1945.

Inventories:

1. March 31, 1621: Posthumous inventory of Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani, “176. A painting of Our Lord in the Garden with the apostles sleeping, in a black frame” [“Un quadro di Nostro Signore nel Orto con l’apostoli che dormeno e cornice negra”].

2. February 9, 1638: Inventory of paintings in the collection of Vincenzo Giustiniani, “In the Great Room of Old Paintings . . . [2] a large painting in the form of an overdoor with Christ in the Garden, while the Apostle sleep, painted on canvas 10 palmi high by 7 palmi, by Michelang.o da Caravaggio with a black gilt frame” [“Nella Stanza Grande de Quadri Antichi . . . Un quadro grande in forma di sopraporta con Christo nell’Horto, che riprende gli Apostoli dormienti depinto in tela largo pal. 10 alto pal. 7 di mano di Michelang.o da Caravaggio con sua cornice negra profilata e rabescata d’oro”].

3. 1793, I. No. 124: Inventory of paintings in the Palazzo Giustiniani: “Another of 7.10 palmi wide representing Saint Peter, Saint James, and Saint John sleeping, with Jesus Christ who

wakes them, by Michel'Angelo Caravaggio, with frame as above" ["Altro di palmi 7.10 per traverso rappresentante S. Pietro, S. Giacomo e S. Giovanni dormienti, con Gesù Cristo, che li sveglia, di Michel'Angelo Caravaggio, con Cornice come sopra"] (Salerno 1960, p.135 n. 2; Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. I, 1621, no. 176, pp. 178–79; 1638, part II, no. 2, pp. 389–90).

Source:

I. Silos 1673 (ed. 1979, p. 87), Epigram CLVI: "Christ and the Apostles/in the orchard sleeping/ Caravaggio for Prince Giustiniani." ["Christus Apostolos / in horto increpat / Caravagij apud Principem Iustinianum . . .]

Exhibition:

Florence 1922 (as school).

Bibliography:

Landon 1812, p. 31; *Verzeichniss der ehemals zu der Giustinianischen jetzt zu den Königlichen Sammlungen gehörigen Gemälde* 1826, no. 95; Marangoni 1922, pp. 52–53 (probably copy); Voss 1923, p. 98; Voss 1924, p. 82, pl. 29 (Sicilian period); Longhi 1928–29, p. 292; Bodmer 1936, I, p. 98 (young Dirck van Baburen); Schudt 1942(?); Longhi 1943 (late Roman period); Baroni 1951 (c. 1595); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1605–6) n. 95 ("could have been an original of the end of the master's Roman period"); Norris 1952, p. 339, fig. 41; Hinks 1953, no. 52 (c. 1606); Friedlander 1954, p. 150 (doubts); Baumgart 1955, no. 19 (circle of Bartolomeo Manfredi); Wagner 1958, p. 233 (later than Caravaggio); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 177; Jullian 1961, pp. 143, 228 (perhaps copy of 1602–3 original); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 52 (not in Berlin inventory as Caravaggio until proposed by Voss, doubts picture, doubts sources); Cinotti 1971, p. 128; Marini 1974, pp. 194, 407–8, n. 54 (c. 1605); Moir 1976, pp. 98–99, no. 32 (1605); Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Hibbard 1983, p. 227 (doubts); Cinotti 1983, no. 3 (c. 1603); Marini 1989, pp. 476–77, no. 59 (Rome, 1605); Bologna 1992, p. 323 (1603–4); Gregori 1994, p. 151, no. 51 (c. 1605); Gilbert 1995, p. 279 n. 30; Danesi Squarzina 1997, p. 773; Langdon 1998, pp. 235–36; Puglisi 1998, no. 55 (destroyed, questions Giustiniani provenance, attributed, c. 1605); Robb 1998, p. 510 (1605); Spike 2001, pp. 122–23, cat. no. 40 (c. 1604); Corrain in Calvesi and Volpi 2002; Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. I, 1621, no. 176, pp. 178–79, 1638,

II, no. 2, pp. 389–90; Sgarbi 2005, no. 40 (just after *Entombment* [cat. no. 32], 1602–3, citing Cinotti); Varriano 2006, p. 37.

To judge on the basis of a photograph, the lost Giustiniani *Agony in the Garden* appears to have been an autograph work comparable in style to the *Doubting Thomas* (cat. no. 33). Its representations of full-length figures was unusual in Caravaggio's Roman period. The painting left little impression on the artist's followers, nor do any sources mention it prior to the poet Silos. Its departure from traditional iconography may have caused this neglect. Christ was customarily shown in dialogue with an angel, not remonstrating with Saint Peter.

See pp. 122–23.

Condition:

To judge from available photographs, the painting was in good condition prior to its destruction.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C.1

Olimpia Aldobrandini Pamphili, Rome

1665 inventory, and repeated in 1682 inventory: "A painting on panel of Christ in the Garden 11/2 p.mi high inventory no. 2/3 N. 202 from that of the Cardinal Ca 146" (Della Pergola 1963, p. 321; Spike 2001, cat. 40.c.1).

C.2

Sale of Valuable Pictures of the Collection of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, London, November 23, 1691, lot no. 9: "Our Saviour in the Garden, by Mich. Angelo Caravagio."

Spike 2001, cat. 40.c.2.

41. *Crowning with Thorns*, c. 1605

Oil on canvas, 70 x 49¼ in. (178 x 125 cm)

Cassa di Risparmio e Depositi, Prato

Provenance:

Cecconi collection, Florence, by 1916; acquired 1976.

Documents:

I. A painting of this subject of unknown dimensions was in the Massimi collection by 1605: In Caravaggio's own hand, signed and dated, June 25, 1605: "I, Michel Ang.o Merisi da Caravaggio, obligate myself to paint by the first of August for Sig. Massimo Massimi a painting of the same value and size as that I have already made for him of the *Crowning of Christ with Thorns*." ["Io Michel Ang.lo Merisi da Caravaggio mi obliigo di pingere all' Ill.mo Signor Massimo Massimi p[er] esserne prima statto pagato un quadro di valore e grandezza come quello ch'io gli feci già della Incoronatione di Cripto p[er] il primo di Agosto 1605."] (Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 58–59; Maurizio Marini 1989, p. 454, Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 10; Macioce 2003, doc. 198, p. 165)

II. References to untraced paintings of this subject in the following seventeenth-century inventories were hypothetically related to this picture by Maurizio Marini (1987, 1989) and Barbiellini Amidei (*Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 58–59):

1. May 8, 1630, inventory of goods in the estate of Lanfranco Massa, sold by his heirs to pay his debts, records: "A painting of an *Ecce Homo* with a frame by Caravaggio" ["Un quadro 'Ecce Homo' con cornice del Caravaggio"] (cf. Delfino 1985, p. 95, who relates this reference to a copy of the painting in Genoa, c.1 below).

2. 1688 inventory of Giovanni Vandeneynnden: "Another of *palmi* 8 by 10 with a gilt frame being a *Crowning with Thorns of Our Lord*, half figure, hand of Michel'Angelo Caravaggio. 400

ducati” [“Un altro di pal 8 e 10 con cornice indorata consistente l’incoronazione di spine di NS mezze figure al naturale mano di Michel’Angelo Caravaggio. 400 d[ucati]”].

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 49 (as attr.); Prato 1976; New York-Naples 1985, no. 81; Florence 1991, no. 10; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 114–15; Bergamo 2000, no. 5; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 97.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1916 (copy of unknown original); Marangoni 1922, pp. 51–52 (derivation of Giustiniani picture); Longhi 1928/29, pp. 29–31 (copy of original of 1598–99); Longhi 1943, pp. 15–16, 36 n. 20 (copy); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 49 (derived from a work by Caravaggio datable to 1598); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (“could be a copy after the master, conceivably after a very late original”); Venturi 1951, p. 41 (rejects); Hinks 1953, no. 66 (work derived from late original, part of Passion cycle for Nicolao di Giacomo, Messina); Friedlaender 1954, p. 150 n. 66; Baumgart 1955, no. 23 (rejects); Wagner 1958, pp. 230–31 (rejects); Berne Joffroy 1959 (copy); Jullian 1961, p. 96; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 94 (Maltese period); Kitson 1969, no. 93 (if Caravaggio, then late second Neapolitan period); Cinotti 1971, pp. 136, 199; Marini 1974, pp. 173, 392–93, n. 44 (copy of lost original 1601); Moir 1976, p. 147 n. 245 (rejects); Gregori 1976, pp. 20–32 (1602–3, proposes as original and cites Mahon and Rosenberg as in agreement); Schneider 1976, pp. 679–80; Marini 1978/79, pp. 17–18 (1600–1602); Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Marini 1981, p. 366 (1600–1602); Marini 1982, p. 78 (1600–1602); Cinotti 1983, no. 45; Hibbard 1983, pp. 291–93, n. 41, fig. 178 (c. 1601); Spear 1984, p. 165; Campagna Cicala in Syracuse 1984, pp. 140–41 nn. 51, 76 (possibly painted in Sicily); Gregori 1985, no. 81 (1602–3); Christiansen 1986, pp. 441–42 (prime version of a questionable attribution); Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 58–59; Barbiellini Amidei 1989, pp. 47–55; Marini 1989, pp. 453–55, n. 47 (Rome c. 1600–1602); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 10; Bologna 1992, p. 325; Gregori 1994, p. 149, no. 36 (c. 1600–1602); Gilbert 1995, pp. 106, 135, 152, 159; Heimbürger 1998, pp. 29–32 (1601–2, Dürer influence); Gregori 1998, pp. 3–14; Langdon 1998, pp. 228, 235, 298; Puglisi 1998, no. 48 (attributed, c. 1603–5); Robb 1998, p. 510 (1604); Gregori in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 114–15; Brown in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 97 (c. 1605); Gash 2001, p. 429 (questionable); Spike 2001, pp. 158–61, ill. 162, cat. no. 42 (c. 1605); Macioce 2003, p. 165.

Caravaggio's execution of a *Crowning with Thorns* for the Massimi collection in Rome was overlooked by the early writers. On June 5, 1605, he signed an agreement to paint an unspecified subject similar in size and value to a previously consigned *Crowning with Thorns*. Following its cleaning in 1976, Gregori and Marini associated the former Cecconi picture with the Massimi picture of presumably 1604–5. The work had already been brought to the attention of scholars by Longhi, who considered it a copy after a lost prototype. The attribution is still under discussion. The handling of Christ's face, shoulder, and hands and, possibly, also the red mantle, seem attributable to the master himself. By contrast, the three assailants on all sides of Christ display little contact with his technique or skills. If this *Crowning with Thorns* is indeed the Massimi picture, he delivered a collaborative work to that gentleman.

It is worthy of note that the measurements of the *Ecce Homo* (69 x 53¼ in. [175 x 135 cm]) executed by the painter Cigoli to comprise a pair with an unspecified Caravaggio in the Massimi collection conform to the format of this painting rather than the Genoa *Ecce Homo* with which it is often compared. Miles Chappell has kindly pointed out that Cigoli included a small sketch of this *Crowning with Thorns* on a sheet of drawings in the Louvre.

See pp. 158–61, illustrated p. 162.

Condition:

Good. The painting was restored prior to the 1951 exhibition in Milan. In 1974, the painting was restored by Thomas Schneider (1976), who removed numerous old repaints and observed pentimenti in the fingers of Christ's right hand and shoulder. The low dark balustrade and the mantle draped over it were evidently painted after the rest of the composition was already complete. See *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* (1991).

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Gregory 1985, p. 293; Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 59–60 (for the paintings in Sicilian collections considered not copies but derivations of this painting). Among these are:

C. I

Rivarolo (Genoa), San Bartolomeo della Certosa

Oil on canvas, 65 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 78 $\frac{3}{4}$ in. (165 x 200 cm)

Bibliography:

Gregory 1985, p. 293 (anonymous Genoese, active second quarter seventeenth century); Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 60 (Gregori's thesis of Genoese origin of painting based on this copy, not necessarily proven); di Fabio in Bergamo 2000, p. 212 (relates to two references to paintings of this subject attributed to Caravaggio in the Genoese collections of Gio. Vincenzo Imperiale, 1648 [Martinoni 1983, pp. 278–79] and of Pietro Gentile, 1780 [Ratti 1780, p. 121]).

Good old copy with variations that are in a sense corrections of the original. For example, the copy shows both hands of the figure in the foreground, who is standing instead of sitting. At right, one sees a square ledge toward which Christ appears to reach with his hand.

42. *Ecce Homo*, 1605

Oil on canvas, 50 $\frac{3}{8}$ x 40 $\frac{1}{2}$ in. (128 x 103 cm)

Genoa, Musei di Strada Nuova–Palazzo Bianco

Provenance:

Palazzo Rosso Museum, Genoa, where found in storage; Palazzo Bianco Museum, Genoa, inventory 1921 n. 1638 as copy by Lionello Spada; transferred to storage of Palazzo Rosso, Genoa, 1925; lent to the Scuola Navale, Genoa, 1929 where it hung on staircase; recovered from the bombed ruins in 1944 and placed in temporary storage in Palazzo Ducale, Genoa; transferred to storage, Palazzo Rosso, Genoa, 1946; discovered in storage in 1951 by Caterina Marcenaro, director of Musei Civici, Genoa, and entrusted for restoration in 1953 to Pico Cellini, by this time without stretcher, irregular canvas measured 46 $\frac{1}{2}$ x 37 $\frac{3}{8}$ in. (118 x 96 cm); Civica Galleria di Palazzo Rosso, Genoa, inv. P.B. 1638, from whence transferred.

Documents:

I. A painting of this subject of unknown dimensions was in the Massimi collection by 1605: In Caravaggio's own hand, signed and dated June 25, 1605: "I, Michel Ang.o Merisi da Caravaggio, obligate myself to paint by the first of August for Sig. Massimo Massimi a painting of the same value and size as that I have already made for him of the *Crowning of Christ with Thorns*." ["Io Michel Ang.lo Merisi da Caravaggio mi obbligo di pingere all' Ill.mo Signor Massimo Massimi p[er] esserne prima statto pagato un quadro di valore e grandezza come quello ch'io gli feci già della Incoronatione di Crixto p[er] il primo di Agosto 1605."] (Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 58–59; Maurizio Marini 1989, p. 454, Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 10; Macioce 2003, doc. 198, p. 165).

II. According to the same scholars Cigoli was commissioned in 1607 to paint a pendant to this picture that is now in the Palazzo Pitti: in Cigoli's hand dated March 1607: "I, Lodovico di Giambattista Cigoli received from Sig. Massimo Massimi 25 scudi for a large painting to be a pair to one by Michelangiolo Caravaggio . . ." ["Io Lodovico di Giambattista Cigoli ò ricevuto da N[obil] Sig.r Massimo Massimi scudi venticinque a buon conto di un quadro grande compagno di uno altro mano del sig.r Michelangiolo Caravaggio . . ."] (Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 47–51; Macioce 2003, doc. 333, p. 221).

Inventories:

Vannugli (1998) relates this picture to two references to untraced painting(s) of this subject by Caravaggio in Spanish collections:

1. January 22, 1631: Inventory of Juan de Lescano "[21] An Ecce Homo with Pilate who shows him to the public and an executioner who dresses him in a purple cape, large painting, original by Caravagio and this picture is estimated at over 800 D" ["Un ecce homo con pilato que lo muestra al pueblo, y un sazon (*sic*) que le viste de detras la veste porpureas quadro grande original del caravagio y esta pintura es estimada en mas de 800 D"] (Labrot 1992, p. 57).

2. 1645: Inventory of Anna Sigher y Strada refers to an *Ecce Homo* by Caravaggio (Getty Provenance Index 1645/03/20I-1960).

Sources:

1. *Vita di Lodovico Cardi* [known as Cigoli] written by his nephew Giambattista Cardi, pre-1628 (ed. Battelli 1913, pp. 37–38): “Massimo Massimi wanted an *Ecce Homo* painted to his satisfaction and so he commissioned one from Passignano, one from Caravaggio, and one from [Cigoli], all to be done by the end of the month, without advising the artists themselves about the contest. He liked Cigoli’s more than the others, and took it to Rome, and then Florence, where it was sold to the Severi.” [“volendo Monsignor Massimi un *Ecce Homo* che gli soddisfacesse, ne commesse uno al Passignano, uno al Caravaggio, et uno al Cigoli senza che l’uno sapesse dell’altro: i quali tutti tirati al fine e messi al paragone . . . [quello di Cigoli] . . . piacque più degli altri, e perciò tenutolo appresso di se Monsignore mentre stette in Roma fu di poi portato a Firenze e venduro al Severi.”]

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 223): (follows description of the *Taking of Christ*, cat. no. 30): “For the Massimi he made an *Ecce Homo* that was taken to Spain” [“Alli Signori Massimi colorì un *Ecce Homo* che fu portato in Ispagna . . .”].

Exhibitions:

Bordeaux 1955; New York-Naples 1985, no. 86; Florence 1991, no. 13; Genoa 1992, pp. 109–10; Mantua 1996, no. 5; Bergamo 2000, no. 37; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 98 (London only); Berlin 2003–4; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 6.

Bibliography:

Ainaud 1947, p. 368; Rotondi 1954, pp. 6–17; Longhi 1954², pp. 3–13 (accepts after restoration as original of Messina copy); Longhi 1954³, pp. 211–12 (identifies with picture mentioned by Bellori, but hypothesizes a second version by Caravaggio painted in Sicily, suggested by the number of copies found there; original transferred to Genoa during nineteenth century, because no reference in Ratti 1780); Baumgart 1955, p. 201 n. 18 (school); Czobor 1955, pp. 211–12 (Pilate is a self-portrait?); Friedlaender 1955, no. 47 (Longhi published this painting as book went to press); Baroni 1956 (attributed); Samek Ludovici 1956, pp. 143–77 (Bellori picture); Wagner 1958, pp. 115–17 (copy); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 347–50; Longhi 1960, p. 34; Jullian 1961, pp. 150, 157 n. 77–80 (copy); de Logu 1962, p. 158 (copy); Venturi 1963, no. 34 (April

1604–May 1606); Bottari 1966, pp. 30–31; Moir 1967, I, p. 184, II, pp. 56 EE 2, 59 C 3 (agrees with Longhi hypothesis that second version exists, but is lost—picture not recorded in Ratti 1780 nor Hackert 1790, possibly arrived from Sicily after earthquake of Messina in 1783, perhaps a connection with the Passion cycle for Nicolao di Giacomo and thus dates post August 1609); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967 n. 67 (1605–6); Kitson 1969, no. 64; Cinotti 1971, p. 123 (copy?); Dell’Arco–Marini 1970, p. 121; Calvesi 1971, pp. 93–142 (cannot be Massimi picture); Cellini 1973 (restored 1954); Marini 1974, pp. 35, 72, 411–13, n. 58 (1606); Moir 1976, pp. 99 no. 34, 131 n. 215 (now accepts painting as that done for the Massimi, and Caravaggio’s only representation of the subject); Marini 1978–79, pp. 22, 59, fig. 14 (1606, had to have arrived in Genoa in seicento because of the influence it had on local school, i.e., Orazio Ferrari, Luciano Borzone, Bernardo Strozzi); Moir 1976, pp. 99, 131–32 (connects to Massimi pictures, 1604–5); Negri Arnoldi 1977, pp. 17–37; Spear 1979, p. 318 (rejects); Cinotti 1983, no. 18 (reference to Cigoli competition is plausible); Hibbard 1983, pp. 337–38 (attributed, 1606); Campagna Cicala in Syracuse 1984, pp. 106–9 (last Roman moment); Gregori 1985, no. 86 (April–May 1606, when Cigoli in Rome, associates with Massimi’s competition, and identifies Cigoli’s painting as *Ecce Homo* in Palazzo Pitti, Florence; New York–Naples 1985, no. 35); Christiansen 1986, p. 438 (not Caravaggio, not Massimi picture because dimensions wrong, absence of incisions); Barbiellini Amidei 1987, pp. 14–15; Strinati 1987; Cinotti in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 43–58; Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 33–34 (Pilate is an unidentified portrait); Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 47–51, 61–64 (dispels idea of competition between painters); Marini 1989, pp. 481–84, no. 62 (1605); Calvesi 1990, pp. 322–24; Gregori 1990, pp. 19–20; Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 13; Bologna 1992, p. 325 (summer 1605); Spike 1992², pp. 275–77 (doubts); Gregori 1994, p. 151, no. 50 (1605); Christiansen 1995, pp. 87–88; Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50; Safarik in Mantua 1996, pp. 79–80; Marini 1997, pp. 40–41; Bona Castellotti 1998, p. 92 n. 68; Heimbürger 1998, p. 20 (cites Gregori 1990, one of the figures inspired by Dürer); Langdon 1998, pp. 228, 298; Puglisi 1998, no. 52 (not Massimi commission; attributed, c. 1605); Robb 1998, p. 510 (1605); Vannugli 1998, pp. 5–15, no. 15 (similar to painting in the inventory of the Spanish diplomat, Juan de Lezcano); Di Fabio in Bergamo 2000, pp. 212–13 (1605); Brown in London–Rome 2001, cat. no. 98 (c. 1605); Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 13–15, fig. no. 12 (1605, after June 25 and before August); Spike 2001, pp. 158–61, cat. no. 42 (1605); Macioce 2003, pp. 198, 221; Boccardo and Fabio in Barcelona 2005, pp. 64–67, cat. no. 6 (1605); Sgarbi 2005, no. 42 (c. 1604–5); Tresoldi 2006, p. 95 (1605).

There is circumstantial evidence that Caravaggio painted an *Ecce Homo* for Massimo Massimi in Rome. From his later vantage point, Bellori knew only that the *Ecce Homo* painted for Massimi was taken to Spain. In 1607 Cigoli was commissioned by Massimi to paint a pair to a picture by Caravaggio already in his possession. Cigoli's nephew, Giambattista Cardi, wrote in his *Vita di Lodovico Cardi*, pre-1628, that Massimi commissioned paintings of the subject by Caravaggio, Cigoli, and Passignano. Baldinucci's inflation of this story into a full-fledged artistic competition that captured the imaginations of Roman painters is discounted by the documented commissions. On June 25, 1605, Caravaggio agreed to deliver to Massimi by August a painting of the same size and value as the *Crowning with Thorns* already in the Massimi collection. The *Crowning with Thorns* in Prato is considered by Gregori and Marini to be the Massimi picture, but the connection has yet to be proved.

The attribution of this *Ecce Homo* to Caravaggio is implicitly supported by the existence in Messina of an old, if weak, copy of the painting that was likewise ascribed to Caravaggio when it was in the church of Sant'Andrea Avallino dei Padri in that city, see c.2 below.

Given these circumstances, Longhi and other scholars concluded that the present painting in Genoa is to be identified with the Massimi picture. The date of the dispersal of that collection is not known, but the *Ecce Homo* by Cigoli (today in the Palazzo Pitti) had already been transferred to a Florentine private collection by 1628. Caravaggio's lost *Ecce Homo* seems not to have left any traces in Spain, although Bellori's report may reflect the presence of an *Ecce Homo* of similar description by 1631 in the collection of Juan de Lescano, a Spaniard resident in Naples. This provenance was proposed by Vannugli (1998), who places Lescano in Rome between 1609 and 1616.

The question is seriously complicated by the problematic authorship of the Genoa *Ecce Homo*. Pentimenti show that this Genoa picture is the prime version of this subject, yet the execution is atypical for Caravaggio as Christiansen observed in detail in 1986. Although the composition has a dramatic intensity that is worthy of Caravaggio, there is no passage on the canvas that can be considered indisputably his handiwork. Christ holds a reed that casts no shadow, an inexplicable omission for this artist. The dense application of opaque colors suggests strongly the intervention of a different painter working under Caravaggio's

direction. The same diagnosis seems to fit the Prato *Crowning with Thorns*. If someday the Massimi provenance of these two pictures is established, it would be shown that Caravaggio had respected his agreement on June 25, 1605 to the letter.

See pp. 158–61, illustrated at p. 157.

Condition:

Mediocre. Restored by Pico Cellini in 1954. There are incisions around left hand of Christ. See *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* (1991). Another restoration in 2003 by Bona Vera and Di Fabio revealed many pentimenti in the hands of Christ. See Barcelona 2005.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C.1

Naples, Lanfranco Massa, 1630 inventory: “An Ecce Homo by Caravaggio.”

Bibliography:

Delfino 1985, p. 95; Boccardo and Di Fabio in Barcelona 2005, pp. 64–67, cat. no. 6 (possibly identical to the *Ecce Homo* cited a year later in the inventory of Juan de Lescano 1631.

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 99, no. 34a–34e; Campagna Cicala 1984–85, p. 108; Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 62–63.

Among these is:

C.2

Messina, Museo Regionale, inv. 985

Oil on canvas, 82¾ x 42½ in. (210 x 108 cm)

Provenance:

Church of Sant'Andrea Avellino dei Padri. Teatini, Messina; removed to museum before earthquake of 1908.

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 61 (as copy of lost original); Palermo 2001, cat. no. 10.

Bibliography:

Gallo 1756, I, p. 99 (Caravaggio); Hackert 1792 (Caravaggio); Grosso–Cacopardo 1821 (Caravaggio); Saccá 1906, pp. 66–67 (Caravaggio); Mauceri 1921–22, pp. 581–82 (Sicilian follower); Isarlo 1941, p. 210 (Alonzo Rodriguez); Longhi 1943, p. 37 (crude but faithful copy of late, lost Caravaggio); Berenson 1951, pp. 44–45; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (marginalia, “little to do with Caravaggio”); Longhi 1954², pp. 3–13 (executed, first half of the seventeenth century); Friedlaender 1955, p. 223 (copy); Kitson 1969, no. 64 (copy); Moir 1976, p. 99 no. 34a, 131 n. 215 (Biagio Manzoni, who could have seen the original in Rome c. 1610–20, and possibly this copy is a source for other Sicilian copies); Negri Arnoldi 1977, pp. 20, 33 no. 2 (Alonzo Rodriguez, executed not in Sicily but Rome, where he resided in 1606); Cinotti 1983, p. 439 (copy); Campagna Cicala 1984–85, p. 108 (Rodriguez); Marini 1989, p. 482 (attributed Alonzo Rodriguez); Barbiellini Amidei in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 62–63 (attributed Alonzo Rodriguez; and lists various copies of this copy); Campagna Cicala in Palermo 2001, pp. 128–29, cat. no. 10 (as Alonzo Rodriguez); Spike 2001, cat. no. 42.c.2 (copy).

43. *David and Goliath*, c. 1605

Oil on canvas, 43¼ x 35¾ in. (110 x 91 cm)

Museo Nacional del Prado, Madrid, inv. 65

At lower left, in red, “208.1”; at lower right “1118”

Provenance:

Royal collection, Palacio Buen Retiro, Madrid, by 1794; transferred to the Prado by 1849.

Inventories:

1. 1794 inventory of Buen Retiro, n. 1118: “David triumphant over the Philistine, two varas and one quarter high, one vara across, Michelangelo Carabacho” [“David triunfante del filisteo, dos varas y cuarta de alto y una vara de ancho, Michelangelo Carabacho”] (Pérez Sánchez 1970, no. 32).
2. 1849 inventory of Prado Museum, n. 2.081 (as school).

Source:

Some scholars associate this picture with the following reference:

Bellori 1672 (1976, pp. 232–33): “. . . and the Count of Villamediana had a half figure of David and the portrait of a youth with an orange blossom in his hand” [“. . . e ‘l Conte di Villa Mediana hebbe la mezza figura di Davide, e ‘l ritratto di un giovane con un fiore di melarancio in mano”].

Exhibitions:

Madrid 1970, no. 32; Cleveland 1971, no. 19; Seville 1973, no. 2; New York-Naples 1985, no. 77; Brescia-Frankfurt Savoldo 1990, cat. no. 38; Florence 1991; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 106–9; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 4.

Bibliography:

De Madrazo 1872, no. 77 (as school); Venturi 1927, p. 369 (late); Longhi 1943, p. 39 (circle of Saraceni); Sánchez Cantón 1945, no. 65 (as ?); Ainaud 1947, p. 385, n. 14 (copy after lost original); Baroni 1951 (attributed); Berenson 1951, pp. 34, 38–39, 58 (copy after lost Caravaggio); Longhi 1951, pp. 21–25 (“on the Caravaggesque margins, 1592–95” [“sui margini caravaggeschi, 1592–95”]); Mahon 1952, pp. 18, 19 (1598–99, perhaps ex-Villamediana); Hinks 1953, no. 25 (1599–1600); Battisti 1955, p. 174 (painting taken to Spain by G. B. Crescenzi in 1617 and confiscated with other paintings in 1635, but no proof of this); Friedlaender 1955, p. 203 (“inferior work, definitely not by Caravaggio”); Wagner 1958, pp. 229–30 (doubtful); Arslan 1959, p. 208 (rejects); Baumgart 1959, no. 34 (?); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 322–24; Jullian 1961, pp. 95, 227 (with doubts

1598–99); de Logu 1962 (attributed); Bottari 1966 (attributed); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 38 (copy after lost original); Kitson 1969, no. 38 (copy after lost original); Pérez Sánchez in Madrid 1970, no. 32 (1599–1600, confirms that not in inventory of Alcazar in 1686 or 1700, picture referred to in earlier catalogues was a David with head of Goliath by Tanzio da Varallo); Schleier 1970, p. 346; Cinotti 1971, pp. 124, 193 n. 412–13 (with question); Spear 1971, no. 19 (as attributed, c. 1600, same hand as *Narcissus*); Borea 1972, p. 154 I (masterpiece); Nicolson 1972, p. 113; Pepper 1972, p. 170 (doubtful); Volpe 1972, p. 62; Cinotti 1973, p. 185; Pérez Sánchez in Seville 1973, no. 2; de Salas 1973, pp. 31–32; Gregori 1974, pp. 30–32; Harris 1974, p. 236; Marini 1974, pp. 149, 380–81 n. 34 (1599); Nicolson 1974, pp. 607–8; Moir 1976, pp. 107, no. 54a, 138–39 n. 235 (copy); Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Bissell 1981, pp. 203, 205–7 (Orazio Gentileschi?); Marini 1981, p. 366 (1599); Cinotti 1983, no. 27 (some doubts, 1600); Hibbard 1983, p. 332; Gregori 1985, no. 77 (early 1600s); Spike 1985, p. 417 (1604–5); Christiansen 1986, p. 440 (autograph, very good state); Marini 1989, pp. 424–26, no. 37 (Rome, 1599); Museo del Prado 1990, 2.081; Milà in Brescia–Frankfurt Savoldo 1990, cat. no. 38; Posèq 1990, p. 171 (1599); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, pp. 28–29 (publishes x-ray with pentimento of Goliath’s head); Bologna 1992, p. 311 (1598–99); Fumagalli 1994; Gregori 1994, p. 148, no. 25 (1597–98); Gilbert 1995, p. 25; Marini in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 135–42 (1597–99); Langdon 1998, pp. 169–70; Puglisi 1998, no. 21 (c. 1598–99); Robb 1998, p. 502 (1599); Milucua in Madrid–Bilbao 1999, pp. 106–9 (c. 1599), Spike 2001, pp. 200–201, cat. no. 43 (c. 1605); Berra in Milan 2004, pp. 55–83; Milucua in Barcelona 2005, pp. 56–59, cat. no. 4 (c. 1600); Sgarbi 2005, no. 34 (dates after Cerasi Chapel, before *Victorious Cupid*); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 26 (1599); Varriano 2006, p. 81, figs. 63, 64 (pentimento significantly changed Goliath’s expression).

The circumstances by which this *David and Goliath* arrived in Spain are not known, but several old copies in that country are evidence that it had already arrived in the seventeenth century. The Roman sources do not mention it. Although its brown tonality recalls the lateral paintings in the Contarelli Chapel, the handling of the pigments is noticeably less dense than that transitional moment. The cloth folds are also more freely described. A significant pentimento in the face of Goliath was revealed by radiography in 1991; in the artist’s original conception the giant’s gruesome face seemed almost alive.

See p. 200, illustrated at p. 201.

Condition:

Good, apart from a triangular hole in the middle of David's sleeve. See Madried-Bilbao 1999, Barcelona 2005.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 107 no. 54a–b; Marini in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 135–36.

44. *Holy Family*, 1605

Oil on canvas, 46¼ x 37¾ in. (117.5 x 96 cm)

Clara Otero Silva collection, Caracas, Venezuela

Since 1998 on long-term loan to The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York

Provenance:

Nicholas M. Acquavella Galleries, New York, 1951; Eric W. Bergman collection; purchased by present owner in 1967.

Exhibitions:

Rome 2001, cat. no. 16; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 12; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 15.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1951, pp. 29–30 (c. 1595); Longhi 1952, (ed. 1999 p. 183) (compares composition to Andrea del Sarto); Mahon 1952, p. 19 n. 95 (“a version . . . which is evidently considerably superior to the copies in the Mostra [1951]”); Hinks 1953, no. 45 (copy); Friedlaender 1954, p. 150 (copy); Baumgart 1955, no. 27 (c. 1597–98); Wagner 1958, pp. 111, 209 (copy of unknown origin 1602); Arslan 1959, p. 217 (copy); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 326 (1602–3); Jullian 1961, pp. 142–43 (with reservations); Venturi 1963, p. 43 (copy); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 51 (open question); Kitson 1969, no. 50 (open question); Cinotti 1971, pp. 124–25 (copy of lost original 1600–1601); Rossi 1973, no. 30 (copy); Marini 1974, pp. 234, 432–32 n. 71

(1607); Moir 1976, pp. 116–17 no. 104d, 157–58 nos. 275–76 (theme not like Caravaggio, wistful sentimentality suggests Angelo Caroselli, c. 1615); Marini 1978–79, p. 40 (perhaps the picture commissioned by the Duke of Modena for the Chapel della Madonna); Nicolson 1979, p. 32 (copy); Cinotti 1983, no. 5 (from photo, copy?); Hibbard 1983, p. 338 (rejects); Marini in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, p. 68; Marini 1989, pp. 504–6 no. 71 (Naples, after August 20, 1607); Bologna 1992, p. 350 (best example of a lost original); Gregori 1994, p. 152, no. 63 (1607); Puglisi 1998, no. 66 (attributed, c. 1607); Christiansen 1999, pp. 3–11; Vogel 2000, p. E38; Christiansen in Rome 2001, p. 36, cat. no. 16; Spike 2001, cat. no. 44 (c. 1605); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 173, 182 no. 12 (first Neapolitan period); Marini 2005, pp. 286, 518–20, no. 79 (1607); Amsterdam 2006, pp. 65–69, cat. no. 12 (c. 1603); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 225, no. 15 (1602–4); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 124 n. 21 (Roman period).

The Daret engraving and other old copies are the sole seventeenth-century records of this presumed original that have as yet been traced. The present version of the *Holy Family* has only recently come to light after decades of inaccessibility in private collections. With very few exceptions, modern writers on Caravaggio judged the picture a copy after a lost original. The painting is attributable to Caravaggio himself around 1605.

See illustration at p. 160.

Condition:

Fair. Following its restoration in 1999 at the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York, the painting was placed on temporary view in January 2000. The painting has suffered numerous scattered losses across its surface.

Copies:

I. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, pp. 116–17 no. 104a–e. Among these are:

C. I

Engraving 11¼x 8½ in. (28.5 x 20.5 cm)

Pierre (or Jean?) Daret

Inscription: “Daret scul . . . Mich.Ang. de Caravagio inve.t”

Albertina, Vienna, HB XIV 153/249; Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, 51.501.4808; Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, no. 5505

Bibliography:

Voss 1924, p. 75; Moir 1976, pp. 117 no. 104a, 157–58 n. 276 (as by Pierre Daret 1610–84 who worked with Vouet in Rome, or possibly Jean [Brussels c. 1613–15, Aix-en-Provence 1668]); Cinotti 1983, p. 640, fig. 1; Marini 1989, p. 506; Spike 2001, cat. no. 44.c.1.

C.2

Berlin–Dahlem, Staatliche Museen, Gemäldegalerie

Oil on canvas, 45 x 36¾ in. (114 x 92 cm)

Provenance:

By gift 1923 Gallerie, Oldenberg, as attributed Pietro Novelli; Kaiser Friedrich Museum, Berlin.

Exhibition:

Milan 1951, no. 47 (as Caravaggesque); Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 16.

Bibliography:

Voss 1923, pp. 82–83 (c. 1595); Voss 1924, p. 75 pl. 9 (as original); Venturi 1925, p. 11; Longhi 1928/29 (copy of unknown original c. 1595); Arslan 1951, p. 445 (“a nineteenth century copy”); Venturi 1951, p. 41 (among works attributed); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1605–6, copy); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (copy of unknown original, 1602–4); Hinks 1953, no. 45 (copy Naples, Battistellian); Wagner 1958, pp. 111, 209 (copy, unknown original 1602); Jullian 1961, pp. 142–45; *Catalogue . . .* 1966, p. 27 (dubious original); Moir 1976, pp. 116–17 no. 104b, 157–58 nos. 275–76; Cinotti 1971, pp. 124–25 (copy lost original 1600–1601); Schleier 1975, p. 88 (copy); Gemäldegalerie Berlin 1975, p. 88; Schleier in *Katalog der Gemäldegalerie* 1978, p. 92; Cinotti 1983, no. 5 (copy); Marini 1989, p. 504 (attributed Pietro Novelli); Christiansen 1999, pp. 5–6; Spike 2001, cat. no. 44.c.2 (copy); Marini 2005, p. 518; Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 225; cat. no. 16 (copy).

C.3

Musée des Beaux-Arts de Tours, Inv. 795.1.5

Oil on canvas, 37³/₈ x 35³/₈ in. (95 x 90 cm)

Provenance:

Collection of Cardinal Richelieu.

Bibliography:

Moir 1976, pp. 116–17 no. 104c, 157–58 nos. 275–76; *Tableaux français et italiens du XVIIe siècle* 1982, pp. 116–17; Spike 2001, cat. no. 44.c (among copies listed in Moir); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, no. 17 (copy).

45. *Death of the Virgin*, c. 1605

Oil on canvas, 145¹/₄ x 96¹/₂ in. (369 x 245 cm)

Musée du Louvre, Paris

Provenance:

June 14, 1601 commissioned by Laerzio Cherubini (1550–1626) for the church of Santa Maria della Scala in Trastevere, Rome; finished at the end of 1605 or early 1606 and rejected by the clergy of that church; acquired by Vincenzo I Gonzaga (1526–1612), Duke of Mantua; sold by his son and heir, Vincenzo II Gonzaga (1549–1627) to Charles I of England; sold in 1650 at London in the dispersal of his collection; Paris, collection Everhard Jabach (1618–1695); acquired by Louis XIV, 1671; Paris, Palace of the Tuileries in 1679; Paris, Royal collection, 1690–91; Paris, cabinet of the paintings of the King, 1709–10; exhibited at the Musèum des Arts after 1793 (Loire 2006, p. 56).

Inventory:

1. 1626: Inventory of Ferdinando VI Duke of Mantua and Monferrato, as by Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio, “Dead Madonna mourned by the Apostles” [“Madonna morta pianta

dalli Apostoli”] (Getty Provenance Index, 0898 Gonzaga, Ferdinando, VI Duca di Mantova e Monferrato 1626/12/30I-2393).

Documents:

1. June 14, 1601: Laerzio Cherubini, a jurist from Norcia and a friend of Cardinal Del Monte and Marchese Giustiniani, commissioned a painting for his chapel in Santa Maria della Scala for delivery the following year (Parks 1985, pp. 438–48).

2. August 4, 1602, testament: Instructions of Cherubini to be buried in his chapel in the Church of Santa Maria della Scala in Trastevere [“Cherubinus sepelliri voluit, et mandavit in ecclesia Beatae Mariae de Schala in regione Transtiberim in eius Tumulo nuper constructo esistenti in eius Cappela”] (Parks 1985, pp. 438–48).

3. May 22 and July 24, 1606: Papal privileges given for the altar of this chapel (Parks 1985, pp. 438–48)

4. February 17, 1607: Giovanni Magno, Roman agent of Vincenzo I Gonzaga, Duke of Mantua, to Annibale Chieppo, chancellor of the Duke: “I saw last Sunday the painting by Caravaggio proposed by Sr. Peter Paul Rubens . . . [Caravaggio is] the most famous modern painter in Rome, and this canvas is reputed to be the best of the works he has done, many factors favor the painting, and truly one sees certain parts that are quite exquisite.” [“Si vide dom[en]ica passata il quadro del Caravaggio proposto dal s[igno]r Pietro Pavolo Rubens . . . Il pittore però è de’ più famosi di quelli che habbino cose moderne in Roma, et questa tavola è tenuta delle meglio opere che habbi fatto, onde la presuntione sta a favor del quadro per m[ol]ti rispetti, et realm[en]te vi si osservano certe parti m[ol]to esquisite.”] (Corradini 1993, doc. 113; Macioce 2003, doc. 332[a], p. 220).

5. February 24, 1607: Giovanni Magno writes to Annibale Chieppo, regarding the acquisition of the *Death of the Virgin*, that the price of 280 scudi agreed to by Rubens was by no means discredited even though the painting was out of the hands of the painter and was refused by the church for which it was painted. (Corradini 1993, doc. 114; Macioce 2003, doc. 332[b] p. 220).

6. March 31, 1607: Giovanni Magno writes that the painting had been brought to his house with great difficulty on account of its height but he had decided that “I would not let anyone make a copy of it” (Corradini 1993, doc. 115; Macioce 2003, doc. 332[c] p. 220).

7. April 7, 1607: Magno writes that it had been “necessary to allow the painters of the town to visit this week to see the painting recently purchased because of its fame and the curiosity it had evoked in many” [“mi è stato necess[ari]o per sodisfar all’università delli pittori lasciar veder per tutta questa settimana il quadro comperato, essendovi concorsi molti et delli più famosi con m[olt]a curiosità . . .] (Corradini 1993, doc. 117; Macioce 2003, doc. 332[d] p. 220).

8. April 14, 1607: Magno writes that the purchased painting was “at the disposition of Rubens to send it but to protect it from damage, he is having made some kind of case, which will unavoidably delay the shipment until after the Easter celebrations . . .” [“... il quadro comperato sta a disposit[i]one del s[igno]r Pietro P[avo]lo [Rubens], quanto all’esser inviato, ma egli per assicurarlo da patimento fa lavorar non so che cassa, che farà tardar necessariamente sin doppo le feste il metterlo in via . . .”] (Corradini 1993, doc. 118; Macioce 2003, doc. 332[e], p. 220).

9. April 28, 1607, Magno writes that on Thursday the painting was sent to Mantua [“... Intanto dirò a V[ostra] S[ignoria] che giovedì s’incaminò a cotesta volta il quadro . . . alla condotta sin nella città di Mantova per dove hanno i suoi reccapiti . . .”] (Corradini 1993 doc. 119; Macioce 2003, doc. 332[f] p. 221).

10. 1627: Inventory of paintings of the son and heir of Vincenzo I, ex-cardinal Ferdinando Gonzaga, sold to Charles I of England “n. 239: and another of the Madonna dead, with weeping Apostles, work of Michelangelo da Caravazzi, L. 600” [“n. 239: Un altra ancora dove la Madonna è morta, pianta dalli Apostoli, opera di Michelangelo da Caravazzi, L. 600”] (Luzio 1974, p. 106).

11. Maccherini 1997, pp. 76–77, identifies this as the painting Mancini attempted to acquire between October 1606 and January 1607.

A. October 14, 1606: Giulio Mancini wrote to his brother in Siena, Deifebo, “Another canvas by this Caravaggio which is pleasing is the death of the Madonna surrounded by the apostles,

which was to go to the church of the Madonna della Scala in Trastevere, but was compromised by its lasciviousness and lack of decorum and the Carmelite brothers had it removed. It is 23 palmi high and 11 wide, well made but without decorum or invention or cleanliness, but executed even better than the Saint John. I offered 200 scudi, it cost 270, and it seems that with some diligence we can acquire it and around it do something of Saint Bartholomew, but I await your comment.” [“Già che dite piacer questo Caravaggio, qua è una tavola da altare dove è la morte della Madonna attorno con li Apostoli, quale andava nella Madonna della Schala di Trastevere che, per esser stata spropositata di lascivia e di decoro, il Frate Scalzo l’ha fatta levare. È alta 23 palmi larga 11 in circa, è ben fatta, ma senza decoro e inventione e pulitezza, ma le cose son ben fatte di miglior maniera che cotesto Sancto Giovanni. Io li ho offerto 200 scudi, costò 270, se vi paresse che fussi per noi io farei diligenza di haverla et attorno ne potessimo far qualche cosa di Sanvto Bartolomeo, però ditemene quanto prima.”] (Maccherini 1997, pp. 81-82)

B. January 6, 1607: Giulio Mancini wrote to Deifebo, “I wrote you about the painting that I have bought, though for the 270 scudi I know that someone could reprove me but being of service to God and the embellishment of the City [Siena] I will ignore the critics. Since this week has been rainy and I have rarely gone out, I’ve not concluded the affair. Monday I will go to the fathers to conclude. I will make the writings and I shall see to its being rolled and I will send it with the name of God. Do not ever allow it to be seen privately, nor ever say anything about having it with you.” [“. . . Vi scrissi del quadro che l’havevo per compro con mio comodo, però per li 270, so che quancheduno saputo ci riprenderà, ma per esser servitio di Iddio e abbellimento della Città mi curarò pocho delle lagne. E perché questa settimana è stata tutta piovosa e io esco fuor pocho, non ho concluso, lunedì sarò da Padri, fermerò, farò le scritture e mirarò arrotolarlo e mandarlo con il nome di Iddio né lo lascerete vedere mai privatamente, né fia che l’havere costà non ne dite cos’alcuna.”] (Maccherini 1997, p. 82)

C. January 12, 1607: Giulio Mancini wrote to Deifebo, “I have written you several times regarding the painting of the Madonna della Scala, but you have not responded. I have concluded the matter in words but not bound in writing, because I have waited word from you which I have not had. I would like to know if your servant will come here leading a beast on such a long journey loaded by such a heavy thing as this painting will be when it is rolled up, or whether I should buy a horse. Respond to this question.” [“Vi ho scritto più volte del

quadro della Madonna della Schala, né mi havete risposto, l'ho concluso in parola, ma non leghato con scritte, perché ho aspettato avviso da voi, che non l'ho potuto havere. Desidererei sapere se codesto vostro garzone è da venir qua e guidare una bestia tanto viaggio con carico di cosa che se li havesse a provar rispetto come sarà questo quadro arrotolato, che, essendo atto, comprarei una cavalla e come l'havesse all'ordineve lo avviserei, però risponderemi a questo quesito.”] (Maccherini 1997, p. 81)

D. Letters of January 19, 20, and 27, 1607: Giulio Mancini complains of not receiving a response, and he never mentions the painting again (Maccherini 1997, p. 82).

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–25 (1956, pp. 120, 132): “The death of the Virgin in the Madonna della Scala that now is with the Duke of Mantua was removed by the fathers from that church because Caravaggio had used a courtesan as the model for the person of the Madonna . . . he portrayed the Virgin, Our Lady, as a whore from the slums whom he loved, carefully and without devotion . . . and in particular that offended those good fathers.” [“. . . la Morte della Madonna della Scala che l'ha adesso il Serenissimo di Mantova, fatta levar di detta chiesa da quei padri perchè in persona della Madonna havea ritratto una cortigiana . . . Qualche meretrice sozza degli ortacci da lui amata ecosi scrupolosa e senza devozione . . . et in particolare appresso que' buoni padri”] (Hess 1954, p. 275; Friedlaender 1955, p. 195).

2. Baglione 1642, p. 138: “For the Madonna della Scala in Trastevere he painted the Dormition of the Virgin, but because it had such little decorum, the Madonna was swollen and her legs uncovered, it was removed; and purchased by the Duke of Mantua who put it in his splendid gallery” [“Per la Madonna della Scala in Trastevere dipinse il transito di N. Donna, ma perchè havea fatto con poco decoro la Madonna gonfia, e con gambe scoperte, fu levata via; e la comperò il Duca di Mantova, e la mise in Mantova nella sua nobilissima Galleria”].

3. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 231): “The same fate [refusal] befell the Dormition of the Madonna from the Chiesa della Scala, removed for being overly imitative of the corpse of a dead and swollen woman” [“La medesima sorte ebbe il Transito della Madonna nella Chiesa della Scala, rimosso per avervi troppo imitato una Donna morta gonfia”].

4. Lanzi 1792 [(1809) ed. 1968, I, p. 358].

Exhibitions:

Florence 1922, no. XXVII; Paris 1965, no. 26.

Bibliography:

Bertolotti 1885, p. 36; Kallab 1906–7, p. 286 (last Roman work); Marangoni 1922, p. 220 (near *Agony in the Garden*); Voss 1924, pp. 79–80 (between Cerasi Chapel and *Entombment*); Pevsner 1927/28, p. 287 (c. 1604, after *Entombment*, before *Madonna of Loreto*); Longhi 1928/29, p. 32; Schudt 1942, nos. 36–37; Longhi 1943, p. 16; Arslan 1951, pp. 450–51 (c. 1603); Berenson 1951, pp. 36, 59, 67; Longhi 1951, p. 26 n. 1; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1605–6); Venturi 1951, no. 36; Longhi 1952, no. XXVI (last great work in Rome); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1605–6); Hinks 1953, no. 51 (1605–6, work left unfinished); Borsook 1954, pp. 270–72; Hess 1954, pp. 275–77; Baumgart 1955, no. 54 (1605–6); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 195–98, no. 28 (after *Madonna of Loreto*); Mahon 1956, p. 28; Wagner 1958, pp. 124–27, 131–34; Wittkower 1958, pp. 25, 27–29; Arslan 1959, p. 210 (c. 1603); Steinberg 1959, pp. 187–88; Miller 1960, p. 228; Jullian 1961, pp. 148, 151–54 (near *Entombment*, 1605–6); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 66 (1605–6, last documented work done in Rome); Kitson 1969, no. 63; Longhi 1968, pp. 39–40; Ottani Cavina 1968, pp. 118–19 (work of same subject by Carlo Saraceni substituted for Caravaggio); Argan 1970, pp. 192, 201; Calvesi 1971, pp. 120, 122, 129–36 (together with *Madonna dei Palafrenieri*, a beginning of the misfortune of Caravaggio coincided with the triumph of the Spanish faction under Paul V); Cinotti 1971, pp. 79–80, 86, 122, 160 (end Roman period); Spear 1971, p. 11; Waterhouse 1972, p. 116; Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 125–37 (altarpiece rejected before *Madonna dei Palafrenieri* under influence of Cardinal of Como, Tolomeo Gallio, rigorous prelate of Spanish faction); Marini 1974, pp. 204–9, 414–16, n. 60 (May 1605–early 1606); Röttgen 1974, pp. 236–38; Salerno 1974, p. 589 (same model as in *Madonna of Loreto*); Moir 1976, p. 99 no. 33; Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Magnuson 1982, pp. 90–91 (1605–6); Moir 1982, pp. 128–29 (1605–6); Cinotti 1983, no. 41 (1606); Hibbard 1983, pp. 198–202, 321–22 (1605–6); Lavin 1985; Loire–Brejon de Lavergnée 1987 (1605–6, altarpiece not in place July 24, 1606); Marini 1989, pp. 479–81, n. 61 (Rome, after June 14, 1601 to 1605–6); Askew in Macioco 1990, pp. 17–18, 105; Calvesi 1990, pp. 341–51 (the model for the Virgin may have been the

rehabilitated prostitute Caterina Vannini); Bologna 1992, pp. 43–44, 107–10, 322 (1601–6); Bassani–Bellini 1994, pp. 181–84 (model for the Virgin was the prostitute Anna Bianchini); Calvesi 1994, pp. 148–57; Gregori 1994, pp. 107, 151, no. 53 (1605–6); Pacelli 1994, pp. 176–77; Gilbert 1995, pp. 173–76, 184–85; Macioce 1996, p. 360 (Carmelitani); Heimbürger 1998, pp. 20, 34–35 (“the Virgin’s death is a deeply human event, although the genre-like intimacy of the Northern tradition, as in the engraving of Dürer, is avoided”); Langdon 1998, pp. 226–27, 246, 248–51, 317–18; Puglisi 1998, no. 37 (c. 1601–3); Robb 1998, p. 510 (1604); Benedetti in Mormando 1999, pp. 210, fig. 27 (c. 1605–6); Varriano in Mormando 1999, pp. 192–203; Spike 2001, pp. 150–56, cat. no. 45 (c. 1605); Macioce 2003, pp. 220–21; Sgarbi 2005, no. 44; Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 29 (1605); Loire 2006, pp. 56–64 (1605–6, with more detailed bibliography); Loire and Ravaut 2006, pp. 40–44; Marini in Paliano 2006, pp. 13–15; Tresoldi 2006, p. 97 (1605–6); Varriano 2006, pp. 32–33, 46–47, 62, 80, 94, 105–9, 119–20, fig. 28 (composition adapted to the site of the Cherubini Chapel); Debono 2007, p. 17 ill.; Papa 2008, pp. 114–21 (1605–6); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82.

Caravaggio’s altarpiece of the *Death of the Virgin* was the most controversial rejection of his career. The sources agree that the fathers of the church of Santa Maria della Scala in Trastevere were offended by the unidealized representation of Mary’s corpse on her deathbed. Mancini added a marginal note to the effect that the model for Our Lady was a prostitute whom Caravaggio loved. Indeed, the Virgin’s oval face and luxurious tresses invite comparison with the Fillide portrait painted several years earlier.

The unadorned room contains only an empty copper basin in the foreground that is either an isolated prop or an allusion to Mary as a vessel of divinity. A cloth of deep red hue hovers in the air like the final chord of a Bach chorale. The suspended cloth has no real function, but it resembles a bed canopy or the curtain of a temple, another Marian attribute. Saint Ambrose, the bishop of Milan, composed a meditation on Mary’s qualities by associating the Latin words *aula*, *auleum*, and *olla*, meaning dwelling, curtain, and vessel. In the *Death of the Virgin*, the curtain is identified with Mary’s supine form by being red and ending precisely at her feet, at which point an unseen force pulls it abruptly upward. This is Caravaggio’s poetic metaphor of the ascent of Mary’s soul at her death. It is also one of the most supernatural metaphors in his art.

The altarpiece was commissioned from Caravaggio in 1601 by Laerzio Cherubini from Norcia, who desired the painting for his burial chapel in Santa Maria della Scala. Although the contract required the consignment within a year, it appears from Cherubini's testament of August 4, 1602, that the chapel architecture was not yet complete. The style of the painting has convinced most scholars that Caravaggio executed it before 1604.

It is not known whether the painting was ever installed in the Cherubini Chapel. In October 1606, a few months after Caravaggio's flight from Rome, the Carmelite fathers offered the painting for sale to Giulio Mancini. On February 17, 1607, the Duke of Mantua was informed by letter that his Roman agent had been advised by Peter Paul Rubens to acquire the painting. The excitement shown by Roman painters when it was on view in April 1607 in the house of the Mantuan ambassador suggests that it had not previously been accessible.

See text pp. 150–56.

Condition:

Good. The visibility of the painting is obscured by discolored varnish.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

Antwerp, Belgium, Dominican Church

Bibliography:

von Sandrart 1675, p. 276; Moir 1976, p. 99 no. 33h (lost).

II. Other copies listed in Loire 2006, p. 59.

46. *Saint John the Baptist*, 1605–6

Oil on canvas, 38 x 51 in. (97 x 131.5 cm)

Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica, Palazzo Corsini, Rome

Provenance:

Palazzo Corsini, Rome, by 1784; acquired by the Italian state in 1883 together with Palazzo Corsini alla Lungara.

Inventories:

1. 1784: Inventory of Principe Bartolomeo Corsini, in the Archivio Corsini, Florence (Papini in *L'ornamento della pittura. Cornici, arredo e disposizione della collezione Corsini di Roma nel XVIII secolo*, 1998, p. 183 n. 111)

2. 1812: Inventory of Prince Tommaso Corsini, in the Archivio Corsini, Florence, “a painting 6½ palmi wide and 5 palmi high . . . depicting Saint John the Baptist, by Caravaggio” (Alloisi in Hartford 1998, p. 64).

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 22; Rome 1955; Paris 1965; Rome 1987; Hartford 1998, no. 11; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 132–35; Canberra-Melbourne 2002, cat. no. 51; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 8; Düsseldorf 2006, no. 23; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 6; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 6.

Bibliography:

Barbier de Montault 1870, p. 390; Longhi 1927, p. 31 [*Opere complete*, 1967, II, pp. 306] (Caravaggio); Schudt 1942 (school); Longhi 1943, p. 14; de Rinaldis 1948, p. 226; Arslan 1951, p. 445 (“for extrinsic reasons, canvas, preparation, paint, etc., it seems to have been painted in the 18th century. It is certainly not a copy, but a very free paraphrase of Caravaggio: congenial like a Piazzetta”); Berenson 1951, pp. 32–33; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 22 (1597–98); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1602–3) n. 117 (“Prof. Longhi, who first made the attribution to the master, acutely points out its affinities with Velázquez”); Venturi 1951, p. 41 (rejects); Longhi 1952,

no. XXII [1999 ed. p. 184] (1598–99, “the young rowdy companion who so often served as his model”); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1602–4); Hinks 1953, no. 36; Baumgart 1955, no. 39; Friedlaender 1955, p. 172 (composition closely related to *Saint John the Baptist* in Kansas City, possibly derived from a painting by Caravaggio); Wagner 1958, pp. 106–9, 207, 220 (1602–4); Arslan 1959, p. 194 (original, after examining x-ray); Jullian 1961, pp. 149, 151–53 (c. 1603); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967 no. 56 (c. 1603–4); Kitson 1969, no. 54; Cinotti 1971, pp. 128, 195 n. 41 (1603–4); Marini 1974, pp. 198–99, 411, n. 57 (late Roman period); Moir 1976, pp. 119 no. 118, 161 n. 284 (rejects); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Spear 1979, p. 318 (controversial); Cinotti 1983, no. 56; Hibbard 1983, pp. 320, 334, 341 (follower?); Gregori 1985, p. 300 (doubts about Corsini version are unjustified, postdates Capitoline version, nearer in date to *Baptist* of Kansas City, and *Saint Jerome* at Montserrat, 1606); Tempesta in Rome 1986, p. 35; Marini 1989, pp. 488–89, no. 64 (Rome 1606); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, pp. 262–73 (cites 1808 and 1827 inventories of Prince Tommaso Corsini as referring to “a Saint John the Baptist, style of Caravaggio”); Bologna 1992, p. 318 (c. 1601); Spike 1992², pp. 275–77; Gregori 1994, p. 150, no. 46 (c. 1603–4); Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, p. 16, fig. 11 (1605–6, attributed); Rowlands 1996, pp. 222 (possibly by Lo Spadarino, citing Hibbard); Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50; Alloisi in Hartford 1998, no. 2 (1606, perhaps acquired by the Corsini with the marriage of Felice Barberini, 1758); Papini 1998, p. 183 n. 11; Puglisi 1998, no. 47 (c. 1603–4); Robb 1998, p. 509 (1604); Alloisi in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 132–35 (1606); Zuccari in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, p. 71; Gash 2001, p. 429; Spike 2001, p. 165, ill. 168, cat. no. 46 (1605–6); Costantini in Canberra-Melbourne 2002, pp. 154–55, cat. no. 50; Alloisi in Barcelona 2005, pp. 72–75, cat. no. 8 (c. 1606); Barcelona 2005, pp. 72–75; Cardinali, De Ruggieri, Falucci 2005, “Le incisioni . . .,” pp. 51–55; Cardinali, De Ruggieri, Falucci 2005 “Incisions in . . .,” pp. 58–60; Marini 2005, pp. 272, 503, no. 72; Sgarbi 2005, no. 47 (end of Roman period, dates after Brera *Supper at Emmaus* and *Saint Jerome Writing*); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 232–33, cat. no. 23; Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 120; Clark 2007, cat. no. 5, p. 68 (1606, Rome); Marini in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 6, pp. 222–27 (Rome 1606); Marini in Valletta, Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 6, pp. 236–41 (1606, no earlier reference to this painting than 1808 inventory); Kliemann in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 181–215; von Rosen in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 59–85; Papa 2008, pp. 94–103 (1606).

The Corsini *Baptist* is generally considered an autograph work of inferior quality to the Kansas City painting of the same theme, and apparently the same model, of one or two years

earlier. In contrast to the latter's incisive characterization of its subject, the Corsini picture lacks resolution. The saint's position is ambiguous—he seems to shy away from an unseen menace—and the paint surface is relatively bland and dense. Radiography executed in 1991 revealed that the painting is the result of a tortuous working process in some ways anomalous for the artist. The saint's face and chest were executed possibly in more than one moment with patchy brushwork that does not closely respect the modeling of light and shade, as is the rule in Caravaggio. The saint's attribute of reed cross was originally held in the hand that rests upon his knee. When it was shifted, the grasping pose of this hand was not modified. These observations encourage the supposition that Caravaggio supervised the execution of this *Baptist*, but availed himself of assistants.

See p. 165, illustration at p. 168.

Condition:

Good. The condition of the painting which was x-rayed in 1987 is fully discussed in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* (1991, pp. 262–73). The painting was restored again in December 2000 in the conservation studio of the Palazzo Corsini, Rome, under the supervision of S. Aloisi.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, pp. 119, 161 n. 284.

47. *Portrait of Paul V Borghese*, 1605–6

Oil on canvas, 80 x 46¾ in. (203 x 119 cm)

Collection Principe Camillo Borghese, Rome

Provenance:

Palazzo Borghese, Rome by 1650

Sources:

1. Manilli 1650, p. 77: “Portrait of Paul V by Michelangelo da Caravaggio . . .” [“. . . il ritratto di Paolo Quinto di mano di Michelagnolo da Caravaggio”].
2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 224): “The Cardinal, pleased with these and other works made by Caravaggio, introduced him to Pope Paul V, of whom he painted a seated portrait for which he was well paid.” [“Si compiacque il cardinale di queste e di altre opere che gli fece il Caravaggio [*Saint Jerome Writing, David & Goliath*, Galleria Borghese], e l’introdusse avanti il pontefice Paolo V, il quale da lui fu ritratto a sedere, e da quel signore ne fu ben remunerato.”]
3. Montelatici 1700, p. 236: “Among the portraits in the Villa Pinciana is one of Paul V painted by Michel’Angiolo da Caravaggio, above door.” [“. . . Fra questi ritratti nella Villa Pinciana si riconosce quello di Paolo V. Dipinto da Michel’Angiolo da Caravaggio, assiso, sopra la porta, che risponde in sala . . .”]
4. Nibby 1844, II, p. 313: “A portrait of Paul V painted excellently by Michelangiolo da Caravaggio” [“Un ritratto di Papa Paolo V dipinto egregiamente da Michelangiolo da Caravaggio”].

Exhibition:

Florence 1911 (as Caravaggio).

Bibliography:

Kallab 1906–7, among lost works; Venturi 1909, p. 40; Venturi 1910, pp. 276–79; Marangoni 1922, p. 52 (rejects); Voss 1923, p. 86; Voss 1924, p. 446; Schudt 1942, no. 45; Longhi 1943 (as by Ottavio Leoni); Baroni 1951 (works attributed); Berenson 1951, pp. 44–45 (Caravaggesque Moroni?); Venturi 1951, no. 34; Hinks 1953; Mahon 1953, p. 213 n. 8 (? not of style of 1605–6); Baumgart 1955, no. 20 (school); Friedlaender 1955, p. 219, no. 44C (painted after 1605, ?); Wagner 1958, p. 233 (?); Della Pergola 1959, p. 83 (original); Jullian 1961, pp. 150, 157 n. 81–83, 229 (1606); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 64 (1605–6); Moir 1967, I, p. 93, II, p. 62 n. 14 (unknown follower); Kitson 1969, no. 62 (not included in inventory of Cardinal Borghese’s bequest to gallery always in custody of sitter’s descendants—good provenance, Bellori cites,

but question remains open); Cinotti 1971, pp. 79, 130, 196 n.468 (?); Marini 1974, pp. 35, 192–93, 405–7 n. 53; Moir 1976 pp. 116 no. 99, 155–56 n. 270 (doubtful, copy of lost original); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Marini 1982, pp. 72–83; Cinotti 1983, no. 85 (attributed); Hibbard 1983, p. 342 (attributed); Pepper in London 1985, pp. 42–45 (Guido Reni ? based upon Malvasia 1678, p. 47 who refers to a portrait of the pope by this painter); Marini 1989, pp. 474–76, no. 58 (Rome 1605); Pacelli 1994, pl. 6 (?); Puglisi 1998, no. 57 (attributed, c. 1605–6); Robb 1998, p. 511 (1605); Spike 2001, cat. no. 47 (1605–6); Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 13; Varriano 2006, p. 89, fig. 71.

The portrait appears from photographs to be a meticulously rendered original by the artist. Very few scholars have had the opportunity to examine this picture. Mancini and Baglione are inexplicably silent on this important commission to portray the pope elected on May 16, 1605.

See pp. 163–64.

Condition:

From a photograph, the condition appears to be good.

Copy:

C. I

Rome, Galleria Borghese; inv. 73

Oil on canvas, 123 x 142 cm

Provenance:

Recorded in 1693, and subsequent, inventories of Palazzo Borghese as copy; transferred in 1891 to Villa Borghese, Rome.

Inventory:

April 7, 1693: Inventory of Palazzo Borghese, Campo Marzio, Rome, no. 26, a portrait of Paul V by Mola (Della Pergola 1959, p. 84).

Bibliography:

Catalogue 1790 (n. 16: attributed to Mola); Barbieri de Montault 1870, p. 354; Piancastelli 1891, p. 116; Venturi 1893, p. 72; Voss 1910, p. 218; Longhi 1928, p. 183 (copy); Friedlaender 1955, p. 219 (copy); Della Pergola 1959, pp. 83–84 (copy, anonymous Roman mid-sixteenth century); Moir 1976, pp. 155–56 n. 270 (recorded in Galleria by 1650, probably painted after Scipione Borghese's death in 1633, rather inept); Spike 2001, cat. no. 47.c.1 (as copy).

48. *Madonna dei Palafrenieri*, 1606

Oil on canvas, 115 x 83 in. (292 x 211 cm)

Galleria Borghese, Rome, inv. 110

Provenance:

Painted for the confraternity of Saint Anne of the Palafrenieri (papal grooms) between November 1605 and May 1606; installed on the altar of Saint Anne in Saint Peter's in mid-April 1606; removed after a few days to the nearby church of Saint Anne; purchased by Cardinal Scipione Borghese between June and July 1606; Palazzo Borghese, Rome, by 1613; transferred to the Villa Borghese in 1891.

Inventory:

1. April 7, 1693, Inventory of the Palazzo Borghese, Campo Marzio, Rome (room I, no. 13): "A large painting of the Madonna who holds the head of a serpent under her foot with the Child and Saint Anne in a gilded frame, no. 284, by Caravaggi" ["Quadro grande con la Madonna che tiene sopra la testa di un serpe un piede con il Bambino e S. Anna con cornice dorata del N. 284 del Caravaggi"] (Della Pergola 1959, p. 83).

Documents:

1. October 31, 1605: The confraternity resolves to acquire an altarpiece for the altar of Saint Anne in New Saint Peter's (ASAP, cod. 17, ff. 79–80, Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 236, p. 181).

2. December 1, 1605: The confraternity records payment of 25 scudi by Antonio Tirelli, deacon, to Michelangelo da Caravaggio for the painting to be made for the chapel and altar of Saint Anne in Saint Peter's ["Adì 1.° dicembre, 1605. Abbiamo pagato a buon conto del quadro da farsi in s.to Pietro novo alla capella et altare de s.ta Anna al s.re Michelangelo da Caravaggio Pitore per mano del s.re Antonio Tirelli Decano di N. S.re sc 25"] (ASAP, cod. 243, f. 89; Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 245, p. 186).

3. January 30, 1606: The confraternity records receipt of 4 scudi from Cardinal Colonna to be divided in three parts for the painting of Saint Anne, the deacon, and the grooms ["Adì 30 genaro, 1606, si è hauto dalli Palafrenieri dell' Ill.mo Card.le Colonna s.di 4 per essere nata deferentia in fra loro no[n] havendo servito il tempo la Congregatione, dichiaratto delle tre parte, una per il quadro di S.ta Anna et l'altra parte al Decano, et l'altra alli Palafrenieri, in piena congregatione senteziato, sc.4 . . ."] (ASAP cod. 246, f. 33, Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 252, p. 188).

4. March 12, 1606: The confraternity resolves to obtain wooden boards so that the painting can be sent ["Die D[omi]nico xii men: Martij 1606 fu fatta cong.ne delli confratri della Ven. le comp.a de S.ta Anna de Paraf.re dell' Ill.mi SS.ri Card.li de S.ta Chiesa a Palazzo, alla Sala dove si fa Cam[er]a ava[n]ti al S.r Decano g.ale d'essa comp.a et alcuni off.li ove fu detto et risoluto che sia cura d'essi off.li a provvedere per le tavole del quadro acciò si spedisca."] (ASAP, cod. 17, f. 96; Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 258, p. 189).

5. March 13, 1606: The confraternity records payment of 2.10 scudi for the cost of 15 boards of chestnut used to install the painting of Saint Anne in Saint Peter's ["A di 13 marzo [1606] Abbiamo pigliato tavole de castagnia n.o quindice quale hanno servito per metere il quadro di s.ta Anna in San Pietro novo con tre piane che hanno pure da servire per il ditto altare et pagatto la caretta che la portate al falegname, sc 2.10"] (ASAP, cod. 246, ff 78v, 79; Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 259, p. 190).

6. April 8, 1606: Caravaggio certifies to the deacon of the confraternity, "The undersigned, Michel'Ang.o da Caravaggio, declare that I am content and satisfied with the painting that I have painted for the Company of Saint Anne, in faith I have written and underwritten this 8th day of April 1606" ["Io Michel'Ang.o da Caravaggio / son contento e satisfatto, del / quadro

ch'io dipinto alla / Compagnia di S.ta Aña in / fede o scritto e sott[o]scritto / questa il dì 8 Aprile 1606. Io Michel Ang.o da Caragg.o”] (ASAP, cod. 843, between M and N, “Ricevute dal 1605 al 1609”; Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 262, p. 190).

7. April 14, 1606: The confraternity records payment of 1 *scudo* to the carpenter, Pierfrancesco, for the installation of the painting on the altar of Saint Anne in Saint Peter’s [“A di 14 de Aprile 1606. Abbiamo, pagato per fattura de havere acomodatto le tavole nel altare di s.ta Anna in San Pietro novo à m.o Pierfrancesco falegname, sc. 1”] (ASAP, cod. 246, f. 80; Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 263, p. 191).

8. April 16, 1606: The confraternity records “payment to two porters to carry the painting of Saint Anne from Saint Peter’s to our church” [“A di 16 detto [April 1606] Abbiamo dato a dua fachini che hanno portato il quadro de s.ta Anna alla nostra chiesa da san Pietro, b.20”] (ASAP, cod. 246, f. 80; Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 263, p. 191).

9. May 4, 1606: The confraternity records “payment for three memorials, one for the Pope, one for the Illustrious Cardinal of Como, and one for the Illustrious Cardinals of the Congregation della Fabbrica in order to have the altar in Saint Peter’s” [“A di 4 de Maggio 1606. Abbiamo pagato per tre memoriali uno p[er] nostro S.re et uno p[er] il Ill.mo Card.le di Como et uno per Ill.mi Card.li della Congregatione della fabrica per havere l’altare in san Pietro”] (ASAP, cod. 246, f. 80; Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 267, p. 192).

10. May 19, 1606: The confraternity records that “the remainder of fifty scudi owed for the the *Saint Anne* to Michelangelo da Caravaggio was paid in two payments, to make a total of 75 *scudi* for the said painting which was placed on the new altar in Saint Peter’s. The 25 *scudi* previously paid were transferred by ‘m. giovane pontara,’ a German.” [“A di 19 de maggio 1606 si è dato in due volte per resto del quatro di s.ta Anna al S.re Michelangelo da Charavagio s.di cinquanta di moneta, quale á fatto pagare scudi settantacinque il ditto quadro che fu messo nel altare nuovo in San Pietro; indetta la suma computati li 25 scudi che gli fu dato lano pasato da m.giovane pontara per la natione todescha.”] (ASAP, cod. 246, f. 81v; Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 268, p. 192)

11. June 16, 1606: The confraternity approves the sale of the painting made of Saint Anne by Caravaggio, not having suffered any loss but rather a gain, as Cardinal Scipione Borghese acquired it for 100 *scudi* ["Die Veneris xvi Junij [16 June] 1606. Fu fatta Cong.ne . . . s'approvò la vendita del quadro fatto de S.ta Anna del Caravaggio pittore, non essendo stata de danno alla co[m]p[agn]ia, ma piutosto utile, havendolo hauto il Card.le Borghese per ce[n]to, s.di."] (ASAP, cod. 17, ff, 98–99; Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 280, p. 197).

12. July 20, 1606: The confraternity records "receipt from Cardinal Scipione Borghese of 100 *scudi* for the painting of Saint Anne that had been made for the altar at Saint Peter's" ["A di 20 de luglio 1606. Abbiamo riciv[u]to dal Ill.mo S.re Card.le Borghese scudi cento di moneta quali sonno p[er] il quadro di S.ta Anna che fu fatto per san Pietro novo alla Chapella, sc. 100"] (ASAP, cod. 246, f. 7; Spezzaferro 1974; Macioce 2003, doc. 298 p. 202).

Sources:

1. Milesi 1606 c. 61v (ed. 1980, p. 87 [1]) "On a painting by Michel Ang(iol)o da Caravaggio. Of the boy Jesus, of Anna and Maria" ["Per una Pittura di Michel Ang(iol)o da Caravaggio. Del fanciullo Giesù, d'Anna e Maria"] (Macioce 2003, II doc. 249, p. 187).

2. Castellini 1606 (lost epigram in honor of the painting) (Della Pergola 1958, 1959, p. 220, n. 79).

3. Francucci 1613 (ed. 1647) verses 260–64: "Jesus and His Mother with the head of two asps underfoot, by Caravaggio" ["Gesù e la Madre calpestando due aspidi, del Caravaggio"].

4. Mancini 1619–21 (ed. 1956, p. 224): ". . . the altarpiece of the Palafrenieri, now in the possession of the illustrious Borghese . . ." [" . . . quella dell'altar de'Palafrenieri che possiede adesso l'illustrissimo Borghese"].

5. In a volume of collected letters, *Iani Nicii Erytraei: Epistolae ad Diversos. Coloniae Ubiorum*, 1645, Bibl. gen. Documenti, 1620, p. 62, n. 79 (Della Pergola 1959, pp. 71–75; Macioce 2003, doc. 237, p. 181). September 4, 1620: Gian Vittorio Rossi writes to Giovanni Zaratini Castellini that the altarpiece was painted by Caravaggio while he was resident in the house of Andrea Ruffetti in 1605.

6. Baglione 1642, pp. 137–38: “. . . He also made for Saint Peter’s in the Vatican a Saint Anne with the Madonna, who has the Child between her legs, who crushes the head of a serpent with his foot. He did this work for the Palafrenieri of the Palace, but the Cardinals ordered it removed and then given to Cardinal Scipione Borghese.” [“fece anch’egli in s. Pietro Vaticano una s. Anna con la Madonna, che ha il Putto tra le sue gambe, che con il piede schiccia la testa ad un serpe, opera da lui condotta per li palafrenieri di palazzo; ma fu levata d’ordine de’Signori Cardinali della fabbrica, e poi da Palafrenieri donata al cardinale Scipione Borghese.”]

7. Manilli 1650, p. 60: “The painting of Saint Anne with the Virgin and the Child who squashes the head of the serpent underfoot is by Caravaggio” [“Il quadro di S. Anna con la Vergine che calca il capo di serpente con un bambino in piede è del Caravaggio”].

8. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 231): “The other painting of Saint Anne was taken from one of the minor altars in the Vatican Basilica because it depicted in a vile manner the Virgin with Jesus as a naked boy; as can be seen in the Villa Borghese” [“L’altro quadro di Santa Anna fu tolto ancora da uno de’ minori altari della Basilica Vaticana, ritratti in esso vilmente la Vergine con Giesú fanciullo ignudo, come si vede nella Villa Borghese”].

9. von Ramdohr 1787, I, p. 303.

Exhibitions:

Rome 1914; Florence 1922, XXVIII–XXIX; Milan 1951, no. 30; Utrecht-Anvers 1952; Rome 1987; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 122–27; Rome 2000, no. 4; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

Catalogue 1790, room IX, n. 1; *Fideocommisso* 1833, p. 13; Piancastelli 1891, p. 105; Venturi 1893, no. 110, p. 106; Kallab 1906/7; Venturi 1909, p. 39; Venturi 1910, pp. 269, 275; Venturi 1912, p. 4; Longhi 1913 (1604–6); Witting 1916, pp. 31, 63, 75; Marangoni in Florence 1922 (notes incisions); Voss 1924, pp. 80–81, pl. 24; Pevsner 1927/28, p. 387 (1605–6); Longhi 1928/29, pp. 32, 314; Mâle 1930, pp. 1–6 (inspired by a work of Ambrogio Figino at Sant’Antonio Abate in Milan); Stechow 1931/32, pp. 194–99; de Rinaldis 1937, p. 230 n. 1; Schudt 1942, no. 34–35; de Rinaldis 1948, p. 64; Arslan 1951, pp. 448–49; Berenson 1951, p. 25; Longhi in Milan 1951,

no. 30; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1605–6); Urbani–Brandi 1951; Venturi 1951, no. 29; Longhi 1952, no. XXXIII; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1605–6); Hess 1954, pp. 273–74 n. 18, p. 287 (removed 1620 in Vatican renovation); Baumgart 1955, no. 43; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 191–92, no. 27 (rejected because Caravaggio’s painting was too big for the altar of the Palafrenieri; style of painting of Madonna markedly different from that of Saint Anne, Madonna modeled after paintings by Ambrogio Figino [Sant’Antonio Abate, Milan]); theological controversy between idea that Christ treads on the sin of heresy versus idea that the Virgin treads on it—solution being that the painting is a compromise, where both act; presence of Saint Anne is puzzling but represents the immaculate Anne as the bearer of the Virgin’s purity from original sin, all explicable but iconographically unique); Chastel 1956, p. 964 (1600–1606); Salerno 1956–57, n. 896; Wagner 1958, pp. 117–19, 131–32, 211–12; Della Pergola 1959, II, no. 116, pp. 81–82 (1605–6); Jullian 1961, pp. 147–48, 152–54, 158 (1605–6); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967 no. 61 (1605, rejects sources that say canvas rejected by confraternity, iconographically orthodox); Longhi 1968, p. 39; Kitson 1969, no. 59; Cicinelli 1970, pp. 80–82; Calvesi 1971, pp. 94, 116, 129, 139–40; Cinotti 1971, p. 78, 121–22, 159–60, 178; Mâle 1972, pp. 30–38, 346–53; Niggel 1972, pp. 53–58; Marini 1974, pp. 35–36, 196–97, 408–11, n. 56 (1605–6); Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 129, 136–37 (publishes documents; Anne is symbol of Grace); Settis 1975, pp. 4–18, pl. 1; Moir 1976, p. 98 no. 30; Warner 1976, chap. 16; Ferrari 1978, p. 372; Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Spezzaferro 1980, pp. 96–97; Magnuson 1982, p. 90; Moir 1982, pp. 126–27; Cinotti 1983, no. 48; Hibbard 1983, pp. 197–98, 320–21 (1605–6, exhibited only a few days in the Vatican); Spike 1983, p. 40; Calvesi 1986, p. 48 (1606); Marini 1989, pp. 484–88, no. 63 (Rome, executed after October 31, 1605, before April 9, 1606); Calvesi 1990, pp. 347–52; Bologna 1992, pp. 63, 383, no. 15; Gregori 1994, pp. 114, 151, no. 54 (c. 1605–6); Gilbert 1995, pp. 174, 176, 183, 291 n.84 (removal not for doctrinal reasons but because “it did not look satisfactory in the new location which after all it had not been painted to fit”); Macioce 1996, p. 361 (Pio V, 1569, in “Bolla del rosario” established that Mary had squashed the head of the serpent with the help of her son); Ward in *Tulsa-Kansas City* 1995–96, p. 4 (1605–6); Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50; Rowlands 1996, no. 25 (c. 1605); Calvesi in Coliva 1998, pp. 33–49 (incised outline caused by transfer from cartoon); Coliva 1998; Langdon 1998, pp. 304–9; Puglisi 1998, no. 56 (refutes Calvesi 1990, 1605–6); Robb 1998, p. 512 (1606); Strinati in Coliva 1998 (rejections of paintings after the Council of Trent); Coliva in *Madrid-Bilbao* 1999, pp. 122–27; Varriano in *Mormando* 1999, p. 194; Beltramme 2001, pp. 72–100; Spike 2001, pp. 165–71; cat. no. 48

(1606); Coliva 2003; Berra in Milan 2004, pp. 55–83; Moreno in Milan 2004, pp. 35–45; Sgarbi 2005, no. 43 (1605–6); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 29 (1605); Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 114; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 10, 15; Tresoldi 2006, p. 97 (1605–6); Varriano 2006, pp. 47, 62, 94, 120, fig. 41; Debono 2007, p. 17 ill.; Steinbrück 2007; Papa 2008, pp. 134–37 (1605–6); Coliva in Rome 2009, pp. 142–51; Giantomassi 2009, pp. 23–24.

The *Madonna dei Palafrenieri* (*Papal Grooms*) was painted for a new side altar of Saint Peter's but remained in place for only days in April 1606. Bellori writes that the nudity of the Christ child disturbed the cardinals. The diminished importance assigned to Saint Anne, to whom the altar was dedicated, may have been another source of dissatisfaction. A scandal was averted when Cardinal Scipione Borghese acquired the painting for his private collection. Still the rejection must have hurt Caravaggio, who had accepted a modest fee of 75 scudi in recognition no doubt of the honor of having an altarpiece in the new Basilica.

The boy Jesus is portrayed as nude as Adam and Eve were before they heeded the temptations of the serpent. An unexpected result of the campaign to protect public decency was the systematic dismantling of an important iconographic theme, namely, the full humanity of Christ as testified by his masculine sexuality. Christ's nudity was thematically required to represent that he came to free human nature from its inheritance of Adam's shame. Both Augustine and Thomas Aquinas specified that the Resurrected, both male and female, shall not be ashamed in heaven. In Renaissance paintings, the genitalia of the infant Jesus were frequently revealed as an emblem of the doctrine: true God—true Man. Caravaggio respected this Renaissance convention, which is called the *ostentatio genitalium*.

The encircled coil of the snake is itself an allusion to the ancient symbol of the *ouroboros*, signifying both creation and eternity. In the *Madonna dei Palafrenieri*, Caravaggio depicts Mary, who was conceived immaculately without sin, and her divine son, crushing original sin and breaking the cycle of death. Standing apart, in the shadows, Saint Anne represents humanity of the pre-Incarnation generations.

See pp. 165–71.

Condition:

Good. The painting was restored in 1998 by the Soprintendenza of Rome. No signs of undersketching or incisions were detected; there was a pentimenti in the Virgin's dress which was widened. For a detailed discussion see Coliva in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, p. 127.

Copies:

None recorded.

49. *Saint Jerome Writing*, 1606

Oil on canvas, 44 x 61¾ in. (112 x 157 cm)

Galleria Borghese, Rome, inv. no. 56

Provenance:

Probably painted for Cardinal Scipione Borghese, Rome, 1605–6; villa Borghese, Rome by 1650; Palazzo Borghese, Rome, by 1693; transferred in 1891 to the Villa Borghese, Rome.

Inventories:

1. April 7, 1693: Inventory of Palazzo Borghese, in Campo Marzio, “No. 43 Above the door under the large cornice a large painting on canvas with Saint Jerome writing with a skull, n. 316, gilt frame by Caravaggi” [“Sopra la porta sotto al cornicione un quadro grande in tela con San Gerolamo che scrive con la testa di morto del n. 316 cornice dorata del Caravaggi”] (Della Pergola 1959, II, p. 81).

2. 1790: Inventory of Palazzo Borghese, in the Campo Marzio, Rome, as attributed to “Lo Spagnoletto” Ribera (de Rinaldis 1937, p. 225 n. 19 [as 1760]; Della Pergola 1959, (corrected to 1790), p. 81).

Sources:

1. Manilli 1650, p. 85: “Room of the Moor, the Saint Jerome writing is by Caravaggio . . .” [“Stanza del Moro, il San Gerolamo che sta scrivendo è del Caravaggio . . .”].

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 223): “For Cardinal [Borghese] he painted *Saint Jerome writing*, extending his hand, his pen in the inkwell” [“Per lo medesimo Cardinale [Borghese] dipinse San Gerolamo, che scrivendo attentamente, distende la mano e la penna al calamaio”].

Exhibitions:

Rome 1914; Florence 1922; Milan 1951, no. 33; Utrecht-Anvers 1952; Naples 1963, no. 2; Rome 1987; Florence 1991, no. 5; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 128–29; Tokyo-Okazaki 2001–2; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.5; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 35; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 19; Milan 2009.

Bibliography:

Fidecommesso 1833 (as Lo Spagnoletto, Ribera); Piancastelli 1891, p. 374 (as Lo Spagnoletto); Venturi 1893, p. 62 (as Ribera, lo Spagnoletto); Kallab 1906/7; Modigliani in L. Venturi 1909, p. 39 (Caravaggio); Marangoni 1922, p. 50 (old copy); Voss 1924, p. 73; Longhi 1928, p. 92 (c. 1603); Pevsner 1927/28, p. 387 (copy after 1610); de Rinaldis 1937, p. 225 n. 19; Schudt 1942, no. 77 (rejects); Longhi 1943, p. 16; de Rinaldis 1948, p. 59; Berenson 1951, p. 35; Baroni 1951 (c. 1604–6); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 33 (after July 1605); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1602–3); Venturi 1951, no. 32; Longhi 1952, no. XXXVII; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1602–4); Grassi 1953, pp. 103, 181; Hinks 1953, no. 43 (c. 1604); Mahon 1953, p. 154; Baumgart 1955, no. 40 (1605–6); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 203–4, no. 31 (1605–6, fully autograph, characteristic of late Roman period); Wagner 1958, pp. 231–32 (rejects); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 213; Della Pergola 1959, no. 115 (provenance, 1605–6); Jullian 1961, pp. 149, 151–53, 157 n. 72, 229 (1605–6); de Logu 1962 (?); Della Pergola 1964, p. 224, n. 91; Kinkead 1966, p. 114; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 62 (1605–6); Kitson 1968, no. 56 (dry, 1602–4); Calvesi 1971, p. 121; Cinotti 1971, pp. 130, 163, 196 (end 1605–early 1606); Marini 1974, pp. 202–3, 413–14, no. 59 (1606); Moir 1976, p. 97, no. 28; Bardoni 1978, p. 140 (iconography); Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Cinotti 1983, no. 47; Hibbard 1983, pp. 193–94, 320 n. 127 (1605, underscored importance of Saint Jerome in Catholic Reform); Gregori 1985, p. 300 (after Montserrat [cat. no. 88], other works

attributed); Marini 1989, pp. 488–89, n. 65 (Rome, 1606); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono* . . . 1991, no. 15; Bologna 1992, p. 330 (1606); Gregori 1994, p. 119 (1606); Gilbert 1995, p. 107; Rowlands 1996, no. 25 (possibly commissioned July, 1605); Langdon 1998, pp. 292–93, 303; Puglisi 1998, no. 53 (c. 1605); Robb 1998, p. 511 (1605); Coliva in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 128–29; Coliva in Tokyo-Okazaki 2001–2002, pp. 76–78; Spike 2001, pp. 163–67, cat. no. 49 (1606); Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 154–55, cat. no. I.5; Marini 2005, pp. 274, 504, no. 73; Sgarbi 2005, no. 48 (apparently unfinished; dates after Corsini *Saint John the Baptist*); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 29 (1605–6); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 35, pp. 151–54 (c. 1606); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 227, no. 19 (1606); Pichler in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 9–33; Papa 2008, pp. 176–84 (1605–6); Coliva in Rome 2009, pp. 138–41; Giantomassi 2009, pp. 24–25.

The Saint Jerome looks ahead to Caravaggio's late style in which the painter's realism is tempered by the unmistakable signs of his own presence, in particular, in his forceful, detached brushstrokes. Previously Caravaggio employed colors to heighten the effects of illusion; now he emphasized their intrinsic expressiveness. The composition balances four vivid areas of tone: the owlish skull and spectral white shroud, left, are balanced by the umber-tinted skin and deep red mantle of Jerome, right. The Saint's pen poised in mid-air appears to bridge the void between these opposite poles of life and death. Jerome was the Church Father who firmly opposed reading the "letter" of the Bible at the expense of tropes and metaphors: a widely read medieval text explained that every passage of Scripture contains an elusive "*penna contemplationis*."

Bellori identified this *Saint Jerome* as a commission from Scipione Borghese during the last phase of Caravaggio's Roman career, 1605–6. Since early in the last century, when the understandable confusion with the style of Ribera was cleared up, the painting has been universally recognized as a fine and characteristic work. The only curiosity is that neither Mancini nor Baglione mention it, despite its prominent collection. The chromatic brilliance of the saint's red mantle is closely comparable to the *Madonna dei Palafrenieri* altarpiece.

See pp. 163–67.

Condition:

Good. See *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* (1991).

Copies:

None recorded.

50. *Supper at Emmaus*, 1606

Oil on canvas, 55½ x 68⅞ in. (141 x 175 cm)

Pinacoteca di Brera, Milan

Provenance:

Reportedly acquired by Ottavio Costa, Rome; Marchese Costanzo Patrizi, Rome by 1624; Purchased by Amici di Brera 1939 from Marchese Patrizio Patrizi, Rome.

Inventory:

1. February 27, 1624: Inventory of Marchese Costanzo Patrizi, Rome, “In the Gallery . . . Another large painting of a Supper when they came to know him in the breaking of the bread by Caravaggio with a frame touched in gold, 300 scudi” [“Nella Galleria . . . Un altro quadro grande di una Cena q[uan]do congnosceru[n]t eum in fractione panis di mano del Caravaggio con cornice tocca d’oro scudi trecento 300”] (Longhi in Milan 1951, pp. 29–30; Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 584–86).

Sources:

1. Mancini 1619–21 (1956, I, p. 225): “. . . and Caravaggio stopped first at Zagarolo where he was hidden by the Prince [of Palestrina]. There he painted a *Magdalene* and *Christ Going to Emmaus* which was bought by the Costa in Rome. With the money he earned from this he went to Naples . . .” [“e di primo salto [Caravaggio] fu in Zaragolo, ivi trattenuto segrementemente da qual principe, ove fece una *Madalena*, e *Christo che va in Emaus* che lo comperò in Roma il Costa che con questi denari se ne passò a Napoli”].

2. Possibly a *Supper at Emmaus* referred to by Jusepe Martinez c. 1650, although he could not remember where saw it, “Christ had common features of a workshop apprentice and the disciples were painted with such little decency that it may be said that they look like a couple of knaves” (Gregori 1985, no. 78, possible).

3. Bellori 1664 (ed. 1976, p. 44): As in the Palazzo of the Patrizi, Rome, “The supper of the Lord in Emmaus with two disciples by Michele da Caravaggio, very beautiful” [“La cena di Signore in Emaus co due discepoli di Michele da Caravaggio bellissima”].

4. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 223): “For the Massimi he painted an *Ecce Homo* that was carried to Spain and for the Marchese Patrizi a *Supper at Emmaus* in which there is Christ in the center who blesses the bread, and one of the seated apostles recognizes him and opens his arms while the other apostle rests his hands on the table and stares at Him in wonderment. Behind stands the host with a cap on his head and an old woman carrying food. For Cardinal Scipione Borghese, he painted a somewhat different version [London, National Gallery (cat. no. 25)]; the first is in deeper tones, but both are praiseworthy for their imitation of natural color even though they lack decorum. For Michele’s work often degenerated into low and vulgar forms.” [“Alli Signori Massimi colorí un *Ecce Homo* che fu portato in Ispagna ed al marchese Patrizi la *Cena in Emaus*, nella quale vi è Cristo in mezzo che benedice il pane, ed uno de gli apostoli a sedere nel riconoscerlo apre le braccia e l’altro ferma le mani su la mensa e lo riguarda con meraviglia: evvi dietro l’oste con la cuffia in capo, ed una vecchia, che porta le vivande. Un’altra di queste invenzioni dipinse per lo cardinale Scipione Borghese, alquanto differente; la prima più tinta, e l’una e l’altra alla lode dell’imitazione del colore naturale; se bene mancano nella parte del decoro, degenerando spesso Michele nelle forme umili e vulgari.”]; Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 225): “Fleeing from Rome, without money and persecuted, he recovered in Zagarolo in the care of Duke Marzio Colonna, where he painted *Christ at Emmaus* between two apostles and a half-figure of the *Magdalen*.” [“Fuggitosene di Roma, senza denari e perseguitato ricoveró in Zagarolo nella benevolenza del duca don Marzio Colonna, dove colorí il quadro di Cristo in Emaus fra li due apostoli ed un’altra mezza figura di Madalena.”]

Exhibitions:

Florence 1922, cat. XXXII; Milan 1951, no. 35; Utrecht-Anvers 1952, no. 5; São Paulo 1954, no. 23; Athens 1962–63; Naples 1963, no. 3; Paris 1965; New York-Naples 1985, no. 87; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 2; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.6; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 7; Valletta, Malta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 7; Milan 2009, cat. no. 5.

Bibliography:

Venturi 1912, pp. 1, 7–8 (1606); Marangoni 1922, p. 218 (copy because of mediocre still life); Voss 1924, p. 442 (rejects); Pevsner 1927/28, p. 132 (1606); Santangelo 1939–40, pp. 67–68; Schudt 1942, no. 40; Baroni 1947, p. 83; Berenson 1951, pp. 25–26; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 35 (connects painting to Mancini); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1604–5) n. 121 (original); Venturi 1951, no. 35 (painting mentioned by Mancini); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1606) n. 95; Hinks 1953, no. 53 (painting mentioned by Mancini); Marangoni 1953, pp. 152, 250 n. 70 (Caravaggio); Baumgart 1955, no. 46 (1605–6); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 164–68, no. 18B (much later than London *Emmaus*, after 1600, clearly the Patrizi picture described by Bellori, and thus not picture mentioned by Mancini, which is lost); Wagner 1958, pp. 136–37 (painting mentioned by Mancini); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 91–92; Jullian 1961, pp. 149–53, 157 n. 75–76, 170, 229 (1605–6, not the Mancini picture); Bottari 1966; Kinkead 1966, pp. 112–14; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 68 (1606); Moir 1967, I, pp. 9, 206–7, 213, II, p. 57; Kitson 1969, no. 65 (not the Mancini picture); Röttgen 1969, p. 167 n. 43; Calvesi 1971, pp. 97, 134; Cinotti 1971, pp. 80–81, 130–32, 163 (end of Roman period); Spear 1971, p. 12; Frommel 1972, p. 9 n. 31 (painting mentioned by Mancini); Safarik 1972, pp. 24, 26; Marini 1974, pp. 38, 210–11, 416–18 (near Genoa *Ecce Homo*), 475–76 (the picture mentioned by Bellori is lost); Röttgen 1974, p. 117 n. 43; Spezzaferro 1975², pp. 116, 118 (Costa never owned *Emmaus* picture, but perhaps had a copy made for his collection); Borea in Bellori 1672 [ed. 1976, p. 225 n. 2] (“It is possible that the picture purchased by Ottavio Costa c. 1606 was in the Patrizi collection by 1624, and then to the Brera in which case Mancini erred in title of work, e.g., *Christ Going to Emmaus*”); Moir 1976, p. 100 no. 35, 111 no. 68 (picture mentioned by Mancini and Bellori is lost); Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Magnuson 1982, p. 88 (last years); Moir 1982, pp. 132–33 (c. 1606, picture referred to by Mancini); Cinotti 1983, no. 31; Hibbard 1983, pp. 211–12, 323–24 (1606); Gregori 1985, pp. 306–10, n. 87 (late Rome); Christiansen 1986, p. 440 (not painted from models); Marini 1989, pp. 490–91, no. 66 (Paliano?, after May 31, 1606); Bologna 1992, p. 331

(May–September 1606); Cappelletti–Testa 1994, p. 104 (Mancini reference is to this picture); Gregori 1994, pp. 123, 152, no. 57 (c. 1606); Gilbert 1995, p. 257; Schröter 1995, pp. 62–87; Langdon 1998, pp. 316–17; Puglisi 1998, no. 58 (1606); Robb 1998, p. 513 (1606); Varriano in Mormando 1999, pp. 192–203 (1606); Pedrocchi 2000, p. 118; Spike 2001, pp. 175–78, cat. no. 50 (1606); Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 117 (1606); Carr in Naples–London 2005, pp. 100–103; cat. no. 2; Pagano and Utili in Naples–London 2004–5, pp. 172, 179 no. 3 (1606–7); Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, cat. no. I.6; Sgarbi 2005, no. 45; Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 29 (extreme end Roman period, 1605–6); Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 18; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 109–10; Tresoldi 2006, pp. 100–101 (1606); Varriano 2006, pp. 1, 2, 40, 120, 124–25, fig. 84; Debono 2007, p. 17 ill.; Marini in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 7, pp. 228–35 (perhaps painted in Paliano after May 31, 1606); Terzaghi 2007, pp. 293, 306; Marini in Valletta–Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 7 pp. 242–49; Papa 2008, pp. 146–49 (1606); Gregori in Milan 2009, pp. 29–37, 58.

Caravaggio twice used the Emmaus story as a pretext for his reflections on Salvation. The striking differences between the Brera *Emmaus* and the electrifying picture painted perhaps five years earlier for Ciriaco Mattei are more than stylistic. The two canvases read the same biblical story from opposite ends of the emotional spectrum. The first *Emmaus* in London overwhelms us, like the two disciples, with Christ's almighty power. Robed in the triumphant scarlet and white colors of his Resurrection, Christ reveals himself as judge. Returning to Emmaus in the Brera version, night has descended at the inn. The pilgrims lean over the white tablecloth, which glimmers faintly like an island of salvation in a sea of darkness. As Christ blesses the bread, the good disciples display amazement at the epiphany. But this time he gestures quietly, directing his thoughts inward. The pilgrims enclose the eucharistic bread and wine between their hands, while nearly touching Christ's. Theirs is the community of the redeemed. The innkeeper looks on the miracle without comprehending it; an elderly maidservant, too weary to care, carries in a plate laden with the sacrificial lamb.

According to Mancini, an eyewitness with a deep interest in the movements of Caravaggio's paintings, this *Supper at Emmaus* was painted in Zagarolo, a Colonna property near Rome, to which Caravaggio had fled following the Tomassoni murder on May 28, 1606. Mancini noted that the painting was acquired by Ottavio Costa in Rome; he does not say how or through whose agency the transfer took place, but the presence of a copy in his collection in 1639 lends credence to the possibility that the original was sold by him to the Patrizi. Bellori, who

was born after these events transpired, knew that Caravaggio had painted a *Supper at Emmaus* during his early summer refuge at Zagarolo. He did not connect this untraced picture with the *Supper at Emmaus* that he knew very well in the Patrizi collection in Rome. Perhaps by Bellori's time family tradition held that the picture had been acquired directly from the artist. It was already in the Patrizi collection by 1624.

The *Supper at Emmaus* was thinly painted with a tremulous brushwork that had not been seen previously in Caravaggio's work. It is the first painting to display all the hallmarks of the artist's late style; indeed its dating to the summer of 1606 is based entirely on Mancini's authority.

See pp. 175–78.

Condition:

Good. The painting was cleaned and restored in 1939 and 1978. Radiography of the heads of the four illuminated faces confirm the economy and rapidity of the execution, almost like a drawing, with the brush on the dark brown underpainting (cf. Gregori 1985, p. 308).

Copies:

I. See cat. no. 25 for a list of seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies, including the 1639 inventory of Ottavio Costa (cat. no. 25.c.3), which may refer either to this version of the subject or to the one now in London (cat. no. 25).

II. Selected copies are listed by Gregori 1985, p. 310; Moir 1976, pp. 66, 100 no. 34.

51. *Madonna of the Rosary*, September 1606– July 1607

Oil on canvas, 143½ x 98¼ in. (364.5 x 249.5 cm)

Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna

Provenance:

In the custody of Louis Finson and Abraham Vinck, Naples, by August 2, 1607; probably taken by Louis Finson after his departure from Naples to Aix-en-Provence and then to Antwerp where he died in 1617; acquired from his estate and his partner's, Abraham Vinck (died c. 1619), by Rubens, Brueghel, van Bael, and Cooymans for the Dominican church at Antwerp where it is recorded by 1651; sold or given in 1786 to the Emperor Josef II of Austria on the occasion of his visit to Antwerp in 1781; since July 7, 1786, in the royal collection; transferred to museum in 1891.

Documents:

I. Most scholars identify this with a painting of this subject which was the object of negotiations in Naples in the summer of 1607 between an agent for Vincenzo I Gonzaga, Duke of Mantua and unidentified representatives of Caravaggio:

1. August 2, 1607, Mantua: Vincenzo I Gonzaga, Duke of Mantua, wrote to Ottavio Gentili, his agent, that he was sending Frans Pourbus, a Flemish painter, to Naples to examine some paintings.

2. September 15, 1607, Naples: Letter of Ottavio Gentili, agent, to Duke Vincenzo I Gonzaga, concerning the pictures seen by Frans Pourbus, "He saw other portraits of some women by Flemish artists and they say that there are some good ones for the rooms of your Highness . . . I saw again some good things by Michelangelo Caravaggio that are for sale . . ." ["Ha però visto li ritratti di alcune dame principali che ha fatto questo altro fiammingo che habbita que et dice che sariano buoni per il camerino di V.A. . . .Ho visto ancora qualche cosa di buono di Michelangelo Caravaggio che ha fatto qui che si venderanno"] (Mantua, Archivio Gonzaga, Esterni, n. XXV, *Diversi, Carteggio da Napoli*; Luzio, *Galleria degli Gonzaga*, 1913).

3. September 25, 1607, Naples: Letter of Frans Pourbus to Duke Vincenzo I Gonzaga, "I saw here two very beautiful paintings by M[ichel]Angelo da Caravaggio: one of a rosary, made for an altarpiece. It is very large at 18 palmi and the price is no less than 400 ducati; the other is a painting of half-length figures of a Judith with Holofernes, at 300 ducati. I did not make any offer without knowing your wishes, but they promised me that they would not sell it until

they learned of your wishes.” [“Ho visto qui doi quadri bellissimi di mano de M[ichel]Angelo da Caravaggio: l’uno è d’un rosario et era fatto per un’ancona et è grande da 18 palmi et non vogliono manco di 400 ducati; l’altro è un quadro mezzano da camera di mezze figure et è un Oliferno con Giudetta, et non lo dariano a manco di 300 ducati. Non ho voluto fare alcuna proferta non sapendo l’intentione di V[ostra] A[ltezza], me hanno però promesso di non darli via sintanto che saranno avvisati del piacere.”] (Mantua, Archivio Gonzaga, Esterni, n. XXV, *Diversi, Carteggio da Napoli*; Baschet, *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, 1868, p. 447; Luzio, *Galleria degli Gonzaga*, 1913)

II. September 19, 1617: Testament of Louis Finson, Amsterdam, in which he leaves his half interest in the *Madonna of the Rosary* and the *Judith and Holofernes* both by Michelangelo Caravaggio [“beyde van Michael Angel Crawats”] to his partner, Abraham Vinck (Bredius 1918, pp. 198–99; Bodart 1970, pp. 228–29; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 191, at A).

III. By 1651 the painting was purchased for the Dominican church in Antwerp:

1. 1651, Archives of PP. Domenicani di Anvers: “The large painting first located between the fifteen mysteries, now in the chapel above the altar, is a work of Michelangelo di Caravaggio and was given by various art lovers, including among others, Rubens, Bruegel, Van Bael, Cooymans. Seeing as they could acquire this extraordinarily great work of art for a good price, they bought it out of affection for the chapel and to have in Antwerp a rare art work, paying no more than 1,800 fiorini, while a little while later they were offered 4,000 fiorini for it, then 6,000 together with a promise to replace it with a perfect copy. A bit later they were asked if they would accept 13,000 to 14,000 for the painting, but responded that they would not sell it at any price. They made for it an altar of precious marble and place the painting above it, by so doing honoring both the painting to the glory of God, to Mary his mother, and to sainted Father Dominic.” [“La grande pittura collocata prima tra i Quindici Misteri, adesso nella cappella sopra l’altare, è opera di Michelangelo da Caravaggio e ci fu procurata da diversi amatori, nominatamente dai Signori Rubens, Bruegel, van Bael, Cooymans, e diversi altri. Avendo visto in quest’opera un’arte straordinariamente grande, e considerando il prezzo non troppo alto, l’hanno comperata per affetto verso la capella e per avere in Anversa un’opera cosi rara, pagandola non più di 1800 fiorini, mentre poco dopo ne furono offerti 4000 fiorini, poi 6000 con promessa di far eseguire una copia che non si sarebbe riconosciuta dall’originale.

Qualche tempo dopo ci fu chiesto se il quadro si darebbe per 13000 o 14000 fiorini, a che fu risposto che esso non sarebbe da comprare a nessun prezzo. Questo ci ha indotto a far fabbricare un altare prezioso di marmo e a collocarvi sopra il quadro, onorando così tanto la cappella quanto l'opera d'arte, per la gloria di Dio di Maria Sua Madre e del nostro Santo Padre Domenico.”] (Goovaerts 1873, pp. 22–25)

Sources:

1. von Sandrart 1675, p. 190: “In the Dominican Church at Antwerp, there is a large painting in which Saint Dominic distributes the Rosary to the faithful” [“Ad Anvers, nella chiesa dei Domenicani, vi è una grande tavola in cui S. Domenico distribuisce ai fedeli il Rosario”].
2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 233): “In the Dominican Church, Antwerp, the painting of the Rosary, brought great fame to his brush” [“Si conserva in Anversa, nella Chiesa de’ Domenicani, il quadro del Rosario, ed è opera che apporta gran fama al suo pennello”].
3. Mensaert 1763, I, p. 200.

Exhibition:

Zurich 1946–47, no. 303.

Bibliography:

Baschet 1868, pp. 447–48; Engerth 1881, I, no. 6; de Roever 1885, pp. 186–87; Bredius–de Roever 1886, p. 9; Hymans 1893, pp. 91–92, no. 47; Kallab 1906/7; Longhi 1913 (1603); Longhi 1913, p. 162 (1603); Longhi 1915, pp. 59, 70, 128 (1607); Longhi 1916, pp. 248, 276; Witting 1916 (donor added later by another hand); Marangoni 1922, no. XXXVI; Voss 1924, p. 81; Pevsner 1927/28, p. 387; Longhi 1928/29, pp. 17, 32 n. 1, 284, 295; Schudt 1942, nos. 46–51 (c. 1595); Longhi 1943, pp. 18, 39 n. 25; Arslan 1951, pp. 450–51 (1607); Berenson 1951, p. 34 (follower); Longhi 1951, p. 9; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1606–7); Venturi 1951, no. 37 (Roman period); Longhi 1952, no. XLVI (entirely autograph); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1605–6) n. 95 (“slightly earlier”); Samek Ludovici 1952 (late Roman); Hinks 1953, no. 46 (curtain in painting is unfinished); Mahon 1953, p. 219; Hess 1954, pp. 277–80, 285, 288 (commissioned by

Duke Marzio Colonna while Caravaggio was his guest in Naples, 1606); Baumgart 1955, no. 44 (1604–5); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 198–202, no. 29, pp. 310–14 (“undoubtedly Caravaggio’s own invention and was probably far advanced when he quit work on it.” But face of Madonna, red curtain, and portrait of donor, are un-Caravaggesque portions, Finson?); Chastel 1956, pp. 956–57, 965 (1600–1606); Stechow 1956, pp. 62–63; Chastel 1956, p. 956 (describes a print in British Museum, London, without donors); Wagner 1958, pp. 139–42, 164, 216–18, 592–604 (begun in Rome 1605, finished at the house of Marzio Colonna in Naples 1607); Arslan 1959, p. 210; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 346–47; Longhi 1959, p. 27 (executed for altar of San Domenico Maggiore, Naples, not for the Duke of Modena); Jullian 1961, pp. 172–79 (not Duke of Modena, 1606–7); Bottari 1966, no. 53; Causa 1966 (early Naples); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 72 (1606–7); Moir 1967, I, pp. 11, 158, II, p. 56; Kitson 1969, no. 72 (not picture for Duke of Modena because price too low for such a large painting and no subject mentioned; Pourbus/Gentili letters to Duke of Mantua identify subject exactly); Bodart 1970, pp. 12–14, 29, 51–55, 91, 132–36, 228–29 (nothing in painting is by Finson); Causa 1970, p. 27; Cinotti 1971, pp. 82–83, 134–35, 161, 163; Causa 1972, pp. 916, 962–63; Moir 1972, no. 10; Gregori 1974, p. 599; Marini 1974, pp. 39–42, 74 n. 23, 218–22, 423–26 n. 64 (Naples 1607, but executed at two different times); Moir 1976, p. 100 no. 36; Pacelli 1977, pp. 819–20; Marini 1978/79, pp. 33–34 (queries, on the basis of newly discovered documents concerning the commission of an altarpiece by Niccolò Radolovich (or Rudolovich) from Caravaggio and the similarity of dimensions, whether this was the same altarpiece, datable to 1606–7); Nicolson 1979, p. 32 (?); Pacelli 1980², p. 29; Prohaska 1980, pp. 111–32 (x-ray analysis indicates painting was executed at one time; not for Radolovich); Gregori 1982, pp. 37–38, 51 (Radolovich commission datable 1609); DeVito 1982, pp. 41–47; Moir 1982, pp. 130–31 (1605–6, accepting hypothesis that this is painting Duke of Modena tried to acquire); Cinotti 1983, no. 69 (1606 or early 1607); Hibbard 1983, pp. 180–84, 316–17 (1605–6); Pacelli 1984, p. 102 n. 7; Brown 1984, pp. 15–21 (donor resembles Viceroy Juan Alfonso Pimentel de Herrera, Count of Benavente); Calvesi 1986, p. 50 (donor is possibly Luigi Carafa–Colonna, nephew of Marchesa di Caravaggio, d. 1630 and buried in Chapel of the Rosary in the church of San Domenico Maggiore, Naples); Marini 1989, pp. 497–503, no. 69 (Naples after October 6, 1606); Calvesi 1990, pp. 129–31, 352 (painted on his own initiative and given to Colonna family); Prohaska 1991, p. 40 (probably 1606–7); Bologna 1992, pp. 326–29 (1605–6, same date as painting commissioned for Duke of Modena; not Radolovich altarpiece which is lost); Danto

1993, pp. 107–8; Gregori 1994, p. 152, no. 59 (c. 1606–7); Pacelli 1994, pp. 54–57 (September 1607, after return to Naples, not painting commissioned by Duke of Modena, rather by a descendant of Marcantonio Colonna, victor of Lepanto, which explains the iconography of the rosary); Gilbert 1995, p. 102; Macioce 1996, p. 360; Marini 1997, pp. 40–41; Langdon 1998, pp. 333–35; Puglisi 1998, no. 62 (c. 1606–7); Robb 1998, p. 514 (1607); Spike 2001, pp. 179–84, cat. no. 51 (1606–7); Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 118 (1606–7); Pagano and Utili in *Naples-London* 2004–5, pp. 172, 179 no. 5; Sgarbi 2005, no. 55; Sgarbi in *Milan* 2005, p. 29 (1607); De Stefano 2006 (reports Bruno Fermariello hypothesis identifying donor painted at left as Camillo Medici); Manuth in *Amsterdam* 2006, pp. 183–88 (illustrates Vorsterman etching); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 110–11, 124; Tresoldi 2006, p. 98 (1606–7); Varriano 2006, pp. 38–39, 40, 47–48, 115–16, fig. 33; Papa 2008, pp. 172–73 (1606–7).

The *Madonna of the Rosary* enters the historical record in September 1607 as a large altarpiece without destination or known commission that two foreign painters in Naples are offering for sale, presumably on consignment from the artist himself. Mancini and Baglione knew nothing about this picture and Bellori adds nothing to Sandrart's reference to it in the Dominican church in Antwerp, where it was a celebrated painting. The unsuccessful negotiations between the sellers, Louis Finson and Abraham Vinck, and Frans Pourbus, painter to Vincenzo I Gonzaga, Duke of Mantua, can be followed in three letters from August and September 1607. As Caravaggio had departed for Malta by mid-July, it appears that he was constrained to leave the *Madonna of the Rosary* in Naples, stipulating a notably high price of 400 ducati. Finson and Vinck precipitously departed from Naples with the painting in the fall of 1609 on the eve of Caravaggio's unexpected return to the city.

The *Madonna of the Rosary* has sometimes been identified as a transformed version of the altarpiece commissioned by Nicolò Radolovich in October 1606, for which the artist received an initial payment in Naples of 150 ducats in that month. Neither the iconography nor the composition of the lost or unexecuted Radolovich altarpiece, as described in the contract, conform to the painting in its present state or to the artist's underlying pentimenti as revealed by radiography.

The most intriguing hypothesis regarding the origin of the *Madonna of the Rosary* has been advanced by Calvesi (1990, p. 352), who proposes that it was executed for the Chapel of

the Sacred Rosary of the Caraffa–Colonna family in San Domenico Maggiore, Naples. For unknown reasons the painting did not satisfy.

See pp. 179–84.

Condition:

Good. A detailed discussion of the condition and technique of the painting is provided by Prohaska (1980). Pentimenti revealed by the radiography include significant changes in the position of the child, who was originally seated, and in the presence of other figures in the center of the composition subsequently painted out.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

February 27, 1630: In Amsterdam, Charles de Connick of Middelborch, sold a copy of the *Distribution of the Rosary to the Dominicans* to Jacques van Nieulandt for 600 florins payable over two months and pursuant to an estimate signed by Finson and three experts—Pieter Lastman, Adrien van Nieulandt, and François Venant—for 300 florins.

Bibliography:

Bredius–de Roever 1886, p. 9; Friese 1911, p. 17; Bodart 1970, pp. 13–14; 132–36, no. 18; Moir 1976, p. 100 no. 36d [Finson?]; Spike 2001, cat. no. 51.c.1; Macioce 2003, II doc. 473, p. 293; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 192 at D.

C. 2

Engraving, 20³/₄ x 12 in. (52.6 x 30.6 cm), in reverse

by Lucas Vorsterman the Elder

Dedicated to Antonius Triest (1576–1642), Bishop of Bruges, 1617–22, and of Ghent, 1622–42

Bibliography:

British Museum, London, V, 9–75; Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, 51.501.4851; Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris bd. 8 no. 25 (Hymans 1893, pp. 91–92 no. 47); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 201–2 (incomplete first state may support thesis that upper part of painting was completed by another hand); Moir 1976, pp. 100 no. 36a, 132 n. 216, fig. 88 (first state), fig. 89 (second state, without donor portrait).

C.3

François Quesnel, Paris

1697 inventory of the collection: “a *Rosary by Caravaggio*” (Bodart 1970, p. 133 n. 3).

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 100, nos. 36a–36f.

C.4

Chiesa Madre, Santa Croce Camerina (Ragusa, Sicily)

Oil on canvas, 90½ x 55⅞ in. (230 x 140 cm)

Exhibition:

Palermo 2001, cat. no. 8.

Bibliography:

Barbera in Palermo 2001, pp. 124–25, cat. no. 8 (copy, seventeenth century, workshop of Pietro Novelli?).

52. *David with the Head of Goliath*, 1604

Oil on wood, 35⅝ x 45⅞ in. (90.5 x 116.5 cm)

Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna, inv. 147

Provenance:

Possibly the painting of this subject purchased by Don Juan de Tasis y Peralta, second Count of Villamediana, Viceroy of Naples 1611–17, and sold with his collection in Madrid 1623; acquired by Prince of Wales, future Charles I of England; sold at auction 1649 a year after his death; Amsterdam where it was engraved (1662) by Wallerant Vaillants (1623–77); purchased at sale 1667 by Franz Imstenraed (Cologne); offered to emperor in the context of the sale of his collection in 1670; 1675 ceded to Archbishop Karl von Liechtenstein, who at some point must have given it to the emperor; Imperial Collection, Vienna; Kunsthistorisches Museum by 1718.

Documents:

1. 1667 catalogue of sale *Iconophylacium Artis Apellae Thesaurarium*, No. 32: “Michel Angelis di Caravaggio David holding the head of Goliath in his hands, half figures, 3.6 high, 4.3 wide” [“Michel Angelis di Caravaggio David Goliathi caput manu prehensum tenens et gladium intentas medium corpus ad genua usque est alta 3.6 lata 4 pedibus 3 digitis”].
2. 1718 Inventory by Prayer of Kunsthistorisches Museum, as School.

Sources:

1. 1615: The correspondence of the Duke of Urbino records that “Count Villamediana bought many paintings which the gentleman sent to Spain where they say he had a collection of works bought in Naples, Rome, and other cities for twenty thousand scudi” [“Il Sr Conte di Villa Mediana [. . .] va comprando buona quantità di quadri di pittura [. . .] de valenthuomini per mandar in Spagna, dove dicono haver fatta raccolta sin hora per compra in Napoli, Roma et altre città per ventimila scudi”] (Cited in Garas 1981, pp. 398, 400 n. 13).
2. Bellori 1672 (1976, pp. 232–33): “And the Count of Villamediana had a half figure of David, and the portrait of a youth with an orange blossom in his hand” [“. . . e ‘l Conte di Villa Mediana hebbe la mezza figura di Davide, e ‘l ritratto di un giovane con un fiore di melarancio in mano”].

Exhibition:

Milan 1951, no. 38.

Bibliography:

von Engerth 1881, I, no. 9; Kallab 1906/7, p. 289; Venturi 1910, pp. 269–70 (identifies with painting made of the Count Villamediana); Marangoni 1922, no. XLV (replica by a follower); Voss 1924, p. 75, pl. 10 (early); Longhi 1927, p. 31 [*Opere complete*, 1967, II, pp. 306] (Caravaggio); Pevsner 1927/28 (1595); Schudt 1942, no. 42 (c. 1595); Ainaud 1947, pp. 368, 382 n. 4, 385 n. 14; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 38 (Naples, same moment as *Madonna of the Rosary*); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (marginalia, “Another work which I feel bound to reject . . . This is a good picture which paradoxically brings together too much knowledge of Caravaggio’s development onto a single panel to be Caravaggio himself”); Venturi 1951 (Roman period); Samek Ludovici 1952 (late Roman); Berenson 1953, p. 34 (Naples); Baumgart 1955, no. 30 (Roman period); Friedlaender 1955, p. 203 (“inferior work, definitely not by Caravaggio”); Wagner 1958, pp. 232–33 (no. ? Gentileschi); Della Pergola 1959, p. 80; Jullian 1961, pp. 174, 181 n. 33–35, 230 (Neapolitan period); Bottari 1966, p. 34 (first Neapolitan period); Causa 1966, II, p. 6, no. 6; Kinkead 1966, p. 113; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 69 (1605–6); Moir 1967, I, pp. 19 n. 27, 63 n. 218, II, p. 61 (unknown follower); Kitson 1969, no. 69 (rejects); Cinotti 1971, pp. 82, 129–30, 196 n. 457–61 (with doubts); Causa 1972, p. 963 n. 4 (1606–7); de Salas 1974, pp. 31–32 (rejects); Marini 1974, pp. 431–32, n. 70 (1607); Moir 1976, p. 118–19 no. 108 (rejects); Nicolson 1979, p. 31; Spear 1979, p. 318 (controversial); Garas 1981, pp. 397–401 (provenance research); Gregori 1982, p. 38 (1607); Cinotti 1983, no. 68 (1607); Hibbard 1983, pp. 332–33 (rejects); Gregori 1985, p. 338 (1607); Prohaska 1991, p. 40 (1606–7); Bologna 1992, p. 333 (1606–7); Gregori 1994, p. 153, no. 67 (1607); Gilbert 1995, p. 25; Papi in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 123–34 (model Cecco del Caravaggio who appears in works between 1601–4, by older age of David 1606–7); Puglisi 1998, no. 69 (c. 1607); Robb 1998, p. 514 (III, 1607); Milicua in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, p. 106 (perhaps Villamediana); Spike 2001, pp. 197–200 cat. no. 52 (1607); Zeffi in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 119 (1607); Pagano and Utili, in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 172, 179 no. 7; Sgarbi 2005, no. 52 (1607, after *Seven Acts of Mercy* [cat. no. 53]); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 120; Papa 2008, pp. 212–21 (1607).

Bellori is the sole source to mention this half length *David* that was acquired by the Count of Villamediana during his Italian sojourn, 1611–15. An avid collector, Villamediana's preference for Caravaggio may have been encouraged by his relationship with the Tassis family of Bergamo. Not all authorities identify the Vienna *David* with this reference, which lacks confirmation. Garas (1981) proposed to trace the provenance of this *David*, after Villamediana's death in Madrid in 1622, to Charles I of England. The painting seems certainly to have been in Vienna by 1667, where it entered the Imperial collection by 1718.

The use of a wooden support is most unusual for the artist and may well be the cause of the divergent opinions over its attribution. Recent writers in support of this fine picture, including Prohaska, have dated it to Caravaggio's first year in Naples, 1607, in recognition of its stylistic affinities with the *Madonna of the Rosary* (cat. no. 51). On November 5, 1610, Baldassarre Alvise painted two copies of a *David* by Caravaggio that is generally assumed to be the picture in the Galleria Borghese (cat. no. 77), but the question remains open.

See pp. 197–200.

Condition:

Good, compromised by numerous small losses. Restoration in 1951 led to the discovery by radiography that the painting is executed on top of an earlier composition representing Venus, Mars, and Cupid by an anonymous Mannerist painter.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Garas 1981, pp. 397, 400 n. 5 (Imperial Collection, Prague); Hibbard 1983, pp. 332–33; Marini in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 59–80, fig. 13 (private collection, Rome; Caracciolo); Marini 1989, p. 516; Prohaska 1991, p. 40.

53. *Seven Acts of Mercy*, 1606

Oil on canvas, 153½ x 102¾ in. (387 x 256 cm)

Pio Monte della Misericordia, Naples

Provenance:

In situ.

Documents:

1. January 9, 1607: “To Tiberius del Pezzo 370 ducati to be paid to Michelangelo da Caravaggio: out of a total of 400 for the price of a painting that he made for the Monte della Misericordia paid for us by the Banco del Popolo” [“A Tiberio del Pezzo ducati trecentosettanta e p[er] lui a Michelang[e]lo da Caravaggio: diss[er]o a comp[imen]to di ducati 400. Diss[er]o per prezzo d’un quadro che haa depinto p[er] il Mo[n]te della Mis[ericordi]a in nome del quale esso Tiberio li paga e p[er] noi il Banco del Popolo”] (Ruggero in *Napoli Nobilissima* 1902, p. 10; Pacelli 1984, p. 103).

2. January 9, 1607, Naples: “Banco di S. Maria del Popolo 370 ducati paid to Michelangelo da Caravaggiaio by order of Tiberio del Pezzo” [“Banco di S. Maria del popolo pat[a]te noi a Michelang[e]lo da Caravaggio d[ucati] trecentosettanta al quale si pag[a]no p[er] p[oli]za de Tiberio del Pezzo. In Nap[oli] 9 Gen[na]ro . . .”] (Pacelli 1984, p. 103).

3. January 9, 1607, Naples: “To the Banco del Popolo 370 ducati. To be paid to Michelangelo di Caravaggio by authorization of Tiberio del Pezzo” [“Al Banco di Monte ducati 370. Et per lui a Michelangelo di Caravaggio per polisa di Tiberio del Pezzo”] (Pacelli 1984, p. 103).

4. August 20 and 27, 1613: Record of meetings of the congregation that concluded that the painting could never be sold for any price and must always be kept in the church despite reports that several offers of 2,000 scudi had been made for its purchase. The record of August 27 reveals that Conde de Villamediana, Governor, wanted the picture, but he was only allowed to have a copy made for himself (Gregori 1982, p. 126).

Sources:

1. Mancini c. 1620, p. 340: “In the church of the Pietà on the road towards ‘vicaria’ are more works by Caravaggio, in particular that of the high altar” [“Nella chiesa della Pietà posta nella strada che va alla vicaria di suo [Caravaggio] vi sono più tavole, particolarmente quella dell’altar maggiore”].

2. De Pietri 1634, p. 204: “The new Caravaggio in the church is a most worthy canvas of the *Seven Acts of Mercy*, a painting of rare quality” [“il novello Caravaggio . . . nella chiesa . . . degnissime tavole dentrovi le Sette opere della Misericordia di rara dipintura”] (Cinotti 1983, p. 471).

3. De Lellis 1642, p. 467: “On the high altar, which is in the middle, is a most beautiful painting, that is one of the most celebrated works made by the most famous painter Michelangelo Caravaggio, in which he expresses with great judgement all of the seven acts of mercy” [“Nell’Altar Maggiore, che sta in mezzo, è il bellissimo quadro, che è una delle più celebri opere fatte dal famosissimo dipintore Michelangelo Caravagio, nel quale si esprimono con giudiziosissimo intreccio tutte le sette opere della Misericordia corporali”].

4. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, pp. 225–26): “In the same city in the Church of the Misericordia he painted the *Seven Acts* in a large canvas of nearly 10 palmi; one sees the head of an old man sticking out of the bars of a prison sucking the milk of a woman who bends toward him with a naked breast. Among the other figures appear the feet and legs of a dead man carried to his tomb; and from the light of a torch carried by one who holds the cadaver, rays spread over the priest dressed in a white surplice. The color is luminous, enlivening the composition.” [“Nella medesima città per la Chiesa della Misericordia dipinse le Sette Opere in un quadro lungo circa dieci palmi; vedesi la testa di un vecchio che sporge fuori dalla ferrata della prigione suggendo il latte d’una donna, che a lui si piega con la mammella ignuda. Fra l’altre figure vi appariscono li piedi, e le gambe di un morto portato alla sepoltura; e dal lume della torcia di uno, che sostiene il cadavero, si spargono i raggi sopra il sacerdote con la cotta bianca, e s’illumina il colore, dando spirito al componimento.”]; (ed. 1976, p. 231): “. . . and in Naples among the *Seven Acts of Mercy* is one, who raising his flask drinks with an open mouth, unconsciously spilling the wine” [“ed in Napoli fra le sette Opere della Misericordia vi è uno, che alzando il fiasco beve con la bocca aperta, lasciandovi cadere sconciamente il vino”].

5. Scaramuccia 1674, p. 75: “Another altarpiece by Caravaggio in the Chiesa della Misericordia is above the high altar, in which all the Seven Acts of Mercy are shown in a very picturesque and completely bizarre manner . . .” [“un’altra [tavola d’altare del Caravaggio] nel Tempio della Misericordia sopra l’Altar Maggiore, nella cui per appunto vi espresse le Sette Opere della Misericordia con modo pittoresco, ed’in tutto bizzaro . . .”].

6. Celano 1692, p. 326: “A noble invention in a night scene” [“inventione purtroppo nobile in una maniera di notte”].

7. De Dominici 1742–43, p. 275: “The painting on the high altar is a much praised work by his brush where he paints the seven Acts of mercy, for which the church is named, . . .” [“Ma il quadro del maggior altare della Chiesa della Misericordia è opera lodata de’suoi pennelli ove dipinse le sette opere del titolo della Chiesa, . . .”].

8. Corona 1743, fol. 101: “The first painting on the high altar representing Our Lady of Mercy was made in 1607 by the celebrated Michel’angelo Caravaggio, who was paid 400 ducati with a final payment of 65 ducati, paid by Sig. Tiberio del Pezzo through the Banco di Pietá, as appears in the journal that begins with September 1605, inside the Razionalia Maggiore del Monte.” [“Il primo quadro dell’altare maggiore rappresentante nostra Signora della Misericordia fu formato nell’anno 1607 dal celebre Michel’angelo Caravaggio, a cui furono pagati d. 400 giusta partita di d. 65 per saldo, giratagli dal Sig. Tiberio del Pezzo per Banco di Pietá, siccome appare nel giornale che comincia a settembre 1605, dentro la Razionalia Maggiore del Monte.”]

Exhibitions:

Naples 1938, no. 6; Milan 1951, no. 36; Naples 1963, no. 5; Paris 1965, no. 26bis; London-Washington-Naples-Turin 1982–83, no. 16; Paris 1983; Naples 1984; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 4; Naples 2005.

Bibliography:

Ruggiero 1902, p. 10; Rochès 1920, p. 10; Marangoni 1922, no. XXXVII; Voss 1924, p. 440; Pevsner 1928/29, p. 387; Schudt 1942, no. 52–56; Berenson 1951, pp. 37–38; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1607); Venturi 1951, no. 38; Longhi 1952, no. XLIII–XLIV; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1607); Hinks 1953, no. 58; Baumgart 1955, no. 51; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 207–10, no. 34 (1607); Wagner 1958, pp. 143–46, 164, 219–20; Jullian 1961, 173–79; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 73; Moir 1967, I, pp. 158–60, II, p. 55; Argan 1968, pp. 284–85; Longhi 1968, p. 42; Dell’Arco 1968, pp. 37–61; Kitson 1969, no. 73 (1607); Causa 1970, pp. 19–30; Calvesi 1971, pp. 122–23; Cinotti 1971, pp. 133–34; Causa 1972, pp. 916–18; Bologna 1974, p. 185; Gregori

1974, p. 44; Marini 1974, pp. 214–17, 320–21, 421–23 n. 63; Röttgen 1974, p. 173; Moir 1976, p. 100 no. 37; Pacelli 1977, p. 820; Tzeustchler Lurie–Mahon 1977, pp. 16–17; Pacelli 1978, p. 493; Stoughton 1978, pp. 406–8; Brejon de Lavergnée–Dorival 1979; Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Pacelli 1979, p. 378; Gregori 1982, pp. 125–28, n. 16; Moir 1982, pp. 136–37; Cinotti 1983, no. 36 (1606–7); Hibbard 1983, pp. 213–19; Spike 1983, p. 41; Pacelli 1984; Calvesi 1985, pp. 70–71; Mormone 1986, pp. 91–100; Marini 1989, pp. 494–97, no. 68 (Naples, 1606 to before January 9, 1607); Bologna 1992, p. 332 (1606–7); Tuck–Scala 1993; Gregori 1994, p. 132, 152, no. 60 (1606–7); Pacelli 1994, pp. 21–35 (iconography); Macioce 1996, p. 360; Langdon 1998, pp. 327–33, 335–36; Puglisi 1998, no. 61 (1606–7); Robb 1998, p. 512 (1606); Spike 2001, pp. 184–90, cat. no. 53 (1606); De Stefano 2003 (symbols in painting); Bernard 2004 (symbols in painting); Bologna in Naples 2004, pp. 107, cat. no. 4; Bologna in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 105–6, cat. no. 4; Moreno in Milan 2004, pp. 35–45; Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 172, 179 no. 6; Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 119 (1606–7); Lapucci 2005, p. 37, fig. 9; Pagano in Naples 2005 (restoration report); Sgarbi 2005, no. 51 (fine 1606); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 29 (1607); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 10, 100, 110, 112–13, fig. 6; Tresoldi 2006, p. 99 (1606–7); Varriano 2006, pp. 48, 62, 109, 117, fig. 42; Caraffa in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 119–31 (iconography comparable to the Madonna delle Grazie theme in Naples); Debono 2007, p. 18 ill.; Papa 2008, pp. 152–57 (1606–7); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82.

The *Seven Acts of Mercy* is dedicated to the unmeditated acts of charity that illuminate our dark existences, however fleetingly. A crowded alley in Naples serves as the agitated setting for episodes lifted from antiquity, the Old Testament, the New Testament, the Middle Ages, and the artist's own day. There was no better way to show the timelessness of the idea.

The anachronisms, picturesque actors, blacked-out background, and theatrical lighting in this painting are proof that simple realism was never an end in itself for Caravaggio. Berenson pointed out that Caravaggio paid no more attention to space than a Greek vase painter.

The choice of Samson as an emblem of Giving Drink to the Thirsty is unexpected and difficult to explain. Samson was a heroic battler of the Philistines, but a deeply flawed man whose victories came through the grace of God. When Samson was in danger of dying of thirst God gave him water to drink from the jawbone of an ass. This miracle was an act of

grace, not a human work of charity. From radiographs we know that Caravaggio originally placed Samson's upturned face just below the angel's outstretched hand in the middle of the composition. Caravaggio took the angel's gesture directly from Michelangelo's fresco of the *Conversion of Saint Paul* in the Cappella Paolina in the Vatican. Thus Caravaggio's original idea was for God's gracious gift to Samson to dominate the center of the altarpiece. As finally realized, the angel in the center transmits the grace that inspires humanity to be merciful.

Caravaggio's arrival in Naples in late September 1606 coincided with the completion of a new church attached to the noble confraternity of the Misericordia. The commission to paint the high altarpiece representing the *Seven Acts of Mercy* must have been offered to him almost immediately, as he received final payment for the large and complex composition on January 7, 1607. He was paid the considerable sum of 400 *ducati*. The Roman biographers seem not to have known the painting in the original. Mancini mentions only its large size and refers to other paintings in the church of which there is no record. Bellori described a few motifs in a confused manner apparently relying upon someone else's description. Instead of a man drinking from a flask, Caravaggio painted Samson, as the erudite Bellori would have recognized.

See pp. 184–90.

Condition:

Good. Cleaned and restored by E. Masini at the Capodimonte, Naples, 1962–63. Radiography executed at that time revealed that the figure of Samson was originally placed at the center of the composition and the group of the Madonna and Child above had an additional angel. Cleaned again by Bruno Arciprete in 2004–5; many pentimenti, little use of incisions. For pigment analysis see Pagano in Naples 2005.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

1614, Juan de Tassis y Peralta, second Count of Villamediana (in Naples 1611–17) requested that a copy be made; the execution was entrusted to Fabrizio Santafede, Carlo Sellitto, or Battistello Caracciolo without removing the painting from the church (Causa 1970, p. 29 [unknown if made]).

54. *Flagellation of Christ*, 1607

Oil on canvas, 104³/₈ x 83⁷/₈ in. (286 x 213 cm)

Museo e Gallerie Nazionali di Capodimonte, Naples

Provenance:

Painted for the di Franco chapel in the church of San Domenico Maggiore, Naples, 1607; probably transferred after 1632 to safe storage while the chapel was reconstructed to include the adjacent one; probably reinstalled above the altar when the new chapel is dedicated to the Flagellation of Our Lord in 1652; transferred to a side wall of chapel in 1675; transferred at unrecorded dates at the end of the eighteenth century and beginning of the nineteenth century to the chapel of Saint Stephen, then to the chapel of Rosary, by 1928/29; transferred to museum in 1972.

Documents:

1. May 11, 1607: “To Thomas di Franco 100 ducats and through him to Michelangelo Caravaggio to make 250 ducats, of which the other 150 ducats he received in cash and these are on account of the price of a [. . .] that he will have to consign. To him cash 100 ducats” [“A Tomase di Franco D[ucati] cento e p[er] lui a Michelangelo Caravaggio dete ce li paga a comp[imen]to di D[ucati] duecentocinquanta, atteso li altri D[ucati] 150 l’have ric[evu]ti con[tan]ti et sono in conto del prezzo di una . . . che [eg]li haverá da consig[na]re. A lui con[tan]ti D[ucati] 100”] (Pacelli 1977, p. 820).

2. May 28, 1607: “40.09 ducati by Tommaso di Franco to Caravaggio” [“Ducati 40.09 tramite Tomase de Franchis a Caravaggio”] (Gregori 1985, p. 324).

3. 1652: The chapel of the di Franco was re-named the chapel of the Flagellation of the Lord” [“della Flagellazione del Signor”] (ASN, Monasteri Soppressi S. Domenico Maggiore, platea, parte seconda, tomo I, vol 429, f. 20; Cinotti 1983, p. 469).

Sources:

1. Carlo de Lellis 1666 (ed. 1672): “The Flagellation of the di Franco by Caravaggio is the most beautiful work made by this illustrious painter” [“la Flagellazione de’ Franchis del Caravaggio . . . la più bell’opera che giammai abbia fatto mai quell’illustre dipintore”].

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 225): “Afterwards he went to Naples, where he immediately found commissions, because his manner and name were already known there. In the chapel of the Signori di Franco in the church of San Domenico Maggiore he was commissioned to do the Flagellation of Christ at the column . . .” [“Prese dopo il camino per Napoli, nella qual città trovó subito impiego, essendovi già conosciuta la maniera e ‘l suo nome. Per la Chiesa di San Domenico Maggiore gli fu data a fare nella cappella de’ signori di Franco la Flagellazione di Cristo alla colonna.”]

3. Celano 1692, III, p. 458: Moved from above altar to the lateral wall, on the side of the lectern [“dalla parte dell’epistola”].

4. Sarnelli 1713, p. 120.

5. De Dominicis 1742–43, pp. 275–76: “And also a large painting of the Flagellation of the Lord at the Column for the Church of San Domenico Maggiore in the chapel of the Franco family. This work when it was shown to the public attracted much attention, in particular the figure of Christ which was taken from a common and not a noble model as is necessary for the representation of God made Man; everyone, from the amateurs to the professors were shocked by his new manner: the use of deep and terrible shadows, the truth of the nakedness, the cold light without reflections.” [“e più il gran quadro della flagellazione alla colonna del Signore nella Chiesa di San Domenico Maggiore nella Cappella della famiglia Franco. Quest’opera esposta al pubblico trasse a se tutti gli occhi de’ riguardanti, e benchè la figura del Cristo sia presa da un naturale ignobile e non gentile, come era necessario, per rappresentare la

figura d'un Dio per noi fatto Uomo; Ad ogni modo la nuova maniera di quel terribile modo di ombreggiare, la verità di que' nudi, il risentito lumeggiare senza molti riflessi, fece rimaner sorpresi, non solo i dilettanti ma i Professori medesimi in buona parte.”]

6. Dézallier d'Argenville 1745, p. 263.

7. Cochin 1756 (ed 1763, I, p. 165): Admired the picture's colors and considered it “bien compose.”

8. Sigismondo 1788, II, pp. 16–17.

9. Galante 1792, p. 141.

Exhibitions:

Naples 1938, no. 8; Milan 1951, no. 37; Athens 1962–63; Naples 1963, no. 69; Paris 1965, no. 29; London-Washington-Paris-Turin 1982/83, no. 15; New York-Naples 1985, no. 93; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 6; Naples 2005, cat. no. I.8; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 11; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.8.

Bibliography:

Romanelli 1815, p. 111; Perrotta 1828, pp. 34, 45–46; Valle–Minichini 1854, pp. 356–57; Kallab 1906/7, p. 285; Longhi 1915, pp. 61–62; Rouchès 1920, pp. 97–98 (late); Marangoni 1922, p. 50 (poor condition); Voss 1924, p. 446 (poor condition); Pevsner 1927/28, p. 387; de Rinaldis 1928/29, pp. 49–54 (incontestable); Schudt 1942, p. 51; Berenson 1951, pp. 38, 84 (composition derived from Sebastiano del Piombo); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 37; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1607); Venturi 1951, no. 39; Longhi 1952, no. XLII (1607); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1607); Hinks 1953, no. 57; Baumgart 1955, no. 50; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 205–7, no. 33; Chastel 1956, pp. 955–65; Wagner 1958, pp. 142–43, 164; Longhi 1959, pp. 28–29 (second period Naples, 1609–10); Jullian 1961, pp. 173–79 (after *Seven Acts of Mercy*, 1607); Causa 1966, p. 6 (1610); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 75 (1607 or 1610?); Kitson 1969, no. 74 (1610?); Moir 1967, I, pp. 19–20, II, 52, 56–57; Dell'Arco 1968, p. 58 (earlier); Causa 1970, p. 27; Cinotti 1971, pp. 82, 135 (first period Naples); Causa 1972, p. 917 (last great canvas, 1610); Bologna

1974, p. 185; Marini 1974, pp. 40, 58, 74 n. 307, 80 n. 417, 297; Moir 1976, pp. 100, no. 32; 132 n. 218 (1609); Pacelli 1977, pp. 823 (publishes di Franco payments); Tzeuschler Lurie–Mahon 1977, pp. 16–17 (1607); Pacelli 1978, pp. 59–64; Stoughton 1978, p. 408; Nicolson 1979, p. 32 (1607); Pacelli 1979, pp. 382–83; Bologna 1980, p. 41, no. 67 (dating unresolved); Gregori 1982, pp. 36–38, 124–25, n. 115 (perhaps begun 1607, left unfinished, and completed on return); Moir 1982, pp. 140–41 (1607); Cinotti 1983, no. 35 (1607); Hibbard 1983, pp. 222–25, 325 n. 145 (1607); Gregori 1985, no. 93 (documents likely refer to this painting, x-rays confirm painting completed in two stages, first and second Neapolitan sojourns); Spike 1985, p. 417; Pacelli–Brejon 1985, pp. 209–18 (x-rays reveal a portrait covered over—perhaps di Franco—for reasons of the Counterreformation?); Gregori 1985, no. 93; Pacelli in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 81–103; Marini 1989, pp. 517–20, no. 79 (before May 11, 1607); Bologna in Naples 1991, no. 2.1 (influence on Battistello Caracciolo); Lapucci in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, p. 43; Bologna 1992, p. 336 (1607, finished 1609–10); Gregori 1994, p. 153, no. 68 (1607); Pacelli 1994, pp. 41–47; Macioce 1996, p. 360; Christiansen in *Come dipingevo . . .* 1996, pp. 27–28 (composition related to Romanino's *Flagellation*, Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York); Heimbürger 1998, pp. 32–34 (Dürer influence); Langdon 1998, pp. 356–58; Puglisi 1998, no. 63 (1607); Robb 1998, p. 514 (1607); Spike 2001, pp. 192–96, cat. no. 54 (1607); Pacelli 2002, p. 41; Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 120 (1607); Bologna in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 112–13, cat. no. 6 (begun in first Neapolitan period, reworked by master in second Neapolitan period); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 173, 180 no. 14; Puglisi 2004–5, p. 252 (“Bologna argues plausibly that the substantial revisions to the composition uncovered by recent technical examination of the canvas must have been finished by the painter on his return visit”); Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 162–63, cat. no. I.8; Pagano in Naples 2005, pp. 61–65 (restoration report); Sgarbi 2005, no. 57 (1607, after Rouen *Flagellation* [cat. no. 56]); Spinosa in Barcelona 2005, pp. 86–89, cat. no. 11 (1607–10); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 112; Tresoldi 2006, p. 102 (1607); Varriano 2006, pp. 83, 112, fig. 65; Papa 2008, pp. 158–61 (1607).

The *Flagellation of Christ* must have been at an advanced stage of completion by May 11, 1607, by which date Caravaggio had received 250 ducats payment. Two weeks later Caravaggio received an additional payment of 40,09 ducats from the patron Tommaso di Franco, presumably in connection with this work. This discovery of these bank documents (Pacelli 1977) resolved the long-standing dispute over the dating of this painting and of Caravaggio's

Neapolitan period. Recent scholarship has sought a middle ground in this question of dating. Based on the artist's alterations revealed in the radiograph, several scholars suggest that Caravaggio returned to this painting for further touches in 1610. De Lellis (1672), the Neapolitan ecclesiastic historian, praised the *Flagellation* as the artist's masterpiece. The painting was influential on Ribera's large scenes of martyrdoms.

See pp. 192–96.

Condition:

Good. Radiography reveals a significant pentimento: in place of the executioner at right, Caravaggio had painted the portrait of a bearded man looking reverently at Christ. Cleaned by Bruno Arciprete in 2004–5; for conservation history and pigment analysis see Pagano in Naples 2005.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, pp. 107–9, no. 56a–56p. Among these is:

C. I

Naples, San Domenico Maggiore

Oil on canvas, 112¾ x 84 in. (286 x 213 cm)

Provenance:

Santissima Trinità degli Spagnuoli, Naples.

Source:

1. De Dominici 1742–43, II, p. 276: “. . . in the new manner one of our painters, Caracciolo, copied many of the works of Caravaggio and among these the Flagellation of Our Lord, . . . still doubtful is whether the copy of the Flagellation of Our Lord which is shown on the lateral wall of the high altar of the Church of Santissima Trinità de' Spagnuoli, would be copied by him [Caracciolo] or by Andrea Vaccaro.”

Bibliography:

de Rinaldis 1928/29, p. 54 n. 1 (Vaccaro); Hinks 1953; Friedlaender 1955, p. 207 (contemporary copy); Moir 1967, I, pp. 19–20, 158; Moir 1976, p. 100, no. 38a, 132 n. 218 (Caracciolo or Vaccaro or Rodriguez?); Lurie–Mahon 1977, pp. 16–17, fig. 29; Hibbard 1983, p. 222, fig. 145; Marini 1989, p. 518 (many previous writers published this Vaccaro as original by mistake).

C.2

Bologna in Naples-London 2004–5, p. 112, in entry for cat. no. 6, refers to a copy of this painting recorded as early as 1615–20 in the collection of Giovan Carlo Doria in Genoa, as a pair with a copy of the lost *Resurrection of Christ* which Caravaggio painted for the Fenaroli Chapel in Sant’Anna dei Lombardi (1609–10).

55. *Crucifixion of Saint Andrew*, 1607

Oil on canvas, 79¾ x 60 in. (202.5 x 152.7 cm)

Cleveland Museum of Art, Cleveland, OH, inv. 76.2

Provenance:

Don Juan Alonso de Pimental, eighth Count of Benevente (Spanish Viceroy in Naples 1603–July 1610) by whom taken to Valladolid; by descent to his grandson, Juan Alonso de Pimentel y Ponce de León, eighth Count of Luna and tenth Count of Benevente, 1653; possibly Juan Gaspar Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and Admiral of Castile, 1691; reportedly in a Convent in Castile, Spain; A. Tors, Madrid by 1972; Josè Manuel Arnaiz, Madrid, 1973; art market Switzerland, 1974; purchased by Cleveland Museum of Art through L. C. Hanna Jr. Bequest in 1976.

Documents:

1. January 18, 1611 inventory of the goods of Juan Alfonso Pimental y Herera, Conte de Benevente without attribution [“San andres original en lienço y cornisa”] (Macioce 2003, inventari 8, p. 343).

2. December 25, 1652: Inventory, Juan Alonso de Pimentel y Ponce de León, eighth Count of Luna and tenth Count of Benevente without attribution as “A nude Saint Andrew when they put him on the cross with three executioners and a woman” [“San andres desnudo quando le estan poniendo en la cruz con tres sayones y una muger”] (Getty Provenance Index).

3. January 26, 1653: Inventory of the paintings in Palace of Counts of Benevente in Valladolid, “a large painting of a nude Saint Andrew when he is being put on the cross with three executioners and a woman, with an ebony frame, 1500 ducati”: with marginal annotation: “It is original by micalael angel Caraballo” [“Es de micalael angel caraballo original”]; [“[10] yten un lienzo muy grande de pintura de san andres desnudo quando le estan poniendo en la cruz con tres sayones y una muger con moldura de ebano todo lo tasaron en mill y quinientos ducados”] (Burke–Cherry I, 1997, pp. 496–97; Lurie–Mahon 1977, pp. 8–10 [dates inventory January 3, 1653]; Macioce 2003, inventaria 45, p. 359).

4. February 20, 1653: Inventory of the inheritance of Don Juan Francisco Alfonso Pimentel y Ponces de Lèon, nephew of Don Juan Alfonso Pimentel y Herrera, “A nude being put on the cross with three executioners and a woman with an ebony frame, 1,500 ducati,” annotated at left, “es de micalael angel caravago original,” at right, “16D500 reales” [“hallamos la desnudo quando lo estan poniendo en la cruz con tres sayones y una muger con moldura de ebano todo lo tasaron en mil y quinientos ducados”] (Garcia Chico 1946, pp. 393–94; Ainaud 1947, pp. 380–81; Lurie–Mahon 1977, pp. 8–10; Gregori 1985, p. 345).

5. Possibly an untraced painting of this subject by Caravaggio in the inventory of a different family:

September 25–November 19, 1691: Posthumous inventory of Juan Gaspar Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and Almirante de Castilla, “Caravaggio, Michelangelo Merisi da: Saint Andrew nude being put on the cross with three executioners and a woman” [“San andres desnudo quando le estan poniendo en la cruz con tres sayones y una mugger,” “Benavente,” “55:0010”] (Burke–Cherry I, 1997, pp. 892–93, 1094).

Source:

1. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 232): “The Count of Benavente, who was viceroy of Naples, also carried to Spain a *Crucifixion of Saint Andrew* . . .” [“Il conte di Benavente, che fu viceré di Napoli, portò ancora in Ispagna la Crocifissione di Santo Andrea, . . .”].

Exhibitions:

Seville 1973, no. 4 (as a copy, *Martyrdom of Saint Phillip*); London-Washington 1982; New York-Naples 1985, no. 99; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 5; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 1.

Bibliography:

Pérez Sánchez 1973, n. 4 (not Saint Andrew because the form of the cross is wrong); Borea 1974, p. 44 n. 2; Brejon–Cuzin 1974, p. 35; de Salas in *Caravaggio e i caravaggeschi* 1974, pp. 30–31; Harris 1974, p. 238, fig. 3; Marini 1974, pp. 235, 433–35; Nicolson 1974, pp. 604–8 (1607); Gregori 1975, pp. 43–44 (1609); Moir 1976, pp. 113 no. 73b, 151 n. 252 (copy of lost original); Pacelli 1977, pp. 826, 829; Tzeuchler Lurie–Mahon 1977, pp. 1–24; Pacelli 1978, pp. 493 (1607); Marini 1978–79, pp. 18–19 (1607); Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Bologna 1980, p. 42; Guillaume in *Catalogue du Musée des Beaux Arts de Dijon . . .* 1980, under no. 27; Gregori 1982, pp. 38, 40, 128–29 (1610); Lurie 1982, pp. 318–23 (dates c. 1607); Cinotti 1983, no. 8; Hibbard 1983, pp. 219–23, 324–25 (1607); Spear 1984, p. 162 (1607); Gregori 1985, no. 99 (1609–10); Christiansen 1986, p. 436 (execution comparable to the Borghese *David* and Naples *Flagellation*); Marini in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 59–80; Pancelli in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 81–103; Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 34; Marini 1989, pp. 520–24, n. 80 (Naples, before 13 July 1607); Bologna 1992, pp. 333–34 (1607); Gregori 1994, p. 153, no. 69 (c. 1607); Pacelli 1994, pp. 39–41 (1607); Gilbert 1995, pp. 23, 169; Zuccari in Macioce 1996, pp. 295–96; Langdon 1998, pp. 187–88; Puglisi 1998, no. 82 (c. 1609–10); Robb 1998, p. 513 (1607); Varriano in Mormando 1999, pp. 192–203, fig. 23 (1607); Spike 2001, pp. 200–202, cat. no. 55 (c. 1607); Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 120 (1607); Christiansen in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 109–11, cat. no. 5 (first Neapolitan period); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 172, 179 no. 9; Puglisi 2004–5, p. 252 (“reconfirmed my view that the short brushstrokes describing the mottled lighting on the apostle’s gaunt torso match most closely the stylistic experimentation seen in the later paintings from the Sicilian and second

Neapolitan periods”); Sgarbi 2005, no. 56 (c. 1607); Dibbits in Amsterdam 2006, pp. 32–33 (Naples, c. 1607); Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 183; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 109–12; Varriano 2006, pp. 57, 112 fig. 49; Pichler in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 9–33; Papa 2008, pp. 170–71 (1607).

The subject of Andrew’s martyrdom was frequently represented in sanctuaries dedicated to the saint, but very rarely in independent compositions such as this one. Caravaggio has inexplicably complicated the identification of the scene by representing the saint crucified in the conventional Roman manner and not on the X-shaped cross that became his identifying attribute. Caravaggio has depicted the miracle that occurred when the Apostle Andrew, the brother of Peter, was hung alive on a cross in Patraso in Greece by order of the Roman proconsul. The crowd made such a clamour in Andrew’s defense that the Romans resolved to take him down. The executioner who attempted to untie the saint found himself suddenly frozen and unable to move. The saint refused to be pardoned by the secular authority in order to choose death. The story makes a painful contrast with Caravaggio’s own situation at this date, when he urgently desired a pardon that would not be granted.

Bellori wrote that the Count of Benevente had taken a *Crucifixion of Saint Andrew* back to Spain in July 1610, at the end of his tenure as viceroy of Naples. The whereabouts of the Benevente painting were unknown from 1653 until the twentieth century. The connection remains to be established with a 1691 inventory reference to a *Saint Andrew* of this same composition. Many old copies of the painting are known.

In 1943 Longhi published the copy in Toledo (c.3, below), astutely identifying it as a copy of the lost Benevente picture cited by Bellori. Ainaud (1947) found confirmation of the scholar’s intuition in the 1653 inventory. The present work was exhibited in Seville in 1973, incorrectly identified as the *Crucifixion of Saint Phillip* and with a questioned attribution to Caravaggio. This moment of scholarly doubt permitted the exportation of the canvas to Switzerland, where it was acquired by the Cleveland Museum of Art. The painting was thoroughly studied by Lurie and Mahon and is universally dated to Caravaggio’s activity in Naples in 1607.

See pp. 200–202.

Condition:

Good, apart from a scratch through the eye of the soldier and pigment loss in the left arm of the executioner on the ladder. The painting was obscured by surface dirt and discolored varnish when exhibited in 1973. Its owner had had the painting x-rayed at the Instituto Tecnico in Madrid. The painting was restored in 1974 by Jan Dik in close consultation with Luigi Salerno and Denis Mahon. Radiography reveals that the woman originally held her hands folded in front of her neck.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

Formerly Abraham Vinck collection, Amsterdam

Documents:

1. September 19, 1617: “Saint Andrew said to be by Caravaggio” that was in possession of Finson at his death, and passed to Abraham Vinck, who sold at auction in Amsterdam in the same year.
2. November 25, 1619: Letter of Barnaert van Someren, Willem van den Bundel, Pieter Lastman, Adriaen van Nieulandt, and Louis du Predt certifying that a *Crucifixion of Saint Andrew* in the possession of Pieter de Wit, an antiquary in Amsterdam, is an autograph Caravaggio; sold to collector Franz Segher of Antwerp through intermediary Jacob von Neulandt.
3. November 26, 1619: Van Neulandt declares he bought the painting as an original Caravaggio two years before at a sale of the Finson estate in Vinck house, and experts confirm authenticity.

Bibliography:

De Roever 1885, pp. 186–87 (publishes notarial archives); Bredius–de Roever 1886, p. 9; Longhi 1943, pp. 17–18; Friedlaender 1955, p. 210 (cannot have been original, probably copy made by Finson when in Naples); Bodart 1970, no. 19, pp. 136–39, 234–36; Meijer 2000,

p. 404, n. 14; Spike 2001, cat. no. 55.c.1; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 191, at B document dated November 25, 1619; at C document dated November 26, 1619.

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, pp. 113, no. 73a–73f, 151.

C.2

Dijon, France, Musée des Beaux Arts

Oil on canvas, 82 x 62¾ in. (208 x 159 cm)

Provenance:

By 1789, church of Saint-Bénigne, Dijon, identified as the *Martyrdom of Saint Simeon*.

Bibliography:

Marini 1974, pp. 433–35, n. 72; Moir 1976, p. 113 no. 73d; Tzeuschler Lurie–Mahon 1977, pp. 3, 5, 9, figs. 4, 13 (copy of Finson version by Abraham Vinck); Guillaume in *Catalogue du Musée des Beaux Arts de Dijon . . .* 1980, no. 27; Lurie 1982, p. 321, fig. 142c (perhaps Vinck’s “copie van een St. Andries” offered for sale by his son-in-law Simon Glaude c. 1621); Gregori 1985, p. 345 (copy after Finson by Abraham Vinck); Marini 1989, p. 524 (Vinck); Spike 2001, cat. no. 55.c.2.

C.3

Toledo, Spain, Museo Provincial de Santa Cruz, in deposit at Instituto de Conservacion y Resturacion de Obras de Arte, Madrid

Oil on canvas, 91⅝ x 61 in. (232.5 x 155 cm)

Provenance:

Museo Parroquial de San Vicente.

Exhibition:

Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 30.

Bibliography:

Parro 1857, II, p. 53 (Spanish); Longhi 1927¹ [*Opere complete* 1967, II, p. 124] (currently attributed to Ribera, it is a good copy of the painting taken to Spain by the counts of Benavente and Villamediana); Tormo–Monzò 1932, p. 6 (Juan Bautista del Mayno); Longhi 1943, pp. 17–18 (copy); Ainaud 1947, no. 2 (Caravaggio's original painting was exhibited at Benevente castle in Valladolid, 1610); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1607, copy); Venturi 1951, p. 31 (copy); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (copy of an original of 1609–10); Hinks 1953, no. 68 (original); Baumgart 1955, pp. 44, 108 (copy of unknown original); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 210, 254 (copy); Wagner 1958, p. 233 (no connection with Caravaggio, neither invention nor execution); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 344–45 (original); Longhi 1960, p. 35 (copy, but better than Back–Vega copy); Jullian 1961, pp. 174, 181 n. 37 (copy); de Logu 1962, p. 158; Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 77 (copy); Moir 1967, p. 158; Kitson 1969, no. 77 (copy); Bodart 1970, pp. 15, 137; Cinotti 1971, pp. 82, 136 (copy); Pérez Sánchez 1973, n. 4 (original?); Harris 1974, p. 238 (damaged copy); Marini 1974, pp. 433–35 n. 72 (original?); Nicolson 1974, pp. 607–8 (copy); Moir 1976, p. 113, no. 73a, 151 (copy of lost original); Tzeuschler Lurie–Mahon 1977, pp. 3–24, fig. 3 (copy); Lurie 1982, p. 319, fig. 142a (copy by seventeenth-century follower); Cinotti 1983, p. 420 (copy, ruined condition); Gregori 1985, p. 345; Spike 2001, cat. no. 55.c.3 (copy); Marini 2005, pp. 533–35, cat. no. 87; Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 237–40, cat. no. 30 (copy).

C.4

Switzerland, private collection

Oil on canvas, 78¾ x 59½ in. (200 x 150 cm)

Provenance:

Sale Enyedy February 15, 1923, attributed to Ribera (Moir 1976, p. 113 no. 73c); Ernst Museum, Budapest, by 1940; deposited in the Austrian embassy, 1945; transferred to the Szépművészeti Museum, Budapest; acquired 1953 by Emmerich and Christa Back–Vega, Vienna; sold at their death in 1958 and passed to current owner.

Exhibitions:

Bordeaux 1955 (as attributed); Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 29 (as Finson).

Bibliography:

Fiocco letter of May 1954; Voss letter of June 1954 (copy by Finson); Friedlaender 1955, p. 210 (Finson); Baroni 1956 (attributed); Back–Vega 1958, pp. 65–66; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 262–63, 344–45 (copy); Longhi 1960, p. 35 (copy, inferior to Toledo); Jullian 1961, pp. 177–78 (?); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 77 (excellent copy of lost original); Moir 1967, p. 158; Kitson 1969, no. 77 (one of these copies was painted by Finson?); Bodart 1970, pp. 15, 136–37, fig. 60, 234–35 (Finson); Marini 1971, pp. 56–58; Cinotti 1971 (better copy); Spear 1971, p. 93 (Finson?); Causa 1972, p. 962 (“a work of major importance for later Neapolitan painting, the point of departure for Battistello, Sellitto and Preti”); Marini 1974, pp. 235, 433–35; Moir 1976, pp. 113 nos. 73c, 73f, 151 (copy); Tzeutschler Lurie–Mahon 1977, n. 18 (copy); Lurie 1982, p. 321, fig. 142b (Louis Finson?); Cinotti 1983, pp. 420–22 (copy); Gregori 1985, p. 345 (copy); Marini 1989, pp. 523–24 (copy); Spike 2001, cat. no. 55.c.4 (copy); Marini 2005, p. 535; Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 237, cat. no. 29 (Finson).

56. *Flagellation of Christ*, c. 1607

Oil on canvas, 53 x 69 in. (134.5 x 175.5 cm)

Musée des Beaux-Arts, Rouen, inv. 55.8

Provenance:

Hôtel des Ventes, c. 1950; Clèves, M. Stuart collection; acquired restorer Georges Zerzos; Jean Descarsin collection, Paris, c. 1954; acquired 1955 with attribution to Mattia Preti by H. Guillet, conservator of the Musée des Beaux-Arts, Rouen.

Inventories:

Several paintings of the *Flagellation* are ascribed to Caravaggio in old inventories. Here follow two hypothetical identifications that have been proposed but await confirmation.

1. 1688: Inventory of the property of Marchese Ferdinando Vandeneynnden, Naples, “Another painting of about 8 by 10 palmi with a gold frame being the Flagellation of Our Lord at the column, by Michel’Angelo Caravaggio. 400 *ducati*.” [“Un altro [quadro] di pal[mi] 8 e 10

in circa con cornice indorata consistente la Flagellazione di Nostro Signore alla colonna di Michel'Angelo Caravaggio. 400 [ducati]”] (Ruotolo 1982, pp. 14, 27; Marini 1989, p. 508).

2. 1699: Inventory of Carlo de Cardenas, Count of Acerra and Marchese di Laino, “[157] A painting 6 by 5 with a smooth frame being the flagellation of Our Lord by Caravaggio” [“Un quadro di palmi 6 e 5 con cornice liscia ordinaria entrovi la flagellazione di Nostro Signore del Caravaggi”] (Labrot 1992, p. 209).

Sources:

An untraced painting of the *Flagellation* ascribed to Caravaggio is cited by several sources as in the Borghese collection, but there is no corresponding entry for a painting of this subject in 1693 inventory of palazzo Borghese (Della Pergola 1964, pp. 26, 28, 30, who cites instead a reference to an *Ecce Homo* by Baglione with a single executioner [“un solo manigoldo”]).

1. Manilli 1650, p. 64 as in the Borghese Collection in the villa Porta Pinciana: “The Christ at the column by Caravaggio” [“Il Christo alla colonna è di Caravaggio”].

2. Sebastiani 1683, p. 23, as in the Borghese Collection in the Palazzo in Campo Marzio: “The Christ at the column is by Caravaggio” [“Il Cristo alla Colonna del Caravaggio”].

3. Montelatici 1700, p. 297, as in the Villa Borghese: “Our Lord flagellated by two executions is the work of Caravaggio” [“Nostro Signore flagellato da due manigoldi è opera del Caravaggio”] (Mahon 1956, p. 31; Cinotti 1983, p. 545).

Exhibitions:

Paris 1965, no. 61 (as Caravaggio); Cleveland 1971, no. 18; New York-Naples 1985, n. 91; Grand Palais 1988–89, no. 30; Florence 1991, no. 18; London 1998; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 136–37.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1960, p. 26 (first publishes as Caravaggio’s original, notes incisions); Jullian 1961,

pp. 174, 181 n. 31–32 (rejects); Rosenberg in Paris 1965, no. 61; Wagner in Rosenberg 1966 (rejects); Rosenberg 1966, no. 194, p. 174 (late, 1607); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 76 (composition by Caravaggio, early in Naples, no opinion whether Rouen or Swiss or Rome version is best); Longhi 1968 (1605–6); Kitson 1969, no. 75; Fagiolo Dell’Arco–Marini 1970, p. 121 (late); Cinotti 1971, pp. 136, 199 n. 506 (copy); Spear in Cleveland 1971, pp. 76–77 (1605–7); Causa 1972, p. 963 (early Neapolitan period); Pepper 1972, p. 170 (rejects); Volpe 1972, pp. 61–62; Gregori 1974, pp. 599 (Caravaggio); Marini 1974, pp. 426–28 n. 65 (1607); Röttgen 1974, p. 201; Moir 1976, pp. 118 no. 107, 156–60 n. 279, fig. 120 (rejects); Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Cinotti 1983, no. 65 (1607); Hibbard 1983, pp. 325–26 (?); Gregori 1985, no. 91 (autograph version, early Naples, c. 1607); Spike 1985, p. 417 (original); Christiansen 1986, pp. 442, 445, fig. 39 (first Neapolitan period); Brejon de Lavergnée–Volle 1988, p. 73; Marini 1989, pp. 506–8, no. 72 (Naples 1607); Papi in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 18; Bologna 1992, pp. 343–44 (not as secure an attribution as when proposed by Longhi); Spike 1992², pp. 275–77 (c. 1606); Gregori 1994, pp. 130, 152, no. 62 (1606–7); Pacelli 1994, pp. 54–62 (fall 1607, Naples); Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50; Finaldi in London 1998 (original); Puglisi 1998, no. 64 (best extant version, c. 1607); Robb 1998 p. 515 (1607); Petry in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 136–37 (original, 1606–7); Spike 2001, pp. 196–97, cat. no. 56 (c. 1607); Zeffi in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 119 (1607, “risalgono probabilmente alcune opere non documentate e in parte discusse, come le due versioni della *Flagellazione di Cristo* di Vienna e Rouen”); Bologna in Naples-London 2004–5, p. 112 (in entry at cat. no. 6, relates the execution of the Rouen canvas to the *Saint Ursula* in May 1610); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 174, 180 no. 16a; Sgarbi 2005, no. 53 (c. 1607); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 25; Varriano 2006, p. 112, fig. 88.

Mancini and other sources based in Rome were not well informed on Caravaggio’s paintings for private collectors in Naples. The lack of firm references to this *Flagellation*, generally dated to 1607 is not surprising. Its presence in Naples is supported by a *Flagellation* by Fabrizio Santafede (or close follower) in which the Christ is copied from the present picture (cf. Bologna [1991, fig. 4]). A well-known *Flagellation* (Museo Nazionale di Capidomonte, Naples) by Battistello Caracciolo, Caravaggio’s greatest Neapolitan follower, owes as much to the Rouen *Flagellation* as to the San Domenico Maggiore altarpiece (cat. no. 52.c.2) with which it is rightly compared.

In this *Flagellation*, Caravaggio represents brutal violence without descending into the gory pathos of devotional art. Christ is once again portrayed as a “Hercules drawn from life” (Gregori 1982). Though the air is charged with hatred, Christ’s powerful torso is unmarked. The stone column, striped as if by the lash, separates him from his assailants. Entirely on Christ’s side of the column are the scarlet and white colors that symbolize Resurrection. Indeed, the floating bit of scarlet drapery is illogical from any point of view except the symbolic.

See pp. 196–97.

Condition:

Good. The painting was restored in 1965. Longhi (1960) first observed the use of incisions to indicate the positions of the heads. See Christiansen (1986) and Papi in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* (1991).

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 118 nos. 107a–b; Brejon de Lavergnée–Volle in Paris-Milan 1988–89, p. 146. Among these are:

C. I

Rome, private collection

Oil on canvas, 52 x 67¼ in. (132 x 171 cm)

Provenance:

Private collection, Lucca.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1951, pp. 28–29 (arid copy of lost original); Mahon 1952, pp. 3–23 (rejects relationship to Caravaggio); Baumgart 1955, p. 112, no. 81 (copy; methodologically how can one propose the existence of a lost original on basis of a copy?); Chastel 1956, pp. 949–67 (copy executed by artist trained in Bologna); Longhi 1960, p. 26 (version more faithful to lost original than other versions); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 76 (composition invented by Caravaggio in

first Naples period, no opinion whether Rouen, Swiss, or Rome version is best); Moir 1967, I, pp. 54 n. 134, 180, 254, II, p. 61 (Angelo Caroselli, citing biographies of Passeri and Baldinucci which say his copy was so faithful to Caravaggio's original no one could tell them apart); Marini 1974, p. 223, no. 65, fig. E1 (copy); Moir 1976, p. 118 no. 107b (as copy of Rouen, disappeared during war from Lucca private collection); Cinotti 1983, p. 545 (copy); Gregori 1985, p. 319 (mediocre copy); Brejon de Lavergnée-Volle in Paris-Milan 1988–89, p. 146 (copy); Marini 1989, p. 506 (modest quality); Pétry in Madrid-Bilbao 1999 (version).

C.2

Switzerland, private collection

Oil on canvas, 52 x 67³/₈ in. (132 x 171 cm)

Provenance:

London, Wildenstein & Company (Marini 1989, p. 506).

Exhibition:

New York-Naples 1985, no. 92.

Bibliography:

Mahon 1956, pp. 225–28 (first publishes as Caravaggio's original, 1605–7); Chastel 1956, pp. 949–67; Wagner 1958, p. 234 (rejects); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 354–61 (rejects); Jullian 1961 (1607); Longhi 1960, pp. 23–28 (rejects) Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 76 (composition by Caravaggio, early Naples; no opinion which version best); Marini 1974, p. 223, no. 65 (copy); Moir 1976, p. 118 no. 107a (as copy of Rouen, owned by Wildenstein, London, perhaps same hand as Odessa *Betrayal*); Nicolson 1977, p. 862; Cinotti 1983, p. 545 (copy); Salerno 1984, p. 440; Gregori 1985, no. 92 (by artist familiar with Caravaggio's technique); Spike 1985, p. 417 (copy); Christiansen 1986, p. 442 (“no discernible incised lines in the version published by Mahon”); Brejon de Lavergnée-Volle in Paris-Milan 1988–89, p. 146 (copy); Marini 1989, p. 256 (modest copy); Bologna 1992, pp. 343–44 (rejects); Pacelli 1994, pp. 54–61 (French copyist); Finaldi in London 1998 (version); Pétry in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, p. 136 (version); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 174, 180 no. 16b.

This good old copy is executed with melded brushwork and oily pigments unlike Caravaggio's technique.

57. *Denial of Saint Peter*, c. 1607

Oil on canvas, 37 x 49³/₈ in. (94 x 125.5 cm)

Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York

Gift of Herman and Lila Shickman and Purchase Lila Acheson Wallace Gift

Inscribed on reverse : illa/[?]N.8 AM 9 f

Provenance:

Reportedly acquired after 1945 in Naples by Prince Vincenzo Imperato Caracciolo, Naples, who transferred in those years to Rome; his daughter, Princess Elena Imperato Caracciolo until c. 1964; Ian Dik, Lausanne; Julius Weitzner, London–New York, 1970–76; Herman and Lila Shickman, New York, 1976–97; acquired by Metropolitan Museum of Art in 1997.

Inventories:

Marini (1979), Gregori (1985), and Testa (1998) identify this picture with the following inventory notices:

1. 1631: Inventory Cardinal Paolo Savelli, Palazzo Savelli, Ariccia, Italy, without attribution, no. 87: "A Saint Peter with a maid, gilt frame" ["Un S. Pietro con L'ancella cornice dorata"].
2. February 3, 1650: Inventory of Cardinal Fabrizio Savelli, nephew and heir of Paolo Savelli, in the gallery of the Palazzo Montesavello, Rome, as "Denial of Saint Peter by Caravag.o similar frame" ["S. Pietro negante del Caravag.o cornice simile"].
3. September 1650: Inventory of the paintings in the Savelli Gallery, Rome, compiled for the eventual acquisition by Francesco I d'Este ". . . a maid with a Denial of Saint Peter, and

another half figure, 5 palmi by 4, by Caravaggio. Ducati 250” [“Un’Ancella con S[an] Pietro negante, et una altra meza figura per traverso, p[al]mi 5 e 4 del Caravaggio. D[ucati] 250”].

Exhibitions:

London-Washington-Naples 1982, no. 18; New York 1985, no. 100; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 17; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

Campori 1870, p. 162; Longhi 1952 (Manfredi); Longhi 1964 (after cleaning, late Caravaggio); Jullian 1961, p. 182, n. 39; Rosenberg 1970, p. 104 (first reported as in a private collection, Lausanne); Cinotti 1971, p. 179 n. 119; Volpe 1972, p. 71; Cellini 1973, restored 1963; Marini 1973, pp. 189–94; Marini 1974, pp. 428–29 (Naples, 1607); Röttgen 1974, pp. 202, 254 n. 178 (last work painted by Caravaggio); Moir 1976, pp. 120 no. 124, 162 n. 290 (probably executed during the last months of artist’s life); Nicolson 1979, I, p.33; Gregori 1982, pp. 36–40, 130–31; Marini 1982, pp. 80–82 (1607); Moir 1982, p. 56; Cinotti 1983, no. 67 (1609); Hibbard 1983, pp. 340–41 (1610); Gregori 1985, no. 100 (1609); Christiansen 1986, pp. 430–31; Marini 1989, pp. 508–9, no. 73 (Naples 1607); Calvesi 1990, p. 427; Cinotti 1991, pp. 180–81; Bologna 1992, p. 344 (1610); Gregori 1994, p. 155, no. 85 (c. 1609–10); Pacelli 1994, pp. 99–100 (1610); Gilbert 1995, pp. 23, 25; Bona Castellotti 1998, p. 135; Puglisi 1998, no. 86 (c. 1609–10); Robb 1998, p. 518 (1610); Testa 1998, p. 349 (1607 or 1610; “the gesture of Saint Peter in the painting by Caravaggio was in fact faithfully cited in the painting of the same subject today at the palazzo Corsini by the so-called ‘Master of the Judgment of Solomon,’ active in Rome between 1615 and 1625 circa”); Spike 2001, p. 233, cat. no. 57 (1607/10); Papi 2002, p. 22; Macioce 2003, p. 358; Spinosa 2003, p. 38; Gregori in Rome 2004, p. 54; Gregori in Rome–Milan–Vicenza, 2004, p. 54; Christiansen in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 140–43, cat. no. 17 (1609–10 close to *Saint Ursula*); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 178, 181 no. 39; Christiansen 2005, pp. 110, 140–43; Sgarbi 2005, no. 69 (1609); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 31 (1609); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, pp. 20–21; Petrucci 2006, p. 25; Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 117 (date fluxuates between 1606/07 and 1610); Varriano 2006, pp. 110, 117–18, fig. 87; Papa 2008, pp. 218–19 (1609–10); Pellini in Rome 2009, pp. 160–63 (1609–10).

The subject of the *Denial of Saint Peter* was greatly favored by Caravaggesque painters, but the Roman sources do not describe any renditions by the master himself, apart from Bellori's mistaken reference to an anonymous Caravaggesque picture in the Certosa di San Martino. To date, the only contemporary testimony to a *Denial of Saint Peter* by Caravaggio is found in references in Savelli family inventories in Ariccia in 1624 and Rome in 1650. The connection with the present picture whose provenance before 1945 is as yet unknown however remains to be demonstrated.

This *Denial of Saint Peter* is painted in the rapid and expressionistic style of Caravaggio's last years and it is often dated as late as 1610. The surface of the painting is uncharacteristically smooth and lacking in relief, presumably as a result of a flattening relining in the past and a highly reflective varnish. These factors complicate the problem of dating. Large volumetric figures that fill the picture format are more representative of Caravaggio's first Neapolitan period than his second. There are affinities with the composition of the *Salomé* in London (cat. no. 58), for which reason, an open date of c. 1607/10 appears the most reasonable.

See p. 233.

Condition:

Fair, restored by Pico Cellini in 1963. The colors have noticeably darkened. The background shadows appear to have suffered overcleaning. The picture was flattened by an old relining. See Marini 1989.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

46 x 66 in. (120 x 172 cm)

The Hague, Sales Catalogue Adriaan Bout, August 11, 1733:

“A fine piece by Michel Angelo da Caravaggio of Peter with the maidservant, the only one known here” [“Een schoon Stuk door Michel Angelo de la Caravagio, verbeeldende Petrus met de Dienst-maagd, het eenige hier bekend”].

Bibliography:

Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 194 at W.

58. *Salomé with the Head of Saint John the Baptist*, c. 1608

Oil on canvas, 36 x 42 in. (91.5 x 106.7 cm)

National Gallery, London, inv. 6389

Provenance:

Private collection, France; sold Paris, Hotel Drouot (anonymous) 1959; Private collection, Switzerland, 1959; Major A. E. Allnatt, 1961; lent to National Gallery, London; acquired in 1970.

Source:

Possibly identifiable with Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 228): “He then left the island of Sicily and returned to Naples . . . seeking to placate the Grand Master he sent him as a gift a half-figure of Salome with the head of the Baptist in a basin.” [“. . . uscì fuori dell’isola [Sicilia] e navigò di nuovo a Napoli, . . . e cercando insieme di placare il Gran Maestro, gli mandò in dono una mezza figura di Erodiade con la testa di San Giovanni nel bacino.”] (cf: *Salomé with Head of John the Baptist*, Palacio Real Madrid, cat. no. 69).

Exhibitions:

London-Washington 1982, no. 20; New York-Naples 1985, no. 96; Bergamo 2000, no. 48; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 14; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.9.

Bibliography:

Luzio 1913, p. 278; Longhi 1959, pp. 21–32 (1609–10; this *Salomé*, not that at Madrid, is picture recorded by Bellori as sent to the Grand Master of Malta during Caravaggio's second Neapolitan period); Jullian 1961, pp. 193, 195–96 (1609–10); Nicholson 1963, p. 210; Scavizzi in Naples 1963, p. 21; Venturi 1963, p. 43 (from photo uncertain); Bottari 1966, pp. 36–37 (1610); Causa 1966, II p. 6; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 74 (1610); Longhi 1968, p. 45 (September–October 1609); Kitson 1969, no. 92 (1610, stylistic inconsistencies make dating difficult); Calvesi 1971, p. 135; Cinotti 1971, pp. 82, 135, 179; 198–99 (1607); Levey 1971, pp. 55–56 (attributed); Spear 1971, p. 14 (1609–10?); Causa 1972, pp. 917, 963 n. 5 (1610); Marini 1973, p. 189 (Naples, 1607); Marini 1974, pp. 429–30, n. 67 (first Neapolitan period, iconographic error; perhaps this is the Judith referred to by Gentili and Pourbus in September 1607); Nicolson 1974, p. 560; Röttgen 1974, pp. 173, 202, 209–10 (1610); Moir 1976, pp. 103 no. 48, 134–35 n. 226 (not the picture mentioned by Bellori, questions whether original or near contemporary copy); Pacelli 1978, p. 493 (1607); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Bologna 1980, p. 41 n. 8 (1610); Moir 1982, pp. 138–39 (1606–7); Gregori 1982, pp. 133–35 (late work); Moir 1982, p. 138; Cinotti 1983, no. 26 (1609–10 date is too late stylistically, perhaps the painting mentioned in Naples in 1607 in the letters of the agents of the duke of Mantua, cf. Vienna, *Madonna of the Rosary* [cat. no. 51]); Hibbard 1983, pp. 284–51, 329–30 (possibly Bellori citation, 1610); Campagna Cicala in *Caravaggio in Sicily* 1984, pp. 104–6 (connection with Sicilian Caravaggists); Pacelli 1984, pp. 79, 85 (1607); Gregori 1985, no. 96 (picture described by Bellori, end of October 1609); Mahon in Gregori 1985, p. 336 (dates to reference to a *Saint John the Baptist* carried by Caravaggio on the boat in July 1610 at very end of his life); Christiansen 1986, p. 438 (fine condition); Marini 1989, pp. 509–12, n. 74 (Naples, 1607); Bologna 1992, p. 343 (?); Gregori 1994, p. 152, no. 64 (1607); Pacelli 1994, pp. 54, 62–64, 205 (fall 1607–spring 1608, Naples); Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50; Langdon 1998, pp. 383–84, 391; Puglisi 1998, no. 83 (c. 1609–10); Robb 1998, p. 515 (1607); Benedetti in Mormando 1999, p. 218 (c. 1609, Naples); Finaldi in Bergamo 2000, p. 220 (1609–10); Spike 2001, pp. 221–23, cat. no. 58 (c. 1608); Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 124 (1610); Carr in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 132–33, cat. no. 14 (1609); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 177, 181 no. 35; Puglisi 2004–5, p. 253 (first Neapolitan period); Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 164–65, cat. no. I.9; Sgarbi 2005, no. 68 (second version, 1609); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 31 (1609); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 119, fig. 38; Varriano 2006, p. 109, fig. 86; Papa 2008, pp. 162–66 (1609); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82.

Bellori's reference to a late *Salomé with the Head of John the Baptist* made for Grand Master Alof de Wignacourt in the hope of placating the knight's anger over his offense, is at least evidence of the presence of such a picture in Malta near to the time of Bellori's writing. Although Caravaggio's authorship of this *Salomé* was doubted as recently as the National Gallery's own catalogue of 1971, today the painting is universally accepted. Opinions still diverge as to its place in the complex chronology of the artist's last years, 1607–1610. It is not inconceivable that Caravaggio brought the picture with him as a gift when he transferred to Malta in July 1607.

See pp. 221–23.

Condition:

Good. The painting is well preserved for a late work. It was executed rapidly with dense pigments, more characteristic of the first Neapolitan period than the second. For a more detailed discussion see Gregori 1985, no. 96.

Copy:

C. I

Abbey of Montevergine (Avellino)

Oil on canvas, 64½ x 36¼ in. (165 x 92 cm)

Exhibitions:

Naples 1963, no. 9; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 39.

Bibliography:

Scavizzi 1963, no. 9; Moir 1976, p. 103, no. 48a; Cinotti 1983, p. 452; Marini in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987 pp. 59–80, fig. 10; Cicala in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, p. 104; Carr in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 132–33, cat. no. 14 (copy); Marini 2005, pp. 292, 532–35, no. 82; Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 252–55, cat. no. 39 (copy).

59. *Portrait of Alof de Wignacourt and a Page, 1607*

Oil on canvas, 76¼ x 52¾ in. (194 x 134 cm)

Musée du Louvre, Paris, inv. 1124

Provenance:

In 1644, collection Roger du Plessis de Liancourt (1598–1674), Palace of the Count of Liancourt, rue de Seine, Paris; Francois Oursel, or Hoursel, by 1644; sold by his heirs to Louis XIV on June 18, 1670; by 1695 at Versailles; enters the collection of the Louvre in 1737; exhibited in the Palais du Luxembourg 1750–79; in the Royal Collection of the Louvre by 1785; exhibited at the Muséum des Arts after 1793 (Loire 2006, p. 70).

Inventories:

1. February 1, 1670; Sold by Hoursel, secretary of the Duke of Vrillière and a noted lover of art to Louis XIV, a “portrait of a Grand Master of Malta done by Michel Lange” [“Comptes des Bâtimens du Roi reproduced by Maindron, ‘Reçu du sieur de Bartillat 14.419 liv. 3 sols 6 den. pour d’icelle deslivrer 14.300 aux sieurs Vinot et Hoursel pour le paiement de sept Bustes etc. et de huit tableaux qui sont etc . . . un portrait d’un grand-maistre de Malte fait par Michel Lange”] (Bonaffe 1884, pp. 185, 240; Cinotti 1983, pp. 487–89).

2. 1761: *Catalogue des tableaux du Cabinet du Roy au Luxembourg* (p. 21, n. 79) as “Portrait of Adolphe de Vignacourt, Grand Master of Malta by Caravaggio” [“ritratto di Adolphe de Vignacourt, grand maître de Malthe del Caravaggio”].

3. 1793: Picault’s list of paintings in the Republic: “Among the portraits is one of the Grand Master Wignacourt, painted by Michelangelo da Caravaggio.”

Sources:

1. Baglione 1642, p. 138: “Afterward he went to Malta and was invited to pay his respects to the Grand Master, whose portrait he painted. As a sign of his satisfaction this exalted

personage presented him with the mantle of Saint John and made him Knight of Grace.” [“Poscia andossene a Malta, & introdotto a far riverenza al gran Maestro, fecegli il ritratto; onde quel Principe in segno di merito dell’habito di San Giovanni il regalò, e creollo cavaliere di gratia”].

2. Baudoin 1643, pl. 53.

3. February 1644, *Diary of John Evelyn* (ed. 1960, I, p. 86): In a description of the palace of the Count of Liancourt, rue de Seine, Paris “. . . a Cavaliero di Malta, attended by his page, said to be of Michael Angelo.”

4. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 226): “Desiring to receive the cross of Malta, he went to Malta and was introduced to the Grand Master, Wignacourt, a French nobleman. Caravaggio portrayed him standing in his armor and also seated, unarmed, and in the habit of the Grand Master, the first of these portraits is in the Armory of Malta.” [“Era Caravaggio desideroso di ricevere la croce di Malta, . . . dove giunto fu introdotto avanti il Gran Maestro Vignacourt, signore francese. Lo ritrasse in piedi armato ed a sedere disarmato nell’abito di Gran Maestro, conservandosi il primo ritratto nell’armeria di Malta.”]

5. Baldinucci 1681 (ed. 1845–47, III, p. 686).

6. Félibien des Avaux 1688, II, p. 13.

7. Abbé de Vertot 1726, IV, pp. 127–33.

8. Susinno 1724 (ed. 1960, p. 109): “He portrayed the same Grand Master standing in his armor. He made another portrait of this man dressed in the habit of the Order” [“ritrasse lo stesso Gran Maestro in piè armato. Formò un altro ritratto del medesimo signore vestito in abito signorile di pompa . . .”].

Exhibitions:

Paris 1935, no. 83; Milan 1951, no. 39; Valletta 1970; Valletta 1978; New York-Naples 1985, no. 94.

Bibliography:

Villot *Catalogue* . . . 1849, no. 35; Bonaffé 1885, pp. 185–86, 240; Kallab 1906/7, p. 290; Saccà 1907, pp. 56–57; De Ricci *Catalogue* . . . 1913, no. 1124; Marangoni 1922, no. XXXVIII; Hautecoeur *Catalogue* . . . 1924, no. 1124; Voss 1924, pp. 82–83, pl. 31; Schudt 1942, no. 65; Longhi 1943, p. 39 (1608, ?); Sammut 1948, pp. 82–84 (if Wignacourt died in 1622 at 65 years unlikely this is him); Arslan 1951, p. 447 (“at least the head is worthy of Caravaggio”); Berenson 1951, pp. 39, 44; Longhi 1951, no. 39 (expressed doubts); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1608); Venturi 1951, no. 41; Longhi 1952, p. 43; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (“problematical owing to condition,” 1608); Hinks 1953, no. 61 (1608, head repainted); Baumgart 1955, no. 55 (1607–8); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 132, 219–21 no. 44D; Wagner 1958, pp. 146–48, 151, 220–21; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 342–43 (ruined state); Jullian 1961, pp. 184–85, 201–3, 230 (not picture mentioned by Bellori); Cauchi 1962, pp. 168–70; Macrae 1964, p. 416; Causa 1966, II, p. 6 (doubts); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 84 (1608, all critics agree on authorship notwithstanding Bellori who wrote in 1672 that the picture was in Malta when it had already entered the French royal collections, Paris, by 1670; and despite the fact that the armor was not Wignacourt’s but Jean-Jacques Verdelin’s who was only 18 in 1608); Longhi 1968, p. 42; Kitson 1969, no. 83; Cinotti 1971, pp. 83, 136–37; Gregori 1974, pp. 594–602; Marini 1974, pp. 435–38 n. 74 (1608); Moir 1976, pp. 67, 101, no. 40, 133 n. 220; Nicolson 1979, p. 33 (1607–8); Moir 1982, pp. 33–35, 148–49 (1607–8); Cinotti 1983, no. 43 (1607); Hibbard 1983, pp. 227–28, 326–27 (“Page may have been repainted or even finished by another hand”); Gregori 1985, no. 94 (armor datable to 1585, condition good, autograph 1608); Cutajar 1989, pp. 15–17; Marini 1989, pp. 525–27, no. 82 (Malta 1608); Gregori 1994, p. 153, no. 70 (c. 1608); Pacelli 1994, pp. 69–74 (1608); Gilbert 1995, p. 201; Marini 1997, pp. 40–41; Gregory 1998, p. 3; Langdon 1998, pp. 350–51; Puglisi 1998, no. 71 (c. 1607–8); Robb 1998, p. 515 (1608); Spike 2001, pp. 206–7, cat. no. 59 (1607); Macioce 2003, p. 234, fig. 48; Pagano and Utili in *Naples-London* 2004–5, pp. 174, 180 no. 20; Sciberras in *Naples-London* 2004–5, p. 64; Stone in *Naples-London* 2004–5, pp. 67–71, 77–78; Zeffi in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 120 (1607–8); Sgarbi 2005, no. 58 (“It was probably with this portrait that Caravaggio secured the interest of the Knights of Malta” c. 1607); Sciberras and Stone 2005, p. 9; Spear 2005, p. 141; Loire 2006, pp. 70–75 (1607–8); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 12, 70–79, 84, 86, 113–14, 123, 129, figs. 21, I–III (documents for armour); Varriano 2006, pp. 14, 88–90, 117, fig. 67; Debono 2007, 19 ill (late 1607); Stone in *Valletta* 2007, pp. 67–69 (late 1607, classic suit of Milanese armor of c. 1565–80 may allude to

the Grand Master's participation in the Battle of Lepanto); Terzaghi 2007, pp. 286–88 (1607–8, page is probably a portrait of Ottavio Costa's son, Alessandro); Papa 2008, pp. 174–85 (1608).

Portraiture, which requires numerous face-to-face encounters, was Caravaggio's customary tactic for winning the confidence of a new patron. It would have made sense for him to start in on his full-length portrait of *Alof de Wignacourt and a Page* as soon as possible after his arrival on Malta in July 1608. The painting harks back self-consciously to Titian's official portrait style, which a well-traveled dignitary like Wignacourt could be counted on to appreciate. Paris Bordone, another Venetian Renaissance master, had painted a celebrated portrait of a general assisted by his squire, so the idea had distinguished precedents.

Baglione was informed that Caravaggio had painted in Malta the portrait of his new protector, Grand Master Alof de Wignacourt. By 1644 the present portrait was in a noble collection in Paris where it was seen by the English traveler, John Evelyn. Bellori's contradictory report in 1672 of the painting's presence in the Armory of the Grand Master's Palace in Malta may either recall the location of the picture prior to its transfer to France or may refer to a copy, for example that preserved today in the sacristy of Santa Maria della Vittoria, Valletta. Notwithstanding the praise it even received from critics hostile to Caravaggio—for instance Félibien des Avaux in 1688—the *Portrait of Alof de Wignacourt* was doubted by many modern critics. Caravaggio's authorship is generally recognized today. The portrait would presumably have been among his first works executed in Malta following his arrival in July 1607.

See pp. 206–7.

Condition:

Fair. The paint surface was flattened and damaged by a harsh relining in 1751. The dark tones in the background and on the armor were abraded by excessive cleaning, presumably in the eighteenth century. The canvas consists of two strips whose vertical join is visible between the two figures. See Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 342–43.

Copies:

I.

C. I

Engraving in reverse by Nicholas de Larmessin (Paris 1684–1755) in *Recueil d'estampes . . .* 1729–42, on which is written: “Portrait of Adolphe de Vignacourt Grand Master of Malta. Painting by Michel-Ange Merigi, called Caravage, today in the King’s Collection. Painted on canvas, six feet high, 3 feet 11 inches wide.” Albertina, Vienna, HB XIV 164/260; Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris, Bd 8, no. 35.

Bibliography:

Moir 1976, p. 101 no. 40a, fig. 108; Cinotti 1983, p. 487; Gregori 1985, p. 328; Spike 2001, cat. no. 59.c.1.

C.2

Valletta, Italy, Santa Maria della Vittoria

Inscription: “F. Adolphe de Wignacourt of the Venerable League of France elected Grand Master February 10, 1601 and remained in office 21 years seven months and four days.”

Bibliography:

Sammut 1959; Marini 1974, p. 437; Cinotti 1983, p. 487 (indicates original still in Malta c. 1622); Gregori 1985, p. 328 (modified gesture); Marini 1989, repr. p. 237; Spike 2001, cat. no. 59.c.2.

The Grand Master holds his arms in a different position but otherwise the portrait derives from the Louvre prototype. The page is not represented.

II. Other copies listed in Loire 2006, p. 72.

60. *Saint Jerome Writing*, c. 1607

Oil on canvas, 46 x 61¾ in. (117 x 157 cm)

Museum of the Co-Cathedral of Saint John the Baptist, Valletta, Malta

Provenance:

Commissioned by Fra Ippolito Malaspina, prior of the Order of Jerusalem in Naples; bequeathed by him to the chapel of Italy in the conventual church of Saint John the Baptist, Valletta, 1629; transferred to the National Museum of Fine Arts, Valletta, in February 1957, but returned to Saint John's with the successive change of government; transferred to the Museum of Saint John's in 1964; stolen on December 29, 1984; recovered on August 4, 1987 and restored in Rome until 1990; currently exhibited in the Oratory of the Co-Cathedral.

Document:

1. May 10, 1629: Ippolito Malaspina bequeaths to the chapel of Italy, conventual church of Saint John the Baptist, Valletta, a “large picture” and “four small pictures” (Macioce 1994, p. 217).

Source:

1. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, pp. 226–27): “For the same church of Saint John, entering into the chapel of Italy, he painted two half figures over the door, a Magdalen and a Saint Jerome writing . . .” [“Per la Chiesa medesima di San Giovanni, entro la cappella della nazione Italiana dipinse due mezze figure sopra due porte, la Madalena e San Gerolamo che scrive; . . .”].

Exhibitions:

Florence 1922, no. XXXIX; Naples 1938; Rome 1956, no. 37; Valletta-Floriana 1960; Valletta 1970, no. 270; Valletta 1978; Valletta 1990; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 7 (not exhibited in London); Trapani 2007, cat. no. 9; Valletta 2007, cat. no. 2; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 9.

Bibliography:

Rouchés 1920, pp. 101–2 (as in chapel of Italy, not by Caravaggio, late Roman); Marangoni in Florence 1922, no. XXXIX (identified by Vincenzo Bonello; one of the most beautiful of Caravaggio’s works); Schudt 1942, no. 61; Berenson 1951, pp. 38–39; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1608); Venturi 1951, no. 44; Longhi 1952, pp. 43–44; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1608); Hinks 1953, no. 60 (1608); Baumgart 1955, no. 54 (1607–8); Friedlaender 1955, p. 211, no. 37; Scicluna 1955, p. 94 (identifies coat-of-arms of Malaspina); Salerno in Rome 1956, no. 37; Carita 1957, pp. 68–77; Hess 1958, pp. 142, 145, 147; Wagner 1958, pp. 151–52; Cauchi in Valletta-Floriana 1960; Jullian 1961, pp. 183–85; Cauchi 1962, p. 169; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 85 (1608—always over door in the chapel of Italy in the Cathedral at Valletta, attributed to Ribera until Marangoni 1922); Kitson 1969, no. 84; Levey in Valletta 1970, no. 230; Cinotti 1971, p. 83; Gregori 1974, pp. 599 n. 28; Marini 1974, pp. 439–40 n. 76 (1607–8); Nicolson 1974, p. 608; Spezzaferro 1974, p. 585 n. 49; Moir 1976, p. 101 no. 41, 133 n. 221 (quotes Hess 1958, as “probably a portrait of Alof de Wignacourt”); Nicolson 1979, pp. 32–33; Moir 1982, p. 146; Cinotti 1983, no. 22; Hibbard 1983, pp. 225–26 (begun in Naples?); Macioce in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, p. 175 (Malaspina research); Cutajar 1989, p. 74 (commissioned by Gerolamo Carafa, prior of Barletta); Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 34; Marini 1989, pp. 529–30, n. 84 (Malta, 1608); Amelio–Borg 1990 (restoration report, unpaginated); Bologna 1992, p. 337 (1607); Gregori 1994, p. 153, no. 71 (c. 1608); Pacelli 1994, pp. 51–54 (July 1607, portrait of Wignacourt); Gilbert 1995, pp. 108–9; Azzopardi 1996, p. 205; Basile in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 51–56; Langdon 1998, p. 375; Puglisi 1998, no. 70 (c. 1607–8); Robb 1998, p. 513 (1607); de Piro 1999, p. 79; Spike 2001, p. 208, cat. no. 60 (c. 1607); Moreno in Milan 2004, pp. 35–45; Zeffi in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 121 (1608); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 174, 180 no. 18; Sciberras and Stone in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 113–14, cat. no. 7; Sgarbi 2005, no. 60; Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 29–30 (1607–8); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 24–25, 69–70, 84, 89–99, 103, 107, 113, 123–31, fig. 31, IV–VII (commissioned by Fra Ippolito Malaspina who was in Rome with Caravaggio and most probably traveled to Malta in 1607 on same galley with Caravaggio); Varriano 2006, p. 125; Debono 2007, 36 ill. (February 1608); de Giorgio in Valletta 2007, cat. no. 2; Marini in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 9, pp. 240–47 (Malta 1608); Stone in Valletta 2007, pp. 72–74 (1607–before August 1608); Terzaghi 2007, pp. 283–89; Marini in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 9, pp. 254–61 (Malta, 1608); Papa 2008, pp. 176–84 (1608).

This *Saint Jerome* is assumed to be the “quadro grande” that Malaspina bequeathed to the chapel of Italy in 1629, as his coat-of-arms is prominent at lower right on the painting. Prior to its transfer to the cathedral’s museum, it hung *ab antiquo* in the chapel of Italy above the passage-way into the adjacent chapel. Many writers have noted a resemblance between the saint and the Grand Master Alof de Wignacourt seen in the portrait by Caravaggio in the Louvre. The work would therefore have been commissioned by Malaspina, admiral of the Order, as a tribute to the Grand Master from Caravaggio in Malta in 1607.

See illustration at p. 208.

Condition:

The painting was restored from 1955 to 1956 by the Istituto di Restauro in Rome. After its theft in 1984 and subsequent recovery in 1987, it was restored in Rome at the Centro di Studi Corrado Alvaro. The painting was damaged by being cut clumsily out of its frame and improperly rolled and scratched. See the report by G. Basile 1990; Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 89; and Lapucci 2009, pp. 68–71.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Marini 1971, p. 58 n. 5; Moir 1976, p. 101 nos. 41a–41b; Cinotti 1983, p. 444; Cutajar 1989², pp. 3–6, Sciberras in Valletta 2007, pp. 39–40 discusses a copy in a Maltese private collection, inscribed enigmatically “GNFDC.”

61. *Saint Francis in Prayer*, 1608

Oil on canvas, 51¼ x 35⅜ in. (130 x 90 cm)

Pinacoteca del Museo Civico, Cremona

Provenance:

Gift of Marchese Filippo Ala Ponzoni in 1879.

Documents:

The early provenance of the painting is disputed.

1. Spezzaferro (1974, p. 586) relates an untraced painting in the inventory of Ottavio Costa either to this painting or the *Saint Francis* at the church of San Pietro, Carpineto Romano (cat. no. 9.1). January 18, 1639: Posthumous inventory of Ottavio Costa, “and another painting of Saint Francis made by the same Caravaggio” [“E più un altro quadro di San Francesco fatto dall’istesso Caravaggio”].

2. Azzopardi (1996, pp. 196–209) noted a *Saint Francis* by Caravaggio in the prestigious collection of Monsignor Paul Alpheran de Bussan, who bequeathed the painting to Fra Christophe Sebastian, Baron von Remschingen by testament dated November 6, 1756. [“Al Signore Gran balì Barone di Remschingen il quadro di S. Francesco d’Assisi dipinto dal Caravaggio che ritrovasi nella mia camera dell’estate della Valletta”].

3. Marubbi (2007, pp. 13–16) raises the possibility that this *Saint Francis* was acquired by Mons. Benedetto Ala, who was *Governatore* of Rome (1604–10) and was specifically cited by Caravaggio as having given him permission to carry a sword in a deposition of May 25, 1605. Though not confirmed in any document, the painting would presumably have been taken to Cremona and remained for centuries in the possession of the Ala Ponzoni family, perhaps on deposit in a Franciscan monastery for a period, until its donation to the Museo Civico.

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 60 (as good, old copy); New York-Naples 1985, no. 88; Cremona 1987; Florence 1991, cat. no. 17; Salonicà 1997; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 116–17; Bergamo 2000, no. 41; Cremona-New York 2004; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 3; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 5; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.7; Düsseldorf 2006 (as 1606) cat. no. 7; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 5; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 5; Caldarola (Macerata), 2009 cat. no. 9.

Bibliography:

Camelli 1930, p. 2; Longhi 1943, p. 17 (“antica e buona copia”); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 60 (as copy); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1607) n. 125 (“In the opinion of this writer it is an original . . .

It was painted hurriedly, and has probably suffered damage from cleaning, but is a fine work”); Puerari 1951, p. 169 (catalogue Cremona, after Caravaggio); Venturi 1951 (rejects); Longhi 1952, (accepts); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1607); Hinks 1953, no. 56; Baumgart 1955, no. 62 (1609–10); Czobor 1955, p. 212 (self-portrait?); Friedlaender 1955, p. 224 (mentions with Mancini quote regarding lost *Saint Francis* from Saint Anne of Lombardy in Naples, late work?); Wagner 1958, pp. 155–56 (copy of Sicilian original); Berne Joffroy 1959, (probably); Jullian 1961, pp. 170, 180 (copy); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 71 (no opinion); Kitson 1969, no. 71 (reserves opinion); Cinotti 1971 (copy); Rossi 1953, no. 53; Marini 1974, pp. 186–87, 401–2 (c. 1603); Röttgen 1974, pp. 208, 211, 213 (after flight from Rome); Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 585–87 (most likely related to Costa inventory); Moir 1976 pp. 119 no. 120 (doubtful), 121–22 n. 180, 161 n. 286 (imitation?); Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Spear 1979, p. 318 (uncertain); Cinotti 1983, no. 9 (copy?); Hibbard 1983, p. 287 (possibly North Italian); Gregori 1985, no. 88 (summer, 1606); Spike 1985, p. 417 (summer 1606); Christiansen 1986, p. 436 (comparable to the Brera *Supper at Emmaus*); Marini 1989, pp. 467–68, no. 53 (Rome, 1603, questions Costa provenance); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 17; Lapucci in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, pp. 291–98; Bologna 1992, p. 342 (1610); Gregori 1994, p. 129, 151, no. 56 (c. 1605–6); Pacelli 1994, pp. 95–97 (after November 1609); Azzopardi in Macioce 1996, p. 201 (publishes Alpheran inventory and provisional identification by Spike with the Cremona picture); Berra 1996, pp. 101–18 (self portrait?); Sciuti et al. in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 69–85; Gregori in Salonicà 1997, pp. 98–102; Lapucci in Salonicà 1997, pp. 102–5, n. 1e; Puglisi 1998, no. 59 (attributed, c. 1606); Robb 1998, p. 512 (1606); Gregori in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 116–17; Corradini–Marini 2000, pp. 105, 107; Gregori in Bergamo 2000, p. 215 (c. 1605); Marini 2001 (1603); Toninelli 2001, pp. 79–87; Spike 2001, pp. 208–9, ill. 211, cat. no. 61 (c. 1608); Christiansen in Bayer 2004, pp. 173–74 (1606–7); Christiansen in Cremona–New York 2004, pp. 248–49; Christiansen in Naples–London 2004–5, pp. 104–6, cat. no. 3 (1606, immediately after his flight from Rome); Pagano and Utili in Naples–London 2004–5, pp. 172, 179 no. 4 (1606–7); Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 160, cat. no. I.7; Gregori in Barcelona 2005, pp. 60–63, cat. no. 5 (1604–6); Sgarbi 2005, no. 49 (c. 1606, just before Carpineto *Saint Francis in Meditation*, cat. no. 9.1); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 213–14, cat. 7; Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 110; Marubbi 2007, pp. 13–16; Marubbi in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 5, pp. 217–21; Pupillo in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 99–109; Ziane in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 161–79 (for music); Marubbi in Valletta–Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 5 pp. 228–35 (c. 1605); Papa 2008, pp. 124–27 (1605–6); Marubbi in Caldarola (Macerata) 2009, pp. 92–93, cat. no. 9 (c. 1605).

The early history of this *Saint Francis* is unknown. The existence of a reduced copy in Castell'Arquato (Piacenza) suggested to Gregori (1985) the hypothesis that the original may have been in the Franciscan convent of Monte Oliveto in that town. Recently, Marubbi (in Trapani 2007, p. 220) has suggested that the painting was brought to Cremona by Mons. Benedetto Ala, who was *Governatore* in Rome (1604–10) and probably knew Caravaggio personally. A painted inscription on the back of the frame “Con.S.^{ti} Fran.^{ci}” (Conventus Sancti Francisci) appears to attribute a successive passage of the painting to a Franciscan convent. Another hypothesis awaiting confirmation is that this *Saint Francis* was painted on Malta and eventually entered the collection of Mgr. Paul Alpheron de Bussan (1686–1756), a member of the Order of Saint John and a discriminating patron of the arts. This hypothesis would accord with Mahon's dating to after Caravaggio's departure from Rome in 1606.

The painting represents Saint Francis in accord with the Capuchin Constitution of 1536 which enjoined the friars “not to carry with them many books, so that they may attentively study the most excellent book, the Cross.” The hunched over saint meditates on a crucifix which is made to seem synonymous with the Bible held open by its arms. Behind Francis stands the eviscerated trunk of a barren tree; the saint's own body similarly enfolds a deep void.

See pp. 208–9, illustrated at p. 211.

Condition:

Good, apart from minor scattered losses especially in the saint's hair. The painting was restored in 1951, 1955, and 1986. Radiography executed in 1986 did not reveal significant pentimenti. See Lapucci (*Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 17) for a detailed discussion.

Copy:

C. I

Castell'Arquato (Piacenza), Museum of the Collegiata

Bibliography:

Gregori 1991, p. 290 cites its reduced dimensions.

62. *Portrait of Fra Antonio Martelli, a Knight of Malta, c. 1608*

Oil on canvas, 46³/₄ x 37⁵/₈ in. (118.5 x 95.5 cm)

Palazzo Pitti, Florence, inv. 717

Provenance:

Painted for the sitter on Malta, 1607–8; Cosimo III, Grand Duke of Tuscany, Florence, by 1666–70; transferred to the Granducal collection, Villa del Poggio Imperiale, 1696; transferred to Palazzo Pitti.

Inventories:

1. Inventories of 1666–70 of the Medici holdings, without indication of author: Archivio di Stato, Florence: “A painting on canvas of March’Antonio Martelli with a cross of Malta on his chest” [“Un quadro in tela dipintovi March’Antonio Martelli con croce di Malta in petto con adornamento di noce alto braccia 2 1/3 largo braccia 2, di mano . . .”] (ASF, Guardaroba medico 741, a.c. 301, n. 329; Chiarini 1989, pp. 15–16 n. 6).

2. December 6, 1696: Sent by Giuseppe del Nobolo, keeper of the Grand Duke’s Collection to the Villa del Poggio Imperiale “Fra Marc’Antonio, with a cross of Malta on his chest” [“Fra Marc’Antonio Martelli, con croce di Malta in petto del n. 426, braccia 2½”] (ASF, Guardaroba medico 1026, c.23r; Chiarini 1989, p. 16 n. 6; Sebregondi 2005, p. LIX could not confirm reference).

3. Inventory of Objects of Art of the Crown: Palace of the Grand Duke: No. 717—attributed to Francesco Bassano or Niccolò Cassana. (Gregori 1974, p. 594).

4. 1837–42: Engraved illustration by G. Silvani in *L’Imperiale e Reale Galleria Pitti illustrata*, as attributed to Niccolò Cassana (Cinotti 1983, p. 434; Gregori 1985, p. 332).

Exhibitions:

Florence 1911 no. 7 (as Giovanni Francesco [father of Niccolò] Cassana); Versailles 1961, no. 29 (as Niccolò Cassana); Florence 1970, no. 23 (unknown Caravaggist); New York-Naples 1985, no. 95; Florence 1991, no. 20; Venice 2000, no. 49; Naples-London 2004–5 cat. no. 9; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 19; Valletta 2007, cat. no. 3; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

Foglari in Florence 1911 [ed. 1927, pp. 111, 118] (Niccolò Cassana); Caracciolo di Torchiariolo 1939, p. 187; Baumgart 1955, p. 107 (sitter is Wignacourt, contemporary with Louvre portrait, but artist not Caravaggio); Gregori in Batini in *La Nazione* (as Caravaggio, as Portrait of Wignacourt); Borea in Florence 1970, no. 23 (unknown Caravaggist, circle Manfredi, on card on back of canvas in eighteenth-century(?) hand is written, “Ritrato de Bassano”); Salerno 1970, p. 237; Volpe 1970, p. 111 (late); Cinotti 1971, p. 137 (doubts); Pérez Sánchez 1971, p. 85; Schleier 1971, p. 88 (late); Marini 1974, pp. 44, 250–51, 442–43, n. 79 (Maltese period); Gregori 1974, pp. 594–603 (Portrait of Wignacourt by Caravaggio, perhaps unfinished? because red-brown underpainting visible throughout); Testori 1975, p. 3; Moir 1976, pp. 66, 116 no. 100 (copy of lost original), 132–33 n. 220 (rejects), 156 n. 271; Meloni Trkulja 1977, p. 49 (sent to Florence by Francesco dell’Antella, in Wignacourt’s service in Malta); Whitfield 1978, p. 359 (doubts); Nicolson 1979, p. 33 (1607–8); Spear 1979, p. 318 (uncertain); Marini 1982, pp. 72–83; Cinotti 1983, no. 15 (“leans toward seeing the hand of Caravaggio in it”); Hibbard 1983, p. 327 n. 151 (rejects); Gregori 1985, no. 95 (not unfinished, c. 1608); Spike 1985, p. 417 (convincing, 1608–10); Chiarini 1989, pp. 15–16 (based on archival findings, probable identity of sitter, Marc Antonio Martelli, of ancient and noble Florentine family, prior of the Order at Messina in 1604); Marini 1989, pp. 533–34, n. 87 (Malta, 1608, as portrait of Marcantonio Martelli); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 20; Bologna 1992, p. 478, no. 23 (identifies sitter as Niccolò Caracciolo di San Vito, questions attribution to Caravaggio); Gregori 1994, p. 154, no. 74 (c. 1608–9); Macioce 1994, p. 208; Pacelli 1994, p. 83 (1608, last work on Malta); Gregori in Florence 1996, pp. 36–39; Gash 1997, pp. 156–60 (identifies sitter as Fra Antonio Martelli); Gregory 1997, pp. 124–28; Gregory 1998, pp. 3–4 (as “can be identified with Fra Antonio Martelli and this too was executed in the Maltese period”); Langdon 1998, pp. 348, 351–52; Puglisi 1998, no. 75 (as *Portrait of a Knight*, c. 1608); Robb 1998, p. 516 (1608); Papi in Venice 2000, no. 49, pp. 197–99; Spike 2001, ill. p. 209,

cat. no. 62 (1608); Sciberras 2002, pp. 11–12 (April to end of August 1608); Chiarini 2003, I, p. 223, II, pp. 110–11, cat. no. 156; Navarro in Chiarini 2003, I, pp. 220–22; Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 121 (1608); Pagano and Utili, Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 175, 180 no. 23; Sciberras and Stone in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 119–21, cat. no. 9 (archival records of Martelli's residence in Malta during Caravaggio's sojourn); Fabbri in Pontedera 2005, LXI–LXXVII; Sebregondi 2005, pp. LII–LX (likeness of sitter cannot be confirmed from another portrait of Antonio Martelli); Sgarbi 2005, no. 62 (end of 1607–early 1608); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 29–30 (1607–8); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 19, pp. 91–93 (1608); Loire 2006, p. 73 (1608); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 24, 85–89, 113, 128, figs. 30, XX–XXI; Tresoldi 2006, p. 104 (1608); Varriano 2006, pp. 88, 91–92, fig. 68; Debono 2007 (May–August 1608); Lapucci in Valetta 2007, pp. 133–35; Sciberras in Valletta 2007, cat. no. 3; Stone in Valletta 2007, pp. 71–72 (likely Caravaggio's last work on Malta); Papa 2008, pp. 88–93 (1608–9); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82; Pellini in Rome 2009, pp. 152–55.

The identities of the sitter and the artist were forgotten during the centuries that this portrait was part of the Florentine collections. In 1966 Gregori restored the picture to Caravaggio's oeuvre. Chiarini's (1989) identification of the sitter from a Medici inventory of 1666–70, was strengthened by Gash's (1997) discovery that Fra Antonio Martelli was in Malta at the same time as Caravaggio, 1607–8. Formerly admiral of the Order of Saint John and prior of Messina, Fra Martelli appears younger than his 74 years in Caravaggio's portrait. The Martelli were Florentine nobles closely allied to the Medici; either of these families could have been the original recipient for this portrait, which has alternatively been identified as Grand Master Alof de Wignacourt (Gregori). Archival research has established that the portrait was most likely painted between Caravaggio arrival in Malta in July 1607 and Martelli's departure from the island in April 1608 Sciberras (2002).

See illustration at p. 209.

Condition:

Good. The rapid and thin execution of this portrait, not to mention the summary handling of the knight's hand, have suggested to some that the portrait is unfinished. These same qualities are characteristic of this late date, however. See Lapucci 2009, pp. 72–73.

Copies:

None recorded.

63. *Beheading of Saint John the Baptist*, 1608

Oil on canvas, 142 x 204³/₄ in. (361 x 520 cm)

Oratory, Co-Cathedral of Saint John's, Valletta, Malta

Signed

Provenance:

In situ, commissioned by the Grand Master Alof de Wignacourt whose arms are sculpted on the frame.

Document:

1. Connected to the confirmation of Caravaggio as a Knight of Obedience in the Order of Jerusalem on July 14, 1608 (Sammut 1948–49, pp. 20).

Sources:

1. Nicolas Benard 1621, p. 80: Views the painting during a visit to Malta in November 1616 (cf. Freller 1996, p. 103).

2. Johann Friedrich Breithaupt 1632: Views the painting during a visit to Malta in 1624 (cf. Freller 1997, p. 22).

3. von Sandrart 1635: "Beheading of John in Malta ["Juannis decollatione"] . . . a painting so extraordinarily close to reality . . . rivalled by few" (Feller 1997, p. 22).

4. Fra Fabrizio Cagliola, *Le Disavventure Marinaresche o sia Gabriello disavventurato*, c. 1650: "Go [the Padre said] turning toward Gabriello, when you get to Malta, into the oratory of San Giovanni Decollato, which was painted by the greatest of all painters, Michelangelo di Caravaggio" (Azzopardi–Stone 1996, p. 166).

5. Engraving dated 1650 by Wolfgang Killian (5 x 3 in. [127 x 75 mm], Catholic University of America, Washington D.C.) (Azzopardi–Stone 1996, p. 164, fig. 9).

6. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 226): “As a reward for this [his portrait] the Grand Master presented him with the Cross of Malta. For the Church of Saint John he had him paint the Beheading of the Saint fallen on the ground, while the executioner, as though he had not quite killed him with the blow of his sword, takes his knife from his flank and grasps the saint by the hair in order to cut off his head. Salome looks on intently, while an old woman is horrified by the spectacle, and the warden of the prison who is dressed in turkish garb, points to the atrocious massacre. In this work Caravaggio used all the power of his brush, working with such boldness that the canvas priming shows through the half tones. In addition to honoring him with the cross, the Grand Master gave him a precious chain of gold and two slaves, together with other demonstrations of his esteem and pleasure in the work.” [“Laonde questo signore gli donò in premio la croce; e per la Chiesa di San Giovanni gli fece dipingere la Decollazione del Santo caduto a terra, mentre il carnefice, quasi non l’abbia colpito alla prima con la spada, prende il coltello dal fianco, afferrandolo ne’ capelli per distaccargli la testa dal busto. Riguarda intenta Erodiade, ed una vecchia seco inorridisce allo spettacolo, mentre il guardiano della prigione in abito turco, addita l’atroce scempio. In quest’opera il Caravaggio usò ogni potere del suo pennello, avendovi lavorato con tanta fierezza che lasciò in mezze tinte l’imprimitura della tela: sí che, oltre l’onore della croce, il Gran Maestro gli pose al collo una ricca collana d’oro e gli fece dono di due schiavi, con altre dimostrazioni della stima e compiacimento dell’operar suo.”]

7. Archbishop Molina 1680, Pastoral Visit: “In 1608 in the Oratory the painting by the hand of the celebrated painter Cavaliere Fr. Michel-Angelo Caraca da Caravaggio . . .” [“si fece poi nel 1608 in esso Oratorio il quadro p. Mano del Celebre Pittore il Cav[alier]e Fr. Michel-Angelo Caraca da Caravaggio . . .”] (Spike 1978, p. 627).

8. Lanzi 1809 (ed. 1968, I, p. 359).

Exhibitions:

Rome 1956, no. 38; Valletta 1970, no. 229; Valletta 1978; Florence 1998; Florence 1999; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 10; Valletta 2007, cat. no. 1; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 10.

Bibliography:

Rouchés 1920, pp. 100–101 (“This painting merits the greatest rank among those by Caravaggio, not simply for its vast size but also for its great beauty”); Marangoni in Florence 1922, no. XLI; Schudt 1942, no. 57; Berenson 1951, p. 39; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1608); Venturi 1951, no. 42; Longhi 1952, p. 43 (ruined state); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1608); Hinks 1953, no. 59; Baumgart 1955, no. 53 (1608, “important tonal innovations”); Friedlaender 1955, p. 211, no. 36 (poorly preserved); Scicluna 1955, pp. 138–39, 141 (Oratory completed 1603, paid for by Stefano Lomellino); Argan 1956, p. 37; Gendel 1956, p. 20; Carità 1957, pp. 41–68; Hess 1958, p. 146; Wagner 1958, pp. 149–51; Cauchi 1962, p. 169; Bottari 1966 (most tragic of oeuvre, 1608); Moir 1967, I, pp. 12, 313; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 83 (1608); Kitson 1969, no. 82 (the largest canvas the artist ever painted, gift to Order in which Caravaggio was made a knight on July 14, 1608, vividly shows technique of letting priming of canvas show through in half tones); Moir 1972, no. 13; Gregori 1974, pp. 598, 600; Marini 1974, p. 43, n.75; Röttgen 1974, pp. 208–12; Moir 1976, p. 101 no. 39; Spike 1978, p. 627; Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Moir 1982, p. 150 (1607–8); Cinotti 1983, no. 23 (1608); Hibbard 1983, pp. 228–34; Spike 1983, p. 41; Gregori 1985, p. 44 (painter identifies with blood of the martyr through his signature); Macioce in Calvesi 1987, p. 179; Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 39 n.24 (“The signature in the Saint’s blood, as Calvesi noted, is an impassioned cry for personal salvation”); Cutajar 1989, p. 13 (Prior Stefano Lomellini was not patron); Marini 1989, pp. 527–28, no. 83 (Malta, 1608); Posèq 1990, pp. 175–77 pls. 4, 5 (1608); Bologna 1992, p. 337 (1608); Gregori 1994, pp. 135, 153, no. 72 (1608); Macioce 1994, pp. 212–13; Pacelli 1994, pp. 76–78 (1608); Ward in Tulsa–Kansas City 1995–96, pp. 5, 14 (1608); Azzopardi in Macioce 1996, pp. 204–5; Zuccari in Macioce 1996, pp. 295–96; Azzopardi–Stone 1996, pp. 61–66; Freller 1997, p. 22; Stone 1997, p. 165; Langdon 1998, pp. 356–63; Puglisi 1998, no. 72 (1608); Robb 1998, p. 516 (1608); Ciattie and Silla 1999; Farrugia Randon 1999, p. 8 (compares restoration reports of 1957 and 1999); Varriano in Mormando 1999, pp. 192–203 (1608); Spike 2001, pp. 212–15, cat. no. 63 (1608); Moreno in Milan 2004, pp. 35–45; Zeffi in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 121 (1608); Pagano and Utili, Naples–London 2004–5, pp. 174, 180 no. 19; Lapucci 2005, p. 37, fig. 8; Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 30 (1608); Sgarbi 2005, no. 59 (1608); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 12, 14, 31, 38, 69, 84, 90–99, 103–9, 113, 115, 123, 129, 132, 134, figs. 16, 32, 41; Tresoldi 2006, p. 103 (1608); Varriano 2006, pp. 42–49, 82–83, 110, 116–17, 125, fig. 44; Debono 2007, 20, 22–23 ill, 37 ill (March–July 1608); de Giorgio in Valletta 2007, cat. no. 1; Marini in Trapani

2007, cat. no. 10, pp. 248–55 (Malta 1608, before July 14/before August 29?); Pichler in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 9–33 (compares the bilateral symmetry of the composition to the arched outline of the figures in the *Beheading of Saint John*, Valletta [cat. no. 63]); Stone in Valletta 2007, pp. 74–77 (Oratory built in 1602–5, Caravaggio likely unveiled his painting on August 29, 1608, the feast of Saint John’s Decollation); Marini in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 10, pp. 262–69 (Malta, before July 14/before August 29, 1608?); Papa 2008, pp. 184–88 (1608); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82; Bonello n.d. (suggests that Fra Stefano Lomellino paid for altarpiece as well as chapel).

Joachim von Sandrart, the German painter, gathered his notices on Italian art during his eight years’ residence in Italy, 1627–35. Around 1632, Sandrart visited Sicily and Malta; his comments on the *Beheading of Saint John the Baptist* represent therefore the first recorded reaction by a knowledgeable viewer to this masterpiece. It is the sole painting signed by Caravaggio.

The painting still stands in its original position against the rear wall, although the Oratory itself, where the knights held Chapter meetings and conducted criminal trials, underwent substantial modifications after 1680 on designs by Mattia Preti. In an engraving by Wolfgang Killian showing the interior of the Oratory in 1650, a simple altar is represented beneath Caravaggio’s painting which is crowned by a large painted lunette. The subsequent renovations called for a monumental polychrome altar (which partially hides the lower part of the painting) and the removal of the lunette. That lunette, with the *Martyrdom of the Knights of Malta at the Siege of Fort Saint Elmo in June 1565*, has recently been rediscovered by Azzopardi and Stone (1996) in the friary of the Franciscan Conventuals, Rabat, Malta.

Prior to the swearing of vows every novice was responsible for the *passaggio*, a gift that functioned like entry dues, although tradition sometimes allowed donations in lieu of payment. Wignacourt surely encouraged Caravaggio to satisfy this rite of passage with his somber masterpiece, the *Beheading of Saint John the Baptist*. The martyrdom of the knights’ patron saint was the most appropriate subject for an order of religious whose deceased were eulogized as “martyrs” regardless of their cause of death.

Loss of life exchanged for eternal life has been the universal prayer of warriors from time immemorial. The knights sought from Caravaggio a pictorial reading of this mighty theme

that would be comforting and inspirational. Caravaggio chose instead to cloak in silence the brutal violence of decapitation. The painter stops the action at the instant that the executioner grasps the Baptist's hair. The four participants are captured in an instant of perfect symmetry, forming a human cupola over John's motionless body. The curved arc of their backs is repeated in the great portal behind them. An arch is a sacred shape, symbolic of the vault of heaven. As far as the persons present can see, nothing relieves the ignobility of the event. The act is not observed by anyone, without a single angel or halo in view; the Divine is nevertheless witness.

Two poor souls look on with trepidation from the prison window. Caravaggio derived this motif, and the general outlines of the composition, from Byzantine icons of this subject (see text page 244; comparative illustrations, fig. 3).

See pp. 212–15.

Condition:

Fair. The painting was successfully restored by the Opificio delle Pietre Dure, Florence, in 1998–99. There is a large loss in the middle of Caravaggio's signature and numerous scattered losses across the surface of the canvas. For a complete discussion see Ciattie and Silla 1999 and Lapucci 2009, p. 74.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 101, nos. 39a–39e.

64. *Sleeping Cupid*, 1608

Oil on canvas, 30 x 41 ¼ in. (71 x 105 cm)

Palazzo Pitti, Florence, inv. 183

Inscribed on reverse of canvas in seventeenth-century hand: "Opera del Sr. Michel Angelo Maresi Da Caravaggio in Malta 1608"

Provenance:

Painted for Fra Francesco Antella, Malta, 1608; by whom sent to Senator Niccolò dell'Antella, his brother, in Florence, July 1609; by descent to Prior Donato dell'Antella, died January 14, 1667; from whose estate acquired by Cardinal Leopoldo de' Medici; in his posthumous inventory of 1675; by 1681 in the collection of the Grand Duke of Tuscany.

Documents:

1. June 20, 1609: Fra Francesco Buonarroti wrote to his brother, Michelangelo the Younger, "Let me inform you that I have conferred two or three times with Signor [Francesco] Antella who tells me he has sent a painting by Michelangelo da Caravaggio, of a *Sleeping Cupid* to his brother, Signor Niccolò, who treats the picture as a jewel, and delights in letting it be seen so as to have other opinions and because one of the persons who saw it wrote a sonnet for which reason I imagine he would be pleased if you should go to see it." ["Per vostra intelligenza sappiate che mi son trovato due o tre volte in ragionamento con il Signor Antella [Francesco], il quale mi dice di haver mandato costá un Quadro di mano di Michelangelo da Caravaggio, dentrovi un Cupido che dorme, in casa il Signor Niccolò suo fratello, il quale il Signor Commendatore lo tiene per una gioia, e ha gran piacere che sia visto perchè gli sia detto l'opinione altrui e perchè qualcuno che l'ha visto ci ha composto sopra qualche sonetto, i quali esso mi ha mostri, perciò m'immagino ch'esso avrebbe caro che lo vedessi"] (Sebregondi Fiorentini 1982, p. 122 [dates 1608]; Stone 1997², p. 166).

2. April 24, 1610: In a letter from Malta to Michelangelo Buonarroti the Younger, Commendator Antella acknowledges his enthusiastic reception upon viewing the painting, "I value now more than before my cupid, after hearing the praise of Your Lordship for which I kiss your hand" [". . . stimando io ora molto più di prima il mio cupido poi che mi viene lodato da Vostra Signoria alla quale bacio le mani"] (Stone 1997², p. 168).

3. March 15, 1667: Annibale Ranuzzi in a letter from Bologna congratulates Cardinal Leopoldo de' Medici on his good acquisition of the painting by Caravaggio that was owned by Prior Antella ["bell'acquisto fatto da V.A. di quel quadro del Caravaggio ch'era del Priore Antella"] (Melloni Trkulja 1977, pp. 46–50).

4. 1675: Posthumous inventory of Cardinal Leopoldo de' Medici, "a painting on canvas 1½ bracci high by 2½ bracci wide of a Sleeping Cupid with a bow and arrows by Caravaggio" ["Un quadro in tela alto bracci 1 e ½ largo 2 e ½ dipintovi un Amorino che dorme con l'arcano e frecce di mano del Caravaggio"] (Borea 1970, pp. 5–6; Meloni Trkulja 1977, pp. 46–50; cf. Sebreghondi 2005, p. XLVIII, with date of 1676).

Source:

1. Baldinucci 1681 (1728, VI, p. 10): Describes "a Cupid sleeping by . . . Caravaggio today in the Medici Palace . . ." [" . . . figura dell'Amorino che dorme . . . che oggi è nel Palazzo Serenissimo, fatta per mano del Caravaggio"] (Giglioli 1909, pp. 151–52).

Exhibitions:

Florence 1922; Milan 1951, no. 40; Florence 1970; Florence 1972; Florence 1982–83; Tokyo 1987, cat. no. 75; Florence 1991, no. 19; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 8; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.10.

Bibliography:

Marcucci 1842, II, pl. 65 (engraving, based on a design by Muzzi with a landscape in the background); Giglioli 1909, pp. 151–52; Longhi 1916, p. 305; Marangoni 1922 [1953, p. 157]; Schudt 1942, no. 68; Giglioli 1949, pp. 34, 159, pl. XIII; Berenson 1951, pp. 32, 42; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 40; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1608); Venturi 1951, no. 45; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1608); Grassi 1953, no. 62; Hinks 1953, no. 56 (1608); Baumgart 1955, no. 56 (1608); Friedlaender 1955, p. 212, no. 38A; Wagner 1958, pp. 152–53; Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 341; Jullian 1961, p. 186, 194 n. 20-1, 202, 230; Moir 1967, pp. 212, 214, 271; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 87 (1608, without documentation no one would have assigned this work to Caravaggio); Kitson 1969, no. 86 (weak); Borea in Florence 1970, no. 2; Salerno 1970, pp. 236, 241; Cinotti 1971, pp. 138–39, 163; Moir 1972, p. 140; Rossi in *Immagine . . .* 1973, pp. 103–4; Marini 1974, pp. 440–41, n. 71 (1608); Moir 1976 pp. 102 no. 42, 133 n. 222 (1607–8); Banti 1977, no. 8; Meloni Trkulja 1977, pp. 46–50; Nicolson 1979, p. 408; Cinotti 1983, no. 14; Hibbard 1983, pp. 234, 331 n. 172 (last Maltese work); Gregori 1985, p. 334; Pizzorusso 1983, p. 52; Posèq 1987, pp. 170–74; Marini 1989, pp. 530–31, n. 85 (Malta 1608); Calvesi 1990, p. 232

(source is print by G. B. Sculturi, 1583); Posèq 1990², pp. 162–67, pl. 14 (1608); Cropper 1991, pp. 199–201; Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 19; Bologna 1992, p. 338 (1608); Espinel 1994, pp. 1750–52 (child suffering from juvenile rheumatoid arthritis); Gregori 1994, p. 154, no. 73 (1608–9); Pacelli 1994, pp. 78–80 (1608); Person 1995, p. 62 (supports diagnoses of Espinel); Gilbert 1995, p. 127; Macioce 1994, p. 208 (1608); Gregori in Florence 1996, pp. 40–41; Stone 1997², p. 168 (publishes document, “conceit” of Merisi inspired by one of Michelangelo Buonarroti’s early sculptures, now lost, mistaken for piece of ancient statuary, enjoyed by his namesake, the poet; Caravaggio replaces Michelangelo’s counterfeit antique—a double sham—with a simulacrum of nature); Langdon 1998, pp. 213, 355; Puglisi 1998, no. 73 (1608); Robb 1998, p. 516 (1608); Bandera 2000, pp. 188, 191–92; Sbrigondi 2001, p. 602; Spike 2001, p. 208, ill. p. 210, cat. no. 64 (1608); Chiarini 2003, I, p. 221, II, p. 110 cat. no. 155 (1608); Macioce 2003, pp. 253–54, doc. 390; Navarro in Chiarini 2003, I, pp. 220–22; Zeffi in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 121 (1608); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 175, 180 no. 22; Sbrigondi in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 116–18, cat. no. 8; Sciberras in Milan 2005, pp. 166–67, cat. no. I.10; Sbrigondi 2005, pp. XLIV–LII; Sgarbi 2005, no. 61; Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 29–30 (1607–8); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 14, 23–24, 80, 85, 101–2, 114, 130, 132, fig. 28, XVII–XIX; Varriano 2006, pp. 57, 130, fig. 48; Debono 2007 (late 1608); Stone in Valletta 2007, pp. 69–71 (1608, “the topos of ‘love sleeping’ is a metaphor for the vow of chastity taken by the knights”); Papa 2008, pp. 38–39 (1608–9); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82.

The extraordinary *Sleeping Cupid* was immediately sent back to Florence so that it could be admired by poets and painters in the Palazzo Dell’Antella in Piazza Santa Croce. No one appears to have had misgivings over this unsettling representation of a deformed or moribund child in the guise of Cupid. Nor did anyone point out the obvious, namely, that the picture was a wicked travesty on a famous sculpture by Michelangelo Buonarroti, a *tour-de-force* that fooled everybody into thinking it was ancient. Caravaggio’s response to the classical theme, which celebrated earthly love, and to Michelangelo, whose youthful works were notoriously sensual, was to equate Eros with death.

The *Sleeping Cupid* was painted in Malta for Fra Francesco d’Antella, who proudly sent the painting only a year later to his family in Florence. The painting is well-documented in contemporary Florentine sources thanks no doubt to the extraordinarily helpful inscription

on its reverse, which provides even the date, 1608. The picture was immortalized by the still extant copy painted in 1619 by Giovanni da San Giovanni on the façade of the Palazzo dell'Antella in the Piazza Santa Croce, Florence, a decoration that exemplifies Florentine Baroque taste. See Stone 1997² for a detailed discussion of the Antella commission and its enthusiastic reception in Florence.

See p. 208, illustrated at p. 210.

Condition:

Good. Restored in 1969–70 by the Soprintendenza of Florence. The painting has never been x-rayed. Marini (1989) notes some modifications to the wing. See Lapucci in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* (1991); Lapucci 2009, pp. 66–67.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

May 15, 1676: Rotterdam, Sales catalogue, Reynier van der Wolf, brewer, “a dead child by the same (Michelangelo da Caravaggio)” fl. 40

Bibliography:

Hoet 1752, vol. 2, p. 342; Bodart 1970, p. 99, no. 3; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p.192 at F.

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 102 nos. 42a–42e. Among these are:

C.2

Florence, façade fresco, Palazzo dell'Antella,
Santa Croce

By Giovanni da San Giovanni, 1619

Source:

Baldinucci 1681 (1728, VI, p. 10): describes the façade of the Palazzo dell'Antella and “the wonderful figure of the Cupid sleeping by a swan made by Giovanni da San Giovanni, who had no difficulty copying a similar figure by Caravaggio now in the Royal Palace” (Giglioli 1909, pp. 151–52).

Bibliography:

Giglioli 1949, pp. 34, 159, pl. XIII (bozzetto of the entire façade in watercolor preserved in the Uffizi of Florence); Moir 1976, p. 102 n. 42e (as lost); Banti 1977, no. 8; Pizzorusso 1983, p. 52 (by Giovanni da San Giovanni [1593–1636]); Cinotti 1983, p. 433 (1619–20); Marini 1989, p. 530; Puglisi 1998 at no. 73.

C.3

Indianapolis, Indianapolis Museum of Art; lent by G. H. Clowes Fund

Oil on canvas, 25¾ x 41½ in. (65.4 x 105.4 cm)

Provenance:

Private collection, Ireland; New York market.

Exhibitions:

Indianapolis 1959 (as attributed); Detroit 1965, no. 4 (as attributed); New York 1968–69 (as attributed); Milan 2001, pp. 480–81 (as attributed); Düsseldorf 2006 cat. no. 2 (original 1594–95).

Bibliography:

Friedlaender 1955, p. 212, no. 38B (autograph replica); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 341 (copy); Jullian 1961; Moir 1965 (dubious); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 87 (copy in Indianapolis private collection); Kitson 1969, no. 86 (copy); Borea 1970 no. 2 (copy by Gentileschi?); Salerno 1970, pp. 236, 241; Moir 1967, I, pp. 55 n. 139, 56, II, fig. 111; Moir 1976, p. 102 n. 42d, 133 n. 222 (copy by Caroselli in Florence c. 1610, Ottani identifies the painting with one by Pietro Paolini); Nicolson 1979, p. 41 (copy); Cinotti 1983, p. 433 (copy); Marini 1989, pp. 530, 532;

Lapucci in *Florence-Rome* 1991, pp. 311–16; Macioce 1994, pp. 207–28; Spike 2001, cat. no. 64.c.2 (copy); Sebreondi in *Naples-London* 2004–5, pp. 118 (as copy); Sciberras in *Milan* 2005, p. 166; Marini 2005, pp. 391–92, 542–44; Hartje in *Düsseldorf* 2006, cat. no. 2 (1594–95); Clark 2007, pp. 70–71, no. 6 (?); Sciberras in *Valletta* 2007, p. 40 (copy, painted in Florence, directly rebuts Marini’s attribution as first version).

C.4

Orazio Fidani

Florence, Private collection

Oil on canvas, 30¼ x 40¼ in. (76.8 x 102.2 cm)

Signed and dated 1632

Bibliography:

Sebreondi 2005, pp. L, LVII nos. 83–84. fig. 5.

65. *Saint John the Baptist at the Source*, c. 1608

Oil on canvas, 18 x 25⅞ in. (45.5 x 65.5 cm)

Private collection, Switzerland

Provenance:

Private collection, Rome; Roman art market, 1993; exported from Italy c. 1998.

Exhibitions:

Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 21; *Trapani* 2007 cat. no. 17.

Bibliography:

Porcella n.d. [1969], p. 13 (as Caravaggio); Marini 1974, p. 249 (as copy E.1); Moir 1976, pp. 120 no. 123a, 161–62 n. 289 (“Porcella’s illustration of the painting is not very good; but

the painting is evidently from the inner circle of Caravaggio's followers [Valentin or Caracciolo or their ateliers] and could conceivably be a drastically damaged [and reduced?] and clumsily repainted original"); Marini 1989, pp. 532–33 (copy, Neapolitan, repainted, lists dimensions as 90 x 68 cm and lacking the upper zone and the first plane); Gregori 1993, pp. 3–21 (Caravaggio, 1608–9); Schneider 1993, pp. 21–23; Gregori 1994, p. 154, no. 76 (c. 1607); Gregori 1998, pp. 3–14; Puglisi 1998, no. 78 (attributed, c. 1608–9); Spike 2001, p. 224, cat. no. 65 (c. 1608); Gregori in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 153–54, cat. no. 21 ("new proposals"); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 175, 181 no. 25; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 121 (reject both this and Bonello version); Varriano 2006, 68, fig. 56 (illustrates Bonello collection); Gregori in Trapani 2007 cat. no. 17, pp. 292–99; Kliemann in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 189 (as attributed); von Rosen in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 70 (autograph; leaves status open of Bonello version).

A small painting of the young John the Baptist drinking at a spring must have been executed at one of the stopovers—Malta or Sicily—in the last two years of Caravaggio's life. By any other painter, the work would qualify as a sketch, brushed in so rapidly and so summarily as to look unfinished in the hands and chest, indeed in almost every part except for the boy's face.

The attribution to Caravaggio by Porcella (c. 1969) was ignored by authorities until the painting was cleaned and restored by Thomas Schneider in 1992. The motif was already known from the version in the Bonello collection in Malta. As Gregori (1993) notes, the known paintings of this composition have sometimes been hypothetically associated with the picture of this subject that Caravaggio was carrying with him to Rome at the time of his death (cf. Marini 1974, no. P-34, p. 478).

The painting was surely executed in Caravaggio's last years 1607 to 1610, perhaps in Malta, given its subject and the existence of an old copy in that country.

See p. 224.

Condition:

Good, apart from some damage to the hand holding the cross. Pentimenti have been observed especially in the fingers. See Gregori and Schneider 1993 for photographs during restoration.

Copy:

C. I

Valletta, Malta, Bonello collection

Oil on canvas, 39¼ x 28¾ in. (100 x 73 cm)

Provenance:

Noble Maltese family; Cavaliere Vincenzo Bonello, Valletta, Malta; his heirs.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1951, no. 21, p. 34, fig. 14 (possibly Caravaggio's last work, 1610); Longhi 1952, p. 46, fig. 35; Mahon 1952, p. 19 n. 95 ("appears, from what little one can see in the reproduction, to have a reasonable claim to be a very late work"); Grassi 1953, p. 119; Baumgart 1955, no. 24 (school?), p. 20 (1607–10); Baumgart 1958, p. 122 (motif imitated by Cecco and other Caravaggists); Wagner 1958, p. 234 (rejects); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 328, 375; Longhi 1960, p. 36 n. 13; Jullian 1961, pp. 193, 196 n. 66–68, 232 (doubtful, 1610); Bottari 1966, p. 39 (reference in letter of 1610); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 96 (1610); Kitson 1969, no. 95; Cinotti 1971, p. 203 n. 58 (possibly late); Marini 1974, pp. 441–42, no. 78 (autograph but repainted); Röttgen 1974, p. 158 (the lament of Caravaggio in extremis); Moir 1976, pp. 120, no. 123, 161–62 no. 123 (knows only from poor photograph); Nicolson 1979, p. 33 (uncertain); Spear 1979, p. 318 (copy); Cinotti 1983, no. 77 (attributed); Marini 1989, pp. 532–33, no. 86 (Malta 1608); Bologna 1992, p. 345 (1610); Gregori 1993, p. 4; Pacelli 1994, p. 158 (known from photograph only); Pacelli 1994, p. 158 (known from photograph only); Robb 1998, pp. 424, 516 (1608); Spike 2001, p. 224, cat. no. 65.c.1; Pagano and Utili in *Naples-London 2004–5*, pp. 175, 181 no. 24; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 121 (reject); Varriano 2006, 68, fig. 56; Kliemann in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 181–215, at p. 189 (publishes Bonello and a small version in the Galleria Estense, Modena, as copies); von Rosen in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 59–85 ("which of the two versions, that at Malta and the other at Rome, will be considered the original?").

66. *Burial of Saint Lucy*, 1608

Oil on canvas, 160⁵/₈ x 118 in. (408 x 300 cm)

Museo Nazionale di Palazzo Bellomo, Syracuse

Provenance:

Chiesa di Santa Lucia al Sepolcro, Syracuse, high altar.

Sources:

1. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 227): “Having arrived in Syracuse, he made a painting for the church of Santa Lucia, outside the walls by the seashore. He painted the dead saint with a bishop who blesses her; and two men who are digging the earth with their shovels to bury her.” [“Pervenuto in Siracusa, fece il quadro per la Chiesa di Santa Lucia che sta fuori alla Marini: dipinse la Santa morta col Vescovo, che la benedice; e vi sono due che scavano la terra con la pala per sepelierla.”]

2. Susinno 1724 (ed. 1960, p. 110): Mario Minniti, recalls that Caravaggio in Syracuse proposed to the city, “a large canvas of the virgin and Sicilian martyr, Saint Lucy. Today admired in the church of the Reformed Franciscans, the cadaver of the saint lies on the ground as the bishop and the people come for her burial, two laborers, the principal figures in the work, one on each side, dig with shovels to prepare the grave in which she will be placed.” [“una grande tela della vergine e martire di S. Lucia siciliana. Oggi giorno ammirasi nella chiesa de’Padri Riformati di S. Francesco, dedicata il dipintore fece il cadavere della martire disteso in terra, mentre il vescovo con il popolo viene per sepelirlo e due facchini, figure principali dell’opera, una di una parte ed una dall’altra, con pale in azzione che fanno un fosso acciò in esso lo collochino.”]

3. Capodieci, *Antichi Monumenti di Siracusa*, II, p. 364, as by Caravaggio.

Exhibitions:

Rome 1948, no. 2; Milan 1951, no. 41; Palermo 1952; Syracuse 1984–85; Palermo 2001, cat. no. 1; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 10; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.11; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 11; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 11.

Bibliography:

Rouchés 1920, pp. 104–6; Mauceri 1922, pp. 585–86; Marangoni 1922, pp. 16, 49; Longhi 1926 [*Opere complete*, II, p. 31]; Schudt 1942, no. 63–64; Argan in Rome 1948, no. 2; Berenson 1951, pp. 39–40, 57–58; Mahon 1951, pp. 232 n. 90, 234 (1608); Longhi 1952, p. 44 (ruined state); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1608); Hinks 1953, no. 63; Baumgart 1955, no. 57; Friedlaender 1955, p. 213, no. 39 (very bad condition, late 1608); Wagner 1958, pp. 153–55, 167–68, 222–23 n. 663–65; Wittkower 1958, pp. 25–26; Steinberg 1959, p. 187; Jullian 1961, pp. 188–89; Moir 1967, I, p. 12, 183, II, pp. 127, 140; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 88 (1608); Kitson 1969, no. 87; Cinotti 1971, pp. 83–84, 138–39, 201; Röttgen 1974, p. 254 n. 179; Marini 1974, pp. 45–46, 76–77, 443–44 n. 80; Moir 1976, pp. 102 no. 43, 133–34 n. 223 (severely damaged condition, possible assistance from Minniti); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Zuccari 1981, pp. 92–105; Marini 1982, pp. 79–80 (1608); Moir 1982, p. 154 (1608–9); Cinotti 1983, no. 66 (first work done in Sicily after Caravaggio fled Malta, October 6, 1608); Hibbard 1983, pp. 235–40, 327–28 (1608); Barbera and Cordaro in *Caravaggio in Sicilia* 1984, no. 8; Zuccari 1984, pp. 147–52; Pacelli in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 81–103; Zuccari in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 147–73; Marini 1989, pp. 534–36, n. 88 (Siracusa, after October 6, 1608); Bologna 1992, p. 338 (1608); Gregori 1994, p. 154, no. 77 (c. 1608–9); Pacelli 1994, pp. 85–87 (1608); Zuccari in Macioce 1996, pp. 295–96; Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50; Langdon 1998, pp. 368–69; Puglisi 1998, no. 74 (1608); Robb 1998, p. 517 (1608); Barbera in Palermo 2001, pp. 106–8, cat. no. 1; Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 8–10; Spike 2001, pp. 214–28, cat. no. 66 (1608); Barbera 2003, pp. 20–25; Barbera in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 122–24, cat. no. 10 (autumn 1608); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 175, 181 no. 26; Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, cat. no. I.11; Sgarbi 2005, no. 64 (end 1608); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 12, 34, 108, 113, 115, fig. 17; Varriano 2006, pp. 14, 48, 110–12, 116, 144 n.68, fig. 43; Debono 2007, p. 20 ill.; Marini in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 11, pp. 256–63 (Syracuse after October 6, 1608); Marini in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 11 pp. 270–77 (Syracuse after October 6, 1608); Papa 2008, pp. 208–9 (1608–9).

Bellori's brief notice of the *Burial of Saint Lucy* is valuable for its confirmation that Caravaggio painted this altarpiece in the brief interval between his October flight from Malta and his arrival in Messina by December 6, 1608. The painting is unfortunately in very poor condition; the original effect of its penumbral lighting was probably analogous to the *Beheading of Saint John the Baptist* in Valletta. Marini (1989) published a precise copy of fine quality (c.2, below) which preserves many details no longer visible in the altarpiece, among them, the reinforced wooden door at left and the armor of the soldier at right.

Caravaggio arrived in Syracuse in 1608, at which time the church of Saint Lucy, the city's patron saint, was undergoing renovation and a new altarpiece was needed. The unusual subject was dictated by the church's situation on top of the catacombs where the virgin martyr was laid after her death during the persecution of Diocletian, c. 304.

Most of the details in the composition have been lost to severe abrasion of the canvas surface. The two massive gravediggers bend over a dark hole that is now barely visible. The maiden's lifeless hand once grasped a martyr's palm. Despite its damaged surface, the picture retains its expressive force.

One of the diggers pauses to look up. His gaze leads us across the picture to the right side where two figures of authority are issuing their contradictory commands. The Roman consul, wearing an armor breastplate, directs the diggers to their work. Behind his shadowy figure, a descending ray of light picks out a bishop's white miter, face, and hands. This early Christian prelate is solemnly blessing the little martyr.

The light filtering through the penumbra carries the same message as the beam of light in the painting that most resembles this one, the *Calling of Saint Matthew*. It is the light of grace. Caravaggio invariably lit his figures from the left side except in four paintings only: the *Burial of Saint Lucy*, the *Calling of Saint Matthew*, and both the first and second *Conversion of Saint Paul* for the Cerasi Chapel. The theme of spiritual conversion is what these pictures have in common. In the *Burial of Saint Lucy* it is a gravedigger who lifts his head to discover that his orders have been altered by the Divine. A providential light of benediction shines on his face. His companion does not see and sinks ever deeper into his earthen grave.

See pp. 214–28.

Condition:

Poor, with extensive loss of pigment along the lower margin in particular. The large painting has undergone many restorations since the eighteenth century in well-meaning efforts to arrest its deterioration, caused no doubt by its exposure over the high altar of a maritime sanctuary. The thin execution of Caravaggio's late style, and his preference for fragile dark pigments, are particularly vulnerable to adverse conditions.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

Madrid, Collection of Juan Gaspar Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and Admiral of Castile.

Inventory:

I. September 25–October 21, 1691: Inventory taken at death of tenth Almirante de Castilla, with appraisal beginning November 19, 1691: Under list for *Caravaggio, Michelangelo Merisi da (copy after)*: “Santa Lucia” “Saavedra Guzmán” “15:0005” (Burke–Cherry 1997, pp. 892–93, 1095).

II. Selected copy is listed by Moir 1976, p. 102, nos. 43a–c; Marini 1989, p. 292.

C. 2

Rome, private collection

Oil on copper, 16 x 13³/₈ in. (40.6 x 34 cm)

Bibliography:

Marini 1989, p. 292 reproduction.

To judge from the photograph, this contemporary copy is attributable to Mario Minniti, who was reported to have met with Caravaggio in Syracuse. The facial types are reminiscent of Carlo Saraceni's, whose influence appears in other documented works of Minniti.

67. *Raising of Lazarus*, 1608–9

Oil on canvas, 149⁵/₈ x 108¹/₄ in. (380 x 275 cm)

Museo Regionale, Messina, Italy

Provenance:

Commissioned by G. B. de Lazzari, a merchant, for his chapel in the church of the Crociferi; until 1866 when removed during the suppression of the religious convents; 1879, entered Museo Civico of Messina; transferred after earthquake of 1908.

Documents:

1. December 6, 1608: Contract of commission according to which the principal chapel of the church formerly known as Saints Peter and Paul of the Pisani and maintained by the Padri Crociferi was ceded in perpetuity to the Genoese merchant Giovan Battista de' Lazzari, resident of the city, who agreed to build a chapel with an altarpiece showing the Madonna, Saint John the Baptist, and other saints (Saccà 1906–7, pp. 66–69, destroyed by earthquake of 1908, formerly in Messina, *Archivio Storico, Atti del notaio Giuseppe Plutino*, December 6, 1608, Cinotti 1983, p. 459).

2. June 10, 1609: Consignment by Caravaggio, Knight of Malta, of a Resurrection of Lazarus “with an image of Our Lord Jesus Christ and of Saint Martha and Mary Magdalen and others by the hand of fr. Michelangeli Caravagio Knight of the Order of Jerusalem . . .” The painting consigned was of a different subject than that G. B. de Lazzari agreed to provide the previous December [“in quo quatuor fuit et est depincta resurrectio Lazzari cum imagine domini nostri Jesu Christi et cum imaginibus Martae et Magdalenae et aliorum in numero personarum

tres etc. picturundis manu fr. Michelangeli Caravagio militis Gerosolimitani . . .”] (Saccà 1906/7, pp. 66–69; Cinotti 1983, p. 459; Macioce 2003, p. 251, doc 387; Terzaghi 2007, p. 286 publishes a revised date of July 7, 1609).

Sources:

1. Maurolico 1613, p. 427: “In Messina, the church of San Pietro, originally the Chiesa de’ Pisani and later a parish, is celebrated for the Oratorio de’ Medici dedicated to saints Cosma and Damian, and for the Resurrection of Lazarus by the hand of Caravaggio” (Ruvulo 1988, p. 134).
2. Samperi 1654, p. 615: “Michael Angelus Caravagius, celebrated painter in all Italy in his time, who came to Messina and left two examples of his noble genius, one in the church of Saints Peter and Paul of the regular Pisan clerics, the ministers of the ill, namely Lazarus called back to life by the Lord Christ . . . both held in great esteem.” [“Michael Angelus Caravagius, Pictor tota Italia praestantissimus eo tempore, quo Messanae versatus est, duo nobilissimi ingenii sui reliquit pignora, unum in templo S. Petri et Pauli et Pauli Pisanorum Clericorum Regularium Ministrantius infirmis hoc est Lazzari a Christo Domino in vitam revocati . . . utraque in magno pretio habita.”]
3. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 227): “Next he went to Messina, . . . and in the church of the Ministri de gl’infermi he made the Resurrection of Lazarus, who is held outside the tomb and opens his arms at the sound of the voice of Christ who calls him and extends his hand towards him. Martha weeps, the Magdalen marvels, and there is a man who puts his hand to his nose to protect himself from the stench of the corpse. The painting is large and the figures are placed within the cave, with the strongest light on the nude figure of Lazarus and of those who support him. The painting is most highly esteemed for the power of its realism.” [“Passando egli dopo a Messina, . . . e nella Chiesa de’ Ministri de gl’infermi, nella cappella de’ signori Lazzari, la Risurrezzione di Lazzaro, il quale sustentato fuori del sepolcro, apre le braccia alla voce di Cristo che lo chiama e stende verso di lui la mano. Piange Marta e si maraviglia Madalena, e vi è uno che si pone la mano al naso per ripararsi del fetore del cadavero. Il quadro è grande e le figure hanno il campo d’una grotta, col maggior lume sopra l’ignudo di Lazzaro e di quelli che lo reggono, ed è sommamente in istima per la forze dell’imitazione.”]

4. Susinno 1724 (1960, pp. 110–12): “Certain rich gentlemen of the Lazzaro family, desiring to erect a new chapel at the high altar of the church of the Crucifer Fathers, decided to commission this large canvas from this virtuoso, with whom a price was agreed of 1,000 scudi. The painter depicted the Resurrection of Lazarus, a theme alluding to their house. The aforesaid gentlemen were pleased to enlarge the space so that the artist would be able to successfully execute his invention . . . Putting his hand to the work, he made at right the Savior seen from the back, with the apostles, in the act of calling to the spirit already departed from the deceased and shrouded Lazarus. In the middle two laborers raise a great stone. The cadaver of Lazarus is seen in the arms of another laborer and he seems as though he wishes to awake. To the left of Lazarus’s head are his astonished sisters who observe their awakening brother. In the faces of the sisters Michele represented the most beautiful ideas of beauty.” [“Dovendosi da certi signori ricchi di casa Lazzaro erger una nuova cappella nell’altare maggiore della Chiesa de’ Padri Crociferi, pensarono commettere la gran tela a questo virtuoso, con cui si agiustarono pel prezzo di mille scudi. Il pittore ideossi la Resurrezione di Lazzaro, pensiero allusivo al loro casato. N’ebbero i predetti signori molto gradimento, imperoche aveva l’artefice aperto campo da potervi felicemente condurre la sua ideata fantasia . . . Dato di mano all’opera fece nella parte destra il Salvatore voltato di schiena, con gli apostoli in atto di chiamare nel defonto e quattriduoano Lazzaro lo spirito già partito, e nel mezzo sonovi due facchini che alzano una gran lapide. Il cadavero di Lazzaro vedesi in braccio ad un altro facchino, e sembra come volesse svegliarsi. Da capo del Lazzaro nella parte sinistra, vi sono le sorelle che istupidite osservano il fratello che si sveglia. Ne’ visaggi delle sorelle Michele rappresento le più belle idee delle bellezza . . .”]

5. Hackert 1792, p. 27.

Exhibitions:

Naples 1938; Milan 1951, no. 43; Bordeaux 1955; Paris 1965; Syracuse 1984–85; Palermo 2001, cat. no. 2; Rome-Milan-Vicenza, 2004; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 11; Milan 2005, I.13; Athens 2006, cat. no. 1; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 12; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 12; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

La Farina 1840; Saccà 1906, pp. 66–69; Posse 1911, pp. 571; Witting 1916, pp. 45, 72; Rouchés 1920, p. 109 (imitator); Venturi 1921 (with reserve); Voss 1924, p. 446 (not reproduced); Mauceri 1925, p. 562 (only design by Caravaggio, executed by another, Minniti?); Pevsner 1928/29, p. 387 (old copy?); Bottari 1935, pp. 39–47; Oertel in Naples 1938, p. 228; Schudt 1942, no. 67; Longhi 1943, p. 15; Arslan 1951 (1600); Berenson 1951, pp. 40–41; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 43; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1609); Brandi in Urbani 1951, pp. 61–62 (at least two collaborators, Minniti and a Fleming); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1609); Hinks 1953, no. 65; Ainaud 1955, pp. 22–25 (major work); Baumgart 1955, no. 58 (1609); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 213–15, no. 40 (1609); Argan 1956, p. 37; Wagner 1958, pp. 156–58; Wittkower 1958, pp. 25–28; Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 165–66; Jullian 1961, pp. 189–95; Spear 1965, pp. 65–70 (publishes documents to establish authenticity); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 89 (1609); Moir 1967, I, p. 183, II, p. 57; Kitson 1969, no. 88; Röttgen 1969, pp. 157–59; Argan 1970, p. 201; Salerno 1970, pp. 238, 243; Calvesi 1971, pp. 120, 124; Cinotti 1971, pp. 84, 139–40, 161; Röttgen 1973, p. 40; Gregori 1974, p. 47; Marini 1974, pp. 50–51, 260–63, 445–47 n. 82; Moir 1976, pp. 102–3, no. 44; Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Zuccari 1981, pp. 103–5; Marini 1982, pp. 81–82 (1608–9); Cinotti 1983, no. 30; Moir 1982, p. 156 (1609); Hibbard 1983, pp. 240–45 (1609); Maugeri in *Caravaggio in Sicily* 1984, no. 9; Pacelli 1987, p. 96; Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 21–22; Marini 1989, pp. 536–39, no. 89 (Messina, 1608–before June 10 1609); Calvesi 1990, pp. 173–74, 228–39; Posèq 1990², p. 164 n. 8 (“The central group seems to have been derived from a Hadriatic sarcophagus acquired by the Medici in 1584. The scene in the painting is similar to a sculptured group representing Menelaus carrying the body of Patroclus”); Bologna 1992, pp. 338–39 (1608–9); Campagna Cicala in *Messina. Museo Regionale* 1992, pp. 115–16; Gregori 1994, p. 154, no. 78 (c. 1608–9); Lapucci 1994, pp. 17–37; Pacelli 1994, pp. 88–90 (before June 1609); Gilbert 1995, p. 192; Prater 1995, pp. 59–60; Spadaro 1995; Tremblay in Macioce 1996, pp. 309–14; Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, p. 5 (completed June 1609); Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50; Langdon 1998, pp. 370–73; Puglisi 1998, no. 76 (1608–9); Robb 1998, p. 517 (1609); Varriano in Mormando 1999, p. 202 (1609); Pupillo in Palermo 2001, pp. 109–11, cat. no. 2; Spike 2001, pp. 219–21, cat. no. 67 (1608–9); Macioce 2003, pp. 249–50, II, doc. 283, pp. 251–52, II, doc. 387; Boccoardo in Rome-Milan-Vicenza, 2004; Zeffi in Rome-Milan-Vicenza, 2004, p. 123 (1609); Barbera in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 125–26, cat. no. 11; Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 175, 182 no. 27; Sgarbi 2005, no. 65; Sgarbi

in Milan 2005, p. 30 (1609); Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, cat. no. I.13; Caretta and Sgarbi in Athens 2006, cat. no. 1 (1608–9); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 87, 109, 113, 115, fig. 36; Tresoldi 2006, p. 107 (1608–9); Debono 2007, p. 21 ill.; Langdon in Valletta 2007, p. 216, note 45; Marini in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 12, pp. 264–73 (Messina, 1608–9 before June 10); Marini in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 12, pp. 278–87 (1608 before June 10, 1609); Terzaghi 2007, pp. 284–87 (1609, connects Lazzari commission with Ottavio Costa); Papa 2008, pp. 208–11 (1608–9); Spadaro 2008, pp. 89–101, 113–14; Barbera in Rome 2009, pp. 156–59.

Bellori published a fine description of this altarpiece. If early in the twentieth century an astute observer like Pevsner harbored doubts about the painting's authenticity, it can only be because the painting was obscured by dirt and old repaints. The contractual documents published by Saccà permit the dating of this extraordinary masterpiece between December 1608 and June 1609.

Christ's command (Come forth!) and Lazarus's outstretched arms are recovered from the *Calling* and the *Martyrdom of Saint Matthew* for use in the *Raising of Lazarus*, which incorporates in a single composition the Contarelli themes of grace and life after death. Christ enters the Messina altarpiece from the opposite, left side; the hand he extends again resembles the hand of God the Creator on the Sistine Chapel ceiling—though seen from the back. A few paces away Lazarus receives this grace. At the same time his finger “touches” the brow of a bystander whose uplifted face is suffused with light: in that instant he understands and is saved.

In the shadows below Christ's hand are seen two hands clasped in prayer. They belong to the young witness who gazes toward the light that issues from behind Christ's shoulders. His hopeful profile is believed to be the artist's self-portrait.

See text pp. 219–21.

Condition:

Good. The dark pigments and fragile execution of Caravaggio's technique perplexed local restorers. Susinno records an attempt at cleaning in 1671 in which the restorer was horrified to touch his wet rag to the canvas and see it turn black. The paint surface was thereafter “easily”

restored by a committee of painters. Reflectography and radiography executed by Maurizio Seracini and Editech Laboratory in 1990 and 1993 revealed incisions along the body and the shroud of Lazarus. See Lapucci 1994 for a complete condition report.

Copies:

None recorded.

68. *Adoration of the Shepherds*, 1609

Oil on canvas, 123⁵/₈ x 83 in. (314 x 211 cm)

Museo Regionale, Messina, inv. 403 [983]

Provenance:

Church of Santa Maria la Concezione, Messina, main altar; 1887 moved to Museo Civico of Messina; after the earthquake of 1908 to its present location.

Sources:

1. Samperi 1644, p. 143; “On the high altar of the devoted church of the Capuchin fathers is revered the marvelous painting of the Madonna del Parto by the excellent painter Michelangelo da Caravaggio, esteemed by experts as something extraordinary, at least as regards his skill”(Cinotti 1983, p. 457; Marini 1989, p. 539).

2. Samperi 1654, p. 615: “Michael Angelus Caravagius, celebrated painter in all Italy in his time, who came to Messina and left two examples of his noble genius, one in the church of Saints Peter and Paul . . . the other, in the house of the Capuchin ‘Christ the Lord of the Nativity,’ both held in great esteem.” [“Michael Angelus Caravagius, Pictor tota Italia praestantissimus eo tempore, quo Messanae versatus est, duo nobilissimi ingenii sui reliquit pignora, unum in templo S. Petri et Pauli et Pauli . . . alterum in aede Cappuccinorum ‘Christi Domini Natalitorum’ utraque in magno pretio habita.”]

3. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 227): “Next he went to Messina where he painted a Nativity for the church of the Capuchins; the Virgin and Child are outside a dilapidated shed with its boards and rafters rotting; Saint Joseph leans on his staff while the shepherds adore the Child.” [“Passando egli dopo a Messina, colori a’ Cappuccini il quadro della Natività, figuratavi la Vergine col Bambino fuori la capanna rotta e disfatta d’assi, e di travi; e vi è San Giuseppe appoggiato al bastone con alcuni pasatori in adorazione.”]

4. D’Ambrosio 1685: “that admirable picture” [“la mirabile pittura”].

5. Susinno 1724 (1960 ed., pp. 113–14): “Moreover, knowing of the good work by Caravaggio, the senate of Messina commissioned a large canvas for the high altar of the church of the Capuchin Fathers in the same city. In this canvas is shown the *Nativity of Our Lord* with full-size figures. It is, in my opinion, among his best works, because in this the great naturalist does not cleverly paint the canvas with patches of color, but makes it natural without fierce shadows. . . . This single great work will be remembered in the centuries to come, for its distance from dryness and deep shadows. In the foreground one sees a basket with carpenter’s tools alluding to Saint Joseph, in the half distance, at right, the Virgin is seen reclining on the ground and gazing lovingly at the Child Jesus wrapped in cloths, caressing him. She leans on a manger behind which the animals graze; at left, at the Virgin’s feet, Saint Joseph sits pensively in handsome drapery, close to him the three shepherds adore the newborn child, the first, with a staff in hand, is dressed in white, the second adores with his hands joined together, with a naked shoulder that seems living flesh; and finally the third admiring, with his bald head, is miraculous. The remainder of this canvas consists of a black area with rustic wooden boards that compose the hut, in fact the background was too high and a large piece was cut in order to fit the canvas in the chapel.” [“Inoltrossi vieppù del Caravaggio il concetto, colla sperienza del suo ben operare, di modo che il senato di Messina gli commise una gran tela per l’altare maggiore della Chiesa de’Padri Capuccini della medesima citta. In questa tela sta figurato il Natale di Nostro Signore, con figura al naturale e tra le opere sue a mio credere questa si é la migliore, perché in esse questo gran naturalista fuggi quel tingere di macchia, furbesco, ma rimostrossi naturale senza quella fierezza d’ombre . . . Questa sola grand’opera l’averebbe reso memorabile ne’ secoli a venire, come lontano affato dalle seccaggini e dagli oscuri cotanto gagliardi. Vedesi quivi nel piano terreno una sporta con strumenti di falegname alludenti a

S. Giuseppe, nel secondo nella parte destra si vede distesa a terra la Vergina che vagheggia il pargoletto Gesù involto tra panni, facendogli vezzi. Ella sta appoggiata ad un fenile, dietro cui gli animali che vi pascono; nella sinistra parte, a pie' della Vergine, vi sta S. Giuseppe sedente pensoso in vaga panneggiatura ed in appresso li tre pastori che adorano il nato bambino, il primo con bastone in mano vestito di panno bianco, il secondo in atto adorante colle mani giunte, con una spalla ignuda che rassembra di viva carne; e per fine il terzo ammirative, con testa calva, ch'è miracolosa. Il rimanente di questa tela consiste in campo nero con legni rustici che compongono la capanna; anzi il campo era più alto e ne fu tagliato un gran pezzo per potersi incastrare nella cappella.”]

6. Hackert 1792, pp. 45–46: “It is here convenient to write a few words on the fatal sojourn of Caravaggio in Messina where he stayed for over a year after his return from Malta. The Senate of Messina immediately hired him to paint a canvas of the Nativity for the church of the Capuchin which is one of his best works, and for which he was paid 1,000 scudi, and of other works whether for churches or for particular citizens, but his violent nature caused him to gravely wound a schoolteacher for little cause and he was obliged to flee.” [“Cade qui acconcio far parola del soggiorno fatale del Caravaggio in Messina per più di un anno e cio fu dopo il suo ritorno da Malta. Ei fu dal Senato di Messina immediatamente impiegato a dipingere la tela della Natività nella chiesa de' Cappuccini, che é una delle migliori su opere, avendone riportato un compenso di mille scudi lavoró ancora della altre opere sia per chiese, che per particolari cittadini, ma il suo naturale violento e risoso lo porto a ferir gravamente un maestro di scuola per lieve cagione e piero fu costretto a fuggirse.”]

Exhibitions:

Naples 1938; Milan 1951, no. 42; Palermo 1952; Syracuse 1984–85; Palermo 2001, cat. no. 3; Syracuse 2003; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 12; Milan 2005, cat. no. I.12; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 13; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 13.

Bibliography:

Grosso Cacopardo 1821, p. 80; Saccà 1906/7, pp. 49–50; Posse 1911, pp. 571–73; Witting 1916, pp. 45, 72; Rouchés 1920, pp. 109–10; Mauceri 1921–22, pp. 581–82; Voss 1924, p. 445;

Longhi 1928/29, pp. 272–73; Schudt 1942, p. 52, pl. 68; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 42; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1609); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1609); Friedlaender 1955, p. 216, no. 41; Jullian 1961 (1609–10); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 90 (1609); Kitson 1969, no. 89; Marini 1974, pp. 51–52, 264–67, 447–49 n. 83 (after *Resurrection*); Moir 1976, p. 103, no. 45; Marini 1982, p. 78 (1609); Spadaro and Maugeri in *Caravaggio in Sicily*, 1984, no. 10; Natoli in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, p. 224; Pacelli in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 81–103; Marini 1989, pp. 539–40, n. 90 (Messina, 1609); Bologna 1992, p. 339 (1609); Gregori 1994, p. 154, no. 79 (1609); Lapucci 1994; Pacelli 1994, pp. 87–88 (1609); Sciuti et al. in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 69–85; Langdon 1998, p. 384; Puglisi 1998, no. 77 (1608–9); Robb 1998, p. 518 (1609); Varriano in Mormando 1999, p. 203; Pupillo in Palermo 2001, pp. 112–14, cat. no. 3; Spike 2001, pp. 227–29, cat. no. 68 (1609); Pupillo in Syracuse 2003, pp. 26–29; Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 123 (1609); Barbera in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 127–29, cat. no. 12; Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 175, 182 no. 28; Caretta and Sgarbi in Milan 2005, pp. 170–71, cat. no. I.12; Sgarbi 2005, no. 66 (1609); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 31 (1609); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 12, 109, 115, fig.7; Tresoldi 2006, p. 106 (1609); Varriano 2006, pp. 48, 112, 120, fig. 90; Marini in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 13, pp. 274–79 (Messina 1609); Marini in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 13 pp. 288–93 (Messina, 1609); Papa 2008, pp. 212–13 (1609); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82.

For the Franciscans of Messina, Caravaggio painted his own altarpiece with a deep foreground, composed entirely of humble earth. The Virgin Mary seated on the ground signifies the devotion to the Madonna of Humility. Brown earth colors, the dust of creation, are everywhere in the composition. Dante associated Mary with *terra*, the clay of the New Creation in the *Paradiso*, canto XIII:82, as translated by John Ciardi:

As once a quickening of the dust of earth
issued forth the form of animate perfection
so once the Virgin womb quickened toward birth

*Così fu fatta già la terra degna
di tutta l'animal perfezione;
così fu fatta la Vergine pregna*

Apart from Bellori's fine description, contemporary accounts of this altarpiece for the Capuchin church in Messina are lacking. According to Susinno (1724), Caravaggio received the commission and impressive fee of 1,000 scudi from the Senate of Messina, acting on the advice of the city's archbishop Fra Bonaventura Secusio. The notably refined execution of this altarpiece implicitly supports this report of an important commission, most likely dating from 1609.

See pp. 227–29.

Condition:

Very good. The painting was restored in 1950–51. Susinno (1724) wrote that the canvas was significantly cut along its upper edge to fit into its space. However, the composition does not seem truncated, as Moir (1989) noted. See Lapucci 1994 for a complete condition report and the radiography, infrared and reflectography executed by Maurizio Seracini in 1990 and 1993.

Copy:

C. I

Engraving by Placido Donia published in Samperi 1644.

C. 2

Catania, Museo Civico di Castello Ursino, inv. 2477

Oil on canvas, 110¼ x 82⅝ in. (280 x 210 cm)

Provenance:

Copy of Caravaggio original commissioned by Gaspare Orioles, Count of Bastiglia and Baron of Fontanafredda, together with Raphael's *Spasimo di Sicilia*, in 1627. In some manner probably came into the Collection of President of the Supreme Court of Justice of Palermo, G. B.

Finocchiaro, who bequeathed his collection to the commune of Catania in 1826. Placed on deposit with the Prefettura when rediscovered in museum storage in 1954.

Exhibitions:

Palermo 2001, cat. no. 12; Naples 2004-London 2005.

Bibliography:

Davì in Palermo 2001, p. 122; Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 132–34, cat. no. 12 (attr. Paolo Geraci, first half of seventeenth century, with previous bibliography); Abbate in Naples-London 2004–5, p. 170 (Paolo Geraci).

69. *Salomé with the Head of Saint John the Baptist*, 1609–10

Oil on canvas, 45³/₄ x 55 in. (116 x 140 cm)

Palacio Reale, Madrid

Provenance:

Spanish royal collection, Alcázar, Madrid, by 1666; transferred to the Palacio Real after 1734; transferred to the Casita del Principe, El Escorial, by 1849; transferred to the Palacio Reale by 1970.

Inventories:

The early provenance of the painting is disputed:

1. Battisti (1955, pp. 174–77) and Harris (1974, p. 236) identify this with a painting of this subject without attribution to artist in the 1636 inventory of the Alcázar Real of Madrid.
2. Milicua (in Madrid 1999) identifies this with a painting of this subject in the January 1657 inventory of the possessions in Naples of Garcia de Avellaneda y Haro, Count of Castrillo:

“No. 91, a painting of the beheading of Saint John with a woman receiving the head of the saint, and an old woman at her side six palmi with a black frame original by Caravaggio” [“Un quadro della degollación de San Juan con la mujer que recibe la cabeza del Santo el Berdugo y una vieja al lado de seis palmos con marco negro de peral soriginal de Caravacho”].

3. 1666: Inventory of the Alcázar Real of Madrid, Audience room: “In the Audience Room, no. 242 another painting by Caravaggio of the beheading of Saint John the Baptist, one vara and a quarter 100 ducados of silver” [“Cuarto bajo. Pieza primera donde daba Su. Mgd. audiencia n. 242 Otra [pintura] del Caravacho de la degollación de S. Joa Bautista de vara y quarta en 100 ducados de plato”].

4. 1686: Inventory of Pictures in Alcázar Real de Madrid, Royal Audience Room, “In the large audience room, another painting of the beheading of Saint John the Baptist, 1½ vara long by 1¼ vara wide, by Carabacho” [“Quarto Bajo Pieza Primera donde dava su Mag[esta] d audiencia. Mas sele carga otra Pintura de la Degollacion de S[an] Juan Bautista de vara y media de largo y de alto vara y quarta de mano de Carabacho”] (Battisti 1955, pp. 174–77; Harris 1974, p. 236).

5. September 26, 1700: Testament of Carlo II, including paintings in the Alcázar Real de Madrid: “Audience Room, n. 221 . . . a beheading of Saint John the Baptist 1½ vara long by 1¼ high by Carabachos” [“Pieza primera donde daba su Magestad Audiencia, Quarto Vaso . . . n. 221: Iten otra Pintura de la degollacion de San Juan Bap.ta de vara media de largo y vara quarta de alto de mano del Carabachos”] (Battisti 1955, pp. 174–77; Harris 1974, p. 236).

6. December 1734: Inventory of “items saved from the fire in the Alcázar Real of Madrid: n. 876. Saint John the Baptist when Salomé presents his head to Herod, 2 vara long by 1½ high” [“Nuevo Imbentario que se forma de las pinturas que se reserbaron del incendio: n. 876. Otra de la Dollaz.n de S.n Juan Baup.ta quando Herodias presenta la cabeza a Herodes de dos varas de largo y vara y tercia de cahisa”] (Battisti 1955, pp. 174–77; Harris 1974, p. 236).

7. 1794: Inventory of the paintings in the Palacio Real, Madrid, lists two paintings of Salomés with the head of the Baptist [“Herodiadi con la testa del Battista”], n. 354 (anonymous) and n. 834 (copia da Caravaggio) (de Salas 1973, p. 33).

8. 1814: Inventory of paintings in the Palacio Real, Madrid, lists an unattributed “Salomé with the head of the Baptist, her mother and the tyrant n. 354” [“Herodiade con la cabeza del Bautista, su madre y el tirano n. 354”] (de Salas 1973, p. 33).

9. 1849: Inventory of the Escorial, Sala del Barquillo, in the Casita del Principe, as unattributed at n. 702 (Ainaud 1947, pp. 392–93).

10. 1857: Inventory of Poleró y Toledo (1857) recorded as in the Escorial, n. 702, “style of Carabajo.”

Source:

1. Possibly identifiable with Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 228): “He then left the island of Sicily and returned to Naples . . . seeking to placate the Grand Master he sent him as a gift a half-figure of Salomé with the head of the Baptist in a basin.” [“. . . uscì fuori dell’isola [Sicilia] e navigò di nuovo a Napoli, . . . e cercando insieme di placare il Gran Maestro, gli mandò in dono una mezza figura di Erodiade con la testa di San Giovanni nel bacino.”] (Cf: *Salomé with the Head of Saint John the Baptist*, National Gallery, London, cat. no. 58).

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 44bis; Bordeaux 1955, no. 4; Madrid 1970, no. 31; Valletta 1970, no. 230a; Madrid 1970; Seville 1973, no. 1; Madrid 1985; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 138–41; Bergamo 2000, no. 52 (not exhibited); Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 13; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 10.

Bibliography:

Zarco Cuevas 1922 (as school); Longhi 1927¹ [*Opere complete*, 1967, II, p. 124] (“a proud, certainly original work from the master’s last years”; discussed by Bellori, 1609–10); Longhi 1943, pp. 8, 19; Ainaud 1947, pp. 392–93 (not picture cited by Bellori); Arslan 1951, p. 447 (“the master’s contribution is visible in the old woman’s head; a painting perhaps finished by another hand”); Berenson 1951, p. 32 (late Rome, early Naples, period after *Madonna of Loreto*); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 44bis (1609–10); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1607–9) n. 122

(“Subject to what may be revealed by cleaning, there seems to be a good *prima facie* case for regarding this as a late original”); Venturi 1951, no. 40 (1607); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1607); Hinks 1953, no. 55 (follows Mahon, 1607); Battisti 1955, pp. 174–77; Baumgart 1955, no. 52 (c. 1607); Friedlaender 1955, p. 217, no. 43 (second period in Naples, 1609–10; connects to picture discussed by Bellori); Baroni 1956 (first Naples period); Wagner 1958, pp. 119–21, 133–34, 212–13 (late Roman, c. 1606, not cited by Bellori); Longhi 1959, pp. 24–25, 28 (Maltese, 1608–9, revises his opinion and identifies picture described by Bellori with London’s National Gallery [cat. no. 58]); Jullian 1961, pp. 173–74, 177–78 (1607, not cited by Bellori); Bottari 1966 (agrees with Longhi); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 92 (1609, follows Longhi); Moir 1967, I, pp. 19 n. 27, 158, 164, 228–39, II, p. 61 n. 10 (unknown follower of Caravaggio); Kitson 1969, no. 91 (1609, in Escorial, no stylistic differences with London); Bodart 1970, pp. 15, 142; Schleier 1970, p. 346 (first or second Neapolitan period); Calvesi 1971, p. 135; Cinotti 1971, pp. 143–44, 202–3 n. 576–79 (Sicilian period, connects to picture discussed by Bellori); Levey 1971, pp. 53–54 (follows Mahon, described by Bellori, but painted at earlier date, 1607); Causa 1972, p. 963 n. 5 (young Caracciolo?, not the Bellori picture); Spear 1971, p. 4; de Salas 1973, p. 33; Harris 1974, p. 236; Marini 1974, pp. 52, 268, 449–50 n. 84 (late, connects to picture discussed by Bellori); Nicolson 1974, pp. 607–8; Röttgen 1974, p. 209 (not Bellori picture); Moir 1976, pp. 116 no. 102, 135 n. 226, 156–57 n. 273 (doubtful, perhaps Arslan theory, only Salomé’s head by Caravaggio, rest [all or part] by Caracciolo); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Gregori 1982, p. 133 (not Bellori picture); Marini 1982, p. 82 (1609); Cinotti 1983, no. 28 (stylistically, second Naples period or slightly earlier, late Maltese or Sicilian periods); Hibbard 1983, pp. 251, 330–31 (copy or pastiche, Caracciolo?); Gregori 1985, p. 335, n. 96; Calvesi 1986, p. 84 (among last works, 1610); Marini 1989, pp. 540–43, n. 91 (Messina, 1609); Bologna 1992, p. 341 (1609); Bartolomé 1994; Gregori 1994, p. 153, no. 81 (c. 1609); Pacelli 1994, pp. 97–99 (1609–10); Puglisi 1998, no. 84 (c. 1609–10); Robb 1998, p. 518 (1609); Milicua in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 138–41; Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 11–13, fig. nos. 9, 10, 11; Spike 2001, pp. 221–23, cat. no. 69 (1608–10); Zeffi in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 121 (1608); Carr in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 130–31, cat. no. 13 (1607); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 177, 181 no. 33; Puglisi 2004–5, p. 253 (later than National Gallery *Salome*); Milicua in Barcelona 2005, pp. 80–85, cat. no. 10 (c. 1606–8); Sgarbi 2005, no. 54 (1606–7); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 31 (1609); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 116, 119, fig. 37; Papa 2008, p. 193 (1609); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82.

In the *Salomé* in Madrid, the protagonist has assumed the rôle of a Janus, personifying the seductions and corruptions of the flesh. Her right shoulder is completely draped in a blood-red mantle evocative of John's martyrdom. Beneath this drapery, her Roman courtesan's dress is in semi-disarray. One of her breasts is demurely veiled, while the other side of her bodice is wantonly undone. The old crone's ghostly head rises from Salomé's shoulders as though it is she who holds the silver tray and looks at it with a grim satisfaction. The executioner is a beautiful youth whose listless face is deeply shadowed. The sword hilt in his hand makes a respectful cross above the saint's severed head. These underlying currents of death and sexual tension inspired Longhi to call this picture "Shakespearean."

The reference by Bellori to a *Salomé with the Head of Saint John the Baptist* painted by Caravaggio, after his return to Naples, as a gift for Grand Master Wignacourt in Malta is difficult to reconcile with the present painting, later in the Spanish royal collection. Two similar descriptions of an unattributed painting of this subject in the Alcázar in Madrid in 1636 and (attributed to Caravaggio) in 1666 were associated with this picture by Harris (1974). Milicua has recently proposed an alternative identification of this painting with an inventory compiled in 1656 for the Count of Castrillo, Viceroy of Naples, 1653 to 1659. The painting bears at lower right the number "354," which corresponds to the 1794 inventory of the paintings in the Palacio Real. It is worth noting the citation in the same inventory of a copy after this subject by Caravaggio.

Longhi's initial dating of this *Salomé* to the last years of Caravaggio has been generally accepted. As it is not possible to distinguish between the style of Caravaggio's paintings in Sicily, made between October 1608 and the fall of 1609, and his return to Naples, sometime before October 24, 1609 until his death in July 1610, the painting is provisionally catalogued with the Messina pictures only by virtue of its similarities to the *Adoration of the Shepherds* (cat. no. 68).

See pp. 221–23.

Condition:

Good. Restored in Madrid 1951–52 and more recently for its exhibition in Madrid-Bilbao 1999.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by 1776 Ponz, *Viaje de España*, p. 42; de Salas 1973, p. 33.

70. *Narcissus*, 1608–10

Oil on canvas, 44⁵/₈ x 37 in. (113.3 x 94 cm)

Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica a Palazzo Corsini, Rome, inv. 1549

Provenance:

Probably collection Laudadio della Ripa, Florentine banking family, by nineteenth century; by inheritance Paolo D'Ancona, Milan, by 1913; acquired by B. Kwhoshinsky, who donated it to Galleria Nazionale in 1916 (Vodret in Rome 1999, no. 2; Gregori 1985, no. 76).

Document:

1. Possibly the untraced painting referred to in the May 8, 1645, entry for the license issued in Rome to G. B. Valtabelze to export works of art to Savona: “G. B. Valtabel[ze] sends to Savona (from Rome) a Narcissus of Imperial size canvas by Michelangelo da Caravaggio . . .” [“G.B. Valtabel[ze] invia a Savona (da Roma) un Narciso in tela d'imperatore di mano di Michelangelo da Caravaggio . . .”] (Bertolotti 1877, p. 152; Macioce 2003, II . 483, p. 295).

Sources:

Proposed as possible references to this picture:

1. Alizeri 1846, III, p. 1340: As in the Palazzo Serra, Genoa, “Narcissus at the fount, by Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“Narciso al fonte, di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”].

2. Gandolfi 1846, p. 306: As in the Palazzo Serra, Genoa, “Narcissus at the fount, by Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“Narciso al fonte, di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”].

Exhibitions:

Rome 1914; Florence 1922, no. XLII (as attributed); London 1930, no. 469; Milan 1951, no. 18; Rome 1955, no. 1; New York-Naples 1985, no. 76; Rome 1986–87; Florence 1991 (as Spadarino); Cremona 1996; Hartford 1997; Rome 1999, no. 2; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 94–97; London-Rome 2001; Milan 2001, cat. no. IX.6; Tokyo-Okazaki 2001–2, cat. no. 3; Turin 2002, cat. no. 34; Canberra-Melbourne 2002, cat. no. 49; Sydney-Melbourne 2003, cat. no. 3; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 3; Siena-Rome 2005 no. 6.2.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1914 [ed. 1961, p. 229] (1590–91, Longhi saw it in the Milanese collection of Paolo D’Ancona); Biancale 1920; Marangoni in Florence 1922, no. XLII (as attributed); Hermann 1924, pp. 40–41; Voss 1925 (rejects); de Rinaldis 1932, p. 22; Schudt 1942, no. 78 (old copy); Longhi 1943, p. 8; de Rinaldis 1948 (1601); Panovsky 1949, p. 115 (Gentileschi?); Arslan 1951, p. 446; Berenson 1951, p. 35; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 18; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (*marginalia*: “I have difficulty in believing that *Narciso*, a good picture in poor state, is by Caravaggio”); Venturi 1951, p. 41 (rejects); Longhi 1952, no. XXI; Hinks 1953, no. 24 (1599–1600); Mahon 1953, p. 219 (1598–1600); Grassi 1953; Baumgart 1955, p. 113 (Gentileschi?); Nolfo di Carpegna in Rome 1955, no. 1; Friedlaender 1955, p. 139 (Tuscan imitator); Bauch 1956, p. 259; Wagner 1958, pp. 84–85, 91 (c. 1600); Arslan 1959, pp. 201–2, 214 n. 41 (eighteenth-century copy of a lost original, 1596–97); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 112, 172, 322; Czobor 1960; Jullian 1961, pp. 51–52, 60–61, 231 (rejects, 1593); Moir 1961, pp. 3–15 (unknown follower); de Logu 1962; Vigne 1966, pp. 42–44 (seventeenth-century writers often viewed Narcissus “not as one who studies himself, but one who is deluded by an image”); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 25 (1594–96); Longhi 1968, pp. 26–27 (datable with the *Calling of Saint Matthew* [cat. no. 22.1]); Kitson 1969, no. 31 (daring and beautiful pictorial invention, subtle play of shadow; coarse handling may be result of old restoration, 1597–99); Salerno 1970, pp. 235, 241; Calvesi 1971, pp. 104, 136 (Christian allegory); Cinotti 1971, pp. 102–3, 195 n. 217–21 (bad condition, copy?); Posner 1971, p. 323, n. 46 (rejects); Spear 1971, p. 78 (?); Marini 1974, no. 39 (offers a neoplatonic and hermetic interpretation); Moir 1976, pp. 119, no. 116, 138–39 n. 235, fig. 38 (copy perhaps by Bartolomeo Manfredi, c. 1615, pair with *David* in Prado?);

Nicolson 1979, p. 31 (uncertain); Bissell 1981, pp. 205–7 (Orazio Gentileschi?); Cinotti 1983, no. 57 (1598–99); Hibbard 1983, p. 334 n. 186 (attributed); Gregori 1985, no. 76 (comparable to Cerasi Chapel *Conversion of Saint Paul* [cat. no. 24.1]); Spike 1985, p. 417 (dated too early, 1608–9); Papi 1986, pp. 20–39 (Spadarino); Vodret Adamo in Rome 1986, p. 31; Marini 1989, pp. 442–43, n. 41 (Rome 1600); Mochi Onori–Vodret 1989, pp. 222–25; Vodret in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 222–26; Calvesi 1990, p. 422 (1599–1600); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, p. 13 (Spadarino); Papi in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, pp. 167–83 (Spadarino); Bologna 1992, pp. 349–50 (rejects); Spike 1992², pp. 275–77; Frommel in Macioce 1996, p. 29 (1600); Milicua 1996, p. 140 (Spadarino); Vodret 1996, pp. 9–13; Vodret in Macioce 1996, pp. 167–83; Langdon 1998, pp. 202–4; Mochi Onori–Vodret 1998, no. 61 p. 90; Puglisi 1998, no. 15 (c. 1597); Robb 1998, p. 505 (1599); Vodret in Rome 1999, no. 2 (1597–99); Vodret in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 94–97; Gash 2001, p. 429; Marini in Milan 2001, pp. 486–88 (1600); Spike 2001, pp. 225–28, cat. no. 70 (1609–10); Strinati and Vodret in Tokyo-Okazaki 2001–2, cat. no. 3; Canberra-Melbourne 2002, pp. 150–51, cat. no. 50; Sohm 2002, pp. 462–64 (as attributed); Vodret in Turin 2002, pp. 112–13 (1597–99); Vodret in Capon 2003, pp. 84–85, cat. no. 3 (c. 1597–99); Maccherini in *Siena e Roma* 2005, pp. 403–6, cat. no. 6.2 (?); Vodret in Barcelona 2005, pp. 52–59, cat. no. 3 (c. 1595–98?); Varriano 2006, pp. 9, 130, 141 n 56, fig. 101; Tresoldi 2006, p. 84 (1600); Mochi Onori–Vodret 2008, p. 283; Papa 2008, p. 36 (1546–48, sic).

The *Narcissus* qualifies as one of Caravaggio's rare mythological paintings, although Ovid would perhaps protest the disrespect shown to his poetical *Metamorphoses*. A boy in contemporary dress, mystically illuminated amid nocturnal darkness, gazes in rapture at his own image reflected in a pool. He re-enacts the Narcissus myth without having the ancient youth's other attributes. The theme traditionally inspired painters to paint meadow ponds in springtime; not a flower nor blade of grass grows in the desolate earth where Caravaggio's Narcissus kneels.

Impenetrable darkness and the lack of any living thing are the landscape of the Inferno: this is Dante's conception of Narcissus as opposed to Ovid's original. Nothing blooms in the dark pit from whence there is no exit. Narcissus cannot escape; Caravaggio shows him locked in an illusory embrace with himself, his arms forming an endlessly repeating circle.

The *Narcissus*, which ranks among the artist's most original inventions, escaped the notice of all early writers. Nor are any copies of the painting known. References to a *Narcissus* being sent from Rome to Savona in 1645 and two centuries later a picture of this subject in the Palazzo Serra in Genoa constitute the only evidence, besides the picture itself, that Caravaggio addressed this theme. The painting has never fit comfortably into reconstructions of Caravaggio's chronology and many authorities have offered alternative attributions. The *Narcissus* is discussed in this place in the catalogue because in my opinion the work betrays more affinities to the artist's late works than to the Roman pictures with which it has hitherto been associated. The problem is compounded by its admittedly unsatisfactory condition.

See pp. 225–28.

Condition:

Mediocre. The canvas has been appraided across its surface. After a technical examination, Thomas Schneider in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, p. 368, stated that the results argued against Caravaggio's authorship. Following its restoration in 1995, the Roman Soprintendenza affirmed that the technique was characteristic. See Vodret in Macioce 1996.

Copies:

None recorded. See Vodret in Rome 1999, p. 26, for possible derivations.

71. *Annunciation*, 1608–10

Oil on wood transferred to canvas, 112¼ x 80¾ in. (285 x 205 cm)

Musée des Beaux-Arts, Nancy, inv. 53

Provenance:

Donated by Duke Henry II of Lorraine (who acceded to the dukedome in 1608 and died in 1624) for the high altar of the Eglise Primatiale de l'Annonciation in Nancy (founded 1607

and consecrated 1609). Henry II married Margherita, sister of Cardinal Gonzaga, second son of the Duke of Mantua, Caravaggio's friend and protector. First recorded in the cathedral in March 1645; transferred to the new cathedral of Nancy in 1742; transferred to the museum of the Couvent des Visitandines, Nancy, in 1793; transferred with the museum to the former Pavillon de la Comédie in 1814; transferred to the Hôtel de Ville prior to its final transfer to the current museum in 1829.

Documents:

1. March 31, 1645: Inventory of the Eglise Primatiale: “. . . a large image of the Annunciation given by Duke Henry II for the high altar by the famous painter Michel-Ange: gilt frame . . .” [“. . . une grande image de l'Annonciation donnée par le Duc Henry second de la main du fameux peintre Michel-Ange: châssis doré partout . . .”] (Pariset 1948, pp. 108–11).
2. Described on the high altar after the death of Leopoldo I, seventeenth century: “A large altarpiece by Michel Ange of the mystery of the Annunciation to Our Lady for the high altar” [“Un grand tableau de Michel l'Ange représentant le mystère de l'Annonciation de Notre-Dame pour le maître autel . . .”].
3. 1737: Inventory of the Eglise Primatiale without attribution to author: “three big pictures behind the high altar, among them the Annunciation” [“trois grands tableaux, derier le maître autel, scavoir celuy del'Annonciation”].
4. 1790: Attributed to Guido Reni in the catalogue of the Biens Nationaux (11 Prairial an II, n. 1) “the Annunciation painted by Guido” [“L'Annonciation peint per le Guide . . .”].
5. 1794: Among 130 paintings selected for the Musée des Beaux-Arts as “a large painting by Guido Reni representing the Annunciation” [“un grand tableau peint par le Guide représentant l'Annonciation. Ce tablèau précieux est du bon temps de ce maître”] (Lionnois 1794, Paris, Archives Nationaux, F 17, 1270 b - dossier Meurthe; Marini 1989, pp. 544–45).

Exhibitions:

Bordeaux 1955 (unknown Caravaggist); Naples-London 2004–5 cat. no. 15.

Bibliography:

Catalogue du Musée . . . 1883, n. 121 (Bolognese school); *Catalogue du Musée* . . . 1909, n. 143 (Bolognese school); Longhi 1921 [cited in Longhi 1951] (Carracciolo); Pariset 1936, pp. 237–38 (Bellange); Pariset 1948, pp. 108–11 (Caravaggio based upon documents, 1605–6); Ainaud 1955, pp. 22–25 (Caravaggesque); Longhi 1959, p. 29 (original, second period in Naples); Jullian 1961, p. 156 n. 64 (follower or imitator of late Roman period); Bottari 1966, p. 32 (first Naples period, near *Madonna del Rosario* [cat. no. 51]); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 95 (1610); Fagiolo dell’Arco 1968, p. 59 n. 40 (second Naples period); Longhi 1968 (Maltese period); Kitson 1969, no. 94 (withholds judgment pending restoration); Salerno 1970, p. 237; Calvesi 1971, p. 132; Dell’Acqua 1971, pp. 52–54; Cinotti 1971, pp. 142–44 (second Naples period); Spear 1971, p. 37 n. 123 (Virgin seems French, angel not by Caravaggio); Marini 1974, pp. 53, 270–71, 451–53 (second period Naples); Calvesi 1975, p. 3 (Malta); Gregori 1975 (1610); Moir 1976, pp. 116 no 101, 156 n. 272 (doubtful, closer to Valentin); Nicolson 1979, p. 32; Bologna 1980, p. 36; Gregori 1982, pp. 37, 40, 132 (1610); Marini 1982, p. 82 (1609); Cinotti 1983, no. 34 (late Naples or Malta periods); Hibbard 1983, p. 338 n. 190 (attributed, poor condition); Campagna Cicala 1984, p. 103 (Sicilian period); Brejon de Lavergnée–Volle 1988, pp. 72–73 (spring 1609); Marini 1989, pp. 544–46, no. 93 (Messina 1609); Calvesi 1990, pp. 375–78; Bologna 1992, p. 345 (1609–10); Gregori 1994, p. 155, no. 82 (c. 1609); Macioce 1994, pp. 209–10, 220, n. 22 (Prince Francesco di Lorena was on Malta in 1608, as was Caravaggio, and probably commissioned painting which was done there); Pacelli 1994, pp. 80–83 (1608, Malta); Puglisi 1998, no. 85 (c. 1609–10, dates acquisition between 1608 and 1620 date of death of Jacques Bellange who engraved a derivative image); Robb 1998, p. 517 (1608); Arasse 1999, p. 294; Gelly–Saldias 2001, no. 19, pp. 94–95; Spike 2001, cat. no. 71 (1608–10); Zeffi in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 121 (1608); Brejon de Lavergnée in *Naples-London* 2004–5, pp. 134–36, cat. no. 15 (with details of provenance); Pagano and Utili in *Naples-London* 2004–5, pp. 177, 181 no. 36; Puglisi 2004–5, p. 253 (“Stone and Sciberras argue persuasively for a Maltese commission”); Sgarbi 2005, no. 63 (c. 1608); Gelly 2006, cat. no. 30, pp. 108–9 (comparable in its existential sadness and mute acceptance of destiny to the *Martyrdom of Saint Ursula*, 1610); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 27, 95–98, 104, 109–10, 114, fig. 33; Debono 2007 (late 1608); Stone in *Valletta* 2007, pp. 77–79 (last months in Malta, 1608); Papa 2008, pp. 196–97 (1609).

Despite its prominent position in the principal church of Lorraine, the *Annunciation* in Nancy was overlooked by the early sources. The specific circumstances of its ducal commission are only thinly documented. A church inventory of 1645 states that the altarpiece “by Michelangelo” was a gift of Duke Henry II, who reigned in Lorraine from 1608–24. As the church of the Annunciation was founded in 1607 and opened to the cult in 1609 (Brejon 1988), the commission presumably came to Caravaggio in those years. This dating was proposed by Longhi (1951) on the basis of its style.

Calvesi (1990) and Macioce (1994) have demonstrated that the Count of Brije, the illegitimate grandson of the Duke of Lorraine, was in Malta at the beginning of 1608 seeking admission into the Order. The candidacy of this young nobleman was coincidentally linked to Caravaggio’s in that the Grand Master had requested permission to admit them in the same letter to Pope Paul V.

Condition:

Mediocre. The original effect of the composition has been spoiled by excessive cleaning probably in the early nineteenth century, which removed the veils of dark tone from which the angel and Virgin were intended to emerge with mystical luminosity. Conservation carried out in Rome, 1967–70, revealed large areas of pigment loss.

Copy:

Engraving by Jacques Bellange (d. 1618) (Worthen–Reed, in *Des Moines-Boston-New York* 1975–76, p. 67: in reverse, but the angel is specifically quoted from Caravaggio as is the bed in the background).

72. Nativity with Saints Lawrence and Francis, 1609

Oil on canvas, 105½ x 77⅝ in. (268 x 197 cm)

Oratory of the Compagnia di San Lorenzo, Palermo (formerly, stolen 1969)

Provenance:

In situ until stolen the night of September 17–18, 1969.

Sources:

1. Baglione 1642: “some things in Palermo” [“opera alcune cose in Palermo . . .”].
2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 227): “From Messina he went to Palermo where for the Oratorio della Compagnia di San Lorenzo he painted another Nativity representing the Virgin contemplating the newborn babe with Saint Francis and Saint Lawrence; Saint Joseph is seated, and an angel is in the air above. The lights are diffused among the shadows of the night.” [“. . . di Messina si trasferì a Palermo, dove per l’Oratorio della Compagnia di San Lorenzo fece un’altra Natività; la Vergine che contempla il nato Bambino, con San Francesco e San Lorenzo, vi è San Giuseppe a sedere ed un angelo in aria, diffondendosi nella notte i lumi fra l’ombra.”]

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 44; Palermo 1952; Paris 1965; Palermo 2001, cat. no. 6 (as location unknown).

Bibliography:

Saccà 1906, p. 45; Rouchés 1920, pp. 110–12; Mauceri 1924–25, p. 562 (Roman period); Voss 1924, p. 445; Meli 1925; Schudt 1942, no. 69–72; Arslan 1951, p. 451 (recalls Cerasi cycle [cat. no. 24]); Berenson 1951, pp. 42–43; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 44; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1609); Venturi 1951, no. 68; Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1609); Pawels 1953, p. 200 (end 1607–8); Baumgart 1955, no. 60; Friedlaender 1955, pp. 216–17, no. 42 (1609, well preserved); Jullian 1961, pp. 191–204; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 90 (1609); Longhi 1968, p. 44; Kitson 1969, no. 90 (before October 1609); Cinotti 1971, pp. 85–86, 141–42, 202; Marini 1974, pp. 55–57 (1609); Moir 1976, p. 103, n. 46; Cinotti 1973, no. 40; Marini 1982, p. 82 (after August 1609); Moir 1982, pp. 35, 37, 45 (1609–10?); Hibbard 1983, pp. 247, 329 (summer 1609); Maugeri in *Caravaggio in Sicilia* 1984, no. 11; Calvesi 1986, p. 61 (may have been painted during second Naples sojourn and shipped to Palermo); Paccelli in *L’ultimo Caravaggio*, pp. 81–103; Marini

1989, pp. 548–49, no. 96 (Palermo before October 20, 1609); Bologna 1992, p. 340 (1609); Gregori 1994, p. 155, no. 83 (c. 1609); Pacelli 1994, p. 92 (summer 1609); Tremblay in Macioce 1996, pp. 309–14; Langdon 1998, pp. 377–79; Puglisi 1998, no. 80 (1609); Robb 1998, p. 518 (1609); Davì in Palermo 2001, pp. 120–22, cat. no. 6 (location unknown); Spike 2001, cat. no. 72; Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 123 (1609); Pagano and Utili, Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 176, 182 no. 29; Sgarbi 2005, no. 67 (1609); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 112, 115; Varriano 2006, pp. 112, 120, fig. 91; Papa 2008, pp. 215 (1609); Lapucci in *Painted Optics Symposium* 2009, pp. 37–82.

As Mary contemplates the divine fruit of her womb, an angel displays a banner proclaiming, “Glory to God in Heaven.” With his right hand, the angel points emphatically upward, creating a living bridge between God in heaven and the Christ child in the world. In Christian theology, the Virgin Mary is the locus through which the divine Logos passes in order to assume its human nature. There are very few precedents for representing the Madonna in such an evident position of giving birth. The visionary quality of the *Nativity* is affirmed by the presence of saints who came long after the biblical narrative.

The young man seated in the foreground has been identified as Saint Joseph since the time of Bellori. Apart from his proximity to the mother and child, however, this blond youth is unrecognizable as Mary’s elderly husband. It is unseemly that one so near the mother and child should look away in a different direction, while pointing underhandedly, his shoe almost touching the Child. He turns to speak to a perplexed-looking old man, who has the Joseph attributes the rude youth lacks. Joseph’s perplexity at the miracle of virgin birth was commonly represented in Greek icons of the Nativity, which often show him in conversation with an incredulous shepherd.

Borrowing such a theme from icons was consistent with Caravaggio’s interest in paleo-Christian and medieval iconography in his Sicilian works and appropriate for his patrons. The *Nativity* altarpiece was destined for an oratory in the heart of the Greek quarter of Palermo. Its ecclesiastical patrons, the Observant Franciscans, were headed in Sicily by their former general, Fra Bonaventura Secusio, recently elevated to Archbishop of Messina and Patriarch of Constantinople.

Baglione was informed that Caravaggio had painted more than one work while in Palermo. Bellori mentioned only this altarpiece which he described precisely (apart from Saint Joseph). Caravaggio's stopover in Palermo was so brief—between July and October 20, 1609—that we can assume he was called to the city for the express purpose of painting this picture. The painting was stolen in 1969, and the present author has never had the opportunity of studying the original whose authenticity and fine quality is unquestionable.

See p. 228, illustrated at p. 231.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C.1

Madrid, collection of Juan Gaspar Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and Admiral of Castilla.

Inventory:

September 25–October 21, 1691, inventory taken at death of tenth Admiral of Castilla, with appraisal beginning November 19, 1691, Under list for “Caravaggio, Michelangelo Merisi da (copy after)”: “Nacim.to de N.s.r”, “Carculli” (Getty Provenance Index).

C.2

1627: The Palermitano painter, Paolo Geraci, was commissioned to paint a copy, now lost.

Bibliography:

Meli 1929, pp. 205–6; Moir 1976, p. 103, no. 36a.

II. Selected copies are listed by Spadaro 1984, p. 6; Marini 1989, p. 549.

C.3

Drawing, red ink and white highlights on paper, 6 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 7 $\frac{1}{4}$ in. (15.5 x 18.5 cm)

Private collection

Bibliography:

Testori 1984, pp. 143–50, figs. 1, 2 (as Caravaggio); Marini 1989, p. 549.

73. *Saint John the Baptist*, 1609–10

Oil on canvas, 62 $\frac{5}{8}$ x 48 $\frac{3}{4}$ in. (159 x 124 cm)

Gallery Borghese, Rome, inv. 267

Provenance:

Cardinal Scipione Borghese, Rome, by 1613; Palazzo Borghese, Rome, by 1693; transferred in 1891 to the Villa Borghese, Rome.

Inventory:

1. April 7, 1693: Inventory of the Palazzo Borghese, Campo Marzio, Rome, no. 396, “under the large cornice above the door a large painting of Saint John the Baptist in the desert seated on a red cloth n... gilded frame by Mechel.° Caravaggi” [“Sotto al cornicione sopra la Porta un quadro grande con S. Gio. Battista in tela nel deserto a sedere sopra un panno rosso del N... Cornice dorata di Mechel.° Caravaggi”] (Della Pergola 1959, p. 78).

Documents:

Many scholars identify this with the painting of this subject in Caravaggio’s possession at his death:

1. July 29, 1610: Deodato Gentile, Bishop of Caserta, writes from Naples to Cardinal Scipione Borghese in Rome to inform him that Caravaggio died in Port’Ercole and that the felucca in

which he was traveling had returned to Naples with his goods, which were now in the house of the Marchesa of Caravaggio in Chiaia, from whence Caravaggio had departed. Gentile further writes that he has immediately inquired regarding paintings and found only three remaining, two of *Saint John* and a *Magdalen* (Pacelli 1991, pp. 167–68; Corradini 1993, doc. 139).

2. July 31, 1610: Deodato Gentile writes from Naples to Cardinal Scipione Borghese in Rome that he has learned from the Marchesa of Caravaggio that the paintings left by Caravaggio are not in her house but were sequestered by the prior of Capua on the grounds that, as Caravaggio was a member of the Order of Saint John, they form part of the painter's legacy (Pacelli 1991, p. 168; Corradini 1993, doc. 141).

3. August 19, 1610: The viceroy of Naples writes to the Auditor de los Presidios de Toscana to take the necessary steps to recover the property and paintings of the late Caravaggio—who was not a member of the Order—which he has heard are in custody at Port'Ercole, “and in particular the painting of Saint John the Baptist” (O. H. Green, “The Literary Court of the Conde de Lemos at Naples, 1610–1616,” *Hispanic Review*, vol. 1, no. 4 [Oct.], pp. 290–308, at p. 297; Corradini 1993, doc. 143, with the author mistaken for the recipient).

4. December 10, 1610: Deodato Gentile writes from Naples to Cardinal Scipione Borghese, in Rome, to explain the reasons for the delay in sending the *Saint John the Baptist* by Caravaggio. The letter is damaged but it is clear that the viceroy (Pietro Fernandez di Castro, count of Lemos [1610–16]) has first had a copy of it made (Pacelli 1991, p. 169; Corradini 1993, doc. 144).

5. August 19, 1611: Deodato Gentile writes from Naples to inform Cardinal Scipione Borghese in Rome, that he had tried to send the painting via a pontifical frigate, which had stopped in the Gulf of Naples, but the small boat it had sent to Terracina to pick up the painting was so narrow and the painting so well-packed that did not fit in any manner. Seeing that he had had such bad luck in putting it on the frigate, he resolved to send it on another boat immediately and hoped that it would shortly arrive in Rome (Pacelli 1991, pp. 169–70).

6. August 26, 1611: Deodato Gentile writes from Naples to inform Cardinal Scipione Borghese, in Rome, that he has sent the picture of *John the Baptist* by Caravaggio, framed, by Felucca (Corradini 1993, doc. 148).

Sources:

1. Francucci 1613, v. 266–68 (ed. 1647): “On a rock, and under ample foliage, the youthful Baptist is represented: his face is gentle rather than emaciated, and limbs are graceful rather than lean” [“Emulo a Rafeallo il Caravaggio / Anzi emulo gentili da la Natura / Sopra d’un masso, e sott’un ampio faggio / Giovinetto il Battista anco figura . . . / Ha piuttosto gentil che scarno il volto / E più che magre ancor gracili membre. . .”] (Della Pergola 1959, p. 78).

2. Scannelli 1657, pp. 39–42: “And in particular in the Palazzo Borghese . . . a naked Saint John the Baptist” [“ed in particolare nel Palazzo de’ Borghesi . . . un ignudo di S. Gio. Battista . . .”] (Della Pergola 1959, p. 78).

3. Vasi 1763 (ed. 1794, p. 396).

Exhibitions:

Rome 1914; Milan 1951, no. 31; Rome 1985; Rome 1987; Florence 1991, no. 22; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 142–43; Bergamo 2000, no. 49; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 19; Milan 2005, cat. I.14; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 25; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

Catalogue 1790, n. 40 (“Last room . . . *Saint John the Baptist*, attributed to Valentin”); *Fideocommisso* 1833, p. 19 (attributed to Valentin); Piancastelli 1891, p. 412 (Valentin); A. Venturi 1893, p. 139 (as Caravaggio); L. Venturi 1909, pp. 39–40; Longhi 1913, p. 162; Marangoni 1922, no. XXXV (1605–6); Voss 1924, p. 446; Benkard 1928, p. 184; Pevsner 1928/29, p. 132 (1605–6); Longhi 1928, p. 201 (second time in Naples); de Rinaldis 1936, p. 206; de Rinaldis 1937, p. 232; Schudt 1942, no. 75 (doubts); de Rinaldis 1948, p. 59; Arslan 1951, pp. 446–47 (“much damaged but certainly mostly by Caravaggio”); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 31; Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1604–5)

n. 122 (“Presumably an original, but so damaged as to be practically inscrutable”); Venturi 1951, no. 31; Longhi 1952, no. XXXVIII (1605–6); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1605–6); Hinks 1953, no. 48 (1605–6); Baumgart 1955, no. 48 (1605–6); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 170–71, no. 20C (bad condition, late Roman period c. 1600); Wagner 1958, p. 231 (Caravagesque influenced by France); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 69–72; Della Pergola 1959, no. 113 (same date as Borghese *David with the Head of Goliath*, 1605–6); Longhi 1959, p. 31 (first proposed late dating, 1609); Jullian 1961, pp. 149, 157, 229 (1605–6?); Bottari 1966, no. 75 (1609); Causa 1966, II, no. XIV (first Naples period); Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 93 (1609); Longhi 1968, p. 45 (last days in Naples, 1610); Kitson 1969, no. 61 (most somber treatment of subject, but earlier than 1609); Calvesi 1971, p. 99; Cinotti 1971, pp. 79, 128–29, 163 (very late?); Marini 1974, pp. 284–86, 459–60 n. 93 (1610); Moir 1976, p. 98, no. 31 (1606); Marini 1982, p. 83 (1610); Moir 1982, p. 134 (1608); Cinotti 1983, no. 50 (1610); Hibbard 1983, pp. 152, 255 (1610, damaged); Tempesta in Rome 1985, pp. 44–45; Marini 1989, pp. 556–57, n. 101 (Naples 1610, cannot be the painting that Caravaggio took with him to Port’Ercole); Calvesi 1990; Pacelli 1991, pp. 167–88 (publishes Deodato letters); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 22; Bologna 1992, pp. 344–45 (1610); Marini 1992, p. 11 (1610); Corradini 1993, p. 108; Gregori 1994, p. 139, 155, no. 86 (1609–10); Pacelli 1994, pp. 119–55; Gilbert 1995, pp. 13, 21–23, 32–33, 35, 107; Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, p. 15, fig. 10 (1610?); Rowlands 1996, pp. 222 (late); Puglisi 1998, no. 87 (1610); Robb 1998, p. 518 (1610); Coliva in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 142–43; Coliva in Bergamo 2000, pp. 220–21 (1610); Spike 2001, pp. 234–35, cat. no. 73 (1609–10); Macioce 2003, pp. 265, 268, 270; Zeffi in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 124 (1610); Coliva in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 148–49, cat. no. 19 (1610); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 178, 181 no. 42; Puglisi 2004–5, p. 253 (1610); Lippo in Milan 2005, pp. 174–75, cat. no. I.14; Sgarbi 2005, no. 71 (1610, after *Martyrdom of Saint Ursula* [cat. no. 74]); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 31 (1609); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 233–34, no. 25 (1610); Tresoldi 2006, p. 109 (1610); Varriano 2006, pp. 112, 113, fig. 78; Kliemann in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 181–215; von Rosen in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 59–85; Papa 2008, pp. 94–103 (1602); Coliva in Rome 2009, pp. 174–79 (1610); Giantomassi 2009, p. 27.

The Roman sources are inexplicably silent on this late masterpiece, in many ways the artist’s enigmatic last testament. The peculiar poignancy of the figure was perhaps perplexing; the

less-biased Scannelli (1657) referred to it only as “a nude figure of Saint John the Baptist.” The rediscovery of the correspondence exchanged between Deodato Gentile, bishop of Caserta and resident in Naples, and Cardinal Scipione Borghese in Rome has established that the cardinal was able to obtain one of the two *Saint John the Baptist* paintings that Caravaggio was carrying with him at the time of his disappearance and death in 1610. The presence of this painting in the Borghese collection by 1613, its contemporary south Italian frame, and the old copy still extant in Naples (c.2 below) argue persuasively on behalf of the identification of the present picture with the *Baptist* sent to Rome from Naples on August 26, 1611.

Various dates have been suggested for the Borghese *Baptist*, in part because it was long believed to have been acquired from the artist in Rome. Its execution is noticeably more refined than other paintings datable to the second Neapolitan period, for example the *Martyrdom of Saint Ursula* or the *Magdalen*. It most resembles, in fact, the Nativities painted in Sicily, 1609–10.

See pp. 234–35.

Condition:

Fair. The canvas surface has been flattened by numerous relinings and the colors have sunk and darkened as occurs frequently with the late paintings. Cinotti (1983) who refers to the condition as poor (“*cattivo*”) was unduly pessimistic in response to the distracting effect of discolored old repaints. These have since been restored, most recently before its exhibition in Madrid-Bilbao 1999.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

December 10, 1610: Deodato Gentile writes from Naples to Cardinal Scipione Borghese, in Rome, to explain the reasons for the delay in sending the *Saint John the Baptist* by Caravaggio.

The letter is damaged but it is clear that the viceroy (Pietro Fernandez di Castro, Count of Lemos [1610–16]) had first had a copy made of it (Pacelli 1991, p. 169; Corradini 1993, doc. 144).

Bibliography:

Macioce 2003, p. 268, doc. 411; Terzaghi 2007, pp. 310–11.

C.2

Naples, church of the Confraternità del Santissimo Sacramento all'Avvocata, known as "la Scorziata" (chapel on right of entrance). Oil on canvas, 60¼ x 45½ in. (153 x 115.5 cm)

Bibliography:

Marini 1974, p. 460, n. 93; Cinotti 1983, p. 501 (in reverse); Marini 1989, p. 557 (Battistello); Pacelli 1991, p. 177; Gilbert 1995, p. 265 n. 35.

In reverse, with many variations.

74. *Martyrdom of Saint Ursula*, April–May 1610

Oil on canvas, 55½ x 63 in. (141 x 160 cm)

Naples, Palazzo Zevallos Stigliano, Banca Intesa Collection

On reverse in a seventeenth-century hand: "D. Michel Angelo da / Caravaggio. 1616 / + / M.A.D." [Marco Antonio Doria]

Provenance:

Painted in Naples on commission from Lanfranco Massa, agent of Marcantonio Doria, Genoa 1610; sent by ship from Naples to Genoa on May 27, 1610; Marcantonio Doria, Genoa, 1620; by

descent to his son, Nicolò, Prince of Angri and Duke of Eboli, Genoa, 1651; Giovanni Francesco Doria, Genoa; Giuseppe Maria Doria, Genoa, by 1816; Giovanni Carlo Doria, Genoa; Maria Doria Cattaneo, transferred with much of the Doria *fidecommesso* to Naples, by September 8, 1832; Giovanni Carlo Doria Palazzo d'Angri, Naples, 1854–55; after World War I the Villa Doria d'Angri and its contents were sold to Baron Romano Avezzano; Baroness Felicita Romano Avezzano, by 1960; in 1973, with attribution to Mattia Preti, sold to present owner.

Inventories:

1. May 15, 1620: Inventory of Marcantonio Doria, Genoa: “Saint Ursula struck by the tyrant, by Caravaggio” [“Santa Orsola confitta dal tiranno del Caravaggio”] (Pacelli 1980, p. 28).

2. October 19, 1651: Testament of Marcantonio to his son, Nicolo, “The following paintings, that is . . . Saint Ursula by Michel'Angelo da Caravaggio . . .” [“li seguenti quadri, cioe . . . Sant'Orsola di Michel'Angelo da Caravaggio . . .”] (Pacelli 1980, p. 28).

Documents:

1. May 11, 1610: Letter to Genovese Prince Marcantonio Doria from his procurator in Naples, Lanfranco Massa, “I thought to send the painting of Saint Ursula this week but to be sure that it was dry, I put it in the sun yesterday, and this instead caused the thick varnish which Caravaggio put on to liquify; I want to obtain Caravaggio's opinion on how to repair it so as not to harm it; Signor Dam.o has seen it and was amazed as all the others who saw it; with Caraciolo as I already told you we are not agreed for the Martyrdom of Saint Lawrence that you wanted . . .” [“. . . Pensavo mandarle il quadro / di Sant'Orzola questa settimana però per assicurarmi di mandarlo ben asciutato, lo posi ieri al sole, che più / presto ha fatto revenir la vernice che asciutolo per / darcela il Caravaggio assai grossa; voglio di nuovo / esser da d.º Caravaggio per pigliar parere come si ha da / fare perchè non si guasti; Il sig.or Dam.o l'ha visto et ha / stupito, come tutti l'altri che l'hanno visto; col Caraciolo [Battistello] / come già ho detto a V.S. per anc.a non siamo convenuti / per il Martirio di S.^{to} Lorenzo che V.S. desidera per voler den.^{ri} . . .”] (Pacelli 1980, p. 24 [A.D.A., parte II, b 290]).

2. May 27, 1610: Letter from Lanfranco Massa to Genoa Prince Marcantonio Doria, “to tell you that I am sending with P. Alessandro Caramano on his boat a long box inside of which is the painting of the *Martyrdom of Saint Ursula*, carefully packed, for which Doria will be required to pay 50 soldi in conformance with the shipper’s policy.” In margin “June 18, 1610,” the date of arrival. [“Con altra mia ho suplito a complimen.^{to} a V.S. La presente serà solo per / dirli col presente P. Alessandro Caramano e s.^a Sua feluca / mandarli una scatola longa signata pel suo nome, con dentroli / il quadro del Martirio di S.^{ta} Orsola, benissimo conditionato. / Al suo arrivo serà V.S. contento di riceverlo e pagarli per / suo nolo soldi cinquanta conforme nella polizia di / carico vederà notato, e non essendo questo per altro / le baso le mani e dal cielo le prego cont.^o / In Napoli 27 maggio 1610.” Nel margine “June 18, 1610”] (Pacelli 1980, pp. 24–25 [A.D.A., parte II, b 293]).

3. May 27, 1610, shipper’s manifest: “Sr. Lanfranco Massa has loaded in the name of God and of good fortune in the present port of Naples onto the felucca named Santa Maria di Porto Salvo owned by Alessandro Caramano a box containing the painting of the Martyrdom of Saint Ursula, made by the hand of Michel’Angelo Caravaggio, very well packed, in order to consign it in the same condition upon arrival in Genoa to Sr. Marcantonio Doria who will pay two and one-half libre of that money should God carry it safely. I, Antonio Feraro, have signed the present on command of the above stated Alessandro Caramano who does not know how to write.” [“Ha caricato col nome di Dio e di ben salvam.^{to} in questo presente porto di Napoli / il S. Lanfranco Massa s.a la feluca nom.ia S.ta Maria di Porto Salvo / Patronegiata per Patrone Alessandro Caramano una scatola con / dentro un quadro per Martiro di S.^{ta} Orsola, fatto per mano di / Michel’Angelo Caravaggio benissimo conditionato, per doverlo / al suo arrivo in Genoa consignare in l’istesso modo al S.^{or} Marcantonio / Doria il quale per il suo nolito li pagherà libre doe, è meza di quella / moneta, che Dio la porte salve. Io Antonio feraro di volontà de il supradeto Patrone Alessandro / Caramano ho firmato la presente per non sapere lui scirvere.”] (Pacelli 1980, pp. 24–25 [A.D.A., parte II, b 293]).

Exhibitions:

Naples 1963 no. 50; London-Washington-Turin 1982/83; New York-Naples 1985, no. 101; Rome 1989; Bergamo 2000, no. 51; Rome-Milan-Vicenza 2004; Naples 2004-London 2005, cat. no. 18; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 14; Naples 2005; Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 31; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

Nobile 1845, II, p. 334 (among important paintings in Palazzo Doria d'Angri); Bertolotti 1881, II, pp. 71–72; Scavizzi in Naples 1963, p. 53 n.50 tav.6b (as Mattia Preti, formerly attributed to Bartolomeo Manfredi); Gregori 1974, pp. 44–48 (as Caravaggio, late Naples period); Testori 1975, p. 3; Cannata 1978, fig. 8 (as Preti); Marini 1980, p. 88, n. 114, p. 94 (Alonzo Rodriguez?); Pacelli 1980, pp. 24–30 (publishes documents); Bologna 1980, pp. 30–45; Marini 1981, p. 431 (Caravaggio, 1610); Gregori 1982, pp. 131–33, n. 19 (1610); Marini 1982, p. 83 (1610); Moir 1982, p. 162 (?); Causa 1983, p. 13; Cinotti 1983, no. 37; Hibbard 1983, pp. 252–54, 331; Pérez Sánchez 1985, pp. 48, 102 n. 22; Calvesi 1985, pp. 84–85; Gregori 1985, no. 101 (painted two months before Caravaggio's death); Christiansen 1986, p. 441 (badly damaged); Pacelli in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 81–107; Marini 1989, pp. 557–61, n. 102 (Naples, before May 11, 1610); Calvesi 1990, p. 427; Bologna in Naples 1991, no. 2.3; Pacelli 1991, pp. 179–78; Bologna 1992, pp. 263–80, 344 (1610); Pacelli 1992, pp. 179–88; Gregori 1994, p. 155, no. 87 (1610); Pacelli 1994, pp. 100–17 (1610); Gilbert 1995, pp. 23, 26, 169; Zuccari in Macioce 1996, pp. 295–96 (1610); Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, p. 5; Langdon 1998, pp. 386–88; Puglisi 1998, no. 88 (1610); Robb 1998, p. 519 (1610); Varriano in Mormando 1999, p. 202 (1610, Naples); Bona Castelloti in Bergamo 2000, p. 222; Spike 2001, pp. 237–38, cat. no. 74 (April–May 1610); Boccardo in Rome-Milan-Vicenza, 2004; Bonazzoli 2004; Giantomassi-Zara in Rome-Milan-Vicenza, 2004; *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004 (includes essays and restoration reports); Ravasi in Rome-Milan-Vicenza 2004, pp. 16–27; Bologna in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 144–47, cat. no. 18 (last picture, 1610); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 178, 181 no. 40; Puglisi 2004–5, p. 253 (1610); Arcipreti in Naples 2005, pp. 31–34; Gregori in Barcelona 2005, pp. 100–103, cat. no. 14 (1610); Lapucci 2005, pp. 35 fig. 3, 37 fig.7; Marini 2005, pp. 570–74; Pagano in Naples 2005, pp. 66–74 (restoration report); Sgarbi 2005, no. 70 (1610); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 31 (1610); Bull in Amsterdam 2006, cat. no. 31, pp. 129–32 (1609–10); *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2006, pp. 10–47; Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 21; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 117–19, fig. 40; Tresoldi 2006, p. 110 (1610); Varriano 2006, pp. 112, 117, fig. 89; Terzaghi 2007, pp. 290 (1610); Papa 2008, pp. 222–23 (1610); Giantomassi 2009, pp. 21, 27–29; Pellini in Rome 2009, pp. 164–67 (1610).

The rediscovery of the *Martyrdom of Saint Ursula* as a result of the archival researches of Pacelli (1980) is an illustrative example of the ease with which paintings were sent between

distant cities and eluded the attention of the early sources. The letters of Lanfranco Massa in Naples to his patron Marcantonio Doria in Genoa reveal that G. B. Caracciolo and other Neapolitan painters had time to admire the *Saint Ursula* before its departure. In the Palazzo Doria, Genoa, the painting was similarly admired by visitors (Bernardo Strozzi painted his own version of it) but never commented upon in print. After the transfer of the Doria d'Angri collection to Naples, the *Saint Ursula* received a single and perfectly accurate citation in the 1845 guidebook of Nobile. The work was not mentioned again in the literature until 1963 when Scavizzi published it as by Mattia Preti. The Banca Commerciale Italiana acquired the painting as a scene of martyrdom by Mattia Preti in 1973. A year later, Gregori proposed the attribution to Caravaggio in his second Neapolitan period, citing the agreement of Causa. Her brilliant intuition was confirmed in 1980 by Pacelli's research and the iconography of the *Saint Ursula* elucidated by Bologna.

See pp. 237–28.

Condition:

Poor. The painting was seriously damaged by Lanfranco Massa when it was barely completed: Massa exposed it to the sun in order to dry its thick varnish, which liquified instead of drying. This extreme heat evidently affected the chemical equilibrium of the underlying paint layers, and the picture was permanently darkened (see Marini 1989, p. 559). These problems were exacerbated by abrasive cleanings to which the painting was subjected in the past. Cleaned by Bruno Arciprete in 2004–5; for conservation history and pigment analysis see Pagano in Naples 2005.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

May 8, 1630: Inventory of Lanfranco Massa, Neapolitan agent of Prince Marcantonio Doria, “a painting of Saint Ursula with frame by Caravaggio” (Delfino 1985, p. 95; Boccardo 2004, p. 264; Terzaghi 2007, p. 308).

75. *Magdalen in Ecstasy*, 1610

Oil on canvas, 42 x 35³/₄ in. (106.5 x 91 cm)

Private collection, Rome

Provenance:

Princess Carafa–Colonna collection, Naples; acquired c. 1873 by Reverend Canon Michele Blando, Naples; by descent to his lawyer nephew, Giuseppe Klain, from whom acquired by the present owner in 1976.

Documents:

1. July 29, 1610: Deodato Gentile, Bishop of Caserta, writes from Naples to Cardinal Scipione Borghese in Rome to inform him that Caravaggio died in Port'Ercole and that the felucca in which he was traveling had returned to Naples with his goods, which were now in the house of the Marchesa of Caravaggio in Chiaia, from whence Caravaggio had departed. Gentile further writes that he has immediately inquired regarding paintings and found only three remaining, two of *Saint John* and a *Magdalen* (Pacelli 1991, pp. 167–68; Corradini 1993, doc. 139).

2. July 31, 1610: Deodato Gentile writes from Naples to Cardinal Scipione Borghese in Rome that he has learned from the Marchesa of Caravaggio that the paintings left by Caravaggio are not in her house but were sequestered by the prior of Capua on the grounds that, as Caravaggio was a member of the Order of Saint John, they form part of the painter's legacy (Pacelli 1991, p. 168; Corradini 1993, doc. 141).

3. August 19, 1610: The viceroy of Naples writes to the Auditor de los Presidios de Toscana to take the necessary steps to recover the property and paintings of the late Caravaggio—who was not a member of the Order—which he has heard are in custody at Port'Ercole, “and in particular the painting of Saint John the Baptist” (O. H. Green, “The Literary Court of the Conde de Lemos at Naples, 1610–1616,” *Hispanic Review*, vol. 1, no. 4 [Oct.], pp. 290–308, at p. 297; Corradini 1993, doc. 143, with the author mistaken for the recipient).

Sources:

Some scholars identify this with the painting of this subject by Caravaggio referred to by:

1. Mancini 1619–21 (1956, I, p. 225): “He had to flee from Rome and his first stop was in Zaragolo, where the prince hid him. There he painted a Magdalen and a Christ on the road to Emmaus which Costa bought in Rome. With this money he moved on to Naples” [“fu necessitato fuggirsi da Roma e di primo salto [Caravaggio] fu in Zaragolo, ivi trattenuto segrementemente da qual principe, dove fece una Madalena, e Christo che va in Emaus che lo comperò in Roma il Costa che con questi denari se ne passò a Napoli”].

2. Baglione 1642, p. 138: “Everyone involved fled Rome and Michelangelo went to Palestrina where he painted a Mary Magdalen” [“Fuggirono tutti da Roma, e Michelangelo andossene a Pellestrina, ove dipinse una s. Maria Maddalena”].

3. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 225): “He fled Rome, persecuted and without money, and recovered in Zaragolo under the protection of Duke Don Marzio Colonna, where he painted a Christ in Emmaus between the two apostles [Milan, Brera (cat. no. 50)] and another half-length figure of the Magdalen” [“Fuoggitosene di Roma, senza denari, e perseguitato ricoverò in Zaragolo nella benevolenza del Duca D. Martio Colonna, dove colorì il quadro di Cristo in Emaus fra li due apostoli [Milan, Brera] ed un'altra mezza figura di Maddalena”].

Exhibitions:

Naples 1963, no. 7 (as copy); New York-Naples 1985, no. 89; Paliano 2006; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 35; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 8; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, no. 8.

Bibliography:

Longhi 1943, p. 17 (first identifies the image with a Magdalen painted by Caravaggio at Colonna estates in 1606 after artist's flight from Rome; and with reference in Giustiniani inventory to full-length Magdalen); Longhi 1951, pp. 16–17, fig. 3 (publishes photograph of lost original, location unknown); Friedlaender 1955, p. 205 (known only from copies); Salerno 1960, p. 135 (Giustiniani document inventory no. 7, refers to full length Magdalen); Bodart

1966, pp. 18–26; Longhi 1968, p. 41 (expresses reservations, denies by letter of November 21, 1968); Pico Cellini 1972 (Caravaggio); Scavizzi in Naples 1963, no. 7; Bodart 1970, pp. 94–110 (as original the photograph, location unknown, published by Longhi in 1951; Klain version different); Cellini 1973, restored 1972; Marini 1974, pp. 37–38, 212–13, 418–21 n. 62 (1606); Nicolson 1974³, p. 624, ill. 91 (best version); Gregori in *Novità sul Caravaggio* 1975, p. 28 (best version); Gregori 1976, p. 677 (later than 1606); Moir 1976, pp. 111–13 no. 69g, 148 n. 247–48, fig. 97 (Angelo Caroselli?, copy of lost original); Moir 1982, pp. 31, 41, fig. 53 (original lost); Marini 1982, pp. 72–83; Cinotti 1983, no. 64 (copy?); Calvesi 1985, pp. 63–64; Gregori 1985, no. 89 (perhaps the painting referred to by Mancini 1606, but also has stylistic relation to later works); Calvesi 1986, p. 50; Marini in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 59–80, fig. 4; Marini 1989, pp. 491–94, no. 67 (Paliano 1606, after May 31?); Posèq 1991, pp. 121–30; Bologna 1992, p. 331 (1606, original lost); Pacelli 1992, pp. 178–80 (after Caravaggio's death, *Magdalen* remained in Naples in Colonna collections, proven by numerous Neapolitan copies, e.g., Finson's); Gregori 1994, p. 152, no. 58 (copy?, c. 1606); Pacelli 1994, pp. 161–87; Treffers in Macioce 1996, pp. 270–87, ill. 288; Langdon 1998, pp. 235, 315–16, 390; Puglisi 1998, no. 60 (attributed, c. 1606); Robb 1998, p. 512 (1606); Benedetti in Mormando 1999, pp. 208–33, fig. 29 (after Caravaggio); Varriano in Mormando 1999, p. 198 (1606); Spike 2001, pp. 236–37, cat. no. 75 (1610); Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 117 (1606, “the *Supper at Emmaus* in the Brera in Milan and the *Magdalen in Ecstasy*, known through copies and dubiously identified in a private collection”); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 172, 179, no. 2 (1606–7); Gasparri and Marini in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 249–50, cat. no. 35 (1606); Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 183 (fig. 78, Caravaggio?, c. 1610); Marini in Paliano 2006, pp. 25–33; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 109–10, 119, 129; Varriano 2006, pp. 32–33, 125, fig. 29.; Marini and Gasparri in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 8, pp. 236–39 (1606, after May 31); Ziane in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 161–79; Marini and Gasparri in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 8, pp. 250–53 (after May 31, 1606?); Papa 2008, pp. 228–29 (as copy after lost original of 1606).

Caravaggio's Roman biographers refer with rare unanimity to a *Magdalen* painted on the Colonna estates, most likely Zagarolo, where he took refuge in the summer of 1606 after his flight from Rome. None of these sources was informed as to the painting's ultimate destination. Bellori's reference to a half-length *Magdalen* has induced most authorities to associate the present composition with the painting mentioned by Mancini, Baglione, and Bellori. This testimony

of the early sources is somewhat difficult to reconcile with the *Magdalen* that Caravaggio reportedly had with him on his final voyage to Rome in July 1610.

Further research will doubtless clarify the early provenance of this picture. Its presence in Naples by 1613 is established by the copy of Louis Finson (c.1, below). In my opinion, the style and technique of this *Magdalen* are characteristic of Caravaggio's last works executed in Naples in 1610. As such, it may well be the *Magdalen* referred to in the letters Bishop Deodato Gentile sent from Naples to Cardinal Scipione Borghese in Rome in 1610. This divergence between the sources and the late style of the painting was observed by Gregori (1985, p. 314) when the painting was exhibited in New York.

See pp. 236–37.

Condition:

Very good. Restored by Pico Cellini in 1972, whose report was published by Pacelli 1994, p. 232, fn 23.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

May 15, 1676: Rotterdam, Sales catalogue, Reynier van der Wolf, brewer, “a dying Magdalen, lifelike, powerfully executed and rare, by Michelangelo da Caravaggio” fl. 1,500

Bibliography:

Hoet 1752, vol. 2, p. 342; Bodart 1970, p. 99, no. 3; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p.192 at E.

C.2

April 26, 1713: Rotterdam, Sales catalogue, Adiaen Paets, Director of the Dutch East India Company (fl. 375)

Bibliography:

Hoet 1752, vol. I, p. 154, no. 2; Bodart 1970, p. 99, no. 3; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 193, no. O.

II. Selected copies are listed by Bodart 1970, pp. 94–110; Moir 1976, pp. 111–13, nos. 69a–69u; Pacelli 1994, p. 172, fig. 6. Among these are:

C.3

Marseilles, Musée des Beaux-Arts

Oil on canvas, 49³/₄ x 39³/₈ in. (126 x 100 cm)

Signed by Finson “LVDOVICVS/FINSONIVS/FECI . . .”

Provenance:

Among the canvases sent from Paris 1804 to form the Musée des Beaux-Arts, Marseilles (Bodart 1970, pp. 95–96).

Bibliography:

von Schneider 1933, p. 88; Longhi 1935, p. 1 (original Caravaggio signed by Finson); Longhi 1943, p. 16 (faithful copy); Isarlo 1941, p. 132 (composition Finson); Pariset 1948, p. 378 (copy of unknown original, composition of which not by someone as mediocre as Finson); Baumgart 1955 (prototype Caravaggesque 1606–7); Friedlaender 1955 (copy of unknown Caravaggio, 1606); Styns 1955, pp. 1–8 (composition Finson); Bodart 1966, pp. 118–26 (signature fragmentary and perhaps made later, also date); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, at no. 70 (copy executed at Naples where the original was presumably found; among other copies, e.g., Milan); Kitson 1969, no. 70 (as *Sleeping Magdalen*); Bodart 1970, pp. 94–109 (possibly painted

by Finson upon his arrival in Aix-en-Provence from Naples c. 1612); Nicolson 1974³, p. 624, ill. 93 (Finson); Vsevolozhskaya 1975, no. 3 (Finson signed and dated 1612); Moir 1976, p. 112 no. 69b; Cinotti 1983, p. 542; Gregori 1985, p. 314; Marini in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 59–80, fig. 3; Pacelli 1994, p. 164, fig. 72.

C.4

Saint Remy, France, private collection

Oil on canvas, 44 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 34 $\frac{1}{8}$ in. (112 x 86.5 cm)

Louis Finson, 1613

Signed and dated: “LVDOVICVS/FINSONIVS/FECIT/An° I.6.I.3”

Provenance:

Perhaps from the collection of Michel Borrilly, Provence, in seventeenth century; in 1846 described as in house of Mme Ravanas, Aix-en-Provence; M. Poulle, 1877; by descent to heirs.

Bibliography:

Chennevières–Pointel 1847, I, pp. 15–17; Bodart 1966, pp. 118–26 (copy of Marseilles picture); Bodart 1970, pp. 96–98 (mediocre replica); Vsevolozhskaya 1975, no. 3; Moir 1976, p. 112 no. 69c; Cinotti 1983, p. 543; Gregori 1985, p. 314; Marini in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 59–80, fig. 6 (Finson); Pacelli 1994, p. 165, fig. 73; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 183, fig. 79.

C.5

Barcelona, Santiago Alorda collection

Oil on canvas, 43 $\frac{3}{8}$ x 34 $\frac{1}{4}$ in. (110 x 87 cm)

At bottom right: “Imitando Michaelem Angelum Carrava . . ./Mediolan./Wybrandus de Geest/Friesius/A° 1.6.2.0.” (“Wybrand de Geest, the Friesan, imitating Michelangelo Caravaggio 1620”; de Geest, the brother-in-law of Rembrandt, was in Rome 1616–21).

Bibliography:

Ainaud 1947, pp. 393–94 n. 32; Friedlaender 1955, p. 205; Bodart 1966, pp. 118–26; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, at no. 70; Kitson 1969, p. 103; Bodart 1970, pp. 11–12, 94–109; Nicolson 1974³, p. 624, ill. 94; Vsevolzhskaya 1975, no. 3 (specifically inscribed that it was painted after a Caravaggio original); Moir 1976, p. 112 no. 69d; Cinotti 1983, p. 542; Gregori 1985, p. 314; Pacelli 1994, p. 166, fig. 74; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 183, fig. 80.

C.6

Hermitage, Saint Petersburg, inv. 10100
Oil on canvas, 39³/₈ x 33¹/₄ in. (100 x 84.5 cm)

Provenance:

Acquired from a private Russian collection by 1970.

Exhibition:

Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 36.

Bibliography:

Vsevolzhskaya 1975, no. 7 (copy of nonexistent original); not cited in Moir 1976; Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 250, cat. no. 36.

76. Saint John the Baptist, Reclining, 1610

Oil on canvas, 40¹/₈ x 70³/₄ in. (106 x 179.5 cm)
Private collection, Munich

Documents:

Some scholars identify this with the painting of the same subject by Caravaggio in his possession at his death.

1. July 29, 1610: Deodato Gentile, Bishop of Caserta, writes from Naples to Cardinal Scipione Borghese in Rome to inform him that Caravaggio died in Port'Ercole and that the felucca in which he was traveling had returned to Naples with his goods, which were now in the house of the Marchesa of Caravaggio in Chiaia, from whence Caravaggio had departed. Gentile further writes that he has immediately inquired regarding paintings and found only three remaining, the two of *Saint John* and the *Magdalen* (Pacelli 1991, pp. 167–68; Corradini 1993, doc. 139).

2. July 31, 1610: Deodato Gentile writes from Naples to Cardinal Scipione Borghese in Rome that he has learned from the Marchesa of Caravaggio that the paintings left by Caravaggio are not in her house but were sequestered by the prior of Capua on the grounds that, as Caravaggio was a member of the Order of Saint John, they form part of the painter's legacy (Pacelli 1991, p. 168; Corradini 1993, doc. 141).

3. August 19, 1610: The viceroy of Naples writes to the Auditor de los Presidios de Toscana to take the necessary steps to recover the property and paintings of the late Caravaggio—who was not a member of the Order—which he has heard are in custody at Port'Ercole, “and in particular the painting of Saint John the Baptist” (O. H. Green, “The Literary Court of the Conde de Lemos at Naples, 1610–1616,” *Hispanic Review*, vol. 1, no. 4 [Oct.], pp. 290–308, at p. 297; Corradini 1993, doc. 143, with the author mistaken for the recipient).

4. December 10, 1610: Deodato Gentile writes from Naples to Cardinal Scipione Borghese, in Rome, to explain the reasons for the delay in sending the *Saint John the Baptist* by Caravaggio. The letter is damaged but it is clear that the Viceroy (Pietro Fernandez di Castro, count of Lemos [1610–16]) has first had a copy of it made (Pacelli 1991, p. 169; Corradini 1993, doc. 144).

5. August 19, 1611: Deodato Gentile writes from Naples to inform Cardinal Scipione Borghese in Rome, that he had tried to send the painting via a pontifical frigate, which had stopped in the Gulf of Naples, but the small boat it had sent to Terracina to pick up the painting was so narrow and the painting so well-packed that it did not fit in any manner. Seeing that he had had such bad luck in putting it on the frigate, he resolved to send it on another boat immediately and hoped that it would shortly arrive in Rome (Pacelli 1991, pp. 169–70).

Exhibitions:

Florence 1991, cat. no. 22; Naples-London 2005, cat. no. 41; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 26.

Bibliography:

Marini 1978–79, pp. 23–25, 41–42 (1610); Marini 1982, p. 83 (1610); Spike 1988, pp. 229–30; Marini 1989, pp. 561–62, no. 103 (Naples 1610); Lapucci in Florence–Rome 1991, pp. 349–54, cat. 22; Pacelli 1991, p. 179 (last days in Naples, “could be the one that the count of Lemos kept for himself”); Bologna 1992, p. 342; Marini 1992, pp. 8–11, color ill.; Slatkes 1992, p. 230; Pacelli 1994, pp. 132–54; Puglisi 1998, at no. 87 (reference); Robb 1998, p. 519 (1610); Zeri 1998, pp. 28, 45; Marini in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 40, 41; Pacelli in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, p. 60; Spike 2001, pp. 234–35, cat. no. 75 (1610); Treffers 2002, p. 28; Marini 2005, pp. 350, 574–75; Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 178, 181 no. 41; Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, ill. pp. 162, pp. 234–35, cat. no. 26 (1610); Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 120; Tresoldi 2006, p. 108 (1610); Ruiz Gomez 2009, pp. 78–79.

Of the two paintings of *Saint John the Baptist* that are documented in Caravaggio’s possession at the time of his death in 1610, one has been almost definitively identified as the *Baptist* in the Galleria Borghese, Rome (cat. no. 73). There is as yet no concrete evidence to identify the present work as the untraced version, as some authors have reasonably suggested.

This painting, although darkened with time, has retained the elegaic mood that we find in all works from the troubled last days of this artist. There is an unmistakable poignancy to this image of a beautiful youth who reclines in the depths of a grotto that seems intended as a metaphor of spiritual isolation. The long limbs of the youth and his red cloak unfold in a measured cadence across the horizontal canvas. Caravaggio used a similar pose for the Virgin in his *Adoration of the Shepherds* in Messina. Indeed Slatkes (1992) has published the hypothesis that both this picture and the Borghese *Baptist* were painted in Messina and brought by Caravaggio from Sicily to Naples.

See pp. 234–35.

Condition:

Fair. The painted surface has darkened as the colors have sunk into the canvas. The painting has also suffered various scattered losses of pigment. The features of the deeply shadowed face appear to have been strengthened by Pico Cellini in the course of restoration in Rome in 1977–78, when the painting was cleaned, relined, and restored. Cellini noted incisions in the forehead of the saint and on the inner contour of the left leg. Technical analysis of the reflectography, video tapes and x-rays by Roberta Lapucci and infrared reflectography by Mauricio Seracini of Editech Laboratory, Florence, underscore the similarity of the finely woven canvas with both the Borghese canvas and the *Adoration of the Shepherds* in Messina (see Slatkes 1992).

Copies:

None recorded. Pacelli (1994, pp. 143–44, 154) discusses Neapolitan derivations.

77. *David with the Head of Goliath*, 1610

Oil on canvas, 49¼ x 39¾ in. (125 x 101 cm)

Gallery Borghese, Rome, inv. 455

Inscribed on the blade of the sword: H[or M] A S[?] O

Provenance:

Probably in the custody of the Viceroy of Naples, Count of Lemos, by November 5, 1610; Cardinal Scipione Borghese, Rome, by 1613; transferred in 1891 to the Villa Borghese, Rome.

Inventories:

1. April 7, 1693: Inventory of Palazzo Borghese, in Campo Marzio, “no. 28, a painting on canvas of imperial size with David holding the head of the giant Goliath n. 368 with a gilded

frame by Michelan Caravaggi” [“. . . un quadro in tela d’Imperatore con David con la testa del gigante Golia del n. 368 con cornice dorata di Michelan Caravaggi”] (Della Pergola 1959, pp. 79–80).

2. 1790: Inventory of Palazzo Borghese, in the Campo Marzio, Rome, “second room, n. 2, David, Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“Seconda Camera, n.2, Il David, Michelangelo da Caravaggio”] (de Rinaldis 1937, with date of 1760 corrected in Della Pergola 1955, I, p. 157 n. 48).

Documents:

1. November 5, 1610: The painter Baldassare Alvise receives payment for two copies of a *David* by Michelangelo da Caravaggio from Giulio Cesare Fontana, architect to the Viceroy Conde de Lemos (Pacelli 1977, p. 829).

2. 1613: Annibale Durante records the payment by Cardinal Scipione Borghese for a frame for a David, “Another frame for the painting of David with the head of the Giant Goliath” [“Altra cornice per il quadro di David con la testa del Gigante Golia alt. p. 5 e 4 b.50.”] (Della Pergola 1959, p. 79).

3. Francucci 1613 (ed. 1647), Canto III, Stanze 182–88: “the skull of the giant Goliath seems heavy in the left hand of the good son of the bald Isaiah” [“. . . il teschio del Geteo Gigante, / Che del buon figlio del canuto Isai / Alla sinistra man sembra pesante . . .”] (Della Pergola 1959, p. 79; Coliva in Rome 2009, pp. 168–69).

Sources:

1. Manilli 1650, p. 67: As in Villa Borghese, “which in that head is a portrait of himself and in the David of his Caravaggino” [“il quale in quella testa volle ritrarre se stesso, e nel David ritrasse il suo Caravaggino”] (Della Pergola 1959, p. 79; Cinotti 1983, p. 503).

2. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, pp. 223–24): “For Cardinal [Borghese] he painted *Saint Jerome Writing*, extending his pen in the inkwell; for him also he painted a half-length *David*, holding

by its hair the head of Goliath, which is his self-portrait. David who is shown grasping the hilt of a sword, is represented as a bareheaded youth with one shoulder out of his shirt. The picture has the bold colors and deep shadows which Caravaggio liked to use to give force to his figures and composition.” [“Per lo medesimo Cardinale [Borghese] dipinse San Gerolamo, che scrivendo attentamente, distende la mano e la penna al calamaio, [now at Borghese Gallery, Rome] e l'altra mezza figura di Davide, il quale tiene per li capelli la testa di Golia, che è il suo proprio ritratto, impugnando la spada: lo figurò da un giovine discoperto con una spalla fuori dalla camicia, colorito con fondi ed ombre fierissime, delle quali soleva valersi per dar forza alle sue figure, e componimenti.”]

3. von Ramdohr 1787, I, p. 303.

Exhibitions:

Rome 1914; Florence 1922, no. XXXIV; London 1930; Milan 1951, no. 32; São Paulo 1954; New York-Naples 1985, no. 97; Rome 1987; Florence 1991, no. 16; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 130–31; Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 16; Budapest 2006, cat. no. 4; Beijing 2006; Rome 2009.

Bibliography:

Fideocommesso 1833, p. 17 (as Caravaggio); Piancastelli 1891, p. 106; Venturi 1893, p. 209; Venturi 1909, pp. 269–70; Witting 1916, p. 75; Marangoni 1922, pp. 786, 794; Voss 1924, p. 81; Pevsner 1928/29, p. 387 (1605–6); Longhi 1928/29, p. 32; Schudt 1942, no. 43; de Rinaldis 1948, p. 142; Berenson 1951, pp. 33–34, 57, 83; Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 32 (after July 5, 1605–6); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1605–6); Venturi 1951, no. 30 (1605–6); Longhi 1952, pl. XXXIX (self-portrait?); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1605–6); Grassi 1953, pp. 103, 180; Hinks 1953, no. 49; Baumgart 1955, no. 47; Czobor 1955, p. 212 (Goliath, self-portrait?); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 202–3, no. 30A (1605–6); Chastel 1956, p. 965 (1600–1606); Wagner 1958, pp. 121–24, 131–32 (inscription on sword signature of Caravaggio: M[ichel] A[ngelo] C[aravaggio] O[pus]); Della Pergola 1959, p. 79 no. 114 (1605 is a *termine post quem*); Longhi 1959, pp. 30–31 (second Neapolitan period); Jullian 1961, pp. 149–53; Della Pergola 1964, pp. 28, 79, 452 n. 194 (“Caravaggio, that is, Mao Salini”); Röttgen 1965, p. 169; Bottari 1966; Causa 1966, II, p. 6 no. VIII; Salerno–Kinkead–Wilson 1966, p. 113; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, n. 63 (1605–6, based upon

Bellori); Moir 1967, I, pp. 10, 263, 283, II, p. 56 C I; Longhi 1968, p. 45; Kitson 1969, no. 60 (1605); Calvesi 1971, pp. 111, 124 (after 1606); Cinotti 1971, pp. 79, 128 (1605–6); Levey 1971, p. 55 (late 1610); Causa 1972, p. 963 n. 5 (painted in Sicily or Naples); Frommel 1972, pp. 44, 52–53; Marini 1974, pp. 282–83, 458–59 n. 92 (1610); Nicolson 1974, p. 625 (among last works); Röttgen 1974, pp. 206–9; Moir 1976, pp. 103 no. 47, 134 n. 225 (1607–9); Pacelli 1977, p. 829 (two copies in Naples in November 1610); Pacelli 1978, p. 67; Bologna 1980, p. 41; Moir 1982, pp. 32, 144 (1607–9); Gregori 1982, p. 39 (last Naples period); Marini 1982, p. 83 (1610); Cinotti 1983, no. 51 (late 1609–early 1610); Gedo 1983, p. 179; Hibbard 1983, pp. 262–67, 331–33 (1609–10, David prefigures Christ); Calvesi 1985, pp. 80–81, 83–84 (end 1609); Gregori 1985, no. 97 (old Neapolitan inventory reference tends to support dating of this work to second Neapolitan period); Christiansen 1986, p. 442, fig. 22 (many incisions on foreshortened arm and hand); Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 37; Marini 1989, pp. 554–56, n. 100 (Naples 1609–before May 11, 1610, “the letters on David’s sword . . . H.O.C.S., an abbreviation of the Latin phrase, *Humilitas occidit superbiam* [*Humility slays pride*] . . .”); Rossi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989; Calvesi 1990, p. 148; Posèq 1990, pp. 169–82, pl. 1 (1609?); Papi in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 16; Pacelli 1991, pp. 179–88; Bologna 1992, p. 345 (1610); Pacelli 1994, pp. 132–58 (1610); Gregori 1994, p. 126, 155, no. 84 (1609–10); Gilbert 1995, pp. 23–25, 107, 257; Askew in Macioce 1996, p. 255 (1609–10); Papi in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996; Rossi in Macioce 1996; Langdon 1998, pp. 384–86; Puglisi 1998, no. 89 (c. 1610); Robb 1998, p. 512 (1606); Benedetti in Mormando 1999, p. 218, fig. 40 (among final compositions); Coliva in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 130–31; Spike 2001, pp. 239–41, cat. no. 77 (1610); Stone 2001 (redates to Roman period, c. 1605–6, “carefully planned act of self-fashioning or myth making”); Testa in Volpi 2001, p. 140; Pacelli 2002 *passim*; Stone 2002, pp. 19–42; Macioce 2003, p. 268; Coliva in Rome-Milan-Vicenza, 2004, pp. 137–38; Gregori in Rome-Milan-Vicenza 2004, p. 54; Zeffi in Rome-Milan-Vicenza, 2004, p. 117 (1605–6); Coliva in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 137–39 (1610), cat. no. 16 (1607); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 177, 181 no. 38; Puglisi 2004–5, p. 532 (“careful description of the folds of David’s shirt and the firm modeling of his bare chest and extended arm . . . support an earlier dating”); Sgarbi 2005, no. 72 (1610, last work); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 31 (1609); Marini in Paliano 2006, p. 21; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 103, 117–19, 124, 132, fig. 39; Stone 2006, pp. 36–46 (painted in Rome before the death of Tomassoni); Tàtrai 2006, cat. no. 4; Tresoldi

2006, p. 105 (1609–10); Varriano 2006, pp. 9–10, 73, 81–83, 93–98, 110, 112–13, 117, 135, fig. 4; Debono 2007, p. 21 ill; Papa 2008, pp. 212–20 (1609–10); Coliva in Rome 2009, pp. 168–73 (1610; shows late technique, e.g., *The Martyrdom of Saint Ursula*).

On its literal level, the painting represents nothing more than an agile lad claiming his bounty on a criminal's head—on Caravaggio's criminal head, since the Goliath's darkened face is the painter's self-portrait. Indeed, the picture contains nothing that would define the event as biblical or the youth as David. Goliath's fabled sword was immense, not this modern rapier. David was not a swordsman: he killed the giant with a stone thrown from his shepherd's sling. Caravaggio omits the sling but includes it as an afterimage in the detail of the boy's sleeve looped over his belt.

For most viewers through the ages, the primary meaning of the picture has been the heroic story of David's triumph over the Philistine as showing that righteousness has prevailed over sin—an Old Testament foreshadowing of Christ's annihilation of Satan. The youthful shepherd is isolated in darkness. Instead of the customary shouts of jubilation, he contemplates his enemy in silent regret, not exulting at all. The dead man stares fixedly with one eye, the other lid is almost closed. To every authority that had sought Caravaggio's head, the message was clear: "Here it is."

Both Manilli and Bellori identify Cardinal Scipione Borghese as the patron of this *David*, which implies a dating to Caravaggio's Roman years prior to May 1606, as does Manilli's suggestion that David is a portrait of Caravaggio's model and assistant, Cecco del Caravaggio, whom he calls "Il Caravaggio." On the strength of these testimonies, the picture was generally dated 1605–6, following the election of Pope Paul V Borghese, until Longhi (1959) modified his earlier opinion. The picture is now considered by most writers one of the artist's last works, a circumstance favored by documents of 1610 and 1613 that indicate that the *David* entered the Borghese collection around that time. Manilli's identification of Goliath's head as a self-portrait is universally accepted.

The letters on the sword simulate the mark of a steelmaker and are difficult to interpret. Marini (1989) provided an ingenious reading of H.O.C.S., an abbreviation of the Latin phrase,

Humilitas occidit superbiam [Humility slays pride] from Saint Augustine's First Exposition on Psalm XXXIII, which Hibbard 1983 had previously associated with this *David*. Hermann Fiore (cited by Stone 2006) identifies the letters, M A C O F, that are to be read as a signature, M[ichaeli] A[ngeli] C[aravaggio] O[pus] F[ecit].

See pp. 239–41.

Condition:

Good. The painting received a much needed restoration by the Soprintendenza of Rome in 1999, replacing the old varnish that had become opaque in several places. David's shadowed right arm and hand were evidently barely painted. A series of incisions around David's arm and the back of his head demonstrate the care with which Caravaggio studied the foreshortening from a living model. Restorations of 1915, 1936, and 1951 are cited by Cinotti (1983). Coliva (2009, p. 172) notes an important finding, "After the campaign of chemical and diagnostic analyses that accompanied the restoration of all the Borghese Caravaggios, there are grounds for distinguishing between the technique used by the 'Roman' Caravaggios in executing his paintings and the one employed in works such as the *Young Saint John the Baptist* and precisely the *David*, which instead are much more similar to paintings such as the *Martyrdom of Saint Ursula*, . . . in both the accentuated technique of 'saving' the light with respect to the shade and the colour composition, as well as the priming. All of these considerations lead to dating the work at the beginning of 1610."

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies of this painting or possibly of the *David* in the Prado (cf. cat. no. 52):

C. I

November 5, 1610: Payment in Naples to Baldassarre Alvise to paint two copies of the *David* by Caravaggio: "To Giulio Cesare Fontana 10 ducats, and for him to the painter Baldassarre

Alvise, given in exchange for two copies of David by Michel'Angelo Caravaggio, who executed it and is executing it. And for him to Giulio Cesare d'Alietta.”

Bibliography:

Pacelli 1977, p. 829 (publishes two copies in Naples, private collections); Bologna 1980; Cinotti 1983, p. 502 (but copy published by Pacelli is Battistellian); Stoughton 1978, p. 408 n. 47 (documents published by Pacelli refer to a copy of the *David* painted for the Count of Villamediana; reference to copies in old Neapolitan inventories tends to support dating of this work to Naples period); Gregori 1985, p. 341 (Caracciolo-like, certainly not painting referred to in Pacelli documents); Marini 1989, p. 555; Pacelli 1994, p. 139; Coliva in Madrid-Bilbao 1999 (identifies Baldassarre Alvise, as the legally registered name of a Bolognese painter called il Galanino); Spike 2001, cat. no. 77.c.1 (as reference to seventeenth-century copy); Pacelli 2002, pp. 122, 130–42; Terzaghi 2007, pp. 309–10 (“the painter in question without doubt is identifiable with the Bolognese Baldassarre Aloisi called il Galanino, student and distant relative of Annibale Carracci”).

C.2

Rome, Collection of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps

1. Account book (Libro Mastro) of the Altemps, 1611–1613: February 15, 1613: payment by Giovan Angelo Altemps of 70 scudi to Prospero Orsi for two unidentified paintings of Saint Thomas and Our Lord and of David and Goliath [“scudi settanta di moneta a Prospero Orsi pittore e sono per doi quadri di San Tomaso e N.S. e l'altro di Golia e David”] (Spezzaferro in Calvesi and Volpi 2002, p. 29, who states that the paintings must be copies on the basis of the low price).

2. October 15, 1620: Inventory Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps Castello di Gallese, at c.38.r: “A David cho has in his hand the head of Goliath, by Bartolomeo, the excellent pupil of Caravaggio in life size with a gilt frame” [“Un David che ha in mano la testa di Golia di Bartolomeo Ottimo scolare del Caravaggio del naturale con cornice dorato”] (Macioce 2003, p. 345).

II. Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, p. 103, nos. 47a–47c; Cinotti 1983, p. 502. Among these are:

C.3

Gemäldegalerie Staatliche Museen Kassel, Inv. no. GK

Oil on canvas, 37⁷/₈ x 50³/₄ in. (96 x 129 cm)

Provenance:

By 1730 with Karl von Hessen-Kassel (1654–1730) who bequeathed it to the museum at his death.

Exhibition:

Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 3.

Bibliography:

Moir 1976, p. 103, no. 47b; Schnackenburg in *Gemäldegalerie Alte Meister*, 1996, vol. 1, p. 77, II, plate 330; Spike 2001, cat. no. 77.c.2 (copy); Hartje in *Düsseldorf 2006*, ill. p. 187, p. 207, cat. no. 3 (copy).

Additions to Catalogue Since 2001

78. *Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew*, 1604–6

Oil on canvas, 55 x 69¹/₄ in. (140.1 x 176 cm)

Hampton Court Palace, London; Royal Collection (RCIN 402824)

Provenance:

Acquired by Charles I in 1637 through William Frizell, placed in the Long Gallery at Whitehall; sold by the Puritan government to Mr. De Critz, November 18, 1651, as *Three Fishermen* by

Michel Angelo Caravaggio; recovered in the Restoration of 1665 and presented to Whitehall 1665; later at Windsor.

Inventories:

1. 1637, London: Record of purchase from William Frizell: "Caravaggio. Item the picture of the 3 disciples Saint John in a red blewish drapery & another in yellow coming from fishing half figures so big as the life being the 12th piece of the number of 23 Italian Collection peices which the King bought of Fresley in a large old wooden sarv'd frame. Size 4 ft. 4 in. by 5 ft. 8 in." (B. Reade, "William Frizell and the Royal Collection," *Burlington Magazine for Connoisseurs*, Vol. 89, No. 528 [Mar 1947], pp. 70–75, at p. 71).

2. c. 1639, Catalogue by van der Doort, Keeper of the Royal Collection, at p. 181: in Whitehall, *Three Disciples* by Caravaggio or an imitator.

3. In a contemporaneous inventory at Greenwich, n. 285, a painting *The Apostles Peter, James and John* by "M. A. Caravaggio."

4. 1640 inventory of the Commonwealth (p. 228): "*Three Fishermen* by Michel Angelo Caravaggio" with a value of £40.

5. November 18, 1651: "Three Fishermen by Caravaggio" sold with the paintings in the Gallery at Somerset House by the Commonwealth to De Critz for £40 (Reade 1947, p. 71).

6. *A catalogue of the Collection of the Pictures, &c. belonging to King James the Second*, London printed for W. Bathoe [1758] on British Museum Add. MS 15,752, which was a copy from MS. Harl. 1890 with small annotations and corrections by George Vertue, c. 1745, n. 70: "A piece, being three Apostles, one having a fish, by Michel Angelo" with an annotation by Horace Walpole: "It is now over a door at Windsor, and is one of the finest pictures the King has." (See Mahon, D. "Notes on the 'Dutch Gift' to Charles II: 11," *Burlington Magazine*, Vol. 91, No. 561, [Dec 1949], pp. 349–50)

Source:

1. Mezzotint dated 1783, by Boydell Murphy (published John Murray)
16¼ x 20¼ in. (408 x 528 mm) as by Caravaggio (New York, Metropolitan Museum
51.501.4818).

Exhibitions:

Naples 1963, no. 5a (as copy after Caravaggio); Rome-Termini 2006; London 2008.

Bibliography:

Law 1881, no. 285; Law 1898, p. 105, no. 285; Voss 1924, p. 79 (possibly original); Isarlov 1935, p. 118; Schudt 1942, p. 49 (copy); Longhi 1943, pp. 12, 39 n. 25 (as *Walk to Emmaus*; weak, copy); Longhi 1951, p. 26 (refines subject, date of original 1595); Hinks 1953, no. 28 (1599–1600); Friedlander 1955, p. 168, no. 19 (copy, prototype late 1590s, identifies subject as *Walk to Emmaus* described by Celio and Bellori); Wagner 1958, p. 230 (not even Caravaggio prototype); Salerno 1957 (original would be 1600); Jullian 1961, pp. 142, 154 n. 9–11, 228 (copy, 1601–2); Nicolson 1963, p. 210 (Saraceni?); Levey 1964, pp. 69–70; Guttoso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 49; Moir 1967, pp. 66, 110, no. 61b (copy); Kitson 1969, no. 48 (1600–1602); Cinotti 1971, pp. 124, 193 n. 402, 405–6; Levey 1971, p. 52 n. 11; Marini 1974, pp. 128, 370 n. 27 (copy, 1598); Nicolson 1974, pp. 559–60 (must await its restoration before deciding on its attribution); Moir 1976, pp. 110, 144–45, no. 61a–m (English copies derive from this example, Italian copies from lost original); Scribner 1977, pp. 376 n. 18, 381 n. 44; Nicolson 1979, pp. 32, 49; Cinotti 1983, no. 76 (attributed); Hibbard 1983, p. 294 n. 42 (excludes existence of prototype); Cinotti 1983, no. 76, p. 559 (attributed, one of several copies after lost original); Hibbard 1983, p. 294 (Bolognese prototype); Marini 1983, pp. 142–44; Marini 1989, pp. 412–13, no. 29 (Rome 1598, original?); Levey 1991, pp. 53–54, no. 424 (not *Walk to Emmaus* but *Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew*, weak execution, “conceivable that it would look less impressive if it were cleaned”); Bologna 1992, pp. 318–19, cat. 46 (considers this an autograph Caravaggio *Walk to Emmaus* and that which was paid by Ciriaco Mattei on January 7, 1602); Cappelletti–Testa 1994, p. 104 (not Mattei picture described in early sources as “Christ at Emmaus”); Gregori 1994, p. 147, no. 22 (c. 1597–98); Gavazza–Nepi Sciré–Rotondi Terminiello 1995, pp. 142–43; Puglisi 1998, no. 17

(copy?, c. 1597–98); Spike 2001, cat. no. 85 (other works attributed); Christiansen in *Naples-London* 2004–5, p. 140 (c. 1601–1603); Sgarbi 2005, no. 25 (c. 1598–99, dates just after *Jove* [cat. no. 13], and just before *Doubting Thomas* [cat. no. 33]); Featherstone in *Rome Termini* 2006, pp. 36–48; Marini in *Rome-Termini* 2006, pp. 26–32 (Rome c. 1600); Marini and Mahon in *Rome-Termini* 2006, pp. 52–79 (Rome c. 1600); Whitaker and Clayton 2007 (1602–1604, autograph); Whitaker and Featherstone in *Burlington Magazine*, 2010, forthcoming.

The subject of this picture, of which many copies are known, has often been confused for the *Way to Emmaus*. Friedlaender (1955) associated this composition with Mancini's *Christ Going to Emmaus*, painted for the Mattei family. As documents have now identified the Mancini reference with the *Supper at Emmaus* in London (cat. no. 25), there is little reason to question the reading, first offered by Longhi, of this curiously reticent composition once described as “Three Fishermen.”

The iconography of this painting is highly original, but can be interpreted through comparison with other paintings by the artist. Two apostles are called by Christ, who appears beardless. The yellow mantle and the “bluish” tunic worn by the apostle at far left identify him as Saint Peter, as does his bald pate, resembling a tonsure. He carries two fish (one very darkened and unrecognizable) on sticks that cross in the form of an “X,” a symbol of Christ and also of Saint Andrew. The brothers Simon Peter and Andrew were together when Christ called them, saying, “Follow me and I will make you fishers of men” (Matt. 4:19). Andrew points to himself with the same questioning gesture used by Matthew in the Contarelli Chapel.

In the first edition of this catalogue it was noted that “Marini’s proposal (1989) of this overlooked canvas as a Roman period original deserves serious consideration in light of its notable quality. One hopes that the painting will be the subject of restoration and technical analysis in the near future.”

On March 7, 2003 the author was invited to examine this painting in the course of its restoration at the Windsor Conservation Studio by Rupert Featherstone, senior conservator. Lucy Whitaker, assistant to the surveyor of the Queen’s pictures, was also present and helpful.

The process of cleaning had been begun a few days previous, and dense layers of discolored varnish had been removed from two small rectangular “windows,” each about 4 by 6 inches.

Enough could be seen of the original paint surface to recognize Caravaggio’s characteristic handling of his maturity, as I communicated by letter the next day. Sir Denis Mahon and Clovis Whitfield had visited the studio a few days earlier and reached a similar conclusion, provisional on the completion of the restoration.

The painting was exhibited in Rome inside the Termini train station in 2006. It was proposed without documentation that the painting might once have belonged to Vincenzo Giustiniani. After viewing the painting during its exhibition in Rome, a date toward the end of Caravaggio’s Roman period, c. 1606, seemed advisable on the basis of its dark tonality and relatively thin application of paint. This view was communicated to Rupert Featherstone by letter dated February 6, 2007.

Condition:

Mediocre. The paint surface is significantly abraded throughout, and some of the colors have deteriorated and changed over time. Saint Peter’s dark green tunic was originally more blue; Christ’s robe, now a pinkish color in the highlights, was originally a deep purplish-crimson still visible at the bottom edge of the painting where the pigment was protected from fading beneath an old repaint.

During recent restoration at the Windsor Conservation Studio numerous incisions, perhaps made with a kind of stylus, were observed in the lower paint layers, marking out important parts of the composition. Incisions are visible around the ear of Saint Andrew (hidden by hair) and around Christ’s head and shoulder.

Significant pentimenti came to light on the outlines of Christ’s neck and shoulder. Saint Andrew’s hand was originally laid out slightly higher and farther to the left.

See Rupert Featherstone (“The ‘resurrection’ of The Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew,” in *Rome-Termini 2006*, pp. 36–48) for a detailed condition report.

Copies:

Selected copies are recorded by Moir 1976, p. 110, nos. 61a–61k.

C. I

Bernardo Strozzi

Genoa, Private collection

Oil on canvas, 49 x 62¼ in. (124.3 x 158 cm)

Exhibition:

Genoa 1995.

Bibliography:

Marini 1983, p. 152 n. 76; Marini 1987, p. 412; Algeri in Genoa 1995, p. 142, cat. no. 23 (without date); Loire 1995, pp. 477–79; Marini and Mahon in Rome 2006; Whitaker and Clayton 2007 (date the Strozzi copy to before he left Genoa c. 1630).

C. 2

Ulrich Loth

Oil on canvas

Exhibition:

Munich 2008.

Bibliography:

Whitaker and Clayton 2007 (exact replica).

Other Works Attributed

79. *Ecce Homo*

This composition exists in several versions, the first of which appeared in 1986. There is some dispute between Marini, Gregori, and others as to whether the versions are copies or originals.

V. I

Private collection

Oil on canvas, 30⁵/₈ x 40 in. (77.7 x 101.8 cm)

Exhibition:

Palermo 2001, cat. no. 4.

Bibliography:

Marini 1989, pp. 546–47, n. 94 (attributed, Messina 1609); Gregori 1990, pp. 19–27 (copy, associates with Passion cycle commissioned by Niccolò di Giacomo in Messina 1609); Papi 1990, pp. 28–48 (copy, Arenzano is lost original); Gregori 1994, p. 154, no. 80 (copy of lost original c. 1609); Puglisi 1998, no. 81 (copy? c. 1609); Fumagalli in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 145–46, fig. 227 (copy); Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 14–15, figs. 14, 15 (as in New York, collection of E. Cortez, dates to before August 1609); Pupillo in Palermo 2001, pp. 114–17, cat. no. 4 (spring–summer 1609); Spike 2001, cat. no. 78 (other works attributed); Gregori in Naples-London 2004–5, p. 155 (copy); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 176, 182 no. 32a; Gregori in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 212–13, ill. pp. 178, 181 (Arenzano is a copy after recently discovered original, see v.3 below).

According to Marini (1989), Gregori called this painting to the attention of the restorer, Pico Cellini, who first published the photographs after restoration as an autograph picture. Gregori (1990) describes the painting as a copy after a lost prototype by Caravaggio possibly related

to the commission Caravaggio received in Messina in 1609 for subjects of the Passion (see Catalogue of Lost Works, L.1). In subsequent publications the painting is considered a copy after a lost work, sometimes identified as an *Ecce Homo with Pilate and Two Soldiers* (Catalogue of Lost Works L.30).

The composition is decidedly Caravaggesque and it inspired imitations by Battistello Caracciolo and other Neapolitan painters. The technique of this version invites comparison to the *Judith Beheading Holofernes* in the collection of the Banco di Napoli, Naples (Other Works Attributed, cat. no. 89), which after long discussion has recently been convincingly attributed to Louis Finson. It remains an open question as to whether this *Ecce Homo* is an imitation or a copy of a lost original by Caravaggio.

V.2

Arenzano, sanctuary of Bambin Gesù di Prague

Bibliography:

Papi “Un nuovo Ecce Homo del Caravaggio” in *Paragone*, 1990, 489, pp. 28–49; Marini in Palermo 2001, p. 22, fn. 57 (good copy, by a Sicilian hand); Spike 2001, cat. no. 78 (other works attributed); Gregori in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 212–13, ill pp. 178, 181 (Arenzano is a copy after recently discovered original, see v.3 below); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 176, 182 no. 32b.

V.3

Private collection

Oil on canvas, 32 $\frac{7}{8}$ x 41 in. (83.3 x 104 cm)

Exhibitions:

Naples-London 2004–5, cat no. 22; Barcelona 2005, cat no. 13; Düsseldorf 2006, cat no. 5.

Bibliography:

Gregori in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 155–56, cat no. 22; Pagano and Utili, Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 176, 181 no. 32c; Gregori 2005, pp. 3–24; Marini 2005, p. 559; Gregori in Barcelona

2005, pp. 96–99, cat. no. 13 (c. 1609); Gregori in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 209–211, cat. no. 5, ill. 180–81 (1609).

Gregori publishes as autograph this version brought to her attention in 2004 by Paolo Saponi. A comparative report of the x-rays of v.1 to v.3 is provided at Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 210–11 in support of the attribution of this picture.

V.4

Private collection, Barcelona

Oil on canvas, 31½ x 39¼ in. (80 x 99.5 cm)

Exhibitions:

Düsseldorf 2006, cat no. 6 (copy).

Bibliography:

Marini 2005, pp. 332, 558–60, no. 102; Marini in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 209–211, cat. no. 6, ill. pp. 179, 181 (as copy, first quarter seventeenth century).

Marini (2006) concludes that v.1 is the original; v.2 and v.4 are good copies; he reserves judgement on v.3, pending inspection.

80. *Saint Francis in Prayer*

Church of San Quirico, Monastero delle Clarisse, Assisi

Oil on canvas, 56¾ x 39⅞ in. (144 x 100 cm)

Sources:

Engraving by Pieter Soutman (1580–1657) in which the design is attributed to Caravaggio (Marini 1989, p. 262 cat. 75; Vannugli 1998, pp. 6–7 [relates this reference to the Saint Francis found in Carpineto Romano]; Spike 2001, cat. no. 9.1).

Bibliography:

Cristofani–Leonelli 1883, p. 56 (Ludovico Cigoli); Causa 1972, pp. 963, 969 (connects Mancini reference to copy by Filippo Vitale in Sacristy of same church that is very Caravaggesque, postulates lost Caravaggio of same type); Moir 1976, p. 122 3/vi (Francesco Bassano picture at Kunsthistorisches Museum is origin of Soutman engraving); Pacelli 1977, p. 820 (connects to lost picture in Sant’Anna dei Lombardi, Naples); Toscano 1980, pp. 398–99; Strinati 1982, p. 93 (similar composition to *Saint Francis* in Modena, Galleria Estense, circle of Saraceni, there are thus three versions, the copy in Sant’Anna dei Lombardi, the Soutman engraving, and the circle of Saraceni, which all reflect lost Caravaggio model); Gregori 1985, p. 294, nn. 82–83 (cites cult of Francis diffused in Tuscany, ignores Assisi picture); Marini 1989, pp. 512–13, n. 75 (lost original, Naples 1607); Spike 2001, cat. no. 79 (other works attributed).

The picture has been proposed by some writers as based upon a lost original; Marini (1989) tentatively assigned its execution to Caravaggio himself. The debate was launched by two pieces of evidence: an undated etching by Pieter Soutman that ascribes the invention to Caravaggio and an analogous *Saint Francis* by Filippo Vitale in Sant’Anna dei Lombardi in Naples, perhaps executed as early as 1613, in which Causa (1972) noted its “qualities of strict Caravaggesque derivation almost as if a copy” [“caratteri di strettissima derivazione caravaggesca, quasi di copia”]. Moir (1976) rejected this hypothesis identifying instead as the print’s source an analogous *Saint Francis* (50½ x 37 in. [128 x 94 cm]) by Leandro Bassano, previously attributed to Francesco Bassano, in the Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna (inv. no. 42; Provenance: Hamilton Collection 1638–49; dated c. 1600–1615). Of possible relevance to this debate is the reference to a similar *Saint Francis* in a 1631 Neapolitan inventory as a copy after Caravaggio.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

1631 inventory of Juan de Lescano: [42] “Saint Francis who is praying on a cross over a skull, copy after Caravaggio” (Labrot 1992, p. 57; see Catalogue of Lost Works L.55).

C.2

Saint Francis

by Filippo Vitale

Sant'Anna dei Lombardi, Naples, c. 1613

81. *Boy with a Vase of Roses*

Oil on canvas, 26½ x 20¾ in. (67.3 x 51.8 cm)

High Museum, Atlanta

Provenance:

England, private collection; Paris, Moussali collection; Wildenstein & Co., New York; from whom purchased in 1958 through The Great Painting Fund.

Documents:

I. Della Pergola identifies this painting with number 99 in the 1607 inventory of paintings confiscated from Cavaliere d'Arpino for Cardinal Scipione Borghese, without indication of author, "a painting with a portrait of a woman with a carafe of flowers on a small table" ["Un quadro di ritratto d'una donna con caraffa di fiori in un tavolino"] (Della Pergola 1964², p. 253).

II. Marini identifies this painting instead with number 59 in the 1607 inventory of paintings confiscated from Cavaliere d'Arpino for Cardinal Scipione Borghese, without indication of author, "another small picture of a youth and a band with diverse flowers without a frame" ["Un altro quadretto di un giovane ed una banda che tiene diversi fiori senza cornice"] (Della Pergola 1964, p. 28).

III. Della Pergola identifies this painting with number 47 in the April 7, 1693 inventory of the ground floor apartment of the Palazzo Borghese in Campo Marzio, "Between two windows on the cornice a painting of two palmi with a portrait of a youth with a vase of roses on canvas . . .

with a gilt frame by Garavaggio [*sic*].” [“Tra le due finestre sotto al cornicione un quadro di due palmi con un ritratto d’un Giovane con un Vaso di rose in tela del N . . . con cornice dorata del Garavaggio [*sic*]”] (Della Pergola 1964², pp. 253).

IV. Fumagalli (*Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, p. 145) identifies this painting with a work described in the accounts of the “pittore doratore,” Annibale Durante, Casa Borghese, July 25, 1612, a portrait of Caravaggio holding flowers in his hand [“un ritratto del Caravaggio, che tiene fiori in mano”].

Source:

1. Fumagalli (*Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, p. 145) identifies this painting with one described by Nibby (*Roma nell’anno MDCCCXXXVIII. Parte Seconda Moderna*, Rome, 1841, p. 602) in the Palazzo Borghese, “a half figure of a youth holding flowers in his hands, work of the renowned Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“Una mezza figura esprime un giovane che tiene de’ fiori fra le mani, opera pregevole di Michelangiolo da Caravaggio”].

Exhibitions:

Houston 1952; Bordeaux 1955; St. Petersburg, Florida 1965; New York-Naples 1985 (as copy); Bergamo 2000, no. 13 (as copy); Frankfurt am Main 2009, cat. no. 26.

Bibliography:

Venturi, letter to Wildenstein & Co. from Rome, March 18, 1949; Voss 1951, pp. 410–12; Baumgart 1952, p. 18; Longhi 1952, no. VIII (doubts); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1591–92) n. 96 (on the basis of a photograph, “sound claims as an exceptionally early work of the master”); Hinks 1953 (rejects); Baumgart 1955, no. 6 (1591–93); Czobor 1955, p. 213 n. 21 (self-portrait); Friedlaender 1955 (rejects); Wagner 1958, p. 227 (rejects, “excessive metallic sharpness”); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 344 (rejects); Julian 1961, pp. 47, 53, 56 n. 37–38, 225 (c. 1592, for quality of still life); Della Pergola 1964, pp. 28, 453 n. 213; Della Pergola 1964², pp. 253–56; Hancock *Catalogue of the Collection*, 1965, p. 13; Calvesi 1966, p. 287; Salerno 1966, p. 110; Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa, 1967, no. 5 (1592–93); Kitson 1969, no. 5 (1592–93: details of

leaves, flowers, glass, fabrics, hair are remarkable, but facial type and idealized pose untypical, variant of *Boy Bitten by a Lizard* [cat. no. 7]); Salerno 1970, p. 235; Cinotti 1971, pp. 88–90, 163, 179; Posner 1971, p. 316; Spear 1971, p. 4 n. 11; Spear 1971³ pp. 470–73 (copy of lost original, cites another version); Zeri–Frederickson 1972, p. 44; Marini 1973, nn. 4/4a (copy by Salini?, from original of 1593); Marini 1974, no. 6 (Roman, circle of Antiveduto Grammatica, Baglione, Tommaso Salini); Röttgen 1974, pp. 253 n. 157, pl. 98 (as Baglione, 1605–10); Salerno 1974, p. 587 (1593–95); Moir 1967, I, p. 27 n. 20, no. 103 (Pensionante di Saraceni?); Moir 1976, pp. 116 no. 103a, 136 n. 229 (rejects, school); Nicolson 1979, p. 34; Marini 1983, pp. 123–31, 149 (notes bad condition, perhaps original); Cinotti 1983, no. 72 (attributed); Hibbard 1983, p. 284 (Baglione); Gregori 1985, no. 62 (unfaithful copy of lost original, not self-portrait); Cottino 1989, p. 663 (copy); Marini 1989, pp. 365–67, no. 8 (copy? 1593–94); Gregori in Florence 1991, p. 125 (copy); Bologna 1992, pp. 299 (1592–93, best copy of lost original); Gregori 1994, p. 145, no. 4 (1593–94, copy); Fumagalli in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, p. 145; Puglisi 1998, no. 5 (copy? c. 1593–94); Marini in Bergamo 2000, p. 189 (copy); Spike 2001, cat. no. 80 (other works attributed); Eclercy in Frankfurt 2009, pp. 154–55, cat. no. 26 (copy?).

This *Boy with a Vase of Roses* is widely considered a copy after a lost original painted by Caravaggio soon after his arrival in Rome, 1592–93. Similar pictures were in the studio of Cavaliere d'Arpino in 1607. Most authorities have observed that the smooth handling of the boy's face and shirt are uncharacteristic of Caravaggio.

The painting appears to be an original painting inspired by Caravaggio's early genre works. Presumably Cesari continued to offer this sort of decorative picture after Caravaggio's activity in his workshop in 1593–94. The theme—an allegory of love—is interpreted with a superficiality impossible to assign to Caravaggio. The fine still life of flowers and carafe was perhaps executed by a different painter under the influence of Jan Brueghel. See p. 43, illustrated at p. 35.

Copies:

Selected copies are listed by Moir 1976, pp. 116 no. 103b, 157 n. 274; Marini 1983, pp. 126–27, fig. 17.

82. *Portrait of Sigismondo Laire*

Oil on canvas, 30 x 25 in. (76 x 63.5 cm)

Staatliche Museen Preussischer Kulturbesitz, Gemäldegalerie, inv. 354,

Berlin

According to Danesi Squarzina (2003, inventari I, pp. 392–93), this portrait, now attributed to Jusepe de Ribera, is not identifiable with the painting of this sitter listed in the Giustiniani inventory of 1638 (see Catalogue of Lost Works L.81).

83. *Christ at the Column*

Oil on canvas, 55 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 41 $\frac{3}{4}$ in. (140 x 106 cm)

Palazzo Camuccini, Cantalupo Sabino (Rieti)

Provenance:

Nineteenth-century, noble Roman family; Barone Pietro Camuccini, Rome; Vincenzo Camuccini, Rome.

Source:

1. Orsini 1784, p. 41, records in the sacristy of the church of San Pietro, Perugia, a copy of “Cristo alla colonna” by Caravaggio (Macioce 1996, p. 133 n. 29).

Bibliography:

Longhi 1960, pp. 30–31 (by Camuccini); Marini 1974, pp. 123, 366–68, n. 25 (1598, relates to Vienna); Nicolson 1974³, p. 624 (questions); Marini 1974, pp. 123–24 no. 25 (original?, c. 1598); Moir 1976, p. 118 no. 106c, 158 n. 278 (near Valentin?); Nicolson 1979, p. 624 (?); Marini 1981, p. 366 (1598); Cinotti 1983, p. 561 (?; Marini’s dating too early); Gregori 1985, p. 318 (copy of lost original, Neapolitan period); Marini 1989, pp. 420–22, no. 34 (Rome, 1599 original?); Bologna 1992, p. 336 (all copies lost original, 1607); Gregori 1994, p. 148, no. 28 (copy, c. 1598–99); Puglisi 1998, no. 22 (as *Flagellation of Christ*, copy?, c. 1598–99); Spike 2001, cat. no. 82 (other

works attributed); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 173, 180 no. 13.c.

The invention of this *Christ at the Column* is generally recognized as due to Caravaggio in his Roman phase. Marini (1989) has tentatively proposed it as autograph, c. 1599. The same scholar would associate with this *Christ at the Column* the Borghese provenance that is usually assigned instead to the *Flagellation of Christ* in Rouen (cat. no. 54, Sources). The question remains open for both these pictures. The present *Christ at the Column* is difficult to judge on the basis of the mediocre photographs that have been published and it is to be hoped that the painting will be made available for study.

Copies:

C. I

Catania, Museo Civico

Oil on canvas, 59 $\frac{1}{8}$ x 39 $\frac{3}{8}$ in. (150 x 100 cm)

Bibliography:

Longhi 1915, p. 61 (as derivation by young Battistello Carracciolo of the *Flagellation* by Caravaggio in San Domenico Maggiore, 1607); Longhi 1943, pp. 18–19 (both copies of late original by Caravaggio); Bottari 1949, pp. 217–18 (copy at Catania inferior to Macerata); Longhi 1951, no. 58 (inferior version of Macerata picture); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (rejects Caravaggio prototype); Hinks 1953, no. 39 (refers to late Roman period); Baumgart 1955, no. 17 (Carracciolo original); Jullian 1955, pp. 83–84 (after lost original); Wagner 1958 (Carracciolo original); Berne Joffroy 1959, pp. 323 (copies of lost Caravaggio); Longhi 1960, pp. 30–31; Jullian 1961, pp. 175, 182 n. 41–43; Moir 1967, I, p. 254, II, p. 59; Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 79b (copies); Kitson 1969, no. 79b (copy); Cinotti 1971, p. 136, 199 n. 507 (derivation of Naples); Marini 1974, pp. 123–24, no. 25, fig. E1; Moir 1976, p. 118 no. 106b (perhaps Valentin painted original); Nicolson 1979, p. 624; Cinotti 1983, p. 561 (copy); Bologna 1992, p. 336 (all copies lost original, 1607); Spike 2001, cat. no. 82.c.1 (copy); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 173, 180 no. 13.b.

C.2

Macerata, Pinacoteca Civica; inv. 49

Oil on canvas, 52½ x 39 in. (133 x 99 cm)

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, n. 58 (as copy, but better version than picture at Catania); Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 27 (as anonymous seventeenth-century copy).

Bibliography:

Longhi 1943, pp. 18–19 (both copies of late original by Caravaggio); Bottari 1949, pp. 217–18 (copy at Catania inferior to Macerata); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (marginalia, 1604–5); Hinks 1953, pp. 71–72, no. 39 (1604–5); Friedlaender 1954, p. 150 (copy of lost original); Baumgart 1955, no. 17 (Caracciolo original); Friedlaender 1955, p. 207 (copy after Caravaggio, late period); Jullian 1955, pp. 83–84 (after lost original 1607); Chastel 1956, pp. 954–55; Wagner 1958, p. 230 (copy of lost original 1607); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 323 (copies of lost Caravaggio); Longhi 1960, pp. 30–31; Jullian 1961, pp. 175, 182 n. 41–43 (copy of lost original); Moir 1967, I, p. 254, II, p. 59; Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 79a (copies); Kitson 1969, no. 79a (copy of lost original); Marini 1974, pp. 123–24, no. 25, fig. E2; Moir 1976, p. 118 no. 106a (perhaps Valentin painted original); Cinotti 1971, p. 136, 199 n. 507 (copy of lost original, 1607); Nicolson 1979, p. 624; Cinotti 1983, no. 79 (attributed, copy); Bologna 1992, p. 336 (all copies of lost original, 1607); Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 126–28; Spike 2001, cat. no. 82.c.2 (copy); Barucca in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 168–69, cat. no. 27 (as anonymous seventeenth-century copy); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 173, 180 no. 13a.

84. *The Toothpuller*

Oil on canvas, 54⅞ x 76⅝ in. (139.5 x 194.5 cm)

Palazzo Pitti, Florence, inv. 5682

Provenance:

From 1925 on deposit in the Palazzo di Montecitorio, Rome.

Inventory:

1. Gregori (1985, p. 342) identifies this painting with an untraced painting of this subject in the 1637 inventory of Palazzo Pitti (ASF Guardaroba 525, fol. 572): “A painting on canvas by Caravaggio of a toothpuller and other figures around a table . . .” [“un quadro di tela di mano del Caravaggio dipinto che uno leveva i denti a un altro e altre figure intorno a una tavola . . . con adornamento di legno tutto dorato circa alto bracci 2 $\frac{3}{4}$ largo 3 e $\frac{3}{4}$ ”].

Source:

1. Scannelli 1657, p. 199: “I also saw some years ago in the apartments of His Highness the Grand Duke of Tuscany a painting of half-length figures carried out with his accustomed naturalism that shows a surgeon pulling a tooth of a peasant, and if this picture were in good condition instead of darkened in many areas and ruined, it would be one of the most worthy pictures he painted” [“Viddi pure anni sono nelle stanza del Serenissimo Gran Duca di Toscana un Quadro di meze figure della solita naturalezza, che fa vedere quando un Ceretano cava ad un Contadino un dente, e se questo Quadro fosse di buona conservatione, come si ritova in buona parte oscuro, e rovinato, saria une delle più degne operationi che havesse dipinto” (Gregori 1985, p. 342).

Exhibitions:

Florence 1970, no. 6 (as unknown follower); New York-Naples 1985, no. 98; Florence 1991, pp. 259–61; Bergamo 2000, no. 50; Cremona-New York 2004; Barcelona 2005, cat. no. 12; Rome-Termini 2006; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 18; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 17.

Bibliography:

Friedlaender 1955, p. 226 (unusual subject and possibly a work of Honthorst that Scannelli took to be a work by the master himself); Briganti 1967, p. 404 (as Caracciolo); Borea in Florence 1970, no. 6 (unknown follower, Caravaggio did not paint such genre scenes, especially at such a late date); Volpe 1970, p. 110–11 (rejects, anecdotal typical of Dutch); Schleier 1971, p. 88 (perhaps); Gregori 1975, pp. 42–43; Testori 1975, p. 3; Calvesi 1975, p. 3; Nicolson 1979, p. 34

(uncertain, ruined); Bologna 1980, p. 41 n. 8 (rejects); Marini 1980, no. 115 (rejects, derives from Honthorst or Rombouts); Gregori 1982, pp. 37, 39; Cinotti 1983, no. 75 (attributed); Hibbard 1983, p. 342 (rejects); Spear 1984, p. 165 (rejects); Gregori 1985, no. 98 (late work); Spike 1985, p. 417 (provocative proposal); Christiansen 1986, p. 438 (autograph late work); Cottino 1989, p. 672; Christiansen 1990, p. 51 n. 30; Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 21; Bologna 1992, pp. 352 (attributed); Spike 1992², pp. 275–77 (doubts); Gregori 1994, p. 136 (1608–9); Gregori 1994, p. 154, no. 75 (1608–9); Puglisi 1998, no. 79 (attributed, c. 1608–10); Robb 1998, p. 498 (rejects); Castellotti in Bergamo 2000, pp. 221–22; Spike 2001, cat. no. 83 (other works attributed); Chiarini 2003, I, p. 222, II, p. 111, cat. no. 157 (questionable); Navarro in Chiarini 2003, I, pp. 220–22; Christiansen in Cremona-New York 2004, pp. 175–76 (1608–9); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 176, 182 no. 30; Zeffi in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 124 (1610); Fabbri in Pontedera 2005, pp. LXXII, LXXVII n. 53–55 (c.1608 Malta, perhaps brought to Florence by Martelli in 1609); Gregori in Barcelona 2005, pp. 90–95, cat. no. 12 (c. 1609); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 120 (controversial); Varriano 2006, pp. 125–26, 132, fig. 100 (questionable); Gregori in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 18, pp. 300–305; Gregori in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 17, pp. 306–12.

The provocative proposal by Gregori to recognize in this *Toothpuller* an autograph invention by Caravaggio is strongly supported by its Medici provenance by 1637 and the precise description by Scannelli in 1657. Independent confirmation of an indirect kind is provided by the presence in a Spanish collection by 1630 of a *Toothpuller* considered a copy after the artist. That the painting faithfully reflects the style of Caravaggio's late works is indubitable. At the time of its 1985 exhibition, Christiansen reported that its technique is congruent with Caravaggio's.

Nevertheless the *Toothpuller* has failed to convince most observers primarily because of its boring composition and numerous glaring lapses in execution. The patient's face is monstrously distorted in ways that cannot be explained by its rapid execution. Comparison with the late *Salomé* in London underscores the fact that Caravaggio's observations are never compromised no matter how economical his execution becomes. The witnesses to the toothpulling occupy a large part of the composition yet are essentially superfluous.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

November 17, 1630, inventory of Don Martín de Saavedra Guzmán y Galindo, knight of the Order of Calatrava, inventory made of objects pledged against loan of 1,000 ducats and 4,551 silver reales from his father: “[24] a copy of a Caravaggio, Toothpullers” (Burke–Cherry 1997, pp. 15, 282).

85. *Salomé with the Head of Saint John the Baptist*

Oil on canvas, 36 x 28½ in. (91.8 x 71.5 cm)

Arditi di Castelvete collection, Lecce

Exhibition:

Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 23.

Bibliography:

Bologna in Pacelli 1984, p. 104; Marini 1989, p. 543 (Battistello Caracciolo, cites Stoughton); Bologna 1992, pp. 340–41, fig. 80 (1609, or after?); Puglisi 1998, no. 84 (variant); Spike 2001, cat. no. 84 (other works attributed); Bologna in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 158–59, cat. no. 23 (1608–9); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 179, 181 no. 34.

Attributable to a Neapolitan painter influenced by Caracciolo.

86. *Still Life with Flowers and Fruits*

Oil on canvas, 28⁵/₈ x 39¹/₂ in. (76 x 100.4 cm)

Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford, Ct., inv. 1942.353

Provenance:

Purchased as Fede Galizia (Milan 1578?–c. 1630) in 1942 from Koester Gallery, New York-London from the Sumner Fund.

Inventory:

1. Zeri (1976) identified this painting with number 47 in the 1607 inventory of paintings confiscated from the studio of Cavaliere d'Arpino for Cardinal Scipione Borghese “[47] A painting of fruits and flowers with two carafes” [“Un quadro pieno di frutti, et fiori con due Caraffe”].

Exhibitions:

New York 1944, no. 35 (as Fede Galizia); San Francisco 1949, no. 35 (as Fede Galizia); Paris 1952, no. 66 (unknown Italian, 1615–20); Sarasota 1958 (attributed to Fede Galizia); Houston 1962, no. 6 (as Fede Galizia); Philadelphia 1963, no. 120 (as Caravaggio Follower); Hartford 1963, no. 9 (as Caravaggio Follower); New York-Dayton-Tulsa 1983, no. 10 (as Caravaggio Follower); New York 1985, no. 65; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 18 (as Master of Hartford Still Life); Munich 2002.

Bibliography:

Sterling in Paris 1952, no. 66 (Caravaggesque with Flemish influence, lost original); Sterling 1952, pp. 53–54 (anonymous copy of lost Caravaggio); Hüttinger in Zurich-Rotterdam 1964–65, p. 36, no. 33 (connects to *Still Life* in Roman private collection, Roman 1610–20); Causa 1966 (rejects, connects to *Still Life*, Galleria Manzoni, Milan); Moir 1967, I, p. 27n. 19, II, p. 37 (northern master); Causa 1972, p. 1033, no. 6 (not Caravaggio); Volpe 1972, p. 74 (connects with pair of *Still Lifes*, Finarte, Milan); Fredericksen–Zeri 1972, pp. 44, 506, 585 (as follower);

Gregori 1973, pp. 41–48 (Crescenzi); Moir 1976, p. 138 n. 234; Zeri 1976, pp. 92–103, fig. 100 (relates painting to Bellori and identifies as first Roman work of young Caravaggio, second half 1593, connects to two still lifes in Borghese collection, Rome; he rejects pictures published by Gregori 1973 as by a different hand, Roman 1620); Volpe 1976 (nominates group of “Master of Hartford” and includes *Saint John The Baptist* in Toledo as G. B. Crescenzi); Rosci 1977, pp. 83–112 (not Caravaggio); Causa 1978, pp. 39–48 (rejects); Marini 1978/79, pp. 43–44, n. 128 (only middle part possibly by Caravaggio); Strinati in Rome 1979, p. 62 (attributed); Sterling 1981, p. 17 (anonymous follower of Caravaggio); Cinotti 1983, no. 92, p. 567, fig. 1, p. 633; Spike 1983, no. 10, pp. 46–47 (follower of Caravaggio, Roman); Harris 1983, p. 514 (evidence of impact of early Caravaggio in Rome); Marini in Rome 1984, pp. 13, 17 n. 32 (Francesco Zucchi?, c. 1562–1622); Salerno 1984, pp. 46–55, fig. 13.6 (Zucchi?); Gregori 1985, no. 65 (follows Zeri, possibly early Caravaggio); Spike 1985, pp. 416–17 (not Caravaggio); Cottino 1989, pp. 654–62 (young Caravaggio?); Salerno 1989, p. 30 (not Caravaggio “for superficial and repetitive manner in which Lombard and, in a way, also Caravaggesque elements are represented”); Cadogan–Mahoney 1991, pp. 92–97 (as follower?; publish March 22, 1960 letter from Longhi to Curator, C. Cunningham, “Not by Galizia. I studied it in Paris . . . and I think it is a Flemish free copy from a lost early Caravaggio” [p. 96, n. 7]); Bologna 1992, p. 347 (rejects); Berra 1996, pp. 130–32 (style diverse from that of Caravaggio); Laureati in London–Rome 2001, cat. no. 18 (as c. 1600, Master of Hartford Still Life); Spike 2001, cat. no. 86 (other works attributed); Cottino in Munich 2002, pp. 138–39; Cottino in Florence, 2003, pp. 142–43.

Charles Sterling was the first to recognize the Roman characteristics of this *Still Life with Flowers and Fruit*, previously ascribed to Fede Galizia. A general consensus that the picture was the work of a Roman artist influenced by Caravaggio was momentarily challenged by Zeri’s designation in 1976 of this painting as the name piece of a group of still lifes he attributed to the young Caravaggio in Giuseppe Cesari’s workshop, c. 1593. The Caravaggio hypothesis was dismissed after its consideration in New York in 1983 and by the subsequent appearance of numerous other paintings plausibly attributed to this same anonymous artist active in Rome.

The painting appears to be by Antonio Tanari, a figure painter and still-life specialist documented in Rome between 1609 and 1635.

87. *Saint John the Baptist*

Oil on canvas, 50¼ x 37 in. (127.5 x 95.5 cm)

London, Fernando Peretti

Provenance:

Private collection, Switzerland; sale, Sotheby's London, October 29, 1998, lot no. 137, as Circle of Caravaggio.

Exhibition:

Naples-London 2004–5, cat. no. 24.

Bibliography:

Spike 2001, cat. no. 87 (other works attributed); Gregori in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 154 (“possibly original”); Peretti in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 160–62, cat. no. 24 (“new proposals”); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 178, 181 no. 43; Kliemann, J. in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, pp. 190, fig. 13 (Caravaggio and others?).

This *Saint John the Baptist* appeared at auction in 1998. The composition was previously known from variants and copies attributable to Neapolitan painters. Following restoration and exhibition, the painting failed to impress most observers. The possibility remains that it is an autograph late work of comparable technique to the *Saint John the Baptist at the Source* (cat. no. 63) in small format.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

Plasencia, Spain, Cathedral

Full figure of Saint John with lamb seated at feet

Provenance:

Arrived in Spain from Sicily; donated to cathedral in 1679.

Exhibition:

Seville 1973, no. 39 (as anonymous Italian).

Bibliography:

Borea 1974, p. 44 (as Spadarino); Harris 1974, p. 238, fig. 2 (more similar to version in Vienna than Malta, Giacinto Brandi?); Gregori 1993, pp. 3–23, fig. 21.

Variation by another artist, in reverse, anonymous.

II. Selected variations are listed by Gregori 1993, pp. 3–23.

88. *Saint Jerome in Meditation*

Oil on canvas, 43³/₈ x 31⁷/₈ in. (110 x 81 cm)

Pinacoteca, Monastero di Santa Maria di Montserrat, Monserrat (Barcelona)

Provenance:

Collection Magni, Rome 1914; from which acquired in 1915 by the monastery. See Catalogue of Lost Works, L.53.

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 34; Bordeaux 1955; New York-Naples 1985, no. 84; Thessalonika 1997; Berlin-Rome 2001, no. D5; Bilbao-Seville 2001, no. 20; Barcelona 2005 cat. no. 7; Düsseldorf 2006, no. 18.

Bibliography:

Analecta Montserratensia, I, 1917 (1918) p. 338 (“magnificent work”); Longhi 1943, p. 16, fig. 22 (c. 1603); Ainaud 1947, p. 395 (1605–6); Arslan 1951, p. 446 (rejects, “influenced by Ribera’s

art which the old copyist has misunderstood”); Berenson 1951 (probably); Baroni 1951 (late Roman); Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 34 (1605–6); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (1602–3) n. 118 (“The rawness of the painting may be due to over-cleaning in the past . . .”); Venturi 1951, no. 33 (1605–6); Mahon 1952, p. 19 (1602–4); Hinks 1953, no. 44 (c. 1604); Baumgart 1955, no. 41 (1602–4); Friedlaender 1955, p. 204, no. 31B (Caravaggesque imitation); Wagner 1958, p. 232 (no, copy of lost original); Arslan 1959 (criticized violent red as not Caravaggesque, copy influenced by Ribera); Della Pergola 1959; Jullian 1961, pp. 149–53 (1605–6); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 65 (1605–6); Kitson 1969, no. 57 (lighting too clear for Caravaggio); Cinotti 1971, pp. 79, 130, 196 (?); Marini 1974, pp. 194–95, 408, n. 55 (late 1605); Nicolson 1974, pp. 607–8; Moir 1976, pp. 111 no. 66, 147–48 (original lost) 119, no. 119, 161 n. 285 (Montserrat, possibly Ribera’s earliest work, c. 1616?); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Cinotti 1983, no. 33 (c. 1605), no. 136 (Giustiniani document refers possibly to a lost original); Hibbard 1983, pp. 193, 196, 320 (copy); Gregori 1985, no. 84 (1605–6); Spike 1985, p. 417 (copy); Christiansen 1986, p. 440 (a clever imitation); Marini 1989, pp. 477–78, n. 60 (Rome, 1605); Barroero 1992, pp. 30–33; Bologna 1992, pp. 330–31 (1606); Gregori 1994, p. 151, no. 52 (c. 1605); Pacelli 1994, p. 176; Sciuti, et al. in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 69–85; Langdon 1998, p. 235 (not Giustiniani picture); Puglisi 1998, no. 54 (attributed, c. 1605); Robb 1998, p. 511 (1605, I); Benedetti in Mormando 1999, pp. 208–33, fig. 33 (1605–6); Bilbao-Seville 2001, pp. 168–69, no. 20; Danesi Squarzina in Berlin-Rome 2001, p. 294, no. D5 (c. 1605, Giustiniani provenance is not undisputed); Gash 2001, p. 429; Spike 2001, cat. no. 88 (other works attributed); Danesi Squarzina 2003, vol. 1, pp. 111–13, 392; Ramon y Navarro in Barcelona 2005 pp. 68–71, cat. no. 7 (c. 1605); Marini 2005, pp. 264, 492–93, no. 68; Sgarbi 2005, no. 46 (1606, after Brera *Supper at Emmaus* [cat. no. 50]); Sgarbi in Milan 2005, p. 29 (1605–6); Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, p. 226, cat. no. 18 (1605–6); Gash 2007, p. 102 (given its likely Giustiniani provenance, it is worth note that Fra Marc’Aurelio Giustiniani, a cousin of Vincenzo, was a Knight of Saint John and known to be in Malta in July of 1607); Lapucci 2009, pp. 75 (for condition).

Even allowing for the deleterious effects of overcleaning, the handling of this painting seems too dry and the modeling too flat to ascribe to Caravaggio. As the composition is fully worthy of the master, on the other hand, one suspects that this *Saint Jerome* was executed by an assistant under Caravaggio’s design around 1605, i.e., near to the Borghese *Saint Jerome* in which the same model is represented. Despite a current tendency to consider this work fully

autograph, the picture is not securely identifiable with the half-length *Saint Jerome* cited in the Giustiniani inventories and by Silos (See Catalogue of Lost Works, L.56).

89. *Judith Beheading Holofernes*, 1606–7

Oil on canvas, 55 x 63 in. (140 x 160 cm)

Museo Pignatelli, Naples

(Collezione Banco di Napoli, Banca Intesa San Paolo IMI)

Provenance:

Private collection.

Documents:

It is not known whether the painting is identifiable with the *Judith and Holofernes* that was offered for sale as an original by Caravaggio, together with the *Madonna of the Rosary* (cat. no. 51) in Naples, following Caravaggio's departure to Malta in July 1607.

1. Naples, September 25, 1607: Letter of Frans Pourbus to Duke Vincenzo I Gonzaga, "I saw here two very beautiful paintings by M[ichel]Angelo da Caravaggio: one of a rosary, made for an altarpiece. It is very large at 18 palmi and the price is no less than 400 ducati; the other is a painting of half-length figures of a Judith with Holofernes, at 300 ducati. I did not make any offer without knowing your wishes, but they promised me that they would not sell it until they learned of your wishes." [" . . . Ho visto qui doi quadri bellissimi di mano de M[ichel] Angelo da Caravaggio: l'uno è d'un rosario et era fatto per un'ancona et è grande da 18 palmi et non vogliono manco di 400 ducati; l'altro è un quadro mezzano da camera di mezze figure et è un Oliferno con Giudetta, et non lo dariano a manco di 300 ducati. Non ho voluto fare alcuna proferta non sapendo l'intentione di V[ostre] A[ltezza], me hanno però promesso di non darli via sintanto che saranno avvisati del piacere . . ."] (Mantua, Archivio Gonzaga, Esterni, n. XXV, *Diversi, Carteggio da Napoli*; Baschet, *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, 1868, p. 447; Luzio, *Galleria degli Gonzaga*, 1913).

2. September 19, 1617: Testament of Louis Finson, Amsterdam, in which he leaves his half interest in the *Madonna of the Rosary* and the *Judith and Holofernes* “both by Michael Angel Crawats” to his partner, Abraham Vinck (Bodart 1970, pp. 228–29).

3. Marini (in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, p. 79 n. 5) tentatively associates with this painting a notice that c. 1621 Simon Glaude, the brother-in-law of Vinck, sent to Rome for sale an unnamed painting by Caravaggio valued at 600 florins (de Roever 1885, pp. 186–87).

Bibliography:

Longhi 1951, pp. 10–18; Bodart 1970, pp. 12–14; Marini 1974, p. 429 n. 67 (copy of lost original); Prohaska 1980, pp. 111–32 (probably consigned by Caravaggio for sale by Finson and Vinck); Leone de Castris in *Il patrimonio artistico del Banco di Napoli* 1984, pp. 36–38 (copy by Finson of lost Caravaggio); Marini 1985, pp. 3–6 (connects to Finson); Marini in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 59–80 (Finson); Marini 1989, pp. 59–63, pp. 503–4, no. 70 (as copy after original); Navarro in Naples 1991, no. 2.4 (as copy after lost original by Artemisia Gentileschi); Gregori 1994, p. 152, no. 61 (copy 1607); Pacelli 1994, p. 54 (1607), p. 59 (copy); Puglisi 1998, no. 65 (copy? c. 1607); Spike 2001, cat. no. 89 (other works attributed); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 173, 179 no. 11; Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 122 (reject); Leone de Castris 2007, pp. 44, 46 (“strong possibility” by Louis Finson); Terzaghi 2007, p. 303, no. 122 (copy of a lost original by Caravaggio that was at Naples).

In September 1607, Ottavio Gentile wrote to Duke Vincenzo I Gonzaga in Mantua to inform him of the availability in Naples of two paintings by Caravaggio, the *Madonna of the Rosary* (cat. no. 51) and a gallery-sized *Judith and Holofernes* with half-length figures, valued at 300 ducats. The painting was eventually taken from Italy by Louis Finson in whose Amsterdam testament in 1617 it is cited together with the *Madonna of the Rosary* as paintings held in common with his partner, Abraham Vinck.

While strongly Caravaggesque, the handling of this *Judith Beheading Holofernes* does not imitate Caravaggio’s distinctive brushwork. In view of their close association with Caravaggio, it is worth considering whether Finson or Vinck might have executed this painting on Caravaggio’s design, perhaps on a canvas left unfinished by the Lombard. Several writers have supported

the hypothesis of Leone de Castris (1984) that would identify the present *Judith Beheading Holofernes* as a copy after Caravaggio's lost prototype. Recently, Leone de Castris (2007) has offered new arguments that serve to establish the attribution to Finson.

90. *Saint Januarius Shows His Own Relics*

Oil on canvas, 49 $\frac{7}{8}$ x 36 $\frac{3}{8}$ in. (126.5 x 92.5 cm)

Palmer Art Museum, University Park, Pa.; Penn State University, gift of Morton and Mary Jane Harris

Provenance:

Private collection (Spanish, seventeenth century), France; purchased by E. Moratilla, Paris, in 1970; Paul Ganz, New York; Morton and Mary Jane Harris, New York.

Exhibitions:

Cleveland 1971, no. 26 (as Finson); Naples 1977, no. 22.

Bibliography:

Spear 1971, pp. 92–93 (Finson, c. 1612); Volpe 1972, p. 66 (Finson); Borea 1972, p. 156 (Tanzio da Varallo); Causa 1972, pp. 917, 962–63 n. 4, 964 n. 8 (copy perhaps of lost original); de Salas 1974, p. 31 (after lost original); Marini 1974, p. 430 n. 68 (copy of original 1607 model); Nicolson 1974³, p. 624 (possible); Prohaska 1975, p. 10 (Carlo Sellitto?); Pavone in Naples 1977, p. 125 no. 22, tav. XLIV (Finson); Nicolson 1979, pp. 48, 90 (Neapolitan school); Gregori 1982, p. 128 n. 17 (copy of 1607 original); Cinotti 1983, p. 569 (Finson); Marini in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 59–80, fig. 8 (Finson); Marini 1989, pp. 513–14, no. 76 (copy, after lost original, Naples 1607; associated with Benevente inventory of 1653, see *Palestrina Beheading of a Martyr* below); Bologna in Naples 1991, p. 116 (copy after Tanzio da Varallo and not Caravaggio); Bologna 1992, p. 351 (neither after a lost Caravaggio nor by Finson; copy after a painting by Tanzio da Varallo); Gregori 1994, p. 152, no. 65 (copy, 1607); Zuccari in Macioce 1996, p. 294 (replica of the lost Caravaggio); Puglisi 1998, no. 68 (copy? c. 1607);

Spike 2001, cat. no. 90 (other works attributed); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 174, 180 no. 17.

The distinctive subject derives from the official *Martyrologium Romanum* by Cesare Baronio as Zuccari (1995) points out. The miraculous liquifaction of the blood of Saint Januarius, patron saint of Naples, is described as occurring when its ampule is brought together with the relic of the saint's severed head. It is not likely that this painting or a version of it was described in the Benevente inventory as a "Decapitated Bishop."

This impressive *Saint Januarius* was convincingly dated to circa 1612 and placed in relationship to Caravaggio's late *Saint Mary Magadalen in Ecstasy* (cat. no. 75) executed in Naples by Spear (1971). The scholar's plausible attribution to Finson has attracted wide support; indeed, the painting exhibits stylistic affinities to the *Ecce Homo* in a private collection (cat. no. 79, Other Works Attributed, above) and to the *Judith Beheading Holofernes* (cat. no. 89, Other Works Attributed, above). Some authorities consider this picture a faithful record of a lost original by Caravaggio.

91. *Portrait of a Gentleman*, 1607

Oil on canvas, 28½ x 22¼ in. (72.4 x 56.5 cm)

New York, private collection

Provenance:

Sale, Sotheby's New York, May 22, 1992, lot 193 (as attributed to Caracciolo).

Bibliography:

Gregori interview "Da Roma a New York: due nuovi Caravaggio," in *Corriere della Sera*, June 27, 1993, p. 25 (1606–7); Gregori 1994, pp. 137, 150, no. 48 (c. 1604–5); Marini 1997, pp. 40–41 (Caracciolo, as *Portrait of the Count of Lemos*, c. 1611); Gregori 1998, pp. 3–14, fig. 4 (Roman period); Varriano 1998², p. 39; Spike 2001, cat. no. 91 (Caravaggio, 1607); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 122, 124 n. 26; Sickel in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 113 (Roman period).

The portrait bears no identifying inscriptions nor attributes. Marini's proposal (1997) to identify the sitter as the Count of Lemos is not convincing. Gregori now dates the painting to Caravaggio's Roman period without citing a specific year. Her previous comparison of this portrait with the portrait heads in the *Madonna of the Rosary* has much to recommend it, however. On the basis of a photograph, I consider this portrait probably autograph by Caravaggio during his first Neapolitan period, 1606–7.

92. *Beheading of a Martyr*

Oil on canvas, 45³/₄ x 38⁵/₈ in. (116 x 98 cm)

Church of Sant Antonio Abbate, Palestrina (Rome);

on deposit at the Palazzo Barberini, Rome; property of the Fondo Edifici di Culto

Inventories:

This painting may possibly be connected with untraced paintings of this subject by Caravaggio referred to in two seventeenth-century inventories of Spanish collections:

1. January 26, 1653: Inventory of paintings in the palace of Counts of Benevente, Don Juan Francisco Alfonso Pimentel y Ponce de Leon, nephew of Don Juan Alfonso Pimentel y Herrera, Count of Benevente and Viceroy of Naples until July 1610: "Item, another of a Bishop saint with his decapitated head in a black pine frame, original by Caravaggio, 1,000 reales" ["[13] ytem, otro lienzo de un santo obispo la cabeza degollada con moldura negra de pino, original de Carabacho—todo ello en mill reales"] (Valladolid, *Archivo Histórico Provincial*, in Ainaud 1947, p. 381; Burke–Cherry 1997, pp. 496–97).

2. September 25–November 19, 1691: Inventory taken in Madrid, at death of Juan Gaspar Enríquez de Cabrera, Duque de Medina de Ríoseco and Almirante de Castilla, "Caravaggio, Michelangelo Merisi da: Bishop saint decapitated, Benevente, 55:0013" ["Caravaggio, Michelangelo Merisi da: Santo obispo la cabeza degollada" "Benevente" "55:0013"] (Burke–Cherry 1997, pp. 892–93, 1094).

Exhibition:

Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 16.

Bibliography:

Marini 1971, pp. 57–58 (copy of lost original late 1609, described in 1653 inventory); Cinotti 1971, pp. 144, 203 n. 580 (agrees with Marini); Causa 1972, pp. 917, 963 n. 4 (possible copy of lost Caravaggio); Nicolson 1974, p. 624 (agrees with Marini); Nicolson 1979, p. 34 (rejects); Cinotti 1983, no. 81 (attributed), no. 166 (document refers to lost original); Gregori 1985, p. 314 (copy of lost original; compares features of *Dying Bishop* to no. 89, *Magdalen in Ecstasy*); Marini in *L'ultimo Caravaggio* 1987, pp. 59–80; Marini 1989, pp. 318–19, no. 98 (many pictures sent to this church in Palestrina from the Carmine Maggiore, Naples); Marini in *Caravaggio: Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 135–44; Calvesi 1990, pp. 162 n. 143, 370–71 (as Sant'Agapito, patron saint of Palestrina); Bologna 1992, p. 351 (rejects); Zuccari in Macioce 1996, pp. 294–95 (as by Caravaggio, neither Saint Januarius nor Sant'Agapito); Spike 2001, cat. no. 92 (other works attributed, c. 1610, follower of Caravaggio); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 177, 181 no. 37; Tempesta in Rome-Valletta 2007, pp. 288–91, cat. no. 16; Tempesta in Trapani 2007, pp. 302–5, cat. no. 16 (summer 1606).

The identity of the saint remains problematic. The young martyr appears not to be Saint Januarius, because he lacks the attributes of a bishop, nor Saint Agapito, because that saint, one of the protectors of the Colonna family, was not a priest. Marini, Causa, and Calvesi regard this little-known canvas as a faithful copy of a lost composition by Caravaggio; Zuccari attributes the painting to Caravaggio himself.

The painting appears to be an original composition, c. 1610, by a Neapolitan follower of Caravaggio.

93. *Saint Francis in Ecstasy*

Oil on canvas, 40 x 30 in. (102.9 x 76.2 cm)

Barbara Piasecka Johnson collection, Princeton, N.J.

Provenance:

Private collection, Geneva, Switzerland, 1982; London, Matthiesen Fine Arts, 1987 from whom purchased by current owner.

Exhibitions:

Sydney-Melbourne 2003, cat. no. 9; Trapani 2007, cat no. 2; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, no. 2 (as *Saint Francis in Prayer*).

Bibliography:

Bologna 1987, pp. 159–77; Marini in *Il Tempo*, September 12, 1987 (as by Gentileschi); Marini 1989; Norman 1989, p. 44; Bologna in Grabski 1990, pp. 174–79 (connects to the *Saint Francis in Ecstasy* belonging to Cardinal Del Monte); Bologna 1992, pp. 237–62, 310, figs. 67–70 (1596–97); Spike 2001, cat. no. 93 (other works attributed); Jaffé in Sydney-Melbourne 2003, pp. 96–97, cat. no. 9 (attribution vexing); Mahon in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 2 (without date); Mahon in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 2, pp. 214–17 (cites the attribution to Orazio Gentileschi proposed by Marini in 1987).

Bologna considers the painting an original by Caravaggio which he would identify instead of the Hartford picture (cat. no. 8) with the *Saint Francis in Ecstasy* cited in the 1627 inventory of Cardinal Del Monte collection, Rome.

94. *Sacrifice of Isaac*

Oil on canvas, 45³/₄ x 68¹/₈ in. (116 x 173 cm)

Barbara Piasecka Johnson collection, Princeton, N.J.

Provenance:

Private collection, Switzerland, purchased 1989.

Documents:

1. Gregori (1990, p. 168) identifies this with an untraced painting of this subject by Caravaggio

in the early eighteenth-century inventory of fifty paintings that formed a part of the dowery of Doña Antonia Cecilia Fernández de Híjar on her marriage to Don José Fuenbuena, “a painting of Abrahoam and the sacrifice of Isaac by Michael Angelo Carabaggio” [“Un quadro de Abraham y sacrificio de Isaac di Michael Angelo Carabaggio”] (Ainaud 1947, pp. 386–87, nn. 17–19).

2. According to Gregori (1990) paintings from this collection were divided between Lierta Palace and Ayerbe Palace in Saragossa. Some were given to the Marquis de la Ensemada, then disappeared.

Exhibitions:

Warsaw 1990, no. 28; Florence 1991, no. 6 (in catalogue, not exhibited); Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 92–93; Tokyo-Okazaki 2001–2, cat. no. 1; Rome-Termini 2006; Trapani 2007, cat. no. 3; Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 3.

Bibliography:

Gregori 1989, pp. 99–142; Gregori in Grabski 1990, no. 28 (notes affinities with *Saint John the Baptist* in Toledo, Spain); Gregori in *Carvaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, no. 6; Bologna 1992, pp. 320–21 (1601–2, “from a stylistic point of view when the Caravaggism of Bartolomeo Cavarozzi collides with that of early Simon Vouet”); Gregori 1994, p. 147, no. 21 (c. 1597–98); Gallo in Macioce 1996, pp. 331–60, ill. p. 360 (attributed, critics divided); Lapucci in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 31–50 (attributed); Sciuti et al. in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 69–85; Marini in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 140, n. 6; Puglisi 1998, no. 18 (attributed, c. 1597–98); Gregori in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 92–93; Spike 2001, cat. no. 94 (other works attributed); Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 3–24; Marini in Tokyo-Okazaki 2001–2, cat. no. 1, pp. 64, 67; Mahon in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 3 (no date); Mahon in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 3 pp. 218–21 (Gregori and Marini concur); Marini 2007; Marini in Trapani 2008, p. 214 (1602).

The diffusion of this composition in Spain through numerous copies was first observed by Ainaud (1947) who proposed to identify the prototype as a *Sacrifice of Isaac* attributed to Caravaggio in the early-eighteenth-century inventory of Doña Antonia Cecilia Fernández

de Híjar. This thesis was discussed by subsequent scholars without resolution. Chenault compiled an anthology of the known copies.

The present picture was unknown until its rediscovery in Switzerland and acquisition by its current owner in 1989. The painting has been published as an original work by Caravaggio of c. 1598 by Gregori, who cites the agreement of Mahon and Christiansen. The painting is evidently by the same hand as the *Saint John the Baptist* in Toledo (see below cat. no. 97), a work whose attribution is debated between Bartolomeo Cavarozzi and Caravaggio.

Copies and Versions:

Selected copies are listed by Pérez Sánchez 1973, no. 7, Moir 1976, pp. 117–18, nos. 105a–p, p. 124 n. 187, p. 158 n. 277, fig. 25; and Grabski 1990, p. 170.

C. I

Sacrifice of Isaac (Nocturnal)

Oil on canvas, 44⁷/₈ x 66⁷/₈ in. (114 x 170 cm)

Modena, private collection

Provenance:

Christie's, Rome, April 13, 1989, lot 188 (as copy of Caravaggio); Semenzato, Rome, September 27, 1995, lot 325 (as attributed to Tommaso Salini by Giuliano Briganti).

See: Marini in Trapani 2007, pp. 212–15.

Exhibitions:

Trapani 2007, cat. no. 4; Valletta-Trapani 2008, cat. no. 4.

Bibliography:

Marini 2007 (as autograph, 1602); Marini in Trapani 2007, cat. no. 4, pp. 212–15 (1602); Marini in Valletta-Trapani 2007–8, cat. no. 4 pp. 222–27 (1602).

95.1 *Still Life with Birds*

Oil on canvas, 40³/₄ x 68¹/₈ in. (105 x 173 cm)

Galleria Borghese, Rome

Provenance:

Giuseppe Cesari, Cavaliere d'Arpino, Rome, 1607; from whom seized by the papal treasury and presented by Paul V to Cardinal Scipione Borghese.

Inventory:

1. May 4, 1607: Inventory of paintings confiscated from Cavaliere D'Arpino for Cardinal Scipione Borghese, without identification of author: "No. 38 a painting with various dead birds without frame" ["un quadro con diversi uccellami morti senza cornici"] (Della Pergola 1959, no. 248, p; 170).

Document:

1. 1619 record of payment to Annibale Durante, "For three frames in burnished gold . . . for a painting of dead birds . . ." ["Per tre cornici Indorate a oro brunito . . . l'altra dove sonno l'uccelli diversi morti . . ."] (Della Pergola 1959, p. 170).

95.2 *Still Life with Flowers and Fruit*

Oil on canvas, 40³/₄ x 72³/₈ in. (103.5 x 184 cm)

Galleria Borghese, Rome

Provenance:

Giuseppe Cesari, Cavaliere d'Arpino, Rome, 1607; from whom seized by the papal treasury and presented by Paul V to Cardinal Scipione Borghese.

Inventories:

1. Zeri (1976, p. 94) identified this painting with one of this subject in the May 4, 1607, inventory of paintings confiscated from Cavaliere D'Arpino for Cardinal Scipione Borghese, without identification of author: "No. 39 another painting with various fruits and flowers without frame" ["un altro quadro con diversi frutti et fiori senza cornici"].

2. Della Pergola (1959, p. 191) identified this painting with one of this subject listed among the effects of Marcantonio Borghese in 1783: "A painting of fruits by D. De Hem" ["un quadro di frutti di D. de Hem"].

Exhibitions:

Rome 1979 (attributed to Caravaggio); New York-Dayton-Tulsa 1983, nos. 8, 9 (as follower); New York-Naples 1985, nos. 64, 63; Rome 1995, no. 13; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 19; Munich 2002; Florence 2003.

Bibliography:

(Following 1976 the paintings are discussed together, based upon a proposal by Zeri 1976, p. 94, that they are among paintings mentioned by Bellori as by the young Caravaggio [second half 1593] and by the same hand as the *Still Life* in Hartford). *Fideocommisso* 1833, p. 24 (cat. no. 95.1, as Flemish) p. 26 (95.2, as de Hem); Piancastelli 1891, p. 423 (as anonymous Flemish school); Venturi 1893, p. 154 (95.1 as Resani), p. 346 (95.2 as Karel van Vogelaer, a.k.a. Carlo dei Fiori); Longhi 1928, p. 205 (95.1 is not Resani, 95.2 is not van Vogelaer); Della Pergola 1959, no. 248, p. 170 (95.1, as second half of 1500s, manner of Pieter Aertsen), p. 191 (95.2 as Karel van Vogelaer, with doubts); Zeri 1976, pp. 92–103, figs. 92, 93; Rosci 1977, pp. 92, 95, 166 n. 67; Marini 1978, p. 43 n. 128; Strinati in Rome 1979, p. 62 (attributed); Cinotti 1983, no. 92, p. 567, figs. 6, 7, p. 633; Spike 1983, nos. 8, 9, pp. 41–47 (follower of Caravaggio, execution more Roman than Lombard); Harris 1983, p. 514; Marini in Rome 1984, pp. 13, 17 n. 32 (Francesco Zucchi?, c. 1562–1622); Salerno 1984, pp. 46–55 (not Zucchi, different hand from Hartford, unknown painter in d'Arpino's studio); Gregori 1985, nos. 64, 63 (follows

Zeri, early Caravaggio, later than Galleria Lorenzelli, Mont, and Finarte pictures, but before Hartford); Spike 1985, pp. 416–17 (rejects); Salerno 1989, p. 30 (not Caravaggio “for superficial and repetitive manner in which Lombard and, in a way, also Caravaggesque elements are represented”); Cottino 1989, pp. 654–62 (young Caravaggio); Cadogan–Mahoney 1991, p. 94; Bologna 1992, pp. 288–90, 346 (by two different artists, *Fruit and Flowers* perhaps by Tommaso Salini); Heimburger 1993, pp. 69–84 (Franz Snyders); Berra 1996, pp. 130–32 (style diverse from that of Caravaggio); Laureati in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 19 (c. 1600); Spike 2001, cat. nos. 95.1 and 95.2 (other works attributed); Cottino in Munich 2002, pp. 136–37; Cottino in Florence, 2003, pp. 140–41.

Formerly attributed to different Flemish artists, these two paintings from the reserve collection of the Galleria Borghese entered the literature in 1976 as the central pieces in Zeri’s hypothetical reconstruction of the young Caravaggio’s activity as a still-life painter in the atelier of Giuseppe Cesare, around 1593. Della Pergola (1959) first suggested that the *Still Life with Birds* could be identified with a reference to a “picture with various dead birds, unframed” confiscated in 1607 from Giuseppe Cesari, Cavaliere d’Arpino. Zeri proposed the same provenance for the *Still Life with Flowers and Fruit* on the basis of the next item in the same inventory, “another picture with various fruits and flowers, unframed.” Zeri associated the Borghese still lifes with an anonymous *Still Life* in Hartford (cat. no. 86) that had been occasionally proposed as a copy after a lost Caravaggio.

Since the publication of Zeri’s thesis, more than twenty paintings have come to light by the Master of Hartford, a decorative, if formulaic, painter, who attempted to imitate Caravaggio’s chiaroscuro while maintaining an archaic approach to composition. Although the known production of the Master of Hartford exceeds the number of paintings that Caravaggio could have produced during his eight months’ service for Cesare, Gregori (1985) and Cottino (1989) do not rule out Caravaggio’s participation “on an experimental basis.”

The painting appears to be by Antonio Tanari, a figure painter and still-life specialist documented in Rome between 1609 and 1635.

96. *Saint Sebastian*

Oil on canvas, 67 x 47¼ in. (170 x 120 cm)

Rome, Private collection

Provenance:

Bologna, Duke of Galliera; Bologna, Montpensier collection (by 1951 where recorded by Berenson); from whom acquired by father of present owner.

Inventories:

See references to untraced paintings by Caravaggio of *Saint Sebastian* in the Catalogue of Lost Works L.69 and L.70 in the seventeenth-century collections in the Roman Collections of Cardinal Carlo Barberini and Asdrubale Mattei.

Sources:

Some scholars have identified this picture with a painting of this description cited by Bellori:

1. Bellori 1672 [ed. 1976, p. 232]: “One of his [Asdrubale Mattei] best works was a figure of St. Sebastian with two executioners that was taken to Paris” [“. . . fu portata in Parigi la figura di San Sebastiano con due ministri, che gli legano le mani di dietro: opera delle sue migliori”].
2. Baldinucci 1681: Work sent to France, where by 1628 a copy was made by Jan Le Clerc (Lausanne, Vosgienne collection).

Exhibitions:

Milan 1951, no. 50 (Neapolitan copy); Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 41.

Bibliography:

Longhi in Milan 1951, no. 50 (connects to Bellori quote, close to original, by good Neapolitan painter close to Vaccaro, 1620–30); Berenson 1951, p. 38 (copy, nearly contemporaneous to

original); Mahon 1951, p. 234 (marginalia, “appears to be a later imitation”); Baumgart 1955, no. 21 (rejects); Jullian 1955, p. 84 (agrees with Longhi); Pariset 1958, pp. 69–70 (Saraceni, not picture cited by Bellori); Wagner 1958, no. 21 (late imitation); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 374 (copy); Longhi 1960, p. 35 n. 10; Jullian 1961, pp. 75, 182 n. 44–45, 232 (not copy, perhaps Saraceni); de Logu 1962 (rejects); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 80 (no opinion); Kitson 1969, no. 80; Moir 1967, I, p. 229 n. 15, II, p. 61, D.14 (agrees with Longhi); Fagiolo Dell’Arco 1968, p. 60 (copy); Bodart 1970, pp. 124–25; Cinotti 1971, pp. 136, 199 n. 509 (copy of lost original); Marini 1974, pp. 430–31, n. 69 (copy of original, 1607); Moir 1976, no. 79, p. 152–53 n. 257 (possibly Neapolitan imitator); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Spezzaferro 1980, p. 95; Gregori 1982, p. 39 (second Neapolitan period); Cinotti 1983, no. 87 (attributed); Hibbard 1983, p. 341 (derived from a copy of a lost Saraceni?); Marini 1989, pp. 514–16 no. 77 (possibly original, Naples 1607); Benedetti 1993, n. 19; Pacelli 1994, pp. 54, 64 (copy of lost original); Gregori 1994, p. 153, no. 66 (1607); Pacelli 1994, pp. 64–67; Gilbert 1995, p. 270 n. 60 (“Caravaggio’s name is assigned to three images of Sebastian. One of these, discussed by Marini [1987, 514–15] might be the same as Asdrubale’s in the opinion of Benedetti [1993] but he does not note that his source, Marini, and all others, date the painting in question about 1607, after the inventory”); Puglisi 1998, no. 67 (copy?, c. 1607); Spike 2001, cat. no. 96 (other works attributed); Pagano and Utili in *Naples-London* 2004–5, pp. 174, 180 no. 15; Marini 2005, pp. 269, 526–28, no. 84; Gasparrini–Marini in *Düsseldorf* 2006, pp. 257–58, cat. no. 41 (identifies with Bellori, dates to 1607, with slightly different provenance).

In favor of Caravaggio’s authorship of this composition is the particularity of the moment represented, namely, the binding of the saint prior to his torture with arrows. Its execution appears uneven in quality. To date, it appears that only Marini considers this work autograph.

Copies:

C. I

Lorraine, private collection

Oil on canvas, 63³/₄ x 43³/₈ in. (162 x 110 cm)

Dated 1628

Bibliography:

Pariset 1958, pp. 69–70 (copy after Saraceni by Jean Le Clerc); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, notes to no. 80; Cinotti 1983, p. 564 (important terminus ante quem for transfer noted by Bellori of original by Caravaggio to France); Pacelli 1994, pp. 54, 65 (copy).

Selected copies are listed by Marini 1989, p. 514; Pacelli 1994, p. 54.

97. *Saint John the Baptist*

Oil on canvas, 66½ x 44 in. (169 x 112 cm)

Toledo, Cathedral Museum

Provenance:

Gift to Toledo Cathedral by Canon Santamaria, in 1786; placed in the church of Santa Lucia (later chapel of San José).

Inventory:

Estella suggested that this painting could be associated with an untraced painting of this subject listed in the January 25, 1625, testament of Don Francisco de Córdoba, sworn in Palermo, to Juan de Acosta “a painting of Saint John with the ram by Caravacho” [“un quadro de San Juan con el cordero del Caravacho”] (Estella 1996, p. 347).

Source:

1. Ponz 1787, I, p. 367 [ed. 1947, p. 133], as style of Caravaggio and gift of Canon Santamaria.

Exhibitions:

Madrid *Mostra Velazquena* 1960–61; Madrid 1970, no. 30; Seville 1973, no. 3; Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 110–13.

Bibliography:

Parro 1857, I, pp. 315–16 (“Ribera, traditionally attributed to Caravaggio”); Longhi 1943, p. 54 (probably Bartolomeo Cavarozzi); Ainaud 1947, pp. 388–89 n. 23 (dubious attribution, of sweeter character than one finds in Caravaggio); Rivero Recio 1949, p. 144, fig. 142 (donated in 1786 by the Vicario General); Wagner 1958, p. 231 (circle of Saraceni); Jullian 1961, p. 157 n. 65 (no); Pérez Sánchez 1964, p. 12 (young Caravaggio); Moir 1967, I, p. 97, II, p. 62 n. 12 (anonymous follower?); Pérez Sánchez in Madrid 1970, no. 30 (Roman, youthful period); Schleier 1970, pp. 345–46 (doubtful); Cinotti 1971, pp. 128, 196 n. 449 (rejects); Gregori 1973, p. 49 (Cavarozzi); Pérez Sánchez in Seville 1973, no. 3 (Roman, youthful period); de Salas in Seville 1973, pp. 33–34; Volpe 1973, pp. 29–32 (leaves by Crescenzi); Harris 1974, pp. 235–39 (as attributed); Nicolson 1974, p. 625; Moir 1976, p. 119 no. 111, 126 n. 188 (composition may be derived from Doria *John the Baptist*, but reversed and transformed), p. 160 n. 282 (leaves close to early work, softness of flesh and light contradicts his manner, drapery similar to young Regnier); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Spear 1979, p. 318 (controversial); Cinotti 1983, no. 88 (attributed, more likely Crescenzi or Cavarozzi); Hibbard 1983, p. 311 n. 102 (no); Cottino 1989, pp. 675–76, figs. 797, 843 (figure by Cavarozzi, leaves by the Acquavella Master); Gregori 1989, pp. 99–142; Calvesi 1990, pp. 221–24; Gregori in Grabski 1990, p. 173 (notes affinities with *Sacrifice of Isaac*, Princeton); Bologna 1992, p. 351 (Bartolomeo Cavarozzi); Gregori in *Caravaggio. Come nascono . . .* 1991, pp. 158, 172–73; Gregori 1994, pp. 34, 147, no. 20 (c. 1597–98); Ward in Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96, p. 17, fig. 12 (1610–20, Spanish? follower); Marini in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, p. 140 n. 6; Puglisi 1998, no. 16 (attributed, c. 1597–98); Marini in Madrid-Bilbao 1999, pp. 110–13; Spike 2001, cat. no. 97 (other works attributed); von Rosen in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, n. 35, 46, p. 66 (probably by Cavarozzi).

The delicacy and refinement of this *Saint John the Baptist* have been admired since its gift to the Cathedral of Toledo in 1786. The picture has generally been attributed to Bartolomeo Cavarozzi since Longhi’s proposal of 1943, though an attribution to Caravaggio has recently been advanced by Gregori and Marini. Volpe and Cottino believe that the vine leaves on the wall were the contribution of a still-life specialist, either G. B. Crescenzi or the “Acquavella Master.” The figure of the Baptist is certainly by Cavarozzi.

Copies:

I. Seventeenth-century references to unidentified versions or copies:

C. I

Madrid, Collection of Saavedra Guzmán y Galindo

Inventories:

1. November 17, 1630, inventory of Don Martín de Saavedra Guzmán y Galindo, knight of the Order of Calatrava, of objects pledged against loan of 1,000 ducats and 4,551 silver reales from his father: “[10] Another painting of Saint John copy of Caravaggio” (Burke–Cherry 1997, pp. 15, 282).

2. September 25–October 21, 1691, posthumous inventory of the collection of Juan Gaspar Enríquez de Cabrera, Duque de Medina de Ríoseco and Almirante de Castilla, Madrid, with appraisal beginning November 19, 1691, “San Juan” (Burke–Cherry 1997, pp. 892–93, 1095).

98. *Vision of Saint Jerome*

Oil on canvas, 28¾ x 38 in. (73 x 97.5 cm)

Museum of Fine Arts, Worcester, Mass., (Austin S. Garver Fund), inv. 1960.13

Letter “N” on the open page of the book

Provenance:

Maltese collection; Rome, private collection; Julius Weitzner, New York, by 1958 as “school”; purchased by museum in 1960 as “school of Caravaggio.”

Inventory:

1. An untraced painting of this subject was listed in a January 25, 1625, testament of Don Francisco de Córdoba, sworn in Palermo, to Gaspar de la Sal, a picture of “San Gerònimo de Caravacho” (Estella 1996, p. 347).

Exhibitions:

Vassar College, Poughkeepsie 1965 (school); Wichita Kansas Art Museum 1967–68 (school); Cleveland 1971, no. 76 (anonymous, c. 1615); Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 45.

Bibliography:

Van de Waal 1964 (school); Spear 1971, no. 76 (anonymous, c. 1615); Cinotti 1971, pp. 141, 202 n. 560 (close to Caravaggio in Messina); Borea 1972, p. 161 (Alonzo Rodriguez); Nicolson 1972, p. 117 (rejects); Röttgen 1972 (Messina 1609); Volpe 1972, p. 76; Cellini 1973, restored 1958; Davies 1974, pp. 330–33 (follower); Marini 1974, pp. 52, 269, 450–51 n. 85 (Messina 1609); Moir 1976, pp. 114, no. 77, 153 n. 256 (anonymous northern); Negri Arnoldi 1977, p. 35 n. 13 (Rodriguez); Nicolson 1979, pp. 34, 38 (Sicilian follower); Marini 1982, p. 82 (1609); Cinotti 1983, no. 91 (attributed); Previtali 1985 (probable); Marini 1989, pp. 543–44, no. 92 (Messina 1609); Marini in Palermo 2001, pp. 10–11, figs. 6, 7; Spike 2001, cat. no. 98 (other works attributed); Pagano and Utili in Naples-London 2004–5, pp. 176, 182 no. 31; Marini 2005, pp. 328, 555–57, no. 100; Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 121 (reject); Hartje and Strähle in Düsseldorf 2006, pp. 262–63, cat. no. 45 (as 1609); Papa 2008, p. 214 (1609).

Only Cinotti (1971) and Marini (1989) have accepted the attribution of this *Saint Jerome*, which displays some affinities with Caravaggio's late technique (1608–10) in the handling of the face although not in the still life.

99. *Still Life*

Oil on canvas, 19⁷/₈ x 28¹/₄ in. (50.5 x 71.7 cm)

National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C., K 306

Attached to back of canvas in seventeenth-century (?) hand: “Quadro di frutti e di Carafa del Caravaggio 125.”

Provenance:

Rome, Fejer de Buck; Florence, Contini Bonacossi; acquired Kress Collection, New York, in 1935; given to the National Gallery, 1941.

Exhibitions:

Hartford 1938, no. 3 (Caravaggio); New York 1939, no. 34 (Caravaggio); Paris-Rome 1974; Paris-Chicago-New York 1982, pp. 298–99; New York-Dayton-Tulsa 1983, no. 11 (as Pensionante di Saraceni); New York-Naples 1985, no. 48; London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 20 (as Pensionante dei Saraceni).

Bibliography:

Longhi 1928/29, p. 274 (Caravaggio); *Preliminary Catalogue of Paintings and Sculpture*, National Gallery of Art, 1941 (Caravaggio); Longhi 1943, p. 8 (Caravaggio); Frankfurter in *The Kress Collection in the National Gallery*, 1944, p. 58 (Caravaggio); Longhi 1950, p. 38 (Caravaggio); Berenson 1951, p. 9 (Caravaggio); Longhi 1952, p. 24 (early 1590s); Sterling 1952, p. 53 (as follower); Baumgart 1954, p. 201 n. 28 (Pensionante del Saraceni); Baumgart 1955; Wagner 1958, p. 227 (close pupil); Shapley in *Comparisons in Art: A Companion to the National Gallery* 1957, pl. 125 (as Caravaggio); Wagner 1958, p. 227 (as Follower); Berne Joffroy 1959, p. 373; Causa 1966 (Roman, highest quality); *Paintings and Sculpture from the Samuel H. Kress Collection, National Gallery of Art*, 1959, p. 217 (as Caravaggio); de Logu in *La natura morta italiana*, 1962 (questions attribution to Caravaggio); Walker in *National Gallery of Art*, p. 309 (as Caravaggio); de Logu 1964, p. 149 (doubts); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 32 (?); *Summary Catalogue of European Paintings and Sculpture National Gallery of Art*, p. 23 (Caravaggio); Causa 1966, no. 7 (Caravaggio); Moir 1967, I, p. 27, II, p. 62 (1590s, follower); Ottani Cavina in *Saraceni*, p. 68, n. 48; Kitson 1969, no. 20 (1596, anonymous); Ottani Cavina 1968, p. 47 (Pensionante di Saraceni); Nicolson 1970, p. 315 (Pensionante di Saraceni); Salerno, “Caravaggio e i caravaggeschi” in *Storia dell’arte*, 7/8, 1970, p. 236 (rejects); Spear 1971, p. 138 (Pensionante di Saraceni); Spear 1971³, p. 473; Causa 1972, p. 1032 n. 6; Gregori 1973, p. 46; Volpe 1973; Shapley 1973, pp. 65–66 fig. 121 (as follower of Caravaggio, perhaps Pensionante); Spear 1973, p. 138 fig. 34; *European Paintings: An Illustrated Summary Catalogue. National Gallery of Art*, 1975, p. 54 (Caravaggio); Moir 1976, p. 119, no. 109 (Pensionate di Saraceni); Nicolson 1979, p. 78; Shapley 1979, I, p. 138 fig. 34; Cinotti 1983, no. 92, p. 567, fig. 2, p. 633 (attributed, Pensionato di Saraceni,

Frenchman active in workshop of Saraceni 1630–40); Rosenberg 1982, p. 299 (Pensionante); Rosci, “La natura morta” in *Storia dell’arte italiana*, 13 vols., no. 4:92 (circle of Caravaggio); Spike 1983, pp. 47–49 (Pensionante); Salerno 1984 p. 68; Gregori 1985, no. 48, p. 262 (as Pensionante di Saraceni); Spike 1985, pp. 416–17 (Pensionante di Saraceni); Cottino, “La natura morta caravaggesco a Roma” in *La Natura Morta in Italia*, 2 vols., 2:687, 718, fig. 814; Salerno 1989, p. 37 (doubts attribution to Pensionante di Saraceni); Spike 1992, p. 20; Berra 1996, p. 154 n. 88 (Pensionante di Saraceni); *Italian Paintings of the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries*, 1996, pp. 199–205, repro. 201 (as Pensionante di Saraceni); Spike in Macioce 1996, p. 214; Laureati in London-Rome 2001, cat. no. 20 (as 1610–20, Pensionante dei Saraceni); Spike 2001, cat. no. 99 (other works attributed, Pensionante di Saraceni).

Roberto Longhi never abandoned his proposed attribution of this beautiful *Still Life* to Caravaggio. By 1952, however, Sterling had reassigned the *Still Life with Fruit and Carafe* to a faithful pupil of Caravaggio. Baumgart associated the picture with the *corpus* assembled by Longhi himself under the heading of the anonymous “Pensionante dei Saraceni.” A strikingly similar still life is represented in the *Fruit Vendor* (Detroit, Institute of Fine Arts) by the Pensionante dei Saraceni which was exhibited in Cleveland in 1971. Since that date, the attribution of the present picture to that same artist has been unanimously accepted.

Proposed Additions to Caravaggio’s Oeuvre Since 2001

100. *The Cardsharps (I Bari)*

Oil on canvas, 41 x 51¾ in. (104 x 131.5 cm)

Collection of Sir Denis Mahon, London (on loan to the Pinacoteca Civica, Cento)

Provenance:

Collection of Surgeon Captain W. G. Thwaytes of Maulds Meaburn, Penrith, Cumberland; sold by his descendants at Sotheby’s Olympia London, December 5, 2006, lot no. 424, from whom it was purchased by Sir Denis Mahon.

Exhibitions:

Trapani 2007; Forlì 2008.

Bibliography:

Gregori in Trapani 2007, pp. 47–83; Marini in Trapani 2007, pp. 85–104; Benati in Forlì 2008, pp. 11–19; Gregori in Benati and Paolucci 2008, pp. 20–49 (early Roman period); Gregori in Forlì 2008, pp. 21–49; Marini in Forlì 2008, pp. 51–59; Schneider in Forlì 2008, pp. 65–67; Stainton in Forlì 2008, pp. 61–63.

Following its appearance at auction in 2006, the painting was identified as an autograph work by Sir Denis Mahon. In subsequent studies and exhibitions, Gregori and Marini have concurred that the painting is an autograph replica of the *Cardsharps* in Fort Worth (cat. no. 4).

Condition:

See technical report in Forlì 2008, pp. 68–69.

101. *Portrait of Giovan Battista Marino*

Oil on canvas, 28³/₄ x 23⁵/₈ in. (73 x 60 cm)

London, Private collection

For early provenance and bibliography see Catalogue of Lost Works L.84.

Bibliography:

Marini 2001, n. 45, pp. 218–19, 453–55; Marini in Calvesi and Volpi 2001, pp. 233–42; Vannugli in Calvesi and Volpi 2001, pp. 269–71; Sickel in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 111.

To judge from the photograph the work is possibly an original of c. 1600. Its identification as Gianbattista Marino remains to be confirmed.

102. *Saint Peter Repentant and the Rooster*

Oil on canvas, 56½ x 43 in. (143.5 x 109.5 cm)

Italy, Private collection

Provenance:

Lazaro Galdano, Spain 1938.

Bibliography:

Mahon 2005 (1601–3; associates this with a lost painting of this subject cited in an inventory of the Palazzo Pitti [see *Lost Works*, cat. no. L.68]).

103. *Sorrowing Magdalen (Death of the Virgin)*

Oil on canvas, 44 x 36 in. (112 x 92 cm)

Private collection

Exhibitions:

Athens 2006; Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 34.

Bibliography:

Petrucci 2004, pp. 3–15; De Sarno Prignano e Muti 2006 *ad indicem*; Hartje in Düsseldorf 2006, cat. no. 34, pp. 248–49; Petrucci and Mahon in Athens 2006, pp. 56–57.

The figure is related to Caravaggio's *Death of the Virgin* (cat. no. 45). The painting is considered autograph by the authors cited as a life-size sketch or modello. Mahon specifies, however, that the painting would not be preparatory to the altarpiece but rather a “tryout” for Caravaggio's personal use. According to Petrucci (Athens 2006, p. 56), the painting has been accepted in oral opinions by Gregori, Marini, and Strinati.

Lost Works

I. Commissioned Altarpieces

L.1 Messina, *Four Subjects of the Passion*

Documents:

Messina, before August 1609: “Note the paintings made for me (Nicolò di Giacomo): I gave the commission to Sig. Michel’Angiolo Morigi da Caravaggio to make the following: four stories of the Passion of Jesus Christ of the painter’s choosing, of which he finished one that represents Christ carrying the cross on his shoulder, the Virgin of Sorrows, and two rogues, one playing a trumpet, which is quite beautiful and for which I paid 46 oz and the others the painter is obliged to bring me during the month of August which I will pay when he delivers them.” [ante agosto 1609 (Nicolò di Giacomo) “Nota delli quatri fatti fare da me Nicolao di Giacomo: ho dato la commissione al sig. Michel’Angiolo Morigi da Caravaggio di farmi le seguenti quatri: Quattro storie della passione de Gesù Cristo da farli a capriccio del pittore delle quali ne finì uno che rappresenta Cristo colla Croce in spalla, la Vergine Addolorata e dui manigoldi uno sona la tromba riusc’ veramente bellissima opera e pagata oz. 46 e l’altri tre s’obligò il Pittore portarmeli nel mese di Agosto con pagarli quanto si converrà da questo pittore che ha il cervello stravolto.”] (Saccà 1907, pp. 64–65; Marini 1989, p. 568 P. 31–32; Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 116 [one delivered by artist, others untraced]; Spadaro 2008, p. 147).

Nicolao di Giacomo commissioned four Passion subjects from Caravaggio during his visit to Messina (spring–summer 1609); only the *Road to Calvary* appears to have been completed.

L.2 Modena, *Chapel of the Madonna*

Between August 6, 1605 and July 15, 1606, Caravaggio received 32 scudi as advance payment for a painting promised to the Duke of Modena, but never delivered. The commission is documented in letters from Fabio Masetti, d’Este ambassador in Rome, to Count Giovanni

Battista Laderchi in Modena (Venturi 1910, v. 13, pp. 281–84; Friedlaender 1974, pp. 310–14 [incorrectly identifies the painting with the *Madonna of Rosary*]; Marcolini 1998).

L.3 Naples, *Sant'Anna dei Lombard*

Fenaroli Chapel, destroyed by earthquake in 1798

(L.3.1) *Resurrection (altarpiece)*

(L.3.2) *Saint John the Baptist (side altar)*

(L.3.3) *Saint Francis Receiving the Stigmata (side altar)*

Sources:

1. Primo Postillatore Anonimo del Mancini (Gallacini, in Mancini 1619–21; Longhi 1943, pp. 36–37 n. 23; Mahon 1947, pp. 285–86, n. 16).
2. Mancini 1619–21 (1956, I, p. 340).
3. Capaccio 1634, p. 674.
4. Bellori 1672 [ed. 1976, p. 225].
5. Scaramuccia 1674, pp. 75–76.
6. Celano 1692, I, pp. 9–10.
7. De Dominici 1742–43, II, p. 275.
8. Cochin 1763, I, pp. 171–72.

9. Tommaso Puccini, 1783: “a saint John seated with a bowl, that is very beautiful and lively” [*un S. Gio. “Sedente con la scodella, che è bellissimo, vivo. Opera del Caravaggio”*] (See: M.C. Mazzi, “Paesi, figure e gallerie d’arte: il soggiorno napoletano di Tommaso Puccini,” in *Libri per vedere. Le guide storiche-artistiche delle città di Napoli*, Naples, 1995, pp. 241–98, 286; Kliemann in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 208).

10. Sigismondo 1788–89, p. 247.

11. Celano–Chiarini 1856–60 [III, 1858, pp. 312–13].

Selected Bibliography:

Longhi 1951, pp. 49, 56–57 (a *Resurrection* by Finson in Aix-en-Provence could reflect the lost original); Mahon 1951, p. 234; Longhi 1952, p. 42; Mahon 1952, p. 19, n. 97; Friedlander 1955, p. 224, no. 50; Longhi 1959, pp. 21–22; Jullian 1961, pp. 175, 182 n. 46; Longhi 1968, pp. 41, 45–46; Bodart 1970, pp. 72–73; Calvesi 1971, pp. 99–102, 10 n. 106; Cinotti 1971, pp. 82, 86, 169, n.118; Spear in Cleveland 1971, p. 82; Causa 1972, p. 962 n. 4 (a *St. Francis Receiving the Stigmata* by Filippo Vitale in sacristy of Sant’Anna dei Lombardi could reflect the lost Caravaggio original); Marini 1974, pp. 476–77, P-24, 308–9 D; Prohaska 1975, p. 3 n. 9; Moir 1976, p. 113 no. 70, pp. 148–49 n. 249; Mellini 1977, pp. 416–17; Pacelli 1977, p. 820; Pacelli 1978, p. 58; Thuillier 1978, pp. 67–68; Pacelli 1980, pp. 24, 29 n. 3; Prohaska 1980, p. 120 n. 43; Cinotti 1983, nos. 112–14; Marini 1989, p. 568 P. 34–36; Bologna 1992, p. 342 (lost, 1609); Pacelli 1994, pp. 67–69 (commissioned Spring 1608); Langdon 1998, p. 386 (untraced); Varriano in Mormando 1999, p. 196 (1608); Spike 2001, Catalogue of Lost Works L.34 (1609); Zeffi in *L’ultimo Caravaggio* 2004, p. 124 (1610); Bologna in Naples-London 2004–5, p. 112 (in the entry for cat. no. 6, the *Flagellation*, discusses a copy, paired with a copy of this lost work, in the collection of Giovan Carlo Doria in Genoa recorded as early as 1615–20); Sciberras and Stone 2006, pp. 111 (lost); Varriano 2006, p. 130; Kliemann in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 208.

On December 24, 1607, Alfonso Fenaroli obtained the rights to the third chapel on the left side of the Church of the Lombards in Naples. Caravaggio appears to have executed the altarpiece and two lateral paintings of Saints Francis and John the Baptist, respectively, after

his return to Naples in late 1609; the details of the commission are not known. The three paintings were evidently lost when the church was destroyed by an earthquake in 1798.

L.4 Naples, *Nicolò Radolovich (or Radulovic)*

October 6, 1606: Archive of the Banco di Napoli: Caravaggio received a payment of two hundred ducati from Nicolò Radolovich for an altarpiece with Saints Dominic, Francis, Nicolò, and Vito (Pacelli 1977, p. 819).

L.5 Recanati, *Copies of Devotional Paintings*

These unidentified paintings were reportedly executed for Pandolfo Pucci in Rome.

Source:

Mancini 1619–21, I, p. 224: “After a few months he left with little recompense calling his benefactor and master ‘Monsignor Salad.’ During his stay he painted some copies of devotional images that are now in Recanati.”

L.6 *Crucifixion of Saint Peter*

Rome, Monsignor Tiberio Cerasi, commissioned from Caravaggio on September 24, 1600

Provenance:

Tiberio Cerasi commissioned two paintings from Caravaggio on September 24, 1600, for his chapel in Santa Maria del Popolo, Rome; Francesco Sannesio, Rome, nephew and heir of Giacomo Sannesio who acquired the pair by descent, by 1644; acquired in Rome by Juan Alonzo Enriquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and ninth Almirante de Castilla, Madrid, who dies in 1647; by descent to his son, Juan Gaspar; acquired by Agostino Ayrolo, Genoa, by 1659; acquired by Francesco Maria Balbi, Genoa, by December 20, 1701; after which traces to this painting are lost.

Inventories:

1. Giacomo Sannesio, Rome, who, according to Baglione (1642), acquired this painting and the *Conversion of Saint Paul* (today in the Odescalchi–Balbi Collection, Rome, see Spike 2001, cat. no. 23; Spike 2010 cat. no. 23) after their rejection by the Ospedale della Consolazione, Cerasi's heir.

2. February 19, 1644: Inventory of Francesco Sannesio (nephew and heir to Cardinal Giacomo), Rome: “Two large paintings that represent a Saint Peter crucified and the other the conversion of Saint Paul, gilt frames” [“Doi quadri grandi in tavola che rappresentano un San Pietro crocifisso e l'altro la conversione di San Paolo corniciati e filettati d'oro”].

3. August 17, 1647: Posthumous inventory of Juan Alonzo Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and ninth Almirante de Castilla, Madrid, f.333, nos. 327, 328: “A large painting of the *Martyrdom of Saint Peter* . . . and another *Conversion of Saint Paul* both by the hand of Caravaggio” [“[86]Ytten Vio un quadro grande del martirio de sant.o de Sanct P.o, con marco inventariado a n° 327, Tasolo con el marco que es dorado y Tallado en . . . Rx 3,330; [87]Ytten Vio otro de la conversion de sanct Pablo gr.de come el de arriva con marco dorado ambos de mano del Caravacho = inventariado a no. 328 . . . Rs 3300”] (Burke and Cherry 1997, I, p. 412 nos. 86, 87 p. 412; Spike 2001, cat. no. 23 and Catalogue of Lost Works L.15, L.16, L.105; Macioce 2003, nos. 37, 40, pp. 356–58).

4. Macioce (2003, inventario 64, p. 369) would add the following painting, not attributed as to author, in the November 17–December 7, 1691, inventory of the goods inherited by Juan Gaspar Enríquez de Cabrera, in the villa at Madrid: Another of the martyrdom of saint Peter Apostle. [“Otra en ttabla que ttiene de altto dos varas y media y de ancho dos Varas en que se ve ser el martirior de san Petro Apostol en dos mill y Duzienttos”].

The following paintings are believed to be copies of the lost first version of the *Crucifixion of Saint Peter*:

C. I

Seville, Spain, Convent of Sant'Alberto

Oil on canvas, 99¼ x 82 in. (252 x 208.5 cm)

Bibliography:

Spezzaferro in Rome 2001.

C. 2

Saint Petersburg, Hermitage; inv. 28

Oil on canvas, 91½ x 79¼ in. (232 x 201 cm)

Provenance:

Paris, Mme. Levi de Montmorency; purchased 1808 by Baron Denon, who sold it to the museum as Caravaggio.

Exhibition:

Leningrad 1973, no. 34 (as copy by Leonello Spada).

Bibliography:

Waagen 1864, p. 82 (inspired Rubens *Crucifixion of Saint Peter* in Saint Peter's, Cologne); Liphart *Catalogue* 1912, no. 216 (as Caravaggio); Witting 1916, p. 29 (rejects); Liphart 1922, p. 116 (identifies as lost first version of Cerasi Chapel picture rejected by Cardinal Sannesio); Zahn 1928 (Manfredi); Longhi 1943, p. 59 n. 83 (rejects); Friedlaender 1945, p. 155 (copy of first version by Saltarello); Mahon 1951, p. 227 n. 39 (not copy of first version); Friedlaender 1955, pp. 8, 30, 185; Wagner 1958, p. 204 n. 400 (not copy, first version); Shcherbachova in *Catalogue . . .* 1958, no. 28 (copy by Leonello Spada); Salerno 1960, p. 94 n. 6 (*Crucifixion of Saint Peter* is described in Giustiniani collection as by Luca Saltarelli, a Genoese [horizontal format, 10 palmi x 15] and cannot be this picture because it remained in Rome at least until 1870, when exhibited in Santa Maria degli Angeli by Domenico Agrestini); Jullian 1961, pp. 93, 100 n. 61,

232 (first version; publishes copy of Hermitage version now in Museo Civico, Genoa); de Logu 1962 (copy of lost original); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 45; Kitson 1969, no. 43 (doubtful); Cinotti 1971, pp. 116, 189 n. 315; Pepper 1971, p. 342 n. 38 (not copy first version); Marini 1974, no. R2 p. 290, 463 R2 n. 244 (not copy first version, by Saltarelli); Vsevolozhskaya 1975, no. 4 (variant of first version, Lionello Spada?, but perhaps Netherlandish); Moir 1976, p. 119, no. 114 (no); Marini 1979, p. 77 n. 10 (von Sandrart); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Cinotti 1983, no. 78 (attributed, not version of Cerasi, Flemish?); Puglisi 1998, no. 33 (version of Cerasi picture, unconvincing attribution); Spike 2001, cat. no. 24.c.6.

The painting is probably by a Northern Caravaggist, perhaps Rombouts.

L.7 Siena, *Fabio Nuti*

On April 5, 1600 Caravaggio agreed to execute for Fabio Nuti of Siena a large painting with figures about 12 by 7 to 8 palmi for which Alessandro Albani paid Caravaggio on November 20, 1600. Nuti's name was variously read as Fabio de Sartis or de Nutis until the clarification by Calvesi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, pp. 8–9.

Bibliography:

Fabio Masetti Zannini 1971, pp. 185–86, doc. 1, 2; Calvesi 1989, pp. 7–13 (relates to commission for *Entombment*); Sickel 2001, p. 427 (separates Nuti and this lost painting from the Vittrici commission of the *Entombment*).

L.8 Tolentino, *Chiesa di S. Maria di Costantinopoli*

A January 2, 1604, letter of Lancelletto Mauruzi from Rome to the priors of Tolentino recommends the merits of Caravaggio, whom he understands to have arrived in the city to paint the high altarpiece of the church of the Cappuccini (Benadduci 1888, p. 7; Cinotti 1983, no. 165 (document probably false, on 8 January Caravaggio in Rome); Marini 1989, p. 472, no. 56 (a copy was lost during the Napoleonic era), p. 566 P.17).

II. Religious Subjects

A. Old Testament

L.9 *Cain and Abel*

Madrid, Doña Catalina Manuela de Torres y Trillo

1666 Taxation evaluation

(Angullo y Cobo 1981, p. 31)

L.10 *David*

Rome, Abbot Galeotto Uffreducci, Canon of Santa Maria Maggiore

January 26, 1643, testament of Abbot Galeotto Uffreducci, who bequeathed to Monsignor Rospiglioso, a David by Caravaggio (Marini 1989, p. 426 identifies with *David and Goliath* at the Prado cat. no. 42).

L.11 *David*

Naples, Giovanni Francesco Salerinitano, Barone di Frosolone

November 16, 1648, posthumous inventory, no. 7: David by Caravaggio D. 50.0 ["Lo David di Caravaggio"] (Labrot 1992, p. 80).

L.12 *Jonah*

Naples, Giovanni Francesco Salerinitano, Barone di Frosolone

November 16, 1648, no. 39: a Jonah, half figure by Caravaggio D.30.0 ["Un Jona mezza figura di Caravaggio"] (Labrot 1992, p. 80).

L.13 *Judith and Holofernes*

Naples, Louis Finson and Abraham Vinck

Documents:

1. Naples, September 25, 1607, letter of Frans Pourbus to Duke Vincenzo I Gonzaga: “I saw here two very beautiful paintings by M[ichel]Angelo da Caravaggio: one of a rosary, made for an altarpiece. It is very large at 18 palmi and the price is no less than 400 ducati; the other is a painting of half-length figures of a Judith with Holofernes, at 300 ducati. I did not make any offer without knowing your wishes, but they promised me that they would not sell it until they learned of your wishes.” [“. . . Ho visto qui doi quadri bellissimi di mano de M[ichel]Angelo da Caravaggio: l’uno è d’un rosario et era fatto per un’ancona et è grande da 18 palmi et non vogliono manco di 400 ducati; l’altro è un quadro mezzano da camera di mezze figure et è un Oliferno con Giudetta, et non lo dariano a manco di 300 ducati. Non ho voluto fare alcuna proferta non sapendo l’intentione di V[ostra] A[ltezza], me hanno però promesso di non darli via sintanto che saranno avvisati del piacere . . .] (Mantua, Archivio Gonzaga, Esterni, n. XXV, *Diversi, Carteggio da Napoli*; Baschet, *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, 1868, p. 447; Luzio, *Galleria degli Gonzaga*, 1913; see Spike cat. no. 51, doc. 3).

2. Amsterdam, September 19, 1617: Testament of Louis Finson, Amsterdam, in which he leaves his half interest in the *Madonna of the Rosary* and the *Judith and Holofernes*, both by Michelangelo Caravaggio [“Beyde van Michael Angel Crawats”], to his partner, Abraham Vinck (Bredius 1918, pp. 198–99; Bodart 1970, pp. 228–29; Marini 1989, p. 503, tentatively associates with this painting a notice that Simon Glaude, the brother-in-law of Vinck, sent to Rome around 1621 for an unnamed painting by Caravaggio valued at 600 florins [de Roever 1885, pp. 186–87]; Leone De Castris, Naples 1991–92, no. 2.4, has associated with this reference to a painting in the Banco di Napoli collection, Naples, attributed to Louis Finson; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 191 at A).

See Spike cat. no. 51; Spike, *Other Works Attributed* cat. no. 89.

L.14 *Judith and Holofernes*

Rome, Albani Collection

Sources:

1. October 24, 1672: Inventory of paintings in the Altieri inventory attached to the Fidecommissio of Clement X Albani, without identification of the artist, “a painting of a Judith with the head of Holofernes with a gilt frame” [“Quadro d’una Giuditta con la testa d’Oloferne con cornice indorata”] (Archivio Storico Capitolino, Roma, Sez. V, prot. 3, ff. 49).

2. von Ramdohr 1787: As in Rome, Palazzo Albani, “Judith with the head of Holofernes by Caravaggio” [“Judith mit dem kopf des Holofernes von Caravaggio”].

Bibliography:

Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 43; Marini 1989, p. 420; Spike 2001, cat. no. 19, Inventories.

An untraced *Judith*, without attribution, is recorded in 1672 in the Albani collection, where in 1787 it appears in a guide to Rome as an original by Caravaggio.

L.15 *Judith Beheading Holofernes*

Indre-et-Loire, France; Chateau Richelieu

1676 inventory of the Cabinet de la Reine: a Judith with the Head of Holofernes by Caravaggio [“Judith, tenant le tête d’Holopherne”] (Bodart 1970, pp. 14–15, n. 1).

L.16 *Judith Beheading Holofernes*

Antwerp, Alexander Voet

February 1689 inventory (Bodart 1970, pp. 228–29).

L.17 *Judith Beheading Holofernes*

Paris, François Quesnel

1697 inventory (Bodart 1970, pp. 228–29).

L.18 *Judith Beheading Holofernes*

Bologna, Palazzo Zambecari

Sources:

1. Charles De Brosses, 1745–55 (p. 278): Composition and expression unique. Remarkable are the horror and fright of Judith, the dreadful head of Holofernes and the cold-blooded wickedness of the servant by Michel Ange de Caravage.

2. Lalande 1769 (ed. 1790, II, p. 94) repeats De Brosses' remarks.

Bibliography:

Friedlaender 1955, p. 159; Spike 2001, cat. no. 19, Inventories.

L.19 *Judith Beheading Holofernes*

Rome, collection of Giulio Gaulli

Inventories:

1. January 3, 1761, inventory of the paintings inherited by Giulio Gaulli and compiled by the painter Ludovico Mazzanti who had personally known Baciccio: “[145] a Judith holding the head of Holofernes, with her maid, original by Caravaggio” [“Una Giuditta con la Testa d’Oloferne in mano, e Fantesca orig.le di Caravaggio”] valued at 100 scudi.

2. 1776: Inventory of Gaulli collection; the painting was catalogued as “school of Caravaggio.”

This painting, listed among those inherited by Giulio Gaulli, son of G. B. Gaulli (“il Baciccio,” 1639–1709), is believed to have been in the artist’s possession at his death.

(Fagiolo dell’Arca–Pantanella 1996, pp. 29, 116; Spike 2001, cat. no. 19, Inventories.)

L.20 *Judith Beheading Holofernes*

Perugia, Conte Riberio Ranieri

1771 Inventory (Archivio Storico Capitolino, Roma, Sez. V, prot. 8, ff. 177–78; Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 42).

L.21 *Susanna and the Elders*

Rome, Giambattista Marino

The poet mentions the picture in a letter sent from Paris in 1620 to Padre Agostino Berti; the work was probably executed when Caravaggio and Marino were in contact in Rome between 1600 and 1605 (Marino 1620 [ed. 1966, p. 276, letter 148]; Samek Ludovici 1956, p. 123).

B. New Testament

L.22 *Adoration of the Magi*

Madrid, Juan Alfonso Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and ninth Almirante de Castilla

1647 posthumous inventory, paintings appraised on August 7, 1647 by Antonio Arias, painter, fol 340, no. 468: “ytten Vio Una lamina de adorazion de Reyes con su marco dorado de Mano del caravacho . . . 1200 reales” (Burke–Cherry 1997, I, no. 226, p. 418).

L.23 *Christ Among the Apostles*

Paris, Cardinal Armand Jean du Plessis Richelieu

1643 Inventory (Getty Provenance Index).

L.24 *Christ Calling a Child*

Cardinal Neri Maria Corsini

No. 77 from Cesare Capranica, Christ who calls a child, above door, by Caravaggio or cav. Mr. Valentino [“Da Cesare Capranica. Cristo che chiama a se un fanciullo, soprapporto, del Caravaggio o cav M.r Valentino, sc. 30”].

A similar subject with a similar attribution is mentioned a second time at no. 116 (Macioce 2003, inventaria 84, p. 377).

L.25 *Christ Bearing the Cross, Half Lengths*

Rome, Cardinal Ludovico Ludovisi

Inventories:

1. November 2, 1623: Inventory of the collection: “no. 223 without indication of author, A Christ with the Cross on his shoulder, 5 palmi high. Frame carved and gilt” [“Un Christo con la Croce in spalla alto p.i 5 Cornice intag.ta e dorata di m.o di–”].

2. January 28, 1633, posthumous inventory: “no. 42: A painting of Christ with a cross of his shoulder, half length, 5 palmi high in a gilt frame by Caravaggio” [“un quadro con Cristo con

la croce in spalla mezza figura alto palmi cinque cornice dorata di mano di Caravaggio”](Garas 1967, pp. 344 nos. 42, 106; 345 n. 116; Wood 1992, pp. 515–23; Macioce 2003, inventaria 18, p. 348; inventaria 26, p. 352).

L.26 *Christ Crowned with Thorns*, copy

Naples, Gaspare San Giovanni Toffetti

1651 Inventory: “A painting of about 5 palmi with the image of Christ, crowned with thorns, a copy of Caravaggio, with figures, gilt frame” [“Un Quadro de palmi 5 in circa con l’Imagine di Cristo, coronato di spine, copia del Caravaggio, con figure, cornice inodrata”] (Labrot 1992, p. 87).

L.27 *Christ Crowned with Thorns*

Naples, Ferdinando Vandeneynnden

1688 Inventory: compiled by Luca Giordano (Archivio di Stato di Napoli, notaio Gennaro Palomba, sec. XVII, scheda 648, prot. 42, inserto dopo f. 642; Ruotolo 1982, pp. 14, 27, 31, 36).

L.28 *Ecce Homo*

Naples, Juan de Lescano

1631 Inventory: no. 21: “An Ecce Homo with Pilate, who shows him to the people, and an executioner who is seen behind dressing him in the purple cloak, a large painting original by Caravaggio and this painting is estimated at more than 800 D” [“Un ecce homo con pilato que lo muestra al pueblo, y un sazon que le viste de detras la veste porpureas quadro grande original del caravagio y esta pintura es estimada en mas de 800 D”] (Labrot 1992, p. 57; Vannugli 1998 p. 7, fig 5, identifies with the *Ecce Homo* in Genoa [see Spike cat. no. 42]).

L.29 *Ecce Homo*

Rome, Cardinal Flavio Chigi

1692 Inventory: “an Ecce Homo with Two Knaves on Either Side” (Getty Provenance Index; Spike 2001).

L.30 *Ecce Homo with Pilate and Two Soldiers*

Siena, Michelangelo Vanni

Documents:

1. March 1615: “A painting on canvas of an Ecce Homo with Pilate and two soldiers, all half figures or less, that is a copy of a Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio, but well done, and well conserved” [“un quadro in tela ove è un Ecce homo, con Pilato, e due soldati, tutti dal mezzo in sù et anco meno, che è copia che viene da Michel’Angelo da Caravaggio, ma ben fatta, e ben conservata”] (Fumagalli in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, p. 145).

2. Included in a list of paintings for sale in Siena attached to letter of March 1615 from Agostino Chigi to Grand Duke Cosimo II. Chigi was responding to a list of paintings acquired by Conte Villamediana and submitted for exportation from Tuscany. This *Ecce Homo* is not included on Villamediana’s list (Fumagalli, Appendix 2), and it is not known if it was acquired and/or exported.

3. Picture dealer and painter, Michelangelo Vanni is known to have made copies of Caravaggio for sale (cf. L.65 *Saint John the Evangelist* below). In a letter of October 10, 1615, Giulio Mancini writes that he has been shown a list of paintings for sale in Siena, reportedly by Michelangelo Vanni, “who is selling many paintings by Sodoma, Michelangelo Caravaggio, and Raphael, as if they were true and original and at low (‘vile’) prices . . .” [“Il Petrangeli mi mostrò una lista, per quanto mi diceva [di] mano del Vanni, dove poneva in vendita molti quadri del Sodoma, Michelangelo Caravaggio e di Raffaello, se fusse vero e che fusser originali e a vil prezzo datemene avviso . . .”] (Maccherini 1997, p. 80).

Bibliography:

Cassanova E. “Esportazione di quadri dallo Stato di Siena,” in *Miscellanea storica senese*, IV, 1896, pp. 178–83 at 182; Fumagalli in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, p. 145; Maccherini 1997, pp. 80–81; Ciampolini in Pontedera 2005, p. CXLV.

This reference is associated by some scholars with an *Ecce Homo*, which exists in several versions, cf. Spike 2010, Catalogue of Other Works Attributed cat. no. 79.

L.31 *Flagellation*

Florence, Medici Collection, Palazzo Pitti

1663 Inventory (Archivio di Stato di Firenze, Guardaroba, 725 c.5; Borea in Florence 1970, p. IX).

L.32 *Flagellation*

Naples, Ferdinando Vandeneynden

1688 Inventory compiled by Luca Giordano (Archivio di Stato di Napoli, notaio Gennaro Palomba, sec. XVII, scheda 648, prot. 42, inserto dopo f. 642; Ruotolo 1982, pp. 14, 27, 31, 36).

L.33 *Flagellation*

Naples, Carlo de Cardenas, Conte di Acerra and Marchese di Laino

October 1699 Inventory: no. 157: “A painting of 6 by 5 with a smooth frame, within is the Flagellation of Our Lord by Caravaggio” [“Un quadro di palmi 6 e 5 con cornice liscia ordinaria entrovi la flagellazione di Nostro Signore del Caravaggi”] (Labrot 1992, p. 209).

L.34 *Jesus Disputing with the Doctors*

Rome, Cardinal Ludovico Ludovisi

Inventories:

1. November 2, 1623: Inventory of the collection: no. 286 without indication of author, “A Christ disputing with the doctors, 5 palmi high in a walnut frame, 6 long” [“Un Christo che disputa con li dottori alto p.i 5 Cornice di noce largo 6 di m.o”].
2. January 28, 1633, posthumous inventory: no. 116: “A Christ who disputes among the doctors 5 palmi high, 3 long, by the hand of Caravaggio” [“Un Xpo, che disputa fra Fottoi alto p.mi cinque longo p.mi tre di mano di Caravaggio”].

Bibliography:

Garas 1967, pp. 344 nos. 42, 106; 345 n. 116; Wood 1992, pp. 515–23; Macioce 2003, inventaria 18, p. 348; inventaria 26, p. 352.

L.35 A Head or a Figure, possibly Joseph

Naples, Ferrante Spinelli, Principe di Tarsia

January 8, 1654 Inventory: no. 66 is called “a head by Juseppe di Ribera,” and no. 67 is “another of the same figure by Caravaggio” [66: “Una testa di Gioseppe di Revera”; 67 “Un altro del jstessa figura di Caravagio quadro] (Labrot 1992, p. 95).

L.36 Holy Family with Other Figures

Amsterdam, Thomas Howard, Earl of Arundel

September 26, 1684 Sales catalogue, Thomas Howard, Earl of Arundel “Michelangelo Caravaggio, Christ, Mary, Joseph and other figures, excellently done” fl. 92

(Hoet 1752, vol. 1, p. 1, no. 3; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p.192 at G)

L.37 *A Madonna*

Genoa, Juan de Tassis y Peralta, Conde de Villamediana

By Michelangelo da Caravaggio / Una Madonna ["Di Michelangelo da Caravaggio/ Una Mad.a di"]

Documents:

1. Included in a list of paintings attached to a letter of March 11, 1615 from the Conde de Villamediana in Genoa to Andrea Cioli, Florence. The paintings had been recently acquired in Siena, mainly through the agency of Michelangelo Vanni. In his letter Villamediana requests the permission from Grand Duke Cosimo II to export the paintings from Tuscany to Spain. It is not certain whether this *Madonna* was ultimately exported. Picture dealer and painter Michelangelo Vanni is known to have made copies of Caravaggio for sale (cf. L.65 *Saint John the Evangelist* below).

2. In a letter of October 10, 1615, Giulio Mancini writes that he has been shown a list of paintings for sale in Siena, reportedly by Michelangelo Vanni, "who is selling many paintings by Sodoma, Michelangelo Caravaggio, and Raphael, as if they were true and original and at low ('vile') prices . . ." ["Il Petrangeli mi mostrò una lista, per quanto mi diceva [di] mano del Vanni, dove poneva in vendita molti quadri del Sodoma, Michelangelo Caravaggio e di Raffaello, se fusse vero e che fusser originali e a vil prezzo datemene avviso. . ."] (Maccherini 1997, p. 80).

Bibliography:

Casanova 1896, pp. 181–83; Fumagalli in *Come dipingeva . . .* 1996, pp. 145–50; Maccherini 1997, pp. 81 and 92 note 122; Ciampolini in Pontedera 2005, p. CXLV.

L.38 *Madonna with Child and Saint John*

Florence, Medici Collection, Palazzo Pitti

September 18, 1620, inventory of Palazzo Pitti (ASF Guardaroba Medicea, 373, c. 377d; Barocchi and Gaeta Bertelà 2002, I, p. 172, n. 646)

1624 Medici Inventory (ASF, Guardaroba Medicea, 373 c. 378)

(Borea in Florence 1970, p. IX).

L.39 (*Madonna of the ?*) *Rosary*

Paris, François Quesnel

1697 Inventory (Bodart 1970, pp. 228–29)

L.40 *Madonna with Child*

Cardinal Neri Maria Corsini

No. 140: “From Sig. Cardinal Lorenzo. The Madonna with Child by Caravaggio both in Imperial canvas” [“Del Sig.r Card. Lorenzo. La Madonna col Bambino di Caravaggio ambedue in tele d’Imperatore”] (Macioce 2003, inventaria 84, p. 377).

L.41 *Supper at Emmaus*

Madrid, Gaspar de Haro y Guzmán, Marqués del Carpio, Marquès de Eliche, Duque de Montoro, Conde-Duque de Olivares and Conde de Morente

Posthumous inventory 1689, fol. 1039v, no. 461: “A painting of the Supper at Emmaus by Michael Angel Caravacho $2\frac{1}{4}$ varas high, $4\frac{1}{2}$ varas wide with a black frame, 2,200 ducados” [“Un quadro del Castillo de maus orig. de Michael Angel Caravacho de dos Varas y quarta de Caida y quatro varas y media de Ancho Con m.^{co} negro en dos mill Ducados 2,200”] (Burke–Cherry 1997, I, p. 854, no. 436).

L.42 *Last Supper*

The Hague, Francisco Jacomo van den Berghe

Documents:

1. November 4, 1720: List of paintings transferred to Jan Osij by the art dealer Francisco-Jacomo van den Berghe, fl. 400: “A large last supper by Michelangelo de Caravaggio” [“Een groot Avontmael door Michélangelo de Caravagio”].

2. May 19, 1723: List of paintings sold by Francisco-Jacomo van den Berghe in The Hague, fl. 31: “A Last Supper by Michelangelo de Caravaggio, very well painted” [“Le Saint Scène par Michelangelo de Caravaggio, très ben peinte”].

(Duverger 2004, p. 232, no. 51; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 194 at S and V)

L.43 *Taking of Christ*

Naples, Ferdinando Vandeneynnden

Inventory: 1688, prepared by Luca Giordano (Archivio di Stato di Napoli, notaio Gennaro Palomba, sec. XVII, scheda 648, prot. 42, inserto dopo f. 642; Ruotolo 1982, pp. 14, 27, 31, 36).

L.44 *Tribute Money*

Naples, Carlo de Cardenas, Conte di Acerra and Marchese di Laino

Inventory: October 1699 (Labrot 1992, pp. 208–9).

L.45 *The Trinity*

Rome, Borghese Collection

Documents:

1. June 25, 1602 : The congregation of the confraternity of SS. Trinità dei Pellegrini resolved that Sig. Carlo Cropello speak with Michel Angelo da Caravaggio to make a painting of the Trinity for 40 scudi, as a gift to the church of the Holy Trinity in Mexico (ASR SS Trinità dei Pelligrini, vol. 62).

2. 1634: Inventory of the Collection of Cardinal Scipione Borghese, compiled by Iacomo Manilli.

3. The following cited the painting as in the Borghese collection in Rome: Manilli 1650, p. 107; de' Sebastiani 1685, p. 25; Montelatici 1700, p. 297.

(Venturi 1909, p. 40; Cannatà–Röttgen 1996, p. 82)

C. Saints

L.46 *Saint Augustine, half length*

Rome, Giustiniani Collection

Inventories:

1. February 9, 1638, II, no. 4, Inventory of Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani: “A painting of a half figure of Saint Augustine painted on canvas 5.5 palmi high by about 4.5 by the hand of Michelangelo da Caravaggio in a black frame” [“Un quadro di mezza figura di Sant’Agostino dipinto in tela alta palmi 5.1/2 larga 4.1/2 incirca [di mano di Michelangelo da Caravaggio] con sua cornice negra”].

2. 1793, I, n. 155: Inventory of the Palazzo Giustiniani: “Another painting of 4.5 palmi high representing Saint Augustine by Michel’Angelo di Caravaggio with a frame as above” [“Altro di palmi 4.5 per alto rappresenatante S. Agostino di Michel’Angelo di Caravaggio con Cornice come sopra.”]

3. Silos 1673, I, p. 88 cited the painting as in the Giustiniani Collection in Rome.

(Salerno 1960, p. 135; Danesi Squarzina 2003, Inventari I, 1638, parte II, no. 4, pp. 391–92)

L.47 *Saint Augustine*

Rome, Cardinal Antonio Barberini

November 12, 1691: Sale, Collection of Valuable Pictures of Cardinal Antonio Barberini, London, by Edward Davis & Edward Millington, lot 4 (Spike 2001, Catalogue of Lost Works, L.71)

L.48 *Il Beato Isidoro Agricola*

Ascoli Piceno, Pinacoteca Civica, n. 1018/815

Oil on canvas, 84 x 59 in. (215 x 150 cm); in the church of S. Filippo until 1811

This mediocre composition is considered a copy of a lost original by some writers beginning with Lazzari 1724, p. 40; Marini 1989, pp. 218–29.

L.49 *Bishop Beheaded*

Valladolid, Don Juan Francisco Alfonso Pimentel y Ponce de Leon, Count of Benevento

January 26, 1653 (dated January 3 and 20, 1653 by Macioce): Posthumous inventory of Don Juan Francisco Alfonso Pimentel y Ponce de León: “A holy bishop with his head in a black pine frame, original by Carabacho” [“Iten otro lienço de un santo obispo la cabeza degollada con moldura negra de pino, original de Carabacho – tajado en mill reales”] (*Arquivo Histórico Provincial*, in Ainaud 1947, p. 381 n.3; Burke–Cherry 1997, I, pp. 496–97; Spike 2001 Catalogue of Lost Works L. 114; Macioce 2003, inventaria 45, p. 359).

L.50 *Two paintings by Caravaggio, one a San Carlo*

Rome, collection of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps

Account book (Libro Mastro) of the Altemps, 1611–13:

September 1, 1612: Giovan Angelo Altemps paid 155 scudi to “Prospero Orsi for four paintings, two by Caravaggio, and one San Carlo and one other” [“maestro Prospero Orsi pittore sono per quattro quadri cioè doi del Caravaggio e uno s. Carlo et uno altro”] (Spezzaferro in Calvesi and Volpi 2002, p. 29).

L.51 *Saint Catherine, Mystical Marriage of*

Naples, Don Antonio Carmignano and Giovan Simone Moccia

Source:

Capaccio 1634, pp. 857–58, “The Mystical Marriage of St. Catherine” (Spike 2001, Catalogue of Lost Works, L.40).

L.52 *Saint Catherine of Siena*

Rome, Cardinal Carlo Barberini

Inventory 1692 (modified until 1704), no. 322 “Saint Catherine of Siena with Jesus with a heart in his hand and an angel, 5 palmi, by Caravaggio” [“Una Santa Catterina di Siena con Giesu con cuore in mano, et un angelo al: p.mi 5:1:4: Cornice intagliata e dorata del Caravaggio”].

(Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 440; Macioce 2003, doc. 65, p. 369)

L.53 *Saint Francesca Romana*

Rome, Cardinal Carlo Barberini

Inventory 1692 (modified until 1704), no. 332 “Una S. Fran.ca Romana con l’angelo al: p.mi 2:1:3½ cornice dorata del Caravaggio.”

(Aronberg Lavin 1975, pp. 431, 440; Macioce 2003, doc. 65, p. 369)

L.54 *Saint Francis with Brother Leo* (*S. Francesco col suo compagno*)

Rome, Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte from whom purchased in 1628 by Cardinal Ascanio Filomarino, Naples

Inventories:

1. February 21, 1627: Inventory of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, “A Saint Francis in Ecstasy by Michel Agnolo da Caravaggio with frame ornamented with gold of four palmi” [“Un S. Francesco in Estasi di Michel Agnolo da Caravaggio con Cornici d’oro rabescate di Palmi quattro”] (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol. 58or, Frommel 1972, p. 34).

2. May 25, 1628: Listed among items sold by Alessandro Del Monte to pay debts of Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte, for a Saint Francis by Caravaggio to an unidentified purchaser for 70 scudi [“A di 25 d° . . . Per un S. fran.º del Caravaggio 70”] (Nota del denaro retratto dalla vendita de Mobili del Giardino di Ripetta dopo otto scuti il Breve posto del Banco di S. Spirito, Kirwin 1972, p. 55).

3. May 30, 1628: Cardinal Ascanio Filomarino paid 70 scudi to Alessandro Del Monte for the purchase of San Francesco abandoned on the ground with a companion who helps him, original by Caravaggio [“un quadro di S. Francesco abbandonato in terra con il Compagno che l’aiuta originale del Caravaggio”] (Archivio di Stato Monte di Pieta, Ascanio Filomarino’s bank when he was in Rome, today in ASR, Lomizzo 2001, p. 408).

4. April 8, 1685: Cardinal Ascanio Filomarino, nephew of Cardinal Ascanio Filomarino, “Saint Francis with his companion by the painter Caravaggio” [“14: un altro dell’istessa misure

(p.mi 3 e 4 in circa) coll'istessa cornice coll'istoria di S. Francesco col compagno del pittore Caravaggio”] (Labrot 1992, p. 161; Lomizza 2001, pp. 404–11).

5. 1700: Inventory of Alfonso Filomarino cites a painting of Saint Francis with his companion by Caravaggio (Ruotolo 1977, pp. 75, 80).

Frommel (1972) had identified this reference as a possible provenance for the painting of *Saint Francis in Ecstasy* today in Hartford. See Spike 2001, cat. no. 8. According to Lomizzo 2001, pp. 404–11, the painting was acquired in 1628 by Cardinal Ascanio Filomarino (See Spike 2001, Catalogue of Lost Works, L.41). Subsequent inventories of the Filomarino indicate that the subject differs from the painting today in Hartford.

L.55 *Saint Francis*, copy

Naples, Juan de Lescano

1631 Inventory: no. 42: A large Saint Francis praying with a cross above a skull, copy of Caravaggio [“Un S. Francesco grande que sta haciendo Horacion en una cruz sobre una muerto copia del caravacio”].

(Labrot 1992, p. 57; Vannugli (1998, p. 7 n. 15) identifies this reference with the *Saint Francis* in Carpineto Romano, see Spike cat. no. 9)

L.56 *Saint Jerome*

Rome, Giustiniani Collection

Inventories:

1. March 31, 1621, Inventory of Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani, no. 40: in the large Gallery: “a painting of Saint Jerome on canvas with a black frame” [“un quadro di San Gerolamo, in tela, con cornice tente di negro”] (ASR, Notai del Tribunale AC, uff. 8, vol. 1302, Rainaldo Buratti).

2. 1638, II, no. 5, Inventory of Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani in the large Gallery of old paintings: “another painting of a half figure of Saint Jerome painted on canvas, 5½ palmi high 4½ palmi wide [by hand of Michelangelo da Caravaggio] with a black frame” [“Nella stanza grande de quadri antichi: “Un altro quadro simile di mezza figura di S. Girolamo dipinto in tela alta palmi 5.½ larga palmi 4.½ in circa [di mano Michelangelo da Carvaggio] con sua cornice negra”].

3. 1793, I, n. 58: Inventory of the Palazzo Giustiniani: “Another of palmi 4.3 high representing Saint Jerome by Spagnoletto with a black frame” [“Un altro di palmi 4.3 alto rappresentante S.Girolamo dello Spagnoletto con Cornice come sopra”].

4. Silos 1673, p. 89 cited a Saint Jerome as in the Giustiniani Collection in Rome.

Bibliography:

Salerno 1960, p. 135; Danesi Squarzina 1997, p. 783; Danesi Squarzina in Rome-Berlin 2001, p. 294; Danesi Squarzina 2003, Inventari I, pp. 111–13, p. 392; Macioce 2003, inventari 15, p. 346.

Some scholars identify this reference with the *Saint Jerome at the Monastery* in Montserrat, see Spike, Catalogue of Other Works Attributed cat. no. 88.

L.57 *Copies of Saint Jerome and Saint John*

Madrid, Don Martín de Saavedra Guzmán y Galindo

Inventory: November 1630 fol 577v, “another painting of Saint John, copy of Caravaggio; another painting of Saint Jerome, copy of Caravaggio” [“Otro quadro de san juan copia de Carabacho”; “Otro quadro de san Geronimo copia de Carabacho”] (Burke–Cherry 1997, I, p. 282, nos. 10, 16).

L.58 *Saint Jerome*

Messina, Chiesa di Santa Maria la Concezione

Sources:

1. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 227): Saint Jerome Writing.
2. Susinno 1724 (ed. 1960, p. 114), records two paintings of this saint in the private collection of Conte Adonnino in Messina.

See Spike 2001, Catalogue of Lost Works, L.30.

L.59 *Saint Jerome*

Valletta, Grand Master's Palace

Source:

Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 227) cites a *Saint Jerome in Meditation with a Skull*.

Bibliography:

Cinotti 1983, no. 100 (mistaken repetition of painting of *Saint Jerome* in Co-Cathedral); Gregori 1985, p. 298 (probably not the Montserrat painting).

L.60 *Saint Jerome*

Rotterdam, Collection Jacques Meyers (1660–1721)

Source:

September 9, 1722, sales catalogue of Jacques Meyers, wine and art dealer, in Rotterdam, 1722, fl. 205: “A Saint Jerome boldly painted by the same [Caravaggio]” [“Een St Jeronimus, stout geschildert, door dezelve (Caravaggio)”].

(Hoet 1752, vol. I, p. 268, no. 22; Duverger 2004, p. 241, no. 22; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 194 at U.)

L.61 *Saint John the Baptist*

Naples, Don Antonio Carmignano and Giovan Simone Moccia

Source:

Capaccio 1634, pp. 857–58.

L.62 *Saint John the Baptist*

Rome, collection of Caterina Longhi Campani, wife of Onorio Longhi

July 22, 1652, posthumous inventory of Caterina Campani, subsequently mentioned in the will of her son, Martino Longhi, dated between July 31, 1656 and January 5, 1657: “A painting, not very large, of a Saint John the Baptist in the Desert, on canvas with a table behind picture by Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio with a gilt frame, on which is carved four sea shells” [“Un quadro non molto grande dove e dipinto S. Gio. Batt.a al deserto in tela con una tavola dietro pittura di Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio con una cornice con quattro conghiglie intorno, il tutto dorato e brunito e a mordente. . . .”] (Archivio di Stato, Rome, 30 Notai Capitolini, Carlo Novi, uff. 12; Testament vol. VII, pp; 55rv, 56r 57r; Bertolotti 1881, II, p. 26; Macioce 2003, inventaria 44, p. 359).

L.63 *Saint John the Baptist*

Rome, Cardinal Flavio Chigi

1692: Saint John the Baptist Pointing to a Lamb (Getty Provenance Index).

L.64 *Saint John the Baptist*

Florence, Medici Collection, Villa Poggio Imperiale

1695: A Saint John in the Desert (ASF, Guardaroba 1017, c.II; Borea in Florence 1970, p. IX).

L.65 *Saint John Evangelist*

Siena, Giulio Mancini

Documents:

1. September 23, 1606, Giulio Mancini, in Rome, writes to his brother Deifebo, in Siena, asking how he likes the painting of Saint John by Caravaggio that he had sent [“fatemi come costà piaccia quel Santo Giovan del Caravaggio”] (Macioce 2003, doc no. 378, p. 247).
2. November 19, 1611, Giulio Mancini, in Rome, writes to his brother Deifebo, in Siena, that he had sent him an original, a unique picture, never copied, of a Saint John and of a Supper of which he has learned Vanni was allowed to make copies. [“Et io credo che, vi ho mandato per originario sia originario, anzi unico e non copiato. Mi duol di quel Sancto Giovanni del Caravaggio e della Cena che mi dite del Vanni che ve la lasciate copiare.”] (Macioce 2003, doc 419, p. 271).
3. December 24, 1611; Giulio Mancini in Rome writes to his brother Deifebo in Siena that he is selling the Saint John by Caravaggio to Vanni [“Intendo che il San Giovanni del Caravaggio il cavaliere Vanni lo trasportò di poco in suo quadro . . .”] (Macioce 2003, doc 420 p. 272; cf. Maccherini 1997, pp. 73, 89 n.1 who dates the letter citing a copy of the San Giovanni made by Michelangelo Vanni to March 1, 1608).
4. April 17, 1620: An inventory of paintings owned by Giulio Mancini includes a “San Giovanni Caravaggio scudi 5” (Macioce 2003, doc. 457, p. 285).
5. In a letter of October 1621 from Giulio Mancini to his brother Deifebo, he refers to a “San Giovanni by Caravaggio” (Maccherini 1993, doc no. pp. 317 ff).

Bibliography:

Mancini 1619–21 [ed. 1956, I, p. 224]; Maccherini 1993, doc no. pp. 317 ff; Maccherini 1997, doc. nos. 1, 13, 36; Spike 2001, Catalogue of Lost Works, L.112; Barocchi and Gaeta Bertelà 2002, I, p. 157 n. 583; Macioce 2003, doc no. 378, p. 247; doc 419, p. 271; doc 420, p. 272; Ciampolini in Pontedera 2005, pp. CXLV (copy by Michelangelo Vanni made on March 1, 1608); Maccherini in *Siena e Roma* 2005, p. 397.

L.66 *Penitent Magdalen in the Desert*

Rome, Giustiniani Collection

Inventories:

1. 1600–c. 1611 Entrata della Guardarobba Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani (ASR, Archivio Giustiniani, b. 15): “A large painting of a naked Magdalen with her hair disheveled with a crucifix in her hand in the desert by Caravaggio in a black frame” [“Un quadro grande in tela di’ una Madalena nel deserto nuda, e scapigliata, nel deserto con un Cristo in mano, con cornice Negre”].

2. March 31, 1621, no. 41, Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani (ASR, Notai del Tribunale AC, uff. 8, vol. 1302, Rainaldo Buratti): “Un quadro di Santa Maria Madalena con un Crocefisso in braccio con cornice tente di negro” (Macioce 2003, inventari 15, p. 346).

3. February 9, 1638, II, no. 7, Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani recorded both an original by Caravaggio [“una Madalena figura intiera diepinto in tela alto pal.10 largo 7, di mano di Michelang.o da Caravaggio”] and a copy by Nicolas Regnier (see c.1 below).

Source:

Silos 1673, p. 90, no. 162; Vasi 1763 [3rd ed. 1804, II p. 347].

Bibliography:

Salerno 1960, p. 135; Spezzaferro 1974, pp. 125–37; Danesi Squarzina 1997, pp. 781, 784; Spike 2001, *Catalogue of Lost Works*, L.88; Testa 2002, pp. 129–54; Danesi Squarzina 2003, *Inventari I*, pp. 22–23, no. 81; no. 41, p. 113; 1638, parte II, no. 7, p. 394; Macioce 2003, *inventari I*, p. 341, *inventari 28*, p. 353.

Luigi Spezzaferro (1974) identified this picture with an untraced and unattributed painting of this subject cited in the testament dated August 6, 1606 of Ottavio Costa, Rome. Costa stated that in the event of his death, his friend the Abbot Ruggero Tritonio, secretary to Cardinal Montalto, should have his choice of two paintings in his collection, a *Saint Francis* and a *Saints Martha and Mary Magdalen*; the picture not selected by Tritonio was to be left to Costa's business partner, Giovanni Enriquez de Herrera. Testa (2002) demonstrated that the Costa picture is not identifiable with the Giustiniani picture.

C. I

Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani

Inventory 1638, I, no. 155: by Nicolas Regniér

[“Un quadro grande con una figura intiegra della Madalena penitente, dipinta in tela alta palmi 10 lar. 7 in circa, [copia della originale del Caravaggio che sta nella stanza grande di quadri antichi fatta da Nicolò Ranieri] senza cornice”] (Danesi Squarzina 2003, *Inventari I*, pp. 23, no. 81).

L.67 *Mary Magdalen, original, and Saint John the Baptist, copy*

Naples, Carlo de Cardenas, Conte di Acerra and Marchese di Laino

Inventory: October 1699 no.136: Two paintings 4 x 3 palmi each, in one is a Saint John the Baptist, copy of Caravaggio, and in the other a Saint Mary Magdalen, original by Caravaggio

[“Due quadri di palmi 4 e 3 con cornice liscia indorata che in uno S. Giovanni Battista copia del Caravaggio, e nell’altro S. Maria Maddalena Originale del Caravaggio”] (Labrot 1992, pp. 208).

L.68 *Saint Peter with a Rooster*

Florence, Medici Collection, Palazzo Pitti

Inventory:

1625 (ASF, Inventorio originale debiti e crediti della Villa Imperiale, 479 c. 20; Borea in Florence 1970, p. IX; Spike 2001, Catalogue of Lost Works, L.8.

See Spike 2010, Other Works Attributed cat. no. 102.

L.69 *Saint Sebastian*

Rome, Asdrubale Mattei

Inventory:

1604: A St. Sebastian by Caravaggio

Sources:

1. Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 232): “One of his [Asdrubale Mattei] best works was a figure of Saint Sebastian with two executioners that was taken to Paris.” [“. . . fu portata in Parigi la figura di San Sebastiano con due ministri, che gli legano le mani di dietro: opera delle sue migliori.”]

2. Baldinucci 1681: the work was sent to France, where by 1628 a copy was made by Jan Le Clerc (Lausanne, Vosgienne collection).

3. Lanzi 1795–96 (ed. 1968, p. 359).

Bibliography:

Friedlaender 1955, p. 225; Moir 1976, p. 114 no. 79; Spezzaferro 1980, pp. 95, 99 n. 24; Cappelletti–Testa 1990, p. 234 (not listed in 1613 inventory); Cappelletti–Testa 1990², p. 5; Gilbert 1995, p. 270 n. 60 (“A *Saint Sebastian* by Caravaggio appears in the 1604 inventory of Marquis Asdrubale, but not in his next one of 1613 or in any other family records. The disappearance validates its absence from Celio’s list.”); Macioce 2003, inventari 2, p. 341.

L.70 *Saint Sebastian*

Rome, Cardinal Carlo Barberini

Inventories:

1. 1663, no. 22 (without attribution to author): “Un S. Sebastian cornice dorata,” which Macioce (2003) connects to the 1692 inventory reference.

2. 1692 (modified until 1704): No. 87 “Un S. Bastiano con tre frezze in mano al: p.mi 6:1:4 cornice dorata del Caravaggio.”

(Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 287, 431, 440; Macioce 2003, doc. 49, p. 361; doc. 65, p. 369)

L.71 *Saint Sebastian*

Madrid, Pedro Nuñez de Guzmán, Conde de Villambrosa y Marqués de Montealegre

Inventory: 1683: Martyrdom of Saint Sebastian (Getty Provenance Index).

L.72 *Saint Sebastian*

Amsterdam, Nicolaes Rosendael

Source:

March 7, 1687, Amsterdam: Inventory taken at the death of Catharina Deyl, widow of the painter Nicolaes Rosendael, Amsterdam, “a Sabastian by M.Z. Caravaggio” (Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 192 at I.).

L.73 *Saint Sebastian*

Madrid, Gaspar de Haro y Guzmán, Marqués del Carpio, Marquès de Eliche, Duque de Montoro, Conde-Duque de Olivares and Conde de Morente

Posthumous inventory: 1689, fol. 1016, no. 143: “Un quadro de San Sevastian de Cuerpo Entero don Una flecha en el pecho y Dos Sayones attandole original de Michael Angel Caravacho del miso tamano que El de Arriba en Seis mill Rs 6000” (Burke–Cherry 1997, I, p. 838, no. 143).

L.74 *Saint Sebastian*

Perugia, Casa Ansidei

Orsini 1784, p. 75

L.75 *Saints Sebastian and Roch*

Rome, Marzio Milesi

In his testament dated February 13, 1637, Milesi left a painting by Michaelis Angeli de Caravaggio of SS. Sebastiani et Rocchi to the Church of S. Silvestro al Quirinale, Rome, with instructions to place it on the center of the right wall of the choir (ASR, Notai capitolini, uff. 11 [già 30] notaio A. Giustiniano, vol 5 testamenti [1628–44] c. 494r sgg.; Spezzaferro 1980, pp. 91–99; Macioce 2003, II, doc 478, p. 294).

III. Portraits

L.76 Portrait of Bernardino Cesari

Rome, Marchese Costanza Patrizi

Inventories:

1. February 27, 1624 Inventory: “Un quadro del retratto di Bernardino Cesare mano del Caravaggio con cornice tocca d’oro scudi 25.”
2. 1689 Inventory. “Un ritratto di Bernardino Cesare mano di Caravaggio cornice tocca d’oro C.P scudi 25.”

Bibliography:

Frommel 1972, p. 6 n. 8, p. 9 n. 3; Spezzaferro 1975, p. 116 n. 51; Moir 1976, p. 115 no. 85; Cinotti 1983, no. 155; Gregori 1998, p. 4; Marini 1989, pp. 364–65, no. 7; Basile in *Come dipingeva* . . . 1996, pp. 51–56; Danesi Squarzina in Macioce 1996, pp. 94–97; Danesi Squarzina 1997, p. 771; Gregory 1998, p. 4 (“una derivazione dell’originale del pittore lombardo”); Marini in Bergamo 2000, no. 16, pp. 192–93; Macioce 2003, inventaria 20, p. 349, inventaria 63, p. 368; Varriano 2006, pp. 90–91, fig. 75; L.81; Sickel in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 111.

This reference has been associated with the anonymous *Portrait of Cesari* in the Accademia di San Luca, Rome (oil on canvas, 24 $\frac{7}{8}$ x 18 $\frac{1}{8}$ in. [63 x 46 cm]).

L.77 Portrait of Monsignor Melchiorre Crescenzi

Rome, Crescenzi Collection

Sources:

Marino 1620, p. 237; Bellori 1672 [ed. 1976, p. 218]
(Sickel in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 111).

L.78 *Portrait of Signor Virgilio Crescenzi*

Teramo, Montonio al Vomano, Barone Crescenzo Crescenzi

Document:

Testament: February 14, 1641, inherited by his nephew, Francesco Crescenzi (Archivio di Stato di Teramo, Notarile, notaio Lorenzo Melchiorri di Montorio, busta 107 [84] vol. 17, f. 2v).

Bibliography:

Marino 1620, p. 244 (refers to his portrait by Caravaggio); Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 218); Samek Ludovici 1956, p. 122 (portrait of Marino by Caravaggio reported in an 1845 guidebook of Naples as in Gallery of Principe di Fondi); Carderi 1968, pp. 421–23; Cinotti 1971, pp. 69, 144, 173 n. 57; Marini 1974, p. 473; Moir 1976, pp. 115 nos. 95, 96, 155 n. 268 (cites Marino portrait in sale, Hon. G. J. Vernon, at Christie's London April 16, 1831, lot 23); Cinotti 1983, nos. 110 (as Portrait of Crescenzo Crescenzi) and 111 (as Portrait of Giovan Battista Marino); Marini 1989, pp. 564–65 P.12–13, 15; Bologna 1992, p. 316 (1600–1601); Waźbiński 1994, p. 201; Pupillo in Macioce 1995, pp. 151–52 (Virgilio Crescenzi died in December 1592; portrait would have been posthumous); Gregory 1998, p. 3, 12 n. 3; Langdon 1998, pp. 193–98 (publishes a Marino portrait tentatively attributed to Caravaggio).

L.79 *Portrait of Prospero Farinacci*

Rome, Giustiniani Collection

Inventories:

1. February 9, 1638, Part II, no. 89, Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani [“Un quadro con il ritratto del Farinaccio Criminalista dipinto in tela da testa [di mano, si crede, di Michelangelo di Caravaggio] con cornice di noce”].

2. Inventory 1791, Part I, no. 349 [“Un Ritratto di uomo vestito al’ antica, Collare bianco, ed un Libro nelle mani di Caravaggio”].

(Salerno 1960, p. 141; Macioce 2003, inventari 28, p. 353)

Prospero Farinacci (1544–1618) was the famous defender of Beatrice Cenci. He was Procuratore Generale Fiscale della Camera Apostolica under Pope Paul V and executor of the confiscation of the goods of Cavaliere d’Arpino.

L.80 *Portrait of Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani*

Rome, Giustiniani Collection

Inventories:

1. April 1600–c. 1611, no. 98: A painting of Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniano, seated, by the hand of Caravaggio [“Un quadro del Cardinal Giustiniano naturale a sedere di mano del Caravaggio”] (Danesi Squarzina Inventari I, p. 27; Macioce 2003, inventari 1, p. 341).

2. March 31, 1621, no. 122: Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani [“Un retratto del Signor Cardinale facto dal Caravaggio, senza cornice, in grande”] (ASR, Notai del Tribunale AC, uff. 8, vol. 1302, Rainaldo Buratti; Macioce 2003, inventari 15, p. 346).

3. February 9, 1638: parte II, no. 13, inventory of Vincenzo Giustiniani: “A painting of a half figure, with a portrait of good memory of the Lord Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani painted on Imperial canvas, by the hand of Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“Un quadro d’una mezza figura, e più col ritratto della bona memoria del Signor Cardinale Benedetto Iustiniani dipinto in tela d’Imperatore [di mano di Michelangelo da Caravaggio”] (Macioce 2003, inventari 28, p. 353).

4. 1649, cappella, no. 29: “A painting of Cardinal Giustiniano, seated dressed with a clerical hat” [“sta a sedere vestito con roccetto mozzetta senza cornice”].

Bibliography:

Salerno 1960, p. 136; Danesi Squarzina 1997, pp. 766–69; 781, 787; Varriano 1998, pp. 14–23 pl. 15; Vannugli in Calvesi and Volpi 2001, pp. 267–90; Danesi Squarzina 2003, inventari I, 1638, parte II, no. 13, pp. 400; Macioce 2003.

Varriano (1998, pp. 14–23 pl. 15) associates this work with a print by Michel Natalis, published c. 1635.

L.81 *Portrait of Gismondo Todescho* (*Sigismondo Laire*)

Rome, Vincenzo Giustiniani

Inventories:

1. February 9, 1638: Posthumous inventory of Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani, no. 6: “Another painting with a Portrait of Gismondo Todesco on canvas of a head by the hand of Michel.o da Caravaggio with a black gilt frame” with question mark at attribution [“Un altro quadro con un Ritratto di Gismondo Todesco Pittore dipinto in tela da testa di mano di Michel.o da Caravaggio con sua cornice negra profilata di oro”] (Danesi Squarzina 2003, inventari I, pp. 392–93).

2. Silos 1673, p. 89, Epigr. CLXI, refers to portrait of Gismondo del Caravaggio possessed by the Marchese Giustiniano.

Bibliography:

Delaroche 1812, no. 101; Landon 1812, p. 123, pl. 58; Paillet–Delaroche 1812, no. 93; *Catalogue* . . . 1826, no. 99; Longhi 1916, p. 267, 311 (Gentileschi before 1616); Salerno 1960, p. 27, p. 135 n. 6 (Giustiniani document refers possibly to a lost original); Longhi 1961, p. 235, 274 n.30, 278 (perhaps copy by Valentin); Cinotti 1971, pp. 72, 145, 165; Marini 1974, p. 480 (young Ribera); Moir 1976, p. 155 n. 265 (rejects); Spinosa 1978, no. 7 (Ribera, same moment as Cinque Sensi); Nicolson 1979, p. 33; Cinotti 1983, no. 74 (attributed, not Ribera according

to letters from Causa, Felton, and Salerno: “seventeenth-century Romanticism, typical of French circle Valentin-Regnier”; Schlier by letter does not believe it is Caravaggio), no. 141 (Giustiniani document refers possibly to a lost original); Spike 2001, cat. no. 81, Other Works Attributed (*Portrait of Sigismondo Laire*, Ribera); Macioce 2003, inventari 28, p. 353.

According to Danesi Squarzina (2003), this Giustiniani reference is not identifiable with the *Portrait of Sigismondo Laire*, now attributed to Jusepe de Ribera, in the Staatliche Museen Preussischer Kulturbesitz, Gemäldegalerie, Berlin, inv. 354 (see Other Works Attributed, cat. no. 82).

L.82 *Portrait of Onorio Longhi*

Rome, collection of Caterina Longhi Campani, wife of Onorio Longhi

July 22, 1652, posthumous inventory of Caterina Campani; subsequently mentioned in the will of her son, Martino Longhi, dated between July 31 1656 and January 5, 1657: “A portrait on canvas of Onorio Longo by Michelangelo Merisio da Caravaggio in a gold frame” [“Un ritratto in tela del Sig. Onorio Longo Pittura di Michelangelo Merisio da Caravaggio con un conricione tutto dorato”] (ASR, 30 Notai Capitolini, Carlo Novi, uff. 12; Testament vol. VII, pp; 55rv, 56r 57r).

Bibliography:

Bertolotti 1881, II, p. 26; Sickel 2001², pp. 125–30; Sickel in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 112 (suggests an identification with the portrait of “Honorio Lunghi di Michele di Caravaggio” cited in the collection of Paolo Maccarani in G. P. Bellori, *Nota dei musei di Roma*, 1664, p. 30).

L.83 *Portrait of Caterina Campani Longhi*

Rome, Collection of Caterina Longhi Campani, wife of Onorio Longhi

July 22, 1652, posthumous inventory of Caterina Campani; subsequently mentioned in the will of her son, Martino Longhi, dated between July 31, 1656 and January 5, 1657: “Another portrait of Caterina Campani the testatrix (with another head of a companion) in a pear wood frame” [“un altro ritratto della signora Catherina Campani testatrice in un’altra testa compagna con cornice simile di pero pittura di Michelangelo Merisio da Caravaggio”] (ASR, 30 Notai Capitolini, Carlo Novi, uff. 12; Testament vol. VII, pp; 55rv, 56r 57r).

Bibliography:

Bertolotti 1881, II, p. 26; Macioce 2003, inventari 44, p. 359; Sickel in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 112.

L.84 *Portrait of Giovan Battista Marino*

Teramo, Montonio al Vomano, Barone Crescenzi Crescenzi

Testament: February 14, 1641 inherited by his nephew, Francesco Crescenzi (Archivio di Stato di Teramo, Notarile, notaio Lorenzo Melchiorri di Montorio, busta 107 [84] vol. 17, f. 2v).

Bibliography:

Marino 1620, p. 244 (refers to his portrait by Caravaggio); Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 218); Samek Ludovici 1956, p. 122 (portrait of Marino by Caravaggio reported in an 1845 guidebook of Naples as in Gallery of Principe di Fondi); Carderi 1968, pp. 421–23; Cinotti 1971, pp. 69, 144, 173 n. 57; Marini 1974, p. 473; Moir 1976, pp. 115 nos. 95, 96, 155 n. 268 (cites Marino portrait in sale, Hon. G. J. Vernon, at Christie’s London April 16, 1831, lot 23); Cinotti 1983, nos. 110 (as Portrait of Crescenzi Crescenzi) and 111 (as Portrait of Giovan Battista Marino); Marini 1989, pp. 564–65, P.12–13, 15; Bologna 1992, p. 316 (1600–1601); Wązbiński 1994, p. 201; Pupillo in Macioce 1995, pp. 151–52 (Virgilio Crescenzi died in December 1592; portrait would have been posthumous); Gregory 1998, p. 3, 12 n. 3; Langdon 1998, pp. 193–98 (publishes a Marino portrait tentatively attributed to Caravaggio); Marini 2002², pp. 233–42; Vannugli 2002, pp. 271; Sickel in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 111.

L.85 *Portrait of Cardinal Serafino Olivier Razali*

Rome, Cardinal Serafino Olivier Razali

Source:

Milesi 1606 c. 76v (ed. 1980, p. 88 [9]).

Bibliography:

Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 85; Fulco 1980, p. 88 n. 9; Marini 1989, p. 566 P.18.

L.86 *Portrait of Andrea Ruffetti*

Rome, Paolo Maccarani

Source:

Inventory taken in August 1667 of Paolo Maccarani: “Another portrait of a Procuratore called Andrea Roffetti, gilded frame, hand of Caravacio (sic)” [“Un altro ritratto d’un pro[curato]re chiamato Andrea Roffetti [sic], cornice dorata, mano del Caravacio”].

Bibliography:

Sickel in *Caravaggio e il suo ambiente* 2007, p. 112, n. 11.

L.87 *Portrait of a Woman with a White Veil and Her Name Marsilia Sicca Written on the Canvas*

Rome, Giustiniani Collection

Inventory:

February 9, 1638, posthumous inventory of Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani no. 74: “A portrait of a woman with a white veil and her name Marsilia Sicca written, on canvas, 2 x 2 palmi believed to be in the early style of Caravaggio, without a frame” [“Un quadro con un Ritratto di una Matrona con un velo bianco in testa e suo nome scritto, Marsilia Sicca, dipinto in tela alt. pal. 2 – lar. 2– della prima maniera di Michelang.o da Caravaggio si crede, senza cornice”].

Bibliography:

Salerno 1960, p. 138; Macioce 2003, inventari 28, p. 353.

L.88 *Portrait of Alof de Wignacourt*

Valletta, Malta

Sources:

Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 226): Portrait of Alof de Wignacourt Wearing Grand Master's Habit.

Susinno 1724 (ed. 1960, p. 109).

The Bellori reference has been associated with a portrait (oil on canvas, 53⁵/₈ x 44¹/₂ in. [136 x 113 cm]) in the Wignacourt College Museum, Rabat, Malta, signed *G.N.D.C.* and dated 1617.

Bibliography:

Bonello–Cauchi 1967 (cited by Cauchi 1978, no. 3; copy of the portrait cited by Bellori); Guttuso–Ottino della Chiesa 1967, no. 84; Salerno 1970, p. 237 (copy of lost original); Cinotti 1971, pp. 137, 200 n. 526 (copy); Marini 1971, p. 56; Marini 1974, pp. 43, 236, 435 n. 73 (copy); Gregori 1974, pp. 594–602 (dated 1617, copy); Gregori 1975, p. 34; Moir 1976, p. 156 n. 271 (not a copy after lost Caravaggio); Cauchi in Valletta 1978, no. 3 (copy); Nicolson 1979, p. 23; Azzopardi 1983, p. 56 no. 3; Cinotti 1983, p. 562, no. 82 (perhaps the picture cited by Bellori)

and Susinno without having seen it; by a different painter); Gregori 1985, p. 328 (copy); Marini 1989, pp. 524–25 (copy); Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 79 (lost).

L.89 *Portrait of Alof de Wignacourt*

Florence, Commenda Fiorentina di San Jacopo in Campo Corbolini

Inventories:

1. February and April 1623. The account books of the Commenda Fiorentina di San Jacopo in Campo Corbolini (the Knights of Jerusalem and Malta in Florence), who was directed by Fra Francesco del Antella to document the purchase of a Portrait of Wignacourt from the hand of Caravaggio, which they placed in the church of San Jacopo in Campo Corbolini, together with a Portrait of Antella, and both hung in the church until 1766 [“Per il ritratto del Gran Maestro di Vignacourt in aovato col suo adornamento d’oro affisso nel muro in testa della loggia che entra nell’orto, di mano del Caravaggio, a perpetua [. . .] Memoria della Gratitude che conserva a detto Gran Maestro il sudetto Signor Commendatore [cav. Antella], per haverli donato di gratia la suddetta commenda di Santo Jacopo in Campo Corbelini; et al riscontro di detto ritratto del Gran Maestro il detto Commendatore vi ha affisso il suo proprio”].

2. 1766: Inventory of the Church of San Jacopo in Campo Corbelini cites a small oval painting of Wignacourt’s head.

Bibliography:

Sebregondi 1982, p. 108; Sebregondi 2005, p. L; Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 79.

Stone (in Sciberras and Stone 2006, p. 79) publishes a portrait of Antella by Justus Sustermans (fig. 27; 58 x 43 cm), first identified by Ludovica Sebregondi. Also in oval format, Sustermans very likely was asked to paint this portrait to conform to Caravaggio’s portrait of Wignacourt.

L.90 *Portrait of an Innkeeper*

Rome, Private collection

Source:

Mancini 1619–21, [ed. 1956, I, p. 224]: Portrait of an Innkeeper [“Ritratto d’un hoste dove si ricoverava”].

L.91 *Portrait of a Peasant*

Rome, Private collection

Source:

Mancini 1619–21, [ed. 1956, I, p. 224]: Portrait of a Peasant [“Ritratto d’un vilico”].

L.92 *Portrait of a Philosopher*

Rome, Mons. Guido Del Pelagio

May 30, 1732: Posthumous inventory of Mons. Guido Del Pelagio, who acquired the painting by descent, A Philosopher by Caravaggio 120 sc 10 [“14. Et il filosofo mano del Caravaggi 120 sc 10”] (Costa Restagno 2004, no. 26, p. 107).

L.93 *Portrait of a Woman with a Carafe of Flowers on a Table*

Rome, Borghese Collection

1607: Inventory of paintings confiscated from Cavaliere d’Arpino and given to Cardinal Scipione Borghese, no. 99: “A woman with a carafe of flowers on a table” [“Una donna con caraffa di fiori in un tavolino”], repeated in 1693 inventory (Della Pergola 1964², p. 253).

L.94 *Head of an Old Man*

Rome, Collection of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps

Document:

A painting by Caravaggio identified in the Libro Mastro of the Altemps, 1611–13: “On March 13, 1613 Giovan Angelo Altemps paid 21 scudi to Prospero Orsi for six pictures of an old man’s head, that is, three in a painting, and one by Caravaggio on paper” [“scudi ventiuono di moneta a Prospero Orsi pittore e sono per 6 teste di vecchio, cioè 3 in uno quadro et una del Caravaggio in carta”] (Spezzaferro in Calvesi and Volpi 2002, p. 29).

L.95 *Head with a frame of old wood carved with two columns 3 palmi tall*

Rome, Cardinal Ludovico Ludovisi

Inventories:

1. November 2, 1623: Inventory of the collection: no. 188 without indication of author [“Una testa con Cornice dorata e intag.ta con dui colonne e frontespitio di sopra e cartella a basso alto p.i 4 in circa m.o”].
2. January 28, 1633: Posthumous inventory [“106 Una Testa con un adornamento vecchio di legno intagliata con due colonne alto p.mi tre di mano di Caravaggio”] (Garas 1967, pp. 344 nos. 42, 106; 345 n. 116; Spike 2001, cat. lost works L.98; Macioce 2003, inventaria 18, p. 348, inventaria 26, p. 352).

L.96 *Portrait of a Famous Courtesan, Half-Length, Unfinished*

Rome, Giustiniani Collection

Inventory:

February 9, 1638, posthumous inventory of Marchese Vincenzo Giustiniani, no. 11: “A painting of a portrait, half figure, of a famous courtesan painted on canvas, still imperfect, 4 wide by 3, by Michelangelo da Caravaggio” [“Un quadro con un ritratto di una mezza figura Ritratto di una Cortigiana famosa depinto in tela ancora imperfetto alto pal. 4 – larg. 3, in circa di mano di Michelangelo da Caravaggio con sua cornice negra.”] (Salerno 1960, p. 136; Macioce 2003, inventari 28, p. 353).

L.97 *Head of a Woman*

Mantua, Gonzaga Collection

Inventory 1639, compiled for Charles I of England (Vertue 1757; Luzio 1913, p. 169 n. 13): “Head of a Woman.”

L.98 *Unidentified Portrait*

Madrid, Juan Alonzo Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and ninth Almirante de Castilla

1647 posthumous inventory, appraised August 17, 1647 by Antonio Arias, painter: Fol. 346, no. 574, “A portrait by carabacho” [“Ytten Vio Un retrato con un cuello de mano del carabacho Tasolo den Rs 200”] (Burke–Cherry 1997, I, p. 422, no. 332).

L.99 *Portrait of a Speaker in a Toga*

Rome, Collection of Caterina Longhi Campani, wife of Onorio Longhi

Inventories:

July 22, 1652, posthumous inventory of Caterina Campani; subsequently mentioned in the will of her son, Martino Longhi, dated between July 31 1656 and January 5, 1657: “A large

painting of a head . . . a speaker in a toga painted by Caravaggio with a frame” [“. . . di simil pittura in tela grande di testa . . . un parlatore togato pittura del Caravaggio con cornice intorno intagliate simili e compagne non indurate”] (ASR, 30 Notai Capitolini, Carlo Novi, uff. 12; Testament vol. VII, pp; 55rv, 56r 57r).

(Bertolotti 1881, II, p. 26; Macioce 2003, inventari 44, p. 359)

L.100 Portrait of a Man Holding a Sword and a Book

Madrid, Don Diego Felipe de Guzman, Marchese di Leganès

Inventory 1655: “A Man holding a sword and a book” (Lopez Navio 1962, p. 271).

L.101 Portrait of a Youth with an Orange Blossom

Naples, Don Juan de Tassis y Peralta, 2nd Count of Villamediana (Naples, 1611–17)

Source:

Bellori 1672 [1976, pp. 232–33]: Portrait of a Youth with an orange blossom.

L.102 Portrait of a Woman

Paris, Louis Phélypeaux de La Vrillière

Inventory 1681: “Portrait of a Woman” (Getty Provenance Index).

L.103 Portrait of a Woman with a Ruffled Collar and a Book in her Hand

Rome, Maffeo Barberini

Inventories:

1. August 9, 1671: Posthumous inventory of Cardinal Antonio Barberini [“Un ritratto d Una Donna Con il Ciuffo di Grandezza di p.mo 3 inc. a Mano del Caravaggio Con Cornice indorata n.01-50-”].

2. 1672: Inventory of the division of the goods left to Cardinal Maffeo Barberini, repeats entry.

3. 1686: Inventory of the estate of Prince Maffeo Barberini: “191) A. Portrait of a woman with a ruffled collar and a book in her hand, about 3 palmi high and 2½ wide, with a black frame decorated with gold, hand of Caravaggio” [“191) A. Un Retratto d’una Donna con il Collaro à Lattuca, et in mano tiene un libro alto p.i 3, largo p.i 2 ½ in circa, con cornice nera fiorata d’oro, mano del Caravaggi”] (Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 402; Macioce 2003, doc 62 p. 368).

4. 1730 Inventory of Francesco Barberini, Prince of Palestrina, Rome (Getty Provenance Index).

(Aronberg Lavin 1975, p. 402; Macioce 2003, doc 62, p. 368, inventari 51, p. 363; inventari 52, p. 364)

L.104 *Portrait of a Man*

Naples, Don Gaspar de Haro, Marchese del Carpio y de Heliche, Count Duke of Olivares and Viceroy of Naples

January 1686: record of a portrait of a man sent from Naples to Spain (Ainaud 1947, p. 393 n. 30, 31).

L.105 *Portrait of a Prelate with a Paper in His Hand*

Rome, Borghese collection

Inventory 1693: “Portrait of a Prelate with a paper in his hand” [“Ritratto di un Prelato a sedere con una Carta in mano”] (Palazzo Borghese in Campo Marzio, Stanza IV n. 17).

(Della Pergola 1964, n. 28, p. 460 n. 367; Getty Provenance Index)

L.106 *Head of a Person*

Rome, Giustiniani Collection

Landon, 1812, on the occasion of the sale of Giustiniani collection, Paris, as “Head of a person by M.A. Caravagge.”

IV. Still Lifes

L.107 *Basket of Fruit (Canestra con frutti)*

Bologna, Cesare Alberto Malvasia

Inventory: July 1697 (Getty Provenance Index)

L.108 *Carafe of Flowers*

Rome, Cardinal Francesco Maria del Monte

Inventories:

1. April 14, 1627: “Un Quadretto nel quale vi è una Caraffa di mano del Caravaggio di Palmi dua” (ASR, 30 Notaio Capitolini, Paulus Vespignanus, Uff. 28, vol. 138, fol. 575v, Frommel 1972, p. 31; Macioce 2003, doc. 23, p. 350).

2. May 8, 1628: “Una Caraffa di fiori del Caravag^o, sold in a lot of five paintings, 142 scudi” (Nota del denaro retratto dalla vendita de Mobili del Giardino di Ripetta dopo otto scuti il Breve posto del Banco di S. Spirito, Kirwin 1972, pp. 53 n. 1, p. 55).

Sources:

Baglione 1642, p. 136; Bellori 1672 (ed. 1976, p. 213).

Bibliography:

Friedlander 1954, pp. 142–43; Della Pergola 1964², pp. 253–54 (cf. *Catalogo Galleria Borghese* 1959, II, nn. 220–21; associates the Bellori reference to two small paintings on copper by Jan Breughel the Elder that have been in the Borghese collection apparently since their sequestration from Cavaliere d'Arpino in 1607); Gregori 1985, p. 208 (queries whether Bellori refers to the same picture as in the Del Monte inventories); Wolfe 1985, pp. 450–52 (Baglione may refer to a version of the *Lute Player* that includes a carafe of flowers); Marini 1989, p. 563, P.5; Frommel in Macioce 1995, pp. 20, 29; Bologna 1992, pp. 281–95, 298; Gilbert 1995, pp. 112–13, 127; Spike 2001, cat. no. L.82 (lost).

L.109 *A Still Life with Fruit and a Carafe*

Rome, collection of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps

Inventories:

1. A painting by Caravaggio identified in the Libro Mastro of the Altemps, 1611–13: “On March 2, 1613 Giovan Angelo Altemps paid 40 scudi to Prospero Orsi for two still lifes of fruit, one by Caravaggio, the other by Bartolomeo” [“scudi quaranta di moneta a Prospero Orsi pittore e sono per due quadri de frutti, uno del Caravaggio, e l'altro di Bart.[olome]o”].

2. October 15, 1620: Inventory n. 122 of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps Castello di Gallese, at c.37r: “A table on which sits many fruits and a caraffe of wine with a black gilt frame, 4.1 palmi” [“una tavola con molti frutti sopra una caraffa di vino con cornice nera rabescata d'oro di palmi 4,10”]. The undated manuscript in the Newberry Library, Chicago, of this inventory states: “A painting of fruits by Caravaggio where there is a caraffe with a gilt frame” [“Un quadretto di frutti del Caravaggio dov'è la carafa con cornice rabascata d'oro”].

(Spezzaferro in Calvesi and Volpi 2002, p. 29; Macioce 2003, pp. 345–46)

L.1110 *Still Life with Fruit and Flowers*

Rome, collection of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps

Inventories:

1. A painting by Caravaggio identified in the Libro Mastro of the Altemps, 1611–13: “On March 2, 1613 Giovan Angelo Altemps paid 40 scudi to Prospero Orsi for two still lifes of fruit, one by Caravaggio, the other by Bartolomeo” [“scudi quaranta di moneta a Prospero Orsi pittore e sono per due quadri de frutti, uno del Caravaggio, e l’altro di Bart.[olome]o”].

2. October 15, 1620: Inventory n. 122 of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps Castello di Gallese, at c.38v: “A painting of 3 ½ palmi of flowers and fruits in a blue frame with gilt 30” [“Un quadretto di palmi 3 ½ di fiori et frutti con cornice turchino rabescato d’oro 30”]. The manuscript in the Newberry Library of this inventory states: “A painting with flowers and fruits painted with its blue frame edged in gold by Caravaggio” [“Un quadro con fiori e frutti dipinti con sua cornice turchina profilata d’oro del Caravaggio”] (Macioce 2003, pp. 345–46).

(Spezzaferro in Calvesi and Volpi 2002, p. 29; Macioce 2003, pp. 345–46)

L.1111 *Still Life of Flowers and Fruit*

Rome, Alessandro Vittrici (who died in Rome in 1650 at the age of fifty-four)

Inventory: 1650 Inventory of the possessions of Alessandro Vittrici: “a painting of flowers and fruits, in a white frame, by Caravaggio” [“un quadro mezzano di fiori e frutti corniciata bianca lavorata a mano del Caravaggio”].

(Spezzaferro 1995, p. 53; Sikel 2001, pp. 426–29).

L.1112 *Still Life with Fruits and Flowers*

Naples, Pompeo d’Anna

Inventory: December 4, 1676: “a painting of fruits and flowers by Caravaggio with a gilt frame” [“f.3, n.48 un quadro di frutti e fiori de Caravaggio con cornice indorata”].

(Labrot 1992, p. 131; Getty Provenance Index, Collections of Paintings in Naples 1600–1780, Doc. I–8 Anna, Item 0048).

L.113 *Six Roses with a White Flower*

Naples, Don Gaspar de Haro, Marchese del Carpio y de Heliche, Count Duke of Olivares and Viceroy of Naples

January 1686: record of painting of “six roses with a white flower” sent from Naples to Spain

(Ainaud 1947, p. 393 n. 30, 31)

L.114 *Six Roses with a White Flower*

Madrid, collection of Juan Gaspar Enríquez de Cabrera, Duke of Medina de Ríoseco and ninth Almirante de Castilla

Inventory: 1691 “Small painting with a White Flower and six Roses” (Getty Provenance Index).

L.115 *Slave Cutting Melons (Schiavo che taglia poponi)*

Florence, Cardinal Giovanni Carlo de' Medici

Inventories: 1662; 1663 (Getty Provenance Index).

L.116 *Unidentified Still Life*

Naples, Prince Giacomo Carlo Capece Zurlo

Inventory: 1689 (Ruotolo 1973, p. 149).

L.117 *Unidentified Still Life*

Rome, Cassiano dal Pozzo

Inventory: 1689 (Marini 1984, p. 17 n. 24).

V. Mythological and Genre

L.118 *Bacchanale*

Rome, Stanislao Poniatowski

Document:

1. February 9, 1839: sales catalogue, lot 126, "Caravaggio, A bacchanalian concert; a grand composition," owned by Stanislao Poniatowski, Rome, also sold to a Mr. Norton

(Moir 1976, p. 123 n. 183; Marini 1989, p. 377)

L.119 *Bacchus*

Huesca, Vincencio Juan de Lastanosa

Uztarroz 1653 (Sánchez Cantón 1923–41, V, p. 289).

L.120 *Two Peasants*

Cardinal Neri Maria Corsini

No. 145 Due Bambocciate di Michelangelo

(Macioce 2003, inventaria 84, p. 377)

L.121 *Boy Bitten by a Crab*

Rome, Borghese Collection

Sources:

Manilli 1650, p. 71; de' Sebastiani 1685, p. 24.

See Cinotti 1983, no. 131 for a tentative identification with the *Boy Bitten by a Lizard*, now in the National Gallery, London.

L.122 *Buona Ventura*

Perugia, Conte Riberio Ranieri

Inventory: 1771 (Archivio Storico Capitolino, Roma, Sez. V, prot. 8, ff. 177–78; Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 42).

L.123 *Cardplayers*

Huesca, Vincencio Juan de Lastanosa

Uztarroz 1653 [ed. 1923–41, V, p. 290]. Apparently the same picture described as Gamblers [*Jugadores*] in a Lastanosa inventory of 1662 (Sánchez Cantón 1923–41, V, p. 296).

L.124 *Cardplayers*

Perugia, Marc'Antonio Oddi, Canon of the Perugia Cathedral

Inventory: 1720 (Archivio Storico Capitolino, Roma, Sez. V, prot. 9, ff. 306; Alloisi in *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni* 1989, p. 42).

L.125 *Cardplayers*

Cardinal Neri Maria Corsini

No. 15 Regalo di Cardinal Sacripanti. Alcuni Giuocatore di Michelangelo da Caravaggio [di Gio. Miel.]

(Macioce 2003, inventaria 84, p. 377)

L.126 *Cephale and Proclise*

Paris, Louis Phélypeaux de La Vrillière

Inventory: 1681 (Getty Provenance Index).

L.127 *Charity Among Three Infants*

Paris, Louis Phélypeaux de La Vrillière

Inventory: 1681 (Getty Provenance Index).

L.128 *Cupid in Contemplation of a Skull*

Paris, Louis Phélypeaux de La Vrillière

Inventory: 1681 (Getty Provenance Index).

L.129 *Cupid Bound or Three Cupids*

Rome, Cardinal Francesco Maria del Monte

Sources:

1. 1603: Gaspare Murtola dedicated Madrigal 473 to three cupids painted by Caravaggio.
2. February 22, 1613, letter by Giulio Mancini to his brother in Siena (Maccherini 1997, doc. 23).
3. Baglione 1642, p. 136.

Bibliography:

Voss 1922, pp. 60–64; Voss 1923, p. 96; Friedlaender 1955, p. 222; Salerno 1960, p. 110; Enggass 1967, (Murtola writes: “Love is neither blind nor nude as you paint him”); Moir 1969, p. 372 n. 45; Cinotti 1971, pp. 96–97; Spear 1971, pp. 46–49, fig. 46; Röttgen 1974, p. 117 n. 43; Marini 1974, p. 472; Moir 1976, p. 109 no. 58, 128 n. 208, 143 n. 240; Cinotti 1983, nos. 152, 159 (not in the inventory of Del

Monte published by Frommel 1972; poem 1603 recalls *Sleeping Cupid* in Palazzo Pitti, dated Malta 1608); Marini 1987, no. 14, p. 133; Marini 1989, p. 564 P.7; Bologna 1992, p. 304 (1594?, not painting published by Marini 1987).

Variations:

Listed by Moir 1976, p. 143 n. 240:

1. By Baglione, Staatliche Museen, Berlin-Dahlem, ill Moir 1967, II, fig. 30.
2. Arch. Busiri Vici, *Divine Love Conquering Profane Love* (dubiously attr. to Riminaldi) Moir 1967, II, fig. 286.
3. By Manfredi, *Mars Punishing Amor*; Chicago, Art Institute, perhaps reversing Caravaggio's lost painting Moir 1967, II, fig. 47.

L.130 *Danae*

Paris, Philippe de Béthune

Inventory:

November 19, 1608 (Babelon 1988, pp. 33–38).

L.131 *Diana Plays a Harpsichord*

Rome, Alessandro Vittrici (who died in Rome in 1650 at the age of fifty-four)

Inventory:

1650 Inventory of the possessions of Alessandro Vittrici: “a large painting of a woman dressed as Diana, who plays the harpsichord with a carved frame by Caravaggio” [“Un quadro grande di una donna vestita di Diana, che sona il Cimbalo cornice arabescata mano del Caravaggio”] (Spezzaferro 1995, p. 53; Sikel 2001, pp. 426–29).

The incongruous subject appears to be a mistake for a representation of Saint Cecilia.

L.132 *Hercules*

Madrid, Don Luis de Cerdeño y Monzión

1699 Taxation evaluation (Angullo y Cobo 1981, p. 58).

L.133 *Roman Lucretia*

Rome, Girolamo Vittrici

Inventory:

May 1609: Inventory of Girolamo Vittrici lists “a painting of a gypsy – another of a Roman Lucretia” [“un quadro della zingara – un’altro di Lucretia romana”].

(Corradini 1993, doc. 120 as 1607; republished with additions and a date of May 1609 by Sickel 2001, p. 429.)

L.134 *Luteplayer*

Rome, collection of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps

Inventories:

1. October 15, 1620: Inventory at c.37v of Duke Giovan Angelo Altemps Castello di Gallese: “A youth who plays the lute with a carafe of flowers, 6 palmi long in a black and gilt frame” [“Un giovane che sona il liuto con una carraffa di fiori di palmi 6 lungo cornice nera rabescata d’oro 60”].

2. Manuscript c. 1620 in the Newberry Library, Chicago, of items in the Castello Di Galese states: “A painting with a putto who plays the lute by Caravaggio with a gilt frame” [“Un quadro con un putto che suona il liuto del Caravaggio con sua cornice dorata”].

(Spezzaferro in Calvesi and Volpi 2002, p.28; Macioce 2003, p. 345)

L.135 *Love and Harmony, a group of four figures*

London

Document:

1. June 3, 1815: Christie's sale catalogue lot 57, attributed to Caravaggio: "Love and Harmony, a beautiful group of four figures painted with great sweetness and delicacy," unsold

(Moir 1976, p. 123 n. 183; Marini 1989, p. 377.)

L.136 *Musicians*

Amsterdam, Philips de Flines

April 20, 1700, Sale catalogue, lot no. 59, fl. 32.10: "a piece of musicians after Michel Angelo Caravaggio"

(Hoet 1752, vol. I, p. 57, no. 58; Manuth in Amsterdam 2006, p. 193, no. J)

L.137 *Three Figures with Cupid Pressing Grapes in the Background*

London, Collection of Henry Fulton

Document:

1. June 20, 1834; Christie's sale catalogue, lot 94, of Henry Fulton's property, "A concert of three figures with Cupid pressing grapes in the background; a capital picture in Guido's manner," sold to a Mr. Norton for £24.3.0; (Moir 1976, p. 123 n. 183; Marini 1989, p. 377).

L.138 *School of Music*

Naples, Scipione Lancellotti

Document:

July 1, 1789: Export document from Naples issued to Scipione Lancellotti for a painting by Michelangelo del Caravaggio, 6 and 7 long, showing a school of music (Bertolotti 1877, II, p. 35; Marini 1974, p. 344).

Bibliography

1527

Castiglione, B. *The Book of the Courtier*. Trans. G. Bull. London 1986.

1538

Primus liber cum quinque vocibus, Mottetti del frutto. Venice, Gardana, 1538.

1568

Vasari, G. *Le vite de' più eccellenti pittori, scultori e architetti*. Ed. Milanesi. 6 vols. Florence. 1878.

1569

Barbaro, D. *La pratica della prospettiva*. Venice.

1580

Cartari, V. *Imagini delli Dei degl'antichi*. Venice.

1582

Paleotti, G. *Discorso intorno alle imagini sacre e profane*. Bologna. Ed. P. Prodi. 1990.

1584

Borghini, R. *Il riposo*. Florence. Reprint. Milan 1967.

Lomazzo, G. P. *Trattato dell'arte della pittura, scoltura e architettura*. Reprint. Milan 1973–75.

1585

Alberti, R. *On Painting*. Trans. J. R. Spencer. New York and London 1966.

1586

Armenini, G. B. *De' veri precetti della pittura*. Ed. M. Gorreri. Turin 1988.

Garzoni, T. *Le vite delle donne illustri della Scrittura Sacra. Nuovamente descritte del R.P. D.*

Tomaso Garzoni da Bagnacavallo, canonico regolare Lateran predicatore. Con l'aggiunta delle vite delle donne oscure, e laide dell'uno, e dell'altro testamento; et un discorso in fine sopra la nobiltà delle donne. Venice.

1589

Della Porta, G. B. *Magia Naturalis*. Naples.

1591

Comanini, G. *Il figino, ovvero del fine della pittura*. Mantua. In Barocchi 1978, vol. 3, pp. 237–379.

1593

Patrizi, F. *Nova de Universis Philosophia*, Ferrara 1591[2nd ed. Venice 1593].

Ripa, C. *Iconologia*. Ed. P. Buscaroli. Turin 1987.

1595

Possevino, A. *Tractatio de pöesi et pictura ethica, humana et fabulosa*. In Barocchi 1978, vol. 3, pp. 455–59.

1603

van Mander, C. *Het Leven der Moderne oft dees-tijtsche doorluchtige Italiaensche Schilders, Harlem*. Reprinted in R. Longhi, “Alcuni pezzi rari nell’antologia della critica caravaggesca,” *Paragone* 2, no. 17 (1951), pp. 44–45.

1604

Silvestri, H. *Constanza: trionfo del martirio di San Sebastiano*. Rome.

1605–20

Grimaldi, I. *Instrumenta autentica translationum sanctorum corporum et sacrarum reliquiarum e veteri in novum templum S. Petri*. Ed. R. Niggel. Vatican City 1972.

1607

Archivio Galleria Borghese, Bibl. Borghesiana I, 27, cart. 329. *Nota de'quadri portati a palazzo dalla casa del Cav. Giuseppe d'Arpino presi dal fiscale di Paolo V*. *Legenda vita martirio, et morte de Santo Sebastiano*. Venice.

1608

Lottini, G. S. *Bastiano sacra rappresentazione*. Florence.

1611

Rossiglio, M. *Della conversione di Santa Maria Maddalena. Del Sig. Marco Rossiglio da Foligno. Di nuovo ristampata, corretta, e di bellissime figure adornata*. Treviso.

1612

Mirabella, V. *Dichiarazioni della pianta dell'antiche Siracuse*. Naples.

1613

Albertini, F. *Trattato dell'angelo custode*. Rome.

Francucci, S. *Galleria dell'Ill.mo e Rev.mo Signor Scipione Cardinale Borghese cantata in versi da S.F.* 1st ed. Arezzo 1647.

Maurolico, S. *Historia sagra intitolata Mare Oceano di tutte le religioni*. Messina.

1616

Gaetti, B. *Rime spirituali in lode della Gloriossima Vergine da Loreto nuovamente posta in luce da Bartolomeo Gaetti*. Ferrara and Treviso.

1618

Borromeo, F. Card. *Musaeum*. In *De pictura sacra* (1618, published 1625; ed. 1754).

1619

Sarpi, P., Fra. *The History of the Council of Trent*. London.

1619–21

Mancini, G. *Considerazioni sulla pittura*. Ed. A. Marucchi. 2 vols. Rome 1956.

1620

Marino, G. B. *Lettera al Padre A. Berti*. Ed. M. Giuglielminetti. Turin 1966.

1620–24

Celio, G. *Memorie delli nomi dell'artefici delle pitture che sono in alcune chiese, facciate, e palazzi di Roma*. Facsimile ed. Naples 1638. Ed. E. Zocca. Milan 1967.

1621

La confessione di Santa Maria Maddalena. Treviso.

1625

Baiacca, G. B. *Vita del Cavaliere Marino*. Venice.

1631

Fuligatti, I. *Vita Roberti Bellarmini Politiani, S.J.* Antwerp.

1632

Chiaro, F. *Vita del Cavaliere Marino*. Naples.

1633

Carducho, V. *Diálogos de la pintura*. Madrid.

1634

de Pietri, F. *Historia napoletana*. Naples.

1638

Pacheco, F. *El arte de la pintura, su antigüedad y grandezas*. Seville. In Sánchez Cantón 1923–41, vol. 1, pp. 144, 456; vol. 2, pp. 13, 140, 159, 169, 188.

1642

Baglione, G. *Le vite de' pittori, scultori et architetti dal pontificato di Gregorio XIII del 1572 in fino a' tempo di Papa Urbano Ottavo nel 1642*. Rome.

De Lellis, C. *Parte seconda ovvero supplemento a Napoli sacra di D. Cesare d'Engenio*. Naples. Reprint 1654.

1643

Baudouin. *Histoire des Chevaliers de Saint-Jean de Jérusalem*. Paris.

1644

Evelyn, J. *Diary of John Evelyn*. Ed. J. Dobson. London 1906.

Samperi, P. *Iconologia della gloriosa Vergine Maria*. Messina.

1647

Francucci, S. *Galleria dell' Ill.mo e Rev.mo Signor Scipione Cardinale Borghese cantata in versi da S. F. Arezzo*.

1650

Manilli, J. *Villa Borghese fuori di Porta Pinciana descritta da Giacomo Manilli Romano, guardaroba di detta villa*. Rome.

Martinez, J. *Discursos practicables del nobilissimo arte de la pintura*. In Sánchez Cantón 1923–41, vol. 3, p. 40.

1652

Ottonelli, G. D., and P. Berrettini. *Trattato della pittura e scultura. Uso et abuso loro*. Florence. Ed. V. Casale. Treviso 1973.

1653

Uztarroz, J. A. *Cronaca aragonese*. In Sánchez Cantón 1923–41, vol. 5, pp. 289–90.

1654

De Lellis, C. *Parte seconda o' vero supplimento a Napoli sacra di D. Cesare d' Engenio (1642)*. Naples.

Samperi, P. *Messina*. Messina. Reprint 1742.

1657

Scannelli, F. *Il microcosmo della pittura*. Cesena.

1664

Bellori, G. P. *Nota delli musei librerias galleries . . . etc. di Rome*. Rome.

1665

Chantelou de Fréart, P. *Journal du voyage du Cavalier Bernini en France*. Paris. In *Paragone* 2, 17(1951), p. 54.

1666

De Lellis, C. *Aggiunta alla Napoli sacra di D. Cesare d'Engenio*. Biblioteca Nazionale di Napoli, MSS., 5 vols. Naples [I, 1977].

1672

Bellori, G. P. *Le vite de' pittori, scultori e architetti moderni*. Rome. Ed. G. Einaudi. Turin 1976.
Bosca, P. P. *De' origine et statue Bibliothecae Ambrosianae*. Milan.

1673

Silos, G. M. *Pinacotheca sive romana pictura et sculptura*. Rome. Ed. M. Basile Bonsante. Treviso 1979.

1674

Scaramuccia, L. *Le finezze dei pennelli italiani ammirate e studiate da Girupeno sotto la guida del genio di Raffaello da Urbino*. Ed. G. Giubbini. Pavia 1965.

1675

von Sandrart, J. *L'Academia todesca della architettura, scultura, e pittura, oder Teutsche Academie der Edlen Bau-, Bild- und Mahlerei-Künste*. Nurenberg.

1678

De Magistris, F. *Status rerum memorabilium tam ecclesisticarum quam politicarum*. Naples.

Malvasia, C. C. *Felsina pittrice, vite de' pittori bolognes*. Bologna. Reprint 1841. Facsimile ed. Bologna 1967.

Passeri, G. B. *Vite dei pittori, scultori ed architetti che anno lavorato in Roma morti da 1641 al 1673*. Bologna. Ed. J. Hess. Vienna 1934.

1680–1700

de Molina, M., Mons. *Breve relazione dello stato spirituale di tutta la diocesi di Malta con le chiese che sin'al presente anno 1680: si trovano erette sotto la giurisdizione dell'ordinario, e della*

qualità di ciascheduno d'esse, . . . con occasione della prima visita di Monsignor Ill.mo Signor Deo. mo Vescovo Michaelae de Molina. Ms. ca. 1700. Private collection, Malta (formerly collection Chev. Joseph Galea, Malta. Copies of this ms. are found in the ACM, Misc. 180 [Stato di tutte le chiese della diocesi di Malta nell'anno 1680], and the NLM, Libr. 422).

1681

Baldinucci, F. *Notizie de' professori del disegno da Cimabue in qua.* Vol. 5. Florence 1847.

1683

de' Sebastiani, P. *Viaggio curioso de' palazzi e ville più notibili di Roma.* Rome.

1688

Félibien des Avaux, A. *Entretiens sur les vies et les ouvrages des plus excellents peintres, anciens, et modernes.* Vol. 2. Paris. In *Paragone* 2, no. 17 (1951), pp. 62–63.

1689

di Capua, L. *Parere del Signor lionardo di capoa divisato in otto raggionamenti.* Naples.

1692

Celano, C. *Notizie del bello, dell'antico e del curioso della città do Napoli.* Ed. G. B. Chiarini. Naples 1856–60. Reprint 1969–70.

Parrino, D. A. *Teatro eroico e politico dei governi de' vicere del regno di Napoli.* Naples.

1693

Rossini, P. *Il Mercurio errante delle grandezze di Roma.* Rome.

1697

Rossi, M., and P. V. Rossi. *Descrizione di Roma moderna.* Rome.

1700

Montelatici, G. B. *Villa Borghese fuori di Porta Pinciana.* Rome.

Parrino, D. A. *Napoli, città nobilissima antica e fedelissima esposta agli occhi e alla mente degli studiosi.* Naples.

1724

Susinno, F. *Le vite de' pittore messinesi*. Ed. V. Martinelli. Florence 1966.

1725

Panciroli, O., and F. Posterla. *Roma sacra e moderna*. Rome.

1726

de Vertot, R. A., Abbé. *Histoire des Chevaliers Hospitaliers de S. Jean de Jérusalem, appellez depuis les Chevaliers de aujourd'hui les Chevaliers de Malte*. Paris.

1742-43

de Dominici, B. *Vite de' pittori, scultori ed architetti napoletani*. Naples.

1743

Corona, A. *Razionale Del Monte: origine, statuti e progressi Del Monte, volume manoscritto compilato nell'anno 1700 da Alessandro Corona 1o aiutante di razionalia, ed indi razionale dello stesso Pio Monte della Misericordia*. Naples.

1745

Dézailler D'Argenville, A. J. *Abrégé de la vie des plus fameux peintres*. Vol. 1. Paris. In *Paragone* 2, no. 21 (1951), pp. 46-47.

Roisecco, G. *Roma ampliata e rinnovata o sia descrizione dell'antica e moderna città di Roma e di tutti gli edifici notabili che sono in essa*. Rome.

1745-55

de Brosses, C. *Lettere familiari*. Ed. C. Levi and G. Natoli. Rome 1957.

1752

Hoet, G. *Catalogue of naamlyst van schilderyen, met derzelver pryzen*, 2 vols. The Hague.

1756

Gallo, C. D. *Annal della città di Messina*. 2 vols. Messina.

1757

Vertue, G., ed. *A Catalogue and Description of King Charles the First's Collection of Pictures, Limnings, Statues, Bronzes, Medals and Other Curiosities*. London.

1761

Catalogue des tableaux du Cabinet du Roy au Luxembourg. Paris.

1762

Chattard. *Nuova descrizione del Vaticano*. Vol. 1. Rome.

1763

Cochin, N. *Voyage d'Italie*. Paris. In *Paragone* 2, no. 21(1951), pp. 48–49.

Titi, F. *Descrizione delle pitture, sculture, et architetture esposte al pubblico in Roma*. Rome.

Vasi, G. *Indice storico del gran prospetto di Roma, ovvero itinerario istruttivo di Roma diviso in otto giornate*. Rome. 2d ed. M. Vasi, 1794; 3d ed. G. Matthiae, 1804.

1765

Roisecco, G. *Roma antica e moderna*. Vol. 1. Rome.

1766

Ratti, C. G. *Istruzione di quanto può vedersi di più bello in Genova, etc*. Genoa.

1767

Venuti, R. *Accurata, e succinta descrizione topografica e istorica di Roma moderna*. Rome.

1769

de Lalande, I. I. *Voyage d'un françois en Italie fait dans les années 1765 et 1766*. Venice.

1776

Rossini, P. *Il Mercurio errante*. Rome.

1778

Ver Cruijs, T. *Raccolta di quadri dipinti dai più famosi pennelli e posseduti da S.A.R. Pietro Leopoldo di Toscana*. Florence.

1784

Orsini, B. *Guida al forestiere per l'augusta città di Perugia*. Perugia.

1786

Cancellieri, F. *De secretariis basilicae vaticano veteris et novae*. Rome.

1787

Ponz, A. *Viaje de España*. Ed. Aguilar. Madrid 1947.

von Ramdohr, F. *Über Mahlerei und Bildhauerarbeit in Rom*. Leipzig.

1788

Sigismondo, G. *Descrizione della città di Napoli e suoi borghi*. 2 vols. Naples.

1790

Catalogo della quadreria Borghese nel palazzo a Campo Marzio. In Piancastrelli 1891, pp. 890–93.

1792

Galante, G. M. *Breve descrizione della città di Napoli e suoi borghi*. Naples.

Hackert, F. *Memorie de' pittori messinesi*. Naples.

Lanzi, L. *La storia pittorica della Italia inferiore (o sia delle scuole fiorentina, senese, napolitana) compendiata e ridotta a metodo*. Florence.

1793

Picault, J. M. *Observations de Picault, artiste restaurateur de tableaux, à ses concitoyens, sur les tableaux de la République*. Paris.

1794

Tonci, S. *Descrizione ragionata della Galleria Doria Pamphili*. Rome.

Vasi, M. *Itinerario istruttivo di Roma o sia descrizione generale delle opere più insigni di pittura, scultura e architettura*. Rome.

1809

Lanzi, L. *Storia pittorica dell'Italia dal risorgimento delle belle arti fin presso la fine del XVIII secolo*. Ed. M. Capucci. Bassano 1968.

1812

Delaroche, H. *Catalogue historique et raisonné de tableaux par les plus grands peintres des écoles d'Italie composant la rare et célèbre Galerie Giustiniani*. Paris.

Landon, C. P. *Galerie Giustiniani, ou Catalogue figuré des tableaux de cette célèbre galerie*. Paris.

Paillet, A., and H. Delaroche. *Catalogue historique et raisonné de tableaux par les plus grands peintres principalement des écoles d'Italie qui composant la rare et célèbre galerie du Prince Giustiniani*. Paris.

1815

Romanelli, D. *Napoli antica e moderna*. Naples.

1819

Tofanelli, A. *Descrizione delle sculture e pitture che si trovano al Campidoglio*. Rome.

1820

Craffonara, G., and G. A. Guattani. *I più celebri quadri delle diverse scuole italiane riuniti nell'appartamento Borgia del Vaticano*. Rome.

1821

Cacopardi, G. Grosso. *Guida per la città di Messina*. Messina.

1822–25

Bottari, G., and S. Ticozzi. *Raccolta di lettere sulla pittura, scultura ed architettura scritte da più celebri personaggi dei secoli XV, XVI, e XVII, pubblicata da M. Gio. Bottari, e continuata fino ai nostri giorni da Stefano Ticozzi*. Milan.

1828

Perotta, V. *Descrizione storica della chiesa e del monastero di S. Domenico Maggiore di Napoli*. Naples.

1833

Fidecommesso artistico della famiglia Borghese. Istromento rogato il 21 dicembre 1833. Iscritto all'Ufficio dell' Ipoteche il 3 giugno 1834. Rome.

1834–40

Parthey, G. *Wanderungen durch Sicilien und die Levante.* 2 vols. Berlin.

1836

Marcucci, G. *Galerie du Palais Pitti.* Florence.

Righetti, P. *Descrizione del Campidoglio.* 2 vols. Rome.

1837

Kugler, F. *Handbuch der Geschichte der Malerei seit Constantin dem Grossen.* Berlin. In *Paragone* 2, no. 21 (1951), pp. 55–56; no. 23, pp. 28–29.

1838

Badger, G. P. *Description of Malta and Gozo.* Malta. Reprint 1989.

1843

Donovan, J., Rev. *Rome Ancient and Modern.* 3 vols. London.

1844

Nibby, I. *Itinerario di Roma e delle sue vicinanze.* 2 vols. Rome.

1845

Nobile, G. *Napoli e i luoghi celebri delle sue vicinanze.* 2 vols. Naples.

1846

Arciconfraternità dei SS. Angeli Custodi. *Statuti della venerabile Arciconfraternità dei SS. Angeli Custodi di Roma.* Rome.

Banchero, G. *Guida alle bellezze di Genova.* 2 vols. Genoa.

1847

de Chennevières-Pointel, P. *Recherches sur la vie et les ouvrages de quelques peintres provinciaux de l'ancienne France.* Paris.

1850

Emerson, R. W. *Representative Men*. Boston.

1853

Ranke, L. *The History of the Popes, Their Church and State and especially of the Conflicts with Protestantism in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries*. 3 vols. London.

1854

Valle, R. M., and B. Minichini. *Descrizione storica, artistica, letteraria della chiesa del convento e dei religiosi illustri di San Domenico Maggiore di Napoli*. Naples.

1855

Amico, V. *Dizionario topografico della Sicilia*. Palermo.

Burckhardt, J. *Der Cicerone. Eine Einteilung zum Genus der Kunstwerke Italiens*. Basel.

1857

Parro, S. R. *Toledo en la mano*. 2 vols. Toledo.

Poleró y Toledo, V. *Catalogo de los quadros del Real Monasterio de San Lorenzo llamado del Escorial*. Madrid.

1864

Waagen, J. F. *Die Gemäldesammlungen in der Kaiserlichen Ermitage zu St. Petersburg, Nebst Bemerkungen über andere dortige Kunstsammlungen*. Munich.

1868

Baschet, A. "François Porbus, peintre de portraits à cour de Mantoue." *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, November, pp. 438–56.

1869

Burckhardt, J. *Der Cicerone*. Ed. Von Zahn and Mundler. 2d ed. Leipzig.

1870

Barbier de Montault, X. *Les musées et galeries de Rome*. Paris.

Campori, G. *Raccolta di cataloghi ed inventarii inediti . . . dal secolo XV al secolo XIX*. Rome.

1872

de Madrazo, P. *Catalogo descriptivo e historico del Museo del Prado de Madrid etc.* Madrid.

Meyer, J. *Allgemeines Künstler Lexikon.* Leipzig.

1873

Groovaerts, A. *Notice historique sur un tableau de Michelangelo da Caravaggio.* Anvers.

1877

Bertolotti, A. “Esportazione di oggetti di belle arti da Roma nei secc. XVI, XVII e XVIII.”

In *Archivio storico artistico archeologico e letterario della città e provincia di Roma.* 2 vols. Rome.

1881

Bertolotti, A. *Artisti lombardi a Roma nei secoli XV, XVI e XVII. Studi e ricerche negli archivi romani.* Milan.

Engerth, E. R. von. *Kunsthistorische Sammlungen des Allerhöchsten Kaiserhauses, Gemälde, Beschreibendes Verzeichnis.* Vol. 1. Vienna.

Law, E. *A Historical Catalogue of the Pictures in the Royal Collection at Hampton Court.* London.

1884

Bonaffé, E. *Dictionnaire des amateurs français au XVII siècle.* 2d ed. Paris 1885.

Burckhardt, J. *Der Cicerone.* 2 vols. 5th ed. Ed. W. Bode. Leipzig.

Cristofani, A., and L. Leonelli. *Guida d'Assisi e suoi dintorni.* Assisi.

1885

Bertolotti, A. *Artisti in relazione coi Gonzaga signori di Mantova.* Milan.

de Roever, N. “Drie Amsterdamsche Schilders. Pieter Isaaksz, Abraham Vinck, Cornelis van der Voort.” *Oud Holland* 2, pp. 171–208.

1886

Bredius, A., and N. de Roever. “Pieter Lastman en François Venant.” In *Oud Holland* 4, pp.1–23.

1888

Benadduci, G. *Di un quadro del Caravaggio*. Tolentino.

1889

Vicchi, L. *Dieci quadri della Galleria Sciarra*. Rome.

1890

Leonardo da Vinci: Trattato della pittura. Facsimile. Ed. M. Tabarrini. Verona 1989.

1891

Piancastrelli, G. *Catalogo dei quadri della Galleria Borghese iscritti nelle Note Fidecommissario*.
Rome.

Verifica dei quadri, oggetti d'arte, e sculture iscritti nelle Note Fidecommissarie riuniti nel Casino della Villa Borghese, 21 novembre 1891. Rome.

1891–1953

Pastor, L. *The History of the Popes from the Close of the Middle Ages*. Trans. F. I. Antrobus, R. F. Kern et al. 40 vols. St. Louis.

1892

Mariotti, F. *La legislazione delle belle arti*. Fidecommissio Barberini. Rome.

1893

Hymans, H. *Lucas Vorsterman: catalogue raisonné de son oeuvre, précédé d'un notice sur la vie et les ouvrages du maître*. Vol. 1. Brussels.

Venturi, A. *Il Museo e la Galleria Borghese*. Rome.

1894

Joppi, V. "Contributo quarto ed ultimo alla storia dell'arte nel Friuli ed alla vita dei pittori . . . friulani del XIV al XVII secolo." In *Monumenti storici pubblicati della R. Deputazione veneta di storia patria*, 4th ser., misc. appendix to vol. 12. Venice.

1895

Rashdall, H. *The Universities of Europe in the Middle Ages*. Oxford.

1896

Venturi, A. *Le gallerie di Roma*. Rome.

1897

Clement, M. *Handbook of Legendary and Mythological Art*. Boston.

1898

Law, E. *The Royal Gallery of Hampton Court*. London.

1901–11

Mireur, H. *Dictionnaire des ventes d'art faites en France et à l'étranger pendant les XVIII^{me} et XIX^{me} siècles*. 7 vols. Paris.

1902

Ruggiero, M. "Il Monte della Misericordia: l'edificio." *Napoli nobilissima*, January, pp. 7–10.

1903

Calzini, E. "Miscellanea: il santuario dell'Ambro ed un quadro attribuito a Michelangelo da Caravaggio." *L'Arte* 6, pp. 391–92.

1905

Battistella, A. *Il S. officio e la riforma religiosa in Bologna*. Bologna.

1906

Jerrold, M. F. *Vittoria Colonna with Some Account of Her Friends and Her Times*. London.

Saccà, V. "Michelangelo da Caravaggio pittore." *Archivio storico messinese* 7, pp. 40–69.

Suida, W. *Genoa*. Leipzig.

1906–7

Kallab, W. "Caravaggio." *Jahrbuch de Kunsthistorischen Sammlungen des allerhöchsten Kaiserhauses* 26, pp. 272–92.

1907

de Foville, J. *Gênes*. Genoa.

Ratti, A. *Guida sommaria per il visitore della Biblioteca Ambrosiana*. Milan.

1908

Ricci, C. "La Medusa degli Uffizi." *Vita d'arte*, January, pp. 1–10.

1909

Beltrami, L. *Il museo del Cardinal Federico Borromeo*. Milan.

Giglioli, O. H. "Notiziario della Regia Galleria Pitti." *Rivista d'Arte*, March–April, pp. 151–52.

Venturi, L. "Note sulla Galleria Borghese." *L'Arte* 12, pp. 31–50.

1910

Freise, K. *Pieter Lastman, sein Leben und seine Kunst*. Wittenburg.

Venturi, L. "Studi su Michelangelo da Caravaggio." *L'Arte* 13, pp. 191–201, 268–84.

1911

Posse, H. "Caravaggio." In *Allgemeines Lexikon der Bilden den Künstler*, ed. U. Thieme and F. Becker. Leipzig.

1912

Archivio storico per le province napoletane. Naples.

Cantalamesa, G. *Note al catalogo Venturi*. Rome.

Pieraccini, E. *Catalogo della Reale Galleria degli Uffizi in Firenze*. Florence.

Venturi, L. "Opere inedite di Michelangelo da Caravaggio." *Bollettino d'arte*, January, pp. 1–18.

Voss, H. "Italienische Gemälde des 16 und 17 Jahrhunderts in der Galerie des Kunsthistorischen Hofsmuseums zu Wien." *Zeitschrift für bildende Kunst*, pp. 41–55, 62–74.

1913

Archivio storico per le province napoletane. Naples.

Longhi, R. "Due opere di Caravaggio." *L'Arte* 16, pp. 161–64.

Luzio, A. *La galleria dei Gonzaga*. Mantua.

1914

Bocconi, S. *Guida di Pinacoteca Capitolina*. Rome.

Borenius, T. *Pictures by Old Masters in the Library of Christ Church, Oxford*. Oxford.

Cantalamessa, G. "Per le future monografie del Guercino e del Caravaggio."

Bollettino d'arte 8 (July), pp. 213–18.

1915

Longhi, R. "Battistello." *L'Arte* 9 (Feb.), pp. 58–75, 120–37.

1916

Longhi, R. "'Gentileschi padre e figlia.'" *L'Arte* 32 (Dec.), pp. 245–314.

Witting, F. *Michelangelo da Caravaggio*. Strasbourg.

1917

Fiocco, G. "Review of T. Borenius, *Pictures by the Old Masters in the Library of Christ Church, Oxford*." *L'Arte* 47 (Nov.), pp. 360–61.

1917–18

Bredius, A. "Lets over de schilders Louys, David en Pieter Finson." *Oud Holland* 36, pp. 197–204.

Marangoni, M. "Valori mal noti e trascurati della pittura italiana del seicento in alcuni pittori di natura morta." *Rivista d'Arte*, pp. 1–31. In Marangoni 1953, pp. 3–35.

1918

Longhi, R. "[Review] F. Saponi, 'Un quadro ignorato di Gherardo delle Notti.'" *L'Arte*, p. 239.

1919

Archivio storico per le province napoletane. Naples.

1920

Archivio Storico per le province napoletane. Naples.

Orbaan, J. A. F. *Documenti sul Barocco in Roma*. Rome.

Rouchès, G. *Le Caravage*. Paris.

Voss, H. *Die Malerei des Barock in Rom*. 2 vols. Berlin.

1921

Marangoni, M. *Il Caravaggio*. Florence.

Patrizi, M. L. *Un pittore criminale: Il Caravaggio: Ricostruzione psicologica: e la nova critica d'arte*. Recanati.

Venturi, L. *Il Caravaggio*. Rome.

1921–22

Mauceri, E. “Restauri a dipinti siracusani compiuti tra il 1920 e il 1921.” *Bollettino d'arte* 1, pp. 585–86.

1922

Liphart, E. de. “Le premier tableau peint à Rome par le Caravage.” *Gazette des Beaux-Arts* 64, January, pp. 30–34.

Lopresti, L. “Un appunto per la storia di Michelangelo da Caravaggio.” *L'Arte* 21, p. 116.

Marangoni, M. “Quattro ‘Caravaggio’ smarriti.” *Dedalo* 2, pp. 783–94. In Marangoni 1953, pp. 139–48.

Marangoni, M.² “Esperienze della mostra secentesca.” *Bollettino d'arte* 2, pp. 217–29. In Marangoni 1953, pp. 149–64.

Voss, H. “Caravaggio Amor als Sieger und Baglione Himmlische und irdische Liebe.” *Berliner Museen*, pp. 60–64. Berlin.

1923

Voss, H. “Caravaggio Frühzeit. Beiträge zur Kritik seiner Werke und seiner Entwicklung.” *Jahrbuch der preussischen Kunstsammlungen*, pp. 73–98.

1923–41

Sánchez Cantón, F. J. *Fuentes literarias para la historia del arte español*. 4 vols. Madrid.

1924

Voss, H. "Die Caravageske Frühzeit von Simon Vouet und Nicolas Regnier." *Zeitschrift für bildende Kunst*, pp. 56–67.

Voss, H.² *Die Malerie des Barock in Rom*. Berlin. Reprint 1999. Ed. A. de Marchi. Vicenza.

Weisbach, W. *Die Kunst des Barock*. Berlin.

1925

Borenius, T. "An Early Caravaggio Re-discovered." *Apollo*, pp. 23–26.

Mauceri, E. "Il Caravaggio in Sicilia ed Alonzo Rodriguez." *Bollettino d'arte* 4, June, pp. 559–71.

1926

Bocconi, S. *The Capitoline Collections: Picture Gallery and Tabularium*. Rome.

Longhi, R. "The Climax of Caravaggio's Influence on Guercino." *Art in America* 14, pp. 13–48. In Longhi 1967, pp. 27–34.

1927

Longhi, R. "Precisioni nelle gallerie italiane I, R. Galleria Borghese, Michelangelo da Caravaggio." *Vita artistica* 2, pp. 28–31. In Longhi 1968, vol. 2, pp. 300–306.

Longhi, R.² "Un 'San Tomaso' del Velázquez e le congiunture italo-spagnole tra il cinque e il seicento." *Vita artistica* 2, pp. 4–12. In Longhi 1967, pp. 113–27.

Longhi, R.³ "Ter Brugghen e la parte nostra." *Vita artistica* 2, pp. 105–16. In Longhi 1967, pp. 164–78.

1927–28

Pevsner, N. "Eine Revision der Caravaggio-Daten." *Zeitschrift für bildende Kunst*, pp. 386–92.

1928

Benkard, E. *Caravaggio-Studien*. Berlin.

Muñoz, A. *Roma barocca*. 2d ed. Rome.

Venturi, A. "Un quadro ignorato di Michelangelo da Caravaggio." *L'Arte* 7 (March–April), pp. 58–59.

1928–29

Longhi, R. “Questi caravaggeschi: I. Registro dei tempi.” *Pinacotheca* 4, pp. 17–35.

1929

Longhi, R. “Questi caravaggeschi: II. I precedenti.” *Pinacotheca* 5–6, pp. 258–320.

Marangoni, M. “An Unpublished Caravaggio in Trieste.” *International Studio*, pp. 34–35, 106.

Meli, F. “Nuovi documenti relativi a dipinti di Palermo dei secoli XVI e XVII.” In *Atti dell'Accademia di Scienza, Lettere, e Arti di Palermo*, pp. 205–6, 219.

1930

Camelli, L. *La pinacoteca del Civico Museo. Il catalogo*. Cremona.

Mâle, E. “La signification d’un tableau du Caravage.” In *Mélanges de l'École française de Rome* 46, pp. 1–6.

Mariani, V. *Il Caravaggio*. Rome.

1931

Philostratus Imagines. Trans. A. Fairbanks. Cambridge, Mass.

1931–32

Stechow, W. “Ikonographisches und Methodisches zu Caravaggio.” *Zeitschrift für bildende Kunst*, pp. 194–99.

1932

Kennard, J. S. *The Italian Theater from Its Beginnings to the Close of the Seventeenth Century*. New York.

Mâle, E. *L'art religieux après le Concile de Trent. Étude sur l'iconographie de la fin du XVIIe siècle, et du XVIIIe siècle*. Paris.

Tormo, E., and Y. Monzò. *Toledo, tesoros y museos*. 2 vols. Madrid.

1933

Schneider, A. von. *Caravaggio und die Niederländer*. 2d ed. Amsterdam 1967.

1935

Ashford, F. "Caravaggio's Stay in Malta." *Burlington Magazine* 67 (Oct.), pp. 168–74.

Isarlov, G. "Le caravagisme." *L'Amour de l'art*, pp. 115–19.

Longhi, R. "I pittori della realtà in Francia." *L'Italialetteraria* (Jan.), p. 1. Also in *Paragone* 269 (1972), p. 6.

Poensgen, G. *Die Gemälde in den preussischen Schlosser: Das Neue Palais*. Berlin.

1936

Bodmer, H. "Aus dem römischen Caravaggio-Kreise." In *Actes du XIV Congrès international d'histoire de l'art*. Berlin.

de Rinaldis, A. "Documenti inediti per la storia della R. Galleria Borghese in Roma. II. Le opere d'arte sequestrate al Cavaliere d'Arpino." *Archivi* 2, pp. 110–18.

Gronau, G. *Documenti artistici urbinati*. Florence.

Pariset, F. G. "Peintures de Jacques Bellange." *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, April, pp. 235–40.

Schneider, A. von. "Zur Stilbildung Caravaggios." *Pantheon* 18, pp. 347–54.

1937

de Rinaldis, A. "Documenti inediti per la storia della R. Galleria Borghese in Roma. III. Un catalogo della quadreria Borghese nel palazzo a Campo Marzio redatto nel 1760." *Archivi* 3, pp. 221–26, 230–32.

Morelli, G. *Le corporazioni romane di arti e mestieri dal XIII al XIX secolo*. Rome.

Symonds, J. A. *Renaissance in Italy: The Catholic Reaction*. London.

1938

Oertel, R. "Neapolitanische Malerei des 17.–19. Jahrhunderts." *Pantheon* 21–22, pp. 225–32.

1939

Caracciolo di Torchiarolo, A. *Una famiglia italianissima. I Carracciolo di Napoli*. Naples.

1939–40

Baumgart, F. "Die Falschspieler Caravaggios." *Das Werk des Künstlers* 1, pp. 482–524.

Santangelo, A. "Nuovi acquisti per i Musei di Stato." *L'Arte*, January–December, pp. 67–74.

1941

Agnello, G. "Un Caravaggesco, Mario Minnitti." *Archivi* 8, pp. 60–80.

Isarlo, G. *Caravage et le Caravagisme européen*. Aix-en-Provence.

1942

Schudt, L. *Caravaggio*. Vienna.

1943

Argan, G. C. "Un'ipotesi caravaggesca." *Parallelo* 2, pp. 40–43.

Longhi, R. "Ultimi studi sul Caravaggio e la sua cerchia." *Proporzioni*, 1, pp. 5–63.

Longhi, R.² "Ultimissime sul Caravaggio." *Proporzioni*, 1, pp. 99–102.

1945

Friedlaender, W. "The Crucifixion of St. Peter: Caravaggio and Reni," in *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes*, VIII, pp. 152–60.

Sánchez Cantón, F. J. *Museo del Prado: catalogo de las pinturas*. Madrid.

1946

Garcia Chico, E. *Documentos para el estudio del arte en Castilla*. 3 vols. Valladolid.

1947

Ainaud y Lesarte, J. "Ribalta y Caravaggio." *Annales y Boletín de los Museos de Arte de Barcelona* 3–4, pp. 345–413.

Bettenson, H., ed. *Documents of the Christian Church*. Oxford.

Borzelli, A. *Storia della vita e delle opere di Giovan Battista Marino*. Naples.

Longhi, R., and U. Barbaro. "Documentario sul Caravaggio." *Universalìa*. Rome.

Mahon, D. *Studies in Seicento Art and Theory*. London. Reprint 1971.

Morassi, A. "Il Caravaggio di Casa Balbi," in *Emporium*, CV, April, pp. 95–102.

Reade, B. "William Frizell and the Royal Collection." *Burlington Magazine* 89, no. 528 (Mar.), pp. 70–75.

1948

Argan, G. C. "Notes sur le Caravage." *Arts plastiques* 1-2, pp. 74-76.

de Rinaldis, A. *Catalogo della Galleria Borghese*. Rome.

Pariset, F. G. *Georges de la Tour*. Paris.

Romani, M. *Pellegrini e viaggiatori nell'economia di Roma dal XIV al XVII secolo*. Milan.

1948-49

Sammut, E. "Caravaggio in Malta." *Scientia*, pp. 78-89.

1949

Giglioli, E. H. *Giovanni da San Giovanni*. Florence.

Kleiner, G. *Die Inspiration des Dichters*. Kunstwerk und Deutung, Heft 5. Berlin.

Riverio Recio, J. F. *Guida de la Catedral del Toledo*. Toledo.

1950

Firpo, L. "Filosofia italiana e Controriforma." *Rivista di filosofia* 41, pp. 150-73.

Longhi, R. "Un ignoto corrispondente del Lanzi nella Galleria di Pomersfelden." *Proporzioni* 3, pp. 216-30.

Longhi, R.² "Un momento importante nella storia della natura morta." *Paragone* 1, pp. 34-39.

Venturi, L. "Il 'baro' del Caravaggio reitrovato." *Commentari* 1, pp. 41-42.

1951

Arslan, E. "Appunto su Caravaggio." *Aut Aut* 5, pp. 414-51.

Baroni, C. *Tutta la pittura del Caravaggio*. Milan.

Berenson, B. *Del Caravaggio, delle sue incongruenze e della sua fama*. Florence.

Firpo, L. "Filosofia italiana e Controriforma." *Rivista di filosofia* 42, pp. 30-47.

Green, O. H., and D. Mahon. "Caravaggio's Death: A New Document." *Burlington Magazine* XCIII (June), pp. 202-4.

Hauser, A. *The Social History of Art*. 4 vols. New York.

- Hess, J. "The Chronology of the Contarelli Chapel." *Burlington Magazine* XCIII (June), pp. 186–201.
- Longhi, R. "Antologia caravaggesca rara." in *Paragone* 15, pp. 3–17; 17, pp. 3–13, 44–62; 19, pp. 10–18, 61–63; 21, pp. 20–34, 35–39, 43–56; 23, pp. 28–53.
- Luther, Martin. *Selections from His Writings*, ed. J. Dillinger. New York.
- Mahon, D. "Caravaggio's Chronology Again." *Burlington Magazine* 93 (Sept.), pp. 286–92.
- Mahon, D.² "Egregius in Urbe Pictor: Caravaggio Revised." *Burlington Magazine* 93 (July), pp. 223–34.
- Urbani, G., and C. Urbani. "Restauro caravaggeschi per la Sicilia. Schede di restauro." *Bollettino dell'Istituto Centrale del Restauro* 2, nos. 5–6, pp. 61–91; nos. 7–8, pp. 47–84.
- Venturi, L. *Caravaggio*. Novara.
- Voss, H. "Caravaggio Europäische Bedeutung." *Kunstchronik*, pp. 287–94.
- Voss, H.² "Die Caravaggio-Ausstellung in Mailand." *Kunstchronik*, pp. 165–69.
- Voss, H.³ "Ein unbekanntes Frühwerk Caravaggio." *Die Kunst und das schöne Heim* 49, pp. 410–12.
- 1952
- Baumgart, F. "Die Anfänge Caravaggio." *Zeitschrift für Kunstwissenschaft*, pp. 85–106.
- Burns, G. D., and D. Carritt. "Una musica by Caravaggio." *Burlington Magazine* XCIV (Apr.), pp. 119–20.
- Felice, G. P. *Villa Ludovisi in Roma*. Rome.
- Longhi, R. *Il Caravaggio*. Milan.
- Mahon, D. "Addenda to Caravaggio." *Burlington Magazine* XCIV (Jan.), pp. 3–23.
- Mahon, D.² "An Addition to Caravaggio's Early Period." *Paragone* 3, no. 25 (Jan.), pp. 20–31.
- Masterpieces of Painting through Six Centuries*. Exh. cat., Allied Arts Association, Houston, Tex.
- Morassi, A., and D. Mahon. "The Odeschalchi-Balbi Conversion of St. Paul." *Burlington Magazine* XCIV (Apr.), pp. 118–19.

Norris, C. "The Disaster at Flaktum Friedrichschain, a Chronicle and List of Paintings."
Burlington Magazine XCIV (Dec.), pp. 337-47.

Sterling, C. *La nature morte de l'antique à nos jours*. Exh. cat., Orangerie des Tuileries, Paris.

1953

Berenson, B. *Caravaggio. His Incongruity and His Fame*. New York.

Bologna, F. "Altre prove sul viaggio romano del Tazio." *Paragone*, pp. 44-45.

Grassi, L. *Il Caravaggio*. Rome.

Hinks, R. *Caravaggio's Death of the Virgin*. London.

Hinks, R.² *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio: His Life, His Legend, His Works*. London.

Ladner, G. B. "The Concept of the Image in the Greek Fathers and the Byzantine
Iconoclastic Controversy." *Dumbarton Oaks Papers*, pp. 1-34.

Mahon, D. "Contrasts in Art-Historical Method: Two Recent Approaches to Caravaggio."
Burlington Magazine XCV (June), pp. 212-20.

Mahon, D.² "On Some Aspects of Caravaggio and His Times." *Bulletin of The Metropolitan
Museum of Art* 12, pp. 33-45.

Marangoni, M. *Arte barocca*. Florence.

1954

Alighieri, D. *The Inferno*. Trans. J. Ciardi. London.

Borsook, E. "Documents Concerning the Artistic Associates of Santa Maria della Scala in
Rome." *Burlington Magazine* 96 (Sept.), pp. 270-75.

Bottari, S. *La cultura figurativa in Sicilia*. Messina and Florence.

Calvesi, M. "Simone Peterzano Maestro del Caravaggio." *Bollettino d'arte*, pp. 114-32.

Friedlaender, W. "Book Reviews, R. Hinks, Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio." *Art
Bulletin* 36 (June), pp. 149-52.

Hess, J. "Modelle e modelli di Caravaggio." *Commentari* 4, pp. 271-89.

Kitzinger, E. "The Cult of Images before Iconoclasm." *Dumbarton Oaks Papers*, pp. 83-150.

Longhi, R. "Ambrogio Figino e due citazioni del Caravaggio." *Paragone* V, no.55 (July),
pp. 36-38.

- Longhi, R.² "L'Ecce Homo del Caravaggio a Genova." *Paragone* 5, no. 51, pp. 3-13.
- Longhi, R.³ "Una citazione tizianesca nel Caravaggio." *Arte Veneta*, pp. 211-12.
- Panofsky, I. *Galileo as a Critic of the Arts*. The Hague.
- Pietrangeli, C. "Un nuovo Caravaggio in Campidoglio?" *Bollettino dei Musei Comunali di Roma*.
- Rotondi, P. "La scoperta di un Caravaggio a Genoa." *Genova*, pp. 6-17.
- Sammut, E. *Art in Malta*. Malta.
- Swarzenski, H. "Caravaggio and Still-Life Painting." *Bulletin of the Museum of Fine Arts*, Boston, June, pp. 22-38.

1955

- Battisti, E. "Alcuni documenti su opere del Caravaggio." *Commentari* 6 (July-Sept.), pp. 173-85.
- Baumgart, F. *Caravaggio Kunst und Wirklichkeit*. Berlin.
- Czobor, A. "Autoritratti del giovane Caravaggio." *Acta Historiae Artium Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae* 2, p. 201-13.
- Friedlaender, W. *Caravaggio Studies*. Rev. ed. Princeton 1969.
- Jullian, R. "Caravage à Naples." *La Revue des arts*, June, pp. 79-90.
- Maltese, C. "Noterelle di critica figurata sul Caravaggio." *Commentari* 6 (April-June), pp. 111-16.
- Saint Bonaventure's De reductione artium ad theologium: A Commentary with an Introduction and Translations*. Ed. and trans. Sister Emma Therese Healy. New York.
- Scicluna, H. P. *The Church of St. John in Valletta*. Malta.
- Styns, L. "Un 'Marie Madeleine' du Musée des Beaux Arts de Poitiers, inspirée de Finsonius." *Dibutade-Bulletin des Amis du Musée de Poitiers* 2, pp. 1-8.
- Toschi, P. *Le origini del teatro italiano*. Turin.

1956

- Arcangeli, F. "Sugli inizi dei Carracci." *Paragone* 79, pp. 17-48.

Bauch, K. "Zur Ikonographie von Caravaggios Frühwerken." *Kunstgeschichtliche Studien für Hans Kauffmann*, pp. 252–61, Berlin.

Blunt, A. *Artistic Theory in Italy: 1450–1600*. 2d ed. Oxford.

Chastel, A. "Le problème de Caravage." *Critique* 14, pp. 949–67.

Gendel, M. "The Great Maltese Caravaggio." *Art News*, Summer, p. 20.

Guillet, H. *La collection de peinture du Musée de Rouen*. Rouen.

Lossow, H. "La presa di Christo. Ein Fragment eines verlorenen Gemäldes des Michelangelo da Caravaggio." *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte*, pp. 204–10.

Mahon, D. "A Late Caravaggio Rediscovered." *Burlington Magazine* 98 (July), pp. 225–28.

Mahon, D.² "Un tardo Caravaggio ritrovato." *Paragone* VII (May), pp. 25–34.

Malitzkaya, X. "Kartina italjanskoi skoly is Odesskogo Musja (Un quadro di scuola italiana al Museo di Odessa)." *Isskusstwo* 4, pp. 67–70.

Mancini, G. *Considerazioni sulla pittura*. Pubblicato per la prima volta da Adriana Marucchi con il commento di Luigi Salerno. 2 vols. Rome.

Samek Ludovici, S. *Vita del Caravaggio dalle testimonianze del suo tempo*. Milan.

Someda de Marco, C. *Il Museo Civico e le Gallerie d'Arte Antica e Moderna di Udine*. Udine.

Stechow, W. "Compte rendu de W. Friedlaender, Caravaggio Studies." *Criterion* 38, pp. 62–63.

Stechow, W.² "Friedlaender, Caravaggio Studies." *Art Bulletin* 38 (March), pp. 58–62.

1957

Bendiscioli, M. *Politica, amministrazione e religione nell'età dei Borromei*. In *Storia di Milano*, vol. 1, pp. 260–61, 265. Milan.

Carità, R. "Il restauro dei dipinti caravaggeschi della Cattedrale di Malta." *Bollettino dell'Istituto Centrale del Restauro* 8, pp. 29–30, 41–82.

Della Pergola, P. "Per la storia della Galleria Borghese." *Critica d'arte*, pp. 135–42.

Santa Teresa, D. de. *Juan de Valdes, 1498(?)–1541: su pensamiento religioso y las corrientes espirituales de su tiempo*. Rome.

Zeri, F. *Pittura e Controriforma: alle origini dell' "arte senza tempo."* Turin.

1958

- Back-Vega, E.-C. "A Lost Masterpiece by Caravaggio." *Art Bulletin* 40, pp. 65–66.
- Baumgart, F. "‘Jean-Baptiste a la source’, au Musée des Beaux-Arts de Lyon." *Bulletin Musées lyonnais* 2, pp. 117–23.
- Benoist, L. "A propos de quatre tableaux du Musée de Nantes." *La Revue des Arts*, pp. 209–14.
- Bologna, F. *Francesco Solimena*. Naples.
- Della Pergola, P. "Una testimonianza per Caravaggio." *Paragone* 105, pp. 71–75.
- Graeve, M. A. "The Stone Unction in Caravaggio's Painting for the Chiesa Nuova." *Art Bulletin* 40, pp. 223–38.
- Hess, J. "Caravaggio's Paintings in Malta: Some Notes." *Connoisseur* 142, pp. 142–47.
- Holt, E. G. *A Documentary History of Art*. Vol. 2. Princeton.
- Mâle, E. *Religious Art from the Twelfth to the Eighteenth Century*. New York.
- Pariset, F. G. "Note sur Jean Le Clerc." *La Revue des Arts*, pp. 69–70.
- Wagner, H. *Michelangelo da Caravaggio*. Bern.
- Wittkower, R. *Art and Architecture in Italy 1600–1750*. London.

1959

- Arcangeli, F. *Maestri della pittura del seicento emiliano*. Bologna.
- Arslan, E. "Nota caravaggesca." *Arte antica e moderna*, pp. 191–218.
- Berne Joffroy, A. *Le dossier Caravage*. Paris. Reprint 1999.
- Della Pergola, P. *Galleria Borghese. II Dipinti*. Rome.
- Della Pergola, P.² "Gli inventari Aldobrandini." *Arte antica e moderna*, pp. 425–44.
- Longhi, R. "Un'opera estrema del Caravaggio." *Paragone* 111 (Mar.), pp. 21–32.
- Longhi, R.² "Un originale del Caravaggio a Rouen." *Paragone* 121, pp. 23–28.
- Longhi, R.³ "Un originale del Caravaggio a Rouen e il problema delle copie caravaggesche." *Paragone* XI, pp. 26–36.
- Millar, O. *Abraham van der Doort's Catalogue of the Collection of Charles I c. 1639*. London.

Salerno, L. "The Picture Gallery of Vincenzo Giustiniani: Introduction and Inventory, Parts I, II, III." *Burlington Magazine*, January, pp. 21–28; March, pp. 93–104; April, pp. 135–48.

Sommer, T. "Licht und Finsternis. Studien zu Caravaggio und Shakespeare." *Shakespeare Jahrbuch* 95, 1959, pp. 193–213.

Steinberg, L. "Observations in the Cerasi Chapel." *Art Bulletin* 41, pp. 183–90.

1961

Bossaglia, R. "Un'altra copia della Maddalena del Caravaggio." *Commentari* 12, pp. 195–202.

Cozzi, G. "Intorno al Cardinale Ottavio Paravicino, a Monsignor Paolo Gualdo e a Michelangelo da Caravaggio." *Rivista storica italiana* 73, pp. 36–68.

Ivanoff, N. "Mattia Stomer e il tema caravaggesco dell'Incredulità di S. Tommaso." *Emporium*, October, pp. 147–51.

Jullian, R. *Caravage*. Lyons and Paris.

Moir, A. "The Boy with a Flute by Bartolomeo Manfredi." *Bulletin of the Art Division, Los Angeles County Museum*, pp. 3–15.

1962

Argan, G. C. "Caravaggio: das Selbstporträt der Galleria Borghese." *Hefte des Kunsthistorischen Seminars der Universität München* 7–8, p. 24.

Borla, S. "1593: arrivo del Caravaggio a Roma." *Emporium*, October, pp. 3–16.

Campanella, T. *La città del sole e scelta d'alcune poesie filosofiche*. Ed. A. Seroni. Milan.

Cauchi, J. A. "Notes on the Works of Art in the Co-Cathedral of St. John in Valletta." *Scientia*, Oct.–Dec., pp. 168–73.

de Logu, G. *Caravaggio*. Milan.

de Logu, G.² *Natura morta italiana*. Bergamo.

Luther, Martin. *Selections from His Writings*, ed. J. Dillinger. Reprint of 1951 ed. New York.

Ottino della Chiesa, A. *Caravaggio*. Bergamo.

Pastor, R. *Storia dei papi*. Vol. 12. Rome.

Sedlmayr, H. "Caravaggio: das Selbstporträt der Galleria Borghese." *Hefte des Kunsthistorischen Seminars der Universität München* 7–8, p. 25.

Waterhouse, E. K. *Italian Baroque Paintings*. London.

1963

Canova, G. *Paris Bordon*. Venice.

Lazareff, V. "Una nuova opera del Caravaggio La presa di Cristo all'orto." *Scritti di storia dell'arte in onore di Mario Salmi*, vol. 3, pp. 275–85. Rome.

Longhi, R. "Il vero Maffeo Barberini del Caravaggio." *Paragone* XIV (Sept.), pp. 3–11.

López-Rey, J. *Velázquez: A Catalogue Raisonné of His Oeuvre*. London.

Nicolson, B. "Caravaggisti in Naples." *Burlington Magazine* CV (May), pp. 209–10.

Scavizzi, G. *Caravaggio e Caravaggeschi*. Exh. cat., Museo Nazionale di Capodimonte, Naples.

1964

Auerbach, E. "Figurative Texts Illustrating Certain Passages of Dante's *Commedia*." *Speculum* 31, pp. 474–89.

Della Pergola, P. "L'inventario Borghese del 1693, parts I and II." *Arte antica e moderna* 26, pp. 219–30; 28, pp. 451–67.

Della Pergola, P.² "Nota per Caravaggio." *Bollettino d'arte* 50, pp. 252–56.

Ivanoff, N. "Intorno al tardo Saraceni." *Arte veneta*, pp. 177–80.

Macrae, D. "Observations on the Sword in Caravaggio." *Burlington Magazine* CVI (Sept.), pp. 412–16.

Merola, A. "Antonio Barberini." *Dizionario biografico degli italiani*, pp. 166–70. Rome.

Röttgen, H. "Giuseppe Cesari, die Contarelli-Kapelle und Caravaggio." *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte*, pp. 201–27.

Stechow, W. *Festschrift für Ludwig Heinrich Heydenreich*. Munich.

Yates, F. *Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition*. Chicago.

1965

Barberi, F. *Libri e stampatori nella Roma dei papi*. Rome.

Friedlaender, W. *Mannerism and Anti-Mannerism in Italian Painting*. 6th ed. New York.

Hibbard, H., and M. Levine. "Seicento at Detroit." *Burlington Magazine* 107, pp. 370–72.

Mastellone, S. *Pensiero politico e vita culturale a Napoli nella seconda metà del seicento*. Messina and Florence.

Röttgen, H. "Die Stellung der Contarelli Kapelle in Caravaggios Werk." *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte*, pp. 47–68.

Spear, R. "The Raising of Lazarus: Caravaggio and the Sixteenth Century Tradition." In *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, CVII, February, pp. 65–79.

1966

Berti, L. *Caravaggio: le Storie di San Matteo*. Florence.

Bodart, D. "Intorno al Caravaggio: La Maddalena del 1606." *Palatino* 10, pp. 118–26.

Bottari, S. *Caravaggio*. Florence.

Brandi, C. *Le due vie*. Bari.

Calvesi, M. "Amore carnale e divino: discussione sulla galleria dei Carracci." *Marcatré* 4, pp. 302–3.

Camesasca, E. *The Complete Paintings of Michelangelo*. New York.

Causa, R. *Caravaggio*. 2 vols. Milan.

Dickens, A. G. *Reformation and Society in Sixteenth-Century Europe*. New York.

Heikamp, D. "La Medusa di Caravaggio e l'armatura dello Scia Abbas di Persia." *Paragone* 191, pp. 70–76.

Kinthead, D. T. "Temi religiosi. Poseia e simboli nel Caravaggio." *Palatino* 10, pp. 112–15.

Klein, R., and H. Zerner. *Italian Art: 1500–1600*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.

Meyers, J. *Hosea, Joel, Amos, Obadiah, Layman's Bible Commentary*. Vol. 14. Richmond, Va.

Rosenberg, P. *Rouen, Musée des Beaux Arts. Tableaux français du XVII siècle et italiens des XVII et XVIII siècles*. Rouen.

Rotondi, P. "Una nuova proposta per il Caravaggio nella Cappella Contarelli." *Bollettino dell'Istituto Centrale del Restauro* 46, pp. 11–35.

Salerno, L. "Temi religiosi. Poesia e simboli nel Caravaggio. I dipinti emblematici." *Palatino* 10, pp. 106–12.

Schiller, G. *Ikongraphie del Christlichen Kunst*. 3 vols. Gütersloh.

Schwarz, H. "Vermeer and the Camera Obscura." *Pantheon* 24, pp. 170–82.

- Urbani, G. "Il restauro delle tele del Caravaggio in San Luigi dei Francesi." *Bollettino dell'Istituto Centrale del Restauro*, pp. 36–80.
- Vigne, L. "Reflections of Narcissus." *Kunsthistorisk Tidskrift* 35, pp. 42–44.
- Wilson, W. H. "Temi religiosi. Poesia e simboli nel Caravaggio. Realtà e composizione storica." *Palatino* 10, pp. 115–17.
- 1967
- Aronberg Lavin, M. "Caravaggio Documents from the Barberini Archive." *Burlington Magazine* 109 (Aug.), pp. 470–73.
- Byam Shaw, J. *Paintings by Old Masters at Christ Church, Oxford*. Oxford.
- Coniglio, G. *I viceré spagnoli di Napoli*. Naples.
- Denaro, V. *The Houses of Valletta*. Malta.
- D'Onofrio, C. *Roma vista da Roma*. Rome.
- Enggass, R. "L'Amore Giustiniani del Caravaggio." *Palatino* 11, pp. 13–20.
- Feiner, J., and M. Löhrer. *L'evento salvifico nella comunità di Gesù Cristo. Azione della grazia di Dio*. Brescia.
- Fransen, P., S.J. "Presentazione storica-dogmatica della dottrina della grazia." In *L'evento salvifico nella comunità di Gesù Cristo*, ed. J. Feiner and M. Löhrer, 1967, pp. 55–216.
- Garas, K. "The Ludovisi Collection of Pictures in 1633." *Burlington Magazine* CIX (May), pp. 287–88, 771, and (June), pp. 229–48.
- Guttuso, R., and A. Ottino della Chiesa. *L'opera completa del Caravaggio*. Milan.
- Hess, J. *Kunstgeschichtliche Studien zu Renaissance und Barock*. 2 vols. Rome.
- Longhi, R. *Opere complete*. Vol. 2, *Saggi e ricerche: 1925–1928*. Florence.
- Lotz, W. "Der Palazzo Zuccari in Rom." In *Künstlerhaus des 16. Jahrhunderts als Sitz eines Max-Planck-Instituts*, pp. 149–55. Rome.
- Moir, A. *The Italian Followers of Caravaggio*. Cambridge, Mass.
- Pesch, O. H. "Azione della grazia di Dio come giustificazione e santificazione dell'uomo." In *L'evento salvifico nella comunità di Gesù Cristo*, ed. J. Feiner and M. Löhrer, pp. 296–408. Brescia.
- Villari, R. *La rivolta antispagnola a Napoli. Le origini (1585–1647)*. Bari.

1968

Benedetti, S. *S. Maria di Loreto*. Rome.

Brugnoli, M. V. "Un San Francesco da attribuire al Caravaggio e la sua copia." *Bollettino d'arte* 53, pp. 11–15.

Carderi, B. "Caravaggio in Abruzzo?" *Abruzzo*, May–December, pp. 421–23.

Fagiolo dell'Arco, M. "Le opere di Misericordia: contributo alla poetica del Caravaggio." *L'Arte*, March, pp. 37–61.

Longhi, R. *Opere complete*. Vol. 4, 'Me pinxit' e quesiti caravaggeschi, 1928–34. Florence.

Ottani Cavini, A. *Carlo Saraceni*. Milan.

Puppi, L. "[Review] Dosso Dossi." *Burlington Magazine* 110 (June), p. 360.

Roskill, M. W. *Dolce's "Aretino" and Venetian Art Theory of the Cinquecento*. New York.

Stuffman, M. "Les tableaux de la collection de Pierre Crozat . . . d'un inventaire après le décès inédit (1740)." *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, pp. 11–144.

1969

Askew, P. "The Angelic Consolation of St. Francis of Assisi in Post-Tridentine Italian Painting." *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32, pp. 280–306.

Falchetti, A. *La Pinacoteca Ambrosiana*. Milan.

Kitson, M. *The Complete Paintings of Caravaggio*. London and New York.

Moir, A. "Did Caravaggio Draw?" *Art Quarterly* 32 (Oct.–Dec.), pp. 354–72.

Porcella, A. *Un capolavoro ritrovato del Caravaggio*. Rome.

Rizzi, A. *La Galleria d'Arte Antica dei Musei Civici di Udine*. Udine.

Röttgen, H. "Caravaggio Probleme." *Münchener Jahrbuch der bildenden Kunst*, pp. 143–70.

Ryan, G., and H. Ripperger, trans. *The Golden Legend by Jacobus de Voragine*. New York.

Slatkes, L. J. "Caravaggio's Painting of the Sanguine Temperament." In *Actes du XXII^{me} Cong. International d'Histoire de l'Art*. Budapest 1972.

Zandri, G. "Un probabile dipinto murale del Caravaggio per il Cardinale Del Monte." *Storia dell'arte* 3, pp. 338–43.

1970

Bodart, D. *Louis Finson*. Brussels.

Causa, R. *Opere d'arte nel Pio Monte della Misericordia a Napoli*. Naples.

Cochrane, W., ed. *The Late Italian Renaissance 1525–1630*. London.

Enggass, R., and J. Brown. *Italy and Spain: 1600–1750. Sources and Documents in the History of Art*, ed. H. W. Janson. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.

Fagiolo dell'Arco, M. "Il Parmigianino." *Storia dell'arte* 7–8, p. 193.

Fagiolo dell'Arco, M., and M. Marini. "Rassegna degli studi caravaggeschi 1951–70." *L'Arte* 11–12, pp. 117–28.

Matthiessen, P., and D. S. Pepper. "Guido Reni: An Early Masterpiece Discovered in Liguria." *Apollo*, June, pp. 452–62.

Müller Hofstede, J. "Rubens in Rom 1601–1602: die Altargemälde für Sta. Croce in Gerusalemme." *Jahrbuch der Berliner Museen*, pp. 61–110.

Petersson, R. *The Art of Ecstasy: Teresa, Bernini, and Crashaw*. New York.

Rosenberg, P. *Le siècle de Rembrandt. Tableaux hollandais des collections publiques françaises*. Paris.

Salerno, L. "Caravaggio e i Caravaggeschi." *Storia dell'arte* nos. 7–8 (July–Dec.), pp. 234–48.

Schleier, E. "Pittura Italiana del Siglo XVII," in *Kunstchronik*, December, pp. 341–49.

Scicluna, H. *A Short History of the Knights Hospitaller of St. John of Jerusalem, of Rhodes, and of Malta*. Malta.

Vsevolozhskaya, S. N. *Paintings by Caravaggio and His School in the Collections of the Hermitage*. Leningrad.

Volpe, C. "Caravaggio e i Caravaggeschi nelle gallerie di Firenze." *Paragone* 21 (Nov.), pp. 110–11.

Zeri, F. *Pittura e Controriforma. L'arte senza tempo di Scipione da Gaeta*. Turin.

1971

Baccheschi, E. *L'opera completa di Guido Reni*. Milan.

Boschetto, A. *La collezione Roberto Longhi*. Florence.

Calvesi, M. "Caravaggio o la ricerca della salvezza." *Storia dell'arte* 9–10 (Jan.–June), pp. 93–141.

- Cinotti, M., and G. A. Dell'Acqua. *Michelangelo Merisi, detto il Caravaggio, tutte le opere*. Bergamo.
- Freedberg, S. J. *Painting in Italy: 1500–1600*. London.
- Haskell, F. *Patrons and Painters: Art and Society in Baroque Italy*. New Haven and London.
- Levey, M. *National Gallery Catalogues. The 17th and 18th Century Italian Schools*. London.
- Marini, M. “Tre proposte per il Caravaggio meridionale.” *Arte illustrata* 43–44, pp. 57–58.
- Masetti Zannini, G. L. “Un dipinto del Caravaggio.” *Commentari*, April–Sept., pp. 184–86.
- Pepper, D. S. “Caravaggio and Guido Reni: Contrasts in Attitudes.” *Art Quarterly* 34, pp. 325–44.
- Pérez Sánchez, A. E. “Caravaggio e i Caravaggeschi a Firenze.” *Arte illustrata*, Jan.–Feb. pp. 85–89.
- Posner, D. “Caravaggio’s Homo-erotic Early Works.” *Art Quarterly* 34, pp. 301–24.
- Schleier, E. “Caravaggio e i Caravaggeschi nelle gallerie di Firenze—zur Ausstellung im Palazzo Pitti, Sommer 1970.” *Kunstchronik*, April, pp. 85–102.
- Spear, R. “A Note on Caravaggio’s *Boy with a Vase of Roses*.” *Burlington Magazine* 113 (Aug.), pp. 470–73.
- Spear, R.² *Caravaggio and His Followers*. Exh. cat., Cleveland Museum of Art, Cleveland. Rev. ed. 1975.
- Spear, R.³ “Caravaggisti at the Palazzo Pitti.” *Art Quarterly* 34, pp. 108–10.
- Spezzaferro, L. “La cultura del cardinale Del Monte e il primo tempo del Caravaggio.” *Storia dell’arte* nos.9–10 (Jan.–June), pp. 57–92.
- Wethey, H. *Titian: The Portraits*. London.
- 1972
- Borea, E. “Considerazioni sulla mostra Caravaggio e i suoi seguaci a Cleveland.” *Bollettino d’arte* 57, p. 156.
- Brigstocke, H., and C. Thompson. *Pictures for Scotland. The National Gallery of Scotland and Its Collection: A Study in Changing Attitudes to Painting since the 1820s*. Edinburgh.
- Burke, P. *Culture and Society in Renaissance Italy 1420–1540*. New York.

- Causa, R. "La pittura del seicento a Napoli dal Naturalismo al Barocco," I, "La natura morta a Napoli nel Sei e Settecento," II. In *Storia di Napoli*, pp. 915–20, 997–99. Naples.
- Fredericksen, B., and F. Zeri. *Census of Pre-Nineteenth-Century Italian Paintings in North American Public Collections*. Cambridge, Mass.
- Frommel, C. L. "Addendum to the Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte's Inventory: The Date of the Sale of Various Notable Paintings." *Storia dell'arte* 11–12 (Jan.–June), pp. 53–56 [Published 1972; dated 1971.]
- Frommel, C. L.2 "Caravaggios Frühwerk und der Kardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte." *Storia dell'arte* 11–12 (Jan.–June), pp. 5–52. [Published 1972; dated 1971.]
- Gregori, M. "Caravaggio dopo la mostra di Cleveland." *Paragone* 263, pp. 23–49.
- Ivanoff, N. "A proposito dell'Incredulità di S. Tommaso del Caravaggio." *Arte lombarda* 17, pp. 71–73, 105–9.
- Kirwin, W. C. "Addendum to Cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte's Inventory: The Date of the Sale of Various Notable Paintings." *Storia dell'arte* nos. 9–10, pp. 53–55. [Published 1972; dated 1971].
- Koschatzky, W., and A. Strobl. *Dürer Drawings in the Albertina*. Greenwich, Conn.
- Mâle, E. *L'art religieux de la fin du XVIe siècle*. Paris.
- Moir, A. "Drawings after Caravaggio." *Art Quarterly* 35, pp. 123–42.
- Nicolson, B. "Caravaggesques at Cleveland." *Burlington Magazine* 114, pp. 113–17.
- Safarik, E., ed. *Acquisti della Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica, 1972–74*. Exh. cat., Rome.
- Slatkes, L. J. "Caravaggio's Painting of the Sanguine Temperament." *Actes du XXIIme Congres International d'Histoire de l'Art, 1969*. Budapest 1972.
- Spear, R. "Unknown Pictures by the Caravaggisti," in *Storia dell'arte*, no. 14, pp. 149–67.
- Volpe, C. "Annotazioni sulla mostra caravaggesca di Cleveland." *Paragone* 263, pp. 50–76.
- 1973
- Cellini, P. *Quarto centenario del Caravaggio*. Rome.
- Cummings, F. "Notes on *The Conversion of the Magdalen*: the Alzaga Caravaggio." *Bulletin of the Detroit Institute of Arts* [entire book devoted to this painting].
- Della Pergola, P. "Breve nota su Caravaggio." *Commentari* 24, p. 52.

Gregori, M. *Gli affreschi della Certosa di Garegnano*. Milan.

Gregori, M.² “Notizie su Agostino Verrocchio e un’ipotesi per Giovan Battista Crescenzi.”
Paragone 275, pp. 36–56.

Immagine del Caravaggio, mostra didattica itinerante. Ed. M. Cinotti. Milan.

Mariani, V. *Caravaggio*. Rome.

Marini, M. “Caravaggio 1607: la ‘Negazione di Pietro.’” *Napoli nobilissima*, 13, pp. 189–94.

Pepper, D. S. “Caravaggio riveduto e corretto: la mostra di Cleveland.” *Arte illustrata*, 48,
pp. 170–78.

Röttgen, H. *Cavaliere d’Arpino*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Venezia, Rome.

Scherliess, V. “Zu Caravaggios ‘Musica’ (Auhang: Notenbücher auf Bildern Caravaggios).”
Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorisches Instituts in Florenz 27, pp. 141–48.

Shapley, F. R. *Paintings from the Kress Collection, Italian Schools XVI–XVII Century*. London.

Skinner, B. *The Indefatigable Mr. Allan*. Exh. cat., Edinburgh Arts Council, Edinburgh.

1973–74

Brejon de Lavergnée, A., and J. P. Cuzin. *I caravaggeschi francesi*. Exh. cat., Academia di
Francia, Villa Medici, Rome.

1974

Bissell, R. W. “Concerning the Date of Caravaggio’s *Amore Vincitore*.” In Enggass and
Stokstad. Lawrence, Kan.

Bologna, F. “Il Caravaggio nella cultura e nella società del suo tempo.” In *Caravaggio e i
caravaggisti*, pp. 149–87.

Borea, E. “Caravaggio e la Spagna: osservazioni su una mostra a Siviglia.” *Bollettino d’arte* 59,
p. 44.

Brejon de Lavergnée, A., and J. P. Cuzin. “A propos de Caravaggesques français.” *La Revue
du Louvre*, p. 35.

Caravaggio e i caravaggeschi. Symposium held 12–14 February, Accademia Nazionale dei
Lincei, Rome.

Chappell, M., and W. C. Kirwin. “A Petrine Triumph: The Decoration of the *Navi Piccole* in
San Pietro under Clement VIII.” *Storia dell’arte* 21, pp. 119–70.

- Cummings, F. "The Meaning of Caravaggio's *Conversion of the Magdalen* (the Alzaga Caravaggio)." *Burlington Magazine* 116 (Oct.), pp. 563–93.
- Davies, M. Italian School. *European Paintings in the Collection of the Worcester Art Museum*. Worcester, Mass.
- Fiorio, M. T. "Note su alcuni disegni inediti di Simone Peterzano." *Arte lombarda* 19, pp. 87–100.
- Friedlaender, W. *Caravaggio Studies*. Reprint of 1955 ed.
- Greaves, J. L., and M. Johnson. "New Findings on Caravaggio's Technique in the Detroit 'Magdalene'." *Burlington Magazine* CXVI (Oct.), pp. 564–71.
- Gregori, M. "A New Painting and Some Observations on Caravaggio's Journey to Malta." *Burlington Magazine* 116 (Oct.), pp. 594–603.
- Harris, E. "Caravaggio e il naturalismo spagnolo." *Arte illustrata* 58, pp. 235–39.
- Lavin, I. "Addenda to 'Divine Inspiration'." *Art Bulletin* 56, pp. 590–91.
- Lavin, I.² "Divine Inspiration in Caravaggio's Two St. Matthews." *Art Bulletin* 56, pp. 59–81.
- Marini, M. *Michelangelo da Caravaggio*. Rome.
- Miller, D. "Renaissance and Baroque Paintings from the Sciarra and Fiano Collections (R. E. Spear)." *Burlington Magazine* 116 (Oct.), pp. 626–28.
- Nicolson, B. "Caravaggio and the Caravaggesques: Some Recent Research." *Burlington Magazine* 116 (Oct.), pp. 603–15.
- Nicolson, B.² "The Literature of Art: Recent Caravaggio Studies." *Burlington Magazine* 116 (Oct.), pp. 624–25.
- Nicolson, B.³ "Provisional List of Caravaggesque Pictures in Public and Private Collections in Great Britain and Northern Ireland." *Burlington Magazine* 116 (Oct.), p. 560.
- Ranucci, P. "La Cultura." In *Storia d'Italia*, vol. 2. Turin.
- Röttgen, H. *Il Caravaggio. Ricerche e interpretazioni*. Rome.
- Salas, X. de. "Caravaggio y los caravaggestas en la pintura española." In *Caravaggio e i caravaggeschi*, pp. 29–43.
- Salerno, L. "The Art-Historical Implications of the Detroit Magdalen." *Burlington Magazine* CXVI (Oct.), pp. 586–93.

- Scavizzi, G. "La teologia cattolica e le immagine durante il XVI secolo." *Storia dell'arte* 21, pp. 171–213.
- Spezzaferro, L. "Colloquio sul tema." In *Caravaggio e i caravaggeschi*, pp. 125–37.
- Spezzaferro, L.² "Detroit's 'Conversion of the Magdalen' (The Alzaga Caravaggio) 4. The Documentary Findings: Ottavio Costa as a Patron of Caravaggio." *Burlington Magazine* 116 (Oct.), pp. 579–85.
- Vlieghe, H. S. *Corpus Rubenium Ludwig Burchardt*. Part 8, vol. 2. London.
- Waterhouse, E. *Giorgione: W. A. Cargill Memorial Lectures in Fine Art*. Glasgow.
- 1974–75
- Wallach, N. C. "An Iconographic Interpretation of a Ceiling Painting Attributed to Caravaggio." *Marsyas* 17, pp. 101–12.
- 1975
- Aronberg Lavin, M. *Seventeenth-Century Barberini Documents and Inventories of Art*. New York.
- Delumeau, R. *Rome au XVIe siècle*. Paris.
- Gregori, M. "Significato delle mostre caravaggesche del 1951 a oggi." In *Novità sul Caravaggio. Saggi e contributi*, ed. M. Cinotti, pp. 27–60. Bergamo.
- Lavin, M. A. *Seventeenth-Century Barberini Documents and Inventories of Art*. New York.
- Posner, D., M. Johnson, and F. J. Cummings. "Exchange of Letters." *Burlington Magazine* 117, pp. 302–3.
- Potterton, H. "The Supper at Emmaus." *Painting in Focus* 3. [London.]
- Prohaska, W. "Carlo Sellitto." *Burlington Magazine* CXVIII (Jan.), p. 10.
- Rizzatti, M. *Caravaggio: i geni del arte*. Milan.
- Settis, S. "Immagini della meditazione dell'incertezza e del pentimento nell'arte antica." *Prospettiva* 2, pp. 4–18.
- Spezzaferro, L. "Ottavio Costa e Caravaggio. Certezze e problemi." In *Novità sul Caravaggio. Saggi e contributi*, ed. M. Cinotti, pp. 103–18. Milan.
- Spezzaferro, L.² "Una testimonianza per gli inizi del caravaggismo." *Storia dell'arte* 23, pp. 53–60.

Testori, G. "Tre nuovi Caravaggio che faranno discutere." *Corriere della Sera*, 8 October.
Vsevolozhskaya, S. *Caravaggio and His Followers*. Leningrad.
Warner, M. *Alone of All Her Sex: The Myth and the Cult of the Virgin Mary*. New York.
Wind, B. "Genre as Season: Dosso, Campi, Caravaggio." *Arte lombarda* 42-43, pp. 70-73.

1976

Baldacchini, L. "Per una bibliografia delle stampe popolari religiose." *Accademie e biblioteche d'Italia* 44, pp. 24-35.
Bentivoglio, E., and S. Valtieri. *Santa Maria del Popolo*. Rome.
Gregori, M. "Addendum to Caravaggio: The Ceconi 'Crowning with Thorns' Reconsidered." *Burlington Magazine* 118 (Oct.), pp. 16-33.
Marini, M. "*Michael Angelus Caravaggio Romanus*": rassegna degli studi e proposte di Maurizio Marini. Rome.
Moir, A. *Caravaggio and His Copyists*. New York.
Parronchi, A. "La camera ombrosa del Caravaggio." *Storia dell'arte* 18 (Apr.), pp. 33-47.
Schneider, T. M. "Addendum to Caravaggio: The Ceconi 'Crowning with Thorns' Reconsidered." *Burlington Magazine* 118 (Oct.), pp. 679-80.
Slatkes, L. "Caravaggio's *Boy Bitten by a Lizard*." *Print Review* 5, pp. 148-53.
Zeri, F. "Sull'esecuzione di nature morte nella bottega del Cavalier d'Arpino, e sulla presenza ivi del giovane." *Diari di lavoro*, pp. 92-103. Turin.

1977

Banti, A. *Giovanni da San Giovanni*. Florence.
Cuzin, J. P. *La disease de Bonne Aventure de Caravage*. Paris.
Jaffé, M. *Rubens and Italy*. Oxford.
Lee, R. W. *Names on Trees: Ariosto into Art*. Princeton, N.J.
Marin, L. *Detruire la peinture*. Paris.
Mellini, G. F. "Momenti del barocco: Lanfranco e Caravaggio." *Comunità*, February, pp. 390-421.
Meloni Trkulja, S. "Per l'Amore dormiente de Caravaggio." *Paragone* 331, pp. 46-50.

- Negri Arnoldi, F. "Alonzo Rodriguez: un caravaggesco contesto." *Prospettiva* 9, pp. 17–37.
- Nicolson, B. "Review of Caravaggio and His Copyists by A. Moir." *Burlington Magazine* 119 (Dec.), p. 862.
- Pacelli, V. "New Documents concerning Caravaggio in Naples." *Burlington Magazine* CXIX (Dec.), pp. 819–29.
- Pavone, M. A. *Carlo Sellitto, primo caravaggesco napoletano*. Turin.
- Rosci, M. "Italia." In *Natura in posa, la grande stagione della natura morta*, pp. 83–112. Milan.
- Scribner, C., III. "In alia effigie: Caravaggio's London *Supper at Emmaus*." *Art Bulletin* 59, pp. 375–82.
- Tzeutschler Lurie, A., and D. Mahon. "Caravaggio's *Crucifixion of Saint Andrew* from Valladolid." *Bulletin of The Cleveland Museum of Art*, January, pp. 16–17.
- Vlam, G. A. H. "The Calling of Saint Matthew in Sixteenth-Century Flemish Painting." *Art Bulletin* 59, pp. 561–70.
- 1978
- Azzopardi J., Canon. *The Church of St. John in Valletta, 1578–1978: An Exhibition Commemorating the Fourth Centenary of Its Consecration*. Valletta.
- Bardon, F. *Caravage*. Paris.
- Barocchi, P. *Scritti d'arte del cinquecento*. Turin.
- Cannata, F. *Il cavaliere calabrese Mattia Preti*. Catanzaro.
- Caruso, R. "Qualità di superficie nelle due versioni della *Buona Ventura* di Caravaggio." *Techniche della pittura: procedimenti, materiali, strumenti*, pp. 27–30.
- Causa, R. "La nature morte italiane au XVIIe siècle en Italie." In *La nature morte de Breughel à Soutine*, pp. 39–48. Exh. cat., Galerie des Beaux-Arts, Bordeaux.
- Cicinelli, A., and S. Rocca. *Repertorio delle fotografie del Gabinetto Nazionale Fotografico. Dipinti dei musei e gallerie di Roma, parte prima*. Rome.
- Di Dario Guida, M. P. *Arte in Calabria ritrovamenti-restauri-recuperi (1971–1975)*. Naples.
- Pacelli, V. "Caracciolo Studies." *Burlington Magazine* 120 (Aug.), p. 493.
- Pacelli, V.² "Nuovi documenti sull'attività di Caravaggio a Napoli." *Napoli nobilissima* 18, pp. 57–67.

- Schleier, E. *Catalogue of Paintings, 13th–18th Century, Staatliche Museen Preussischer Kulturbesitz*. Berlin-Dahlem.
- Spike, J. T. “The Church of St. John in Valletta 1578–1978 and the Earliest Record of Caravaggio in Malta: an Exhibition and Its Catalogue.” *Burlington Magazine* CXIX (Sept.), pp. 626–28.
- Spinosa, N. *L'opera completa del Ribera*. Milan.
- Whitfield, C. “Review of Novità sul Caravaggio.” *Apollo*, November, pp. 359–60.
- Wright, G. “Caravaggio’s Entombment considered in situ.” *Art Bulletin* LVIII (Mar.), pp. 35–42.
- 1978–79
- Marini, M. “Caravaggio e Genova.” *Bollettino dei musei civici genovesi*, pp. 30–40.
- Marini, M.² “Michael Angelus Caravaggio Romanus.” *Studi barocchi* 1. Rome.
- 1979
- Brejon de Lavergnée, A. “New Paintings by Bartolomeo Manfredi.” *Burlington Magazine* 121 (May), pp. 305–10.
- Brejon de Lavergnée, A., and B. Dorival. *La peinture italienne du dix-septième siècle*. Geneva.
- Fahy, E. *The Legacy of Leonardo: Italian Renaissance Paintings from Leningrad*. Exh. cat., National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.
- Fiorani, L. “Religione e povertà. Il dibattito sul pauperismo a Roma tra cinque e seicento.” *Ricerche per la storia religiosa di Roma* 3, pp. 43–131.
- Fratadocchi, M. *Sant’Agostino in Roma. Arte, storia, documenti*. Rome.
- Gli Uffizi: catalogo generale*. 2d ed. Florence 1980.
- Grudin, R. *Mighty Opposites: Shakespeare and Renaissance Contrariety*. Berkeley.
- Magnino Schlosser, J. *La letteratura artistica*. Trans. F. Rossi. Florence.
- Marabottini, A., ed. *Le arti di Bologna di Annibale Carracci*. Rome.
- McGregor Eadie, E. *Blue Guide Malta*. New York.
- Montalto, J. *The Nobles of Malta, 1530–1800*. Malta.
- Nicolson, B. *The International Caravagguesque Movement. List of Pictures by Caravaggio and His Followers throughout Europe from 1590 to 1650*. London.

- Schlosser Magnino, J. *La letteratura artistica*. Trans. F. Rossi. Florence.
- Shapley, F. R. *Catalogue of the Italian Paintings, National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.* Washington, D.C.
- Spear, R. "Review of *The International Caravaggesque Movement* by Benedict Nicolson." *Burlington Magazine* 121 (May), pp. 317–22.
- 1980
- Baldacchini, L. *Bibliografia della stampe popolari religiose del XVI–XVII secolo: Biblioteche Vaticana, Alessandrina, Estense*. Florence.
- Bologna, F. "L'identificazione del dipinto (e i rapporti artistici fra Genova e Napoli nei primi decenni del seicento)." *Prospettiva* 23 (Oct.), pp. 30–45.
- Cordaro, M. "Indagine radiografica sulla 'Buona Ventura' dei Musei Capitolini." *Ricerche di storia dell'arte* 10, pp. 100–106.
- di Stefano, R., and S. di Stefano. "Il potere e lo spazio nella Napoli cinquecentesca." In *Napoli nel cinquecento e la Toscana dei Medici*, pp. 77–124. Naples.
- Firenze e la Toscana dei Medici nell'Europa del cinquecento. La corte, il mare, i mercanti: la rinascità della scienza editoria e società astrologia, magia, e alchimia*. Exh. cat., Orsanmichele, Florence.
- Fulco, G. "Ammirate l'altissimo pittore: Caravaggio nelle rime inedite di Maurizio Milesi." *Ricerche di storia dell'arte* X, pp. 65–89.
- Fumaroli, M. *L'âge de l'éloquence*. Geneva.
- Gash, J. *Caravaggio*. London. (2d ed. 2003).
- Gregori, M., ed. *La Fondazione Roberto Longhi a Firenze*. Milan.
- Haskell, F. *Patrons and Painters: Art and Society in Baroque Italy*. Reprint of 1971 ed. New Haven and London.
- Held, J. *The Oil Sketches of Peter Paul Rubens: A Critical Catalogue*, vol. 1. Princeton.
- Lavin, I. "A Further Note on the Ancestry of Caravaggio's First 'Saint Matthew'." *Art Bulletin* 62, pp. 113–14.
- Pacelli, V. "Caravaggio 1610: la 'Sant'Orsola confitta dal tiranno' per Marcantonio Doria." *Prospettiva* 23 (Oct.), pp. 24–30.

- Pacelli, V.² “Le evidenze documentarie (e i rapporti artistici fra Napoli e Genoa agli inizi del seicento).” *Prospettiva* 23 (Oct.), pp. 44–45.
- Prohaska, W. “Untersuchungen zur Rosenkranz Madonna Caravaggios.” *Jahrbuch der Kunsthistorisches Sammlungen in Wien* 76, pp. 111–32.
- Ridolfini, C. P. *Guide Rionali di Roma—Rione V—Parione II*. Rome.
- Spezzaferro, L. “Caravaggio rifiutato? Il problema della prima versione del San Matteo.” *Ricerche di storia dell’arte* 10, pp. 49–64.
- Spezzaferro, L.² “Il testamento di Marzio Milesi: tracce per un perduto Caravaggio.” *Ricerche di storia dell’arte* 10, pp. 90–99.
- Spike, J. T. *Italian Baroque Paintings from New York Private Collections*. Exh. cat., The Princeton University Art Museum, Princeton, N.J.
- Spike, J. T.² “The Snake as Heresy.” *Burlington Magazine* 122, p. 439.
- Stoughton, M. “G.B. Caracciolo and his son Pompeo: Documents from the Archivio Storico del Banco di Napoli.” In *Antologia delle Belle Arti*, IV, pp. 187–195.
- Strinati, C. “Roma nell’anno 1600. Studio di pittura.” *Ricerche di storia dell’arte* 10, pp. 40–46.
- Toscano, B., et al. *Ricerche in Umbria*, vol. 2. Treviso.

1981

- Angulló y Cobo, M. *Mas noticias sobre pintores Madrileños de los siglos XVI al XVII*. Madrid.
- Art, the Ape of Nature: Studies in Honor of H. W. Janson*. Ed. N. Barash, L. Freeman Sandler, and P. Egan. New York.
- Banti, A., ed. *Vincenzo Giustiniani: discorso sulle arti e sui mestieri*. Florence.
- Bissell, R. *Orazio Gentileschi and the Poetic Tradition in Caravaggesque Painting*. University Park and London.
- Costello, J. “Caravaggio, Lizards, and Fruit.” In *Art, the Ape of Nature*, pp. 375–85.
- Fantarelli, M. *L’istituzione dell’Ospedale di S. Alessio dei poveri mendicanti in Cremona (1569–1600)*. Cremona.
- Garas, K. “Ergänzungen zur Caravaggio-Forschung.” *Ars auro prior*, pp. 397–401. Warsaw.
- Kugler, S. J. *Le collezioni del Kunsthistorisches Museum Vienna*. Milan.

- Marini, M. "Caravaggio e il naturalismo internazionale." In *Storia dell'arte italiana*, vol. 2, pp. 347-431.
- Marini, M.² "Un'estrema residenza e un ignoto aiuto del Caravaggio in Roma." *Antologia di belle arte* 17-20, pp. 180-83.
- Posner, D. "Lizards and Lizard Lore, with Special Reference to Caravaggio's Leapin' Lizard." In *Art, the Ape of Nature: Studies in Honor of H. W. Janson*, ed. N. Barasch, L. Freeman Sandler, P. Egan, pp. 387-91. New York.
- Sterling, C. *Still Life Painting*. 2d ed. New York.
- Vsevolzhskaya, S. *13th- to 18th-Century Italian Painting from the Hermitage Museum*. New York.
- Wright, C. *Italian, French, and Spanish Paintings of the Seventeenth Century*. London.
- Zuccari, A. "La politica culturale dell'oratorio romano nella seconda metà del Cinquecento." *Storia dell'arte* no. 41 (Jan.), pp. 77-112.
- 1982
- Blunt, A. *Guide to Baroque Rome*. London.
- DeMarco, N. "Caravaggio's *Calling of St. Matthew*." *Iris, Notes on the History of Art*, February, pp. 5-7.
- DeVito, G. "Tracce di pittura napoletana del '600 a Ragusa." In *Ricerche sul '600 napoletano*, pp. 41-47. Milan.
- Gregori, M. *Painting in Naples from Caravaggio to Giordano*. Exh. cat., Royal Academy, London.
- Longhi, R. *Caravaggio*. Ed. G. Previtali. Rome.
- Lurie, A. *The Cleveland Museum of Art: Catalogue of Paintings: European Paintings of the 16th, 17th, and 18th Centuries*. Cleveland.
- Magnuson, T. *Rome in the Age of Bernini*. 2 vols. Stockholm and New Jersey.
- Marini, M. "I grandi maestri. Caravaggio. Tutto spada e pennello." *Arte bolaffi*, October, pp. 72-83.
- Moir, A. *Caravaggio*. New York.
- Rosenberg, P. *France in the Golden Age: Seventeenth-Century Paintings in American Collections*. Exh. cat., Galeries Nationales du Grand Palais, Paris; Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York; Art Institute of Chicago.

- Sebregondi Fiorentini, L. "Francesco dell'Antella, Caravaggio, Paladini e altri." *Paragone* 383-85, pp. 107-22.
- Spear, R. *Domenichino*. 2 vols. New Haven and London.
- Strinati, C., ed. *L'immagine di San Francesco nella Controriforma*. Exh. cat. Rome.
- Ticozzi, P. *Immagini dal Tintoretto: stampe dal XVI al XIX secolo*. Exh. cat., Villa della Farnesina alla Lungara, Rome.
- Whitfield, C., and J. Martineau. *Painting in Naples from Caravaggio to Giordano*. Exh. cat., Royal Academy, London.
- Wind, B. "More than Bagatelles: Observations on Caravaggio's 'Lute Player' and 'Calling of Saint Matthew'." *Source* 2, pp. 30-32.
- 1983
- Branchesi, P. "Fra Paolo Sarpi: note biografiche." *Fra Paolo Sarpi e i servi di Maria a Venezia nel 750 anniversario dell'Ordine*, pp. 27-34. Venice.
- Cinotti, M. *Caravaggio: tutte le opere*. Bergamo. With critical essay, G.A. dell'Arturo.
- Del Bravo, C. "Sul significato della luce nel Caravaggio e in Gianlorenzo Bernini." *Artibus et historiae* 1, pp. 69-72. Vienna.
- De Maio, R. *Pittura e Controriforma a Napoli*. Naples.
- Freedberg, S. J. *Circa 1600: A Revolution of Style in Italian Painting*. Cambridge, Mass.
- Gilbert, C. "Caravaggio Revealed." *Art News*, p. 35.
- Harris, A. S. "Exhibition Review: New York, Italian Still Life." *Burlington Magazine* 125, p. 514.
- Hibbard, H. *Caravaggio*. New York.
- Hibbard, H.² "Caravaggio's Two St. Matthews." *Römisches Jahrbuch für Kunstgeschichte* 20, pp. 183-91.
- Manicelli, F. *The Vatican Collection/The Papacy and Art*. Exh. cat., The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York.
- Marini, M. "Equivoci del caravaggismo 2: (A) Appunti sulla tecnica del naturalismo secentesco, tra Caravaggio e 'Manfrediana Methodus'; (B) Caravaggio e i suoi doppi; il problema delle possibili collaborazioni." *Artibus et historiae* 1, pp. 119-54. Vienna.

Pizzorusso, C. "Un 'tranquillo dio': Giovanni da San Giovanni e Caravaggio." *Paragone* 405, pp. 50–59.

Sandberg-Valalà, E. *L'Iconografia della Madonna col Bambino nella pittura italiana del dugento*. Rome.

Spike, J. T., ed. *Italian Still Life Paintings from Three Centuries*. Exh. cat., National Academy of Design, New York.

Steinberg, L. *The Sexuality of Christ in Renaissance Art and Modern Oblivion*. Chicago.

Trinchieri Camiz, F., and A. Ziino. "Caravaggio: Aspetti musicali e committenza." *Studi musicali* 12, no. 1, pp. 68–72.

Zuccari, A. "La cappella della Pietà alla Chiesa Nuova e il committente del Caravaggio." *Storia dell'arte* 47, pp. 53–56.

1984

Bonsanti, G. *Caravaggio*. Florence.

Brown, J. "A New Identification of the Donor in Caravaggio's 'Madonna of the Rosary'." *Paragone* 407, pp. 15–21.

Campagna Cicala, F. "Intorno all'attività di Caravaggio in Sicilia. Due momenti del caravaggismo siciliano: Mario Minnitti e Alonzo Rodriguez." In *Caravaggio in Sicilia*, pp. 106–9.

Caravaggio in Sicilia: il suo tempo, il suo influsso. Exh. cat., Museo regionale di Palazzo Bellomo, Syracuse.

Cozzi, G. "Politica, cultura e religione." In *Cultura e società nel Rinascimento tra Riforme e Manierismo*, ed. V. Branca and C. Ossola. Florence.

Fiorani, L. "L'esperienza religiosa nelle confraternite romane tra cinque e seicento." *Ricerche per la storia religiosa di Roma* 5, pp. 155–96.

Garin, E. *Astrology in the Renaissance: The Zodiac of Life*. London.

Grossman, S. *The 'Deposition' from the Vatican Collections*. National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.

Levy, E. "Ideal and Reality of the Learned Artist: The Schooling of Italian and Netherlandish Artists." In *Children of Mercury. The Education of Artists in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries*, pp. 20–40. Exh. cat., Brown University. Providence, R.I.

- Pacelli, V. *Caravaggio: le sette opere di misericordia*. Salerno.
- Pepper, S. *Guido Reni*. New York.
- Salerno, L. "Caravaggio: A Reassessment." *Apollo* 110, pp. 438–41.
- Salerno, L.² *La natura morta italiana, 1560–1805/Still-Life Painting in Italy, 1560–1805*. Rome.
- Spear, R. "Stocktaking in Caravaggio Studies." *Burlington Magazine* 126, pp. 162–65.
- Stoughton, M. "Battistello Cavacciolo." In *Civiltà del Seicento a Napoli*, pp. 200–201.
- Varriano, J. "Daniel Seiter: St. Sebastian Tended by St. Irene." In *The Mount Holyoke College Art Museum: Handbook of the Collection*. South Hadley, Mass.
- Zuccari, A. *Arte e committenza nella Roma di Caravaggio*. Turin.
- 1985
- Algeri, G. "Le incisioni della Galleria Giustiniana." *Xenia* 9, pp. 71–99.
- Barberi, F. *Il libro italiano del seicento*. Rome.
- Baronio e l'arte*. Ed. R. de Maio. *Atti del convegno internazionale di studi, Sora, 10–13 October 1984*.
- Biordi, M., S. Nicolini, and M. Turci. *Guida per Santarcangelo*. Rimini.
- Bravo, C. del. *Le risposte dell'arte*. Florence.
- Calvesi, M. "La realtà del Caravaggio (i dipinti)." *Storia dell'arte* 55, pp. 51–85, 227–87.
- Cutajar, D., and C. Cassar. "Malta and the 16th-Century Struggle Forward for the Mediterranean." In *Mid-Med Bank Limited Report and Accounts 1985*. Malta.
- Delfino, A. "Documenti inediti per alcuni pittori napoletani del '600 e l'inventario dei beni lasciati da Lanfranco Massa" In *Ricerche sull'600 napoletano*, pp. 89–112. Milan.
- Gregori, M. *The Age of Caravaggio*. Exh. cat., The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York.
- Jayne, S., ed. *Marsilio Ficino: Commentary on Plato's Symposium on Love*. Dallas.
- Kirwin, W. C. "Cardinal Baronius and the Misteri in St. Peter's." In *Baronio e l'arte 1985*, pp. 3–20.
- Lavin, I. "Caravaggio's Roman Madonnas." Paper delivered at the symposium *The Age of Caravaggio*. New York.
- Macioce, S. "Attorno a Caravaggio. Notizie d'archivio." *Storia dell'arte* 55, pp. 289–92.

- Murphy, A. *European Paintings in the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston*. Boston.
- Pacelli, V., and A. Brejon de Lavergnée. “L’eclisse del committente? Congetture su un ritratto nella ‘Flagellazione’ di Caravaggio, rivelato dalla radiografia.” *Paragone* 36, 419, 421, 423, pp. 208–18.
- Parks, N. “On Caravaggio’s ‘Dormition of the Virgin’ and Its Setting.” *Burlington Magazine* CXXVII (July), pp. 438–48.
- Prater, A. “Wo ist Matthäus Beobachtungen zu Caravaggios Anfängen als Monumentalmaler in der Contarelli-Kapelle.” *Pantheon* 43, pp. 70–74.
- Previtali, G. “Caravaggio e il suo tempo.” *Prospettiva* 41, pp. 77–78.
- Sgarbi, V. “Caravaggio.” *FMR* 33, 9. Reprint. *Il sogno della pittura. Come leggere un’opera d’arte*, 1990, pp. 63–78. Venice.
- Shea, W. R. “Panofsky Revisited: Galileo as a Critic of the Arts.” In *Renaissance Studies in Honor of Craig Hugh Smyth*, pp. 4–37. Florence.
- Slim, H. Colin. “Musical Inscriptions in Paintings by Caravaggio and His Followers.” In *Music and Context: Essays for John Milton Ward*, pp. 241–63. Cambridge, Mass.
- Spadaro, A. “Caravaggio a Siracusa e l’orecchio di Dioniso.” *Geo-Archeologia* 1–2, pp. 81–100.
- Spike, J. T. “The Age of Caravaggio.” *Apollo* 121, pp. 415–17.
- Thomas, T. “Expressive Aspects of Caravaggio’s First *Inspiration of Saint Matthew*.” *Art Bulletin* 67, pp. 636–52.
- van Tuyl, C. “Exhibitions Reviews, New York and Naples: Caravaggio.” *Burlington Magazine* 127, p. 487.
- Wolfe, K. “Caravaggio: Another *Lute Player*.” *Burlington Magazine* 127, pp. 451–52.
- 1986
- Bober, P., and N. Rubenstein. *Classical Sculptures Known in the Renaissance*. London.
- Borghero, G. *Collezione Thyssen Bornemisza. Catalogo ragionato delle opere esposte*. Milan.
- Calvini, N. “Il feudo di Conscente.” *La storia dei Genovesi. Atti del convegno di studi sui ceti dirigenti nelle istituzioni della Repubblica di Genova, 25–27 aprile 1985, Genova*, pp. 343–86. Genoa.
- Calvesi, M. “La Maddelena.” *Art et dossier* 2, p. 1.

- Calvesi, M.² “La Maddalena come ‘sposa’ nei dipinti del Caravaggio.” In *La Maddalena tra sacra e profana*, pp. 147–50. Exh. cat., Palazzo Pitti, Florence.
- Carletti, D., ed. *Iscrizioni cristiane di Roma*. Rome.
- Christiansen, K. “Caravaggio and ‘L’esempio davanti del naturale’.” *Art Bulletin* 68, pp. 421–45.
- Gavin, W. “Caravaggio’s ‘Madonna of Loreto’ Reconsidered.” *Source* 6, pp. 20–23.
- Ginzberg, C. *Miti, emblemi, spie, morfologia, e storia*. Turin.
- Gregori, M. “Linee della natura morta fiorentina.” In *Il seicento fiorentino*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Strozzi, Florence.
- Kelley, J. D. *Oxford Dictionary of Popes*. Oxford.
- Lindberg, D. C., and R. L. Numbers, eds. *God and Nature. Historical Essays on the Encounter between Christianity and Science*. Berkeley.
- Mochi Onori, L. “Note sulle vicenda della Giudita Coppi.” *Quaderni di Palazzo Venezia* 6, p. 33.
- Mormone, R. “Per un rilettura delle Sette Opere di Misericordia.” *Napoli nobilissima* 25, pp. 91–100.
- Mosco, M., ed. *La Maddalena tra sacro e profano. Da Giotto a De Chirico*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Pitti, Florence.
- Ottana Cavini, A. *Carlo Saraceni*. Milan.
- Papi, G. “Una precisazione biografica e alcune integrazioni al catalogo dello Spadarino.” *Paragone* 435, pp. 20–39.
- Randon, P. F., ed. *Malta and Caravaggio*. With contributions by D. Cutajar, Fr. J. Azzopardi, C. Brandi, E. Sammut, and V. Pacelli. In *Mid-Med Bank Limited Reports and Accounts 1986*. Malta.
- Spike, J. T. “A Proposal for Caravaggio, Portraitist.” *Apollo* 122, p. 43.
- Varriano, J. “Caravaggio and the Decorative Arts in the Two Suppers at Emmaus.” *Art Bulletin* 68, pp. 218–24.

1987

- Barbiellini Amidei, R. "Io, Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio." *Art et dossier* 18, pp. 14–15.
- Boccardo, P., and L. Magnani. "La Committenza [Balbi]." In *Il Palazzo dell'Università di Genova nella strada dei Balbi*. Genoa.
- Bologna, F. "Alla ricerca del vero San Francesco in estasi di Michel Agnolo de Caravaggio per il cardinale Francesco Maria Del Monte." *Artibus et historiae* 8, pp. 159–77.
- Brejon de Lavergnée, A. *L'inventaire Le Brun de 1683: la collection des tableaux de Louis XIV*. Paris.
- Calvesi, M., ed. *L'ultimo Caravaggio e la cultura artistica a Napoli, in Sicilia, e a Malta*. Syracuse.
- Chorpenning, J. F. "Another Look at Caravaggio and Religion." *Artibus et historiae* VIII 16, pp. 149–58.
- Geist, S. "Related Motifs in Michelangelo, Donatello and Caravaggio." *Source* 6, pp. 8–11.
- Guazzoni, V. "Aspetti del tema sacro nella pittura dei campi." *Paragone* 38, 453, pp. 22–42.
- Jordan, S. J. "The Iconography of the Rest on the Flight." *Storia dell'arte* 61, pp. 225–27.
- Loire, S., and A. Brejon de Lavergnée. *Caravage: La Mort de la Vierge, une Madone sans dignité*. Paris.
- Marini, M. *Caravaggio: Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio 'pictor praestantissimus'*. Rome.
- Montevarchi, B. *Sant'Agostino*. Rome.
- Pasini, P. G. *Arte da salvare nel riminese*. Rimini.
- Posèq, A. W. G. "A Note on Caravaggio's *Sleeping Amor*." *Source* 6, pp. 170–74.
- Prodi, P. *The Papal Prince: Papal Monarchy in Early Modern Europe*. Cambridge.
- Restaino, C. "Giovan Vincenzo Forlì, 'pittore di prima classe nei suoi tempi'." *Prospettiva* 48 (Jan.), pp. 33–51.
- Strinati, C. "L'Ecce Homo da Caravaggio a Guercino." *Art et dossier* 18, pp. 16–18.
- Weaver, J. H. *Physics*. Vol. 1. New York.
- Weissman, R. "Taking Patronage Seriously." In *Patronage, Art, and Society in Renaissance Italy*, ed. F. W. Kent, P. Simons, and J. C. Eade. Oxford 1987.

1988

Babelon, J. P. "Les Caravage de Philippe de Béthune." *Gazette des Beaux-Arts* 111, pp. 33–38.

Boyer, J. C., and I. Volf. "Rome à Paris: les tableaux du maréchal de Créquy (1638)." *Revue de l'art* 79, pp. 22–41.

Brejon de Lavergnée, A., and N. Volle. *Musées de France: répertoire des peintures italiennes du XVII siècle*. Paris.

Buhagiar, M. *The Iconography of the Maltese Islands, 1400–1900*. Malta.

Calvesi, M. "Alla luce di Caravaggio." *Art et dossier* 25, pp. 34–35.

Calvesi, M.² "Il 'Fanciullo morso dal ramarro' di Michelangelo di Caravaggio." *Arte* 2, pp. 114–15.

Calvesi, M.³ "Le realtà del Caravaggio." *Storia dell'arte* 62, 170–92; 63, pp. 117–32.

Cantimori, D. "Reason, Unreason and Faith. Challenges to Traditional Christianity." In *Renaissance Essays*, ed. D. Hay. New York.

Christiansen, K. "Appendix/Technical Report on *The Cardsharps*." *Burlington Magazine* 130, pp. 26–27.

Dempsey, C. "Guido Reni in the Eyes of His Contemporaries." In *Guido Reni*, pp. 101–18.

Donati, C. *L'idea di nobiltà in Italia nei secoli XIV–XVIII*. Rome.

Giusti, A. *Empoli: Museo della collegiata, Chiese di Sant'Andrea e S. Stefano*. Bologna.

Glen, T. L. "Rubens after Caravaggio: The Entombment." *Revue de l'art canadien* 15, pp. 19–22.

Grendler, P. "The Conditions of Inquiry: Printing and Censorship." In *The Cambridge History of Renaissance Philosophy*, ed. C. Schmitt and Q. Skinner, Cambridge, pp. 25–54.

Guido Reni. Exh. cat., Los Angeles County Museum of Art.

Hass, A. "Caravaggio's *Calling of St. Matthew* Reconsidered." *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 51, pp. 245–50.

Joannides, P. "Caravaggio and Caravaggios." *Ideas and Production* 8, pp. 67–78.

Kretschmer, H. "Zu Caravaggios Berufung des Matthäus in der Cappella Contarelli." *Pantheon* 45, pp. 63–66.

Lattuada, R. *Il Barocco a Napoli e in Campania*. Naples.

- Lewis, M. S. *Antonio Gardano, Venetian Music Printer 1538–1569. Vol. 1, 1538–1549.* New York.
- Mahon, D. “Fresh Light on Caravaggio’s Earliest Period: His *Cardsharps* Recovered.” *Burlington Magazine* 130, pp. 10–25.
- Mallia-Milanes, V. *Descrizione di Malta Anno 1716. A Venetian Account.* Malta.
- Nappi, E. “Le chiese di Giovan Giacomo Conforto.” In *Ricerche sul ‘600 napoletano*, pp. 129–52.
- Natale, V. “Un quadro di Tibaldi-Peterzano.” *Paragone* 457, pp. 15–24.
- Pinelli, A. “Vivere ‘alla filosofica’ o vestire di velluto? Storia di Jacone fiorentino e della sua ‘masnada’ antivasariana.” *Ricerche di storia dell’arte* 34, pp. 5–32.
- Posèq, A. W. G. “Caravaggio’s ‘Pastor Friso’.” *Source* 8, pp. 13–17.
- Rotondo, A., ed. *Tutto Caravaggio a Roma.* Rome.
- Ruvulo, F. “Una fonte messinese del seicento per la ‘Resurrezione di Lazzaro’ del Caravaggio.” *Napoli nobilissimo* 27, pp. 134–40.
- Salerno, L. *I dipinti del Guercino.* Rome.
- Schmitt, C. B., and Q. Skinner. *The Cambridge History of Renaissance Philosophy.* Cambridge.
- Spike, J. T. “Report on the *St. John the Baptist* in Munich.” Ms. dated 7 November 1988, transcribed in Pacelli 1994, pp. 229–30.
- Treffers, B. “Il Francesco Hartford del Caravaggio e la spiritualità francescana alla fine del XVI sec.” *Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorisches Instituts in Florenz* 32, pp. 145–72.
- Trinchieri Camiz, F. “The Castrato Singer: From Informal to Formal Portraiture.” *Artibus et historiae* 9, pp. 171–86.
- Varriano, J. “The First Roman Sojourn of Daniel Seiter, 1682–1688.” *Paragone* 12, pp. 31–47.
- Zafran, E. “A Newly Acquired Masterpiece by Guido Reni.” *Bulletin of the Walters Art Gallery*, January, pp. 1–3.
- 1989
- Academies of Art: *Between Renaissance and Romanticism.* Ed. H. Boschloo and S. van der Sman. SDU Uitgeverij ‘s-Gravenhage.
- Azzopardi, J. A., Canon. “Caravaggio’s Admission into the Order, Papal Dispensation for the Crime.” In *Caravaggio in Malta*, ed. P. Ferrugia Randon, pp. 45–56. Malta.

- Azzopardi, J. A., Canon.² “Documentary Sources on Caravaggio’s Stay in Malta.” In *Caravaggio in Malta*, ed. P. Ferrugia Randon, pp. 19–45. Malta.
- Bann, S. *The True Vine: On Visual Representation and Western Tradition*. Cambridge.
- Berra, G. “Contributo per la datazione della ‘natura morta di pesche’ di Ambrogio Figino.” *Paragone* 469, pp. 3–29.
- Biffi, G. *Memorie per servire alla storia degli artisti cremonesi, 1777–1783*. Ed. L. Bandera Gregori. Milan.
- Borsi, F., F. Quinterio, and G. Magnanimiti. *Palazzo Giustiniani*. Rome.
- Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni. Quaderni di Palazzo Venezia* 6. Rome.
- Chappell, M. “On Some Drawings by Cigoli.” *Master Drawings* 27.2, p. 202.
- Chiarini, M. “La probabile identità del Cavaliere di Malta di Pitti.” *Antichità viva* 28, pp. 15–16.
- Corti, G. “Un registro de Mandati dell’Ambasciatore (. . .) Piero Guiciardini.” *Paragone* 40, 477, pp. 108–46.
- Cottino, A. “La natura morta caravaggesca a Roma.” In *La natura morta in Italia*, ed. F. Zeri 1989, pp. 650–89, 695. Milan.
- Cutajar, D. “Caravaggio in Malta. His Works and his Influence” In *Caravaggio in Malta*, ed. P. Ferrugia Randon, pp. 1–18. Malta.
- Cutajar, D.² “Malta and Caravaggio.” In *Malta: History and Works of Art in St. John’s Church*. Valletta.
- Freedberg, D. *The Power of Images. Studies in the History and Theory of Response*. Chicago.
- Fumagalli, E. “Raffaello Vanni in Palazzo Patrizi a Roma.” *Paragone* 40, 477, pp. 129–48.
- Gregori, M. “Il Sacrificio di Isacco: un inedito e considerazioni su una fase savoldesca del Caravaggio.” *Artibus et historiae* 10, pp. 99–147.
- Hermann Fiore, K. “Il Bacchino malato autoritratto del Caravaggio ed altre figure bacchiche degli artisti.” In *Caravaggio. Nuove riflessioni*, pp. 95–132.
- Marini, M. *Caravaggio: Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio ‘pictor praestantissimus’*. 2d ed. Rome.
- Meijer, B. “Sull’origine e mutamenti dei generi.” In *La pittura in Italia: il seicento*, pp. 585–604. Milan.

- Milesi, S. *Caravaggio*. Bergamo.
- Mochi Onori, I., and R. Vodret. *La Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica. Regesto delle didascalie*. Rome.
- Moir, A. *Caravaggio*. New York.
- Norman, G. "A Flourishing New Crop of Caravaggios." *The Independent*, February, p. 44.
- Papi, G. "Caravaggio." In *La pittura in Italia: il seicento*, pp. 667–68. Milan.
- Perrone, S. "E restaurato il quadro attribuito al Caravaggio." *Corriere Valsesiano*, 23 June, p. 5.
- Posèq, A. W. G. "Caravaggio's Medusa Shield." *Gazette des Beaux-Arts* 131, pp. 170–74.
- Randon, P. Ferrugia, ed. *Caravaggio in Malta*. With contributions by D. Cutajar, Fr. J. Azzopardi, C. Brandi, E. Sammut, and V. Pacelli. In *Mid-Med Bank Limited Reports and Accounts 1986*, rev. ed. Malta.
- Salerno, L. *New Studies on Italian Still-Life Painting*. Rome.
- Sgarbi, V. "Itinerario caravaggesco." In *Davanti all'immagine artisti quadri libri polemiche*, ed. V. Sgarbi, pp. 107–16. Milan.
- Shlain, L. *The Alphabet versus the Goddess: The Conflict between Word and Image*. New York.
- Sloan, G. *The Transformation of Religious Conversion from the Renaissance to the Counter-Reformation. Petrarch and Caravaggio*. *Historical Reflections/Reflexions Historiques* 15, pp. 131–49.
- Tombari, G. B. "Note sulla Madonna di Loreto del Domenichino già in S. Francescoa Fano." *Nuovi studi fanesi*, pp. 105–13.
- Treffers, B. "Dogma, esegesi e pittura Caravaggio nella Cappella Contarelli in San Luigi dei Francesi." *Storia dell'arte* 67, pp. 241–55.
- Trinchieri Camiz, F. "La 'Musica' nei quadri del Caravaggio." *Quaderni di Palazzo Venezia* 6, pp. 198–203.
- Wind, B. "A Note on Card Symbolism in Caravaggio and His Followers." *Paragone* 60, pp. 15–18.
- Zeri, F., ed. *La natura morta in Italia*. Milan.

1989–90

Pacelli, V. “Strumenti in posa: novità sull’*Amore Vincitore* del Caravaggio” *Prospettiva* 57–60, pp. 156–62.

Tucker, J. “Conspicuous Consumption: Representations of Food in Roman Art.” *The Georgia Classicist* 23, pp. 1–5.

1990

Amelio, S., and A. Borg. “*San Gerolamo scrivente*” del Caravaggio. Rome.

Askew, P. *Caravaggio’s Death of the Virgin*. Princeton.

Barbiellini Amidei, R. “Figure e ritratti di Innocenzo X.” In *Innocenzo X Pamphilij. Arte e potere nell’età barocca, Atti del convegno*, ed. S. Macioce and A. Zuccari, pp. 163–76. Rome.

Barolsky, P. “The Biblical Poetry of Caravaggio’s Rest on the Flight into Egypt.” *Source X*, pp. 20–21.

Bryson, N. *Looking at the Overlooked. Four Essays on Still-Life Painting*. London.

Calvesi, M. *La realtà del Caravaggio*. Turin.

Caponetto, S. *The Protestant Reformation in Sixteenth-Century Italy*. London.

Cappelletti, F., and L. Testa. “E per me pagate a Michelangelo da Caravaggio. Nuove date per i dipinti Mattei.” *Art et dossier* 42, pp. 5–10.

Cappelletti, F., and L. Testa.² “I quadri di Caravaggio nella collezione Mattei: i nuovi documenti e i riscontri con le fonti.” *Storia dell’arte* 69, pp. 234–44.

Cappelletti, F., and L. Testa.³ “Ricerche documentarie sul S. Giovanni Battista dei Musei Capitolini e sul S. Giovaninni Battista della Galleria Doria Pamphilij.” In *Identificazione di un Caravaggio*, ed. G. Correale. pp. 75–101. Venice.

Christiansen, K. *A Caravaggio Rediscovered: The Lute Player*. New York.

Christiansen, K.² “Some Observations on the Relationship between Caravaggio’s Two Treatments of the ‘Lute-player’.” *Burlington Magazine* 132 (Jan.), pp. 21–26.

Correale, G., ed. *Identificazione di un Caravaggio: nuove tecnologie per un rilettura del San Giovanni Battista. Atti di convegno, 27 febbraio, Pinacoteca Capitolina, Roma*. Venice.

Didi-Huberman, G. *Fra Angelico: Dissemblance & Figuration*. Chicago.

Fiori, M. T., and P. C. Marani. *I leonardeschi a Milano: fortuna e collezionismo*. Milan.

- Gilbert, C. E. "Add One Caravaggio." *New Criterion*, May, p. 59.
- Grabski, J., ed. *Opus Sacrum: Catalogue of the Exhibition from the Collection of Barbara Piasecka Johnson*. Warsaw.
- Gregori, M. "Sulla traccia di un'altro Ecce Homo del Caravaggio." *Paragone* 41, 489, pp. 19–27.
- Heimbürger, M. "Interpretazioni delle pitture di genere del Caravaggio secondo il 'metodo neerlandese'." *Paragone* 489, pp. 3–18.
- Lavin, I. "On the Identity of the Protagonist in Caravaggio's *Calling of St. Matthew*." Paper given at College Art Association meeting, New York.
- Mahon, D. "The Singing 'Lute-Player' by Caravaggio from the Barberini Collection, Painted for Cardinal Del Monte." *Burlington Magazine* CXXXII (Jan.), pp. 5–20.
- Marini, M. "L'ospite inquieto. Le residenze romane di Caravaggio." *Art et dossier* 42, pp. 8–9.
- Museo del Prado. *Inventario general de pinturas*. Vol. 1, *La Colección Real*. Madrid.
- Nicolson, B. *Caravaggism in Europe*. 3 vols. Ed. L. Vertova. Turin.
- Papi, G. "Un nuovo Ecce Homo del Caravaggio." *Paragone* 41, 489, pp. 28–48.
- Pelikan, J. *Imago Dei: The Byzantine Apologia for Icons*. Princeton, N.J.
- Posèq, A. W. G. "Bacchic Themes in Caravaggio's Juvenile Works." *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, March, pp. 113–21.
- Posèq, A. W. G.² "Caravaggio and the Antique." *Artibus et histoire* 11, pp. 147–67.
- Posèq, A. W. G.³ "Caravaggio's Self-Portrait as the Beheaded Goliath." *Konsthistorisk tidskrift* 3, pp. 169–82.
- Rosa, M. "L'Onda che ritorna: interno ed estero sacro nella Napoli del '600." In *Luoghi sacri e spazi della santità*, ed. S. B. Gajano and L. Scaraffia, pp. 397–417. Turin.
- Settis, S. *Giorgione's Tempest: Interpreting the Hidden Subject*. Chicago.
- Il soffitto Del Monte nel Casino Ludovisi: i risultati del restauro e nuove ipotesi*. Atti di convegno, Palazzo Barberini. Rome.
- Trinchieri Camiz, F. "Death and Rebirth in Caravaggio's Martyrdom of St. Matthew." *Artibus et historiae* 22, pp. 89–105.

Verdon, T., and J. Henderson, eds. *Christianity and the Renaissance: Image and Religious Imagination in the Quattrocento*. Syracuse, N.Y.

Warma, S. J. "Christ, First Fruits and the Resurrection: Observations on the Fruit Basket in Caravaggio's London 'Supper at Emmaus'." *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* 53, pp. 583–86.

1991

Agnello, S. L. "Due scolii ad un catalogo." *Archivio storico siracusano* 5, pp. 89–97.

Basile, G. "Oltre il furto. 'Il San Gerolamo che scrive' del Caravaggio." *Art et dossier* 55, pp. 27–29.

Battistello Caracciolo e il primo naturalismo a Napoli. Ed. F. Bologna. Exh. cat., Castel Sant'Elmo, Naples.

Bauer, L. F. "Moral Choice in Some Paintings by Caravaggio and His Followers." *Art Bulletin* 73, pp. 391–98.

Benedictis, C. de. *Per la storia del collezionismo italiano: fonti e documenti*. Florence.

Bernardini, M., G. Gaggi, and A. Marcone. "Giove, Nettuno e Pluto di Caravaggio nel Casino Ludovisi a Roma. Il cosmo in una stanza." *Art et dossier* 60, pp. 18–21.

Blackwell, R. J. *Galileo, Bellarmine, and the Bible*. Notre Dame and London.

Brand, P. "Disguise and Recognition in Renaissance Comedy." *Journal of Anglo-Italian Studies* 1, pp. 16–32.

Cadogan, J. K., and M. Mahoney. *Wadsworth Atheneum Paintings*. Vol. 2, *Italy and Spain*. Hartford, Conn.

Calvesi, M. "Trasparente l'autore come il soggetto." *Art et dossier* 60, pp. 22–26.

Caravaggio. Come nascono i capolavori. Ed. M. Gregori. Exh. cat., Galleria Palatina, Palazzo Pitti, Florence.

Cinotti, M. *Caravaggio. La vita e l'opera*. Bergamo.

Cropper, E. "The Petrifying Art: Marino's Poetry and Caravaggio." *Metropolitan Museum of Art Journal* 26, pp. 193–212.

Levey, M. *The Later Italian Pictures in the Collection of Her Majesty The Queen*. 2d ed. Cambridge.

Pacelli, V. "La morte del Caravaggio e alcuni suoi dipinti da documenti inediti." *Studi di storia dell'arte* 2, pp. 167–88.

- Panzerà, A. M. "Caravaggio e Giordano Bruno, un'ipotesi interpretativa." *Arte lombarda* 96/97, pp. 55–59.
- Posèq, A. W. G. "The Allegorical Content of Caravaggio's Narsissus." *Source X*, 3, pp. 21–31.
- Posèq, A. W. G.² "The Composite *Pathosformel* of Caravaggio's St. Mary Magdalene in Ecstasy." *Wiener Jahrbuch für Kunstgeschichte* 44, pp. 121–30.
- Prohaska, W. *Die Gemäldegalerie des Kunsthistorischen Museums in Wien. Verzeichnis der Gemälde*. Vienna.
- Röttgen, H. "Das ist Matthäus." *Pantheon* 49, pp. 97–103.
- Scott, J. B. *Images of Nepotism: The Painted Ceilings of Palazzo Barberini*. Princeton.
- Shlain, L. *Art and Physics*. New York.
- Trinchieri Camiz, F. "Music and Painting in Cardinal Del Monte's Household." *Metropolitan Museum of Art Journal* 26, pp. 213–26.
- Vannugli, A. "Le postile di Sebastiano Resta al Baglione e al Vasari al Sandrart e all'Orlandi: un'introduzione storica-bibliografica." *Bollettino d'arte* 70, pp. 145–54.
- Ward, R. "Selected Acquisitions of European and American Paintings at The Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art, Kansas City, 1986–1990." *Burlington Magazine* 133, p. 156.
- Ważbiński, Z. "Rubens e Leonardo da Vinci." In *I leonardeschi a Milano: fortuna e collezionismo*, pp. 199–205. Milan.
- Woodhouse, J. "Some Developments in the Courtesy Manual after Castiglione." *Journal of Anglo-Italian Studies* 1, pp. 1–15.
- Yates, F. *Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition*. Reprint of 1964 ed. Chicago.
- 1992
- Barroero, L. *Dipinti Italiani dal XV al XIX secolo del Museo di Montserrat*. Rome.
- Bellini, F. "Tre documenti per Michelangelo da Caravaggio." *Prospettiva* 65, pp. 70–71.
- Boer, W. de. "The Curate of Malgrate or the Problem of Clerical Competence in Counter-Reformation Milan." In *The Power of Imagery. Essays on Rome, Italy, and Imagination*, ed. P. van Kessel, pp. 188–200. Rome.
- Bologna, F. *L'incredulità del Caravaggio e l'esperienza delle 'cose naturali'*. Turin.
- Calvesi, M. "La nobiltà del Caravaggio." *Art et dossier* 68, pp. 18–19.

- Calvesi, M.² “Novità e conferme.” *Art et dossier* 66, pp. 12–14.
- Calvesi, M., M. Gregori, and C. Maltese. “Caravaggio al microscopio.” *Art et dossier* 68, pp. 16–18.
- Cappelletti, F. “La committenza di Asdrubale Mattei e la creazione della Galleria nel Palazzo Mattei di Giove a Roma.” *Storia dell’arte* 76, pp. 256–97.
- Christiansen, K., and D. Mahon. “Caravaggio’s Second Versions—Letters.” *Burlington Magazine* CXXXIV (Aug.), pp. 502–4.
- Cohen, S. *The Evolution of Women’s Asylums Since 1500*. New York and Oxford.
- Cropper, E. “Vincenzo Giustiniani’s Galleria: The Pygmalion Effect.” In *Cassiano Dal Pozzo’s Paper Museum*, v. 2, p. 101–26. Milan.
- Fuda, R. “Note caravaggesche.” *Paragone* 43, 509–11, pp. 72–85.
- Gallavotti Cavallero, D. “La pittura a Roma nella prima metà del cinquecento.” In *L’Arte in Roma nel secolo XVI*, vol 2. Rome.
- Isman, F. “L’arte? Va a Ruba.” *Art et dossier* 66, pp. 15–18.
- Krohn, D., et al. *From El Greco to Cézanne: Masterpieces of European Painting from the National Gallery of Art, Washington, and The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York*. Exh. cat. Athens.
- Labrot, G. *Collections of Paintings in Naples 1600–1780*. The Provenance Index of the Getty Art History Information Program. Munich.
- Mahon, D. *Guercino, Master Painter of the Baroque*. Exh. cat., National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.
- Mallia-Milanes, V. *Venice and Hospitaller Malta 1530–1798*. Marsa, Malta.
- Marini, M. “L’ultima spiaggia.” *Art et dossier* 66, pp. 8–11.
- Olin, J. C. *The Catholic Reformation. Savonarola to Ignatius Loyola*. New York.
- Pacelli, V. “La morte di Caravaggio e alcuni suoi dipinti da documenti inediti.” *Studi di storia dell’arte* 2, pp. 167–88.
- Papi, G. *Cecco del Caravaggio*. Florence.
- Posèq, A. W. G. “Pathosformels, Decorum and the ‘Art of Gestures’ in Caravaggio’s *Death of the Virgin*.” *Konsthistorisk tidskrift* 61, pp. 27–44.
- Randolfi, R. “La vita di Bartolomeo Manfredi nei documenti romani e un’ipotesi sulla sua formazione artistica.” *Storia dell’arte* 74, pp. 81–90.

- Röttgen, H. *Caravaggio. Der irdische Amor oder der Sieg der fleischlichen Liebe*. Frankfurt am Main.
- Röttgen, H.² “Mein Haus soll ein Bethaus heissen, ihr aber habt eine Diebeschühle daraus gemacht’. Das Paradigma für Caravaggio’s ‘Martyrium des hl. Matthäus’ und die innere Verwandtschaft zweier unterschiedlicher Themen.” *Pantheon* 50, pp. 55–60.
- Rurale, F. *I Gesuiti a Milano e Carlo Borromeo*. Rome.
- Slatkes, L. J. “Report on the *St. John the Baptist* in Munich.” Ms. dated 30 April 1992, transcribed in Pacelli 1994, p. 230.
- Spike, J. T. “E se Caravaggio avesse avuto una bottega? Una nuova tesi di John Spike.” *Il Giornale dell’arte* 99, p. 5.
- Spike, J. T.² “Florence and Rome Caravaggio.” *Burlington Magazine* CXXXIV (Apr.), pp. 275–77.
- Spike, J. T.³ “Un momento importante nella storiografia della natura morta italiana.” In *Naturalia*, pp. 17–22. Turin.
- Trinchieri Camiz, F. “Luogo molto vago e delizioso . . .’, il casino del cardinale Del Monte ed un suo soffitto dipinto da Caravaggio.” *Ricerche di storia dell’arte* 48, pp. 81–94.
- Varriano, J. “Caravaggio’s Carpets.” *Burlington Magazine* CXXXIV, p. 505.
- Ważbiński, Z. “Simon Vouet et le cardinal Francesco Maria Del Monte: une hypothèse sur le mécénat d’Henri IV à Rome.” In *Simon Vouet: Actes du colloque international, Galeries nationales du Grand Palais*, ed. S. Loire, pp. 149–67. Paris.
- Wood, C. “The Ludovisi Collection of Paintings in 1623.” *Burlington Magazine* CXXXIV, no. 1073 (Aug.), pp. 515–23.
- 1993
- Bassani, R., and F. Bellini. “La casa, le ‘robbe,’ lo studio del Caravaggio a Roma. Due documenti inediti del 1603 e del 1605.” *Prospettiva* 71, pp. 68–76.
- Bell, J. C. “Some Seventeenth-Century Appraisals of Caravaggio’s Coloring.” *Artibus et historiae* 14, pp. 103–29.
- Benati, D. “Natura ed emozione: itinerari del giovane Cagnacci.” In *Guido Cagnacci*, pp. 9–28. Milan.

- Benedetti, S. *Caravaggio: The Master Revealed*. Exh. cat., National Gallery, Dublin.
- Benedetti, S.² “Caravaggio’s *Taking of Christ*. A Masterpiece Rediscovered.” *Burlington Magazine* CXXXV, pp. 731–46.
- Biagioli, M. *Galileo, Courtier: The Practice of Science in the Culture of Absolutism*. Chicago.
- Bonnici, A. “Maltese Society under the Hospitallers in the Light of Inquisition Documents.” In *Hospitaller Malta*, pp. 311–50.
- Bono, S. “Naval Exploits and Privateering.” In *Hospitaller Malta*, pp. 351–98.
- Calvesi, M. “Il cardinellino in gabbia. Le due versioni del *Suonatore di liuto* del Caravaggio.” *Art et dossier* 82, pp. 29–33.
- Cappelletti, F., and L. Testa. “The Documentary Evidence of the Early History of Caravaggio’s ‘Taking of Christ’.” *Burlington Magazine* CXXXV, pp. 742–46.
- Caruso, R. “Qualità di superficie nelle due versioni della Buona Ventura di Caravaggio,” in *Ricerche di Storia dell’arte*, 51, pp. 27–30.
- Colasanti, V. “Caravaggio il giallo di Dublino.” *Venerdì*, 12 novembre, pp. 112–23.
- Corradini, S. *Caravaggio: materiali per un processo*. Rome.
- Corradini, S., and M. Marini. “The Earliest Account of Caravaggio in Rome.” *Burlington Magazine* CXXXV, pp. 25–28.
- Danto, A. C. “Caravaggio: The Name of the Rosary.” *Art News* 92, pp. 107–8.
- Firpo, M. *Riforma protestante ed eresie nell’Italia del cinquecento*. Rome.
- Fiorino, S. “Malta in 1530.” *Hospitaller Malta*, pp. 111–98.
- Gash, J. “Painting and Sculpture in Early Modern Malta.” In *Hospitaller Malta*, pp. 509–604.
- Gilbert, C. “Caravaggio’s Other Cardinal.” *Arte lombarda* 105/107, pp. 139–42.
- Gregori, M. “Il San Giovannino alla sorgente del Caravaggio.” *Paragone* 519–20, pp. 3–20.
- Heimburger, M. “Michelangelo Merisi, Frans Snyder, and the Genesis of Italian Still-Life Painting.” *Ricerche di storia dell’arte* 51, pp. 69–84.
- Hospitaller Malta 1530–1798*. Ed. V. Mallia-Milanes. Malta.
- Jones, P. M. *Federico Borromeo and the Ambrosiana: Art Patronage and Reform in the Seventeenth Century*. Cambridge and New York.
- Ledrus, M., S.I., *Alla scuola del “Ladrone Penitente.”* Rome.

- Luttrell, A. T. "Malta and Rhodes: Hospitallers and Islanders." In *Hospitaller Malta*, pp. 255–84.
- Macioce, S. "Un cavaliere magistrale. Nuovi documenti sul soggiorno maltese di Caravaggio." *Art et dossier* 85, pp. 19–21.
- Marini, M., and S. Corradini. "Inventarium omnium et singulorum bonorum mobilium di Michelangelo da Caravaggio 'pittore'." *Artibus et historiae* 14, pp. 161–76.
- Posèq, A. W. G. "Caravaggio's *Amore Vincitor* and the Supremacy of Painting." *Source* 12, pp. 13–18.
- Posèq, A. W. G.² "Caravaggio's *Burial of St. Lucy* and the Late Evolution of His Art of Gesture." *Konsthistorisk tidskrift* 62, pp. 143–52.
- Röttgen, H. "Quel diavolo è Caravaggio. Giovanni Baglione e la sua denuncia satirica dell'Amore terreno." *Storia dell'arte* 79, pp. 326–40.
- Schneider, T. M. "L'orecchio del Caravaggio o come distinguere un originale da una copia." *Paragone* 44, 519–21, pp. 21–23.
- Tarpley, W. "The Rôle of the Venetian Oligarchy in the Reformation, Counter-Reformation, Enlightenment, and the Thirty Years' War." In *American Almanac*.
- Tuck-Scala, A. "Caravaggio's 'Roman Charity' in *The Seven Acts of Mercy*." In *Parthenope's Splendor: Art of the Golden Age in Naples*, ed. J. Chenault Porter and S. S. Munshower, pp. 126–63. *Papers in Art History from the Pennsylvania State University*. University Park, Penn.
- Williams, A. "Constitutional Development of the Order of St. John in Malta, 1530–1798." In *Hospitaller Malta*, pp. 285–96.

1994

- Bassani, R., and F. Bellini. *Caravaggio assassino*. Rome.
- Bonfait, O. "De Paleotti à G. B. Agucchi: théorie et pratique de la peinture dans les milieux ecclésiastiques à Rome du Caravage à Poussin." In *Rome 1630. Il trionfo del pennello*, pp. 83–96. Exh. cat., Villa Medici, Rome.
- Calvesi, M. "Uno *sbozzo* del Caravaggio e la *Deposizione* di Santa Maria in Vallicella." In *Studi in onore di Mina Gregori*, pp. 148–97. Milan.

- Cappelletti, F., and L. Testa. *Il trattenimento di Virtuosi. Le collezioni secentesche di quadri nel Palazzo Mattei di Roma*. Rome.
- Coliva, A. *Galleria Borghese*. Rome.
- Danesi Squarzina, S. "Sustermans: cultura degli emblemi in un ritratto del primo settecento." *Arte* 8, pp. 207–16.
- De Pascale, E., and M. Olivari. *Dizionario degli artisti di Caravaggio e Treviglio*. Treviglio.
- Esielonis, K. *Still-Life Painting in the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston*. Boston.
- Espinel, C. H. "Caravaggio's 'Il Amore Dormiente': A Sleeping Cupid with Juvenile Rheumatoid Arthritis." *Lancet* 334, pp. 1750–52.
- Fumagalli, E. "Precoci citazioni di opere del Caravaggio in alcuni documenti inediti." *Paragone* 535, pp. 101–17.
- Fumaroli, M. *L'École du silence*. Geneva.
- Garin, E. *La cultura filosofica del Rinascimento italiano: ricerche e documenti*. Florence.
- Geremek, B. *Poverty: A History*. Trans. A. Kolakowska. Oxford and Cambridge, Mass.
- Gregori, M. *Caravaggio*. Milan.
- Gregori, M.² "Il San Giovannino alla sorgente del Caravaggio." *Paragone*, pp. 3–23.
- Grimaldi, F., ed. *Il santuario di Loreto. Sette secoli di storia, arte, devozione*. Rome.
- Guarino, S. "Qualche quadro per nostro servizio: i dipinti Pio di Savoia inventariati, venduti e dispersi." In *Quadri rinoviatissimi il collezionismo dei Pio di Savoia*, ed. J. Bentini, pp. 101–29. Modena.
- Hammond, F. *Music and Spectacle in Baroque Rome: Barberini Patronage under Urban VIII*. New Haven and London.
- Hopkins, A. *The Book of Courtly Love*. San Francisco.
- Kemp, W. "Review of *Only Connect . . . : Art and the Spectator in the Italian Renaissance*, by John Shearman." *Art Bulletin* LV, pp. 364–67.
- Lapucci, R. "Caravaggio e i 'quadretti nello specchio ritratti.'" *Paragone* 529–33, pp. 160–70.
- Lapucci, R.² "Documentazione tecnica sulle opere messinesi del Caravaggio." In *Quaderni dell'attività didattica del museo regionale di Messina*, pp. 17–67. Messina.
- Macioce, S. "Caravaggio e Malta e i suoi referenti: notizie d'archivio." *Storia dell'arte* 81, pp. 207–28.

- Nagel, A. "Michelangelo's London Entombment and the Church of Sant Agostino in Rome." *Burlington Magazine* 136, no. 1092 (Mar.), pp. 164–67.
- O'Connor, D. "The Stone the Builders Rejected (Psalm 118(117):22) in Caravaggio's *Deposition*." *Irish Theological Quarterly* 1, pp. 1–14.
- Pacelli, V. *L'ultimo Caravaggio dalla Maddalena a mezza figura ai due San Giovanni 1606–1610*. Todi.
- Rossi, L. "Riflessioni e proposte per una nuova lettura del dipinto sul muro eseguito da Caravaggio nel Casino Del Monti." *Arte documentata* 8, pp. 181–84.
- Sire, H. J. A. *The Knights of Malta*. New Haven and London.
- von Lates, Adrienne. "Caravaggio, Montaigne, and the Conversion of the Jews at San Luigi dei Francesi." *Gazette des Beaux-arts* 124, no. 1509 (Oct.), pp. 107–16.
- Ważbiński, Z. *Il Cardinale Francesco Maria Del Monte 1549–1626*. 2 vols. Florence.
- 1995
- Bardin, L. T. "La Giuditta biblica nelle arti figurative: una ricerca." *Arte cristiana* 83, pp. 219–25.
- Bauer, L. "More Evidence of Artists' Tracings." *Burlington Magazine*, January, p. 38.
- Bell, J. C. "Light and Color in Caravaggio's *Supper at Emmaus*." *Artibus et historiae* 16, pp. 139–71.
- Benedetti, S. "Caravaggio's *Taking of Christ*." *Burlington Magazine* 135, pp. 731–46.
- Benedetti, S., ed. *Caravaggio: The Master Revealed*. Exh. cat., National Gallery of Ireland, Dublin.
- Berra, G. "'Il San Francesco in meditazione sulla morte del Caravaggio: altre copie e precisazioni sull'iconografia.'" *Arte Cristiana*, 767, pp. 101–18.
- Calvesi, M. "Novità e conferme. Ancora sulle carte relative agli ultimi giorni di Caravaggio." *Art et dossier* 96, pp. 13–14.
- Calvesi, M.² "Prospero Orsi, 'turchimanno' del Caravaggio." *Storia dell'arte* 85, pp. 355–58.
- Caravaggio rivelato*. Series by eminent scholars coordinated by C. Strinati, with S. Benedetti, M. Calvesi, B. Contardi, M. Gregori, I. Lavin, D. Mahon, M. Marini, J. T. Spike. In *Quadri e sculture* 3, pp. 22–39.

- Christiansen, K. *Le Caravage et l'esempio davanti del naturale*. Paris.
- Danesi Squarzina, S. "I Giustiniani e l'Oratorio dei Filippini." *Storia dell'arte* 85, pp. 369–73.
- Didi-Huberman, G. *Fra Angelico. Dissemblance and Figuration*. Trans. J. M. Todd. Chicago.
- Fumaroli, M. "Academia, Arcadia, Parnassus: trois lieux allegoriques de l'éloge du loisir lettré." In *Italian Academies of the Sixteenth Century*, ed. D. S. Chambers and F. Quiviger, pp. 15–36. London.
- Gavazza, E., G. Nepi Sciré, and G. Rotondi Terminiello. *Bernardo Strozzi: Genova 1581/82–Venezia 1644*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Rosso, Genoa.
- Gilbert, C. *Caravaggio and His Two Cardinals*. University Park, Penn.
- Hermann Fiore, K. "Taking of Christ and Dürer's Woodcut of 1509." *Burlington Magazine* 137, pp. 24–27.
- Jones, M. D. W. *The Counter-Reformation: Religion and Society in Early Modern Europe*. Cambridge.
- Jones, P. "Art Theory as Ideology: Gabriele Paleotti's Hierarchical Notion of Painting's Universality and Reception." In *Reframing the Renaissance: Visual Culture in Europe and Latin America 1450–1650*, ed. C. Farago, pp. 127–39. New Haven and London.
- Kolakowski, L. *God Owes Us Nothing*. Chicago.
- Lemoine, A. "Caravage, Cavalier d'Arpin, Guido Reni et la confrérie romaine de la SS. Trinità dei Pellegrini." *Storia dell'arte* 85, pp. 416–27.
- Lemoine, A.² "Considerazioni su documenti inediti relativi al soggiorno lombardo del Caravaggio." *Storia dell'arte* 85, pp. 359–68.
- Loire, S. "[Review] Bernardo Strozzi. Genoa." *Burlington Magazine* 137, no. 1108 (Jul.), pp. 477–79.
- Marin, L. *To Destroy Painting*. pp. 109–44. Chicago.
- McGinness, F. *Right Thinking and Sacred Oratory in Counter-Reformation Rome*. Princeton.
- La natura morta al tempo di Caravaggio*. Exh. cat., Musei Capitolini, Rome. Naples.
- Perini, G. "Caravaggio a Bologna." *Napoli, l'Europa: ricerca di storia dell'arte in onore di Ferdinando Bologna*. Catanzaro.
- Person, D. A. "Letter." *The Lancet*, p. 62.
- Prater, A. "Matthäus und kein Ende? Eine Entgegnung." *Pantheon* 53, pp. 53–61.

- Prodi, P. "San Filippo Neri: un'anomalia nella Roma della Controriforma?" *Storia dell'arte* 85, pp. 333–39.
- Schröter, E. "Caravaggio und die Gemäldesammlung der Familie Mattei. Addenda und Corrigenda zu den uesten Forschungen und Funden." *Pantheon* 53, pp. 62–87.
- Shulman, K. "A New Caravaggio." *Art News*, October, p. 72.
- Spadaro, A. "La 'Resurrezione di Lazzaro' e la famiglia di Giovanni Battista Lazzari patrizio di Castelnuovo Signore del Castello di Alfano committent messinese di Caravaggio." In *Catania Centro di Ricerca Economica e Scientifica*.
- Spezzaferro, L. "Il Caravaggio, i collezionisti romani, le nature morte." In *La natura morta*. Naples.
- Spike, J. T. "Caravaggio erotico." *FMR* 75 (Aug.), pp. 14–22.
- Spike, J. T.² "Quegli 'errori' inconfondibili. . . ." *Quadri e sculture* 4 (July–Aug.), pp. 35–39.
- Spike, J. T.³ "Un ritratto del Cardinale Baronio agli Uffizi di Firenze. Problemi di attribuzione e di restauro." In *La Regola e la fama*, ed. C. Strinati, pp. 588–93. Rome.
- Strinati, C., ed. *La Regola e la fama: San Filippo Neri e l'arte*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Venezia, Rome.
- Urban, L. *A Short History of Christian Thought*. Oxford.
- von Lates, A. "Caravaggio's Peaches and Academic Puns." *Word and Image* 11.1, pp. 55–60.
- Zuccari, A. "Cultura e predicazione nelle immagini dell'Oratorio," *Storia dell'arte* 85, pp. 340–54.

1996

- Agosti, B. *Collezionismo e archeologia cristiana nel seicento. Federico Borromeo e il medioevo artistico tra Roma e Milano*. Milan.
- Askew, P. "Caravaggio: Outward Action, Inward Vision." In *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio*, ed. S. Macioce, pp. 248–69. Rome.
- Azzopardi, J., Mons. "Un 'S. Francesco' di Caravaggio a Malta nel secolo XVIII: commenti sul periodo maltese del Merisi." In *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio*, ed. S. Macioce, pp. 195–211. Rome.
- Azzopardi, J., Mons., and D. Stone. "Above Caravaggio: The Massacre of the Knights at Fort St. Elmo." *Treasures of Malta* 3, pp. 61–66.

- Baldassare, F. "Review of *La regola e la fama.*" *Gazzetta antiquaria*, Winter, p. 103.
- Berra, G. "Arcimboldi e Caravaggio: 'Diligenza' e 'Patienza' nella natura morta arcaica." *Paragone* 8–10, pp. 108–61.
- Cannata, R., and H. Röttgen. "Un quadro per la SS. Trinità dei Pellegrini affidato al Caravaggio, ma eseguito dal Cavalier d'Arpino." In *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio*, ed. S. Macioce, pp. 80–89.
- Cappelletti, F. "Rest on the Flight into Egypt." In *I capolavori della collezione Doria Pamphilij da Tiziano a Velázquez*. Exh. cat., Fondazione Arte e Civiltà, Milan.
- Caravaggio da Malta a Firenze*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Vecchio, Florence.
- Caravaggio: la vita e le opere attraverso i documenti*. See *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio*, ed. S. Macioce. Rome.
- Come dipingeva il Caravaggio: Atti della giornata di studio Firenze 1992*. Ed. M. Gregori. Milan.
- Estella, M. "Noticias documentales sobre Moro o Key? y sobre el Caravaggio." *Archivo español de arte* 175, pp. 345–49.
- Fagiolo dell'Arco, M., and R. Pantanella. *Museo Baciccio in margine a quattro inventari inediti*. Rome.
- Freller, T. *St. Paul's Grotto and Its Visitors*. 2d ed. Valletta.
- Hooker, R. *Platonic Love*. Internet, wsu.edu.
- Macioce, S., ed. *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio. La vita e le opere attraverso i documenti. Atti del convegno internazionale di studi, novembre 1995*. Rome.
- Milicua, J. "Narciso: attr. Caravaggio. I cinque sensi nell'arte." In *Le immagini del sentire*, ed. S. Ferino-Pagden. Exh. cat., Centro Culturale, Santa Maria della Pietà. Cremona.
- Papi, G. "Riflessioni sul percorso caravaggesco di Bartolomeo Cavarozzi." *Paragone* 47, pp. 85–96.
- Pelikan, J. *Mary through the Centuries: Her Place in the History of Culture*. New Haven and London.
- Pupillo, M. "Stefano Fuccari 'trentinus stucchator in Urbe': identificazione di una personalità artistica." *Studi trentini di scienze storiche*, pp. 5–16.
- Raabe, R. *Der imaginierte Betrachter: Studien zu Caravaggios römischem Werk*. Zurich.

- Rowlands, E. W. *The Collections of the Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art: Italian Paintings 1300–1800, Kansas City, Mo.* Kansas City.
- Sawyer, J. F. A. *The Fifth Gospel: Isaiah in the History of Christianity.* Cambridge.
- Speranza, L. “La Madonna del Rosario. Origine della devozione e diffusione del tema nell’arte del territorio aretino.” In *Mater Christi*, ed. A. M. Maetzke, pp. 26–34. Arezzo.
- Spike, J. T. *Fra Angelico.* Milan, Paris, and New York.
- Spike, J. T.² “Un documento per primo.” In *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio*, ed. S. Macioce, pp. 212–23. Rome.
- Topper, D., and C. Gillis. “Trajectories of Blood: Artemisia Gentileschi and Galileo’s Parabolic Path.” *Woman’s Art Journal*, Summer, pp. 10–12.
- Treffers, B. “Immagine e predicazione nel Caravaggio.” In *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio*, ed. S. Macioce, pp. 270–87. Rome.
- Treffers, B.² “‘In agris itinerans’: l’esempio della Madonna di Loreto del Caravaggio.” *Mededelingen van het Nederlands Instituut te Rome, Historical Studies* 55, pp. 274–92.
- Vagheggi, P. “Delitto per diletto.” *Art et dossier* 114, pp. 4–5.
- Vodret, R. “Ritratto di artista allo specchio.” *Art et dossier* 109, pp. 9–13.
- 1997
- Baroni Vannucci, A. *Jan Van Der Straet detto Giovanni Stradano.* Milan.
- Barroero, L. “L’Isacco di Caravaggio nella Pinacoteca Capitolina.” *Bolletino dei Musei Comunali di Roma* 11, pp. 37–41.
- Burke, M. B., and P. Cherry. *Collection of Paintings in Madrid, 1601–1755. Part 1, The Provenance Index of the Getty Information Institute.* Malibu, Cal.
- Colantuono, A. *Guido Reni’s ‘Abduction of Helen’: The Politics and Rhetoric of Painting in Seventeenth-Century Europe.* Cambridge and New York.
- Danesi Squarzina, S. “The Collection of Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani.” *Burlington Magazine* I, 139, pp. 766–71; II, 140, pp. 102–8.
- Filipczak, Z. *Hot Dry Men, Cold Wet Women: The Theory of Humors in Western European Art, 1575–1700.* Exh. cat. New York.

- Freller, T. "Joachim von Sandrart, Caravaggio, and Early 17th-Century Malta." *The Times of Malta*, March 13, p. 22.
- Gash, J. "The Identity of Caravaggio's Knight of Malta." *Burlington Magazine* CXXXIX, pp. 156–60.
- Gregori, M., ed. *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio e i suoi primi seguaci*. Thessalonica.
- Kettering, A. "Ter Borch's Ladies in Satin." In *Looking at Seventeenth-Century Dutch Art*, ed. W. Franits, pp. 98–115. Cambridge and New York.
- König, E. *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio: 1571–1610*. Cologne.
- Maccherini, M. "Caravaggio nel carteggio familiare di Giulio Mancini." *Prospettiva* 104, pp. 71–92.
- Marini, M. "A scuola da Caravaggio." *Quadri e sculture*, pp. 40–41.
- Morselli, R. *Repertorio per lo studio del collezionismo bolognese del seicento*. Bologna.
- Papa, R. "Da Michelangelo a Michelangelo." *Art et dossier* 110, pp. 22–26.
- Pupillo, M. "Pauperismo e iconografia francescana nella pittura del Caravaggio. Due contesti documentari." In *Art francescana e pauperismo dalla Valle dell'Aniene: l'exemplum di Subiaco*, pp. 152–68. *Atti delle giornate di studio*. Subiaco.
- Reeves, E. *Painting the Heavens: Art and Science in the Age of Galileo*. Princeton, N.J.
- Rice, L. *The Altars and Altarpieces of New St. Peter's: Outfitting the Basilica 1621–1666*. Cambridge.
- Rossi, F. "La 'Macelleria' di Annibale Carracci e il bando per la quaresima del Cardinale Gabriele Paleotti." *Paragone* 12, pp. 18–35.
- Spear, R. *The Divine Guido: Religion, Sex, Money and Art in the World of Guido Reni*. New Haven and London.
- Stone, D. "The Context of Caravaggio's *Beheading of St. John* in Malta." *Burlington Magazine* 139, pp. 161–70.
- Stone, D.² "In Praise of Caravaggio's *Sleeping Cupid*: New Documents for Francesco dell'Antella in Malta and Florence." *Melita historica* 12, pp. 165–77.
- Varriano, J. "Caravaggio and Violence." *Storia dell'arte* 97, pp. 55–67.

Varriano, J.² “Leonardo’s Lost Medusa and other Medici Medusas from the Tazza Farnese to Caravaggio.” *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, September, pp. 73–81.

Verdon, T., ed. *Under the Heaven of the Dome (sotto il cielo della Cupola)*. Florence.

Wind, B. “Gesture and Meaning in Two Paintings by Caravaggio.” *Source XVI* (Spring), pp. 7–11.

1998

Bersani, L., and U. Dutoit. *Caravaggio’s Secrets*. Cambridge, Mass., and London.

Bonnici, A. *Medieval and Roman Inquisition in Malta*. Rabat, Malta.

Bono Castellotti, M. *Il paradosso di Caravaggio*. Milan.

Cappelletti, F. “Una nota di beni e qualche aggiunta alla storia della collezione Aldobrandini.” *Storia dell’arte* 93–94, pp. 341–47.

Caravaggio and His Italian Followers. Ed. M. Gregori. Exh. cat., The Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford, Conn.

Chiarini, M. ed. *La natura morta a palazzo e in villa. Le collezioni dei Medici e dei Lorena*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Pitti, Florence.

Coliva, A. ed. *La Madonna dei Palafrenieri di Caravaggio nella collezione di Scipione Borghese*. Venice.

Corradini, S., and M. Marini. “The Earliest Account of Caravaggio in Rome.” *Burlington Magazine* CXXX (Jan.), pp. 25–28.

Danesi Squarzina, S. “The Collection of Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani, Part II.” *Burlington Magazine* 140, pp. 102–8.

Freller, T. *The Cavaliers Tour and Malta in 1663*. Malta.

Gregori, M. “Un nuovo ritratto del Caravaggio.” *Paragone* 21, pp. 3–14.

Heimbürger, M. “Caravaggio e Dürer.” *Paragone* 21, pp. 19–48.

James, F. A., III. *Peter Martyr and Predestination: The Augustinian Inheritance of an Italian Reformer*. Oxford.

Keith, L. “Three Paintings by Caravaggio.” In *National Gallery Technical Bulletin* 19, pp. 37–51.

Langdon, H. *Caravaggio: A Life*. New York.

- Machamer, P., ed. *The Cambridge Companion to Galileo*. Cambridge.
- Macioce, S. "Mario Minniti nello spoglio di un cavaliere maltese. Notizie d'archivio." *Storia dell'arte* 93–94, pp. 337–40.
- Marcolini, G. "Cesare d'Este, Caravaggio e Annibale Carracci: un duca, due pittori e una committenza 'a mal termine,'" *Sovrane passioni. Studi sul collezionismo estense*, ed. J. Bertini. Milan.
- Marini, M. "Se Bacco non è malato." *Quadri e sculture* 32 (Sept.), pp. 36–37.
- Papa, R. "Il sorriso di Dio." *Art et dossier* 124 (Feb.), pp. 28–32.
- Papini, M. L. *L'ornamento della pittura*. Rome.
- Puglisi, C. *Caravaggio*. London.
- Pupillo, M. "Il 'Virtuoso tradito'. Una società tra Orazio Borgianni, Caspare Celio e Francesco Nappi e i rapporti con Giovan Battista Crescenzi." *Storia dell'arte* 93–94, pp. 303–11.
- Robb, P. M. Sydney.
- Roberts, J. E. Woodbrook Baptist Church, Baltimore, Maryland, internet site.
- Seward, D. *Caravaggio: A Passionate Life*. New York.
- Testa, L. "Presenze caravaggesche nella collezione Savelli." *Storia dell'arte* 93–94, pp. 348–52.
- Vannugli, A. "Orazio Borgianni, Juan de Lezcano and a 'Martyrdom of St. Lawrence' at Roncesvalles." *Burlington Magazine* 140, pp. 5–15.
- Varriano, J. "Caravaggio's Lost Portrait of Cardinal Benedetto Giustiniani: a Possible Print Source." *Paragone* 21, pp. 14–23.
- Varriano, J.² "Torna Betseba." *Quadri e sculture* 6, p. 39.
- Vodret, R. "Caravaggio replicante." *Quadri e sculture* 6, pp. 39–40.
- Zeri, F. *Caravaggio. La vocazione di San Matteo*. Milan.
- Zuccari, A. "Un carteggio di Francesco M. Del Monte e alcune notazioni sul Martirio di san Matteo del Caravaggio." *Storia dell'arte* 93–94, pp. 292–302.

1999

- Arasse, D. *L'Annonciation italienne: Une histoire de perspective*. Paris.
- Berne–Joffroy, A. *Le dossier Caravage. Psychologie des attributions et psychologie de l'art*. Ed. A. Brejon de Lavergnèe. 1st ed. 1959. Paris.
- Best, M., and F. B. Brightman, eds. *The Book of Secrets of Albertus Magnus*. Oxford.
- Bonsanti, G. *Caravaggio al Carmine*. Florence.
- Calvesi, M. “Le opere di Caravaggio a Roma.” In *Arte a Roma. Pittura, scultura, architettura nella storia dei Giubbei*, pp. 114–25. Milan.
- Caponetto, S. *The Protestant Reformation in Sixteenth-Century Italy*. Trans. A. C. and J. Tedeschi. Kirskville, Mo.
- Christiansen, K. “Caravaggio’s Holy Family with the Infant Saint John the Baptist.” *Paragone* 50, no. 26, pp. 3–11.
- Ciattie, M. and Silla, C. *Caravaggio al Carmine. Il restauro della Decollazione del Battista di Malta*. Florence.
- Conticello, B. “Il trompe-l’oeil dell’imperatrice.” *FMR*, March, pp. 88–105.
- De Marchi, A. *Il Palazzo Doria Pamphilij al Corso e le sue collezioni*. Florence.
- Formichetti, G. “Tommaso Campanella e i minimi.” In *Il Sole–24 Ore*, November 7, n. 305, p. 305.
- Hockney, D. Ingres Symposium Lecture, October 22. The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York.
- Johnston, I. “Shakespeare’s Transformation of Medieval Tragedy and an Introduction to Richard III.” Lecture given at Malaspina University-College, Vancouver.
- Klerk, B. de. *The Brothers Campi: Images and Devotion*. Amsterdam.
- Longhi, R. *Studi Caravaggeschi*. Vol. I. Milan.
- Marini, M. “L’alfa e l’omega di Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio, pittore: qualche precisione documentaria sulla nascita e sulla morte.” *Artibus et historiae* 40, pp. 131–49.
- Mormando, F. *Saints and Sinners*. Exh. cat. Boston.
- Piro, N. de. *The Temple of the Knights of Malta*. Malta.

- Randon, P. Farrugia “The Operificio restoration of Caravaggio’s *Beheading of the Baptist*: Two Important considerations.” *The Sunday Times of Malta*, June 20, p. 8.
- Spike, J. T. *Il Corteo Trionfale di Carlo V: un capitolo del Rinascimento in un’acquaforte delle collezioni roveresche*. Urbino.
- Strinati, C., and R. Vodret, eds. *Caravaggio e i suoi*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Venezia, Rome.
- van der Sman, G. “New Light on Perino del Vaga’s ‘Deposition’ for S. Maria sopra Minerva in Rome.” *Burlington Magazine* CXXXI, pp. 164–68.
- Varriano, J. “Caravaggio and Violence.” *Storia dell’arte* 97, pp. 317–32.
- Wittkower, R. *Art and Architecture in Italy, 1600–1750*. Rev. and ed. J. Connors and J. Montagu. New Haven.
- Wohl, H. “The Subject of Giovanni Bellini’s St. Francis in the Frick Collection.” *Mosaics of Friendship. Studies in Art and History for Eve Borsook*, ed. O. Francisci Osti, pp. 187–98. Florence.
- 2000
- Bauer, L., and S. Colton. “Tracing in Some Works by Caravaggio.” *Burlington Magazine* 142, pp. 434–36.
- Bernardini, M. G., S. Danesi Squarzina, and C. Strinati. *Studi di storia dell’Arte in onore di Denis Mahon*. Milan.
- Caravaggio: la luce nella pittura lombarda*. Exh. cat., Accademia Carrara, Bergamo. Milan.
- Cardinali, M, M. B. De Ruggieri, C. Falcucci, C. Merlini, V. Savina, and B. Sorti, “La Madonna dei Pellegrini di Caravaggio. Il restauro, la tecnica esecutiva e un inedito ritrovamento documentario.” *Kermes* XII, no. 40.
- Carter, J. W. “Faith, Works, and the Apparent Controversy of Paul and James.” *American Journal of Biblical Theology* (unpaginated internet journal).
- Corradini, S., and M. Marini. *Roma 1605, lo strano furto di “. . . una lama di spade . . . di M[aestro] Michelangelo da Caravaggio Pittore*. Milan.
- Corti, L. *Lungo il tragitto crociato della vita*. Exh. cat., Venice.
- Gallo, N. “Lo stemma dei Malaspina di Fosdinovo sulla tela del San Girolamo del Caravaggio a Malta: Note e osservazioni.” *Atti e Memorie della Deputazione di Storia patria per le antiche province modenesi* 22, serie XI, pp. 255–62.

- Gregori, M. "Un nuovo Davide e Golia del Caravaggio." *Paragone* LI, no. 31, pp. 11–22.
- Jacobs, F. H. "Aretino and Michelangelo, Dolce and Titian: *Femmina, Masculo, Grazia*." *Art Bulletin* 82.1, pp. 51–67.
- Longhi, R. *Studi Caravaggeschi*. Vol. II. Milan.
- Marini, M. "Caravaggio: l'inicipit tra Lombardia e Venezia." In *Caravaggio: la luce nella pittura lombarda*, pp. 45–56.
- Meijer, B. W. "Italian paintings in 17th century Holland. Art market, art works and art collections." In *L'europa e l'arte italiana. a cura di M. Seidel. Per i cento anni dalla fondazione del Kunsthistorisches Institut in Florenz* (Convegno internazionale Firenze, 22-27 settembre 1997), ed. F. Fehrenbach. Venice.
- Migliorini, M., and A. Assini. *Pittori in Tribunale, un processo per copie e falsi alla fine del Seicento*. Nuoro.
- Pedrocchi, A. M., and M. Minozzi. *La Quadreria Patrizi: cultura senese nella storia del collezionismo romano*. Milan.
- Perlow, K. "Twists of Fate: The Rise and Fall of Neo-Platonist Magic." Unpublished lecture, <http://vdgsa.org/hermes/magic.html>.
- Pescarmona, D. *Giuseppe Vermiglio: Un pittore caravaggesco tra Roma e la Lombardia*. Exh. cat., Campione d'Italia.
- Pupillo, M. "Di nuovo intorno al cardinale Ottavio Parravicino, a monsignor Paolo Gualdo e a Michelangelo da Caravaggio: una lettera ritrovata." *Arte veneta* LIV, pp. 164–69.
- Russo, S. *Vincenzo Mirabella. Cavaliere siracusano*. Palermo-Syracuse.
- Schleier, E. "An Unknown St. Catherine of Alexandria by (or after) Orazio Gentileschi." *Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, February, pp. 167–70.
- Scuola Media "La Sorgente." *Guida alla chiese parrocchiale di Caravaggio*. Treviolo (BG).
- Terzaghi, M. C. "Giuseppe Vermiglio lombardo e piemontese." *Paragone* 599, pp. 187–94.
- Treffers, B. *Caravaggio nel sangue del Battista*. Rome.
- Vannugli, A. "Enigmi Caravaggeschi: i quadri di Ottavio Costa." *Storia dell'arte* 99, pp. 55–83.
- Varriano, J. "Observations on Caravaggio and Girolamo Muziano in Situ." *Source*.

- Vodret, R. "Il giallo dei due S. Francesco." *Ars* IV, 11, pp. 140–45.
- Vogel, C. "A New Caravaggio." *The New York Times*, February 25, p. E38 (with ill.).
- Wechsler, L. "The Looking Glass: Did Old Masters Use Cameras? A Theory from David Hockney." *The New Yorker*, January 31, pp. 64–75.

2001

- Abbate, V., G. Barbera, C. Strinati, and R. Vodret, *Sulle orme di Caravaggio tra Roma e la Sicilia*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Ziino, Palermo.
- Arbace, L. "Il Cinquecento lombardo, da Leonardo a Caravaggio." In *Scritti di storia dell'arte in onore di Sylvie Béguin, Accademia Clementina di Bologna*, ed. M. Di Giampaolo and M. Gregori, pp. 331–38. Naples.
- Beltramme, M. "La pala dei Palafrenieri, precisazioni storiche e ipotesi iconografiche su uno degli ultimi 'rifiuti' romani del Caravaggio." *Studi romani* XLIX, pp. 72–100.
- Bernardini, M. G. "'La quale istoria è affatto senza azione,' la Conversione di San Paolo di Caravaggio." In *Caravaggio, Carracci, Maderno*, ed. Bernardini et al., pp. 87–100. Milan.
- Bernardini, M. G., L. Spezzaferro, C. Strinati, and A. M. Tantillo, eds. *Caravaggio, Carracci, Maderno: la Cappella Cerasi in S. Maria del Popolo a Roma*. Milan.
- Bonevizer, D. O. *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio and Francesco Patrizi da Cherso, Rethinking Tenebrism*. University of Michigan, doctoral diss., Ann Arbor, MI.
- Borea, E. "Bellori 1645, una lettera a Francesco Albani e la biografia di Caravaggio [App. I–II, di A. Boni]." *Prospettiva* C, pp. 57–69.
- Brown, B., ed. *The Genius of Rome 1592–1623*. Exh. cat., Royal Academy, London.
- Brown, B. "Caravaggio and the Giustiniani." *Apollo* CLIV, 473, pp. 54–56.
- Chastel, A. *Le geste dans l'art*. Paris.
- Christiansen, K., and J. Mann, eds. *Orazio and Artemisia Gentileschi*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Venezia, Rome; The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York; St. Louis Art Museum.
- Cirenei, A. "Conflitti artistici, rivalità cardinalizie e patronage a Roma fra cinque e seicento: il caso del processo criminale contro Cavalier d'Arpino." *Visceglia*, pp. 255–306.
- Corsi, C. *Io Caravaggio*. Milan.

- Cossu, M. "Canestra di frutta." *Saper vedere: Come si guarda un quadro: Quaderni di ars*, II, p. 46.
- Danesi Squarzina, S., ed. *Caravaggio e i Giustiniani: toccar con mano una collezione del seicento*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Giustiniano, Rome; Altes Museum, Berlin.
- Dell'Orto, G. "Caravaggio: Self Portraits as Exploration of Living Reality." *Gazette des Beaux-Arts* 138, pp. 225–32.
- De Mambro Santos, R. *Arcadie del vero. Arte e teoria nella Roma del Seicento*. Sant'Oreste.
- Ferino-Pagden, S., ed. *Dipingere la musica: Musik in der Malerei*. Exh. cat., Kunsthistorisches Museum, Palais Harrach, Vienna.
- Ganado, A. *The Palace of the Grand Masters in Valletta*. Malta.
- Garrard, M. D. *Artemisia Gentileschi Around 1622: The Shaping and Reshaping of an Artistic Identity*. Berkeley, Calif.
- Gelly-Saldias, C. *De l'an II au sacre de Napoléon. Le premier Musée de Nancy*. Paris.
- Gregori, M. "Un nuovo 'Davide e Golie' del Caravaggio." *Paragone* LI, pp. 11–22.
- Guarino, S., and P. Masini. *Il San Giovanni Battista ritrovato: la tradizione classica in Annibale Carracci e in Caravaggio*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Caffarelli-Clementino, Rome.
- Held, J. "Caravaggio in Süditalien und auf Malta, zu seinen späten Märtyrerbildern." In *Napoli vicerego spagnolo, una capitale della cultura alle origini dell'Europa moderna (sec. XVI–XVII)*, ed. M. Bosse and A. Stoll, pp. 289–405. Naples.
- Hockney, D. *Secret Knowledge: Rediscovering the Lost Techniques of the Old Masters*. London.
- Lambert, G. *Caravaggio (1571–1610)*. Cologne.
- Lang, W. K. *Grausame Bilder, Sadismus in der neapolitanischen Malerei von Caravaggio bis Giordano*. Berlin.
- L'anima e le cose: la natura morta nell'Italia pontificia nel XVII e XVIII secolo*. Exh. cat. Fano.
- Lavin, I. "Caravaggio Revolutionary or the Impossibility of Seeing." In *Opera e giorni, studi su mille anni di arte europea dedicati a Max Seidel*, ed. K. Bergdolt and G. Bonsanti, pp. 625–44. Venice.
- Lorizzo, L. "Cardinal Ascanio Filomarino's purchases of works of art in Rome: Poussin, Caravaggio, Vouet and Valentin." *Burlington Magazine* CXLIII, no. 1180 (July), pp. 404–11.
- Mambro, S. R. *Arcadie del vero, arte e teoria nella Roma del Seicento*. Sant'Oreste.

- Marini, M. *Caravaggio "pictor praestantissimus". L'iter artistico completo di uno dei massimi rivoluzionari dell'arte di tutti i tempi*, 3rd ed. Rome.
- Matteola, A. "L'autoretrato di un pittore agli Uffizi tolto dall'anonimato." In *Scritti di storia dell'arte in onore di Sylvie Béguin, Accademia Clementina di Bologna*, ed. M. Di Giampaolo and M. Gregori, pp. 387–402. Naples.
- Milazzo, R. *Caravaggio on the Beach, Essays on Art in the 1990s*. New York.
- Pacelli, V. "Caravaggio 'pittore maledetto,' Roma dedica al celebre artista due importanti mostre." In *Lazio ieri e oggi*, pp. 178–80.
- Papa, R. "L'artista come testimone. Letture iconologiche: la 'Deposizione' di Caravaggio." *Arte e dossier* XVI, 164, pp. 34–40.
- Papi, G. *Cecco del Caravaggio*. Soncino.
- Papi, G.² "Finson e altre congiunture di precoce naturalismo." *Paragone* LII, pp. 35–47.
- Pennent, J. *Le temps du caravagisme: la peinture de Toulouse et du Languedoc de 1590 à 1650*. Exh. cat., Musée Paul Dupuy, Toulouse.
- Phillips, J. "Reports of painter's death were greatly exaggerated." *London Times*, December 22, p. 4.
- Prohaska, W. *Kunsthistorisches Museum Wien*. Munich.
- Pulini, M. *San Matteo e l'Angelo di Giuseppe Vermiglio*. Siena.
- Pupillo, M. *La SS. Trinità dei Pellegrini di Roma: artisti e committenti al tempo di Caravaggio*. Rome.
- Resca, G. *La spada e la misericordia: Caravaggio e il demone della violenza*. Rome.
- Rudolf, C., and F. Ostrow. "Isaac Laughing. Caravaggio, non-traditional imagery and traditional identification." *Art History* 24, pp. 646–81.
- Russo, R. *Il ciclo francescano nella chiesa del Gesù a Roma*. Rome.
- Sbregondi, L. "Comende gerosolimitane a Firenze: tracce di storia artistic." In *Riviera di Levante tra Emilia e Toscana. Un crocevia per l'Ordine di San Giovanni*, ed. J. Costa Restagna. Genoa-Rapallo-Ciavari.
- Schneider, T. "Per il nuovo 'Davide e Golie' del Caravaggio, relazione technical." *Paragone* LI, pp. 23–28.

- Sickel, L. "Appunti archivistici su Onorio Longhi e Ippolito Buzzi." *Bollettino d'arte* 86.117, pp. 125–30.
- Sickel, L.² "Remarks on the Patronage of Caravaggio's 'Entombment of Christ'." *Burlington Magazine* 143, no. 1180 (July), pp. 426–29.
- Spezzaferro, L. "La Cappella Cerasi e il Caravaggio." In *Caravaggio, Carracci, Maderno*, ed. Bernardini et al., pp. 9–57. Milan.
- Spike, J. T., with assistance of Michèle K. Spike. *Caravaggio: with Catalogue Raisonné on CD-ROM*. New York and London.
- Strinati, C., and R. Vodret, ed. *Caravaggio e il Genio di Roma 1592–1623*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Venezia, Rome.
- Strinati, C., and R. Vodret, ed.² *Caravaggio e i suoi primi seguaci*. Exh. cat., Teyen Metropolitan Museum; Museum of Fine Arts, Tokyo-Okazaki.
- Talvecchia, B. *Taking Positions: On the Erotic in Renaissance Culture*. Princeton.
- Tantillo, A. M. "La Cappella Cerasi: vicende di una decorazione." In *Caravaggio, Carracci, Maderno*, ed. Bernardini et. al., pp. 49–75. Milan.
- Toninelli, G. ". . . con sua cornice nera alla romana grande con sopra Santo Francesco. Annotazioni sul Caravaggio della Pinacoteca di Cremona." *Arte lombarda* 3, pp. 79–87.
- Volpi, C. *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*. Rome.
- Walter, G. *Le Caravage, peintre roman*. Paris.
- 2002
- Antinori, A. "Caravaggio nel conflitto tra Onorio Longhi e Stefano Longhi." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 97–104.
- Astrua, P., A. M. Bava, and C. E. Spantigati. *La buona ventura di Georges de la Tour e aspetti del caravaggismo nordico in Piemonte*. Exh. cat., Galleria Sabauda, Turin. Milan.
- Baldriga, I. "Le virtù della scienza e la scienza dei virtuosi: i primi lincei e la diffusione del naturalismo in pittura." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 197–208. Rome.
- Barocchi, P., and G. Gaeta Bertelà. *Collezionismo Mediceo e Storia Artistica*, 2 vols. Florence.
- Bell, J., and T. Willette, eds. *Art History in the Age of Bellori: Scholarship and Cultural Politics in Seventeenth Century Rome*. Cambridge.

- Bernardini, M. G. "Una 'nuova' 'Conversione di S. Paolo' di Caravaggio, dall'azione alla storia." *Art e dossier* XVII, pp. 28–32.
- Berra, G. "Il giovane Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio: la sua famiglia e la scelta dell'ars pingendi." *Paragone* 53, pp. 40–128.
- Bora, G. "Da Peterzano a Caravaggio, un 'ipotesi sulla pratica disegnativa.'" *Paragone* 53, pp. 3–20.
- Bracco, P., and O. Ciappi. "Caravaggio: l'Incoronazione di Spine: e il suo doppio." *Restauro* 42, pp. 13–42.
- Calvesi, M. "Fautori e avversari del Caravaggio." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 13–21. Rome.
- Calvesi, M., and C. Volpi, eds. *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli: Convegno internazionale di studi, Roma, 24–26 maggio 2001*. Rome.
- Caneva, C., ed. *La Medusa del Caravaggio Restaurata*. Exh. cat., Galleria degli Uffizi, Sala delle Reali Poste, Florence.
- Cardinali, M., M. B. De Ruggieri, and C. Falucci. *Diagnostici Artistica, Tracce materiali per la storia dell'arte e per la conservazione*. Rome.
- Consolo, V. "La fuga di Caravaggio." *Kalòs* XIV, pp. 10–13.
- Contini, R. *Seventeenth and Eighteenth Century Italian Painting*. London.
- Convegno internazionale di Studi: "e modernamente si è messo in uso di parare li Palazzi compitamente con quadri."* *Fonti e documenti per la storia del collezionismo in Italia e in Europa centrale, 20–23 febbraio 2002*. Palazzo Giustiniani, Palazzo Rospigliosi, Austrian Institute, Roma. <http://web.fu-berlin.de/giove/english/confer/romcon.htm>.
- Corradini, S. "Il testamento del cardinale Matteo Contarelli e la sua quadreria." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 51–62. Rome.
- Corrain, L. "Cristo nell'orto di Caravaggio: un esempio di narrazione prodromica." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 221–32. Rome.
- Cortis, T., T. Freller, and L. Bugeja. *Melitensium Amor: Festschrift in honour of Dun Gwonn Azzopardi*. Malta.

- Cropper, L. "Caravaggio e la questione della Lirica." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 171–84. Rome.
- Danesi Squarzina, S. "Lionello Venturi, le prime radiografie di Caravaggio e i rapporti on l'Istituto Centrale del Restauro." *Storia dell'arte* 1, pp. 54–61.
- Dempf, P. *Das Vermächtnis des Caravaggio*. Frankfurt am Main.
- Dempsey, C. "Caravaggio e i due stili naturalistici: speculare contro maculare." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 185–96. Rome.
- Di Silvestro, P. "Caravaggio in Siracusa." *Kalòs* XIV, p. 12.
- Di Silvestro, P.² *La fuga e la sosta, Caravaggio a Siracusa*. Milan.
- Ebert-Schifferer, S. "Caravaggio 'Früchtekorb'—das früheste Stilleben?" *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* LXXV, pp. 1–23.
- Estivili, D. "Circa l'interpretazione iconografica della gestualità dei Santi." *Arte Cristiana* 90, pp. 219–25.
- Farina, V. *Giovan Carlo Doria promotore delle arti a Genova nel primo seicento*. Florence.
- Floridi, G. "La morte e la sepoltura di Caravaggio a Porto Ercole e la sua appartenenza all'Ordine di Malta." *Strenna dei Romanisti* 63, pp. 245–53.
- Galea, M. *Grandmaster Aloph de Wignacourt, 1601–1622*. Malta.
- Gash, J. "[Review] Caravaggio by John T. Spike." *Burlington Magazine* 144, no. 1192 (July), pp. 438–39.
- Gregori, M. "Caravaggio e i suoi." In *Natura morta italiana tra cinquecento e settecento*. Munich.
- Gregori, M., J. Hohenzollern, and G. von Prinz. *La natura morta italiana tra cinquecento e settecento*. Exh. cat., Kunsthalle, Munich; Palazzo Strozzi, Florence.
- Il ritratto in Lombardia da Moroni a Ceruti*. Exh. cat., Castello di Masnago, Varese.
- Kemp, M. "The cut-and-paste carafe." *Nature* 420 (Nov.), p. 364.
- Kloek, E. "Two northern examples for Caravaggio." In *Aux quatre vents: a Festschrift for Bert W. Meijer*, ed. Boschloo and Grasman. Florence.
- Kroschewski, N. *Über das allmähliche Verfertigen der Bilder: Neue Aspekte zu Caravaggio*. Munich.

- La Medusa del Caravaggio Restaurata*. Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence.
- Land, E. "Caravaggio's tongue." *Source* 21, pp. 36–38.
- Langdon, H. "[Review] *Caravaggio, Carracci, Maderno. La cappella Cerasi in Santa Maria del Popolo* by Maria Grazia Bernardini." *Burlington Magazine* 144, No. 1190 (May), p. 300.
- Maccherini, M. "Novita sulle Considerazioni di Giulio Mancini." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 123–28.
- Macioce, S. "Caravaggio a Malta: precisazioni documentarie." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 155–70. Rome.
- Marini, M. *Michelangelo da Caravaggio, Gaspare Murtola e la chioma avvelenata di Medusa*. Venice.
- Marini, M.² "Marino e Caravaggio: un ritratto nel contesto della Contarelli." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 233–42. Rome.
- Moffit, J. F. "Caravaggio and the Gypsies." *Paragone* 53, pp. 129–56.
- Moffit, J. F.² "Poisoned love posited in an emblematic lizard by Caravaggio." *Gazette des beaux-arts* 140, pp. 1–18.
- Olsen, T. P. "Pitiful Relics: Caravaggio's 'Martyrdom of St. Matthew'." *Representations* 77 (Winter), pp. 107–42.
- O'Neil, M. S. *Giovanni Baglione: Artistic Reputation in Baroque Rome*. Cambridge.
- Pacelli, V. *L'Ultimo Caravaggio 1606–1610: Il giallo dello morte; un omicidio di Stato?* Todi.
- Papa, R. *Caravaggio*. Florence.
- Papa, R.² "Il cosiddetto San Giovanni Battista della Borghese, il vello d'oro di Frisso." *Art & Dossier* 17, pp. 14–19.
- Papi, G. "Jusepe de Ribera a Roma e il Maestro del Giudizio di Salomone." *Paragone* 53 (July).
- Parronchi, A. *Caravaggio*. Milan.
- Perini, G. "Caravaggio e i Carracci: appunti su un intreccio di percorsi." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 303–12. Rome.

- Prohaska, W., and B. de Ruggieri. "Analisi scientifiche e storico-artistiche della Madonna del Rosario e del Davide del Caravaggio a Vienna" in Conference 'E modernamente si è messo in uso di parlar il Palazzi compitamente con quadri': Fonti e documenti per la storia del collezionismo in Italia e in Europa Centrale, Roma Università della Sapienza, Istituto Storico Austriaco. February 21–22, 2002. Website Progetto Giove, European Union.
- Pupillo, M. "La Madonna di Loreto di Caravaggio: gli scenari di una committenza." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 105–22. Rome.
- Röttgen, H. *Il Cavalier Giuseppe Cesari d'Arpino: un grande pittore nello splendore della fama e nell'incostanza della fortuna*. Rome.
- Sala, G. *La Parola si fa gesto. I gesti di Gesù interpretati da Giotto, Beato Angelico e Caravaggio*. Milan.
- Sciberras, K. "'Frater Michael Angelus in tumultu': the Cause of Caravaggio's imprisonment in Malta." *Burlington Magazine* 144, no. 1189 (Apr.), pp. 229–32.
- Sciberras, K.² "Riflessioni su Malta al tempo del Caravaggio." *Paragone* LIII, 3rd series, no. 44, pp. 3–20.
- Sgarbi, V., ed. *Da Tiziano a Caravaggio, a Tiepolo: Capolavori di tre secoli di arte italiana: Titian to Tiepolo: Three Centuries of Italian Art*. Exh. cat., Palazzina di Caccia di Stupinigi, Turin.
- Sickel, L. "Caravaggio's 'Heiliger Franziskus in Meditation über den Tod' als Sinnbild für das Schicksal der Familie Rustici." *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* 65, pp. 117–22.
- Slim, H. C. *Painting Music in the Sixteenth Century: Essays in Iconography*. Burlington, Vt.
- Sohm, P. "Caravaggio's Deaths." *Art Bulletin* 84, no. 3 (Sept.), pp. 449–68.
- Solinas, F. "Il naturalismo di Caravaggio e il Gusto del Cardinal Del Monte." In *La Medusa del Caravaggio Restaurata*, ed. C. Caneva. Florence.
- Solinas, F.² "La Signora degli Scorpioni. Un inedito di Ottavio Leoni (1578–1630) e qualche ritratto romano del tempo di Caravaggio." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 243–66.
- Spear, R. *From Caravaggio to Artemisia: Essays on Painting in Seventeenth-Century Italy and France*. London.
- Spezzaferro, L. "Caravaggio accettato: dal rifiuto al mercato." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 23–50.

Spike, J. T. *The Sense of Pleasure*. Milan.

Stone, D. M. "In figura diaboli: Self and Myth in Caravaggio's David and Goliath." In *From Rome to Eternity: Catholicism and the Arts in Italy, ca. 1550–1650*, ed. Jones and Worcester, pp. 19–42. Leiden-Boston.

Tempesta, C. "Le Storie di san Matteo di Girolamo Muziano per i Mattei: il restauro e qualche considerazione." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 63–80. Rome.

Testa, L. ". . . In ogni modo domatina uscimo: Caravaggio e gli Aldobrandini." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 129–54. Rome.

Tiberia, V. *La Compagnia di S. Giuseppe di Terrasanta nei pontificati di Clemente VIII, Leone XI e Paolo V (1595–1621)*. Lecce.

Treffers, B. *Caravaggio: die Bekehrung des Kunstlers*. Amsterdam.

Treffers, B.² "La comparsa del pentito: Caravaggio dopo Malta. Arte e confessione." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 209–21. Rome.

Vannugli, A. "Il primo ritratto del cardinale Benedetto Giustiniani 'in tela d'imperatore' con una proposta per Antonio Scavati e per Pietro Fachetti." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 267–90. Rome.

Vodret, R. "Giovanni Baglione, nuovi elementi per le due versioni dell'Amor sacro e amor profano." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 291–302. Rome.

Zuccari, A. "Un precedente iconografico per il primo "san Matteo" di Caravaggio." In *Caravaggio nel IV Centenario della Cappella Contarelli*, ed. M. Calvesi and C. Volpi, pp. 81–96.

2003

Barbera, G. *Caravaggio: Due capolavori a confronto*. Exh. cat., Syracuse.

Bardone, F. "A propos de Caravage: pulsions, 'figurae', picturalité." *Revue de l'Art* 160, pp. 72–75.

Bonello, V. *Histories of Malta, iv: Convictions and Conjectures*. Malta.

Bracco, P. "Caravaggio, l'Incoronazione di spine e il suo doppio." *OPD* 14, pp. 13–42.

- Peachment, C. *Caravaggio: A Novel*. London.
- Potts, T., ed. *Kimbell Art Museum, A Handbook of the Collection*. New Haven, Conn.
- Preimesberger, R. "Michelangelo da Caravaggio – Caravaggio da Michelangelo. Zum Amor in der Berliner Gemäldegalerie." In *Der stumme Diskurs der Bilder. Reflexionsformen des Ästhetischen in der Kunst der frühen Neuzeit*, pp. 243–60.
- Schütze, S. *Palazzo Sacchetti*. Rome.
- Sciberras, K. *L-Arti Barokka f'Malta*. Malta.
- Serracino-Inglott, P. "Baroque Philosophy and Death." *Journal of Baroque Studies* I.
- Sickel, L. *Caravaggios Rom: Annäherungen an ein dissonantes Milieu*. Berlin.
- Slatkes, L. J. "Master Jacomo, Trophime Bigot, and the Candlelight Master." In *Continuity, innovation and connoisseurship: Old Master Paintings at the Palmer Museum of Art*, ed. M. J. Harris, pp. 63–83. State College, Penn.
- Spear, R. "Scrambling for Scudi: Notes on Painters' Earnings in Early Baroque Rome." *The Art Bulletin*, vol. 85, 2 (June), pp. 310–15.
- Spinosa, N. *Ribera. L'opera completa*. Naples.
- Spiteri, S. C. *Armoury of the Knights*, rev. ed. Malta.
- Suthor, N. "Bad touch? Zum Körpereinsatz in Michelangelo/Pontormos 'Noli me tangere' und Caravaggios 'Ungläubige Thomas'." In *Der stumme Diskurs der Bilder*, ed. V. von Rosen, pp. 261–81.
- Treffers, B. "Caravaggio: la cappella Cerasi." *Storia dell'arte* 104/105, pp. 65–100.
- Von Rosen, V. "Bedeutungsspiele in Caravaggios Darstellungen Johannes des Täufers." *Kunsthistorische Arbeitsblätter* 7/8, pp. 59–72.
- Von Rosen, V.² *Der stumme Diskurs der Bilder*. Berlin.
- Wallace, W. "Caravaggio's Saint Francis." *Source*, III, pp. 12–13.

2004

- Bayer, A. *Painters of Reality: the Legacy of Leonardo and Caravaggio in Lombardy*. Exh. cat. New York.
- Bernard, D. "Caravaggio: Le Sette Opere della Misericordia nella Lettura di un giovane pittore, Bruno Fermariello, detective dell'arte." *Corriere del Mezzogiorno, Cultura*. October 12.

- Berti, L. *Richiamandoci il Caravaggio felice: l'apoteosi sua contemporanea e quella odierna*. Florence.
- Biscotti, P. *Caravaggio: Cattura di Cristo*. Exh. cat., Museo Diocesano, Milan.
- Bonazzoli, F. "Così il Caravaggio ha riavuto la sua Orsola." Il segno di Caravaggio, *Corriere della Sera Eventi*, June 28, 2004.
- Boucher, B. "Head of Medusa." *Art Institute of Chicago Museum Studies* 29, no. 2, pp. 62–63, 95.
- Caravaggio, La Medusa: Lo Splendore Degli Scudi Da Parata Del Cinquecento*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Bagatti-Valsecchi, Milan.
- Caravaggio: L'ultimo tempo 1606–1610 (The Final Years, 1606–1601)*. Exh. cat., Museo Capodimonte, Naples.
- Cardinali, M., M. B. De Ruggieri, and C. Falucci. "Le incisioni nel processo compositivo di Caravaggio." *Storia dell'arte* 87, pp. 50–62.
- Cardinali, M., M. B. De Ruggieri, and C. Falucci.² "Incisions in Caravaggio's working process, from the illumination of the subject to the depiction of shadows: a revolution without heirs?" *Technologische Studien Kunsthistorisches Museum, Wien* 2, pp. 55–71.
- Cardinali, M., M. B. De Ruggieri, and C. Falucci.³ "Le indagini scientifiche e la genesi di 'Nostra Signora della Misericordia'." In *Caravaggio a Napoli, dalle Sette Opere di Misericordia alla Sant'Orsola trafitta*, Tecnica e restauri, Naples.
- Cesena, M. *Cellini, Storie Barocche, da Guercino a Serra e Savolini nella Romagna del Seicento*. Bologna.
- Christiansen, K. "The Bounty of Caravaggio's Glorious Exile" (Review of the Caravaggio exhibition in Naples)." *The New York Times*, December 12.
- Costa Restagno, J. *Ottavio Costa (1554–1639), le sue case e i suoi quadri. Ricerche d'archivio*. Bordighera-Albenga.
- Duverger, E. *Documents concernant le commerce d'art de Francisco-Jacomo van den Berghe et Gillis von der Vennen de Gand avec la Hollande et la France pendant les premières décades du XVIIIe*. Wetteren.
- Elkins, J. *A History of People Who Have Cried in Front of Paintings*. London.
- Farrini, A. *In questa terra di Porto Hercole*. Monte Argentario.

- Fontana, M. *Caravaggio la Medusa*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Bagatti-Valsecchi, Milan.
- Frangi, F., and A. Morandotti. *Dipinti del Seicento – Collezione Koelliker*. Milan.
- Garbagna, C., and R. Savio, eds. *L'Ultimo Caravaggio: il martirio di Sant'Orsola restaurato*. Milan.
- Gash, J. "Review: Mario Minniti: l'eredità di Caravaggio a Siracusa, exhibition catalogue, G. Barbera and V. Greco, eds. Syracuse 2004." *Burlington Magazine* CXLVI, p. 1218.
- Gregori, M., and A. Bayer. *Pittori della realtà. Le ragioni di una rivoluzione da Foppa e Leonardo a Caravaggio*. Exh. cat. Milan.
- Guasti, A. *Caravaggio: l'opera pittorica complete*. Santarcangelo di Romagna.
- Hartje, N. Bartolomeo Manfredi. *Ein Nachfolger Caravaggio und seine europäische Wirkung*. Weimar.
- L'ultimo Caravaggio: il Martirio di Sant'Orsola restaurato: The Last Caravaggio: the Mario Minniti: l'eredità di Caravaggio a Siracusa*. Exh cat., Chiesa del Collegio dei Gesuiti, Siracusa. Naples.
- Martyrdom of Saint Ursula restored: Banca Intesa collection*. Exh. cat., Galleria Borghese; Pinacoteca ambrosiana, Milan; Gallerie di Palazzo Leoni Montanari, Vicenza.
- Marini, M., and Mahon, D. "Caravaggio, Murtola e 'la chioma avvelenata di Medusa'." *Artibus et Historiae* 25, no. 49, pp. 175–84.
- Moffitt, J. F. *Caravaggio in Context: Learned Naturalism and Renaissance Humanism*. Jefferson, N.C.
- Mozzarelli, C., ed. *Federico Borromeo principe e mecenate: atti delle Giornate di studio, 21–22 novembre 2003*. Accademia di S. Carlo, Biblioteca ambrosiana, Milan.
- Olszewski, E. *The Inventory of Paintings of Cardinal Pietro Ottobini (1667–1740)*. New York.
- Painters of Reality: The Legacy of Leonardo and Caravaggio in Lombardy*. Ed. A. Bayer. Exh cat., Museo civico ala Ponzzone di Cremona; The Metropolitan Museum, New York.
- Petrucci, F. "Una Maddalena addolorata del Caravaggio." *Paragone* LV, 57, pp. 3–15.
- Puglisi, C. "Review Nicola Spinosa, ed. Caravaggio : l'ultimo tempo 1606–1610." *Simiolus: Netherlands Quarterly for the History of Art* 31, no. 3, pp. 251–55.
- Pupillo, M. "Francesco de' Rustici e la copia dei Cappuccini del San Francesco in meditazione del Caravaggio." *Storia dell'arte* 108–8, pp. 79–94.
- Randon, P. Farrugia. *Caravaggio Knight of Malta*. Malta.

- Ravasi, G. "Sant'Orsola: la storia, la leggenda, iconografia." In *Rome-Milan-Vicenza 2004*, pp. 16–27.
- Sapio, M. ed. *Mario Minniti: l'eredità di Caravaggio a Siracusa*. Naples.
- Stone, D. "Caravaggio and Caravaggism." In *Europe, 1450–1789: Encyclopedia of the Early Modern World*, ed. J. Dewald. 6 vols.
- Vodret, R. "I doppi di Caravaggio: le due versioni del San Francesco in Meditazione." *Storia dell'arte*, 108, pp. 45–78.
- Zafran, E., ed. *Renaissance to Rococo: Masterpieces from the Wadsworth Atheneum Museum of Art*. Hartford, Conn.
- Zerafa, M. *Caravaggio – Diaries: Extracts from Fr. Marius Zerafa's Diaries*. Ed. C. S. Galea. Malta.
- 2005
- Bellori, G. P. *The Lives of the Modern Painters, Sculptors, and Architects*. Trans. A. S. Wohl, notes H. Wohl, intro. T. Montanari. New York.
- Berra, G. *Il giovane Caravaggio in Lombardia: Ricerche documentarie sui Merisi, gli Aratori e i marchesi di Caravaggio*. Florence.
- Bissell, R.W. *Masters of Italian Baroque Painting: The Detroit Institute of Arts*. London.
- Camerota, F. "Looking for an artificial eye on the borderline between painting and topography." *Early Science and Medicine* 10(2), p. 264.
- Caravaggio: the Final Years: 1606–1610*. Exh. cat., Royal Academy, London.
- Caravaggio e l'Europa: Il movimento caravaggesco internazionale da Caravaggio a Mattia Preti*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Reale, Milan.
- Caravaggio y la pintura realista europea*. Exh. cat., Barcelona.
- Carofano, P., ed. *Luce e Ombra: Caravaggio e naturalismo nella pittura toscana del seicento*. Exh. cat., Pontedera.
- Christiansen, K. "Going for Baroque: Bringing 17th-Century Masters to the Met." *Metropolitan Museum of Art Bulletin* 62.
- Cole, J. "Se di fuori è dorata, dentro è d'oro: Maffeo Barberini, Michelangelo il giovane e Galileo." *Belfagor* LX, no. 355, fasc. 1 (Jan.).

- Danesi Squarzina, S. *La cappella Contarelli in San Luigi dei Francesi: arte e committenza nella Roma di Caravaggio*. Rome.
- Fo, Dario, and F. Rame. *Caravaggio al tempo di Caravaggio: In Occasione Della Mostra Caravaggio, Una Mostra Impossibile a Roma, Castel Sant'Angelo*. Museo nazionale di Castel Sant'Angelo, Rome.
- Il genio degli anonimi: Maestri caravaggeschi a Roma e a Napoli*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Reale, Milan.
- Gianfreda, S. *Caravaggio, Guercino, Mattia Preti: das halbfigurige Historienbild und die Sammler des Seicento*. Berlin.
- Gregori, M. "Tre cartelle per tre mostre caravaggesche." *Paragone* LVI, 669/64, pp. 3–24.
- Harr, J. *The Lost Painting: The Quest for a Caravaggio Masterpiece*. New York.
- Lapucci, R. *Caravaggio e l'ottica*. Florence.
- Mahon, D. *Caravaggio San Pietro penitente con il gallo*. Venice.
- Mancini, G., G. Baglione, and G. P. Bellori. *Lives of Caravaggio with an introduction by Helen Langdon*. London.
- Marini, M. *Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio "pictor praestantissimus" L'iter artistico completo di uno dei massimi rivoluzionari dell'arte di tutti i tempi*. 4th ed. Rome.
- Milicua, J., and M. M. Cuyàs. *Caravaggio y la pintura realista europea*. Exh. cat. Barcelona.
- Most, G.W. *Doubting Thomas*. Cambridge, Mass.
- Pacelli, V. "Del Martirio di sant'Orsola di Caravaggio e i suoi capisti, ovvero una renovatio iconografica (Azzolino, Strozzi ed altri)." In *Per la storia dell'arte in Italia e in Europa. Studi in onore di Luisa Mortari*, pp. 183–99. Rome.
- Pagano, D.M. ed. *Caravaggio a Napoli: dalle Opere di Misericordia alla Sant'Orsola trafitta*. Exh. cat. Naples.
- Papa, R. *Caravaggio: pittore di Maria*. Milan.
- Paton, J. *How to Look at a Painting*. New Zealand.
- Prose, F. *Caravaggio: Painter of Miracles*. New York.
- Raggio, O. "A Giustiniani Bacchus and François Duquesnoy." *Metropolitan Museum Journal: Essays in Memory of John M. Brealey* 40, pp. 197–210.
- Rowland, I. *From Heaven to Arcadia: The Sacred and the Profane in the Renaissance*. New York.
- Saracino, F. "Caravaggio e i pittori dell'Ispirazione." In *Gregorianum*, pp. 496–522.

- Sciberras, K. "Due persone à lui ben viste: the identity of Caravaggio's companion as a Knight of Magistral Obedience." *Burlington Magazine* CXLVII (Jan.).
- Sciberras, K., and D. Stone. "Malaspina, Malta, and Caravaggio's St. Jerome." *Paragone*, LXI, terza serie, no. 60 (Mar.).
- Sebregondi, L. "Caravaggio e la Toscana" In *Luce e Ombra: Caravaggio e naturalismo nella pittura toscana del seicento*, pp. XLI–LIX.
- Sebregondi, L.² *San Jacopo in Campo Corbolini a Firenze. Percorsi storici dai Templari all'Ordine di Malta all'era moderna*. Florence.
- Sgarbi, V. *Caravaggio*. Milan.
- Siena e Roma: Raffaello, Caravaggio e i protagonisti di un legame antico*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Sgarbinalupi, Siena.
- Spear, R. "Late Caravaggio. Naples and London." *Burlington Magazine* 147, pp. 140–42.
- Varriano, J. "Fruits and Vegetables as Sexual Metaphor in Late Renaissance Rome." *Gastronomica* 5, no. 4 (Nov.), pp. 8–14.
- Vsevolozhskaya, S. N., M. Marini, L. Tonatto, and A. Marini. *The "Pictures and Scents of Caravaggio" Project*. Saint Petersburg.
- 2006
- Bull, D. *Rembrandt–Caravaggio*. Exh. cat., Rijksmuseum and Van Gogh Museum, Amsterdam.
- Capolavori da scoprire. Odescalchi, Pallavicini. Catalogo della mostra*. Rome.
- Come Lavorava Caravaggio. Capolavori nelle collezioni private*. Exh. cat., Gate-Termini Art Gallery, Rome.
- Debout, M., and D. Cettour. *Science et Mythologie de la Mort*. Paris.
- De Groft, A. "A Sensuous Masterpiece." In *Bulletin of the Museum of Art of the College of William and Mary*, Williamsburg, Va.
- "Delight at Caravaggio discovery." *BBC News, Europe*, January 25, 2006.
- De Stefano, S. "l'uomo del mistero dipinto da Caravaggio." *Corriere del Mezzogiorno, Cultura*. November 2.
- Gelly, C. *Musée des beaux-arts: peintures italiennes et espagnoles, XIVE–XIXe*. Nancy.

- Harten, J., M. Marini, and J. H. Martin. *Caravaggio. Originale und Kopien im Spiegel der Forschung*. (*Caravaggio e i suoi doppi* italian insert by M. Marini), introduction by Sir Denis Mahon. Exh. cat., Museum Kunst Palast, Düsseldorf.
- Kaylor, M. *Secreted Desires: The Major Uranians: Hopkins, Pater and Wilde*. Brno.
- Lepri, G. *Capolavori da scoprire: Odescalchi, Palaviccini*. Milan.
- Loire, S. *Peintures italiennes du XVIIIe siècle du musée du Louvre*. Paris.
- Loire, S., and E. Ravaud, “La mort de la Vierge du Caravage au laboratoire.” *Technè*, no. 23, pp. 40–44.
- L'ultimo Caravaggio*. (“Arte Documento,” 21) Monfalcone.
- Mahon, D. *Caravaggio e il seicento*. Exh. cat., Museum of Cycladic Art, Athens.
- Marini, M. *Michelangelo da Caravaggio: la Maddalena di Paliano*. Rome.
- Marini, M., and D. Mahon. *Come Lavorava Caravaggio*. Exh. cat., Rome.
- Papa, R. *Caravaggio*. Florence.
- Papi, G. *La schola del Caravaggio: Dipinti dalla Collezione Koelliker*. Exh. cat. Palazzo Chigi, Ariccia.
- Petrucchi, F. “Seguaci del Caravaggio ad Ariccia: dai Savelli ai Chigi alla collezione Koelliker.” In *La schola del Caravaggio*, ed. G. Papi, pp. 25–35. Ariccia.
- Rosenberg, P. *Only in America: One Hundred Paintings in American Museums Unmatched in European Collections*. Milan.
- Röttgen, H. *Caravaggio: L'amore terreno*. Modena.
- Sciberras K., and D. Stone. *Caravaggio: Art, Knighthood, and Malta*. Malta.
- Spinosa, N. *Ribera. L'opera completa*. Naples (2nd ed. 2003).
- Stone, D. “Bad Habit: Scipione Borghese, Wignacourt and the Problem of Cigoli’s Knighthood.” In *Celebratio Amicitiae, Essays in honor of Giovanni Bonello*, Malta.
- Tàtrai, V. *The Triumphant, the Defeated and the Victim: Caravaggio: David with the Head of Goliath*. Exh. cat., Museum of Fine Arts, Budapest.
- Tresoldi, F. *Il Caravaggio: ipotesi e realtà*. Bergamo.
- Varriano, J. *Caravaggio: The Art of Realism*. Pennsylvania State University Press, State College, Penn.

von Lates, A. "Caravaggio in the Garden of Priapus: Miscellaneous observations on the semiotic, poetic and polemical contexts for the Still Life on a Stone Ledge." In *Acts of a Symposium held at the Muscarelle Museum*.

Vodret, R. *Il Caravaggio Odescalchi: le due versioni della Conversione di San Paolo a confronto*. Exh. cat., Santa Maria del Popolo, Rome.

Warwick, G. *Caravaggio: Realism, Rebellion, Reception*. Newark, Del.

Williamsburg, Va. *Acts of a Symposium held at the Muscarelle Museum, College of William and Mary, Williamsburg, VA, November 10–11, 2006, Virginia, 2010*.

2007

Amadesi, P. *Sette opere in Napoli. Il Caravaggio a Napoli, tra il 1606 e il 1607*. Naples.

Caravaggio e il suo ambiente: Ricerche e interpretazioni. Ed. S. Ebert-Schifferer, J. Kliemann, V. von Rosen, and L. Sickel. Rome.

Caravaggio 400: Flair in *The Malta Independent* Special Commemorative edition on Sunday, November 2007.

Carminati, M. "Caravaggio da Milano." In *Il Sole 24 Ore*, Sunday, February 25, 2007, p. 29.

Clark, E., ed. *Caravaggio*. New York-London.

Dal Bello, M. *Caravaggio. Percorsi di arte & cinema*. Milan.

Debono, S. *Understanding Caravaggio and His Art in Malta*. Exh. cat., Valletta.

de Giorgio, C., and K. Sciberras. *Caravaggio and Paintings of Realism in Malta*. Valletta.

Filippetti, R. *Caravaggio. L'urlo e la luce. Una storia in cinque stanze*. Castel Bolognese.

Gash, J. "Caravaggesque Crossroads." In *Caravaggio and Paintings of Realism in Malta*, ed. Sciberras and De Giorgio, pp. 117–32. Valletta.

Gash, J.² "Exhibition Review: Caravaggio: Auf den Spuren eines Genies (Düsseldorf, 2006)." *Burlington Magazine* CXLIX.

Greco, G. *Caravaggio*. Milan.

Herrmann-Fiore, K. *Dürer e l'Italia*. Exh. cat., Rome.

Jover, M. *Caravaggio*. Paris.

König, E. *Caravaggio*. Königswinter.

- Langdon, H. "Caravaggio Biography in Paint." In *Caravaggio and Paintings of Realism in Malta*, ed. K. Sciberras and C. De Giorgio, pp. 53–78. Valletta.
- Lapucci, R. "The Technique of Caravaggio's Late Years 1606–10." In *Caravaggio and Paintings of Realism in Malta*, ed. K. Sciberras and C. De Giorgio, pp. 133–38. Valletta.
- Leone de Castris, P. "Finson and the 'Colony' of Flemish Artists in Early Seventeenth Century Naples." In *Louis Finson*, ed. P. Smeets, pp. 39–51. Milan.
- Marini, M. *Michelangelo da Caravaggio 1602: la notte di Abramo*, with preface by Sir Denis Mahon. Rome.
- Marini, M., and D. Mahon. *Caravaggio l'immagine del Divino: Un tributo a Sir Denis Mahon*. Exh. cat., Valletta.
- Marubbi, M. *La pinacoteca ala Ponzzone*. Cremona.
- Sciberras, K. "Caravaggio, the Confraternità della Misericordia, and the original context of the Oratory of the decollato in Valletta." *Burlington Magazine* CXLIX (Nov.).
- Sciberras, K., and C. De Giorgio. *Caravaggio and Paintings of Realism in Malta*. Exh. cat., St. John's Co-Cathedral, Valletta.
- Serracino-Inglott, P. "Ars Moriendi – Ad Usum Proprium: Aspects of Dealing with Death in Caravaggio." In *Caravaggio and Paintings of Realism in Malta*, ed. K. Sciberras and C. De Giorgio, pp. 89–100. Valletta.
- Sgarbi, V. *Caravaggio*. Milan.
- Smeets, P. *Louis Finson: The Four Elements*. Milan.
- Spike, J. T. "Caravaggio's Late Paintings: Invisible Witnesses." In *Caravaggio and Paintings of Realism in Malta*, ed. K. Sciberras and C. De Giorgio, pp. 79–88. Valletta.
- Spinosa, N. *Omaggio a Capodimonte: da Caravaggio a Picasso*. Exh. cat., Museo Capodimonte, Naples.
- Steinbrück, M. "Portrait oder kein Portrait: zur Bedeutung des Portraits im Marienbild Caravaggios." In *Das Portrait: eine Bildgattung und ihre Möglichkeiten*, pp. 57–70. Munich.
- Stone, D. "Painting in Exile." In *Caravaggio and Paintings of Realism in Malta*, ed. K. Sciberras and C. De Giorgio, pp. 65–78. Valletta.
- Terzaghi, M. C. *Caravaggio, Annibale Carracci, Guido Reni tra le ricevute del banco Herrera & Costa*. Rome.

Walsh, E. "Images of Hope: Representations of the Death of the Virgin, East and West." In *Religion and the Arts*. 11, no. 1, pp. 1–44.

Warner, M. *An Early Masterpiece of Still-Life Painting*. Fort Worth.

Whitaker, L., and M. Clayton. *The Art of Italy in the Royal Collection. Renaissance and Baroque*. Exh. cat., Queen's Gallery, Buckingham Palace, London.

2008

Baumstark, R. *Ulrich Loth: Zwischen Caravaggio und Rubens*. Exh. cat., Alte Pinakothek, Munich.

Benati, D., and A. Paolucci. *Caravaggio: i Bari della collezione Mahon*. Exh. cat. Forlì.

De Marchi, A. *Il Palazzo Doria Pamphilj al Corso e le sue collezioni*, 2d ed. Florence.

Domínguez, J. B., L. N. Fernández, and A. S. Ledesma. *Caravaggism and Classicism in Italian Painting at the Thyssen-Bornemisza Museum: A Technical and Historical Study*. Madrid.

Fratarcangeli, M. *Intorno a Caravaggio: dalla formazione alla fortuna*. Rome.

Gage, F. "Exercise for Mind and Body: Giulio Mancini, Collecting, and the Beholding of Landscape Painting in the Seventeenth Century." *Renaissance Quarterly* 61, no. 4 (Winter), pp. 1167–1210.

Jones, P. *Altarpieces and Their Viewers in the Churches of Rome from Caravaggio to Guido Reni*. Aldershot, England; Burlington, Vt.

Lapucci, R. *The Zejtun Painting: Shades of Caravaggio*. Florence.

Merlini, V., and D. Storti. *Caravaggio a Milano: La conversione di Saulo*. Exh. cat., Palazzo Marino, Milan.

Mochi Onori, L., and R. Vodret Adamo. *Galleria Nazionale d'arte antica*. Palazzo Barberini. Rome (and earlier editions, 1989 and 1998).

Obras maestras del Museo de Montserrat en BBVA: de Caravaggio a Picasso. Exh. cat. Palacio del Marqués de Salamanca, Madrid.

Papa, R. *Caravaggio: l'arte e la natura*. Florence.

Saggio, A. *Lo Strumento di Caravaggio*. Rome.

Scaletti, F. *Caravaggio. La vita del grande artista raccontata attraverso i suoi quadri*. Milan.

Spadaro, A. *Caravaggio in Sicilia: il percorso smarrito*. Acireale.

Whitfield, C. "The 'Camerino' of Cardinal del Monte." *Paragone* LIX, no. 77 (Jan.), pp. 3–38.

Zuffi, S. *Caravaggio*. Milan.

2009

Barbieri, C., and D. Frascarelli. *Natura morta: rappresentazione dell'oggetto, oggetto come rappresentazione*, Convegno Internazionale di Studi, Accademia di Belle Arti. December 11–12, 2008. Naples.

Cappelletti, F. *Caravaggio. Un ritratto somigliante*. Milan.

Caravaggio e l'Europa: l'artista, la storia, la tecnica e la sua eredità, Convegno internazionale di studi. February 3 and 4, 2006. Directed by Luigi Spezzaferro; scientific coordinator Marcherita Fratarcangeli. Milan.

Coliva, A., and M. Peppiat. *Caravaggio Bacon*. Exh. cat., Rome.

Giantomassi, C. "Note di tecnica pittorica su alcuni dipinti di Caravaggio." In *Caravaggio e l'Europa*, ed. L. Spezzaferro, pp. 21–30. Milan.

Gregori, M., M. C. Bandera, and D. Banzato. *Caravaggio, Lotto, Ribera: Quattro secoli di capolavori dalla Fondazione Longhi a Padova*. Exh. cat., Padua.

Gregori, M., M. C. Bandera, and D. Banzato.² *Dal Duecento a Caravaggio: Capolavori dalla Fondazione Longhi*. Exh. cat., Padua.

Houghton, J., et al. *Philippe de Montebello and The Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1977–2008*. New York.

Lapucci, R. *L'eredità tecnica del Caravaggio a Napoli, in Sicilia e a Malta: Spigolature sul Caravaggismo meridionale*. Florence.

Les Caravagge de Philippe de Béthune . . . Le point de l'enquête. Hotel de Ville, 37600 Loches, France. February 2009.

Maderna, V., and A. Pacia. *Caravaggio ospita Caravaggio*. Exh. cat., Pinacoteca di Brera, Milan.

Merlini, V., D. Storti, and C. Falcucci. "Caravaggio, Manfredi, E Saraceni: tecniche a confronto." In *Caravaggio e l'Europa*, ed. L. Spezzaferro, pp. 35–39. Milan.

- Painted Optics Symposium: Re-Examining the Hockney-Falco Thesis 7 Years On.* Fondazione Giorgio Ronchi and Studio Art Centers International. Florence.
- Rosen, V. von. *Caravaggio und die Grenzen des Darstellbaren. Ambiguität, Ironie und Performativität in der Malerei um 1600.* Berlin.
- Ruiz Gómez, L. *Juan Bautista Maíno.* Exh. cat., Museo Nacional del Prado, Madrid.
- Sander, J., B. Eclercy, and G. Dette. *Caravaggio in Holland: Musik und Genre bei Caravaggio und den Utrechter Caravaggisten.* Exh. cat., Städel Museums, Frankfurt am Main, Munich.
- Schütze, S. *Caravaggio, The Complete Works.* Cologne.
- Sgarbi, V., ed. *Le Stanze del Cardinale: Caravaggio, Reni, Guercino, Preti.* Exh. cat., Palazzo dei Cardinali Pallotta, Caldarola (Macerata).
- Spezzaferro, L., ed. *Caravaggio e l'Europa : l'artista, la storia, la tecnica e la sua eredità; atti del convegno internazionale di studi, Milano, 3 e 4 febbraio 2006.* Milan.
- Spinosa, N., and N. Price. *Pittura del seicento a Napoli: da Caravaggio a Massimo Stanzione.* Naples.
- Strinati, C. *La "Vera" vita di Caravaggio.* Naples.
- Strinati, C., and A. Zuccari. *Alla luce di Caravaggio: percorsi e protagonisti della pittura europea 1600–1630.* Milan.
- Terzaghi, M. C. "The first copies of Caravaggio." In *Caravaggio e l'Europa*, ed. L. Spezzaferro, pp. 88–91. Milan.
- Wilson Smith, T. *Caravaggio.* London.
- FORTHCOMING 2010
- Garofano, L., S. Vinceti, and G. Gruppioni. *Il Mistero Caravaggio. Una vita dissoluta, una morte misteriosa, un corpo scomparso.* Milan.
- Whitaker, L., and R. Featherstone. "The Calling of Saints Andrew and Peter—A Question of Attribution." *Burlington Magazine*, forthcoming.
- N.D.
- Canons and Decrees of the Sacred Oecumenical Council of Trent Celebrated under the Sovereign Pontiffs Paul III, Julius III, and Pius IV.* Trans. J. Waterworth. Chicago.

Exhibition Catalogues

Amsterdam 2006

Rijksmuseum; Van Gogh Museum. *Rembrandt–Caravaggio*, ed. D. Bull.

Ariccia 2006–7

Palazzo Chigi. *La schola del Caravaggio: Dipinti dalla Collezione Koelliker*.

Athens 1992

National Gallery, Alexander Soutzos Museum. *From El Greco to Cézanne: Masterpieces of European Painting from the National Gallery of Art, Washington, and The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York*.

Athens 2006

Museum of Cycladic Art. *Caravaggio e il seicento*.

Barcelona 2005

Museu Nacional d'Art Catalunya. *Caravaggio y la pintura realista europa*, ed. J. Milicua and M. M. Cuyàs.

Beijing 2006

Beijing World Art Museum. *Lo specchio del tempo*.

Bergamo 2000

Accademia Carrara. *Caravaggio: la luce nella pittura lombarda*.

Berlin 1980

Staatliche Museen Preussischer Kulturbesitz, Gemäldegalerie. *Bilder vom Menschen in der Kunst des Abendlandes*, ed. E. Schleier.

Berlin 2003

Gemäldegalerie. *Pracht und Pathos: Meisterwerke der Barockmalerei aus dem Palazzo Bianco in Genua*.

Bilbao-Seville 2005

Museo de Bellas Artes de Bilbao; Hospital de los Venerables Sacerdotes, Seville. *De Herrera a Velázquez. El primer naturalismo en Sevilla.*

Bordeaux 1955

L'âge d'or espagnol. La peinture en Espagne et en France autour du Caravagisme, ed. G. Martin Mery.

Boston 1970

Museum of Fine Arts. *Masterpieces of Painting in The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York.*

Boston 1999

McMullen Museum of Art, Boston College. *Saints and Sinners: Caravaggio and the Baroque Image*, ed. F. Mormando.

Brescia 1998

Museo di Santa Giulia. *Da Caravaggio a Ceruti: la scena di genere e l'immagine dei pitocchi nella pittura italiana*, ed. F. Porzio.

Budapest 2006

Szépművészeti Múzeum. *The Triumphant, the Defeated and the Victim: Caravaggio: David with the Head of Goliath.*

Caldarola (Macerata) 2009

Palazzo dei Cardinali Pallotta. *Le Stanze del cardinale: Caravaggio, Reni, Guercino, Preti.*

Canberra-Melbourne 2002

National Gallery of Australia, Canberra; Melbourne Museum. *Titian to Tiepolo: Three Centuries of Italian Art.*

Caravaggio 2003

Centro monumentale di San Bernardino. *Caravaggio a Caravaggio, esposizione del Ragazzo che sbuccia un melangolo*, ed. M. Marini.

Cleveland 1971–72

Cleveland Museum of Art. *Caravaggio and His Followers*, ed. R. Spear.

Cremona-Rome 1987

Palazzo Venezia, Rome. *Dopo Caravaggio: Bartolomeo Manfredi e “la Manfrediana Methodus,”* ed. M. Gregori.

Cremona 1996

Centro culturale, Città di Cremona, Santa Maria della Pietà. *Le immagini del sentire*, ed. S. Ferino-Pagden.

Cremona-New York 2004

Museo Civico Ala Ponzone, Cremona; The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York. *Painters of Reality: the Legacy of Leonardo and Caravaggio in Lombardy*, ed. M. Gregori and A. Bayer.

Des Moines-Boston-New York 1975–76

Des Moines Art Center; Museum of Fine Arts, Boston; The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York. *Jacques Bellange*, ed. A. Worthen and S. W. Reed.

Detroit 1965

Detroit Institute of Arts. *Art in Italy, 1600–1700*, ed. F. Cummings.

Dublin 1993

National Gallery of Ireland. *Caravaggio: The Master Revealed*, ed. S. Benedetti.

Düsseldorf 2006–7

Museum Kunst Palast. *Caravaggio, Originale und Kopien im Spiegel der Forschung (Caravaggio e i suoi doppi)*, ed. J. Harten, M. Marini, and J. H. Martin.

Edinburgh 1883

National Gallery. *Old Masters and Scottish National Portraits*.

Essen 1960

Museum Folkwang. *Sammlung Thyssen-Bornemisza*.

Florence 1911

Palazzo Pitti. *Mostra del ritratto italiano dalla fine del secolo XVI all'anno 1861*, ed. Fogliano.

Florence 1922

Palazzo Pitti. *Mostra della pittura italiana del seicento*, ed. M. Marangoni.

Florence 1970

Palazzo Pitti. *Caravaggio e i Caravaggeschi nelle gallerie di Firenze*, ed. E. Borea.

Florence 1991

Galleria Palatina, Palazzo Pitti. *Caravaggio. Come nascono i capolavori*, ed. M. Gregori.

Florence 1996

Palazzo Vecchio. *Caravaggio da Malta a Firenze*.

Florence 1998

Palazzo Pitti. *La natura morta a palazzo e in villa. Le collezioni dei Medici e dei Lorena*.

Florence 2002

Galleria degli Uffizi. *La Medusa di Caravaggio Restaurata*, ed. C. Caneva.

Florence 2003

Palazzo Strozzi. *La natura morta italiana. Da Caravaggio al Settecento*, ed. M. Gregori.

Floriana 1960

Cathedral Museum. *L'arte sacra a Malta*, ed. J. A. Cauchi.

Forlì 2008

Musei San Domenico. *Caravaggio. I 'Bari' della collezione Mahon*, ed. D. Benati and A. Paolucci.

Fort Worth 1954

The Kimbell Art Museum. *Inaugural Exhibition*.

Fort Worth 2007

Kimbell Art Museum. *Guest of Honor Exhibition: An Early Masterpiece of Still-Life Painting*, ed. M. Warner.

Frankfurt am Main 2009

Städel Museum. *Caravaggio in Holland. Musik und Genre bei Caravaggio und den Utrechter Caravaggisten*, ed. J. Sander, B. Eclercy, and G. Dette.

Genoa 1947

Galleria Nazionale di Palazzo Spinola and Galleria di Palazzo Reale. *Pittura del seicento etc. in Liguria*, ed. A. Morassi.

Genoa 1992

Galleria Nazionale di Palazzo Spinola and Galleria di Palazzo Reale. *Genova nell'età barocca*, ed. E. Gavazzo and G. Rotondi Terminiello.

Genoa 1995

Palazzo Ducale. *Bernardo Strozzi: Genova 1581/82–Venezia 1644*.

Genoa 2004

Palazzo Ducale. *L'età di Rubens*.

Hartford 1938

The Wadsworth Atheneum. *Painters of Still Life*.

Hartford 1940

The Wadsworth Atheneum. *Night Scenes*.

Hartford 1943

The Wadsworth Atheneum. *Caravaggio*.

Hartford 1949

The Wadsworth Atheneum. *In Retrospect: Twenty-one Years of Museum Collecting*.

Hartford 1963

The Wadsworth Atheneum. *Harvest of Plenty. De Gustibus: An Exhibition of Banquets and Eating Scenes*.

Hartford 1997

The Wadsworth Atheneum. *Caravaggio and His Italian Followers: From the Collections of the Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica di Roma*, ed. M. Gregori.

Houston 1962

Houston University of St. Thomas. *The Age of a Thousand Flowers*.

Leningrad 1973

Hermitage Museum. *Caravaggio e i Caravaggeschi nelle gallerie dell'U.R.S.S.*, ed. S. N. Vsevolozhskaya and I.V. Linnik.

London 1930

Royal Academy of Arts. *Exhibition of Italian Art*, ed. Lord Baniel and K. Clark.

London 1950

Royal Academy of Arts. *Exhibition of Works by Holbein and Other Masters of the 16th and 17th Centuries*.

London 1950–51

Burlington House. *Winter Exhibition*.

London 1955

Wildenstein & Co. *Artists in 17th-Century Rome*, ed. D. Mahon and D. Sutton.

London-Washington-Naples-Turin 1982–83

Royal Academy of Arts, London; National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.; Museo Nazionale di Capodimonte, Naples; Palazzo Reale, Turin. *Painting in Naples from Caravaggio to Giordano*, ed. C. Whitfield and J. Martineau.

London 1985

Matthiesen Gallery. *Around 1610: The Onset of the Baroque*.

London 1988

Royal Academy of Arts. *Old Master Paintings from the Thyssen-Bornemisza Collection*.

London 1998

National Gallery. *Caravaggio: The Flagellation of Christ, a Loan from the Musée des Beaux Arts, Rouen, at the National Gallery of London*, ed. G. Finaldi.

London-Rome 2001

Royal Academy of Arts, London; Palazzo Venezia, Rome. *The Genius of Rome 1592–1623*, ed. B. Brown, C. Strinati, and R. Vodret.

London 2008

Queen's Gallery, Buckingham Palace. *The Art of Italy in the Royal Collection. Renaissance and Baroque*, ed. L. Whitaker and M. Clayton.

Lucerne 1946

Italienische Kunst, Ambrosiana Mailand.

Madrid 1970

Museo del Prado. *Pittura italiana del siglo XVII*, ed. A. E. Pérez Sánchez.

Madrid 1985

Museo del Prado–Palacio de Villahermosa. *Pittura napoletana de Caravaggio a Giordano*, ed. A. E. Pérez Sánchez.

Madrid 1987

Maestros Antiguos de la Colección Thyssen-Bornemisza.

Madrid-Bilbao 1999

Museo del Prado, Madrid; Museo de Bellas Artes, Bilbao. *Caravaggio.*

Madrid 2008

Palacio del Marqués de Salamanca. *Obras maestras del Museo de Montserrat en BBKA: de Caravaggio a Picasso.*

Mantua 1996

Palazzo del Te. *Domenico Fetti*, ed. E. Safarik.

Milan 1951

Palazzo Reale. *Mostra del Caravaggio e dei Caravaggeschi*, ed. R. Longhi, C. Baroni, G. A. Dell'Acqua, and M. Gregori.

Milan 1972

Finarte. *Mostra dei dipinti del XIV al XVIII secolo*, ed. E. Volpe.

Milan 1996

Fondazione Arte e Civiltà. *I capolavori della collezione Doria Pamphilij da Tiziano a Velázquez.*

Milan 1999

Pinacoteca Brera. *Il seicento a Roma da Caravaggio a Salvator Rosa*, ed. S. Guarino.

Milan 2001

Palazzo Reale. *Il cinquecento lombardo. Da Leonardo a Caravaggio*, ed. G. Scavizzi.

Milan 2004

Museo Diocesano. *Caravaggio. Cattura di Cristo*.

Milan 2004²

Museo Bagatti Valsecchi. *Caravaggio. La Medusa. Lo splendore degli scudi da parata del Cinquecento*, ed. M. Fontana.

Milan 2005–6

Palazzo Reale. *Caravaggio e l'Europa. Il movimento caravaggesco internazionale de Caravaggio*, ed. V. Sgarbi.

Milan 2008

Palazzo Mario. *La Conversione di Saulo: Esposizione straordinaria del Caravaggio Odescalchi*, ed. V. Merlini and D. Storti.

Milan 2009

Pinacoteca di Brera. *Caravaggio ospita Caravaggio*.

Moscow-Saint Petersburg 1983–84

Selevr'i iz sobranija barona Tjssen-Bornemjsa (zapalnoevropejskaja zivopis' XIV-XVII vv.).

Munich-Florence 2002

Kunsthalle de Hypo-Kulturstiftung, Munich. *La natura morta italiana tra cinquecento e settecento*, ed. M. Gregori.

Munich 2008

Bayerische Staatsgemäldesammlungen, Alte Pinakothek Munich. *Ulrich Loth: Zwischen Caravaggio und Rubens*.

Naples 1938

Museo Nazionale di Capodimonte. *Mostra della pittura napoletana dei secoli XVII, XVIII, e XIX*, ed. S. Ortolani.

Naples 1963

Museo Nazionale di Capodimonte. *Caravaggio e Caravaggeschi*, ed. G. Scavizzi.

Naples-Zurich-Rotterdam 1964

Palazzo Reale, Naples; Kunsthaus, Zurich; Museum Boymans Van Beuningen, Rotterdam. *La natura morta italiana*.

Naples 1977

Museo Nazionale di Capodimonte. *Mostra didattica di Carlo Sellitto, primo Caravaggesco napoletano*, ed. R. Causa and F. Bologna.

Naples 1991

Museo Nazionale di Capodimonte. *Battistello Caracciolo e il primo Naturalismo a Napoli*, ed. F. Bologna.

Naples 2003

Museo di Capodimonte. *Bacco di Caravaggio a Capodimonte*.

Naples-London 2004–5

Museo di Capodimonte, Naples; The National Gallery, London. *Caravaggio. The Final Years 1606–1610*, ed. N. Spinosa.

Naples 2005

Caravaggio a Napoli Dalle Opere di Misericordia alla Sant'Orsola, trafitta, tecnica e restauri.

Naples 2008

Museo di Capodimonte. *Omaggio a Capodimonte. Da Caravaggio a Picasso*.

New York 1939

World's Fair. *Masterpieces of Art*.

New York 1946

Durlacher Bros. *Caravaggio e i Caravaggisti*.

New York 1958

M. Knoedler & Co. *Masterpieces from The Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford.*

New York-Chicago-San Francisco-Washington D.C. 1982

The Vatican Collections. The Papacy and Art, ed. F. Mancinelli.

New York-Tulsa-Dayton 1983

National Academy of Design, New York; Philbrook Art Center, Tulsa; Dayton Art Institute.

Italian Still Life Paintings from Three Centuries, ed. J. T. Spike.

New York 1983–84

The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York; Art Institute of Chicago; Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco; National Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C. *The Vatican Collections. The Papacy and Art*, ed. F. Mancinelli.

New York-Naples 1985

The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York; Museo Nazionale di Caravaggio. *The Age of Caravaggio*, ed. M. Gregori.

Padua 2009–10

Musei Civici agli Eremitani. *Caravaggio, Lotto, Ribera. Quattro secoli di capolavori dalla Fondazione Longhi a Padova.*

Palermo 2001

Palazzo Ziino. *Sulle orme di Caravaggio tra Roma e la Sicilia*, ed. V. Abbate, G. Barbera, C. Strinati, and R. Vodret.

Paliano 2006

Palazzo Colonna. *Michelangelo da Caravaggio. La Maddalena di Paliano.*

Paris 1935

Petit Palais. *Exposition de l'art italien de Cimabue à Tiepolo.*

Paris 1952

Orangerie des Tuileries. *La nature morte de l'antiquité à nos jours*, ed. C. Sterling.

Paris 1965

Musée du Louvre. *Le seizième siècle européen. Peintures et dessins dans les collections publiques françaises*, ed. M. L. Casanova.

Paris 1977

Musée du Louvre. “La Diseuse de Bonne Aventure’ de Caravage.” In *Les dossiers du département des peintures*, ed. J. P. Cuzin.

Paris 1982

Petit Palais, Musée des Beaux Arts de la Ville de Paris. *Collection Thyssen-Bornemisza. Maîtres anciens*.

Paris-Chicago-New York 1982

Musée du Louvre, Paris; Art Institute of Chicago; The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York. *France in the Golden Age: Seventeenth-Century French Paintings in American Collections*, ed. P. Rosenberg.

Paris 1988

Musée du Louvre. *Le dessin à Rome au XVIIe siècle*.

Paris-Milan 1988–89

Galleries Nationales du Grand Palais, Paris; Palazzo Reale, Milan. *Seicento, le siècle de Caravage dans les collections françaises*, ed. A. Brejon de Lavergnée and N. Volle.

Parma-Naples-Munich 1995

Palazzo Ducale di Colorno, Parma; Museo Nazionale di Capodimonte, Naples; Haus der Kunst, Munich. *I Farnese: arte e collezionismo*, ed. L. Fornaci Schianchi and N. Spinosa.

Philadelphia 1963

Philadelphia Museum of Art. *A World of Flowers*.

Pontedera 2005

Centro per l’arte Otello Cirri. *Luce e Ombra: Caravaggismo e naturalismo nella pittura toscana del seicento*.

Poughkeepsie 1959

Vassar College, Taylor Hall. *The Age of the Baroque*.

Richmond 1961

Virginia Museum of Fine Arts. *A Brief Chronicle of the Twenty-fifth Birthday Celebration and Catalogue of the Anniversary Loan Exhibition: Treasures in America.*

Rome 1914

Palazzo Corsini. *Mostra del Caravaggio.*

Rome 1948

Istituto Centrale di Restauro. *Catalogo della V mostra di restauri*, ed. G. C. Argan.

Rome 1956

Palazzo delle Esposizione. *Il seicento europeo*, ed. L. Salerno.

Rome 1972

Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Antica. *Acquisti 1970–72*, ed. I. Faldi and E. Safarik.

Rome 1983

Istituto Nazionale per la Grafica. *L'immagine di San Francesco nella Controriforma*, ed. C. Strinati.

Rome 1984

Régine's Gallery. *In prosenio*, ed. M. Marini.

Rome 1984–85

Palazzo Venezia. *L'arte degli anni santi: Roma 1300–1875.*

Rome 1986

Palazzo Venezia. *Caravaggio nei musei romani*, ed. R. Vodret Adamo.

Rome 1989

Palazzo Venezia. *La pittura a Roma nel secolo XVII.*

Rome 1995

Galleria Nazionale. *Caravaggio e la collezione Mattei, Roma.*

Rome 1995²

Palazzo Venezia. *La regola e la fama: San Filippo Neri e l'arte*, ed. C. Strinati.

Rome 1995³

Musei Capitolini. *La natura morta al tempo di Caravaggio*.

Rome 1999

Palazzo Barberini. *Caravaggio e i suoi*, ed. C. Strinati and R. Vodret.

Rome 2000

Palazzo delle Esposizioni. *L'idea del bello: viaggio per Roma nel seicento con Giovanni Pietro Bellori*. 2 vols., ed. E. Borea and C. Gasparri.

Rome-Berlin 2001

Palazzo Giustiniani, Rome; Gemäldegalerie, Berlin. *Caravaggio e i Giustiniani*. ed. S. Danesi Squarzina.

Rome-New York-St. Louis 2001

Palazzo Venezia, Rome; The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York; St. Louis Museum of Art. *Orazio e Artemisia Gentileschi*.

Rome 2001–2

Palazzo Caffarelli-Clementino. *Il San Giovanni Battista ritrovato. La tradizione classica in Annibale Carracci e in Caravaggio*.

Rome 2003

Santa Maria del Popolo. *Il Caravaggio Odescalchi: Le due versioni della Conversione di San Paolo a confronto*.

Rome-Milan-Vicenza 2004

Galleria Borghese, Rome; Pinacoteca Ambrosiana, Milan; Gallerie di Palazzo Leoni Montanari, Vicenza. *L'ultimo Caravaggio. Il Martirio di Sant'Orsola restaurato. Collezione Banca Intesa*.

Rome 2005

Museo nazionale di Castel Sant'Angelo. *Caravaggio al tempo di Caravaggio: In Occasione Della Mostra Caravaggio, Una Mostra Impossibile a Roma, Castel Sant'Angelo*.

Rome 2006

Santa Maria del Popolo. *Capolavori da scoprire. Odescalchi, Pallavicini. Le due versioni della 'Conversione di san Paolo' a confronto*, ed. R. Vodret.

Rome 2006–7

Gate-Termini Art Gallery. *Come Lavorava Caravaggio. Capolavori nelle Collezioni Private*, ed. M. Marini.

Rome 2007

Scuderie del Quirinale. *Dürer e l'Italia*, ed. H. Fiore.

Rome 2009

Casino dell'Aurora Pallavicini. *Capolavori da Scoprire*.

Rome 2009²

Galleria Borghese. *Caravaggio Bacon*, ed. A. Colliva.

Saint Petersburg 2005

Hermitage Museum. *The "Pictures and Scents of Caravaggio" Project*.

Salonica 1997

Michelangelo Merisi da Caravaggio e i suoi primi seguaci.

San Francisco 1938

California Palace of the Legion of Honor. *Masterworks of Five Centuries*.

San Francisco 1949

California Palace of the Legion of Honor. *Illusion and Trompe l'oeil*.

São Paulo (Brazil) 1954

Da Caravaggio a Tiepolo, pittura italiano del XVII e XVIII secolo, ed. G. Ronci.

Sarasota 1958

John and Mable Ringling Museum of Art. *A. Everett Austin, Jr.: A Director's Taste and Achievement*.

Sarasota 1960

John and Mable Ringling Museum of Art. *Figures at a Table*, ed. C. Gilbert.

Seattle 1962

World's Fairgrounds. *Masterpieces of Art: Century Twenty-one Exposition*.

Seville 1973

Sala de Armas de los Reales Alcazars. *Caravaggio y el naturalismo español*, ed. A. E. Pérez Sánchez.

Siena 2005–6

Palazzo Squarcialupi. *Siena e Roma: Raffaello, Caravaggio e i protagonisti di un legame antico*.

Stuttgart 1988–89

Meisterwerke aus der Sammlung Thyssen-Bornemisza.

Sydney-Melbourne 2003–4

Art Gallery of New South Wales, Sydney; National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne. *Darkness and Light: Caravaggio and His World*, ed. E. Capon and G. Vaughan.

Syracuse 1984

Museo Regionale di Palazzo Bellomo. *Caravaggio in Sicilia: il suo tempo, il suo influsso*.

Syracuse 2003

Galleria Regionale di Palazzo Bellomo. *Caravaggio: Due Capolavori a confronto*.

Syracuse 2004

Chiesa del Collegio dei Gesuiti. *Mario Minniti-l'eredità di Caravaggio a Siracuse*.

Tokyo-Okazaki 2001–2

Teyen Metropolitan Museum, Tokyo; Museum of Fine Arts, Okazaki. *Caravaggio e i suoi primi seguaci*, ed. C. Strinati and R. Vodret.

Toulouse 2001

Musée Paul Dupuy. *Le temps du caravagisme: la peinture de Toulouse et du Languedoc de 1590 à 1650*.

Tulsa-Kansas City 1995–96

Philbrook Museum of Art, Tulsa; Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art, Kansas City. *Caravaggio & Tiziano*, ed. R. Townsend and R. Ward.

Turin 2002

Palazzina di Caccia di Stupinigi. *Da Tiziano a Caravaggio a Tiepolo*.

Turin 2005

Palazzina di Caccia di Stupinigi. *Il Male: Esercizio di Pittura Crudele*.

U.S.A. 1948–51

Traveling exhibit in various U.S. cities, Amsterdam, Brussels, Paris. *Capolavori dei musei di Berlino*.

Utrecht-Anvers 1952

Caravaggio en de Nederlanden, ed. E. Houtzaager and E. R. Meijer.

Valletta 1970

St. John's Museum. *The Order of St. John in Malta*.

Valletta 1978

St. John's Museum. *The Church of St. John in Valletta 1578–1978. An Exhibition Commemorating the Fourth Centenary of Its Consecration*, ed. Can. J. Azzopardi.

Valletta 2007

St. John's Museum. *Caravaggio and Paintings of Realism in Malta*, ed. C. De Giorgio and K. Sciberras.

Valletta-Trapani 2007–8

Museo Nazionale dell'Archeologia, Valletta; Museo Regionale "Conte Agostino Pepoli," Trapani. *Caravaggio: l'immagine del divino: un tributo a Sir Denis Mahon*, ed. M. Marini.

Varese 2002

Castello di Masnago. *Il ritratto in Lombardia da Moroni a Ceruti*.

Vatican City 2003–4

Visioni ed Estasi: Capolavori dell'arte europea tra Seicento e Settecento.

Venice 2000

Lungo il tragitto crociato della vita.

Vienna 1981

Kunsthistorisches Institut. *Gemälde aus der Ermitage und dem Puschkin-Museum*, ed. S. Wsewoloshskaja.

Vienna 2001

Palace Harrach. *Musik in der Malerei des XVI und XVII Jahrhunderts, eine Ausstellung des Kunsthistorischen Museums.*

Warsaw 1990

Royal Castle. *Opus Sacrum: Catalogue of the Exhibition from the Collection of Barbara Piasecka Johnson*, ed. J. Grabski.

Washington 1975

National Gallery of Art. *Master Paintings from the Hermitage and the Russian State Museums* (also traveled to New York, Detroit, Los Angeles, and Houston), ed. E. Zafran.

Washington 1996

National Gallery of Art. *Georges de la Tour and His World*, ed. P. Conisbee.

Williamsburg, Virginia, 2006–7

The Muscarelle Museum of Art, College of William and Mary. *Natura Morta: Still-Life Painting and the Medici Collections*, ed. A. de Groft.

Zurich 1946–47

Kunsthalle. *Meisterwerke aus Österreich.*

Zurich-Rotterdam 1964–65

Kunsthhaus, Zurich. *Das italienische Stilleben von den Anfängen bis zur Gegenwart*, ed. E. Hüttinger.

Copyright Notice

FRONT COVER: *Cat. 52 (detail; see page 198–99)*. DAVID WITH THE HEAD OF GOLIATH, *c. 1607*.
Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna

Copyright © 2001, 2010 Abbeville Press. All rights reserved under international copyright conventions. No part of this document may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. Inquiries should be addressed to Abbeville Press, 137 Varick Street, New York, NY 10013. The text of this book was set in Caslon 540. Printed and bound in China.

EDITOR: Christopher Lyon
DESIGNER: Julietta Cheung
CD-ROM PROGRAM DESIGN: Carl Skelton
PRODUCTION EDITOR: Ashley Benning
PICTURE EDITOR: Robin Raffer
PRODUCTION MANAGER: Louise Kurtz

Second revised edition

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

A previous edition of this work was catalogued as follows:

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Spike, John T.

Caravaggio / John T. Spike.—1st ed.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-7892-1059-3 (alk. paper)

Caravaggio, Michelangelo Merisi da, 1573–1610. 2. Painters—Italy—Biography. I. Caravaggio, Michelangelo Merisi da, 1573–1610. II. Title.

ND623.C26 S65 2001

759.5—dc21

2001022967

For bulk and premium sales and for text adoption procedures, write to Customer Service Manager, Abbeville Press, 137 Varick Street, New York, NY 10013, or call 1-800-Artbook.

Visit Abbeville Press online at www.abbeville.com.

